IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| SB0 Comment Resolutions for CID 8091,  8102,  8126,  8322,  8446,  8182  |
| Date: 2016-01-18 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Kaiying Lv | ZTE Corp. | ZTE R&D Center, Xi’an, China |  | lv.kaiying@zte.com.cn |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission provides resolutions to Sponsor Ballot comment on TGah Draft 5.0.

CIDs: 8091,  8102,  8126,  8322,  8446,  8182

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Pg/Ln** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8091 | 112/60 | 8.4.1.60 | "a recipient STA is required to wait before it is permitted to transmit a frame" -- passive voice considered dangerous. Who requires? Who permits? Also "permitted" and "required" come close to normative verbs, and Clause 8 doesn't describe behaviour, only frame structure. | Reword to avoid passive voice. It is necessary to describe behaviour, move to clause 9 or 10 and insert "see x.y for the use of this field" here instead. | Revised.Agree in principal. Reword the sentence as follows: “The Suspend Duration field contains a 16-bit unsigned integer. See 9.58 for the use of this field. ~~that specifies the amount of time in microseconds that a recipient STA is required to wait before it is permitted to transmit a frame to the STA that transmitted the Suspend Duration field.~~”.TGah editor makes changes as shown in 11-16/0077r0. |
| 8102 | 133/13 | 8.4.2.78 | In the same para we have "When dot11S1GOptionImplemented is true" and "For an S1G STA,"(I have also submitted a comment indicating "For an S1G STA" is wrong, and should be "In an S1G STA".)Why these two different ways of expressing the same thing in the same para? Are they somehow different,or were the authors trying to capture the excitement of creating this document by generating gratuitousvariability.I believe such gratuitous variability, particularly in adjacent sentences, will cause the reader to try andinterpret a difference that is not there. | If "is an S1G STA" == "dot11S1GOptionImplemented is true", choose one of these terms and use it throughout the amendment.Eliminate the other term. | Revised.Agree in principal. Change “For an S1G STA“ to “When dot11S1GOptionImplemented is true”TGah editor makes changes as shown in 11-16/0077r0. |
| 8182 | 340/40 | 9.58 | This subclause is specific to S1G, the heading indicates otherwise. | Change heading to "S1G flow control". | Accepted |
| 8322 | 201/29 | 8.6.27.1 | The time priority has not been specified for Flow Resumption | Add either "yes" or "no" for the Time priority specification for Flow Resumption | Revised.Agree in principal. TGah editor makes changes as shown in 11-16/0077r0. |
| 8446 | 236/00 | 9.2.4.2 | the phrase "if the value of the element's STA Type subfield includes the STA's type (see 10.50.7 (S1G BSS type and STA type))." is awkward and should be rewritten | change the phrase "if the value of the element's STA Type subfield includes the STA's type (see 10.50.7 (S1G BSS type and STA type))." into "if its STA type is indicated in the STA Type subfield in the received EDCA Parameter Set element (see 10.50.7 (S1G BSS type and STA type))." | Revised.Agree in principal. TGah editor makes changes as shown in 11-16/0077r0. |
| 8126 | 173/31 | 8.4.2.204 | "The Information Not Available field is set to 1 if the relay cannot provide the requested information in the fixed fields of S1GRelay Discovery element."This is a section on frame formats, not what the relay can or cannot do. | Replace with something like: "The Information Not Available field is set to 1 if the information is not provided in the fixed fields."As this creates an exception to statements such as "When UL Mean Data Rate field is included in an S1GRelayDiscovery element in a Probe Request frame, it indicates the UL mean data rate of the direct link between the non-AP STA and AP in the unit of 100 kbps.", edit each of these statements to indicate something along the lines of "When the Information Not Available field is set to 0, and when the UNL Mean Data Rate field is included in an SIGRelay ...".Do this throughout this subclause. Or find a more intelligent way to specify the exclusions to avoid contradiction. | Revised.Agree in principal. TGah editor makes changes as shown in 11-16/0077r0. |

CID 8322:

**Discussion:**

Since flow suspension and flow resumption frame should be able to be carried in an A-MPDU in a control response frame, it can be an Action no ACK frame as shown below.



TGah editor: Please copy the *table 8-422* of Draft P802.11REVmc-D4.3 into *8.7.3 A-MPDU contents* immediately after *table 8-409-A-MPDU contexts on page 209 line39*, as *table 8-410**- A-MPDU contents MPDUs in the control response context* and make changes to *table 8-410* by adding the following sentence under conditions for Action No Ack .

Flow Contol Action No Ack frames carrying a flow suspension frame or a flow resumption frame.

TGah editor: Please make changes to *8.6.27.2 flow suspension frame format* and *8.6.27.3 flow resumption frame format* as indicated below on page 206 line 3 to 36 in D5.1

8.6.27.2 Flow Suspension frame format

The Flow Suspension frame is an Action or an Action No Ack frame of category Flow Control Action used by a STA to suspend incoming transmissions for an amount of time indicated in the Suspend Duration field. The format of the Flow Suspension frame Action field is shown in Table 8-406t (Flow Suspension frame action field format).

8.6.27.3 Flow Resumption frame format

The Flow Resumption frame is an Action or an Action No Ack frame of category Flow Control Action used by the STA identified by the TA field of the frame to cancel any outstanding flow suspension time the STA had previously invoked through the transmission of a Flow Suspension, BAT, TACK, STACK, or NDP Ack frame as described in 9.58 (Flow control). The format of the Flow Resumption frame Action field is shown in Table 8-406u (Flow Resumption frame action field format)

TGah editor: Please modify *Table 8-406s-Flow Control Action field format* by inserting blue texts indicated as below on page 205 line 40-54 of D5.1

**Table 8-406s—Flow Control Action field format**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Flow Control Action Field Value** | **Description** | **Time Priority** |
| 0 | Flow suspension | Yes when transmitted as an Action no Ack frame |
| 1 | Flow resumption | Yes when transmitted as an Action no Ack frame |
| 2-255 | Reserved |  |

CID 8446:

**Discussion:**

The comment indicates that the colored phrase below is not clear.

The text in D5.0 is shown here as reference:

After reception of an EDCA Parameter Set element from the AP with which it is associated, an S1G STA shall transmit PS-Poll frames, PS-Poll+BDT frames and NDP PS-Poll frames using the access category indicated in the PS-Poll ACI subfield **if the value of the element's STA Type subfield includes the STA's type** (see 10.50.7 (S1G BSS type and STA type)).

**8.4.2.28 EDCA Parameter Set element**

The STA Type field indicates the type of STA for which the information in the element is provided. The S1G AP sets the STA Type field to:

—0 to indicate that the information provided by this element is valid for STAs (i.e., both sensor STAs and non-sensor STAs)

—1 to indicate that the information is valid for sensor STAs

—2 to indicate that the information provided by this element is valid for non-sensor STAs

—3 to indicate a reserved value

Since the STA Type subfield of the element might indicate 0 for both sensor STAs and non-sensor STAs or 1 for sensor STAs or 2 for non-sensor STAs, the receiving STA of the element will match the STA Type with its own type. If the STA type subfield includes the STA type of the receiving STA of the element, then the receiving STA of the element will use the access category indicated in the PS-Poll ACI subfield.

 TGah Editor: Please make the following changes to *9.2.4.2 HCF contention-based channel access* on page 241 line63 to page 242 line 2 as below in D5.1

After reception of an EDCA Parameter Set element from the AP with which it is associated, an S1G STA shall transmit PS-Poll frames, PS-Poll+BDT frames and NDP PS-Poll frames using the access category indicated in the PS-Poll ACI subfield if the ~~value~~ interpretation of the STA Type subfield of the element includes the receiving STA's type (see 10.50.7 (S1G BSS type and STA type)).

CID 8126:

Discussion:

The Information Not Available field is meaningless because one bit indicates the presence of the fixed fields but there are no fixed fields and even if there were then having a bit to optionally indicate their absence would mean that they are not actually fixed fields! And several other bits already indicate the presence or absence of all of the optional fields so the additional optional fields present bit is unnecessary. The optional Information Not Available field is meaningless as well.

TGah Editor: Please make the following changes to *figure 8-577bv-Relay Discovery Info field format* as follows in D5.1

Change “Information Not Available field” bit4 and “optional Information Not Available field” bit5 to “Reserved” in figure 8-577bv-Relay Discovery Info field format on page 176 line

TGah Editor: Please delete the last two paragraph of *8.4.2.204 S1G Relay Discovery element* in page 176 line 30-36 in D5.1as below:

“~~The Information Not Available field is set to 1 if the relay cannot provide the requested information in the fixed fields of S1G Relay Discovery element. Otherwise, the Information Not Available field is set to 0.~~

~~The Optional Info Not Available field is set to 1 if the relay cannot provide the requested information in the optional fields. Otherwise, the Optional Info Not Available field is set to 0.~~”