IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Resolution of CID 3055, 3066, 3353, 3409. 3410, 3562 |
| Date: 2018-11-20 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Solomon Trainin | Qualcomm |  |  | strainin@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Assaf Kasher | Qualcomm |  |  | akasher@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Alecsander Eitan | Qualcomm |  |  | eitana@qti.qualcomm.com |

Abstract

Resolution of CID 3055, 3066, 3353, 3409. 3410, 3562

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Line** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3055 | 182.00 | 35 | 10.6.7.8 | Please resolve the apparent disagreement between bullets 1 & 2 per editor's note | Please resolve the apparent disagreement between bullets 1 & 2 per editor's note | Revised |
| 3562 | 182.00 | 23 | 10.6.7.8 | Fix the editor note by adopting the recommended fix | replace the first two bullets with the following one :The CH\_BANDWIDTH parameter may indicate a subset of the channels from those who were indicated in the RXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH SIGNALING of the DMG CTS frame that established the TXOP and from those who used in an immediately preceding received PPDU in the TXOP, if any, provided the transmitted PPDU is an EDMG PPDU. | Reject |

P183L28

*Discussion:*

*CID3055 Propose to resolve by making clear that the DMG CTS is sent in non-EDMG PPDU that is certainly not the EDMG PPDU that is mentioned in the second bullet*

*CID3562 the existent rule requires that the first data frame sent after TXOP negotiation uses the negotiated channel. Despite the editor note does not require to change the rule, the proposed change does. No reason to change the existent rule.*

*TGay editor modify as follows*

The CH\_BANDWIDTH parameter shall be set to channels that were indicated in the RXVECTOR parameters CH\_BANDWIDTH SIGNALING or CT\_Type of the DMG CTS frame conveyed in non-EDMG duplicate or non-EDMG PPDU that established the TXOP.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Line** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3353 | 91.00 | 6 | 9.4.2.127.7 | TDD Channel Access Supported subfield should be set to a value depending on a MIB variable, which is missing. | Define a MIB variable controling TDD Channel Access mode operation at the STA. Set TDD Channel Access Supported subfield and any other normative behaviors based on this MIB value. | Reject |

Discussion: The MIB role is most important when it is not accompanied by relevant capability like in case of dot11SpectrumManagementRequired. In a case that the capability exists, reference to the capability is widely used in the spec. In the latter case the MIB attribute may be defined or maybe not. The TDD channel access supported capability is defined in the 9.4.2.127.7 TDD Capability Information field, so no requirement to have the MIB attribute.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Line** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3066 | 30.00 | 39 | 6.3.3.2.2 | Part of the work in P802E Privacy Recommendations has been oriented towards reducing the number of unnecessary information elements added into the standard. Here it is proposed to add a number of information elements to the MLME-SCAN.request-primitive (namely ScanSectorList and SectorDwellTime).Other information elements in the MLME-SCAN.request primitive that are associted with optional features, carry conditions such as "Optionally present if <MIB variable> is set to true" or "Only present if <condition for presence>". This should be the case for TDD element in this primitive as well. | Make the presence of TDD indicators in the primitive contingent upon a TDD feature indication being present, and allow the TDD indicator to be absent otherwise. | Revised  |

*TGay editor modify as follows*

P31L1

*In each row in the rightest column of the table append* "The parameter is present if the TDD Channel Access Supported subfield is set to 1 in the TDD Capability Information field and is absent otherwise”

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Line** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3409 | 180.00 | 11 | 10.6.7.2 | Not clear whether the rate selection rule applies to a control frame aggregated in an AMPDU with QoS data | Specify these rules does not apply to a control frame aggregated in an AMPDU with QoS data frames | Reject |

*Discussion: the proposed change already exists in the 10.6.7.3 Rate selection for group addressed Data and Management frames transmitted by DMG STAs (IEEE P802.11-REVmd/D1.6, October 2018)*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Line** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3410 | 180.00 | 27 | 10.6.7.2 | this sentence seems already covered by the same/similar requirement in p181 L29 | remove the sentence | Accept |

*Discussion: Rule in P182L29 (10.6.7.6 Channel Width selection for Control frames transmitted by EDMG STAs) is more general and covers both cases (see below the text comparison), so agree to remove the text as proposed. The text is in P181L28 (D2.1)*

P181L28

A STA that sends a control frame in an **EDMG PPDU** in response to a frame carried in an EDMG PPDU shall set the TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH to indicate a channel width that is the same as the channel width indicated by the RXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH of the frame eliciting the response.

P182L29

An EDMG STA that sends a Control frame in response to a frame carried in an EDMG PPDU shall set the TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH to the value indicated by the RXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH of the frame eliciting the response.

**References:**

IEEE P802.11ay/D2.1, October 2018