IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LB200-comment-resolution-clause-8-4-2-170a | | | | |
| Date: 2013-September-15 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jianhan Liu | Mediatek Inc. |  | | Jianhan.liu@mediatek.com |

Abstract

This document provides resolutions for CIDs in subclause **8.4.2.170a**:

* CID1110, CID1111, CID1112, CID1384, CID1759

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Line** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 1110 | 85 | 12 | 8.4.2.170a | The Open-loop Link Margin index is specific to S1G. The name is over-general. | Add an S1G somewhere in the name. Apply change globally. | Accept:  Change “Open-Loop Link Margin Index” to “S1G Open-Loop Link Margin Index” |
| 1111 | 85 | 31 | 8.4.2.170a | "The Length field is set to 1." -- this is contrary to recent TGmc style, | Remove cited text. | Accept |
| 1112 | 85 | 49 | 8.4.2.170a | "The Open-Loop Link Margin Index is defined as (-128+D+∙0.5)dBm, where D is an unsigned integer number  shown in Open-Loop Link Margin Index field."  This is a great example of how to get foundational garments into a state of torsional dislocation.  Don't have a field and the same thing without field attached that mean different things. | Drop "index" when refering to the thing in units of dBm - i.e. at line 38. Replace cited text with: "The open-loop link margin is defined as (-128+D+∙0.5)dBm, where D is an unsigned integer value of the Open-Loop Link Margin Index field."  Also note that We Don't Capitalize random collections Of Words - even if they describe a really cool concept. We capitalize the names that preceed "field, element, frame .etc". So "open loop link margin" and "Open Loop Link Margin Index field" please to represent these two distinct concepts. | Accept:  Revised as commenter suggested,  “The open-loop link margin is defined as (-128+D+∙0.5)dBm, where D is an unsigned integer value of the Open-Loop Link Margin Index field .” |
| 1384 | 85 | 45 | 8.4.2.170a | Sentence indicates that this element can be used for open loop link adaptation and open loop power control but neither of these procedures has been defined for S1G. | Clearly describe protocol behavior of these features and add corresponding indications in the S1G Capabilities element. | Reject:  IE is optional to be included in the management frame. Even if there is no capability indication, IE can be chosen to be included or not.  Open-Loop Link Margin Index is mostly included in the beacon. Since it is mostly serves as an broadcasting message, it is not needed to be indicated by capability. |
| 1759 | 85 | 49 | 8.4.2.170a | The description of the Open-Loop Link Margin Index seems incomplete. In particular, it is defined as (-128+Dx0.5)dBm, but I'm pretty sure that the proper units for a link margin measure should be in dB, not dBm.  Indeed the entire derivation for this link margin seems light. Link budget analysis is a complicated thing involving numerous terms, very few of which I see here. | Provide a more thorough derivation for the Open Loop Link Margin Index, showing how the units are derived. | Reject:  Since the “open loop link margin index” already changed to “open loop link margin” as CID1112, the the description is clear. |