IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| REVmc BRC Telecon Minutes May-June | | | | |
| Date: 2015-06-05 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | CSR Technologies Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | 801-492-4023 | jrosdahl@ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

IEEE 802.11 TGm – REVmc BRC (Ballot Resolution Committee) Telecon Minutes for May-June 2015.

R0 – Telecon on May 29, 2015

R1 – Telecon on June 5, 2015

R2 – Corrected errors and missing note from Mark RISON (2.5.11)

1. **REVmc BRC Telecon May 29, 2015 – 10:00ET**:
   1. **Called to order** at 10:10am by the chair ,Dorothy STANLEY (HP)
   2. **Attendance**: Dorothy STANLEY, HP; Edward AU, Marvel; Emily QI, Intel; Ganesh VENKATESAN, Intel; Mark RISON, Samsung; Jon ROSDAHL, CSR; Sigurd SCHELSTRAETE, Quantenna; Mark HAMILTON, Ruckus; Solomon TRAININ, Intel; Carlos CORDEIRO, Intel; Dick ROY, SRA; Viewer 15 (unannounced name).
   3. **Patent Policy Review** 
      1. No questions
      2. No Patent related items requested
   4. **Review Agenda**:
      1. Draft agenda:

1. Call to order, patent policy, and attendance

2. Editor report

3. Comment resolution

a) Carlos: 11-15/714/00

b) Editorial CIDS – 11-14/0935r1 Edward

c) OCB related CIDs: 5234, 6180, and 6838

d) Mark H CIDs

e) 11-15/12r3 – Genesh

f) RAC CIDs – Jon ROSDAHL

g) Any additional available resolutions

4. AOB

Next Teleconferences:

June 5 Topics

June 26 Topics

Discuss Face-to-Face Meeting: Week June 15: 17-19

Proposed Scheduled Sessions, with Teleconference Bridge available – Times in Pacific

9:00-11:30

1:00-3:00

3:30-500 (Wednesday and Thursday only)

5. Adjourn

* + 1. After discussion, Agenda approved without objection as noted above.
  1. **Review doc: 11-15/714r0** – Carlos CORDEIRO (Intel)
     1. CID 5164 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. BHI – Beacon Header Interval
        3. Change “The BHI comprises of the BTI, …” to “The BHI comprises the BTI, …”
        4. There are some additional cross references that may need to be reviewed, but were not part of the comment.
     2. Review changes to ensure matching the figures.
     3. Request to add reference for BTI, A-BFT and ATI to the appropriate channel access rules.
     4. Make an R1 – and we will consider a motion on June 5th to adopt a resolution
     5. Proposed Resolution: Revised – make changes as shown in 11-15/714r1 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0714-01-000m-resolution-to-cid5164.docx)
     6. Carlos has made the fix and will post, and we will consider next week.
  2. **Review doc 11-14/0935r1** Edward AU (Marvel) (CID 6386, 6385, 6105 GEN)
     1. Review changes proposed by document
     2. Audio for Edward did not work, so we used chat window and Dorothy led the discussion until Edward was able to get his audio to work.
     3. dot11GAS variables:
        1. The two variables are only mentioned in the spec in C.3, and we should be able to just delete it.
     4. DMG MPDU Length –
        1. Additions are underlined
        2. CID related to the length field was pulled from a motion in Vancouver
        3. The CIDs was #5120 (MAC) and 5122 (MAC) were pulled
        4. CID 6384 (MAC) has this particular issue identified
        5. CID 5120 (MAC) was pulled and wanted to have CID 6384 (MAC) considered first
           1. Document 11-15/565r2 was in the motion
           2. Review CID 5120 (MAC) proposed resolution
     5. Review the proposed technical changes in 11-14/935r1
        1. There are references to figures that have changed as this document was done against D3.0 in July 2014.
        2. Updated the figure numbers and line numbers to make it easier for the editor
        3. Need to create an R2 for 11-14/935
     6. Insert Proposed resolutions:
        1. **Proposed Resolution for CIDs 5120 and 6384 (MAC):** Revised, Incorporate the text changes in 11-14/953r2 under the heading of “DMG MPDU Length” (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-0935-02-000m-miscellaneous-802-11mc-d3-0-issues.docx>)
        2. **Proposed Resolution for CIDs 6382 (Editor)** : Revised, Incorporate the text changes in 11-14/953r2 under the heading of “control type of MPDU” (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-0935-02-000m-miscellaneous-802-11mc-d3-0-issues.docx>)
           1. Issue with the proposed resolution
           2. Update the proposal in the document:

Update the Replace with “MPDU with Type Field equal to Control” text

Edits were done on line

Need to modify the resolution in the database for CID 6491 (Editor).

* + 1. Need to update CID 5063 (MAC), which has 22 occurrences of the issue, today we have talked about a few instances and so we would need to look at all the occurrences to be complete.
       1. Review where the Type is defined in the MAC header
          1. This seems to need more review by Editors for a consistent method
       2. We need to address each comment individually and note each specific instance
       3. Proposed resolution is to update to CID 5063 (MAC): Change to -- Replace “MPDU of type” with “MPDU with Type subfield equal to“ throughout the draft.
       4. Note that while there was no objection, there is need to ensure the formula works for the REVmc Editor
    2. For CID 6491 (EDITOR)
       1. Add – Note to editor: related editorial comments need correcting
    3. Review comments resolved here 6382 (EDITOR), 5063 MAC,
    4. CID 6635 and 6634 (EDITOR)
       1. These were marked submission required.
       2. Discussion if the proposed resolution is complete or not, need more editorial review.
    5. MIB variable deletion:
       1. CID 6383 (GEN)
       2. Comment on C.3
       3. **Proposed Resolution:** REVISED (GEN: 2015-05-29 15:37:02Z) Incorporate the text changes in 11-14/953r2 under the heading of “”MMPDU of type Data” and dot11GAS horrors” (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-0935-02-000m-miscellaneous-802-11mc-d3-0-issues.docx>)
       4. Mark ready for motion
    6. DS PHY
       1. Review proposed changes
       2. Review clause 6.5.5
       3. CID 6385 (GEN) has a proposed: “REVISED (EDITOR: 2015-05-01 13:33:04Z) - Change all "DS PHY" to "DSSS PHY", except at 2214.17 change "DS PHY" to "High rate PHY"’
          1. The editorial comment takes care of the cited issues.
          2. **Action Item:** Need to have a review by editor with the commenter about the change of the section heading
       4. **Action Item**: Need to include Editor in conversation.
    7. Order of subelement IDs
       1. The cited table numbers need updating to D4.0
       2. CID 6386 (GEN) is the D4.0 Comment – (address with 6105)
       3. Review context
       4. **Proposed resolution**: CID 6386 (GEN): REVISED (GEN: 2015-05-29 15:49:37Z) Delete the “Order” columns from Tables 8-168 and 8-169
       5. No objection -- Mark ready for motion – “May-June Telecon” comment group
    8. VHT in TVHT Clause
       1. Review proposal
       2. **Proposed resolution** CID 6387 (GEN): REVISED (GEN: 2015-05-29 15:51:43Z) Replace "VHT" with TVHT" at 2595.44 (twice), 2595.48 (twice), 2595.51 (twice).
       3. No objection -- Mark ready for motion – “May-June Telecon” comment group
       4. Question on 23.3.1 clause
          1. The mess is TVVHT and VHT confusing when which is used.
          2. The cleverness is in 4.3.13 where the replacement one should use in TVVHT is given.
          3. There is a table 23-1 that has several VHT-AP in the table that may need some TVVHT clarification added.
          4. We are running out of time, so will schedule for a future call.
  1. **AOB**
     1. Next Teleconferences:
        1. June 5
        2. June 26
     2. Discuss Face-to-Face Meeting: Week June 15: 17-19
        1. Proposed Scheduled Sessions, with teleconference bridge available – Times in Pacific:

9:00-11:30

1:00-3:00

3:30-500 (Wednesday and Thursday only)

* + - 1. End at 3pm on Friday
    1. Question on the topics to be discussed –
    2. Time was called as TGaq needs the Join.me at the top of hour–
  1. **Adjourned** 12:01ET

1. **REVmc BRC – Telecon, June 5 10:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order** by the chair Dorothy STANLEY (HP) at 10:10ET
   2. **Patent Policy Review** 
      1. No questions
      2. No Patent related items requested
   3. **Attendance**: Attendance: Dorothy STANLEY, HP; Adrian STEPHENS, Intel; Jon ROSDAHL, CSR; Sigurd SCHELSTRAETE, Quantenna; Ganesh VENKATESAN, Intel; Scott MARIN, Nokia, Edward AU, Marvel; Mark RISON, Samsung; Dick ROY, SRA; Gloria Gwynne, Caltrans; Emily QI, Intel; viewer 10 (unannounced name)
   4. **Review Draft Agenda**
2. Call to order, patent policy, and attendance
3. Plans for meeting in Portland: Planning scheduled sessions with teleconference bridge available (times below Pacific)

9:00am-11:30am

1:00pm - 3:00pm

3:30pm - 5:00 pm (Wednesday and Thursday only)

If you have a requested topic and timeslot, please let me know.

Requests so far: Location - Friday AM

1. Editor report
2. Motion 128: Resolve CID 5164 as "Revised" with a resolution of "Incorporate the text changes in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0714-01-000m-resolution-to-cid5164.docx> "

Mover: Seconder: Discussion: Result:

5. Comment resolution:

- Remaining editorial CIDs needing input: CID 6385,

also see 11-14-0935r2 Page 4; CID 6105  
- 11-15-0012r3 – Ganesh VENKATESAN, Intel;  
- OCB related CIDs: 5234, 6180, 6838

- RAC Comments

- Any additional available resolutions

6. AOB

6.1: Possible motion: Resolutions in 11-15-0565r3 "Motion MAC-AN" tab

(4 comments discussed in Vancouver)   
6.2: Updated spreadsheets with resolutions from 2015-05-29 teleconference not yet posted.  
Propose to defer these to June 17th.

7. Adjourn

* 1. **REVmc BRC Face to Face Meeting Planning**
     1. starts in 2 weeks in Hillsboro – June 17-19, 2015
     2. The meetings will be taking place at Intel Jones’ Farm campus:

2111 NE 25th Ave  
Hillsboro, OR 97124

<https://www.google.com/maps/d/viewer?msa=0&mid=zO-w9yqGJ4Bk.k5BPBMbB1gWg>

* + 1. Several are planning to attend in person
    2. We will have a WebEx for the session times noted:
       1. teleconference bridge available (times below Pacific)

9:00am-11:30am

1:00pm - 3:00pm

3:30pm - 5:00 pm (Wednesday and Thursday only)

* + 1. Hotel Choices:
    2. Many choices – no specific meeting hotel
    3. Adrian likes:

Extended Stay Deluxe - Portland - Hillsboro

19311 NW Cornell Road

Hillsboro OR 97124 USA

* + - 1. This is nothing special, but the Intel rate is < $100.
      2. It is within walking distance of shopping and dining.
      3. It is a 20 minute drive in traffic to the meeting.  You will need a car.
    1. Also try:

Fairfield Inn & Suites Portland West/Beaverton

15583 NW Gateway Court Cornell

Beaverton OR 97006 USA.

* + 1. The Intel rate is <$100.  It is about 4 miles further away from the Intel Campus.
    2. Other hotels are in area as well.
    3. Mark RISON requested that motions not be held in the third slot (15:30-17:00 local time) as it would be well past his bedtime by then and he might not be able to attend.  The Chair said she made note of his request.
  1. Editor Report Adrian STEPHENS (Intel)
     1. About 50 editor comments without resolutions
     2. Time has been spent on the “value of” etc. CIDs
     3. Discussion on some of the Editor comments needs to be done
     4. Thanks to Edward who has done a lot of heavy lifting, and we should have a draft before the July Plenary
     5. Non contentious Editorial Comments – those that have no objection may be speculatively edited.
        1. If there is concern with specific Editorial Comments, then let the Editor know to pull from the consent agreement, and then schedule some time to discuss during the Face to Face in Oregon
     6. There are 3 CIDs specifically noted in that list – 5230, 5232, 5233
  2. **Motion 128**: Resolve CID 5164 (MAC) as "Revised" with a resolution of "Incorporate the text changes in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0714-01-000m-resolution-to-cid5164.docx> "
     1. Moved: Adrian STEPHENS 2nd: Ganesh VENKATESAN
     2. Discussion: None
     3. Result: 8 yes, 0 no, 1 abstain - Motion passes
  3. **Review of doc:** 11-14/935r2 – Dorothy STANLEY (HP)
     1. Issues outstanding reviewed.
     2. CID 6385 – DS PHY issue? – need to determine the proper changes to address both CIDs (6385 and 6105).
     3. Transfer CID 6385 to GEN –
     4. Request to adjust Authorship for r2 -- request to remove and repost with updated authorship.
     5. PLME test mode deletion is another outstanding issue.
     6. Schedule this topic for Wed AM at the F2F in Oregon
  4. **Review doc: 11-15-0012r3** – Ganesh VENKATESAN (Intel)
     1. We discussed R2 during the Vancouver Session; we had some updates that were needed and recommendation to create 2 new variables rather than try to reuse other entry.
     2. Review the specific 2 changes made in this revision of the document
     3. dot11smt is controlled by the 802.11 ANA – please flag and but in a request for the number assignment.
     4. Review Dot11STALCIconfiguration has an uppercase “D” and question of if that is correct. – Yes, it was and the corresponding errors were corrected and the “35” changed to ANA request.
     5. There is a reference in the description that should be created as a reference rather than a text only reference.
     6. Review the structure of dot11STALCItable –
        1. Discussion on why the structure was as it is.
     7. Ganesh to post R4 and have a motion during the 1-3pm meeting on Wednesday in Portland
  5. **OCB related CIDs: 5234, 6180, 6838**
     1. CID 5234 (MAC)
        1. Defer to F2F
     2. CID 6180 (GEN)
        1. (Note: Adrian left the call at this point at 10:58ET)
        2. Review comment
        3. OCB operation uses EDCA, and would like to have it included in the definition of EDCA
        4. Proposed change: add to the first sentence of the definition to “The prioritized carrier sense multiple access with collision avoidance (CSMA/CA) access mechanism used by quality-of-service (QoS) stations (STAs) in a QoS basic service set (BSS) and STAs operating outside the context of a BSS .”
        5. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (GEN: 2015-06-06) add to the end of the first sentence of the definition of EDCA "and STAs operating outside the context of a BSS" on page 28L23.
        6. Mark ready for motion
     3. CID 6838 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Discussion on back-off parameters scope
        3. “Default” indicates a starting point, but allows for implication of changeable
        4. Discussion on whether or not to add a place to indicate when a default value would be or should be indicated.
        5. Mark the CID as Submission required and Assign this CID to Gloria Gwynne. Suggest adding an annex.
        6. Concern on the timeline to get change proposed in a timely manner.
        7. Gloria and Roy to discuss with the IEEE 1609WG
     4. We will discuss the other editorial comments from Gloria on June 17th during the Face to Face 3:30-5pm in Oregon. (WebEx will be scheduled and Gloria will be added on the invite for WebEx).
  6. RAC comments
     1. Not ready for today
  7. Next Meeting June 17-19 in Hillsboro OR
     1. Topics assigned so far
     2. Wed AM – CID 6385, also see 11-14-0935r2 page 4; CID 6105 (GEN); RAC Comments
     3. Weds PM1 – motions:
        1. Resolutions in 11-15-0565r3 – Motion MAC-AN” tab
        2. June 5 CIDs
        3. 11-15-0012r4
     4. Wed PM2 – 3:30-5:00pm
        1. Editorials needing input: 5230, 5232, 5233, 5234; Gloria’s Comments at 4pmPT
  8. Adjourned at 11:24ET

**References:**

May 29th, 2015:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0714-00-000m-resolution-to-cid5164.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0714-01-000m-resolution-to-cid5164.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-0935-01-000m-miscellaneous-802-11mc-d3-0-issues.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-0935-02-000m-miscellaneous-802-11mc-d3-0-issues.docx>

June 5th, 2015:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0714-01-000m-resolution-to-cid5164.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-0935-02-000m-miscellaneous-802-11mc-d3-0-issues.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0012-03-000m-location-capability-indication.doc>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0012-04-000m-location-capability-indication.doc>