IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Clause 8.4.2.1 Comment Resolutions | | | | |
| Date: 2015-05-12 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| SK Yong | Apple Inc |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document provides proposed comment resolutions for follow comments:

CID # 1628, 1399, 1362, 1356, 1505, 1504, 1395

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1628 | Robert Slater | 8.4.2.1 | 8 | 7 | T | SK Yong | Table 8-83 columns in P802.11REVmc\_D4.0 do not match those in this document | Add "Element ID Extension" column after "Element ID", and fill with <ANA> for all rows under the title row. |
| 1399 | Koichi Ishihara | 8.4.1. | 8 | 6 | G | SK Yong | I am not sure whether table number 8-83 is correct. | Please double check |
| 1362 | Jouni Malinen | 8.4.2.1 | 8 | 6 | T | SK Yong | P802.11aq/D1.0 is described as being an amendment to P802.11-REVmc/D4.0. However, the Table number or contents for the "Element IDs" table does not match that base document. Table 8-74 (not Table 8-83) is "Element IDs" in P802.11-REVmc/D4.0. In addition, that table has a new "Element ID Extension" column which is not included in P802.11aq/D1.0. | Replace "Table 8-83" with "Table 8-74" and add "Element ID Extension" column with appropriate values for the elements added in P802.11aq. |
| 1356 | Yasuhiko Inoue | 8.4.1. | 8 | 6 | G | SK Yong | I am not sure whether table number 8-83 is correct. | Please double check |

**`**

Proposed resolution: Revised

Update Table 8-83 in D1.0 as follows:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Element | Element ID | Element ID Extension | Extensible |
| Service Hint (see 8.4.2.171) | <ANA> | N/A | No |
| Service Advertisement (see 8.4.2.172) | <ANA> | <ANA> | No |
| Service Hash (see 8.4.2.173) | <ANA> | N/A | No |
| Supported ULP (see 8.4.2.174) | <ANA> | <ANA> | No |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1505 | Richard Roy | 8.4.2.1 | 9 | 5 | T | SK Yong | The text "(i.e., the receiving STA can respond to queries with and without proxying the query to a server in an external network)." seems out of place and context. | Reword it or remove it. |

Proposed resolution: Rejected

The text follows the style of the base standard for ANQP advertisement protocol ID

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1504 | Richard Roy | 8.4.2.1 | 9 | 4 | G | SK Yong | Change: "The ANQP-SD supports service information retrieval using ANQP-elements." | to: "The ANQP-SD supports user service information retrieval using ANQP-elements." |

Proposed resolution: Rejected

There is no justification for the change. Service information has nothing to do with user.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1395 | Santosh Abraham | 8.4.2.1 | 8 | 6 7 | T | SK Yong | Service Hint, Service Advertisement, Service Hash perform the same functionality of conveying service "name" information. Three ANA codes need not be used up. | Define a single element with a control field that conveys these different methods of indicating the service name or names information |

Proposed resolution: Rejected

Service Hint and Service Hash elements may be included in the beacon frames. Hence, the proposed change will incur additional complexity by having two elements with the same ID in the single frame.