IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Comment Resolution for Subclause 8.2.4.1.2, 8.2.4.1.3, 8.2.4.1.4 | | | | |
| Date: 2014-01-20 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Liwen Chu | Marvell | 5488 Marvell Ln, Santa Clara, CA 95054 | 1-408-222-0694 | liwenchu@marvell.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for comments in clause 8.2.4.1.3 of TGah Draft 1.0 with the following CIDs:1039, 1040, 1632, 1672, 1826, 1827, 1828, 1829, 1830, 1831, 2373, 2502, 2503, 2504, and 2505.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Num** | **P** | **L** | **Comment** | **Propose Change** | **Resolution** |
| 1039 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 31 | 51 | Please be aware the WG11 style (REVmc onwards) uses an upper-case B to represent a bit position. So under "Type value" should be "B3 B2". | Please review all use of lower-case b followed by a number, and uppercase the B when used to indicate a bit position. | Agree in principle.  Revised.  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-xxxxr0 |
| 1040 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 32 | 20 | "The Poll Type bit 0 is bit 14 and Poll Type bit 1 is bit 15." -- don't say this. There is no need to, and you may confuse the readers. | Remove cited text. | Agree.  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-xxxxr0 |
| 1632 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 31 | 40 | If the Protocol Version is varied then either a new table must be formed for Type and Subtypes that correspond to the new Protocol Version, or a new column must be added to the existing table of Valid type and subtype combinations that shows the Protocol Version. | Include Protocol Version in the table of valid Types and subtypes. | Reject.  As shown in the text, the Type/Subtype are defined in subclause 8.7. |
| 1672 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 32 | 21 | "when Power Management field is set to 1" is both missing an article and misuses "set to". | Replace with "when the value of the Power Management field is 1." and replace the similar words in the next sentence with "when the value of the Power Management field is 0," | Reject.  “When xxx field is set to xxx” is widely used in 802.11 baseline specification. The comenter should submit the comment to 802.11mc. |
| 1826 | 8.2.4.1.2 | 53 | 27 | even 11ad did not need a Protocol revision. I cannot see that the introduction of an alternative frame format requires this. | Delete changes to 8.2.4.1.2 | Reject.  802.11ah TG believes that a new protocol version is the best method to differentiate short frame formats from normal frame formats. |
| 1827 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 53 | 52 | As per previous comment, I suggest that you may need to intorduce more Subtypes to cover the different S1G Control frames you need. | Look at introdung more subtypes so as to avoid ambiguities. | Reject.  See comment resolution for CID 1826. |
| 1828 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 54 | 34 | Table 8-3a - Poll Type. Using "requesting" is clumsy. Suggest alternative wording | Change "Requesting a buffered frame without rescheduling awake/doze cycle" to "Buffered frame requested without rescheduling awake/doze cycle" | Revised. See comment 2504. |
| 1829 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 54 | 37 | Table 8-3a - Poll Type. Using "requesting" is clumsy. Suggest alternative wording | Change "Requesting Change Sequence/Timestamp" to "Sequence/Timestamp change requested" | Revised. See comment 2504. |
| 1830 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 54 | 39 | Table 8-3a - Poll Type. Using "requesting" is clumsy. Suggest alternative wording | Change "Requesting for a duration to a TBTT or Next TWT to reschedule awake/doze cycle" to "Duration to a TBTT or Next TWT requested to reschedule awake/doze cycle" | Revised. See comment 2504. |
| 1831 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 54 | 42 | Table 8-3a - Poll Type. Using "requesting" is clumsy. Suggest alternative wording | Change "Requesting for a duration to a service period to reschedule awake/doze cycle" to "duration to a service period requested to reschedule awake/doze cycle" | Revised. See comment 2504. |
| 2373 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 32 | 20 | The second sentence in "The Poll Type field is 2 bits in length. The Poll Type bit 0 is bit 14 and Poll Type bit 1 is bit 15." should be superfluous | If the bit ordering is different to that in all the other subfields, fix it. In any case, delete the second sentence | Agree in principle.  Revised.  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-xxxxr0 |
| 2502 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 32 | The bits in the table seem to be ordered differently than the bits in the text above the table. There are instances of when the name at the top of the column listing bit numbers is reversed, showing the Lsbit value on the left and the Msbit on the right, but even in those instances, the value that the field can contain will be listed as a number, and that number will have an LSbit that is assumed to be the lowest numbered bit in the field but whenever binary values are shown in the specification, the LSbit is always on the right and because of the wording in the text here, the LSbit in the table for the PollType bits is reversed. | I would fix this by swapping the b14 and b15 order in the heading of the column in the table. | Agree in principle.  Revised.  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-xxxxr0 |
| 2503 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 32 | 21 | Otherwise and the phrase beginning with "when" are redundant. | Delete "Otherwise, " change "when Power" to "When the Power" | Agree in principle.  Revised.  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-xxxxr0 |
| 2504 | 8.2.4.1.3 | 32 | 32 | Bad wording. | Change "Requesting a buffered frame without rescheduling awake/doze cycle" to "Request for a buffered frame without a request to reschedule the awake/doze cycle" change "Requesting Change Sequence/Timestamp" to "Request for Change Sequence/Timestamp" change "Requesting for a duration to a TBTT or Next TWT to reschedule awake/doze cycle" to "Request for a duration to a TBTT or Next TWT to reschedule awake/doze cycle" and change "Requesting for a duration to a service period to reschedule awake/doze cycle" to "Request for a duration to a service period to reschedule awake/doze cycle" | Agree.  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-xxxxr0 |
| 2505 | 8.2.4.1.4 | 33 | 12 | Be more specific. | Change "Relays" to "Relay STAs" | Reject.  Changing “Relays” to “Relay STAs” makes some potential restriction to relay functionality. |

* Type and Subtype fields

***Change the following Table 8-2 by adding a row for the TACK frame and modify the last value of Subtype for Reserved as follows. The changes are based on 802.11 REVmc D1.1 and 802.11ac D5.0:***

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| * Valid type and subtype combinations | | | |
| Type value B3 B2 | Type description | Subtype value B7 B6 B5 B4 | Subtype description |
| 01 | Control | 0000–~~0011~~<ANA> | Reserved |
| 01 | Control | <ANA> | TACK(#12) |
| 01 | Control | 0100 | Beamforming Report Poll |

***Change the following Table 8-2 by adding a row for Short Beacon, and Resource Allocation frames and modify the last value of Subtype for Reserved as follows. The changes are based on 802.11 REVmc D1.1 and 802.11ac D5.0:***

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| * Valid type and subtype combinations | | | |
| Type value B3 B2 | Type description | Subtype value B7 B6 B5 B4 | Subtype description |
| 11 | Extension | 0000 | DMG Beacon |
| 11 | Extension | <ANA> | Short Beacon |
| 11 | Extension | <ANA> | Resource Allocation |
| 11 | Extension | <ANA>–1111 | Reserved |

***Insert the following paragraph and Table 8-3a (Poll Type) after Table 8-3(Control Frame Extension). The changes are based on 802.11 REVmc D1.1:***

The Poll Type field is 2 bits in length. The following indication is only valid when Power Management field is set to 1. Otherwise, the Poll Type bits are reserved.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| * Poll Type | |
| Poll Type value  B15 B14 | Description |
| 00 | Request for a buffered frame without a request to reschedule the awake/doze cycle |
| 01 | Request for Change Sequence/Timestamp |
| 10 | Request for a duration to a TBTT or Next TWT to reschedule awake/doze cycle |
| 11 | Request for a duration to a service period to reschedule awake/doze cycle |

* To DS and From DS fields

***Change the 4th row of Table 8-4—To/From DS combinations in Data frames as shown below:***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| * To/From DS combinations in data frames (continued) | |
| To DS and From DS values | Meaning |
| To DS = 0  From DS = 0 | A data frame direct from one STA to another STA within the same IBSS, a data frame direct from one non-AP STA to another non-AP STA within the same BSS, or a data frame outside the context of a BSS.(11ae) |
| To DS = 1  From DS = 0 | A data frame destined for the DS or being sent by a STA associated with an AP to the Port Access Entity in that AP. |
| To DS = 0  From DS = 1 | A data frame exiting the DS or being sent by the Port Access Entity in an AP, or a group addressed Mesh Data frame with Mesh Control field present using the three-address MAC header format. |
| To DS = 1  From DS = 1 | A data frame using the four-address MAC header format. This standard defines procedures for using this combination of field values ~~only~~ in ~~a~~ mesh BSSs and by Relays. |