IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| REVmc Telecon minutes for Aug-Sept 2013 | | | | |
| Date: 2013-08-16 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | CSR Technologies | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | 801-492-4023 | jrosdahl@ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the following Teleconferences – Aug 16, Aug 30, and Sept 6, 2013

Note that teleconferences are subject to IEEE policies and procedures see:

[IEEE-SA PATENT POLICY](http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt)  
[IEEE CODE OF ETHICS](http://www.ieee.org/web/membership/ethics/code_ethics.html)   
[IEEE-STANDARDS ASSOCIATION (IEEE-SA) AFFILATION FAQ](http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliationFAQ.html)   
[IEEE-SA ANTITRUST AND COMPETITION POLICY](http://standards.ieee.org/resources/antitrust-guidelines.pdf)   
[IEEE-SA LETTER OF ASSURANCE (LOA) FORM](http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/loa.pdf)   
[IEEE-SA STANDARDS BOARD PATENT COMMITTEE (PATCOM) INFORMATION](http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/index.html)   
[IEEE-SA PATENT FAQ](http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/faq.pdf)   
[IEEE 802 LAN/MAN STANDARDS COMMITTEE POLICIES & PROCEDURES](http://www.ieee802.org/policies-and-procedures.pdf)   
[IEEE](http://www.ieee802.org/PNP/2008-11/LMSC_OM_approved_081114.pdf) 802.11 Working Group Policies and procedures

1. TG REVmc Telecon Minutes for Aug 16th
   1. called to order at 10:03am by Dorthy STANLEY (Aruba)
   2. Proposed agenda:

1. Call to order, patent policy, and attendance

2. Editor report

3. Comment resolution: review available resolutions, expected to include:

CIDs 1691, 1692 – Dorothy

CIDs 1028, 1654, 1296, 1335 - Adrian

CID 1373 – Mark Hamilton

CIDs 1155, 1156, 1157 (corrected)

4. AOB  
5. Adjourn

* 1. remind rules and patent policy
     1. no Patents were noted
  2. Attendance: Dorothy STANLEY (Aruba), Jon ROSDAHL (CSR), Peter ECCLESINE (CISCO) Ed REUSS (Clair Global), Mark HAMILTON (Polycom), Adrian STEPHENS (Intel).
  3. Editor Report
     1. D1.6 is being reviewed for accuracies – feedback due Aug 24th
     2. No update on resolved comments
  4. Reviewed CID numbers to be worked on today.
  5. Peter: CIDs 1691, 1692 –assigned in database to Dorothy (GEN)
     1. Presented document 11-13/0968r0
     2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0968-00-000m-cids-on-rfc-3825.docx> to resolve comments 1691 and 1692.
     3. Proposed resolution for 1691 : accept
     4. Proposed resolution for 1692: Revised; Make the changes as noted in 11-13/0968r0: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0968-00-000m-cids-on-rfc-3825.docx> .
     5. Mark both Ready for Motion at next F2F session.
  6. Mark : CID 1373
     1. Review Comment
     2. Suggestion of breaking up the sentence makes sense, but we may loose some meaning if we make the change of “represents” to “contains”.
     3. Proposed Resolution: REVISED. Replace "In order to" with "The tables below". On line 48 replace "STT, the following tables" with "STT. These tables".
     4. Ready for Motion at next F2F session.
  7. Adrian: 11-13/652r12 for CIDs 1028, 1654, 1296, 1335
     1. There are some others as well, no objection to review all the prepared CIDs and to review them in the order of the file
        1. CIDs 1033, 1021, 1023, 1028, 1050, 1654, 1296, 1305, 1088, 1335, 1078, 29, 1079.
        2. No objection to reviewing the extra CIDs in the order appearing in 11-13/652r11.
     2. CID 1033
        1. Review comment
        2. Rewording to avoid “For a” reviewed.
        3. Reviewed each proposed change
        4. Proposed Resolution: Revised. Make changes in doc 11-13/652r12 under CID 1033. These change replace a number (approximately 12) of “for a” statements with more grammatical forms of expression.: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0652-12-000m-some-more-lb193-resolutions.doc>
        5. Mark ready for motion at next F2F
     3. CID 1021
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Rejected. The existing text is not incorrect.
        3. Mark ready for motion at next F2F
     4. CID 1023
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Revised. Globally replace “MAC and PHY sublayer” with “MAC sublayer and PHY”. Globally replace “PHY-SAP sublayer-to-sublayer” with “PHY-SAP inter-(sub)layer”. Globally replace “PHY layer” with “PHY”. Globally replace “PHY sublayer” with “PHY”.
        3. Mark ready for Motion at next F2F
     5. CID 1028
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Revised. Make changes in doc 11-13/652r12 under CID 1028.: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0652-12-000m-some-more-lb193-resolutions.doc>
        3. Mark ready for motion at next F2F
     6. CID 1050
        1. Review comment
        2. This already covered in 11-13/875r1, and will need to be discussed at another time.
     7. CID 1654
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed resolution: Revised: Make changes in doc 11-13/652r12 under CID 1654.: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0652-12-000m-some-more-lb193-resolutions.doc> These changes resolve the cited ambiguity and tidy up the language of the cited subclause.
        3. Mark ready for motion at next F2F.
     8. CID 1296
        1. Review comment:
        2. Proposed Resolution: Revised: Make changes in doc 11-13/652r12 under CID 1296.: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0652-12-000m-some-more-lb193-resolutions.doc>. This defines terminology in 9.20.3.7.2 for various kinds of “reports” mentioned in that subclause, and adjusts related terminology elsewhere to refer to field names.
        3. Mark Ready for motion at next F2F
     9. CID 1305
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Revised: Make changes in doc 11-13/652r12 under CID 1305.: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0652-12-000m-some-more-lb193-resolutions.doc>. This changes remove all notes, and in one case convert a note to a normative statement.
        3. Mark Ready for motion at next F2F
     10. CID 1088
         1. Review Comment
         2. Proposed resolution: Rejected. Comment does not identify specific changes to be made.
         3. Mark ready for motion at next F2F
     11. CID 1335
         1. Review Comment
         2. Proposed Resolution: Revised. At cited location delete “ensure reliability and to”.
         3. Mark ready for motion at next F2F.
     12. CID 1078 (GEN)
         1. Review Comment
         2. This may be more contentious, and if we should defer to later time.
         3. Question on “PHY attached” vs “attached PHY”
            1. Make it consistent with the rest “attached PHY”
         4. Changes being proposed seem to be significant, and wonder if we have had PHY experts review the proposal.
         5. **Status of this CID deferred to have PHY expert input.**
         6. We may also want to review the “according” word as well, but want more specific discussion to find a proposal.
            1. Could change “according to the PHY Attached” to “by the PLME-CHARACTERISTICS.confirm primitive”
            2. We may have issue with “defined in the standard” – change to “provided”.
     13. CID 29 (GEN)
         1. Left over comment from Pre-D1.0 ballot
         2. Review comment
         3. Proposed Resolution: Revised. In D0, At B.2.1 after "<n> is required" add ". The scope of the group of options is limited to a single table (i.e., subclause) within the PICS)." This text was introduced by CID 180, and is already present in D1.
         4. Mark ready for Motion for Next F2F
     14. CID 1079 (GEN)
         1. Review comment
         2. Proposed resolution: Revised. At 2441.22, replace “(CTS***+sounding* |**CTS***+HTC+ndp-announce*** NDP**)**” with “CTS***+sounding***”
         3. Mark ready for Motion for Next F2F
     15. File is completely reviewed.
  8. CIDs 1155-1157 were not ready for today.
  9. Next call in 2 weeks time Aug 30th
     1. For that call Carlos would like to discuss a presentation on 11ad corrections.
        1. Doc 11-13/977 will be posted prior to the call to allow review.
        2. We plan to give 2nd hour (11-12am ET)
  10. No Other business
  11. Adjourned 11:40am

1. Telecon Aug 31
   1. Agenda:

1. Call to order, patent policy, and attendance

2. Editor report

3. Comment resolution: review available comment resolutions, and  
<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0937-01-000m-proposed-pre-ballot-changes-related-to-11ad-text.docx>

4. AOB, next call Sept 6th  
5. Adjourn

* 1. Attendance: Dorothy STANLEY (Aruba); Adrian STEPHENS (Intel); Jon ROSDAHL (CSR); Knut ODMAN (Broadcom); Carlos CORDEIRO (Intel); Assaf KASHER (Intel); Gaius WEE (Panasonic); James YEE (MediaTek); Sai SHANKAR (Tencercom); Brad LYNCH (Peraso); ChaoChun WANG (MediaTek); Mark HAMILON (Polycom); Payam TORAB (Broadcom)
  2. Review Patent Policy - No items
  3. Editor Report
     1. Review updates
     2. 194 assigned – 17 ready for motion mainly from last telecom
     3. Review assignee list
     4. No comments were ready from the list of assignees for today.
  4. Doc: 11-13/0937r1 – Carlos Cordeiro
     1. Review submission
     2. Concern on changes in 8.6.3 – need to revamp
        1. Suggestion of reordering the wording and making the QoS Null MMPDUs singular.
        2. Some questions were not sufficiently resolved, but a new draft will be created and represented next week or in Nanjing for final consensus.
     3. Suggestion for reviewing prior to the Nanjing face to face where it will be motioned.
     4. Suggested changes will be made and uploaded in R2
  5. Next Telecon Sept 6 at 10am ET.
     1. Dorothy to contact assignees for planning
     2. Comments that require a submission that do not get one will be rejected in Nanjing
  6. Adjourned 11:58am ET.

1. Called to order 10:05am
   1. September 6th call Proposed Adjenda:

1. Call to order, patent policy, attendance

2. Editor report

3. Comment resolution: review available comment resolutions, including   
<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-1009-00-000m-resolutions-to-some-assigned-comments.doc> and CID 1154/11-13-1017 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-1017-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-lb193-cid-1154.doc>)

4. AOB  
5. Adjourn

* 1. Agenda approved as proposed
  2. No Patent issues noted
  3. Attendance: Jean-Pierre LE ROUZIC (Orange), Qi WANG (Broadcom), Dorothy STANLEY (Aruba), Jon Rosdahl (CSR), Mark HAMILTON (Polycom)
  4. Editor Report
     1. No update given
  5. DOC 11-13/1017r0 Qi Wang
     1. Review CID 1154 and submission
     2. Question on if using “unbufferred delivery” vs “normal delivery” vs non-bufferred delivery”
        1. Agreed to use “non-buffered delivery”
        2. Editor to fix grammar if necessary
     3. Question on Dialog Token – fixed what is transmitted specific
        1. In 8.6.14.19, change to “When the WNM-Sleep Mode Response Frame is transmitted as a response”
     4. Other CIDS may have been resolved with this submission, but Qi will need to check
     5. CID 263, 314, and 324 may also be resolved by this submission
     6. Proposed resolution for 1154, 263, 314, and 324: Revise, incorporate changes as documented in 11-13/1017r1
  6. Review remaining CIDs assigned to Qi:
     1. CID 1153 – believe it was resolved in Geneva, see doc:11-13/876? May have addressed this.
        1. Proposed Resolution: Revise, incorporate text changes as documented in 11-13/876r3.
     2. CID 1433 – FMS – needs more thought
     3. CID 1155 – was proposed to be rejected, but Qi will work with Jouni on a new resolution for Nanjing meeting
        1. More work is needed
     4. CID 31 – FMS and non-STBC PSMP frame
        1. More work is needed
     5. 317 and 77 are assigned to Qi and Jouni – Proxy ARP topics
        1. Believe this may have been address sufficiently in previous discussion.
        2. Proposed resolution for 317 and 77: Revise, incorporate the changes as shown in 11-13/652r9 under CID 1167.
  7. Doc: 11-13/1009r0 – Mark Hamilton
     1. Submission with all assigned CIDs
        1. About 60% are ready for discussion today.
     2. CID 1132
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accept
        3. Mark ready for motion
     3. CID 1135
        1. Review comment
        2. The accept seemed ackward, so changing the “in a BSS” with “in a non-mesh BSS” would be better wording.
        3. Proposed Resolution: Revise: Replace "The TXOP Duration Requested subfield is present in QoS Data frames sent by STAs associated in a BSS with bit 4 of the QoS Control field equal to 0." with"The TXOP Duration Requested subfield is present in QoS Data frames sent by STAs associated in a non-mesh BSS with bit 4 of the QoS Control field equal to 0."
        4. Mark ready for motion
     4. CID 1137 and 1138
        1. Review comments
        2. Proposed Resolution: Revised. Change as indicated in the commenter’s proposed change. Also, change “dot11MgmtOptionMotionTODImplemented” to “dot11MgmtOptionTODImplemented” at 1243L45.
        3. Mark ready for Motion
     5. CID 1139, 1140, 1141
        1. Review Comments
        2. Mainly editorily change requested
        3. While the sentiment of proposed change is to accept, we need to put in a Revised for the “same as above” comments
        4. Proposed Resolution for CID 1139: Accept
        5. Propoosed Resolution for CID 1140: Revised, make changes as shown in 11-13/1009r1 for CID 1139.
        6. Proposed Resolution for CID 1141: Revised, make changes as shown in 11-13/1009r1 for CID 1139.
        7. Mark all three ready for motion.
     6. CID 1148
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Reject. The commenter has not identified a clear problem with the current text.
        3. Mark ready for motion
        4. The commentor may not have a current e-mail address on file.
     7. CID 1216
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Revised. Change “LLC” to “IEEE Std 802.11” in the cited location.
        3. Discussion on having the “IEEE Std 802.11” in the sentence twice may be awkward.
        4. Alternately if we put the “IEEEStd 802.11” in the beginning to replace the LLC and remove the second “imposed by IEEE Std 802.11” to give a final sentence of “The IEEE Std 802.11 definitions of the primitives and specific parameter value restrictions as given in 5.2.2 (MA-UNITDATA.request) to 5.2.4 (MA-UIITDATA-STATUS.indication).”
        5. There may be a different parameter list or set of restrictions in the ISO version that needs to be checked. We may want to defer this one and do more research.
     8. CID 1258
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed resolution: Revised. Change “as” to “because” at line 26. See also CID 1259.
        3. After discussion
        4. Proposed Resolution: Revised. Note to commenter: “as” means “because” at the cited location. Also, wording is generally awkward. Change “Requested from peer STA as the STA is leaving” to “Requesting STA is leaving” at line 26.
        5. Mark ready for motion
     9. CID 1259
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed resolution: Revised. Change “Requested from peer STA as it does not want to use the mechanism” to “Requesting STA no longer needs to use the stream or session.” Also change “Requested from peer STA as the STA is leaving” to “Requesting STA is leaving” at line 26.
        3. Proposed resolution: Revised. Change “Requested from peer STA as it does not want to use the mechanism” to “Requesting STA is no longer using the stream or session.”
        4. Mark Ready for Motion
     10. CID 1260
         1. Review comment
         2. Proposed resolution: Revised. Change “Requested from peer STA as the STA received frames using the mechanism for which a setup is required” to “Requesting STA received frames using a mechanism for which a setup has not been completed.”
         3. Mark ready for Motion
     11. CID 1311
         1. Review comment
         2. Initial proposed resolution: Revised. Change “ProbeTimer” to “probe timer” throughout this bullet list.
         3. After more thought, drop “probe” from the resolution as well.
         4. Proposed Resolution: Revised. This is simply a local variable timer, and does need any further qualification or definition. Change “ProbeTimer” to “timer” throughout this bullet list.
         5. Mark Ready for Motion
     12. CID 1367
         1. Review comment
         2. Proposed Resolution: Revised. Replace “and the scheduler should ensure that sufficient cumulative TXOP allocations are made to accommodate retransmissions” with “and the scheduler should take into account these retransmissions in the cumulative TXOP allocations”.
         3. After more consideration, it was determined to change “take into account” to be “consider”
         4. Mark Ready for motion
     13. Time was called – Pickup here in Nanjing
  8. Meeting adjourned at 12:00pm

**References:**

**Submission presented during the Telecon Aug 16th:**

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0968-00-000m-cids-on-rfc-3825.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0652-12-000m-some-more-lb193-resolutions.doc>.

**Submissions presented during the Telecon Aug 30th:**

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0937-01-000m-proposed-pre-ballot-changes-related-to-11ad-text.docx>

**Submissions presented during the Telecon Sept 6th:**

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-1009-00-000m-resolutions-to-some-assigned-comments.doc> <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-1017-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-lb193-cid-1154.doc>