IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Resolutions to CID 1298 |
| Date: July 12, 2018 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Abhishek Patil | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | appatil@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Jouni Malinen | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | jouni@qca.qualcomm.com |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |
| George Cherian | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | gcherian@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Mark Hamilton | Ruckus Wireless |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for CID 1298 received for TGm LB232

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGm Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGm Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGm Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGm Editor” are instructions to the TGm editor to modify existing material in the TGm draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGm editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGm Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Pg / Ln** | **Section** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 1298 | Abhishek Patil | 1944.24 | 11.1.3.8 | The spec does not provide the ability to not inherit certain elements. For example, if a particular nontransmitted BSSID doesn't want to support or enable a particular feature that is supported by the transmitted BSSID, it cannot do so. For example, let's say the transmitted BSSID supports TWT but a particular nontransmitted BSSID doesn't want to enable TWT (for whatever reason - let's say because the number of STAs associated with that BSSID is small and manageble without enabling TWT), the spec doesn't allow this. As a result, STAs associated with that nontransmitted BSSID beleive the feature is enabled and the (TWT) element values are inherited from the transmitted BSSID. This can lead to unexpected behavior or unwanted signaling (such a request/reject) frames being exchanged between the AP and STAs. Further, STA may select and associate with a particular nontransmitted BSSID expecting certain features are (inherited and hence) supported. | Spec should provide a mechanism for a nontransmitted BSSID profile to indicate elements that this BSSID doesn't inherit from the transmitted BSSID and hence the corresponding feature is not support for STAs associated to that BSSID. | **Revised**Agree with the comment. AP can indicate that a particular nontransmitted BSSID does not inherit (i.e., conditional inheritance) an element by including a Non-Inheritance element in the corresponding nontransmitted BSSID profile and listing the Element ID value or Element ID Extension value in the element.**TGm Editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/1296r0 having a tag [1298]** |

*
* **Multiple BSSID procedure**

***TGm Editor: Please add the following at the end of the 3rd paragraph in this section (REVmd D1.1, P1943L24):***

… If any of the optional elements are not present in a nontransmitted BSSID profile, the corresponding values are the element values of the transmitted BSSID unless the element is listed in the Non-Inheritance element (if included) in the nontransmitted BSSID profile for that BSS.[1298]

* Multiple BSSID element

***TGm Editor: Please add a new bullet to the paragraph below Table 9-171 (REVmd D1.1, P1074L64):***

The Nontransmitted BSSID Profile subelement contains a list of elements for one or more APs or DMG STAs that have nontransmitted BSSIDs and is defined as follows:

* …
* When included in the Nontransmitted BSSID Profile subelement for this nontransmitted BSSID, the Non-Inheritance element (see 9.4.2.217a (Non-Inheritance element)) carries a list of elements that are not inherited by this nontransmitted BSSID from the transmitted BSSID.[1298]

***TGm Editor: Please add a new section after 9.4.2.217 (REVmd D1.1) as follows:***

9.4.2.217a Non-Inheritance element [1298]

The Non-Inheritance element can be present only in the Nontransmitted BSSID Profile subelement of a Multiple BSSID element. This element identifies one or more elements that not inherited by the BSS corresponding to the nontransmitted BSSID profile that carried it. The identified elements are present in the Management frame of the transmitted BSSID that carried the Multiple BSSID element.

The format of the Non-Inheritance element is shown in Figure 9-708aa (Non-Inheritance element format)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Element ID | Length | Element ID Extension | Element ID List(optional) | Element List Terminator(optional) | Element ID Extension List(optional) | Extension List Terminator(optional) |
| Octets: | 1 | 1 | 1 | variable | 0 or 1 | variable | 0 or 1 |
|  | **Figure 9-708aa – Non-Inheritance element format** |  |

The Element ID, Length, and Element ID Extension fields are defined in 9.4.2.1 (General).

The Element ID List field is optionally present and consists of a list of Element ID values, each one octet in length. Each element listed in the Element ID List field does not have an Element ID Extension field.

Element List Terminator field is present if the Element ID Extension List field contains at least one entry. The field is one octet in length and acts as a separator between elements carried in the Element ID List field and the ones carried in the Element ID Extension List field. When present, the Element List Terminator field is set to 255.

The Element ID Extension List field is optionally present and consists of list of Element ID Extension values, each one octet in length. Each element listed in the Element ID Extension List field has an Element ID Extension field and the Element ID field set to 255.

Extension List Terminator field is present if the Element ID Extension List field contains at least one entry. The field is one octet in length and indicates the end of the Element ID Extension List field. When present, the Extension List Terminator field is set to 255.

* **Elements**
* **General** [1298]

***TGm Editor: Please add a new row to Table 9-85 as follows:***

***Insert the following new rows into Table 9-85 (Element IDs) (header row shown for convenience):***

|  |
| --- |
| **Table 9-85 – Element IDs** |
| **Element** | **Element ID** | **Element ID Extension** | **Extensible** | **Fragmentable** |
| Non-Inheritance (see 9.4.2.217a (Non-Inheritance element)) | 255 | <ANA> | Yes | No |