IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Comment Resolution on CIDs | | | | |
| Date: 2017-09-11 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| SungJin Park | LG electronics |  |  | allean.park@lge.com |
| SunWoong Yun |  |  |  | sunwoong.yun@lge.com |
| Jinmin Kim |  |  |  | jinmin1230.kim@lge.com |
| Jinsoo Choi |  |  |  | js.choi@lge.com |
| Sang G. Kim |  |  |  | sanggook.kim@lge.com |
| Saehee Bang |  |  |  | saehee.bang@lge.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolution of comment received from TGay comment collection (TGay Draft 0.3).

- CIDs: 40, 41, 42, 43, 113, 114, 152, 483

1. **Introduction**

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGay Draft. The introduction and the explanation of the proposed changes are not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGay Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGay Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGay Editor” are instructions to the TGay editor to modify existing material in the TGay draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGay editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGay Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Page Number | Line Number | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 40 | 58 | 14 | "If an initiator uses Short SSW packets to perform the ISS, the responder shall use Short SSW packets to perform the RSS ". Why, autodetection is very simple? | Remove this requirement | Reject  There is no benefit when this requirement is removed.  There is no usecase that an initiator uses Short SSW packets and the responder uses SSW frame. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Page Number | Line Number | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 41 | 58 | 24 | "A frame transmitted by an EDMG STA as part of a sector sweep and that is not a DMG Beacon does not include training fields. An EDMG STA shall set the TRN-LEN parameter of the TXVECTOR to 0 for a frame transmitted as part of a sector sweep and that is not a DMG Beacon" | Remove this requirement | Reject  There is no usecase that TRN field is appended to the SSW frame during a sector sweep. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Page Number | Line Number | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 42 | 64 | 20 | "In the feedback, the initiator shall send the index of the TX sector within the TRN field rather than the sector ID, where the first TX sector has index 0" In a BRP-TX-RX packet, this is not well defined | make more accurate | Accept  A BRP-TX/RX packet with index is well defined at ‘30.9.2.2.5 TRN field definition’ in the draft 0.5. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Page Number | Line Number | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 43 | 64 | 26 | "using the sector ID Order subfield" - we need to enable using the EDMG sector ID subfield | Add the following text at the end of the paragraph: "An EDMG STA may return the ordered list in the EDMG Sector Id Order subfiedl" | Accept  An EDMG STA can send a BRP frame with EDMG Channel Measurement Feedback element during MID subphase. |

* + - * 1. MIDC subphase with MID subphase only

In the R-MID subphase, the initiator shall send a BRP frame with feedback. This BRP frame should be sent using the best TX sector as determined in the SLS phase, while the responder should use a quasi-omni pattern to receive this frame. The feedback included in this BRP frame should be (a) the BS-FBCK field set to the TX sector ID of the BRP-RX packet received with the highest link quality, and (b) the ordered list of transmit sectors (based on received link quality during the R-MID) using the Sector ID Order subfield. An EDMG STA returns the ordered list in the EDMG Sector ID Order subfield.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Page Number | Line Number | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 113 | 59 | 22 | What is the expected behavior after responder receives an additional feedback request from initiator? We should add statements with "shall" or "should" that describe the intended behavior | Please clarify | Reject  The expected behavior after responder receives an additional feeback request from initiator is well defined at ’10.38.9.2.2 Multiple sector feedback’ in the draft 0.5. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Page Number | Line Number | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 114 | 59 | 29 | What is the expected behavior after initiator receives an additional feedback request from responder? We should add statements with "shall" or "should" that describe the intended behavior | Please clarify | Reject  The expected behavior after initiator receives an additional feeback request from responder is well defined at ’10.38.9.2.2 Multiple sector feedback’ in the draft 0.5. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Page Number | Line Number | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 152 | 39 | 27 | Sector sweep field definition with Sector ID and DMG Antenna ID is inefficient for MIMO STAs. | Suggest defining an EDMG Sector Sweep field that supports more efficient sector sweeps over multiple antenns both one at a time and simultaneously. | Reject  Sector sweep does not need to be performed by using MIMO.  In the current draft, the MIMO BF training can be supported without the transmission over multiple antenns both one at a time and simultaneously. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Page Number | Line Number | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 483 | 74 | 2 | Beamforming training for channel bonding and channel aggregation should be defined in the section of '10.38.3 Beam Refinement Protocol(BRP) phase'. | Define when beamforming training for channel bonding and channel aggregation can be performed. | Accept  In the draft 0.5, the beamforming training for channel bonding and channel aggregation can be performed in the BRP phase. |

**References:**

[1] IEEE 802.11ay D0.3

[2] IEEE 802.11ay D0.5

**---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------**

**Straw Poll & Motion:**

* **Do you agree to accept comment resolution as proposed in doc 11-17-1406-00-00ay-Comment Resolution on CIDs (0, 41, 42, 43, 113, 114, 152, 483)?**