IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| LB 200 cluase 9.42.1 comment resolution |
| Date: 2014-01-20 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Young Hoon Kwon  | Huawei |  | 1-858-882-0329 | younghoon.kwon@huawei.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes comment resolutions of the clause 9.42.1 from TGah Draft 1.0.

* CIDs: 1552, 1884, 2911, and 2946

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 1552 | 286 | 9.42.1 | Keep consistency with the definition of non-TIM STA in page 1 line 19: non-traffic indication map (TIM) station (STA): "The STA which does not require reception of TIM." | Replace sentence with: " A non-TIM STA is an S1G STA that does not require reception of the TIM" | Revised. – The comment is resolved by the resolution for CID 2911. |
| 1884 | 208 | 9.42 | "A non-TIM STA is an S1G STA that does not listen to the beacon." Does it have to be a S1G STA? Can not TWT and RAW for example be good features for non S1G STAs? Also where does it talk about what a non TIM STA is doing so that it does not listen to Beacons? Is it simply asleep, or is doing its own thing somehow? How does the AP know that the timing of the non TIM STA so it can set up RAWs and if the nonTIM STA does not listen to the beacon how does it know the timing of the AP as it does not sync to the TSF of the AP? I may be missing the point here but these questions immediately come to mind and make it difficult to floow this clause. Please give some useful ackground as to what this non TIM STA is and why it is useful. | Please give some useful background as to what this non TIM STA is and why it is useful. Also answer the questions in the comment | Revised. – The comment is resolved by the resolution for CID 2911. |
| 2911 | 186 | 9.42.1 | Definition of Non-TIM STA is already described in 3.2, and that definition is different from the one shown here. | Delete the subclause 9.42.1. | Accepted. |
| 2946 | 186 | 9.42.1 | The definition of non-TIM STA is not clear | Add more definitive statement to define non-TIM STA. | Revised. – The comment is resolved by the resolution for CID 2911. |

**CID 1552, 1884, 2911, and 2946**

**Discussion:**

Agree with the commenters of CID 1552, 1884, 2911, and 2946 in principle. The main issue is that the definition of Non TIM STA is already defined in subclause 3.2 as “The STA which does not require reception of TIM”, and the definition shown in the subclause 9.42.1 is different from the definition in 3.2. Subclause 9.42.1 defines non-TIM STA as “an S1G STA that does not listen to the beacon”. However, by this definition it is not clear what “listen to the beacon” implies and as commenter of CID 1884 mentioned it is not clear why it has to be limited to an S1G STA. The main purpose of defining non-TIM STA is to allow mechanism for a STA to transmit and receive frames in power saving manner without periodically receiving beacon frame, and for this purpose the definition shown in 3.2 is clearer and fits better. As whole subclause of 9.42.1 is just to redefine non-TIM STA, which has already been clearly defined in subclause 3.2, we better remove whole subcluse 9.42.1.

***TGah editor: Delete the sub-clause 9.42.1 as the following:***

* Non-TIM STA operation
	+ 1. ~~General~~

~~A non-TIM STA is an S1G STA that does not listen to the beacon.~~

* Resource protection for non-TIM STAs