IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| LB 205 Comment Resolution for Subclause 10.4.2, 9.42d.2 |
| Date: 2015-01-12 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Chao-Chun Wang | MediaTek Inc. |  |  | chaochun.wang@mediatek.com |

Abstract

This document provides resolutions for CID 5340, 5341, 5381, 5383, 5384, 5386, 5420

CIDs: 5340, 5341

The changes are in the following subclause: 10.4.2

CID 5381, 5383, 5384, 5386, 5420

The changes are in the following subclause: 9.42d.2

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Changes** |
| 5340 | 10.42 | 353 | 60 | This last sentence should be an item of the list. | Move "Using individually addressed Operating Mode Notification frames" as an individual item of the list. |
| 5341 | 10.42 | 354 | 21 | This field is called "Supported Channel Width" in an S1G Capabilities element. | Pick one and use consistently. |

**Discussion:**

CID 5340:

**Page 353, line 60**

“An S1G AP should notify associated STAs of a change in its operating channel width through one or more of the following mechanisms:

—Using the Extended Channel Switch Announcement element, Extended Channel Switch Announce­ment frame or both, following the procedure described in 10.10 (Extended channel switching (ECS))Using individually addressed Operating Mode Notification frames

—Using the Channel Width subfield in the S1G Operation element.

“

Agree with the suggestion

CID 5341:

The field name is correct in D 3.0.

**Proposed Response:**

CID 5340: Agree

CID 5341: Reject

**Proposed Resolution Text:**

CID 5340:

***Instruct the editor to revise Clause 10.4.2 , “Notification of operating mode changes” as proposed below***

“An S1G AP should notify associated STAs of a change in its operating channel width through one or more of the following mechanisms:

—Using the Extended Channel Switch Announcement element, Extended Channel Switch Announce­ment frame or both, following the procedure described in 10.10 (Extended channel switching (ECS))

* Using individually addressed Operating Mode Notification frames

—Using the Channel Width subfield in the S1G Operation element.

“

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Changes** |
| 5381 | 9.42d.2 | 299 | 12 | The signaling of No Response for NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack specified in the first paragraph of 9.42d.2 differs from the Table 9-1a (RESPONSE\_INDICATION value for NDP MAC frames) in the subclause 9.3.2.4a (Setting and resetting the RID). | Modify the second sentence of the first paragraph of 9.42d.2 as follows:---A Response Indication of No Response is signaled by setting the TXVECTOR's parameter RESPONSE\_INDICATION to No Response for non-NDP frames and by setting either the Idle Indication field to 0 or the Duration field to a nonzero value for NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack. |
| 5383 | 9.42d.2 | 299 | 26 | A RESPONSE\_INDICATION value of an NDP PS-Poll-Ack that initiates a BDT sequence is not specified. Subitem 1) to 3) of item a) of the third paragraph (P299L29) seems to be not applied to the NDP PS-Poll-Ack frame. | Change the first sentence of item a) of the third paragraph as follows:"The transmission of either an NDP PS-Poll-Ack with Response Indication of Long Response or one PPDU that satisfies the following conditions:" |
| 5384 | 9.42d.2 | 299 | 27 | An S1G STA may initiate Reverse direction (RD) exchange sequence by transmission of a PPDU containing one or more +HTC PV0 MPDUs in which the RDG/More PPDU subfield is equal to 1. According to the Table 9-4a (Setting the TXVECTOR's parameter RESPONSE\_INDICATION) of 9.3.2.15, the TXVECTOR parameter RESPONSE\_INDICATION of the PPDU that initiates RD exchange sequence is Long Response. So, the same PPDU can initiate a BDT sequence. A responding STA cannot know whether the RD sequence or BDT sequence is expected.A +HTC PV0 MPDU with the RDG/More PPDU subfield equal to 1 should not be used to initiate BDT sequence. | Insert a following text as the 4th condition of the BDT Initiator (P299L34):---4) contains no HT Control field with the RDG/More PPDU subfield equal to 1. |
| 5386 | 9.42d.2 | 299 | 60 | The fifth paragraph (P299L60) specifies that a BDT Responder sending a BDT response burst containing an immediate response to an eliciting PPDU that had the More Data field equal to 1 shall set the Response Indication to Long Response for \*each\* PPDU in the BDT response burst. However, the item b) of the third paragraph (P299L39) specifies that all PPDUs in the BDT response burst except the last one shall indicate "No Response" in the response indication field. | Change the fifth paragraph as follows:---A BDT Responder sending a BDT response burst containing an immediate response to an eliciting PPDU that had the More Data field equal to 1 shall set the Response Indication to Long Response for the last PPDU in the BDT response burst. |
| 5420 | 9.42d.2 | 299 | 61 | Change "each PPDU" to the last PPDU" because there is a rule that "All the other PPDUs in the BDT response burst (if there are any) except the last one shall indicate "No Response" in the response indication field." | Change "each PPDU" to the last PPDU" |

**Discussion:**

CID 5381:

P 299, line 12.

“Throughout this subclause, a Response Indication of Long Response is signaled by setting the TXVECTOR's parameter RESPONSE\_INDICATION to Long Response for non-NDP frames **and** by setting the Idle Indication field to 1 and the Duration field to 0 for NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack.”

The long response indication are set by either

1. “TXVECTOR's parameter RESPONSE\_INDICATION to Long Response for non-NDP frames” or
2. “ Idle Indication field value is 1 and Duration field value is 0” in for NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack.

The comment can be addressed by changing the “and” to “or”

CID 5383:

The comment says, “A RESPONSE\_INDICATION value of an NDP PS-Poll-Ack that initiates a BDT sequence is not specified.” which is incorrect. It is clearly specified in the specification.

In line 27, page 299, “ a)The transmission of one PPDU that **is either an NDP PS-Poll-Ack frame** or that satisfies the following conditions:”

The comment is rejected.

CID 5384:

From table 9-4a, the long response indicates one of the flowing operations,

“The addressed recipient may return a response frame which is not an individual control response frame. More details are provided in 9.42d (Bidirectional TXOP), 9.28 (Reverse direction protocol), and 9.32.3 (Explicit feedback beamforming).”

But, there is no mention of how “long response” affect RD operation in 9.28. There is also no description how “long response” affect Explicit feedback beamforming. Unless there are text describing the operations, the statement in te table create confusion. Suggest to remove the last sentence.

CID 5386, 5420:

The comments are correct.

**Proposed Response:**

CID 5381: Counter

CID 5383: Reject

CID 5384: Counter

CID 5386, 5420: Accept

**Proposed Resolution Text:**

***CID 5381***

***Instruct the editor to revise Clause 9.42d.2, (***P 299, line 12) with following revision,

“Throughout this subclause, a Response Indication of Long Response is signaled by setting the TXVECTOR's parameter RESPONSE\_INDICATION to Long Response for non-NDP frames  **or** by setting the Idle Indication field to 1 and the Duration field to 0 for NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack.”

***CID 5384:***

***Instruct the editor to revise Table 9.4*** with following revision,

From table 9-4a, the long response indicates one of the flowing operations,

“The addressed recipient may return a response frame which is not an individual control response frame..”

***CID 5386, 5420:***

***Instruct the editor to revise 9.42d.2 p299 line 61***with following revision,

A BDT Responder sending a BDT response burst containing an immediate response to an eliciting PPDU that had the More Data field equal to 1 shall set the Response Indication to Long Response for last PPDU in the BDT response burst.