IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Suggested resolution to MIB comments |
| Date: 2018-09-12 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Company | Address | Phone | email |
| Kazuyuki Sakoda | Sony |  |  | Kazuyuki.Sakoda (at) sony (dot) com |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document provides suggested resolutions to CID 1245, 1246, and 1247. They are all related to error in MIB definitions.

R0: initial proposal.

R1: includes updates per discussion with Mark Hamilton

# Comment:

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **PP.LL** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Suggested Resolution** |
| 1247 | 3764.07 | dot11STACivicLocation is a control variable, but its MAX-ACCESS is not-accessible. Why we cannot access it? | Please clarify. | REVISED: Adopt changes proposed in doc11-18/1636. |

# Discussion:

MAX-ACCESS of the dot11STACivicLocation is supposed to be read-write, as it is a control variable written by an external management entity or the SME.

FYI, there are some more issue with the MIB variable. There is no reference to dot11STACivicLocation in main body of the standard. The same thing apply to dot11STACivicLocationType.

Furthermore, it seems that dot11STACivicLocationConfigTable is poorly defined and probably does not pass MIB compilation. In description of “dot11RMCivicConfigured”, there is a reference to dot11STACivicLocationEntry. However, dot11STACivicLocationEntry is not defined anywhere.

# Suggested resolution:

**Option 1**: Remove the following MIB definitions:

* dot11STACivicLocationType
* dot11STACivicLocation
* dot11STACivicLocationConfigTable
* dot11STACivicLocationConfiguration
* dot11STACivicLocationConfig.
* Also, remove reference to dot11STACivicLocationEntry inside the description of the dot11RMCivicConfigured.

**Option 2**: Change MAX-ACCESS of the dot11STACivicLocation as follows:

dot11STACivicLocation OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX OCTET STRING

 MAX-ACCESS read-write

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "This is a control variable.

 It is written by an external management entity or the SME.

 Changes take effect as soon as practical in the implementation.

 Civic Location is defined in 9.4.2.21.13 (Location Civic report)."

 ::= { dot11STACivicLocationConfiguration 2 }

The suggested option here is option 2, considering the task group timeline, i.e., finishing comment resolution shortly.

# Comment:

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **PP.LL** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Suggested Resolution** |
| 1246 | 3860.57 | dot11S1GTravelingPilotOptionActivated is a control variable, but its MAX-ACCESS is read-only. It should be read-write. The same problem are seen with dot11S1GLONGOptionActivated, dot11NonAPStationAuthAccessCategories, dot11NonAPStationAuthMaxVideoRate, dot11NonAPStationAuthMaxBestEffortRate, dot11NonAPStationAuthMaxBackgroundRate, dot11NonAPStationAuthMaxVoiceOctets, dot11NonAPStationAuthMaxVideoOctets, dot11NonAPStationAuthMaxBestEffortOctets, dot11NonAPStationAuthMaxBackgroundOctets, dot11NonAPStationAuthMaxHCCAHEMMOctets, dot11NonAPStationAuthMaxTotalOctets, dot11NonAPStationAuthMaxHCCAHEMMRate, etc. | Replace "read-only" with "read-write" w.r.t. the variables cited in the comment. | REVISED: Adopt changes proposed in doc11-18/xxx. |

# Discussion:

Based on the guideline given by ARC SC, 11-15/355r13, “MIB TruthValue usage patterns”. We should amend control MIB as follows:

* If the value is written by an external entity beyond “STA”, its MAX-ACCESS is read-write.
* If the value is written by SME of the STA, its MAX-ACCESS is read-only. (This part have been changed recently)

# Suggested resolution:

dot11S1GTravelingPilotOptionActivated OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX TruthValue

 MAX-ACCESS read-write

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "This is a control variable.

 It is written by an external management entity.

 Changes take effect as soon as practical in the implementation.

 This attribute, when true, indicates that the traveling pilot option is enabled."

 DEFVAL { false }

 ::= { dot11PhyS1GEntry 27 }

dot11S1GLONGOptionActivated OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX TruthValue

 MAX-ACCESS read-write

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "This is a control variable.

 It is written by an external management entity.

 Changes take effect as soon as practical in the implementation.

 This attribute, when true, indicates that the S1G\_Long operation is enabled."

 DEFVAL { false }

 ::= { dot11PhyS1GEntry 29 }

# Comment:

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **PP.LL** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Suggested Resolution** |
| 1245 | 3728.26 | dot11GCRActivated is a control variable, but its MAX-ACCESS is read-only. It should be read-write. The same problem are seen with dot11AdvancedGCRActivated, dot11SCSActivated, dot11QLoadReportActivated, dot11AlternateEDCAActivated, dot11GCRGroupMembershipAnnouncementActivated, dot11APPMActivated, dot11BDTImplemented, etc. | Replace "read-only" with "read-write" w.r.t. the variables cited in the comment. | REVISED: Adopt changes proposed in doc11-18/xxx. |

# Discussion:

Most of the problem is supposed to be introduced by “copy and paste” error.

# Suggested resolution:

dot11GCRActivated OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX TruthValue

 MAX-ACCESS read-write

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "This is a control variable.

 It is written by the SME or external management entity.

 Changes take effect for the next MLME-START.request primitive

 or MLME-JOIN.request primitive.

 This attribute, when true, indicates that the station

 implementation supports the GCR procedures as defined in 11.22.16.3 (GCR procedures) and that this has been activated."

 DEFVAL { false }

 ::= { dot11AVOptionsEntry 1 }

dot11SCSActivated OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX TruthValue

 MAX-ACCESS read-write

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "This is a control variable.

 It is written by the SME or external management entity.

 Changes take effect for the next MLME-START.request primitive

 or MLME-JOIN.request primitive.

 This attribute, when true, indicates that the station implementation supports the stream classification service and that this has been activated."

 DEFVAL { false }

 ::= { dot11AVOptionsEntry 5 }

dot11QLoadReportActivated OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX TruthValue

 MAX-ACCESS read-write

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "This is a control variable.

 It is written by the SME or external management entity.

 Changes take effect for the next MLME-START.request primitive.

 This attribute, when true, indicates that the AP performs the QLoad report procedures described in 11.26.2 (QLoad Report element)."

 DEFVAL { false }

 ::= { dot11AVOptionsEntry 6 }

dot11AlternateEDCAActivated OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX TruthValue

 MAX-ACCESS read-write

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "This is a control variable.

 It is written by the SME or external management entity.

 Changes take effect for the next MLME-START.request primitive.

 This attribute, when true, indicates that the station can additionally use the Alternate EDCA transmit queues."

 DEFVAL { false }

 ::= { dot11AVOptionsEntry 7 }

dot11GCRGroupMembershipAnnouncementActivated OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX TruthValue

 MAX-ACCESS read-write

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "This is a control variable.

 It is written by the SME or external management entity.

 Changes take effect as soon as practical in the implementation.

 This attribute, when true, indicates that the STA sends unsolicited Group Membership Response frames when its dot11GroupAddressesTable changes."

 DEFVAL { false }

 ::= { dot11AVOptionsEntry 8 }

dot11APPMActivated OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX TruthValue

 MAX-ACCESS read-write

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "This is a control variable.

 It is written by an external management entity.

 Changes take effect as soon as practical in the implementation.

 This attribute indicates if the AP may go to doze state."

 DEFVAL { false }

 ::= { dot11S1GStationConfigEntry 50}

dot11BDTImplemented OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX TruthValue

 MAX-ACCESS read-write

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "This is a control variable.

 It is written by an external management entity.

 Changes take effect as soon as practical in the implementation.

 This attribute, when true, indicates that the station implementation is capable of supporting the bidirectional TXOP Operation. The capability is disabled, otherwise."

 DEFVAL { false }

 ::= { dot11S1GStationConfigEntry 51}

# Reference:

[1] Draft P802.11REVmd\_D1.4.

[2] 11-17/670 “REVmd Working Group Comments for PHY ad-hoc”

[3] 11-15/355r13 “MIB TruthValue usage patterns”