IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Clause 8.4.4.21 Comment Resolutions |
| Date: 2015-05-12 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| SK Yong | Apple Inc |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document provides proposed comment resolutions for follow comments:

CID #,

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number (C)** | **Page(C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1518 | Richard Roy | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 2 | G | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | Change: "The Service Information Response ANQP-element is used to provide detailed service information between STAs, using the GAS protocol, in response to a Service Information Request ANQP-element. The Service Information Response ANQP-element is included in a GAS Query Response, sent by the AP to the non-AP STA." | to: "The User Service Information Response ANQP-element is sent by an AP in a GAS Query Response to a non-AP STA in response to a User Service Information Request ANQP-element received from the non-AP STA." |

Proposed resolution: Counter

Change the following setentece in 8.4.4.21 from

“The Service Information Response ANQP-element is used to provide detailed service information between STAs, using the GAS protocol, in response to a Service Information Request ANQP-element. The Service Information Response ANQP-element is included in a GAS Query Response, sent by the AP to the non-AP STA."

To

“The Service Information Response ANQP-element is sent by an AP to the non-AP STA and used to provide detailed service information in response to a Service Information Request ANQP-element. The Service Information Response ANQP-element is included in a GAS Query Response"

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1311 | Tomoko Adachi | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 22 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | How do you set a value in the Service Information Query Response field? | Clarify. |
| 1177 | Jarkko Kneckt | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 23 | E | Stephen McCann | poor english | write:"...is service-specific and contains the requested..." |
| 1520 | Richard Roy | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 22 | G | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | Change: "The Service Information Query Response field is a variable length field. The format of the Service 22 Information Query Response is service-specific that contains requested service information. 23The procedure used for this element is described in clause 10.25.3.2.11.2" | to: "The User Service Specific Information field is a variable length field that contains requested service information, the format of which is service-specific. This field contains infromation requested by the non-AP STA" |
| 1565 | Xiaofei Wang | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 22 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | The sentence "The format of the Service Information Query Response is service-specific that contains requested service information." is not clear. | Change the sentence to "The format of the Service Information Query Response field is service-specific and contains requested service information." |

Proposed resolution: Counter

Change the following setentece in 8.4.4.21 from

The Service Information Query Response field is a variable length field. The format of the Service Information Query Response is service-specific that contains requested service information.

To

“The Service Information Query Response field is a variable length field. The content of the Service Information Query Response field is service-specific based on the requested service information and is outside the scope of this specification”

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1279 | Stephen McCann | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 17 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | The "Service Information Response" ANQP-element appears to include a "Service Information Query Response" sub-element, which appears to be information. This is not very well defined at all and does not appear to be useful | The sub-field name "Service Information Query Response" needs to be clearly defined as something distinct and separate from the "Service Information Response" ANQP-element itself. At the moment it is very difficult to understand what this response is actually providing. |

Proposed resolution: Reject

Each subfield has been defined for the Service Information Response ANQP element.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1280 | Stephen McCann | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 23 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | What does the "Service Information Query Response" sub-field provide as extra service information, that is not already present in the "Basic Service Information Descriptor field "? | Create some text which defines what the "Service Information Response" sub-field is. |

Clarification:

The Basic Service Information Descriptors sub-field is defined in 8.4.2.172, which consists of Advertisment ID, Service Name and Service Status. This information is to provide a minimal but essential service information for device to make an informed decision to connect or to query for more information

Proposed resolution: Counter

See proposed resolution for CID #1311 and #1177

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1281 | Stephen McCann | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 35 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | The reference to the ULPs should be moved to clause 10.25.3.2.11.3 | Move the sentence starting "For more information on the ULPs, see Table 8-257b" to clause 10.25.3.2.11.3. |

Proposed resolution: Accept

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1336 | Yongho Seok | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 3 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | "The Service Information Response ANQP-element is included in a GAS Query Response, sent by the AP to the non-AP STA."In Table 10-16 - ANQP usage, the STA side usage of the Service Information Response ANQP-element is described as "T, R".Which one is correct? If "T,R" is correct, the Service Information Response ANQP-element can be also sent by the non-AP STA to the AP. | Please address this confliction. |

Proposed resolution: Counter

Update the Table 10-16 as follows

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Service Information Response  | 8.4.4.21 (Service Information Response ANQP- element)  | S  | T~~, R~~  | ~~T,~~ R  | T, R  |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1347 | Lei Wang | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 16 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | what's the unit of the field "Service Information Query Response Length"? Do we really need a 2-byte lenth field, which gives 64K values? | please clarify. Particularly, to check if we can reduce the length field to 1 byte. |

Clarification:

Yes. Service information can go beyond 256 bytes and thus 2-bytes length field is needed.

Proposed resolution: Reject

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1397 | Santosh Abraham | 8.4.4.21 | 14 |  | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | The length of the "Basic Service Descriptor" Field is not known, so the start of the "Service Information Query Response Length" field cannot be determined | One possible option is to move the postion of the "Basic Service Information Descriptor" field after the "Service Information Query Response" field |

Proposed resolution: Reject

The length of the Basic Service Descriptor sub-field is variable but is known (4 bytes Advertisment ID, 1 byte Status, 1 byte Service Name length and variable-length Service Nam) by decoding the Service Name length.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1310 | Tomoko Adachi | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 22 | E | Stephen McCann | The Service Information Query Response Length field should be described. | Begin a new line after l.21 saying that the Service Information Query Response Length field contains the length of the Service information Query Response field. |
| 1441 | Yunsong Yang | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 22 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | Missing the text describing the Service Information Query Response Length field. | Add the text describing the Service Information Query Response Length field. |
| 1564 | Xiaofei Wang | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 22 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | The description for Service Information Query Response Length is missing. | add description for Service Information Query Response Length |

Proposed resolution: Counter

Add the following sentence after line 21.

The Service Information Query Response Length field contains the length of the Service Information Query Response field.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1519 | Richard Roy | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 16 | G | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | Change "Service Information Query Repsonse" | to: 'User Service Specific Information (SSI)" here and throughout the document including Table 8-607c. |

Proposed resolution: Reject

There is no justification for the change. Service information has nothing to do with user.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1566 | Xiaofei Wang | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 23 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | The sentence "The procedure used for this element is described in clause 10.25.3.2.11.2" is confusing. A element can be used in a procedure; however, it is probably not right to say that a procedure is used for an element. | Change the sentence to "The usage of this element is described in 10.25.3.2.11.2 (Service Information Response procedure)." |
| 1590 | Joseph Levy | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 24 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | There is no need to reference where the procedure that uses this element is described. | Delete the sentence: "The procedure used for this element is described in clause 10.25.3.2.11.2" |

Proposed resolution 1: Counter

Change the sentence in 8.4.4.21 from

"The procedure used for this element is described in clause 10.25.3.2.11.2"

to

 "The usage of this element is described in 10.25.3.2.11.2.”

Proposed resolution 2: Counter

Delete the following sentence in 8.4.4.21

"The procedure used for this element is described in clause 10.25.3.2.11.2"

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1589 | Joseph Levy | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 2 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | The way the Service Information Response ANQP-element is used does not need to be described in clause 8. Therefore the description should be removed. | Replace the following two sentences: "The Service Information Response ANQP-element is used to provide detailed service information between STAs, using the GAS protocol, in response to a Service Information Request ANQP-element. The Service Information Response ANQP-element is included in a GAS Query Response, sent by the AP to the non-AP STA."With: "A GAS Query Response may contain a Service Information Response ANQP-element to provide requested service information." |

Proposed resolution: ?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1440 | Yunsong Yang | 8.4.4.21 | 14 | 8 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | In 8.4.4.20, a Service Information Request ANQP-element can only query one service. But here a Service Information Response ANQP-element can contain service information of multiple services. It seems the design is not consistent. | Change the design such that both Service Information Request and Service Information Response ANQP-elements can contain a query and a response, respectively, for only one service. Change the figures and description text accordingly. |

Proposed resolution: Counter

Change the the following sentence in 8.4.4.21:

 “The Detailed Service Information Descriptors field contains one or more Detailed Service Information Descriptor sub-fields”

 to

“The Detailed Service Information Descriptors field is a variable length field.”

Change the following sentence in 10.25.3.2.11.2:

“It contains a list of Service Information Descriptors resulting from the service discovery as described in Annex AQ”

 to

“It contains the Detailed Service Information Descriptors resulting from the service discovery as described in Annex AQ”