IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LB 200 Comment Resolution for Clause 8.5.5 | | | | |
| Date: 2013-11-11 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. | 5775 Morehouse Dr, San Diego, CA 92109 | +1-858-658-5302 | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Amin Jafarian | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | jafarian@qti.qualcomm.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for comments in clause 8.5.5 of TGah Draft 1.0 with the following CIDs:

1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 1153 | 126.48 | 8.5.5.1 | "The mostsignificant bit (MSB) of the Block Ack Action field is defined as the NDP BlockAck subfield. " This is both wrong (it also selects BAT) and unnecessary. | Remove cited text. | Revised –  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-13-1431-00-00ah under the heading for CIDs 1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549. |
| 1154 | 126.52 | 8.5.5.1 | Some explanatory material about why there are both NDP and BAT variants would be useful here. Also need to expand BAT at least once rather than force your reader to resort to 3.3. | As in comment. | Revised –  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-13-1431-00-00ah under the heading for CIDs 1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549. |
| 1155 | 127.22 | 8.5.5.2 | The text that .11ah edits has been removed from REVmc D2. | Update stated baseline to REVmc D2.0. Remove changes to text that doesn't exist in REVmc D2.0. | The edits for 11ah have been done with respect to REVmc D1.1 so far. Hence, updated to the baseline of D1.1 to be consistent.  Revised-  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-13-1431-00-00ah under the heading for CIDs 1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549. |
| 1156 | 127.65 | 8.5.5.3 | The originator parameter field is presumably specific to S1G, but as shown appears to be mandatory for legacy devices. | Add dependency on S1G. | Revised –  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-13-1431-00-00ah under the heading for CIDs 1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549. |
| 1441 | 127.28 | 8.5.5.2 | The BlockAction field is also set to 131 to indicate a ADDBA Request of BAT type, similar observation for the ADDBA Response subclause. | Replace "either 0 or 128" with "0, 128, or 131" in line 27 and "either 1 or 129" with "1, 129, or 132" in line 36 of page 127. | Revised –  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-13-1431-00-00ah under the heading for CIDs 1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549. |
| 1442 | 127.65 | 8.5.5.3 | Specify that the Originator parameter is an optional field by adding "(optional)" in row 9, second column of table 8-214. | As in comment. | Revised –  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-13-1431-00-00ah under the heading for CIDs 1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549. |
| 2415 | 127.01 | 8.5.5.1 | It would be mildly more elegant to make the 2 lsbs give the BA type | Change the BAT ones to be in the range 132-134 and make 131 reserved | Revised –  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-13-1431-00-00ah under the heading for CIDs 1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549. |
| 2416 | 127.27 | 8.5.5.2 | What about BAT ADDBAs? Ditto in 8.5.5.3 | Add 132 | Revised –  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-13-1431-00-00ah under the heading for CIDs 1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549. |
| 2545 | 126.48 | 8.5.5.1 | The modification of 8.5.5.1 specifies that the most significant bit (MSB) of the Block Ack Action field is defined as the NDP Block Ack subfield. This definition conflicts with assignments of BAT\_ADDBA Request, BAT\_ADDBA Response and BAT\_DELBA in Table 8-212, as BAT is not a NDP Block Ack. | Modify the inserted text to "The most significant bit (MSB) of the Block Ack Action field is defined as the NDP or short frame Block Ack subfield." | Revised –  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-13-1431-00-00ah under the heading for CIDs 1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549. |
| 2546 | 127.27 | 8.5.5.2 | The Block Ack Action field of ADDBA Request frame shall be able to set to 131 (BAT ADDBA Request). | Modify the third paragraph of subclause 8.5.5.2 as follows: --- The Block Ack Action field is set to 0, 128, or 131 (representing ADDBA request). The meaning for each value is described in 8.5.5.1. | Revised –  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-13-1431-00-00ah under the heading for CIDs 1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549. |
| 2547 | 127.36 | 8.5.5.3 | The Block Ack Action field of ADDBA Response frame shall be able to set to 132 (BAT ADDBA Response). | Modify the third paragraph of subclause 8.5.5.3 as follows: --- The Block Ack Action field is set to 1, 129, or 132 (representing ADDBA response). The meaning for each value is described in 8.5.5.1. | Revised –  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-13-1431-00-00ah under the heading for CIDs 1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549. |
| 2548 | 127.64 | 8.5.5.3 | An Originator Parameter in the ADDBA Response frame shall be optional to keep backward compatibility with non S1G STAs. Also, order 7 to 10 are already used by 802.11aa and 802.11ad (See IEEE P802.11mc D1.1 subclause 8.6.5.3 Table 8-248). | Update the Table 8-214 according to IEEE Std 802.11aa-2012 and IEEE Std 802.11ad-2012, change Order of "Originator Parameter" to 11, and insert "(optional)" after "Originator Parameter". Also, modify the inserted text at the end of 8.5.5.3 as follows: --- The Originator Parameter field is defined in 8.4.1.15a, and exist only if dot11S1GOptionImplemented is true. | Revised –  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-13-1431-00-00ah under the heading for CIDs 1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549. |
| 2549 |  | 8.5.5.4 | The Block Ack Action field of DELBA frame shall be able to set to 130 (NDP DELBA) or 133 (BAT DELBA). | Insert the new subclause 8.5.5.4 (DELBA frame format) (Note: in IEEE P802.11mc D1.1, it is subclause 8.6.5.4), and modify the third paragraph as follows: --- The Block Ack Action field is set to 2, 130, or 133 (representing DELBA). The meaning for each value is described in 8.5.5.1. | Revised –  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-13-1431-00-00ah under the heading for CIDs 1153, 1154, 1155, 1156, 1441, 1442, 2415, 2416, 2545, 2546, 2547, 2548, 2549. |

**Discussion:** *Agree in principle with the commenters. Proposed resolution is inline with their suggestions.*

**8.6.5 Block Ack Action frame details**

**8.6.5.1 General**

***Change the text as shown:***

The ADDBA frames are used to set up or, if PBAC is used, to modify Block Ack for a specific TC, TS, or GCR group address.(11aa) A Block Ack Action field, in the octet immediately after the Category field, differentiates the Block Ack Action frame formats. The Block Ack Action frames are used to negotiate several parameters of a BlockAck session and the type of BlockAck frames that are used: BlockAck, NDP BlockAck and Block Acknowledgment TWT frames (see 9.22.2 (Setup and modification of the Block Ack parameters)). The Block Ack Action field values associated with each frame format within the Block Ack category are defined in Table 8-246 (Block Ack Action field values).

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Table 8-246 -- Block Ack Action field values** | |
| **Block Ack Action field values** | **Meaning** |
| 0 | ADDBA Request |
| 1 | ADDBA Response |
| 2 | DELBA |
| 3–127 | Reserved |
| 128 | NDP ADDBA Request |
| 129 | NDP ADDBA Response |
| 130 | NDP DELBA |
| 131 | Reserved |
| 132 | BAT ADDBA Requst |
| 133 | BAT ADDBA Response |
| 134 | BAT DELBA |
| 135-255 | Reserved |

**8.6.5.2 ADDBA Request frame format**

***Change the third paragraph of sub-clause 8.6.5.2:***

The Block Ack Action field is set to 0, 128, or 132 (representing ADDBA request). The meaning for each value is described in 8.6.5.1(General).

**8.6.5.3 ADDBA Response frame format**

***Change the third paragraph of sub-clause 8.6.5.3:***

The Block Ack Action field is set to 1, 129, or 133 (representing ADDBA response). The meaning for each value is described in 8.6.5.1 (General).

***Change Table 8-247 as follows:***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Table 8-247 ADDBA Response frame Action field format** | |
| Order | Information |
| … |  |
| 10 | ADDBA Extension (optional) |
| 11 | Originator Parameter (optional) |

***Insert the following sentence at the end of the subclause:***

The Originator Parameter field is present only if dot11S1GOptionImplemented is true and it is defined in 8.4.1.15a (Originator Parameter field).

**8.6.5.4 DELBA frame format**

***Modify the third paragraph of sub-clause 8.6.5.4:***

The Block Ack Action field is set to 2, 130, or 134 (representing DELBA). The meaning for each value is described in 8.6.5.1 (General).