IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CR for WUR frame format (part 2) | | | | |
| Date: 2018-11-12 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Woojin Ahn | WILUS | 216, Hwangsaeul-ro, Seongnam-si, Gyeonggi-do, Korea | +82-31-712-0523 | [woojin.ahn@wilusgroup.com](mailto:woojin.ahn@wilusgroup.com) |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. | 5775 Morehouse Dr, San Diego, CA 92109 | +1-858-658-5302 | [aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com](mailto:aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com) |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for comments related to TGba D1.0 with the following CIDs (6 CIDs):

* 36, 103, 402, 623, 855, 1065

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGba Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGba Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGba Editor” are instructions to the TGax editor to modify existing material in the TGba draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGba editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGba Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 36 | Albert Petrick | 50.52 | The bullet identifies a WUR ID based on a greater than or equal to condition. The sentence needs to be restructured with clarity. |  | REJECTED  The two conditions in the cited paragraph can not be merged. If the receiving non-AP finds a WUR ID greater than its WUR ID, it may discard the frame. However, If the STA finds a WUD ID equal to its WUR ID, it shall continue receiving and check the FCS. |
| 103 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 50.51 | "If either of the following is true" replace with "after one of the following conditions is satisifed" | As in comment. | REVISED  Agree in principle with the comment.  The proposed resolution is to clarify the text in a new subclause  TGba editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/1917r0 under all headings that include CID 103. |
| 402 | James Lepp | 50.49 | Strange to be defining in the standard when a STA can "discard" a frame. What does discarding a frame even mean? | Remove the last paragraph of 31.3.4 | REJECTED  Considering the long airtime of LDR or VL WUR frame, and the duty-cycle operation of WUR STA, it is undesirable if a WUR STA captures a frame that is not intended to it (increased power consumption, increased probability of missing actual WUR frames addressed to it, etc). Also, please refer to baseline as well where “discarding” a frame is consistently used. |
| 623 | Mark RISON | 50.49 | "A WUR STA that supports reception of VL WUR frames may discard a received VL WUR Wake Up frame  if either of the following is true:  --- Immediately after locating a WUR ID field in the Frame Body field that is greater than the WUR ID  assigned to it and no WUR ID equal to the WUR ID assigned to it was identified prior to it,  --- Immediately after locating the last WUR ID field in the Frame Body field and the WUR ID is less  than the WUR ID assigned to it."" is both grammatically broken (""may discard if immediately after locating"") and technically broken (surely it must discard if it is not identified?)" | Change to "A WUR STA that supports reception of VL WUR frames shall discard a received VL WUR Wake Up frame if it does not contain the WUR ID assigned to the WUR STA." (early termination per the first bullet is just an implementation optimisation enabled by the rules on WUR ID ordering) | REVISED  Disagree in principle with the comment. Although do agree that it has to be a mandatory behavior.  If the STA does not discard a frame that is not intended to it then it risks losing a WUR PPDU that may be intended to it sent by the AP at about the same (but later) time compared to the discarded frame.  Proposed resolution adds more clarifications to these rules.  TGba editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/1917r0 under all headings that include CID 623. |
| 855 | Po-Kai Huang | 50.49 | A WUR STA can discard the reception of WUR frames based on many other criteria. I wonder if we need to list all of them. For example, WUR STA identifies in frame control that the frame is not supported due to not supported frame type, not supported frame length, not supported protection mode. The WUR STA can also discard the reception if identify through WUR preamble that the data rate is not supported. | List all the criteria in a separate section or remove this paragraph. | REVISED  Agree in principle with the comment.  Other than VL WUR Wake-up frame, WUR STA can early discard the receiving WUR frame.  The criteria for the early discarding can be generalized by the following conditions,  1) the Type/Protected/Length present subfield in The Frame Control field indicates that the frame is not supported by the non-AP STA.  2) The ID field contains none of the expected identifiers of the STA  (The above two criteria are addressed in 11-18/1835r3)  3) The Frame Body field of a VL WUR Wake-up frame does not contain any of the assigned WUR identifiers with respect to the ordering rule.  A WUR frame with unsupported rate will be filtered out by the PHY as already defined in the Figure 32-15 (PHY receive state machine)  The proposed resolution is to add a new subclause for WUR frame processing and list the aforementioned criteria.  TGba editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/1917r0 under all headings that include CID 855. |
| 1065 | Woojin Ahn | 50.49 | The referred paragraph is normative behavior of non-AP STA upon reception of VL WUF. | Move the paragraph to 31.7.3 | REVISED  Agree in principle with the comment.  The proposed resolution is to move and rephrase the text in a new subclause  TGba editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/1917r0 under all headings that include CID 1065. |

**Discussion: None**

* Setting the identifiers of WUR frames
* WUR ID

**TGba Editor: *delete the following paragraph of this subclause (#CID 103, 623, 855, 1065)***

* *(#103, 623, 855, 1065)*

**TGba Editor: *Insert a new subclause as follows (#CID 103, 623, 855, 1065):***

31.2a WUR frame processing

* A WUR non-AP STA shall discard a received VL WUR Wake-up frame when any of the following events occur:A WUR ID field in the Frame Body field is greater than the WUR ID assigned to the WUR non-AP STA and has no WUR ID equal to the WUR ID assigned to the WUR non-AP STA identified prior to it,
* The last WUR ID field in the Frame Body field is less than the WUR ID assigned to it. *(#103, 623, 855, 1065)*