IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| SB Comments & proposed changes to TGah D5.0 |
| Date: 2016-01-08 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Naveen Kakani | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | nkakani@qca.qualcomm.com |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |

Abstract

This submission includes resolutions for the comments below and proposes changes to TGah Draft for SB.

Resolution for CIDs: 8194, 8195, 8196, 8444, 8448, 8464, 8469, 8470

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8194 | ZHENG, SHOUKANG | 241.20 | 9.3.2.4a.1 | For the case that the received PPDU is a non-member PPDU and contains a Duration field for NAV setting but the Duration field value is smaller than the RID counter at the end of the PSDU that is carried in the received PPDU, the text is not correct for the case that the NAV counter is smaller than the RID counter. | If the RID counter is reloaded or updated upon the receipt of a valid S1G PPDU, then the RID counter shall start to count down at the end of the received S1G PPDU. The RID counter shall be reset for the following cases:1. the PPDU is a member PPDU and contains a valid nonzero Duration field2. the PPDU is a nonmember PPDU from which the RID counter is obtained and contains a valid nonzero Duration filed3. the PPDU is a nonmember PPDU from which the RID counter is not obtained and contains a valid nonzero Duration field that is larger than the RID counter at the time that is going to count down4. the PPDU is intended to the S1G STA | Reject.The text refers to updating the NAV and if RID counter will start or not. There is nothing that is updating RID. The relevant text is on Page 240, line 50. “An S1G STA that receives a member PPDU shall reset and update its RID counter as defined in 9.3.2.4a.2 (RID update) when the PHY-RX-START.indication primitive corresponding to that PPDU is received. An S1G STA that receives a nonmember PPDU shall not reset the RID counter and shall update the RID counter, i.e., set it to a new value (as defined in 9.3.2.4a.2 (RID update)) that is not less than the value that the RID counter will have at the instant of time that corresponds to the end of the received PPDU. “ |

**Discussion: None.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8195 | ZHENG, SHOUKANG | 240,55 | 9.3.2.4a.1 | The text of "will have at the instant of time that corresponds to the end of the received PPDU" is not appropriate as it implies the old RID counter still continues to count down, which is not necessary. The RID counter value to be compared can be obtained upon the receipt of PHY-RXSTART.indication primitive. | Revise "will have at the instant of time that corresponds to the end of the received PPDU" to 'had at the time of the receipt of the PHY-RXSTART.indication primitive minus the difference between the current time and that time"  | Reject.The received RID value will be used only if it will be more than the current RID value and hence current text captures the intended behavior. |

**Discussion: None.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8196 | ZHENG, SHOUKANG | 241,14 | 9.3.2.4a.1 | The text of "then the STA shall reload the RID counter to the value that the RID counter had at the time of the receipt of the PHY-RXSTART.indication primitive corresponding to this PPDU minus the difference between the current time and that time" is not appropriate for the case of reclassifying member PPDU into nonmember PPDU based on a valid MAC header. When classifying member PPDU, the RID count is reset, however, the RID count (either the old or new RID count) shall be recorded after later use when the member PPDU is further reclassified as non-member PPDU at the end of the received PPDU. | Revise to "the lager of :- the value that the RID counter had at the time of the receipt of the PHY-RXSTART.indication primitive corresponding to this PPDU minus the difference between the current time and that time- the value of the RID counter as defined in 9.3.2.4a.2" | Reject.If the PPDU is a non-member PPDU the contents of the current PPDU should not be used to update the RID and hence the value of the RID counter will be lowered at the end of the current PPDU as defined in the current text. There are no additional rules to update RID upon receipt of non-member PPDU. |

**Discussion: None.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8444 | Wang, Xiaofei | 235,41 | 9.2.4.2 | The following sentence is incorrect "An S1G STA shall update its MIB values of the EDCA parameters as described for non-S1G STAs in this subclause with the following exception:" since checking for STA type subfield before deciding whether to update its MIB value is another exception for S1G STAs which is different for non-S1G STAs. Not sure whether this sentence adds any value. | Remove the sentence "An S1G STA shall update its MIB values of the EDCA parameters as described for non-S1G STAs in this subclause with the following exception:" | **Accept.****The text following the uoted text has “shall” condition which captures the desired normative behaviour.** |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8448 | Wang, Xiaofei | 257, 44 | 9.2.4.2 | Non-S1G STAs should not be mandated to send S1G PPDUs even if it is not performing asymmetric Block Ack | Change "When the STA is not performing asymmetric Block Ack" into "When an S1G STA is not performing asymmetric Block Ack" | **Accept.** |

**Editor notes: Make the following change to Section 9.2.4.2**

~~An S1G STA shall update its MIB values of the EDCA parameters as described for non-S1G STAs in this subclause with the following exception:~~

**………**

—When the SIG STA is not performing asymmetric Block Ack

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8464 | Asterjadhi, Alfred | 248, 28 | 9.3.2.10a | The originator STA may also send a BAR frame to solicit an NDP BlockAck frame. | Add the missing case. | Revised:Change the quoted text to “The receiving STA that is the intended receiver of either an F-MPDU with the Ack Policy field equal to Implicit Block Ack Request or a BAR frame, shall send an NDP BlockAck frame after a SIFS, without regard of the idle/busy state of the medium, that is” |

**Editor notes: Make the following change to Section 9.3.2.10a**

The receiving STA that is the intended receiver of either an F-MPDU with the Ack Policy field equal to Implicit Block Ack Request or a BAR frame, shall send an NDP BlockAck frame after a SIFS, without regard of the idle/busy state of the medium, that is….

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8469 | Asterjadhi, Alfred | 241, 16 | 9.3.2.4a | "If the classification of a PPDU is changed from member to nonmember PPDU, then the STA shall reload the RID counter to the value that the RID counter had at the time of the receipt of the PHY-RX-START.indication primitive corresponding to this PPDU minus the difference between the current time and that time." is missing the condition of updating the RID counter according to the rules followed for non-member PPDUs. | Replace the quoted text with:"If the classification of a PPDU is changed from member to nonmember PPDU, then the STA shall:\* Reload the RID counter to the value that the RID counter had at the time of the receipt of the PHY-RX-START.indication primitive corresponding to this PPDU minus the difference between the current time and that time.\* Update the RID counter according to the rules for a non-member PPDU".Note to editor: The second bullet is the only inserted text (the rest is paragraph organization as itemized text). | Reject.See resolution for CID 8196. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8470 | Asterjadhi, Alfred | 241, 20 | 9.3.2.4a | "The RID counter shall start at the end of the received S1G PPDU, except when the PPDU either contains a valid nonzero Duration field that updates the NAV as described in 9.3.2.4 (Setting and resetting the NAV) or it is intended to the S1G STA in which cases the RID shall be reset." The RID counter shall start only when it is updated (because otherwise it is continuing countign down as usual. Also that updated the NAV as described in 9.xxx is not needed since the RID is not called whenever the Duration field is valid (i.e., even if it does not set the NAV). | Replace quoted text with:"If the RID counter is updated then it shall start counting down at the end of the received S1G PPDU, except when the PPDU either contains a valid nonzero Duration field that is used for setting the NAV or it is intended to the S1G STA in which cases the RID shall be reset." | Revised:A S1G STA upon receiving a member PPDU shall start the RID counter at the end of the received S1G PPDU, except when the PPDU either contains a valid nonzero Duration field that updates the NAV as described in 9.3.2.4 (Setting and resetting the NAV) or it is intended to the S1G STA in which cases the RID shall be reset. |

**Editor notes: Make the following change to Section 9.3.2.4a**

~~The RID counter shall start~~ A S1G STA upon receiving a member PPDU shall start the RID counter at the end of the received S1G PPDU, except when the PPDU either contains a valid nonzero Duration field that updates the NAV as described in 9.3.2.4 (Setting and resetting the NAV) or it is intended to the S1G STA in which cases the RID shall be reset.