IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 802.11 TGaf March 2013 Vancouver Meeting Minutes | | | | |
| Date: 2013-03-23 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Rich Kennedy | Research In Motion Corporation | 7305 Napiet Trail  Austin, TX 78729 | +1-972-207-3554 | [rikennedy@rim.com](mailto:rikennedy@rim.com) |
| Peter Ecclesine | Cisco Systems | 170 W. Tasman Dr., San Jose, CA 95134-1706 | +1-408-527-0815 | [petere@cisco.com](mailto:petere@cisco.com) |
| Zhou Lan | NICT | 3-4, Hikarino-oka, Yokosuka, 239-0847, Japan | +81-46-847-5097 | [lan@nict.go.jp](mailto:lan@nict.go.jp) |

Abstract

This document contains the meeting minutes from the 802.11 TGaf meetings, held at the March 2013 IEEE 802 Wireless plenary session.

**March 18th , 2013 (Monday) AM 8:30-10:30**

**Notes – Monday, March 18th, 2013; with 30+ attendees, AM1 ad hoc meeting**

1. **Richard Kennedy (RIM) is the chair of the group. Peter Ecclesine (Cisco Systems) is the vice-chair of the group. Zhou Lan (NICT) is the second vice-chair of the group. Chair called the meeting to order: 8:30 am.**
2. **The agenda of this meeting was reviewed and approved by unanimous consent.**
3. **Introduction**
   1. Chair welcomed participants.
   2. Chair reminded participants to record their attendance.
4. **Administrative items**
   1. Chair reviewed the administrative items and presented the links for accessing the related documents.
   2. Chair reviewed the patent policy and meeting guideline slides. Chair asked: “Are there any questions on the slides?” None.
   3. Chair asked: “Are there any patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that the participant believes may be essential for the use of that standard?” None.
   4. Chair reviewed other guide lines of the IEEE WG meetings.
   5. Chair reviewed IEEE-SA bylaws and operations manual.
   6. Chair reviewed task group chair functions and authority.
5. **Discussions of the plan of the week.**
6. **Peter Ecclesine as the TG editor reviewed the status of the comment resolution of LB192.** 
   1. The owner of CID 2035 is changed from Zhou Lan (NICT) to Jens Tingleff (Samsung).
   2. Time values need to be fixed for the resolutions of comment CID 2022.
7. **Peter Ecclesine helped presenting document 802.11-13/237r1 for MAC related comment resolution.**
8. **Zhou Lan presented document 802.11-13/0251r1 for MAC related comment resolution.**
9. **Rich Kennedy reviewed the regulatory updates.**
   1. 802 response to FCC NPRM 12-118.
   2. ETSI BRAN.
10. **Meeting adjourned at 9:39 am Local time**

**March 18th , 2013 (Monday) PM 1:30-3:30**

**Notes – Monday, March 18th, 2013; with 30+ attendees, PM1 meeting**

1. **Richard Kennedy (RIM) is the chair of the group. Peter Ecclesine (Cisco Systems) is the vice-chair of the group. Zhou Lan (NICT) is the second vice-chair of the group. Chair called the meeting to order: 1:30 pm.**
2. **The agenda of this meeting was reviewed and approved by unanimous consent.**
3. **Introduction**
   1. Chair welcomed participants.
   2. Chair reminded participants to record their attendance.
4. **Administrative items**
   1. Chair reviewed the administrative items and presented the links for accessing the related documents.
   2. Chair reviewed the patent policy and meeting guideline slides. Chair asked: “Are there any questions on the slides?” None.
   3. Chair asked: “Are there any patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that the participant believes may be essential for the use of that standard?” None.
   4. Chair reviewed other guide lines of the IEEE WG meetings.
   5. Chair reviewed IEEE-SA bylaws and operations manual.
   6. Chair reviewed task group chair functions and authority.
5. **Motion to approve the comment resolution spreadsheet in 802.11-12/1017r35 as the working document.** 
   1. **Moved by Peter Ecclesine (Cisco Systems), Stuart Kerry (Ok-brit)**
   2. **Discussions: None**
   3. **Passes with unanimous consent.**
6. **Peter Ecclesine reviewed the comment resolution spreadsheet in 802.11-12/1017r35.** 
   1. **Motion to approve the comment resolutions in 802.11-12/1017r35 editorial tab 5.** 
      1. **Moved by Stuart Kerry (Ok-brit), Seconded by James Lansford (CSR)**
      2. **Discussions : None**
      3. **Passes with 22 YES, 0 NO and 1 ABSTAIN.**
7. **Motion to approve the TGaf minutes from the January Interim meeting in Vancouver, and January 29th, February 12th, 19th, 26th, March 5th and 12th teleconferences in documents 11-13/140r0, 11-13/0200r0, 11-13/224r0, 11-13/225r0, 11-13/241r0, 11-13/278r0 and 11-13/279r0 respectively.**
   1. **Moved by James Lansford (CSR), Seconded by Zhou Lan (NICT)**
   2. **Discussions: None**
   3. **Passes with 16 YES, 0 NO and 2 ABSTAIN.**
8. **Tevfik Yucck (Qualcomm) presented document 802.11-13/0312r0 for PHY related comment resolution.**
9. **Dongguk Lim (LGE) presented document 802.11-13/244r1 for PHY related comment resolution.**
10. **Motion to reconsider the earlier decisions on the comment resolutions in 11-12/1017r35 editorial tab 5 (Motion at 16.1) because we were not aware the four hour rule applied.** 
    1. **Moved by Peter Ecclesine (Cisco Systems), Seconded by Stuart Kerry (Ok-brit)**
    2. **Discussions: None**
    3. **Passes with 22 YES, 0 NO and 2 ABSTAIN.**
    4. **Peter Ecclesine is the mover of this motion and is not counted in the votes.**
11. **Motion to approve the comment resolutions in 802.11-12/1017r35 editorial tab 5.** 
    1. **Moved by Stuart Kerry (Ok-brit), Seconded by James Petranovich (ViaSat, Inc.)**
    2. **Discussions : None**
    3. **Passes with 21 YES, 0 NO and 2 ABSTAIN.**
12. **Recess at 3:30 PM**

**March 19th , 2013 (Tuesday) AM 8:00-10:00**

**Notes – Tuesday, March 19th, 2013; with 30+ attendees, AM1 meeting**

1. **Richard Kennedy (RIM) is the chair of the group. Peter Ecclesine (Cisco Systems) is the vice-chair of the group. Zhou Lan (NICT) is the second vice-chair of the group. Chair called the meeting to order: 8:00 am.**
2. **The agenda of this meeting was reviewed and approved by unanimous consent.**
3. **Introduction**
   1. Chair welcomed participants.
   2. Chair reminded participants to record their attendance.
4. **Administrative items**
   1. Chair reviewed the administrative items and presented the links for accessing the related documents.
   2. Chair reviewed the patent policy and meeting guideline slides. Chair asked: “Are there any questions on the slides?” None.
   3. Chair asked: “Are there any patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that the participant believes may be essential for the use of that standard?” None.
   4. Chair reviewed other guide lines of the IEEE WG meetings.
   5. Chair reviewed IEEE-SA bylaws and operations manual.
   6. Chair reviewed task group chair functions and authority.
5. **Adrian Stephens (Intel) provided a tutorial on the proper way of comment resolutions in document 802.11-13/0230r0.**
6. **Motion to reconsider the earlier decisions on the comment resolutions in 11-12/1017r35 editorial tab 5 (Motion at 21).** 
   1. **Moved by Peter Ecclesine (Cisco Systems), Seconded by James Petranovich (ViaSat, Inc.)**
   2. **Discussions: None**
   3. **Passes with 9 YES, 0 NO and 2 ABSTAIN.**
7. **Peter Ecclesine reviewed the 11-12/1017r35 editorial tab 5 (comment CID 2004 change from revised to rejected).** 
   1. **Motion to approve the comment resolutions in 802.11-12/1017r35 editorial tab 5 with changes shown on the screen to become r36.** 
      1. **Moved by Peter (Cisco Systems), Seconded by George Vlantis (STM)**
      2. **Discussions : None**
      3. **Passes with 9 YES, 0 NO and 2 ABSTAIN.**
8. **Tevfik Yucck (Qualcomm) presented document 802.11-13/312r1 for PHY related comment resolution.** 
   1. **Motion to approve comment resolution in document 11-13/312r1.**
      1. **Moved by Tevfik Yucck (Qualcomm), Seconded by Dongguk Lim (LGE)**
      2. **Discussions: None**
      3. **Passes with 10 YES, 0 NO and 5 ABSTAIN.**
9. **Motion to approve comment resolution in document 11-13/251r1.** 
   1. **Moved by Zhou Lan (NICT), seconded by Jens Tingleff (Samsung).**
   2. **Discussions: None**
   3. **Passes with 9 YES, 0 NO and 3 ABSTAIN.**
10. **Coffee break at 9:50 AM.**

**March 19th , 2013 (Tuesday) AM 10:30-12:30**

**Notes – Tuesday, March 19th, 2013; with 30+ attendees, AM2 meeting**

1. **Richard Kennedy (RIM) is the chair of the group. Peter Ecclesine (Cisco Systems) is the vice-chair of the group. Zhou Lan (NICT) is the second vice-chair of the group. Chair called the meeting to order: 10:30 am.**
2. **The agenda of this meeting was reviewed and approved by unanimous consent.**
3. **Introduction**
   1. Chair welcomed participants.
   2. Chair reminded participants to record their attendance.
4. **Administrative items**
   1. Chair reviewed the administrative items and presented the links for accessing the related documents.
   2. Chair reviewed the patent policy and meeting guideline slides. Chair asked: “Are there any questions on the slides?” None.
   3. Chair asked: “Are there any patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that the participant believes may be essential for the use of that standard?” None.
   4. Chair reviewed other guide lines of the IEEE WG meetings.
   5. Chair reviewed IEEE-SA bylaws and operations manual.
   6. Chair reviewed task group chair functions and authority.
5. **Dongguk Lim (LGE) presented document 11-13/246r1 for PHY related comment resolution.** 
   1. **Motion to approve comment resolution in document 11-13/246r1.**
      1. **Moved by Dongguk Lim (LGE) Seconded by Zhou Lan (NICT)**
      2. **Discussions: None**
      3. **Passes with 10 YES, 0 NO and 3 ABSTAIN.**
6. **Ron Porat (Broadcom) presented document 11-13/0298r0 for PHY related comment resolutions.** 
   1. **Motion to approve the comment resolutions in document 11-13/0298r0.**
      1. **Moved by Ron Porat (Broadcom), Seconded by Tevfik Yucck (Qualcomm)**
      2. **Discussions: None**
      3. **Passes with 14 YES, 1 NO and 2 ABSTAIN.**
7. **Peter Ecclesine presented document 11-13/316r0.** 
   1. **Motion to approve the comment resolution in document 11-13/316r0.** 
      1. **Moved by Peter Ecclesine (Cisco systems), Seconded by George Vlantis (STM)**
      2. **Discussions: None**
      3. **Passes with 12 YES, 0 NO and 1 ABSTAIN.**
8. **Jens Tingleff (Samsung) presented document 11-13/344r0 for transmission power on multiple channel related comment.**
9. **Dongguk Lim (LGE) presented document 11-13/244r5 for PHY related comment resolutions.**
10. **Recess at 12:30 am Local time.**

**March 20th , 2013 (Wednesday) AM 8:00-10:00**

**Notes – Wednesday, March 20th, 2013; with 30+ attendees, AM1 meeting**

1. **Richard Kennedy (RIM) is the chair of the group. Peter Ecclesine (Cisco Systems) is the vice-chair of the group. Zhou Lan (NICT) is the second vice-chair of the group. Chair called the meeting to order: 8:00 am.**
2. **The agenda of this meeting was reviewed and approved by unanimous consent.**
3. **Introduction**
   1. Chair welcomed participants.
   2. Chair reminded participants to record their attendance.
4. **Administrative items**
   1. Chair reviewed the administrative items and presented the links for accessing the related documents.
   2. Chair reviewed the patent policy and meeting guideline slides. Chair asked: “Are there any questions on the slides?” None.
   3. Chair asked: “Are there any patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that the participant believes may be essential for the use of that standard?” None.
   4. Chair reviewed other guide lines of the IEEE WG meetings.
   5. Chair reviewed IEEE-SA bylaws and operations manual.
   6. Chair reviewed task group chair functions and authority.
5. **Peter Ecclesine reviewed the status of comment resolution with 802.11-12/1017r36.**
6. **Dongguk Lim (LGE) presented document 802.11-13/237r2.** 
   1. **Motion to approve the comment resolution in document 802.11-13/237r2 with exception of CIDs 2114, 2157 and 2159.** 
      1. **Moved by Dongguk Lim (LGE), Seconded by Zhou Lan (NICT)**
      2. **Discussions: None**
      3. **Passes with 8 YES, 0 NO and 0 ABSTAIN.**
7. **Dongguk Lim (LGE) presented document 802.11-13/244r5.** 
   1. **Motion to approve the comment resolution in document 802.11-13/244r5.** 
      1. **Moved by Dongguk Lim (LGE), Seconded by Al Petrick (Jones-Petrick and Associates, LLC.)**
      2. **Discussions: None**
      3. **Passes with 9 YES, 0 NO and 1 ABSTAIN.**
8. **Jens Tingleff (Samsung) presented document 802.11-13/344r1.** 
   1. **Motion to approve the comment resolution in document 802.11-13/344r1 with changes shown on the screen to become r2.** 
      1. **Moved by Jens Tingleff (Samsung), Seconded by Dongguk Lim (LGE)**
      2. **Discussions: None**
      3. **Passes with 12 YES, 0 NO and 0 ABSTAIN.**
9. **Jens Tingleff (Samsung) presented document 802.11-13/345r1.** 
   1. **Motion to approve the comment resolution in document 802.11-13/345r1 with the changes shown on the screen to become r2.** 
      1. **Moved by Jens Tingleff (Samsung), Seconded by Dongguk Lim (LGE)**
      2. **Discussions: None**
      3. **Passes with 12 YES, 0 NO and 1 ABSTAIN.**
10. **Having approved the comment resolutions for all of the comments received from LB192 on TGaf D3.0, as contained in document 11-12/1017r37, instruct the editor to prepare Draft 4.0 incorporating these resolutions and, Approve a 15 day Working Group Recirculation Ballot, asking the question “Should P802.11af D4.0 be forwarded to Sponsor Ballot?”**
    1. **Moved by Al Petrick (Jones-Petrick and Associates, LLC.), Seconded by Tevfik Yucek (Qualcomm)**
    2. **Discussions: None**
    3. **Passes with 14 YES, 0 NO and 0 ABSTAIN**
11. **Plan for the May**
12. **Motion to adjourn**
    1. **Moved by James Petranovich (ViaSat, Inc.).**
    2. **Meeting adjourned 9:00AM local time.**
13. **References:**
    1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/12/11-12-1017-37-00af-tgaf-wg-lb-comment-resolutions.xlsx>
    2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0345-02-00af-making-a-k-shift-for-non-ht-duplicate-ofdm-in-2w-and-4w-modes-lb192-cid-2044.docx>
    3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0344-02-00af-wsm-words-about-multiple-channels-and-power-levels-lb-192-cid-2035.docx>
    4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0244-05-00af-lb-192-comment-resolutions-8211-clause-3-2-3-2a-and-4-3-10b.doc>
    5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0237-02-00af-lb192-gdc-comment-resolution.doc>
    6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0312-01-00af-misc-phy-comment-resolutions-lb192.docx>
    7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-0251-01-00af-lb192-mac-comment-resolution.doc>