IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| TGaq Minutes – January 2018 Session | | | | |
| Date: 2018-01-18 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Yunsong Yang | Huawei Technologies | 10180 Telesis Court, STE 165, San Diego, CA 92130 | +1-858-754-3638 | [yangyunsong@huawei.com](mailto:yangyunsong@huawei.com) |

Abstract

Minutes for TGaq during the IEEE 802.11 January 2018 interim meeting in Irvine, CA, U.S.A., including 4 sessions: Tuesday AM2, Wednesday AM1, Thursday AM2, and Thursday PM2.

Meeting: TGaq

Place: Irvine, CA, U.S.A.

Officers:

* Chair: Stephen MCCANN (BlackBerry)
* Vice-Chair: Yunsong YANG (Huawei)
* Technical Editor: Lee ARMSTRONG (US DoT) - not present during the week.

**Tuesday January 16th, 2018**

# TGaq 10:30-12:30 (AM2) local time

1. Called to order at 10:30 local time by Stephen McCann.
2. Attendance: 16.
3. Establish secretary for the week

* Yunsong Yang (Huawei) volunteers to take the minutes for the week.

1. Approval of agenda (11-17-1865r1on the server and shown on the screen)

* No comments or questions.

Motion to approve the agenda

Moved: Yunsong Yang

Second: Mike Montemurro

Result: The agenda (r1) is approved unanimously.

1. Review patent policy and guidelines
   * No items identified.
2. Editor’s report:
   * The Technical Editor is not in the meeting this week.
   * Stephen: No particular issue for 11aq comes out of the Editor’s meeting this morning.
3. Approval of previous meeting minutes
   * Approval of November 2017 minutes: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-1621-00-00aq-tgaq-meeting-minutes-november-2017-session.docx>

Motion to approve the meeting minutes

Moved: Mike Montemurro

Second: James Lepp

Results: approved unanimously.

* + Approval of teleconference minutes: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0049-00-00aq-tgaq-january-2018-teleconference-minutes.doc>

Motion to approve the teleconference minutes

Moved: Mike Montemurro

Second: Graham Smith

Results: approved unanimously.

1. Comment resolution
   * 14 comments received from the 7th re-circ SB.
   * One voter changed vote. Currently 99% approval.
   * CID 13001: Rejected. The BRC believes that the comment resolution to CID 12004 (r06-4) fully provides what the comment was requesting. As such it is not necessary to point by point address the separate parts of the comment as they were working towards the change that was made. Evidence of this is provided in that the commenter indicated satisfaction with the comment by voting yes on revision (D14.0). Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.
   * CID 13002: Rejected. The commenter does not demonstrate how the cited sentence is ambiguous "in many ways". The use of "might elect" does not affect interoperability but reflects how a STA chooses a BSS with which to associate, when there are multiple discovered BSSes. The BRC believes that the current text sufficiently specifies the non-AP STA behavior. Furthermore, implementing the change would specify unintended behavior for a non-AP STA that returns to a BSS. Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.
   * CID 13003: Rejected. The comment is in support of an unsatisfied previous comment associated with a disapprove vote and does not provided substantive additional rationale. The previous comment was rejected with the rationale: The commenter does not provide specific changes in sufficient detail to modify the draft.

The BRC agrees that this draft specifies the use of MAC addresses for post-association use, for example see P66L57 in D13.0. The BRC believes this is essential to maintain the privacy properties established pre-association and therefore is reasonable in this draft. The approval rate at the last ballot was 97%, indicating that the ballot group consensus supports this position."

Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.

* + CID 13009:
    - The BRC discussed the possibility of:
      * deleting the MIB variable on P70L26 and P71 lines 36-51, and
      * changing "If such a non-AP STA starts any transaction that establishes state bound to a MAC address and might elect to establish an association or establish transaction state with a discovered BSS, it shall check the value of dot11LocallyAdministeredMACConfig and shall configure its MAC address according to the rules of the local address space prior to the start of the transaction" to "If such a non-AP STA starts any transaction that establishes state bound to a MAC address, it shall configure its MAC address prior to the start of the transaction"
    - However, some member also expressed a desire of keeping D14.0 as a clean draft.
    - The BRC decided to keep this CID open for now and revisit it later, and also revisit CID 13002 if the final resolution to CID 13009 is a “Revised”.
  + CID 13011: The BRC believes that the proposed changes would impose a MAC address allocation scheme in on local administrators that they may not wish to use. Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.
  + Stopped after CID 13011 due to out of time.

1. Waiver document
2. Recessed at 12:30 local time.

**Wednesday January 17th, 2018**

# TGaq 8:00-10:00 (AM1) local time

1. Called to order at 8:01 local time by Stephen McCann.
2. Attendance: 12.
3. Review patent policy and guidelines
   * No items identified.
4. Approval of agenda (11-17-1865r2 is on the server and shown on the screen)

* The updated agenda (r2) is approved unanimously.

1. Comment Resolution
   * Analysis of re-circulation Sponsor Ballot (doc. 11-18-214r0)
   * CID 13012: Rejected. A STA discovers and selects an IEEE 802.11 network before it associates. In order to complete association, a STA must be configured. The configuration process takes place pre-association and therefore it is within scope of IEEE 802.11aq to impose requirements on the STA. This comment is in support of an unsatisfied IEEE RAC comment and does not provide substantive new proposed change.

IEEE 802.11 STAs have many steps which prepare them for post-association operation. The comment identifies some of those pre-association configuration steps that are done in preparation for post-association operation. This amendment does not modify post-association behavior, which remains as defined in the IEEE 802.11 standard, using the MAC address configured pre-association.

Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.

* + CID 13014: Rejected. The BRC believes the resolution of r06-04 did address the issues raised by the comment and resulted in the commenter changing their vote to approve. Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.
  + CID 13004: Rejected. This comment is in support of an unsatisfied previous comment associated with a disapprove vote and does not provide substantive additional rationale.

The previous comment was rejected with the rationale

"Rejected: The commenter does not provide specific changes in sufficient detail to modify the draft.

In the pre-association state, an 802.11 STA transmits management and control frames that contain MAC addresses. These addresses are specified by IEEE Std 802 and therefore IEEE Std 802 is relevant to an 802.11 STA operating in the pre-association state regardless of whether its supports the features defined in P802.11aq.

In order to operate a LAN for the purposes of exchanging data, it is also necessary to perform discovery and to establish state such as encryption keys before forwarding data on the LAN. This is all in scope of IEEE 802.11."

Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.

* + CID 13005: Rejected. The BRC revisited the cited comments and believes that the responses to r06-14 and r05-6 are appropriate and sufficient. Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.
  + CID 13006: Rejected. The BRC revisited the cited comments and believes that the responses to r06-14 and r05-6 are appropriate and sufficient. This comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the changes that will satisfy the commenter can be determined. Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.
  + CID 13007: Rejected. The BRC revisited the cited comments and believes that the responses to r06-15 and r05-5 are appropriate and sufficient. This comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the changes that will satisfy the commenter can be determined. Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.
  + CID 13010: Rejected. This comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the changes that will satisfy the commenter can be determined. Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.
  + CID 13013: Rejected. Administrators configure devices using methods which are out of scope of IEEE 802.11. MAC address allocation is simply another configuration parameter that would need to be configured for a STA to operate on an administered LAN. P802.11aq provides mechanisms to enable such configuration that is applied before the STA associates to the LAN.

This comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the changes that will satisfy the commenter can be determined.

Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.

* + CID 13008: This CID is re-assigned to GEN ad-hoc.
    - Rejected. This comment will be forwarded to the IEEE-SA publications editor for consideration during publication:

1. Consider changing "for when" to "when" at P71L44

Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.

* + CID 13009: Rejected. Administrators set the rules for the local address space and configure devices using methods which are out of scope of IEEE 802.11. P802.11aq provides mechanisms to enable such configuration that is applied before the STA associates to the LAN.

This comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the changes that will satisfy the commenter can be determined.

Set the CID to ready-for-motion with no objections.

* + Thus, all SB7 comments are resolved and set to ready-for-motion. An updated comment spreadsheet will be prepared and uploaded for motion tomorrow.

1. Waiver document
   * 11-17-1704r5
   * As the group is out of time, the review of the waiver document is deferred to Thursday AM2 session.
2. Recessed at 10:00 local time.

**Thursday January 18th, 2018**

# TGaq 10:30-12:30 (AM2) local time

1. Called to order at 10:31 local time by Stephen McCann.
2. Attendance: 13.
3. Review patent policy and guidelines
   * No items identified.
4. Approval of agenda (11-17/1865r2 is on the server and shown on the screen)

* Add motion to approve comments.
* Add motion to start 8th re-circ SB.
* Added Waiver request.
* Update the versions of EC report and Waiver request documents.
* The updated agenda (r3) is approved unanimously.

1. Re-circulation Sponsor Ballot Comment Resolution
   * Comment spreadsheet has been updated and uploaded as 11-18-0048r2 since yesterday.
   * All SB7 comments are ready for motion.

**Motions:**

Motion #113: Move to approve comment resolutions contained in the document <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0048-02-00aq-comments-from-7th-recirculation-sb-on-tgaq-d14-0.xlsx> tab “All SB7 Comments”.

Moved: Yunsong Yang

Seconded: Donald Eastlake

Result: Y/N/A = 9/0/1. Motion passes.

Motion #114: Having approved all the comment resolutions for the comments received in the 7th Sponsor Re-circulation Ballot on P802.11aq D14.0 contained in:

* [https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0048-02-00aq-comments-from-7th-recirculation-sb-on-tgaq-d14-0.xlsx](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-1205-05-00aq-comments-from-3rd-recirculation-sb-on-tgaq-d10-0.xlsx).
* approve a 10 day Sponsor Recirculation Ballot asking the question “Should P802.11aq D14.0 be forwarded to RevCom?”

Moved: Jouni Malinen

Seconded: Mike Montemurro

Result: Y/N/A = 9/0/0. Motion passes.

With these results, the TGaq Motion deck document is updated to 11-15-0417r42.

1. Waiver request
   * Review and update (doc. 11-17-1704r6)
     + Discussed the schedule for TGaq to approve the waiver request: can be approved this week or in a teleconference.
     + Stephen: prefer to give EC sufficient time to consider the request.
     + All comments listed in the documents are from IEEE RAC, submitted by Angela Thomas.
     + Discussion on the Abstract slide resulted in some editorial changes in that slide.
     + Added a slide of IEEE-SA Sponsor Ballot OM rules on 5.4.4 Mandatory coordination.
     + Discussion on the slide stating the reason for the BRC seeking waiver request resulted in some editorial changes in that slide.
     + Discussion resulted in adding a new slide titled technical summary, which states that the BRC’s objection to making the changes requested by the IEEE RAC is based upon three observations, as described in that slide.
     + New Slide 6: add note stating that the numbering in parenthesis are the BRC CID numbers.
     + New Slide 7: editorial changes.
     + Slides 8 and 9: merged into one slide. Replaced the “Current BRC commentary” with “BRC waiver commentary”, and listed the references to the three observations.
     + New Slide 9: add “summary” to “Original MCC”.
     + New Slide 10: Added reference to Observation 1. Plus additional editorial changes.
     + New Slide 12: Added reference to the three observations.
     + New Slide 14: Added reference to Observations 2 and 3. Plus additional editorial changes.
     + New Slide 15: Substantial text changes to the Original BRC Response Summary and BRC waiver summary. Split the slide into 2.
     + New Slide 18: Added “See Observation 1”. Plus additional editorial changes.
     + New Slide 20: Added “See observations 2 and 3”. Plus additional editorial changes.
     + New Slide 22: Replaced the text with “See observations 1, 2 and 3”.
     + New Slide 24: Added “See observations 1, 2 and 3”. Plus additional editorial changes.
     + Stopped after the CID 13010 due to out of time.
2. Recessed at 12:29 local time.

**Thursday January 18th, 2018**

# TGaq 16:00-18:00 (PM2) local time

1. Called to order at 16:00 local time by Stephen McCann.
2. Attendance: 12.
3. Review patent policy and guidelines
   * No items identified.
4. Approval of agenda (11-17/1865r3 is on the server and shown on the screen)
   * No change to the agenda.
   * The agenda (r3) is approved unanimously.
5. Waive request
   * Review of Doc. 11-17-1704r7
     + The document has been updated to add the reference to the three observations in the BRC waiver commentary section for the remaining CIDs (i.e., CIDs 13011 - 13014).
     + Review of the document resulted in some editorial changes being made.
     + The document is updated and uploaded as 11-17-1704r8.

Motion #115: Move to approve the waiver request document: 11-17-1704r8 as part of the P802.11aq submission to RevCom and allow the 802.11aq chair editorial license.

Moved: John Notor

Second: Mike Montemurro

Result: Y/N/A = 8/0/2. Motion passes.

With this result, the TGaq Motion deck document is updated to 11-15-0417r43.

1. Preparation for EC meeting
   * 11-17-1045r4
     + Slide 5: Added a Coordinating Committee row (such that the IEEE RAC appears as the only participating coordinating committee under it); removed the Total row; and removed the footnote.
     + Slide 6: Under MAC privacy, add two sub-bullets: Roger Marks: 28, IEEE RAC: 13.
     + Slide 7: Attachment needs to be updated.
     + Slide 8: Changed RAC Status to “All comments were processed. Outstanding unsatisfied comments remain.”
     + Slide 9: Some key timelines are updated.
     + The document is updated as 11-17-1045r5.
2. Timeline update
   * Changed Final WG/EC Approval to March 2018, and RevCom/Standards Board Approval to April 2018.
3. Preparation for March 2018 Interim meeting
   * Room/Slot Allocation – 4 slots, room for 25.
4. Teleconference(s)
   * 16, 23 February 2018, 12:00 noon ET for 2 hours
5. AOB: none.
6. Meeting adjourned at 16:46 pm local time with no objections.