IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LB 207 Comment Resolution for Miscellaneous | | | | |
| Date: 2014-03-04 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. | 5775 Morehouse Dr, San Diego, CA 92109 | +1-858-658-5302 | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Qi Xue | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  |  |
| Yongho Seok | Newracom |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for comments in multiple subclauses of TGah Draft 4.0 with the following CIDs (TOT 24 CIDs):

* 6025, 6047, 6060, 6061, 6062, 6066, 6073, 6081, 6082, 6092,
* 6093, 6116, 6117, 6118, 6119, 6128, 6138, 6173, 6230, 6207,
* 6177, 6234 6213, 6216

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.
* Rev 1: Correcting the editing instruction errors

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 6025 | MARC EMMELMANN | 80.31 | 8.2.4.1.20 | Missing "the" before "AP-PM" and "AP" (lines 31, 32, 33) | Insert "the" per comment | Accepted –  Note to TGah editor: This is an inline instruction which need to be applied 3 times as per comment |
| 6047 | MARC EMMELMANN | 165.5 | 8.4.2.198 | Value of Sounding Option is important. Use equals instead of is (or use "is equal to"); Same issue in next cls. | is --> equals | Revised –  For consistency propose the use of “is equal to”.  TGah editor to insert “equal to” in P165L5. |
| 6060 | Mitsuru Iwaoka | 202.54 | 8.8.1 | "short MAC header" and "short MAC frame" are obsolete. See CID 5277 of LB205. | Replace "short MAC" with "PV1 MAC" throughout the draft (P93L52, P93L54, P93L63, P93L64, P94L1, P202L54, P202L60, P202L63, P203L48, P203L61,P205L61,P207L5, P207L7, and P554L8) | Accepted |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 6061 | Mitsuru Iwaoka | 202.52 | 8.8.1 | "short frame", "short data frame", "short QoS data frame", "short control frame" and "short management frame" are obsolete. See CID 5277 of LB205. | Replace "short frame" with "PV1 frame" throughout the draft (P73L29, P88L18, P88L20, P202L52, P202L60, P202L63, P202L64, P203L37, P203L50, P203L51, P203L56, P204L16, P204L20, P204L23, P204L57, P204L58-63, P205L1, P205L12, P205L13, P205L16, P205L56, P206L1, P206L10, P206L15, P206L22, P206L31, P206L39, P207L1-2, P521L30, P525L6, P534L22, and P534L26).  Replace "short data frame" with "PV1 QoS Data frame" throughout the draft (P206L36, P207L31, P521L47, P525L33, P529L7, and P529L17).  Replace "short QoS data" with "PV1 QoS data " throughout the draft (P204L57, P204L63, P205L3, P205L25, and P205L31).  Replace "short control frame" with "PV1 Control frame" throughout the draft (P204L1-2, P204L62, P205L5-6, P207L34, P208L1, P208L4, P208L5, P208L16, P208L18, P208L21, and P208L40).  Replace "short management frame" with "PV1 Management frame" throughout the draft (P205L8-9, P207L32, P211L16, P380L26, P280L28, and P380L36). | Accepted |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 6062 | Mitsuru Iwaoka | 95.5 | 8.3.3.5 | "dot11ShortMACHeaderOptionImplemented"is obsolete. See CID 5277 of LB205. | Replace "dot11ShortMACHeaderOptionImplemented" with "dot11PV1MACHeaderOptionImplemented" throughout the draft (P95L5, P96L20, P97L5, P98L20, P551L20,P553L64, and P575L57) | Accepted |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 6066 | Mitsuru Iwaoka | 305.60 | 9.47.2 | "The first paragraph of 9.47.2 is a bit confusing. The first, second, and the last sentence specify how a transmitting STA signals the Response Indication. However, the 3rd sentence (The reception of ...) describe how the recipient STA recognizes the Response Indication.  Table 9-1a clearly specifies that the RESPONSE\_INDICATION value of NDP Block Ack is No Response, it is not necessary to describe the Response Indication value of the NDP Block Ack here.  Also, in a BDT exchange, the Response Indication of NDP PS-Poll-Ack is always Long Response. It is not necessary to specify how No Response is signaled for NDP PS-Poll-Ack frame." | "1) Delete the following 3rd sentence (P306L1):  ""The reception of NDP BlockAck signals a Response Indication of No Response.""  2) Replace ""NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack"" with ""NDP Ack"" in the second sentence (P306L1).  3) Rewrite this paragraph using active voice as follows:  ""Throughout this subclause, an S1G STA signals a Response Indication of Long Response by setting the TXVECTOR's parameter RESPONSE\_INDICATION to Long Response for non-NDP frames and by setting the Idle Indication field to 1 and the Duration field to 0 for NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack frame. The S1G STA signals Response Indication of No Response by setting the TXVECTOR's parameter RESPONSE\_INDICATION to No Response for non-NDP frames or by setting the Idle Indication field to 0 and the Duration field to 0 for NDP Ack frames. The S1G STA signals Response Indication of Normal Response by setting the TXVECTOR's parameter RESPONSE\_INDICATION to Normal Response for non-NDP frames.""" | Revised –  Agree in principle with most of the proposed changes (except for item 2). Please note that the NDP PS-Poll-Ack can signal either long response or no response as indicated by 9.3.2.4a. Please refer to P238L22.  TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-15/0303r1 under all headings that include CID 6066. |

**Discussion:** *None.*

**9.47.2 Rules for BDT**

**TGah Editor: *Change the paragraphs below as follows (#6066):***

Throughout this subclause, an S1G STA signals a Response Indication of Long Response by setting the TXVECTOR's parameter RESPONSE\_INDICATION to Long Response for non-NDP frames and by setting the Idle Indication field to 1 and the Duration field to 0 for NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack frames. The S1G STA signals a Response Indication of No Response by setting the TXVECTOR's parameter RESPONSE\_INDICATION to No Response for non-NDP frames or by setting the Idle Indication field to 0 and the Duration field to 0 for NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack frames. The S1G STA signals a Response Indication of Normal Response by setting the TXVECTOR's parameter RESPONSE\_INDICATION to Normal Response for non-NDP frames.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 6073 | Mitsuru Iwaoka | 163.25 | 8.4.2.198 | As 2 octet length channel activity schedules and 4 octet length channel activity schedules can be mixed, length of Channel Activity Schedule subfield can be (N1 x 2 + N2 x 4), N = N1 + N2. | "1) Replace ""N+2 or N+4"" with ""variable"" in Figure 8-575a29.  2) Modify the third paragraph (P163L32 ""N is the number..."" ) as follows:  ""Channel Activity Schedule subfield contains one or more channel activity schedules.""" | Accepted |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 6081 | Robert Stacey | 74 | 8.2.4.1.1 | Duplicate listing of field names present in figure | Remove field enumeration. Figure is sufficiently clear. | Revised –  Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution is inline with the suggested change.  TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-15/0303r1 under all headings that include CID 6081. |
| 6082 | Robert Stacey | 74 | 8.2.4.1.1 | Duplicate listing of field names present in figure | Remove field enumeration. Figure is sufficiently clear. | Revised –  Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution is inline with the suggested change.  TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-15/0303r1 under all headings that include CID 6082. |
| 6092 | Robert Stacey | 237 |  | "valid Duration field". Under what condition is a Duration field invalid? | Delete "valid" or claiify | Rejected –  The comment fails to identify a technical issue and is asking a question. The duration field is invalid when the FCS of the frame carrying the field fails. Please note that the same terminology is used in REVmc D3.0 as well in the beginning of this subclause:  “A STA that receives at least one valid frame in a PSDU can update its NAV with the information from any valid Duration field in the PSDU.” |
| 6093 | Robert Stacey | 239 |  | What is a "valid nonzero Duration field"? The subclause on Duration/ID field does not identify any invalid values. | Delete "valid" or claiify | Rejected –  The comment fails to identify a technical issue and is asking a question. The duration field is invalid when the FCS of the frame carrying the field fails. Please note that the same terminology is used in REVmc D3.0 as well in the beginning of this subclause:  “A STA that receives at least one valid frame in a PSDU can update its NAV with the information from any valid Duration field in the PSDU.” |

8.2.4.1.1 General

**TGah Editor: *Change the paragraphs below as follows (#6081, 6082):***

For a frame carried in an S1G PPDU, when the value of the Type subfield is equal to 1 and the value of the Subtype subfield is not equal to 3 and not equal to 10, the format of the Frame Control field is illustrated in Figure 8-3a (Frame Control field in S1G PPDU when Type is 1 and Subtype is not equal to 3 and not equal to 10).

For a frame carried in an S1G PPDU, when the value of the Type subfield is equal to 1 and the value of the Subtype subfield is equal to 3, the format of the Frame Control field is illustrated in Figure 8-3b (Frame Control field in S1G PPDU when Type is 1 and Subtype is equal to 3).

For a frame carried in an S1G PPDU, when the value of the Type subfield is equal to 1 and the value of the Subtype subfield is equal to 10, the format of the Frame Control field is illustrated in Figure 8-3c (Frame Control field in S1G PPDU when Type is 1 and Subtype is equal to 10).

When the value of the Type subfield is equal to 3 and the value of the Subtype subfield is equal to 1, the format of the Frame Control field is shown in Figure 8-3d (Frame Control field format when Type is equal to 3 and Subtype is equal to 1).

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 6116 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 99.39 | 8.3.3.10 | The underline is lost in the last paragraph. Underline the last Sentence of the last column. | As in comment. | Accepted |
| 6117 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 123.65 | 8.4.2.30 | Instruction to the editor not correct. It should be Table 8-172. | Replace "172" with "152". Same in P124L49. | Accepted |
| 6118 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 125.17 | 8.4.2.30 | The changes to this paragraph are not inline with REVmc D3.0. Make them inline with REVmc D3.0 or later. | As in comment. Note: Probably just underlining this sentence is fine (and updating the table number of the deleted reference). | Revised –  TGah editor to underline the sentence and update the table references inline with REVmc D3.0 |
| 6119 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 128.1 | 8.4.2.30 | This is an instruction to the editor. Change the font to Bold and italic. | As in comment. | Accepted |
| 6128 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 171.49 | 8.4.2.204 | As pointed out by the Editor's note. Remove this paragraph as there is no Relay Station Indication field. |  | Accepted   * TGah editor Remove this paragraph as there is no Relay Station Indication field. |
| 6138 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 229.11 | 8.8.5.4 | Typo: change "witht" to "with" | as in comment | Accepted |
| 6173 | Joseph Levy | 305.37 | 9.47 | The font is not of the same size in the title of 9.47 | change it to the same font size | Accepted  Note to the editor: the change relates to the “T” of the TXOP of the title. |
| 6230 | Joseph Levy |  | 9.47 | The font is not of the same size in the title of 9.47 | change it to the same font size | Accepted  Note to the editor: the change relates to the “T” of the TXOP of the title. |
| 6207 | Joseph Levy |  | 8.9.1.8.1 | The acronym PTSF and ASD are not clearly defined | provide definition | Rejected –  The PTSF and ASD in this subclause refer to the name of subfields, namely PTSF subfield and ASD subfield. Hence they are clearly defined as subfields. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 6177 | Joseph Levy | 221.56 | 8.9.1.3.2. | The description "Set to a value between 2 and 9 to indicate the relative position of the selected SST channel with respect to the lowest numbered channel in the SST Enabled Channel Bitmap field of a received SST Operation element. For example, a value of the UDI equal to 2 indicates that the selected SST channel is the first channel in the SST Enabled Channel Bitmap." is unclear and confusing and should be clarified. | Clarify the sentence and settings. | Revised –  To better clarify we propose another example of the field setting.  TGah editor to replace: “For example, a value of the UDI equal to 2 indicates that the selected SST channel is the first channel in the SST Enabled Channel Bitmap." with “For example, a value of the UDI equal to 2 indicates that the selected SST channel is the first channel in the SST Enabled Channel Bitmap, while a value of the UDI equal to 3 indicates that the selected SST channel is the second channel in the SST Enabled Channel Bitmap, etc." |
| 6234 | Joseph Levy |  | 8.9.1.3.2. | The description "Set to a value between 2 and 9 to indicate the relative position of the selected SST channel with respect to the lowest numbered channel in the SST Enabled Channel Bitmap field of a received SST Operation element. For example, a value of the UDI equal to 2 indicates that the selected SST channel is the first channel in the SST Enabled Channel Bitmap." is unclear and confusing and should be clarified. | Clarify the sentence and settings. | Revised –  This is a duplicate CID. Proposed resolution si the same as its duplicate 6177. See resolution of CID 6177. |
| 6213 | Joseph Levy |  | 9.3.2.10a | According to rev.mc VHT-single MPDU is defined as "An MPDU that is the only MPDU in an aggregate MPDU (A-MPDU) carried in a VHT physical layer (PHY) protocol data unit (PPDU) and that is carried in an A-MPDU subframe with the EOF subfield of the MPDU delimiter field equal to 1.", therefore, there is no need to explicitly include VHT-sibgle MPDU in the sentence. | remove "or a VHT single MPDU" | Accepted |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 6216 | Joseph Levy |  | 9.47.2 | It is not specified whether AC constraint is used in BDT for non-TXOP holder | Specify whether the non-TXOP holder in BDT exchange is constraint by the AC used by the TXOP holder | Revised –  Agree in principle with the comment that there is no constraint specified for the AC. Proposed resolution is to indicate that there is no such constraint.  TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-15/0303r1 under all headings that include CID 6216. |

**9.47.2 Rules for BDT**

**TGah Editor: *Change the paragraphs below as follows (#6216):***

The total duration of the BDT Initiator PPDUs shall not exceed the TXOP limit as described in 9.22.2.3 (EDCA TXOPs). The BDT responder PPDU transmission(s) and any expected responses shall fit entirely within the remaining TXOP or SP duration, as indicated in the Duration/ID field of the latest MPDU transmitted by the BDT initiator. The PPDUs may carry Data frames of any TID. A BDT exchange is subject to TXOP duration limits for the current AC.