IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes of TGax Teleconferences from March to April 2019 | | | | |
| Date: 2019-04-30 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Yasuhiko Inoue | NTT | 1-1 Hikaro-no-oka, Yokosuka, Kanagawa 239-0847 Japan | ++81-46-859-5097 | yasu.inoue.h2k5@gmail.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains minutes of TGax teleconference from November 2018 to January 2019.

Rev. 0: Initial version containing following TGax teleconference minutes:

* TGax teleconferences on March 29th, April 11th, and 25th, 2019.

# Teleconference on Thursday, March 29th, 2019, 10:00 – 12:00 (ET)

1. **Meeting called to order by Osama Aboul-Magd (Huawei Technologies), the chairperson of TGax @ 10:03 (ET).**
   1. Introduction of the chairperson Osama Aboul-Magd (Huawei Technologies) and the secretary Yasuhiko Inoue (NTT).
2. **Agenda Setting**
   1. Proposed Agenda
      1. Call the meeting to order
      2. IEEE 802 and 802.11 IPR policies and procedures
      3. Attendance (Please send an e.mail to Yasuhiko Inoue (inoue.yasuhiko@lab.ntt.co.jp) and/or Osama Aboul-Magd (osama.aboulmagd@huawei.com))
      4. Announcements
      5. Comment Resolution
         1. Mark’s comments on email
         2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0553-00-00ax-comment-resolutions-on-clause-27-3-15-2-beamforming-feedback-matrix-v.docx> - Kome Oteri
         3. Resolutions to CIDs 20637, 20758, 20771, and 20850 – Mark Rison
      6. AOB
      7. Adjourn
   2. Approval of the agenda
      1. Chair asked if there is any item to add to the agenda. 🡪 No item to add to the agenda.
      2. Chair asked if there is any objection to approve the agenda. 🡪 No objection.
      3. The agenda was approved.
3. **IEEE 802 and 802.11 IPR Policy and Procedure**
   1. Chair mentioned that we are operating under the IEEE 802 and 802.11 Policy and Procedure.
   2. Relevant documents
      1. IEEE Patent Policy - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>
      2. Patent FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/faq.pdf>
      3. LoA Form - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/loa.pdf>
      4. Affiliation FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliationFAQ.html>
      5. Anti-Trust FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/resources/antitrust-guidelines.pdf>
      6. Ethics - <http://www.ieee.org/portal/cms_docs/about/CoE_poster.pdf>
      7. IEEE 802.11 Working Group Operartions Manual - <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-0629-22-0000-802-11-operations-manual.docx>
      8. Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings
   3. Chair asked if there is any potentially essential patent that people are aware of.
      1. No potentially essential patent reported.
4. **Attendance**
   1. Chair asked the attendees to send an email to Yasuhiko ([inoue.yasuhiko@lab.ntt.co.jp](mailto:inoue.yasuhiko@lab.ntt.co.jp)) and/or Osama ([osama.aboulmagd@huawei.com](mailto:osama.aboulmagd@huawei.com)) to record attendance.
5. **TGax ad hoc meeting in San Diego**
   1. TGax adhoc Meeting in San Diego (May 8-10)
      1. This is MAC only ad hoc.
   2. ePoll is open:  <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/poll-status?p=31200008>
6. **Announcement**
   1. Chair asked people to state name and affiliation when addressing for the first time during the session.
   2. Chair memtioned that we still had 283 comments to resolve.
7. **Comment Resolution and Discussion**
   1. **Discussion based on the email from Mark Rison (Samsung Electronics).**
      1. Discussion
         1. CID 20478: 19/0394r1 does exactly what the proposed change was. So resolution should have been ACCEPTED not REVISED. 🡪 The resolution is not ACCEPTED. There are othe related comments to this one and another member (Abhishek Patil) is working on them.
         2. CID resolution claimed to be "Agree with the comment" but in fact 19/0394r1 does exactly the opposite of the comment. 🡪 This comment is also resolved by Abhishek. Abhishek can remove the CID from the CR document and come back in the May session.
         3. CID 20491: it would be desirable to indicate in the resolution in what way the spec has been clarified 🡪 The resolution to be updated.
         4. CID 20540: resolution claims to agree with commenter, but rather than making the proposed change, it keeps the opaque grammar which was the point of the comment) 🡪 Mark to discuss with Po-Kai.
         5. CID 20548: resolution claims to agree in principle, but I'm not convinced it does. 🡪 Robert Stacey, TGax technical editor, suggested email discussion on this CID.
         6. CID 20569: resolution doesn't address the comment, which had a large and specific list of places where "NDP" needed to be qualified. 🡪 This comment is resolved by an individual who is not on the call. Mark to talk to the person.
         7. CID 20574: 19/0394r1 does exactly what the proposed change was. So resolution should have been ACCEPTED not REVISED. 🡪 Mark is expecting global changes.
         8. CID 20999/21000: resolution should have stated that this is the proposed change plus changing "Description" to "RU Index" (which should have been "RU index" -- another D5.0 comment…) in the heading of Table 9-31g 🡪 Mark agrees with the comments.
         9. CID 21020: resolution does not addresses the comment (REJECTION does not make sense). 🡪 The commenter is not on the call.
      2. Next Step
         1. Abhishek to update his CR document.
         2. Mark to talk to some individuals working on the comments.
   2. **Kome Oteri (InterDigital Communication) presented “Comment Resolutions on Clause 27.3.15.2 (Beamforming feedback matrix V),” based on the submission 11-19-0553-00.**
      1. Summary
         1. Resolutions for the comments on the IEEE 802.11ax D4.0 Clause 27.3.15.2 (Beamforming feedback matrix V) are proposed.
            1. Relevant CIDs: 20780, 20781, 21565
      2. Discussion
         1. No discussion.
      3. Next Step
         1. Ready for motion.
   3. **Discussion based on the e-mail from Mark Rison (Samsung Electronics).**
      1. Summary – Discussion based on another email from Mark Rison.
      2. Discussion
         1. CID 20637: Mark suggested resolution as in his email.
            1. A participant commented we should be careful in designing this mechanism since a non-HE STA cannot understand it.
         2. CID 20758: The Proposed Change is clear and specific, but I see the subclause reference is wrong. 🡪 The proposed change seems to be okay.
         3. CID 20771: The proposed change is clear enough for Mark just to accept it, some participants seem to have an issue. This CID is categorized as “submission required.”
         4. CID 20850: This is marked as Submission Required, but the Proposed Change is clear and specific. Mark suggested ACCEPT as the resolution. 🡪 Some members are working on this comment.
         5. CID 20758: This is marked as Submission Required, but the Proposed Change is clear and specific. Mark suggested ACCEPT as the resolution. 🡪 For some people, no change is needed.
      3. Next Step
         1. There will be related submissions with the above CIDs.
8. **AOB**
   * 1. None
9. **Adjournment**
   1. No time to go through the rest of the agenda items.
   2. Meeting adjourned at 11:27 AM (ET).
10. **List of Attendees**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Name** | **Affiliation** |
| 1 | Osama Aboul-Magd | Huawei Technologies |
| 2 | Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm |
| 3 | Stephane Baron | Canon Research |
| 4 | Liwen Chu | Marvell |
| 5 | Yasuhiko Inoue | NTT |
| 6 | Massinissa Lalam | Sagemcom |
| 7 | Kome Oteri | InterDigital Communications |
| 8 | Abhishek Patil | Qualcomm |
| 9 | Gaurav Patwardhan | HP Enterprise |
| 10 | Al Petrick | InterDigital Communications |
| 11 | Mark Rison | Samsung |
| 12 | Yongho Seok | MediaTek |
| 13 | Rober Stacey | Intel |
| 14 | Xiaofei Wang | InterDigital Communications |
| 15 |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |

# Teleconference on Thursday, April 11th, 2019, 10:00 AM – 12:00 (ET)

1. **Meeting called to order by Osama Aboul-Magd (Huawei Technologies), the chairperson of TGax @ 10:05 AM (ET).**
   1. Introduction of the chairperson Osama Aboul-Magd (Huawei Technologies) and the secretary Yasuhiko Inoue (NTT).
2. **Agenda Setting**
   1. Proposed Agenda
      1. Call the meeting to order
      2. IEEE 802 and 802.11 IPR policies and procedures
      3. Attendance reminder: Please send an e-mail to Yasuhiko Inoue (yasu.inoue.h2k5@gmail.com) and/or Osama Aboul-Magd (osama.aboulmagd@huawei.com)
      4. TGax ad hoc meeting in San Diego (May 8 – 10) -  <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/poll-status?p=31200008>
      5. Announcements
      6. Comment resolution and discussion – Robert Stacey and Mark Rison
      7. AOB
      8. Adjourn
   2. Approval of the agenda
      1. Chair asked if there is any item to add to the agenda. 🡪 No item to add to the agenda.
      2. Chair asked if there is any objection to approve the agenda. 🡪 No objection.
      3. The agenda was approved.
3. **IEEE 802 and 802.11 IPR Policy and Procedure**
   1. Chair mentioned that we are operating under the IEEE 802 and 802.11 Policy and Procedure.
   2. Relevant documents
      1. IEEE Patent Policy - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>
      2. Patent FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/faq.pdf>
      3. LoA Form - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/loa.pdf>
      4. Affiliation FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliationFAQ.html>
      5. Anti-Trust FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/resources/antitrust-guidelines.pdf>
      6. Ethics - <http://www.ieee.org/portal/cms_docs/about/CoE_poster.pdf>
      7. IEEE 802.11 Working Group Operartions Manual - <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-0629-22-0000-802-11-operations-manual.docx>
      8. Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings
   3. Chair asked if there is any potentially essential patent that people are aware of.
      1. No potentially essential patent reported.
4. **Attendance**
   1. Chair asked the attendees to send an email to Yasuhiko ([inoue.yasuhiko@lab.ntt.co.jp](mailto:inoue.yasuhiko@lab.ntt.co.jp)) and/or Osama ([osama.aboulmagd@huawei.com](mailto:osama.aboulmagd@huawei.com)) to record attendance.
5. **TGax ad hoc meeting in San Diego**
   1. May 8th to 10th, 2019
   2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/poll-status?p=31200008>
6. **Announcement**
   1. Chair asked people to state name and affiliation when addressing for the first time during the session.
   2. Chair also asked people to mute the microphone when not speaking.
7. **Comment Resolution and Discussion**
   1. **Robert Stacey lead the discussion based on the comment spreadsheet .**
      1. Comment spreadsheet:  <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0292-08-00ax-comments-on-tgax-d4-0.xlsx>
      2. Following comments are reviewed during the call:
         1. CID 20758: the resolution was updated (REJECT 🡪 REVISED).
         2. CIDs under “Editorial” tab:
            1. CID 20057, 20060, 20147, 20151, 20152, 20155, 20156, 20272, 20228, 20239, 20331, 20332, 20334, 20692, 20693, 20839, 20872.
      3. Next Step
         1. We still have quiet a few comments. We will continue commet resolution during the next teleconference.
8. **AOB**
   1. None
9. **Adjournment**
   1. Meeting adjourned at 11:59 AM (ET).
10. **List of Attendees**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Name** | **Affiliation** |
| 1 | Osama Aboul-Magd | Huawei Technologies |
| 2 | Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm |
| 3 | Liwen Chu | Marvel Semiconductor |
| 4 | Yasuhiko Inoue | NTT |
| 5 | Srinivas Kandara | Samsung |
| 6 | Patrice Nezou | Canon Research |
| 7 | Abhishek Patil | Qualcomm |
| 8 | Al Petrick | InterDigital Communications |
| 9 | Mark Rison | Samsung |
| 10 | Sigurd Schelstraete | Quantenna Communications |
| 11 | Robert Stacey | Intel |
| 12 | Rui Yang | InterDigital |
|  |  |  |

# Teleconference on Thursday, April 25th, 2019, 10:00 AM – 12:00 (ET)

1. **Meeting called to order by Osama Aboul-Magd (Huawei Technologies), the chairperson of TGax @ 10:05 AM (ET).**
   1. Introduction of the chairperson Osama Aboul-Magd (Huawei Technologies) and the secretary Yasuhiko Inoue (NTT).
2. **Agenda Setting**
   1. Proposed Agenda
      1. Call the meeting to order
      2. IEEE 802 and 802.11 IPR policies and procedures
      3. Attendance (Please send an e.mail to Yasuhiko Inoue (yasu.inoue.h2k5@gmail.com) and/or Osama Aboul-Magd (osama.aboulmagd@huawei.com))
      4. TGax ad hoc meeting in San Diego (May 8-10)
      5. Announcements
      6. Comment Resolution
      7. AOB
      8. Adjourn
   2. Approval of the agenda
      1. Chair asked if there is any item to add to the agenda. 🡪 No item to add to the agenda.
      2. Chair asked if there is any objection to approve the agenda. 🡪 No objection.
      3. The agenda was approved.
3. **IEEE 802 and 802.11 IPR Policy and Procedure**
   1. Chair mentioned that we are operating under the IEEE 802 and 802.11 Policy and Procedure.
   2. Relevant documents
      1. IEEE Patent Policy - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>
      2. Patent FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/faq.pdf>
      3. LoA Form - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/loa.pdf>
      4. Affiliation FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliationFAQ.html>
      5. Anti-Trust FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/resources/antitrust-guidelines.pdf>
      6. Ethics - <http://www.ieee.org/portal/cms_docs/about/CoE_poster.pdf>
      7. IEEE 802.11 Working Group Operartions Manual - <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-0629-22-0000-802-11-operations-manual.docx>
      8. Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings
   3. Chair asked if there is any potentially essential patent that people are aware of.
      1. No potentially essential patent reported.
4. **Attendance**
   1. Chair asked the attendees to send an email to Yasuhiko ([yasu.inoue.h2k5@gmail.com](mailto:yasu.inoue.h2k5@gmail.com)) and/or Osama ([osama.aboulmagd@huawei.com](mailto:osama.aboulmagd@huawei.com)) to record attendance.
5. **TGax ad hoc Meeting in San Diego**
   1. From May 8th to 10th, 2019. MAC only ad hoc.
   2. ePoll is open: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/poll-status?p=31200008>
6. **Announcement**
   1. Chair asked people to state name and affiliation when addressing for the first time during the session.
   2. Chair mentioned that we had two more teleconferences planned before the Jnauary 2019 session. One more telelconference will be added on January 10th to accelerate the comment resolution.
7. **Comment Resolution**
   1. Not so many people are on the call and there was not enough material to discuss.
8. **AOB**
   * 1. None
9. **Adjournment**
   1. Meeting adjourned at 10:14 AM (ET).
10. **List of Attendees**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Name** | **Affiliation** |
| 1 | Osama Aboul-Magd | Huawei Technologies |
| 2 | Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm |
| 3 | Yasu Inoue | NTT |
| 4 | Al Petrick | InterDigital, Inc |
| 5 | Mark Rison | Samsung |
| 6 | Bo Sun | ZTE |
| 7 | Rui Yang | InterDigital, Inc |
| 8 |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |