IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Comment resolutions for WUR Discovery frame |
| Date: 2019-04-10 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. | 5775 Morehouse Dr, San Diego, CA 92109 | +1-858-658-5302 | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for multiple comments related to TGba D2.0 with the following CIDs (8 CIDs):

* 2128, 2146, 2388, 2510, 2600, 2648, 2810, 2811

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.
* Rev 1: Revised version that contains suggestions received from Rojan and Po-Kai via e-mail. Changes in green.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGba Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGba Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGba Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGba Editor” are instructions to the TGba editor to modify existing material in the TGba draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGba editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGba Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 2128 | Hanseul Hong | 60.01 | For the consistency with P58L11(Protection subfield in WUR Beacon frame), the Protection subfield of WUR Discovery frame should be 0 | Either set the Protection subfield to 0 or reserved for both frame format | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies that the Protected subfield is set to 0 as per suggestion.TGba editor to make the changes shown in 11-19/0584r1 under all headings that include CID 2128. |
| 2146 | James Lepp | 60.35 | Change CRC to 16-bit CRC | "The FCS field contains the 16-bit CRC as defined in..." | Accepted |
| 2388 | Mark Hamilton | 60.01 | The protected subfield is not reserved, it is required to be 0 (because this frame always has a CRC.) | Repalce with "The Protected subfield in the Frame Control field is set to 0." | Accepted |
| 2510 | Osama Aboulmagd | 60.31 | "Channel Information". It is not clear what channel information is included. Primary channel, WUR channel, or the discovery channel. Need clarification. | as in comment | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies that channel information is related to the primary channel location of the BSS being advertised by the WUR Discovery frame.TGba editor to make the changes shown in 11-19/0584r1 under all headings that include CID 2510. |
| 2600 | Rojan Chitrakar | 60.01 | Since Discovery frames are not protected, the Protected subfield should be 0 in WUR Discovery frames. | Change the sentence as:"The Protected subfield in the Frame Control field is set to 0." | Accepted |
| 2648 | Stephen McCann | 59.65 | The Frame Control field is defined in clause 9.10.2.1.1, but not all the subfields are set in clause 9.10.2.1.1. Therefore the values of the Length Present and the Length/Misc subfields are not known. | Change "The Frame Control field is set as defined in 9.10.2.1.1" to"The Frame Control field is as defined in 9.10.2.1.1 (Frame Control field), with the Length Present subfield set to 0 and the Length/Misc subfield is reserved." | Rejected –The Frame Control field contains the definition and setting of the fields contained therein. This applies to the Length Present and Length/Misc field as well. Since there is no exception in this subclasue for the setting of these fields, then the encoding of the Frame Control field applies, i.e., in this case the Length Present field is expected to be set to 1 and the Length field set to 2. However, this is already clear from the definitions in 9.10.2.1.1, hence no further changes are required for this comment.  |
| 2810 | Yunsong Yang | 60.01 | Is the Protected subfield in WUR Discovery frame indeed reserved or set to 0? There is a difference. If it is reserved, we need to add an exception statement at the end of P56L61 to read: ", except that the FCS field in WUR Discovery frames always contains a 16-bit CRC". | Either change "reserved" to "set to 0" on P60L1, or add an exception statement at the end of P56L61 to read: ", except that the FCS field in WUR Discovery frames always contains a 16-bit CRC". | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies that the Protected subfield is set to 0 as per suggestion.TGba editor to make the changes shown in 11-19/0584r1 under all headings that include CID 2810. |
| 2811 | Yunsong Yang | 60.30 | Operating class and channel information of what? It is unclear. | Change the cited sentence to read: "The Operating Channel field contains operating class and channel information, as defined in 9.4.1.22(Operating Class and Channel field), of the primary channel of the AP being advertised by the WUR Discovery frame." | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies that channel information is related to the primary channel location of the BSS being advertised by the WUR Discovery frame.TGba editor to make the changes shown in 11-19/0584r1 under all headings that include CID 2811. |

**Discussion: *None.***

* WUR Discovery frame format

The frame format of the WUR Discovery frame is defined in Figure 9-988a (WUR frame format).

The Frame Control field is defined in 9.10.2.1.1 (Frame Control field).The Address field is set to the Transmit ID.

The TD Control is set to bits 8 to 19 of the compressed BSSID. The Address field is set to the Transmit ID.

The TD Control is set to bits 8 to 19 of the compressed BSSID.

**TGba Editor: *Change the paragraphs below of this subclause as follows (#CID 2128, 2388, 2600, 2810):***

The Protected subfield in the Frame Control field is set to 0.*(#2128, 2388, 2600, 2810)*

The ID field is set to the transmitter ID.

The Type Dependent Control field is set to 12 MSBs of the compressed BSSID (see 30.4.1 (General)).

The format of the Frame Body field is defined in Figure 9-988g ( Frame Body Field format of WUR Discovery frame).

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | B0                     B15 | B16                                 B31 |
|  | Compressed SSID | Operating Channel |
| Bits: | 16 | 16 |
| * Frame Body Field format of WUR Discovery frame
 |

The Compressed SSID field contains 16 LSBs of the Short-SSID as defined in 9.4.2.170.3 (Calculating the Short-SSID).

**TGba Editor: *Change the paragraphs below of this subclause as follows (#CID 2510, 2811, 2146):***

The Operating Channel field contains the Operating Class and Channel field, which is defined in 9.4.1.22 (Operating Class and Channel field), and indicates the location of the primary channel of the BSS being advertised by the WUR Discovery frame.*(#2510, 2811)*The format of the Frame Body field is as defined in Figure 9-747a (Frame Body field format of WUR Discovery frame).The Compressed SSID field contains 16 LSBs of the Short-SSID as defined in 9.4.2.171.2. The PCR Operating Channel field contains operating class and channel information as defined in 9.4.1.22.

The FCS field contains the 16-bit CRC as defined in 9.10.2.5.2 (Cyclic Redundancy Check (CRC) for WUR frames). *(#2146)*