IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| CIDs section 9.17a |
| Date: 2012-08-15 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Simone Merlin | Qualcomm Inc | 5775 Morehouse DrSan Diego, CA 92109 | 8588451243 | smerlin@qualcomm.com |

Abstract

# Comment

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6194 | 123.25 | 9.17a | Table 9-19: for a unassociated STA which is waiting for Beacon, as there is no indication of Beacon in PHY header portion, the STA has to receive all frames and parse it at MAC layer to decide whether this frame is a Beacon, this will waste the power of the unassociated STA. | Assign an special PARTIAL\_AID for the beacon frame, so the unassociated STA can identify the beacon frame only by the PHY head portion to save power when scanning for a AP. | Reject. Beacons are usually sent as non-HT PPDUs. The proposed indication is of little or no practical use. |

# Discussion:

Partial AID is present in VHT PPDUs only. Beacons usually are NOT sent in a VHT PPDU format. If a beacon is sent in VHT format, 11a/n STAs would not receive it; moreover the range would be limited by the 6Mbps minimum MCS of a VHT PPDU. Since beacons are not usually sent in VHT PPDUs, the proposed Partial AID value would be of little or no use.

Even assuming the special Partial AID indication proposed by the commenter is in place, a STA passively scanning for beacons has to process anyway the received non-HT frames, because there is the (very likely) possibility that some beacons are sent as non-HT beacons. Note that most of the broadcast/multicast traffic is also sent as non-HT at the lowest rate.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6289 | 122.52 | 9.17a | From Table 9-19, also a function of RA if mesh | Generalize language for mesh |

**Editorial instructions**

At P112L52 change:

The partial AID is a non-unique identifier of a STA based on its AID, RA, and/or the BSSID of the BSS to which the STA is associated.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6290 | 122.57 | 9.17a | Table 9-19 is not specific whether it means RA or DA where it says "addressed". As importantly, Table 9-19 does not deal with the case where the DA/RA (I think RA) is a group address | Row1: RA = AP, row2: RA = mesh STA, row3: RA = STA associated with that AP etc; add row for RA = group address ... | Reject.As described in the paragraph P122L64, the table refers to the address of MPDUs in the PPDU. The terms ‘group addressed’ and ‘individually addressed’ are well defined in clause 2 and refer to Address 1 Also, the group address case is described at P122L57 |

**Discussion**

At P122L64, the paragraph referencing the table suggests that the table refers to MPDU addressing; Also, NDP is an MPDU, not an MSDU.

*A STA transmitting a VHT SU PPDU carrying one or more individually addressed MPDUs or a VHT NDP*

*intended for a single recipient shall set the TXVECTOR parameters GROUP\_ID and PARTIAL\_AID as shown in Table 9-19 (Settings for the TXVECTOR parameters GROUP\_ID and PARTIAL\_AID).*

The terms ‘group addressed’ and ‘individually addressed’ are well defined in clause 2 and refer to Address 1

Also, the group address case is described at P122L5

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6291 | 122.57 | 9.17a | The definition of group addressed is "group addressed: When applied to a medium access control (MAC) service data unit (MSDU), it is anMSDU with a group address as the destination address (DA)." Now a client sending a group addressed frame has DA = groupAddress, RA = AP. So which is it - group Id = 0 (since to AP) or 63 (since group addressed) | I think the idea here is a group address in the RA, not the DA. Then use a better term than "group addressed" | Reject.The conditions refers to group addressed MPDUs, as indicated in P122L57The definition is group addressed MPDU is clear in 802.11-2012 and refers to the Address 1, i.e. RA.  |

**Discussion**

The par at P122L57 says “A STA transmitting a VHT SU PPDU carrying one or more group addressed MPDUs or […]”

Hence the conditions refer to group addressed MPDUs.

The definition of group addressed MPDU is clear in 802.11-2012 and refers to the Address 1, i.e. RA.

**group address**: A medium access control (MAC) address that has the group bit equal to 1. *Syn*: multicast

address.

**group addressed:** When applied to a medium access control (MAC) service data unit (MSDU), it is an

MSDU with a group address as the destination address (DA). When applied to a MAC protocol data unit

(MPDU), it is an MPDU with a group address in the Address 1 field. *Syn*: **multicast**.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6841 | 127.58 | 9.17a | Implication of "The partial AID can be used for power saving." should be clarified by any reference to subclause number if exist. My apology that this is missed to include at previous LB comment. | Append any refered subclause number or eliminate this sentense. | Agree. Remove the sentence. No need to indicate what is the use of this indication in this section  |

**Editing instructions**

P122L52

The partial AID is a non-unique identifier of a STA based on its AID and the BSSID of the BSS to which the

STA is associated. The partial AID is carried in the TXVECTOR parameter PARTIAL\_AID of a VHT SU

PPDU and is limited to 9 bits.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6762 | 123.34 | 9.17a | Bulky: "for which it is not known which conditions are applicable.". | Replace "it is not known which conditions are applicable" with "the applicable conditions are unknown". |

P132L35

***Change the following sentence.***

sent to a STA for which the applicable conditions are unknown

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6763 | 123.43 | 9.17a | Number mismatch. | Replace "represent" with "represents" on both lines 43 and 46. | Accept |

EDITORIAL COMMENT NOT ADDRESSED HERE

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6425 | 123.65 | 9.17a |  |  | For the avoidance of doubt, state whether bit-reversed notation is being used | Add a "NOTE---Per IEEE 802-2001, the use of hyphens for the BSSID indicates hexadecimal representation rather than bit-reversed represenation." and make sure that's indeed how the example works out |  |