IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Minutes REVmd - August Telecons |
| Date: 2018-08-10 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 WHighland, UT 84003 | +1-201-492-4023 | jrosdahl@ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the IEEE 802.11md “REVmd” for the August 10 and 24 2018 Telecon

R0: August 10th Telecon

Teleconferences are subject to applicable policies and procedures, see below.

==================================================

•       IEEE Code of Ethics

–       <http://www.ieee.org/about/corporate/governance/p7-8.html>

•       IEEE Standards Association (IEEE-SA) Affiliation FAQ

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliation.html>

•       Antitrust and Competition Policy

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/resources/antitrust-guidelines.pdf>

•       IEEE-SA Patent Policy

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/bylaws/sect6-7.html>

–       [https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public//mytools/mob/loa.pdf](http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt)

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/faq.pdf>

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>

•       IEEE 802 Working Group Policies &Procedures (29 Jul 2016)

–       <http://www.ieee802.org/PNP/approved/IEEE_802_WG_PandP_v19.pdf>

•       IEEE 802 LMSC Chair's Guidelines (Approved 09 Mar 2018)

–       <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/17/ec-17-0120-26-0PNP-ieee-802-lmsc-chairs-guidelines.pdf>

•       Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings

–       <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>

•       IEEE 802.11 WG OM: (Approved 10 Nov 2017)

–       <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-0629-21-0000-802-11-operations-manual.docx>

1. **802.11md - REVmd – Telecon, Friday 10 August, 2018, 10:00- 12:00 ET**
	1. **Call to Order** at 10:03 ET by the TG Chair, Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
	2. **Attendance:**
		1. Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
		2. Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
		3. Emily QI (Intel)
		4. Mark HAMILTON (ARRIS/Ruckus)
		5. Mark RISON (Samsung)
		6. Michael MONEMURRO (Blackberry)
	3. **Review of Patent Policy**
		1. **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**
			1. Call for essential patents – No comments.
		2. Participation slide: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>
	4. **Agenda Review – 11-18/1351r7**
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1351-07-000m-tgmd-2018-july-august-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agenda.docx>

1. Call to order, attendance, and patent policy

a.   **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.  Participation slide: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>

2.   Editor report – Emily QI (Intel)

a.       Editor report document, 11-17-920

b.      Comments received LB 232 are here: 11-18-611

3.   Comment resolution:

**2018-8-10**

1. Additional ESP Gen CIDs: 1049, 1050, 1051, 1058, 1059, 1060, 1052, see 11-18-1375r1
2. Mike MONTEMURRO CIDs
3. Edward AU – Editor2 CIDs; 11-18-1367
4. Sigurd S 11-18-701 CIDs
5. Additional CIDs as available

4.  AOB:

 5. Adjourn

* + 1. The above Agenda was the result of identifying who was ready for today – See R8 for approved agenda document
			1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1351-08-000m-tgmd-2018-july-august-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agenda.docx>
	1. **Editor Report**
		1. Review of D1.3 has been posted to members area
		2. Comment Spreadsheet 11-18/611r7 is current spreadsheet
			1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0611-07-000m-revmd-wg-ballot-comments.xls>
		3. Thanks to Reviewers for preparing D1.3
		4. Working on D1.4 – Will roll in 11ak and will be ready in about 1.5 weeks.
		5. Thanks to Emily for Hosting AdHoc last week.
	2. **Review doc 11-18-1375r1** Matthew Fischer (Broadcom) – presented by the Chair, Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1375-01-000m-lb232-cr-esp-bis.docx>
		2. Review Document
			1. The updated doc with the new CIDs does not make changes other than what was proposed previously.
			2. CID 1049, 1050, 1051, 1058, 1059, 1060 (GEN)
				1. Review proposed changes
				2. Proposed Resolution: CID 1049, 1050, 1051: Revise – TGmd editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1192r23 for D1.2 subclause 6.3.102.2.2 and 6.3.102.3.2 which modify the wording of the use of the terms cited by the commenter while noting that the entries in the column with the label “Description” do in fact, provide a definition of the cited parameters. The terms are not changed to uplink and downlink, as the primitive might still be used for cases when there is ambiguity in the meaning of the directions up and down.
				3. Proposed Resolution CID 1058 and 1059: Revise – TGmd editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1192r23 for D1.2 subclause 6.3.102.2.2 and 6.3.102.3.2 which modify the wording to make a correction similar to the one suggested by the commenter.
				4. Proposed Resolution CID 1060 (GEN): Revise – TGmd editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1192r23 for D1.2 subclause 6.3.102.2.2 and 6.3.102.3.2 which modify the wording to make a correction similar to the one suggested by the commenter. The terms are not changed to uplink and downlink, as the primitive might still be used for cases when there is ambiguity in the meaning of the directions up and down.
	3. PHY CIDs – Mike MONTEMURRO
		1. CID 1067 (PHY)
			1. Pending a submission from Emily QI
		2. CID 1057 (PHY)
			1. Commenter has withdrawn the comment
			2. Mark ready for motion
		3. CID 1056 (MAC)
			1. Commenter has withdrawn the comment
			2. Mark ready for motion
		4. CID 1393 (PHY)
			1. Review comment
			2. Propose to correct units
			3. It also clarifies which Join to use.
			4. Proposed Resolution: Accept
			5. Mark Ready for Motion
		5. CID 1521 (PHY)
			1. Previously we marked rejected but we have not motioned it.
			2. Review to ensure process completed.
			3. It is an Annex G comment.
			4. Review minutes from April Adhoc: 11-18/680r0
				1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0680-00-000m-minutes-revmd-adhoc-april-2018-ft-lauderdale.docx>
				2. Quote:
		6. CID 1521 (PHY)
			1. Review comment
			2. Review 3992.29 for context.
			3. Changing only one “These frames” seems to be unnecessary.
			4. Discussion on if the change to “These Data Frames require acknowledgment” is a good thing or not.
			5. The location is a specific exchange sequence acknowledgement definition, not a whole list of all possible acknowledgement required frame exchanges.
		7. CID 1521 (PHY)
			1. Review proposed change
			2. Discussion on the point we ended up with the discussion just prior to lunch. Deleting the comment text was proposed, rather than adding “Data”.
			3. There is not enough consensus to make a change at this time.
			4. Proposed Resolution: Rejected – the current text is unambiguous and accurate. The cited text is a comment and additional precision is not necessary.
			5. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
			6. There was discussion on the minutes and the notes to determine if this was a complete and accurate response.
			7. Comment that we need to identify that it is the Data Frames being identified.
			8. After the discussion, no objection to change proposed resolution to Accept.
			9. Change Resolution to Accept
			10. Mark Ready for Motion
	4. **Review Document 11-18/1367r0** Edward AU (Huawei) presented by the Chair, Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
		1. Edward was not able to attend – presented by Dorothy.
		2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1367-00-000m-revmd-lb232-editor2-ad-hoc-related-comment-resolutions.docx>
		3. CID 1038 (EDITOR2)
			1. Review comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: Revised; The OFDM vectors are removed and the DMGEncodingExamples.zip file embedded in the IEEE 802.11 Working Group document is now updated as 11-12/0751r1 at <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/12/11-12-0751-01-00ad-dmg-encoding-examples.docx.>

Note to editor: CID 1037 is similar, and the resolution to 1037 was approved in July 2018, Motion 49.

* + - 1. Mark Ready for Motion
		1. CID 1070 (EDITOR2)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review Context
			3. Discussion on what the titles should be changed.
		2. Proposed Resolution: **Revised;** Change the title of clause 10.4 to “MSDU and MMPDU fragmentation”. And Change the title of clause 10.5 to “MSDU and MMPDU defragmentation”.
		3. Mark ready for Motion
		4. CID 1072 (EDITOR2)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review Context and proposed changes
			3. Discussion on keeping “procedure” rather than deleting as proposed.
			4. Adjustments to the proposed changes were made and will be in R1 of the document.
			5. P3674.24 (d1.2) there is another instance of *“synchronization (Sync)” with “sync”* that should be made in second column.
			6. P1782.63, “Sync frame” to “sync frame”
			7. Note that this is not a “frame” name, but rather an upper layer construct.
			8. several instances on P2186 change “Sync frame” to “sync frame”
			9. line 27, 31 (2x), 36, 40, 41, 43, 51, 53, 55, 61, 62, 63 (2x) “Sync” to “sync”
			10. P2187.14 “Sync” to “sync”
			11. Discussion on if we should change packet to frame or visa-versa.
			12. More discussion on the Packet-frame issue is needed, in different clauses, it may need to switch a different direction.
			13. Propose to let it be on the next letter ballot, or when a submission is ready (whether before or after Sept meeting).
			14. Proposed resolution: Revise incorporate the changes for 1072 in doc 11-18/1367r1 < <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1367-01-000m-revmd-lb232-editor2-ad-hoc-related-comment-resolutions.docx> >
			15. Mark ready for motion
		5. CID 1084 (EDITOR2)
			1. Review comment
			2. Review the proposed change
			3. Adjustments to the proposed change were made to keep changes consistent.
			4. Proposed Resolution: Revise incorporate the changes for CID 1084 in doc 11-18/1367r1 < <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1367-01-000m-revmd-lb232-editor2-ad-hoc-related-comment-resolutions.docx> >
			5. Mark ready for Motion
	1. **Review doc 11-18/0701r1** Sigurd Schelstraete (Quantenna) (Presented by Dorothy STANLEY)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0701-01-000m-cids-1388-and-1359.docx>
		2. CID 1359 (PHY)
			1. Review comment
			2. Not yet resolved – still open assigned to Sigurd
			3. Reviewed Minutes from May interim (11-18/616r0) on this CID
				1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0616-00-000m-minutes-revmd-may-2018-warsaw.docx>
				2. Quote:
		3. CID 1359 (PHY)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review proposed change
			3. Discussion on the value of the NOTE being in the diagram as apposed to outside the diagram.
			4. Suggestion to add the new sentence as an addition
			5. The NOTE should say that an STBC Block is present even when not used.
			6. Proposed resolution: Change the paragraph starting at line 38, page 2754 as shown in 802.11-18/0701r0.
			7. More fine tuning to be done.
			8. More discussion on the resolution.
			9. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2018-08-10 15:26:52Z) Incorporate the changes indicated for CID 1359 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0701-01-000m-cids-1388-and-1359.docx>
			10. Mark ready for Motion
		4. CID 1388 (PHY)
			1. Motioned in #52 as a Rejected CID during the May Interim in Warsaw.
			2. Review Situation, there is still a concern on this CID
			3. Review 2748.35 (d1.2)
			4. Request to defer until we get more opinion and input on this CID.
			5. The Chair wants the discussion that was held in email be incorporated into the submission for discussion.
			6. Review the previous Email exchange from the reflector:
				1. <http://www.ieee802.org/11/email/stds-802-11-tgm/msg01369.html>
			7. ACTION ITEM #1: Mark RISON – prepare a submission to put all the proposed changes for CID 1388 in context in one submission and announce to reflector.
			8. Note that CID 1388 has been motioned, so without a submission, it will default to being done as rejected.
	2. **Review Agenda plan going forward**
		1. Capture changes in 11-18/1351r8
			1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1351-08-000m-tgmd-2018-july-august-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agenda.docx>
		2. Plans for next Telecon on Aug 24th the Telecon for Aug 17th has been cancelled.

**2018-8-17 – Cancelled**

* + 1. Comment Resolution for Next Telcon:

**2018-8-24**

1. David Goodall – 11-18-1177 11ah TXOP limits, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1177-00-000m-802-11ah-txop-limits.docx>
2. Mark HAMILTON – CIDs 1507, 1525, CIDs 1100, 1104, 1102 in 11-18-1369
3. Mark RISON CID 1465, 1387 & 1388
4. 11ah CIDs, including 11-18-1099 and 11-18-1100
	1. **Review Comment status**
		1. On the order of 90 that have a proposed change that needs to be addressed.
	2. **Review Sept Interim Session Mtg Slot plan**
		1. We currently have 5 slots scheduled.
		2. We may want to add 1 or two on Monday and/or Tuesday Evening.
		3. We may have to push the submission required CIDs last.
		4. If we don’t make Sept for LB, then we will make November, so if we make it great, but if not, it is not the end of the world, and we can complete more Submission required CIDs that would come back up again.
	3. **Review Draft contents**
		1. D1.0 had TGai, and TGah
		2. D1.2 has TGaj
		3. D1.3 has changes from July
		4. D1.4 will have TGak by Sept.
	4. **Request to revisit PHY CIDs**
		1. CID 1387 (PHY)
			1. CID 1387 is similar to CID 1388
			2. Assign CID 1387 to be included with CID 1388 with Mark RISON new submission. (see Action item #1)
			3. ACTION ITEM #2: Mark RISON to talk with Menzo who was assigned to CID 1387.
		2. CID 1587 (PHY)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review context 2893.15
			3. Similar to CID 1329
			4. From REVmd TGmd Adhoc in FT. Lauderdale minutes – 11-18/680r0:
				1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0680-00-000m-minutes-revmd-adhoc-april-2018-ft-lauderdale.docx>
				2. Quote:

1.7.1.16 ACTION ITEM #4: Mark HAMILTON - Prepare a submission on the 3 CIDs (1329, 1587,1621) to outline the question. Do we want to allow 2.4, or preclude or do we want to limit to only 5Ghz or allow adding 6Ghz band… and what about 11ax – Note that CID 1621 is only reference as Peter E is preparing a submission on this one. – See **CIDs 1329, 1236**

* + - 1. Concern that this CID was marked Submission Required and wanted to ensure it was discussed.
			2. The Concern that this CID would not be included in the bulk reject for Submission Required CIDs.
			3. The chair stated that All CIDS would get appropriate attention and discussion and any rejection would be on a case by case basis.
	1. **Adjourned 12:02 pm ET.**

**References:**

**August 10, 2018:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1351-07-000m-tgmd-2018-july-august-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agenda.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1351-08-000m-tgmd-2018-july-august-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agenda.docx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0611-07-000m-revmd-wg-ballot-comments.xls>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1375-01-000m-lb232-cr-esp-bis.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0680-00-000m-minutes-revmd-adhoc-april-2018-ft-lauderdale.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1367-00-000m-revmd-lb232-editor2-ad-hoc-related-comment-resolutions.docx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/12/11-12-0751-01-00ad-dmg-encoding-examples.docx.>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1367-01-000m-revmd-lb232-editor2-ad-hoc-related-comment-resolutions.docx>
9. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0701-01-000m-cids-1388-and-1359.docx>
10. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0616-00-000m-minutes-revmd-may-2018-warsaw.docx>
11. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0701-01-000m-cids-1388-and-1359.docx>
12. <http://www.ieee802.org/11/email/stds-802-11-tgm/msg01369.html>
13. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0680-00-000m-minutes-revmd-adhoc-april-2018-ft-lauderdale.docx>

**ACTION ITEMS List:**

ACTION ITEM #1: Mark RISON – prepare a submission to put all the proposed changes for CID 1388 in context in one submission and announce to reflector. Note that CID 1388 has been motioned, so without a submission, it will default to being done as rejected.

ACTION ITEM #2: Mark RISON to talk with Menzo who was assigned to CID 1387.