IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes REVmd - July Telecon | | | | |
| Date: 2018-07-27 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-201-492-4023 | jrosdahl@ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the IEEE 802.11md “REVmd” on 27 July 2018 Telecon

Teleconferences are subject to applicable policies and procedures, see below.

==================================================

•       IEEE Code of Ethics

–       <http://www.ieee.org/about/corporate/governance/p7-8.html>

•       IEEE Standards Association (IEEE-SA) Affiliation FAQ

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliation.html>

•       Antitrust and Competition Policy

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/resources/antitrust-guidelines.pdf>

•       IEEE-SA Patent Policy

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/bylaws/sect6-7.html>

–       [https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public//mytools/mob/loa.pdf](http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt)

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/faq.pdf>

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>

•       IEEE 802 Working Group Policies &Procedures (29 Jul 2016)

–       <http://www.ieee802.org/PNP/approved/IEEE_802_WG_PandP_v19.pdf>

•       IEEE 802 LMSC Chair's Guidelines (Approved 09 Mar 2018)

–       <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/17/ec-17-0120-26-0PNP-ieee-802-lmsc-chairs-guidelines.pdf>

•       Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings

–       <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>

•       IEEE 802.11 WG OM: (Approved 10 Nov 2017)

–       <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-0629-21-0000-802-11-operations-manual.docx>

1. **802.11md - REVmd – Telecon, Friday July 27, 2018, 10:00- 12:00 ET**
   1. **Call to Order** at 10:03 ET by the TG Chair, Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
   2. **Attendance:**
      1. Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
      2. Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
      3. Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Mark HAMILTON (ARRIS/Ruckus)
      5. Mark RISON (Samsung)
      6. Osama ABOUL-MAGD (Huawei)
      7. Yujin NOH (Newracom)
      8. Michael MONEMURRO (Blackberry)
      9. Edward AU (Huawei)
      10. Graham SMITH (SR-Technology
      11. Nehru BHANDARU (Broadcom)
   3. **Review of Patent Policy**
      1. **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**
         1. Call for essential patents – No comments.
      2. Participation slide: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>
   4. **Agenda Review – 11-18/1351r0**
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1351-00-000m-tgmd-2018-july-august-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agenda.docx>

1.       Call to order, attendance, and patent policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA ([patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.      Participation slide: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>

2.       Editor report – Emily QI (Intel)

a.       Editor report document, 11-17-920

b.      Comments received LB 232 are here: 11-18-611

3.       Comment resolution.

**2018-07-24**

1. Emily QI (Intel)– Editor CIDs, any comment resolution incorporation issues
2. Yujin NOH (Newracom) – CID 1062 in 11-18-1349
3. Mark RISON (Samsung) – CIDs in 11-18-1306

4.       AOB: Ad-Hoc Agenda review;

Reminder to email Emily QI if you plan to attend (Email: [emily.h.qi@intel.com](mailto:emily.h.qi@intel.com))

5.       Adjourn

* + 1. No objection to Agenda for today
  1. **Editor Report**
     1. Comments (103) in July Meeting have been approved and about 80 completed.
     2. Review of D1.3 is being reviewed for posting end of next week.
     3. Comment Spreadsheet 11-18/611r6 is current spreadsheet
     4. Issues with conflicts in -Motion number 58 (Nehru BHANDARU in 11-18/1353) and CID 1062 (Yujin will give update on CID 1062)
  2. **Review doc 11-18/1353r1** Nehru BHANDARU (Broadcom)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1353-01-000m-ociv-update.docx>
     2. From document Abstract
        1. Document 11-17/1807/r12 proposed changes to support operating channel validation. The changes were based on Draft P802.11REVmd\_D0.3.pdf and was adopted by TGmd for incorporation into TGmd draft during the July 2018 IEEE 802 plenary meeting. Resolution for CID 1365 changed some of the text that was also changed by 1807/r12. This document proposes a small editorial update to resolve the merge conflict between the two changes. There is no change to the semantics or the mechanism used for operating channel validation. The changes proposed are relative to TGmd Draft 1.3-0221 that is currently under preparation.
     3. Review submission
     4. Editors have reviewed the proposed changes and have had reviewers look at the paragraph to ensure the correct changes are applied in proper order to end up with the correct final.
     5. Message 2 is the only change being requested.
     6. Not a technical change, but an editorial change to fix notation to use the new notations.
     7. This proposal "fixes" conflicts between 11-17/1807 and the resolution to CID 1365. CID 1365 took text from 11-18/899r4 (but it is in-line, in the resolution) and is in the Comment Resolution Spreadsheet.
     8. Notation on Message 2 and 3 seemed to miss the proper use of “OR”.
        1. Message 2:   Supplicant ® Authenticator: EAPOL-Key(0,1,0,0, P,0,0,SNonce,MIC,{RSNE} OR{RSNE, OCI KDE})
        2. Message 3:   Authenticator ® Supplicant: EAPOL-Key(1,1,1,1, P,0,KeyRSC,ANonce,MIC,{RSNE,GTK[N]} or {RSNE, GTK[N], OCI KDE})
     9. The sentence in the NOTE needed to be edited to parse better.
        1. Original quoted note: “OCI KDE represents the current operating channel information using which the EAPOL frame is sent.”
        2. Change “using” to “for the operating channel in “
        3. Change “represents” to “contains”
     10. Discussion on if OCI KDE is right term – should it just be OCI?
     11. Proposal to keep changes we discussed so far and not make more now, and allow comments in next round of balloting.
     12. Note in spreadsheet that this was reviewed on today’s call.
  3. **Review doc 11-18-1349** - Yujin NOH (Newracom)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1349-00-000m-instruct-the-editor-to-incorporate-dcn1062.docx>
     2. From Doc Abstract
        1. This submission shows
* Instruction for the 11md editor to make changes on LENGTH, APEP\_LENGTH and PSDU\_LENGTH parameters in Table 23-1 properly
  + 1. Editor noted during the roll-in of CID 1136 and CID 1013 a conflict.
    2. Three places of change in Table 23-1
       1. CID 1013 – 11-18/710r6
       2. CID 1136 – 11-18/1062r2
    3. Review submission for the corrected changes that are needed.
    4. Editors acknowledged that changes are clear enough for implementation.
    5. A change in the Comment spreadsheet would be made for CID 1136 to document the adjustment.
  1. **Review doc 11-18/1306r1** – Mark RISON (Samsung)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1306-01-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d1-0-lb232.docx>
     2. From Document Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for CIDs 1375, 1415, 1447, 1452, 1456, 1480, 1507, 1524, 1525, 1526 on 11md/D1.0. Green indicates material agreed to in the group, yellow material to be discussed, red material rejected by the group and cyan material not to be overlooked. The “Final” view should be selected in Word.

* + 1. CID 1456 and CID 1524 (GEN)
       1. Reviewed Comment
       2. Reviewed Proposed Changes
       3. Changes highlighted in yellow are not required now.
          1. They will be deleted in the next revision of this document.
       4. Some discussion on not deleting the highlighted changes.
       5. Use of PPDU vs PSDU in the changes.
       6. Editing of “as a” vs “in a” needs to be made throughout.
       7. ACTION ITEM #1: Mark RISON and Mark HAMILTON will review and adjust the “as a” and “in a” and the PSDU vs PPDU changes and bring back a revision. Also review yellow text for correctness.
       8. Still need to fix the use of frame as synonymous with PPDU
    2. CID 1415 and CID 1526 (MAC)
       1. Review comment
       2. Review proposed changes to make a general ACK policy
       3. Request for positive feedback from a broader group review.
       4. Implicit BAR has a double negative in the other description, but that is because of the non-A-MPDU
       5. Discussion on the ACK ACK terminology.
          1. Change to “ACK acknowledge policy”
       6. New table introduced by 11ah, these type changes were applied as well. There is a set of questions for the 11ah experts.
       7. Reviewed questions
          1. Discussion on can we set a separate 11ah condition rather than mixing the conditions for the Normal Ack.
          2. Discussion on Implicit BAR – used with acronym vs spelled out.
          3. In 9-528 the reference to subclause 10.3.2.10 is not correct.
    3. CID 1375 (MAC)
       1. Quickly described the Multiple streams question
       2. Some changes from “the” to “a” as there may be more than one.
    4. CID 1447 (MAC)
       1. Review comment
       2. At the July Plenary, Mark RISON was asked to demonstrate that there can't be an ACK or BlockAck later in the A-MPDU.
          1. Demonstration of this fact is in 11-18/1306r1.
       3. Proposed Resolution: Accept
       4. Mark ready for Motion
    5. CID 1507 and CID 1525 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment
       2. We need to fix the bugs before we make the wholesale changes
          1. There may be a case for PHY-TXBUSY.Indication is needed, so we should not make the change now as we will have to undo the change in the future.
          2. The discussion is whether the current spec needs it or not and if the current spec is correct.
          3. Logically when a PHY-TXSTART.request is sent, then one of two things happen.
       3. We need alternative text to not make the changes proposed in 11-18/1306r1.
       4. ACTION ITEM #2: Mark HAMILTON will provide alternative text by September 802W interim.
  1. **Review Plan for AdHoc** next week:
     1. Make start time 9:00 PT each day
     2. Request to have items for the Agenda be identified.
        1. Mark RISON requested some time in a PM1 slot for 11-18/1306.
        2. Emily QI will send document number to the Chair – Editorial discuss comment and Beacon Protection.
           1. Put Editorial on Tuesday PM2
           2. Put Beacon Protection CID 1066 on Wednesday, PM2
        3. Also add Mark RISON to Thursday PM1
        4. Add Mark HAMILTON to Wednesday PM2
     3. Add Michael MONTEMURRO – telecon for August 10
     4. Need to focus on GEN CIDs that have definitive proposed resolutions.
        1. Add on Tuesday, Wednesday and Thursday time as place holder
  2. **Adjourned 12:02 pm ET.**

**References:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1351-00-000m-tgmd-2018-july-august-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agenda.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1353-01-000m-ociv-update.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1349-00-000m-instruct-the-editor-to-incorporate-dcn1062.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1306-01-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d1-0-lb232.docx>