IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| LB 207 MAC Miscellaneous Comment Resolution |
| Date: 2015-03-03 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Yongho Seok | NEWRACOM |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions of MAC miscellaneous comments received from TGah Draft 4.0.

* CIDs: 6002, 6003, 6004, 6065, 6113, 6206, 6064 (7 CIDs)

Note) Revision 1 includes the resolution of CID 6064.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6002 |  |  | The resolution for CID 5057 in document https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-1372-09-00ah-tgah-lb205-comments-on-d3-0.xlsx explains what the usage and funciton of the primitive is. This seperation as given in the explanation is not so clearly given in the draft (which likely requiered the verbose explanaiton in the response to the comment).Also, refering to 11mc which is claimed to use similar wording, is not an appropriate response. TGah has added the text (respectively changed the paragraph of the baseline) that was commented on in the previous comment. Hence the comment was valid.The fact that 11mc used unspecific, unclear, or errorneous wording is not a justification for 11ah to repeat the text and claim that changes to this new text, added by 11ah, should be made in 11mc. | Accept the proposed change per previous comment | Revised-CID 5057 is as the following: The text is worded as such it describes when the primitive is GENERATED and not HOW IT IS USED (function)And, the CID 5057 in previous LB was rejected as the following: The current wording is saying both when this primitive is generated and what is the function.Group still thinks that current woring does not have any issue. But, group suggests to change the wording for emphasizing the function of the primitive. TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-15/0275r2 under all headings that include CID 6002. |
| 6003 |  |  | The resolution for CID 5058 in document https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-1372-09-00ah-tgah-lb205-comments-on-d3-0.xlsx explains what the usage and funciton of the primitive is. This seperation as given in the explanation is not so clearly given in the draft (which likely requiered the verbose explanaiton in the response to the comment).Also, refering to 11mc which is claimed to use similar wording, is not an appropriate response. TGah has added the text (respectively changed the paragraph of the baseline) that was commented on in the previous comment. Hence the comment was valid.The fact that 11mc used unspecific, unclear, or errorneous wording is not a justification for 11ah to repeat the text and claim that changes to this new text, added by 11ah, should be made in 11mc. | Accept the proposed change per previous comment | Revised-CID 5058 is as the following: The text is worded as such it describes when the primitive is GENERATED and not HOW IT IS USED (function)And, the CID 5058 in previous LB was rejected as the following: The current wording is saying both when this primitive is generated and what is the function.Group still thinks that current woring does not have any issue. But, group suggests to change the wording for emphasizing the function of the primitive. TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-15/0275r2 under all headings that include CID 6003. |
| 6004 |  |  | The resolution for CID 5059 in document https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-1372-09-00ah-tgah-lb205-comments-on-d3-0.xlsx explains what the usage and funciton of the primitive is. This seperation as given in the explanation is not so clearly given in the draft (which likely requiered the verbose explanaiton in the response to the comment).Also, refering to 11mc which is claimed to use similar wording, is not an appropriate response. TGah has added the text (respectively changed the paragraph of the baseline) that was commented on in the previous comment. Hence the comment was valid.The fact that 11mc used unspecific, unclear, or errorneous wording is not a justification for 11ah to repeat the text and claim that changes to this new text, added by 11ah, should be made in 11mc. | Accept the proposed change per previous comment | Revised-CID 5059 is as the following: The text is worded as such it describes when the primitive is GENERATED and not HOW IT IS USED (function)And, the CID 5059 in previous LB was rejected as the following: The current wording is saying both when this primitive is generated and what is the function.Group still thinks that current woring does not have any issue. But, group suggests to change the wording for emphasizing the function of the primitive. TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-15/0275r2 under all headings that include CID 6004. |
| 6113 | 6.3.7.2 | 22.61 | The listen interval parameter in the (Re-)Association responses is provided by the AID Response element. Hence this ListenInterval parameter is a duplicate which needs to be removed. Remove ListenInterval from P22L61, P23L26, P31L60, P32L26, P36L3, P36L36 | As in comment. | Accepted-TGah editor remove ListenInterval from P22L61, P23L26, P31L60, P32L26, P36L3, P36L36.  |
| 6065 | 9.20a | 269.07 | DFS (dynamic frequency selection) is only applicable to 5 GHz band. DO (DFS Owner) is not exist in S1G. | Delete the following text at P269L7;"or from the DO of the IBSS of which it is a member". | Revised- Agree in principle. DFS Owner does not exist in S1G band.But, in this sentence, a DO represents a STA transmitting a beacon in IBSS. TGah editor replace “from the DO of the IBSS” to “from the STA transmitting a Beacon of the IBSS”. |
| 6206 |  | 267.00 | The condition in the 1st row of table 9-9a is misleading. It suggests this definition of PARTIAL\_AID only applies to frames addressed to an AP. There are some cases where the PARTIAL\_AID defined in this row is used in frames sent by the AP, e.g. NDP CTS frame with address indicator set to 1 | Correct the Condition so that it is clear when the partial BSSID defined in this row is used.  | Revised- Agree in principle. TGah editor replace the condition of the second raw in Table 9-9a from “A frame that is addressed to an AP” to “A frame that is addressed to an AP or send by an AP as a broadcast address”. |
| 6064 | 341.01 | 10.1.3.10.2 | The IBSS functionality of S1G STA specified in this draft is not complete. To support IBSS, at least following modifications are necessary;1) Modify 10.1.2.2 (TSF for an IBSS), 10.1.3.5 (Beacon generation in an IBSS), and (10.2.3 Power management in an IBSS) to use the S1G Beacon.2) Modify 10.1.3.5 (Beacon generation in an IBSS) to support TSBTT or modify 10.1.3.10.2 (Generation of S1G Beacon frames) to prohibit TSBTT in the IBSS.3) It is necessary to specify that NDP CMAC frames and some PV1 frames (e.g. Type 1 data frames) cannot be used in the IBSS as Association ID (AID) is not available in the IBSS.4) Modify 10.48 (S1G BSS operation) to add the IBSS support.5) Modify Annex B (PICS) to add the capabilities necessary for the IBSS support (CF2.2). | Add the necessary modification as in the comment, or delete the support of IBSS for the S1G STA. | Revised- Agree in principle. In IBSS, TSBTT is not used to simplify the protocol of S1G STA. And, Header Compression frames, PV1 frames NDP CMAC is not suppored in S1G IBSS. TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-15/0275r2 under all headings that include CID 6064. |

**Propose:**

Revised for CID 6002, 6003, 6004, 6064, per discussion and editing instructions in 11-15/0275r2.

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraphs below as follows***

**6.3.103.5 MLME-AIDSWITCH.response**

**6.3.103.5.1 Function**

This primitive is used to send an AID Switch Response frame, ~~either generated~~ in response to a received AID Switch Request frame or autonomously by the AP ~~and requests the transmission of an AID Switch Response frame~~.

**6.3.108.5 MLME-TWTSETUP.response**

**6.3.108.5.1 Function**

This primitive is used to send a TWT Setup frame, ~~generated~~ in response to a received TWT Setup frame ~~and requests the transmission of a TWT Setup frame~~.

**6.3.111.5 MLME-HEADERCOMPRESSION.response**

**6.3.111.5.1 Function**

This primitive is used to send a Header Compression frame, ~~generated~~ in response to a received Header Compression frame ~~and requests the transmission of a Header Compression frame~~.

**6.3.113.5 MLME-CONTROLRESPONSEMCS.response**

**6.3.113.5.1 Function**

This primitive is used to send a Control Response MCS Negotiation Response frame, ~~generated~~ in response to a received Control Response MCS Negotiation Request frame ~~and requests the transmission of a Control Response MCS Negotiation Response frame~~.

**6.3.114.5 MLME-RELAYACTIVATE.response**

**6.3.114.5.1 Function**

This primitive is used to send a Relay Activation Response frame, ~~generated~~ in response to a received Relay Activation Request frame ~~and requests the transmission of a Relay Activation Response frame~~.

**10.1.2.2 TSF for an IBSS**

The TSF in an IBSS shall be implemented via a distributed algorithm that shall be performed by all of the members of the BSS. Each STA in the IBSS shall transmit Beacon or S1G Beacon frames according to the algorithm described in this clause. Each IBSS STA shall adopt the TSF value received from any Beacon or S1G Beacon frame or (Short) probe response from the IBSS of which it is a member and which has a TSF value later than its own TSF timer. Within an IBSS in S1G band the generation and/or reception of a Beacon frame and all references to it, refer to that of the S1G Beacon frame.

**10.1.3.5 Beacon generation in an IBSS**

Beacon generation in an IBSS is distributed. The beacon period is included in Beacon, Announce, and Probe Response frames, and a STA shall adopt that beacon period when joining the IBSS. All members of the IBSS participate in beacon generation. Each STA shall maintain its own TSF timer that is used for dot11BeaconPeriod timing. The beacon interval within an IBSS is established by the STA at which the MLME-START.request primitive is performed to create the IBSS. An S1G STA in an IBSS has dot11ShortBeaconInterval set to false. This defines a series of TBTTs exactly dot11BeaconPeriod TUs apart. Time zero is defined to be a TBTT. At each TBTT the STA shall

**9.55 Generation of PV1 MPDUs and header compression procedure**

After association, an S1G STA with dot11PV1MACHeaderOptionImplemented equal to true may transmit Header Compression frames and PV1 frames. An S1G STA shall not transmit PV1 frames with Type subfield equal to 3 to a peer STA unless the PV1 Data Type 3 Supported subfield is 1 in the most recently received Header Compression element sent by the peer STA. A non-S1G STA or an S1G STA in an IBSS shall not transmit Header Compression frames or PV1 frames.

**9.56 Transmission of an S1G NDP CMAC frame**

An S1G STA shall transmit an S1G NDP CMAC frame using the following TXVECTOR parameters:

—NDP\_INDICATION set to 1

—NUM\_STS indicates one space-time stream

—APEP\_LENGTH set to 0

—NUM\_USERS set to 1

An S1G STA in an IBSS shall not transmit an S1G NDP CMAC frame, except for an NDP Ack, NDP BlockAck or NDP Probe Request frames.

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraphs below as follows***

## B.4.4.2 MAC frames

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Item** | **MAC frame** | **References** | **Status** |
| FT44 | S1G Beacon | Clause 8 (Frame formats) | ((CF1 OR CF2.2) AND CF32):M |

B.4.28.1 S1G MAC features

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Item** | **Protocol capability** | **References** | **Status** |
| S1GM2.2 | Signaling of S1G operation in S1G Beacon, Probe Response | 8.4.2.209 (S1G Operation element), 8.3.3.2, 8.3.3.10 | ((CF1 OR CF2.2) AND CF32):M |