IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| LB 203 Comment Resolution for Miscellaneous part 2 |
| Date: 2014-09-01 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. | 5775 Morehouse Dr, San Diego, CA 92109 | +1-858-658-5302 | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for comments in different subclauses of TGah Draft 2.0 with the following CIDs (TOT 12 CIDs):

* 3161
* 3007, 3009
* 3031, 3033
* 3034, 3387, 3388
* 3292, 3293
* 3418, 3457

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3161 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 338.55 | 10.49 | The S1G STA estimates the time of the most recent transition of the EL STA from Doze and/or to Doze state. | Check that the instants of time of these transitions by the EL STA are correctly determined by the peer STA. Same in P339L10. | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies the instant of times for these transitions. TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-14/1089r0 under all headings that include CID 3161. |

10.44e Support for energy limited STAs

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraphs below as follows (#3161):***

An S1G STA receiving an Activity Specification element from an EL STA shall not transmit to the EL STA, or cause the EL STA to transmit, an individually addressed PPDU that would exceed a time of Max Awake Interval following the most recent transition of the EL STA from Doze to Awake state as known at the S1G STA.

The S1G STA estimates the time of the most recent transition of the EL STA from Doze to Awake state based on the latest of the following events:

* An (NDP) PS-Poll or trigger frame sent by the EL STA is received by the S1G STA
* A TWT starts for the EL STA, where the TWT corresponds to any TWT agreement that the EL STA has setup with the S1G STA
* A RAW slot allocated for the EL STA starts, where the RAW slot is scheduled in a RAW for the EL STA by the S1G STA
* A T(S)BTT at which the EL STA has to be awake is due, where the T(S)BTT is the time the S1G STA sends an S1G Beacon frame that is intended to be received by the EL STA

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraphs below as follows (#3161):***

An S1G STA receiving an Activity Specification element from an EL STA shall not schedule a transmission of a PPDU carrying an individually addressed MPDU(#3066) intended for the EL STA, or cause the EL STA to transmit an individually addressed(#3066, Ed) PPDU, before a Recovery Time interval has expired since the EL STA’s last transition to Doze state, as known at the S1G STA. An EL STA may indicate the Recovery time interval by including the Recovery time interval in the Duration field of an NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack frame with Idle Indication set to 1.

The S1G STA estimates the time the EL STA transition to Doze state based on the latest of the following events:

* An acknowledgment is received from the EL STA as a response to the transmission of a BU, where the BU is sent by the S1G STA in response to an (NDP) PS-Poll or trigger frame generated by the EL STA
* An acknowledgment is received from the EL STA as a response to of a frame with EOSP field equal to 1, where the frame is sent by the S1G STA
* An NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack frame is received from the EL STA as a response to a frame generated by the S1G STA, where the NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack frame has an Idle Indication field equal to 1 and a non-zero value of the Duration field
* The adjusted nominal minimum wake duration for a TWT has ended, where the TWT corresponds to any TWT agreement that the EL STA has setup with the S1G STA
* The RAW slot allocated for the EL STA has ended, where in the RAW slot was scheduled in a RAW for the EL STA by the S1G STA
* The transmission of an S1G Beacon frame has ended, where the S1G Beacon is sent at a T(S)BTT at which the EL STA was expected to be awake
* Thetransmission of group addressed BU(s) has ended, where the group addressed BUs are expected to be received by the EL STA following a DTIM Beacon.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3007 | Adrian Stephens | 115.7 | 8.4.2.30 | "IEEE 802.11 down PV1" - what is a 'down' PV1? | Replace or reword so it references defined terms. Ditto line 27. | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies that down refers to downlink. TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-14/1089r0 under all headings that include CID 3007. |
| 3009 | Adrian Stephens | 115.49 | 8.4.2.30 | "Great para! Love the length!That's right - don't give in to those wimps who like things to be readable, for example by adding lists or breaking into multiple paras." | Merge it with the next 10 paras, that will really ensure that nobody can parse it and the secret of 802.11ah will be safe for years to come. | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution is to split the paragraph as suggested by the comment. TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-14/1089r0 under all headings that include CID 3009. |

**8.4.2.30 TCLAS element**

***TGah Editor: Change the table below as follows (#3007):***

|  |
| --- |
| **Table 8-152 -- Frame classifier type** |
| Classifier type | Classifier parameters |
| 0 | Ethernet parameters |
| 1 | TCP/UDP IP parameters |
| 2 | IEEE Std 802.1Q parameters |
| 3 | Filter Offset parameters |
| 4 | IP and higher layer parameters |
| 5 | IEEE Std 802.1D/Q parameters |
| 6 | IEEE 802.11 PV0 MPDU MAC header parameters (B1B0 of the Frame Control field = 00) |
| 7 | IEEE 802.11 downlink PV1 MPDU MAC header parameters (From DS field of the Frame Control field = 1) |
| 8 | IEEE 802.11 non-downlink PV1 MPDU MAC header parameters (From DS field of the Frame Control field = 0) |
| 9 | IEEE 802.11 PV1 MPDU Full Address MAC header parameters |
| ~~7~~10-255 | Reserved |

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3009):***

When the Classifier Type is equal to 6, 7, 8, or 9, the Classifier Mask subfield is three octets in length~~. It~~ and contains a sequence of ~~nine~~ two-bit Classifier Mask Control subfields. Each Classifier Mask Control subfield applies to a specific target field of the MAC header~~. It~~ of an MPDU and determines whether the target field is included in the comparison and whether an additional bitmask (the target field filter mask) is present. When the target field filter mask is present, it determines which bits of the target field are used in the comparison. ~~Table 8-139 (Interpretation of the Classifier Mask Control subfield values)~~

 The Classifier Mask Control subfield values are interpreted as follows:

* Setting the LSB of the two bits to 1 indicates the use of the corresponding MAC Header field for comparison, and setting the LSB of the two bits to 0 indicates the corresponding MAC header field is not used for comparison, and the corresponding Match Specification is not included in the Classifier.
* Setting the MSB of the two bits to 1 indicates the inclusion of the corresponding MAC Header Filter (a bit mask) in the corresponding Match Specification, and setting the MSB of the two bits to 0 indicates the MAC Header Filter is not included in the corresponding Match Specification and every bit of the Match Specification, if included in the Classifier Parameter, needs to be compared.
* If an optional MAC Header field needs to be compared, the LSB of the two bits in the Classifier Mask corresponding to the optional MAC header field is set to 1, and an MPDU that does not include the optional field is not a matching MPDU.

Table 8-152a (Classifier Mask for Classifier Type (6)), Table 8-152b (Classifier Mask for Classifier Type (7)), Table 8-152c (Classifier Mask for Classifier Type (8)) and Table 8-152d (Classifier Mask for Classifier Type (9)) specify~~ies~~ the interpretation of the Classifier Mask Control subfield for each of the Classifier Type values 6, 7, 8 and 9, respectively.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3031 | Adrian Stephens | 241.10 | 9.7.6.5.2 | """The STA that""This is ungrammatical. ""The STA"" at the start of a sentence refers to an antecedent that establishes the conditions implicitly refered to by ""The STA"".Also at 243.20, 243.23, 259.04, 304.60," | "Review all ""The STA that"" at the start of sentences, (note there may correct uses non-initially) and reword:1. Either replace ""The"" with ""A"" if there is no antecedent.2. Reword, ""A STA that receives an RTS ... . ""The STA that received the RTS within X timeout ..."" beomes ""A STA that receives an RTS ... . ""If the STA received the RTS within X timeout ...""" | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested changes. TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-14/1089r0 under all headings that include CID 3031. |

9.7.6.5.2 Selection of a rate or MCS

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3031):***

When the STA is not performing asymmetric Block Ack

—If the STA receives an Accept in the Control Response MCS Negotiation Response frame from a responding STA then it shall transmit the S1G PPDU BlockAck control response frame to the responding STA with the rate described in 9.7.6.5.3 (Control response frame MCS computation)

—Otherwise, the STA shall transmit the S1G PPDU BlockAck control response frame at either the primary rate or the alternate rate (according the rules in 9.7.6.5.4 (Selection of an alternate rate or MCS for a control response frame)), if one exists.

9.7.6.5.3 Control response frame MCS computation

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3031):***

Once the primary MCS, ~~or~~ <VHT-MCS, NSS> or <S1G-MCS, NSS> tuple has been selected, the STA may select an alternate MCS according to 9.7.6.5.4 (Selection of an alternate rate or MCS for a control response frame). If the STA has not negotiated the Control Response MCS Negotiation as described in 9.7.6.5.4b (Control Response MCS Negotiation) or has received a Reject indication in the Control Response MCS Negotiation Response then it shall transmit the control response frame using either the primary MCS or the alternate MCS, if one exists. If the STA has received an Accept indication in the Control Response MCS Negotiation Response from a responding STA then it shall transmit the control response frame to the responding STA using the negotiated MCS or alternative MCS provided that the duration of the frame at the alternate MCS is the same as the duration of the frame at the negotiated MCS, if one exists. Negotiated MCS is computed as the highest MCS less than or equal to the MCS which is MCS Difference lower than the primary MCS if one exists, or the MCS10 otherwise.

9.21.5.2 RAW structure and timing

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3031):***

If the Cross Slot Boundary subfield in RAW Assignment field of the RPS element is 0, a STA shall not transmit or cause to be transmitted a frame exchange sequence that would exceed boundary of its allocated time slot. If theSTA is changing from Doze to Awake state at the start of its allocated time slot then it is allowed to immediately start contending for the WM without waiting until a frame sequence is detected, or until a period of time equal to the ProbeDelay has transpired.

9.42h.2 Relay operation

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3031):***

A STA that is the intended receiver of a frame that contains a Relay Activation element with Relay Activation Mode subfield equal to 1 and Enable Relay Function subfield equal to 0 shall respond with a frame that contains a Relay Activation element with Relay Activation Mode and Enable Relay Function subfields equal to 0.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3033 | Adrian Stephens | 311.27 | 9.51 | """Traveling Pilot Support field of the most recent S1G Capabilities element ""WG11 style removes ""most recent"" from references to Capbilities, which are assumed to be static." | "Remove ""most recent"".Review all ""most recent"" and remove any that apply to capabilities." | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested changes. TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-14/1089r0 under all headings that include CID 3033. |

9.7.6.5.4b Control Response MCS Negotiation

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

An S1G STA shall not transmit a Control Response MCS Negotiation Request to another S1G STA unless the MCS Negotiation Support field of the S1G Capabilities element received from that STA contained a value of 1 and dot11MCSNegotiation is true.

9.7.6.6 Channel Width selection for Control frames

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

An S1G STA that has set the 1 MHz Control Response Preamble Support field to 1 in the S1G Capabilities element transmitted to its peer STA shall use S1G\_1M preamble transmission as the response of S1G\_SHORT\_PREAMBLE or S1G\_LONG\_PREAMBLE as follows:

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

An S1G STA transmitting an S1G Control frame or an NDP Control frame shall set the TXVECTOR parameter FORMAT depending on the value of the TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH:

—If CH\_BANDWIDTH is equal to CBW1 then the FORMAT shall be S1G

—If CH\_BANDWIDTH is equal to CBW2 then the FORMAT shall be:

a) S1G\_DUP\_1M if the RXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH of the eliciting S1G Control frame is equal to CBW1 and the Bandwidth Indication field in the Frame Control field is 1.

b) S1G\_DUP\_1M if the S1G STA intends to transmit a duplicated 1 MHz control frame to an S1G STA that supports duplicated 1 MHz frames as indicated in the Duplicated 1 MHz Support field of the S1G Capabilities element received from that S1G STA.

c) S1G otherwise.

—Otherwise, the FORMAT shall be S1G DUP\_2M.

9.7.11 Channel Width in non-HT and non-HT duplicate PPDUs

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

An S1G STA shall not transmit an S1G Control frame or an NDP MAC frame with the TXVECTOR parameter S1G\_DUP\_1M to another S1G STA, unless the Duplicated 1 MHz Support field of the S1G Capabilities element received from that STA contained a value of 1.

9.24.2 Setup and modification of the block ack parameters

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

If the intended S1G recipient is capable of participating in an HT-Immediate block ack session, the S1G originator shall send an NDP ADDBA Request to indicate that it expects only NDP BlockAck frames during the block ack session with the following exceptions:

1) If the S1G originator has the dot11BATImplemented equal to true and the BAT Support subfield in the S1G Capabilities element received from the S1G recipient is 1 and a TWT has been setup with the S1G recipient as described in 9.42a (Target wake time (TWT)), then the S1G originator shall send a BAT ADDBA Request to indicate that it expects only BAT frames during the block ack session.

2) When any of the conditions below is satisfied then the S1G originator may send an ADDBA Request to indicate that it expects only BlockAck frames during the block ack session:

a) The value of the Buffer Size field in the ADDBA Request, carried in an S1G\_LONG or S1G\_SHORT PPDU, is greater than 16

b) The value of the Buffer Size field of the ADDBA Request, carried in an S1G\_1M PPDU, is greater than 8

c) The dot11AsymmetricBlockAckSupport is true and Asymmetric Block Ack Supported(#3948)field in the S1G Capabilities element received from the S1G recipient is 1.

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

-- The MCS subfield in the Originator Parameter field shall be set to 15 unless the dot11Asymmet­ricBlockAckSupport is true and the Asymmetric Block Ack Supported(#3948) field in the S1G Capabilities element received from the S1G originator is 1 in which case the MCS subfield may indicate the value of the preferred MCS if asymmetric block ack operation is used. The pre­ferred MCS implicitly indicates the MCSDifference value, which is the difference between the preferred MCS and the MCS at which the ADDBA Response is sent.

9.42a.1 TWT overview

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

A non-AP STA with dot11TWTOptionActivated equal to true may transmit a TWT element to its associated AP with a value of Request TWT, Suggest TWT or Demand TWT in the TWT Command field and a value of 1 in the TWT Request field if the S1G Capabilities element received from the AP included a value of 1 in the TWT Support subfield.

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

An AP may transmit a TWT element in an individually addressed TWT Setup frame with a value of Request TWT, Suggest TWT or Demand TWT in the TWT Command field and a value of 1 in the TWT Request field to an associated non-AP STA if the S1G Capabilities element received from the STA included a value of 1 in the TWT Support subfield. An AP may transmit TWT Setup frames to more than one of its associated non-AP STAs.

9.42a.5 TWT grouping

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

When dot11TWTGroupingSupport is true, the AP shall only assign a TWT group ID to a TWT requesting STA when the TWT Grouping Support subfield of the S1G Capabilities element received from that STA contained a value of 1. The AP indicates the TWT value for a TWT requesting STA from which it received a frame containing an S1G Capabilities element with the TWT Grouping Support subfield equal to 1 that is the intended recipient of the frame containing the TWT element by including:

9.42b.2 Rescheduling of awake/doze cycle

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

Upon reception of a PS-Poll with the Poll Type subfield equal to 1, the AP with dot11PollTACKResponseSupport equal to true shall send a TACK frame without the Next TWT field. The S1G STA shall not send a PS-Poll with the Poll Type subfield equal to 1 to an AP unless the TACK Support as PS-Poll Response field of the S1G Capabilities element received from that AP is equal to 1.

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

Upon reception of a PS-Poll with the PS-Poll Type subfield equal to 2 sent by a TWT STA within the negotiated TWT SP, the AP sends a TACK frame in response to a PS-Poll frame as described in 9.42a (Target wake time (TWT)). A TWT STA shall not send a PS-Poll with the Poll Type subfield equal to 2 to an AP unless the TWT Support field of the S1G Capabilities element received from that AP is equal to 1.

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

An S1G AP may set the wakeup timer (Duration field) as the duration to a TBTT in the responding control frame (either NDP Ack or NDP PS-Poll-Ack frame) and treat the non-TIM STA as a TIM STA starting from the TBTT if the bit corresponding to the non-TIM STA in the traffic indication virtual bitmap is equal to 1 and the STA indicates Temporary PS Mode Switch equal to 1 in the S1G Capabilities element transmitted to the AP. After the amount of time that is equal to the Duration field value in the responding control frame from the S1G AP, the non-TIM S1G STA shall wake up to receive the beacon. Upon receiving the beacon, the non-TIM STA infers from the TIM element indicating that there is BU for it that it is treated as a TIM STA and operates as a TIM STA from then on, setting dot11NonTIMModeActivated to false and switching to TIM mode (see 10.2.2.2 (Non-AP STA Power Management modes)). The S1G STA returns to the non-TIM STA operation mode by setting dot11NonTIMModeActivated to true if the S1G AP indicates that there is no more data buffered for the S1G STA and the S1G STA indicates to the S1G AP that there is no more data to transmit. The S1G AP treats the S1G STA as a non-TIM STA if the STA indicates that there is no more data to transmit and the S1G AP indicates that there is no more data buffered for the STA.

9.42j Traveling Pilot Operation

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

An S1G STA shall not transmit a frame with TXVECTOR parameter DOPPLER equal to 1 to an S1G STA unless the Traveling Pilot Support field of the S1G Capabilities element received from that STA contained a value of 1 or 3 and dot11S1GTravelingPilotOptionActivated is true.

9.42n S1G\_Long operation

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

An S1G STA shall not transmit a frame with TXVECTOR parameter PREAMBLE\_TYPE set to S1G\_LONG\_PREAMBLE to an S1G STA unless the S1G\_LONG Support field of the S1G Capabilities element received from that STA contained a value of 1 and dot11S1GLONGOptionActivated is true.

**10.2.2.1 General**

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

When dot11S1GOptionImplemented is false, the traffic-indication virtual bitmap, maintained by the AP, shall be transmitted in a TIM element. When dot11S1GOptionImplemented is true, the traffic-indication virtual bitmap may be divided into more than one page and each page shall be transmitted in a TIM element, hence, more than one TIM element may appear in an S1G Beacon frame. If more than one TIM element is present, then the TIM elements shall be ordered based on their value of the Page Index and Page Slice Number subfields in the Bitmap Control field. TIM elements with Page Slice Number equal to 31 (if any) shall be the first ones and ordered from page 0 to page 3, followed by TIM elements (if any) with Page Slice Number from 0 to 30 each of which are also ordered from page 0 to page 3. When dot11S1GOptionImplemented is true, the traffic virtual bitmap shall be encoded as defined in 8.4.2.6 (TIM element) where the ADE mode may be used by the AP only if the TIM ADE Support field in the S1G Capabilities element received from every STA with AID included in the TIM element, is 1. Otherwise ADE mode shall not be used to encode the TIM element.

**10.2.2.3 AP TIM transmissions**

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3033):***

For S1G band, the TIM is coded in an S1G partial virtual bitmap, as described in 8.4.2.6 (TIM element). This information is constructed with one of the four encoding modes: the Block Bitmap mode, the Single AID mode, the OLB (offset, length, bitmap) mode, and the ADE (AID with differential encoding) mode. An S1G AP shall not transmit the TIM with the encoding mode in the Block Control subfield set to ADE mode to another S1G STA unless the TIM ADE Support field of the S1G Capabilities element received from that STA contained a value of 1 and dot11TIMADEImplemented is true.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3034 | Adrian Stephens | 106.10 | 8.4.2.6 | """cast to decimal operator""I fail to see the significance of decimal here. What we want is a numeric value, not a decimal represented value (e.g. in SQL), which is the conventional interpretation of ""cast to decimal""." | Remove all "dec()" and "cast to decimal" from the amendment. | Rejected –The comment does not identify a technical issue. Please not that the same terminology is used in IEEE802.11REVmc D3.0 e.g. in P1303L27: “dec(A[b:c]) is the cast to decimal operator where b is scaled by 20 and c by 2c-b”. |
| 3387 | Bo Sun | 111.4 | 8.4.2.6.3 | add"set to 1" before "indicates" | as the comment suggests. | Revised –Agree with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-14/1089r0 under all headings that include CID 3387. |
| 3388 | Bo Sun | 111.53 |  | move the sentence "where x refers to the largest integer that is not larger than x." to 8.4.2.6.3 (page 111 line 8) | as the comment suggests. | Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change (by copying the phrase rather than moving). TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-14/1089r0 under all headings that include CID 3388. |

**8.4.2.6.3 OLB mode**

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3387, 3388):***

Each Subblock subfield is 1 octet in length and contains a Subblock of the Partial Virtual Map. A Subblock *m* of the Encoded Block Information field is located in Block *k* where *k* is obtained as Block Offset + *m* / 8, where 

x refers to the largest integer that is not larger than *x*. The bit in position *q* of the Subblock *m* which is located in Block *k*, when set to 1, indicates that there is traffic buffered for the STA whose AID is *N*, where *N* is constructed by concatenating *q* (*N*[0:2]), the Subblock offset mod(*m*, 8) (*N*[3: 5]), the Block *k* (*N*[6:10]), and the Page Index field (*N*[11:12]), in sequence from LSB to MSB.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3292 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 188.58 | 8.6.27.2 | This sentence needs some rephrasing because the way it is writen is ambiguous. Replace with " The Control Response MCS Negotiation Request frame is used by a STA to negotiate with its peer STA the desired MCS for transmitting control response frames as defined in 9.7.6.5.3 (Control Response frame MCS computation). Also keep consistency throughout used terminology i.e., "Control Response MCS Negotiation Request" Similar observations for the Control Response MCS Negotiation Response frame in 8.6.27.3. | As in comment. | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-14/1089r0 under all headings that include CID 3292. |
| 3293 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 189.40 | 8.6.27.3 | This sentence is a little bit ambiguous. Make clear that the MCS Difference field is an unsigned integer that represents the difference between the primary MCS and the MCS that is preferred for use by the STA. And also have a table that lists its possible values. | As in comment. | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. However, a table is not necessary as long as the difference is computed over the indexes of the MCSs.TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-14/1089r0 under all headings that include CID 3293. |

**8.6.27.2 Control Response MCS Negotiation Request frame format**

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3292):***

The Control Response MCS Negotiation Request frame is used by a STA to negotiate with its peer STA the desired MCS for transmitting control response frame as defined in 9.7.6.5.3 (Control response frame MCS computation). The frame format of this frame is shown Table 8-388v (Control Response Negotiation Request frame).

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3293):***

The MCS Difference field is 1 octet and is set to an unsigned value that represents the MCS difference between the index of the primary MCS and the index of the MCS that is preferred for use by the STA to transmit control response frame as described in 9.7.6.5.4b (Control Response MCS Negotiation).

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3418 | Dan Harkins | 69.19 | 8.2.3 | It says, "Within PV0 MPDUs...are present in all PV0 MPDUs." Got it, they're PV0 MPDUs. | clean up the language. | Revised –Agree in principle with the commenter. Proposed resolution resolves the inconsistency identified by the comment.TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-14/1089r0 under all headings that include CID 3418. |
| 3457 | David Hunter | 69.15 | 8.2.3 | Department of ridiculous redundancy department:"The first 2 bits of the first subfield (Protocol Version) of the Frame Control Field and the last field (FCS) in Figure 8-1 (MAC frame format) constitute the minimal frame format and are present in all protocol version 0 (PV0) MPDUs and protocol version 1 (PV1) MPDUs, including reserved types and subtypes. Within PV0 MPDUs, the first three fields (Frame Control, Duration/ID, and Address 1) and the last field (FCS) in Figure 8-1 (MAC frame format) constitute the minimal frame format and are present in all PV0 MPDUs, including reserved types and subtypes." Worse, the two sentences directly conflict about whether the PV0 minimal frame format contains more than the first two bits of the first subfield of the Frame Control field. | Replace both sentences quoted in the comment with:"Protocol version 0 (PV0) MPDUs and protocol version 1 (PV1) MPDUs are distinguished by their minimal frame formats. The minimal frame format of PV0 MPDUs is composed of the general frame format's first three fields (Frame Control, Duration/ID, and Address 1) and last field (FCS). The minimal frame format of PV1 MPDUs is composed only of the Protocol Version subfield of the Frame Control field and the FCS field. The sets of PV0 and PV1 MPDUs include all MPDUs that contain their respective minimal frame formats, including reserved types and subtypes." Then start the next paragraph with the sentence that begins "The fields Address 2, ...". | Revised –Agree in principle with the commenter. Proposed resolution resolves the inconsistency identified by the comment.TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-14/1089r0 under all headings that include CID 3457. |

**8.2.3 General frame format**

***TGah Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows (#3418, 3457):***

The MAC frame format comprises a set of fields that occur in a fixed order in all frames. Figure 8-1 (MAC frame format) depicts the general MAC frame format. The first 2 bits of the first subfield (Protocol Version) of the Frame Control Field and the last field (FCS) in Figure 8-1 (MAC frame format) are present in all protocol version 0 (PV0) MPDUs and protocol version 1 (PV1) MPDUs, including reserved types and subtypes. Within PV0 MPDUs, tThe first three fields (Frame Control, Duration/ID, and Address 1) and the last field (FCS) in Figure 8-1 (MAC frame format) constitute the minimal frame format and are present in all these frames, including reserved types and subtypes. Within PV1 MPDUs, the minimal frame format is defined in 8.8 (MAC frame format for Short frames) The fields Address 2, Address 3, Sequence Control, Address 4, QoS Control, HT Control, and Frame Body are present only in certain frame types and subtypes. Each field is defined in (The Frame Body field is of variable size, constrained as defined in 8.2.4.7.1 (General)). The format of each of the individual subtypes of each frame type is defined in 8.3 (Format of individual frame types). The components of management frame bodies are defined in 8.4 (Management and Extension frame body components). The formats of Management frames of subtype Action are defined in 8.6 (Action frame format details).