IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| CID 7452 |
| Date: 2016-04-01 |
| Author: |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Edward Au | Huawei Technologies | 303 Terry Fox Drive, Suite 400, Ottawa, Ontario K2K 3J1 |  | edward.ks.au@huawei.com  |

##### This submission discusses on the accepted resolution of CID 7452 that need additional inputs to editors.

##### Revision history:

##### R0 – initial version

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 7452 | 8.3.5.1.4.2 | 559 | 40 | "The RXVECTOR represents a list of parameters that the PHY provides the local MAC entity upon receipt of a valid PHY header or upon receipt of the last PSDU data bit in the received frame." -- can't be sent before the end, by definition. I'm not sure why the values in the PHY-RXSTART.ind can't be used, either | Delete this sentence | REVISED (MAC: 2016-02-25 15:06:47Z): Delete "upon receipt of a valid PHY header or" |

***Discussion:***

In this comment, the author refers to 559.40 and clause 8.3.5.14.2. However, 559.40 is actually in clause 8.3.5.13.2, rather than 8.3.5.14.2. To make things worse, the sentence quoted by the commenter exists in both clauses!





Though the approved resolution may be in clause 8.3.5.13.2 (i.e., the page and line numbers indicated by the commenter are correct) as clause 8.3.5.14.2 focuses on RXEND rather than RXSTART, I discuss with Adrian who comments that the resolution may be technically wrong:

|  |
| --- |
| Technically the resolution is wrong. I remember a different outcome (but I might just be mentally inventing that).The point is that the RXSTART ind is given at the end of the PHY header.So this change is needed:At 559.42, to delete “or upon receipt of the last PSDU data bit in the received frame”At 560.40, I think the text is correct, because RXEND ind can come at the end of the header (e.g. unsupported rate) or the end of the PSDU.However, at this location “\*valid\* PHY header” is open to challenge, because the reasons for indication an RXEND ind at the end of the PHY header relate also to receiving an invalid PHY header. |