IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Text proposal on ISTA-2-RSTA LMR feedback | | | | |
| Date: 2019-05-15 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Company | Address | Phone | Email |
| Qi Wang | Apple, Inc. |  |  | [qi\_wang2@apple.com](mailto:qi_wang2@apple.com) |
| Chris Hartman | Apple, Inc. |  |  | chartman@apple.com |

Abstract

This submission contains a proposal to resolve CID-1624, 2295, 2296, 2297, 2298, 2299, 2300 and 1624 received during TGaz LB# 240. The proposal clarifies that an RSTA can request an ISTA to transmit the time measurement feedback and optionally the AoA measurement feedback to the RSTA only if the ISTA has indicated that it is willing to share its data.

**Introduction**

**Introduction**

This submission contains a proposal to resolve CID-2295, 2296, 2297, 2298, 2299, 3000 and 1624 received during the 11az LB#240. The proposal clarifies that, in order to protect users’ privacy if desired, an RSTA can request an ISTA to transmit the time measurement feedback and optionally the AoA measurement feedback to the RSTA only if the ISTA has indicated that it is willing to share its data.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | | Comments:   |  |  |  |  |  | | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | | CID | Clause | Comment | Proposed resolution | Resolution | | 2295 | 9.4.2.279 | "The ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback subfield in the Ranging Parameters field is set to 1 in the Initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame indicates that the ISTA is willing to report the estimated LMR to the RSTA; when included in the Initial Fine Timing Measurement frame indicates that the RSTA requires a LMR report from the ISTA at the end of each ranging exchange. Otherwise the ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback subfield is set to 0. See 11.22.6.4.2.4 (TB 14 19 Measurement Reporting Part) and 11.22.6.4.3.3 (Measurement Report)". The text needs to be clarified that only when the ISTA has set the ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback field to 1 (i.e., willing to share its location information) in the initial FTM Request frame, then the RSTA may set the ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback field to 1 in the initial FTM frame. | Modify the text to clarify that, only when the ISTA has set the ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback field to 1 (i.e., willing to share its location information) in the initial FTM Request frame, then the RSTA may set the ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback field to 1 in the initial FTM frame; the RSTA shall set the ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback field to 0 in the initial FTM frame if ISTA has set the ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback field to 0 (i.e., not willing to share its location information) in the initial FTMRequest frame. See submission. | Revised.  TGaz editor makes changes as specified in 11-19/0331r7 for its resolution. | | 2296 | 9.4.2.279 | "The I2R ToA Type subfield is set to 1 in the initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame to indicate that the ISTA supports phase shift type ToA feedback in the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR. The I2R ToA type subfield is set to 1 in the initial Fine Timing Measurement frame to set the ToA feedback type in the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR to phase shift, corresponding to the average linear phase across the subcarriers. Otherwise, the I2R ToA Type is set to 0 and the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR ToA feedback type will be first path reporting." The spec needs to specify that when the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR Feedback field in the initial FTM Request frame is set to 0 (i.e., not willing to share its location information), then the I2R ToA Type subfield in both the initial FTM Request frame and the initial FTM frame shall have no meaning. | Modify the spec to specify that when the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR Feedback field in the initial FTM Request frame is set to 0 (i.e., not willing to share its location information), then the I2R ToA Type subfield in both the initial FTM Request frame and the initial FTM frame is reserved. See submission. | Revised.  TGaz editor makes changes as specified in 11-19/0331r7 for its resolution. | | 2297 | 9.4.2.279 | "The I2R AoA Requested subfield is set to 1 in the initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame to indicate that the ISTA supports AoA measurement feedback in the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR. The I2R AoA Requested subfield is set to 1 in the initial Fine Timing Measurement frame by the RSTA to request the ISTA to include AoA measurements in the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR in the AoA feedback field." The spec needs to specify that when the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR Feedback field in the initial FTM Request frame is set to 0 (i.e., not willing to share its location information), then the I2R AoA Requested subfield in both the initial FTM Request frame and the initial FTM frame shall have no meaning. | Modify the spec to specify that when the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR Feedback field in the initial FTM Request frame is set to 0 (i.e., not willing to share its location information), then the I2R AoA Requested subfield in both the initial FTM Request frame and the initial FTM frame is reserved. See submission. | Revised.  TGaz editor makes changes as specified in 11-19/0331r7 for its resolution. | | 2298 | 11.22.6.3.3 | In this section, text needs to be added to specify that The ISTA shall set the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR feedback field in the Ranging Parameters field in the initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame to 0 if the ISTA is not willing to share its time measurement or AoA measurement to the RSTA. As a result, the RSTA shall set the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR feedback subfield field in the Ranging Parameters field in the initial Fine Timing Measurement frame to 0. An RSTA shall not reject an ISTA's request because the ISTA has set the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR feedback field in the Ranging Parameters field in the initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame to 0. | For Rev\_mc ranging (i.e., the legacy FTM protocol), the timestamps are transmitted only from the rSTA to iSTA. In the base spec, there is a separate feature that a STA 1(AP, or STA) can request a another STA 2 to send the location of STA1 (self), STA 2 (peer) or STA 3 ( 3r party); STA 2 can refuse to share the requested location information by transmitting a response frame indicating "refused". The protocol was designed precisely for the privacy protection. The 11az spec needs to follow the same principle, so that the the end users, not the networks, have the control of the users' location privacy. The use of the 11az ranging protocol shall not require a user to give up its location privacy. Alternatively, the iSTA-2-rSTA LMR report is not needed and can be removed, because the existing feature of Location LCI Report in the 802.11 base spec can be used to obtain another STA's location. | Revised.  TGaz editor makes changes as specified in 11-19/0331r7 for its resolution. | | 2299 | 11.22.6.3.3 | In this section, text needs to be added to specify that when the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR Feedback field in the initial FTM Request frame is set to 0 (i.e., not willing to share its location information), then the I2R ToA Type subfield in both the initial FTM Request frame and the initial FTM frame is reserved. | As in comment. | Revised.  TGaz editor makes changes as specified in 11-19/0331r7 for its resolution. | | 2300 | 11.22.6.3.3 | In this section, text needs to be added to specify that when the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR Feedback field in the initial FTM Request frame is set to 0 (i.e., not willing to share its location information), then the I2R ToA Type subfield in both the initial FTM Request frame and the initial FTM frame is reserved. | As in comment. | Revised.  TGaz editor makes changes as specified in 11-19/0331r7 for its resolution. | | 1624 |  | Based on discussions/comments related to market adoption hurdles for Fine Timing Measurement protocol (in REVmc) from AP Vendors, it would be prudent to add a ISTA to RSTA LMR Required bit in the Extended Capabilities element. This bit would indicate if the RSTA requires the ISTA to support ISTA to RSTA LMR in order to successfully negotiate a FTM (limited to nTB and TB) session with an ISTA. | The commenter will bring a submission to resolve this comment. | Revised.  TGaz editor makes changes as specified in 11-19/0331r7 for its resolution. | | |  |

*Instruction to the editor: The proposed modifications are in reference to the text* *in IEEE P802.11802.11az\_D1.0, and are indicated by the change marks as follows:*

# 9.4.2.26 Extended Capabilities element

***TGaz Editor: Insert the following new row into Table 9-283 Extended Capabilities element as shown below:***

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Bits | Information | Notes |
| <ANA> | I2R LMR Not Required | A STA sets the I2R LMR Not Required field to 1 if dot11I2RLMRNotRequired is true. Otherwise the STA sets the I2R LMR Not Required field to 0. See 11.22.6.3.3 (Range Measurement Negotiation) |

* + - 1. **Ranging Parameters**

***TGaz Editor: Change the following paragraph as shown below:***

The ISTA sets the ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback subfield in the Ranging Parameters field in the initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame:

* to 0 to indicate that it is not willing to transmit ISTA2RSTA LMR at the end of each measurement exchange, if requested by the RSTA, or
* to 1 to indicate that it is willing to transmit ISTA2RSTA LMR at the end of each measurement exchange, if requested by the RSTA.

The ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback subfield in the Initial Fine Timing Measurement frame is set to 1 to indicate that the RSTA requests an LMR report from the ISTA at the end of each ranging exchange, and is set to 0 otherwise.

See 11.22.6.4.3.4 (TB Ranging Measurement Reporting Part) and 11.22.6.4.4.3 (No-TB Ranging Measurement Report Part)

***TGaz Editor: Change the following paragraph as shown below:***

The I2R ToA Type subfield in the initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame is set to 1 to indicate that the ISTA supports phase shift type ToA feedback and is set to 0 to indicate that the the first path reporting in the ISTA2RSTA LMR. The I2R ToA type subfield in the initial Fine Timing Measurement frame is set to 1 to indicate that the ToA feedback type in the ISTA2RSTA LMR to be phase shift type ToA corresponding to the average linear phase across the subcarriers, and is set to 0 to indicate that the ISTA2RSTA LMR ToA feedback type to be be first path reporting.

***TGaz Editor: Change the following paragraph as shown below:***

The I2R AoA Requested subfield in the initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame is set to 1 to indicate that the ISTA supports AoA measurement feedback in the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR.

The I2R AoA Requested subfield in the initial Fine Timing Measurement frame is set to 1 to indicate to the ISTA to include the AoA measurement feedback in the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR, and is set to 0 otherwise.

**11.22.6.2 FTM Capabilities**

***TGaz Editor: Insert the following new text at the endo of 11.22.6.2 of 11az\_D1.0.***

A STA in which either dot11NonTriggedBasedRangingRespImplemented is true or dot11TriggedBasedRangingRespImplemented is true shall set the I2R LMR Not Required field of the Extended Capabilities element to 1 if dot11I2RLMRNotRequired is true. The STA shall set the I2R LMR Not Required field of the Extended Capabilities element to 0 if dot11I2RLMRNotRequired is false.

**11.22.6.3.3** **Trigger-based and non-Trigger-based Ranging Measurement Negotiation**

— maximum number of LTF repetitions it is capable of receiving in the preamble of the DL NDP frames, in the Max DL Rep subfield of the Ranging Parameters field.

— maximum number of LTF repetitions it is capable of transmitting in the preamble of the  UL NDP frames in the Max UL Rep subfield of the Ranging Parameters field.

The ISTA shall set the Max DL Rep and Max UL Rep subfields to a value greater than 0 if the Secure LTF Required subfield of the Ranging Parameters field is equal to 1.

***TGaz Editor: Insert the following text after the above paragraph.***

The ISTA shall set the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR Feedback field in the Ranging Parameters field in the initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame to 0 if the ISTA is unwilling to transmit its time measurement or AoA measurement to the RSTA, and to 1 otherwise.

If the ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback in the Initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame is set to 0, and the I2R LMR Not Required field in the Extended Capabilities element is set to 1 by the RSTA, then the RSTA shall not reject the request because the ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback subfield in the Ranging Parameters element in the Fine Timing Measurement Request frame was set to 0, and shall set the ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback in the Initial Fine Timing Measurement frame to 0.

If the ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback in the Initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame is set to 0, and the I2R LMR Not Required field in the Extended Capabilities element is set to 0 by the RSTA, then the RSTA shall set the ISTA2RSTA LMR feedback to 1 to indicate it requests the ISTA to transmit the I2R LMR Feedback or to 0 otherwise. If the RSTA has set the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR Feedback field in the Ranging Parameters field in the initial Fine Timing Measurement frame to 1, the ISTA shall determine whether to terminate the ranging session using the procedure described in Subclause 11.22.6.6.

If the ISTA2RSTA LMR Feedback in the Initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame is set to 1, then the RSTA shall set the ISTA2RSTA LMR feedback to 1 to indicate it requests the ISTA to transmit the I2R LMR Feedback or to 0 otherwise.

NOTE : Because the FTM procedure executes at the PHY/MAC layer, an RSTA accepting a ranging request despite the ISTA having set the ISTA-to-RSTA LMR Feedback field in the Ranging Parameters field in the initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame to 0 enables use cases where the ISTA may share its location information at a higher layer.

If the ISTA indicated for AOA feedback in the Initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame, the RSTA may set the I2R AoA Requested subfield in the corresponding Initial Fine Timing Measurement frame to 1, or it is set to 0 otherwise.

# For TB ranging and non-TB ranging, the Ranging Priority subfield of the Ranging Parameters field of the Ranging Parameters element in the initial Fine Timing Measurement Request frame contains the ISTA’s Ranging Priority request which indicates the time sensitivity of a ranging operation, and it is set according to Table 9-281a in 9.4.2.167. *A*nnex C

# (normative)

# ASN.1 encoding of the MAC and PHY MIB

**C. 3 MIB detail**

***TGaz Editor: Insert the following entries into*** *Dot11WirelessMgmtOptionsEntry* ***as shown below:***

Dot11WirelessMgmtOptionsEntry ::= SEQUENCE {

….

dot11RSTANotRequiresLMRActivated, TruthValue,

}

***TGaz Editor: Insert the following as shown below:***

dot11I2RLMRNotRequired OBJECT-TYPE

SYNTAX TruthValue  
MAX-ACCESS read-write  
STATUS current  
DESCRIPTION

"This is a control variable.  
It is written by an external management entity or the SME.  
Changes take effect at the next occurrence of an MLME-START.request or  
MLME-JOIN.request primitive.

This attribute, when true, indicates that the station does not require any initiating stations to support the capability to generate and transmit ISTA-to-RSTA Location Measurement Reports, in order

to successfully negotiate a Range Measurement Session

(see 11.22.6.3.3 (Range Measurement Negotiation)).   
False indicates that the station may require some or all initiating stations to support ISTA-to-RSTA Location Measurement Reporting capability in order to successfully negotiate a Range Measurement session. "

DEFVAL { true }

::= { dot11WirelessMgmtOptionsEntry <tbd>}

**References:**

1. IEEE Draft P802.11az\_D1.0, Draft standard for information technology – telecommunications and information exchange between systems – local and metropolitan area networks – specific requirements – Part 11: Wireless LAN medium access control (MAC) and physical layer (PHY) specifications, Amendment 8: Enhancements for locationing