

Proposals for CTF Ad Hoc Progress

Rev 3 2022-04-14: added slides 17-18
Rev 3 2022-04-07: revised slides 14-15
Rev 2 2022-04-05: added slides 14-16
Rev 1 2022-03-30: added slides 11-13
Rev 0 2022-03-23

Roger Marks
(EthAirNet Associates; Huawei)
roger@ethair.net

+1 802 capable

2022-04-14

Background

- Nendica Study Item: [Cut-Through Forwarding in Bridges and Bridged Networks \[CTF\]](#) active since 2021-03-11
- Organized IEEE 802 Plenary Tutorial (2021-07-07): “Cut-Through Forwarding (CTF) among Ethernet networks”
- Nendica Consensus (2021-09-16) that “further discussion should be brought to the 802.1 WG or a Task Group”
- 802.1 WG submitted draft PAR 802.1DU (“Cut-Through Forwarding Bridges and Bridged Networks”) [PAR](#) and [CSD](#), 2022-01-31 for IEEE 802 March Plenary
- Comments developed in 802.3 WG, with 802.3 and 802.1 members
- Comment responses developed in 802.1 WG, with 802.1 and 802.3 members
- 802.1 WG decided not to pursue PAR in March

802.1 WG Motions

- 802.1 WG Motions, 2022-03-15:
 - *Authorize the 802.1 WG to hold joint meetings with the 802.3 WG to discuss cut-through forwarding.*
 - *802.1 authorizes the 802.1 WG chair to present status of P802.1DU to the 802.3 WG and request joint meetings to continue discussion.*
 - *802.1 authorizes the TSN TG to generate PAR and CSD for pre-circulation to the EC for the July 2022 plenary session for an IEEE 802.1 standard on Cut-Through Forwarding.*

802.1 WG Actions

- 802.3 Closing Plenary
 - 802.1 WG Chair presentation recounted history of CTF activity in 802 back to 2016 and reported:
 - *P802.1DU PAR is deferred...*
 - *Consensus in 802.1 WG to discuss further with 802.3 WG jointly*
 - *Proposed venue*
 - *Joint NEA and Nendica Industry Connections ad hoc*
 - Note: “NEA” is IEEE 802.3 Industry Connections New Ethernet Applications Ad Hoc
 - https://www.ieee802.org/3/ad_hoc/ngrates
 - 802.3 Chair verbally accepted the proposal, with details to be determined
 - Note: Nendica Chair reached out to NEA Chair, March 17

Nendica Chair to NEA Chair (2022-03-17)

- ...
- *The 802.1 WG agreed to joint meetings with the 802.3 WG to discuss cut-through forwarding (CTF). Glenn reported that at the 802.3 Closing Plenary today, proposing a joint NEA/Nendica CTF activity, as Glenn and David had previously discussed. It's my understanding that David gave the go-ahead at the 802.3 Closing Plenary, but correct me if I am wrong.*
- *With that understanding, it seems we are on the hook to try for consensus on bridging the gaps, or at least to improve the level of shared understanding, on the CTF issue.*
- *I think there are many logistical and scheduling points to arrange, and perhaps we should think about how to get that discussion started.*
- *For the moment, I want to let you know that Nendica meets Thursdays 09:00-11:00 ET. For the agenda of March 24, I've scheduled time to review what happened during the 802 Plenary, including on the CTF points, and to discuss how to proceed. Note the Nendica can also hold additional ad hoc meetings, including in other time slots, and I think that Nendica/NEA meetings should be limited to CTF-only so that other topics don't bore the participants.*
- *You (and anyone) are welcome to join the Nendica discussions next week. If you would like to coordinate on a joint contribution on how the process might work, I'm happy to work with you. If not, I'll probably make such a contribution on my own; you are, of course, welcome to make one too. Before too long, I hope we can get the joint activity rolling.*
- *I'm looking forward to your thoughts, again understanding that you may be tied up with secretarial work.*

Issues for Next Steps

- Goals of the joint ac hoc
 - expected output
- Meeting schedule
 - periodicity
 - start times
 - duration
- Meeting logistics
 - document storage area
 - chair
 - agenda setting
 - Minutes
 - conference facility, calendar, IMAT

Next Step Proposal: Goals

- Goals of the joint ad hoc
 - expected output:
 - document consensus, or alternative positions, for consideration of WGs
 - topics
 - list relevant standards
 - summarize requirements, from standards, for frame error checking by the entities
 - summarize understanding of service interfaces and the meaning and implications of atomicity in primitives
 - summarize any inconsistency of MAC and higher-layer standards with a CTF standard
 - options for standardization
 - P802.1DU alone
 - issues that 802.3 WG could consider as a companion project

Next Step Proposal: schedule

- Periodicity
 - one week? two weeks>
 - e.g. (if two weeks, Thursday): April 7, April 21, May 5
 - three meetings before interim sessions
 - 802.1 Interim is May 9–13
 - 802.3 Interim is May 16–26
 - can reassess schedule during Interims
- day/time
 - at the convenience of those interested
 - run a poll (advertised to Nendica and NEA)
- duration
 - allow two hours per meeting

Next Step Proposal: logistics

- document storage area
 - Nendica mentor
- Chair
 - Alternating between Nendica and NEA Chairs
- conference facility
 - Nendica Webex
- calendar and IMAT
 - per Nendica; calendar entry duplicated in 802.3
- agenda setting
 - provided on the Nendica web site
 - provided by the alternating Chair
- Minutes
 - Provided by the group not chairing

Schedule to finishing planning

- develop means to engage NEA participants
- by 2022-03-31 Nendica should:
 - agree on a goal
 - determine logistics
 - schedule the full set of meetings
 - post first meeting agenda
- Further meetings will be within the joint ad hoc, not within Nendica

Update: 2022-03-29

- NEA Chair indicated (2022-03-23) possible participation in Nendica meeting of 2022-03-24
 - No NEA representation there
- Nendica Chair provided 802.1-22-0010-00 to NEA Chair 2022-03-24, with message:
 - *I think we need to decide basic logistics of how and when we will meet. I would like to do that quickly.*
 - *The core Nendica meeting slot is Thursdays 9-11 ET, and can also use custom time slots. My proposal suggests that the Nendica/NEA CTF discussions should take place in custom slots. So, I am proposing that, when Nendica meets a week from today, it should finalize plans for the CTF ad hoc; from that point on, the core Nendica meeting will no longer discuss CTF.*
 - *Please let me know your thoughts regarding the points in the proposal, and if you have suggestions on meeting periodicity and duration. My proposal suggests a Nendica/NEA poll to choose a time slot, but we can use other methods. Also, let me know your thoughts on the proposed logistics. If we could reach agreement among the two of us, we could have an updated version of this contribution source from both of us.*
- Awaiting response

Proposed Schedule: Plan A

- With participation of NEA representatives, Nendica decides, on March 31, on a set of possible time slots for a poll.
 - Plan A-alt: set of time slot options agreed after Nendica meeting
- Poll concludes by April 6
- NEA communicates preferred dates to Nendica
- on April 7, Nendica schedules ad hoc meetings (with at least 10 day notice required)
- in parallel, NEA selects the same dates and agrees on logistics
- Meetings:
 - week of April 18
 - week of April 25
 - week of May 2
 - 802.1 Interim May 9–13

Proposed Schedule: Plan B

- With NEA engagement, Nendica decides, on April 7, on a set of possible time slots for a poll.
 - Plan A-alt: set of time slot options agreed after Nendica meeting
- Poll concludes by April 13
- NEA communicates preferred dates to Nendica
- on April 14, Nendica schedules ad hoc meetings (with at least 10 day notice required)
- in parallel, NEA selects the same dates and agrees on logistics
- Meetings:
 - week of April 25
 - week of May 2
 - 802.1 Interim May 9–13

Update: 2022-04-07

- Following communication with NEA Chair and 802.3 WG Chair, poll on meeting slots was initiated (2022-04-03 to 06)
 - <https://doodle.com/meeting/participate/id/6dBx7BJa>
 - sent to Nendica and 802.1 reflector
 - 802.3 leaders forwarded poll to 802.3 participants
 - indicated deadline 2022-05-06 AOE (2022-05-07 08:00 ET)
- Results (as of 2022-05-07 09:25 ET):

Day	Time (ET)	Count	Notes
Monday	13:00-14:00	13	
Tuesday	12:00-13:00	14	
Tuesday	13:00-14:00	15	
Wednesday	12:00-13:00	20	only slot recorded for NEA Chair
Thursday	12:00-13:00	14	
Friday	11:00-12:00	19	

Suggested Motion

- To schedule ad hoc meetings, joint with 802.3 NEA, 12:00-13:00 ET on April 20, April 27, and May 4, authorizing the ad hoc meetings to schedule additional ad hoc meetings, with logistical details to be agreed by the Nendica and NEA chairs and teleconference details to be provided at least 10 days prior to each meeting.
 - Motion: Specht
 - Second: Congdon
 - Approved, without objection
- Note: Logistical issues are summarized on Slide 9.

Further meeting in Nendica alone

- Should Nendica retain a CTF Study Item segment on the agenda for 2022-04-14?

Update: 2022-04-14

- Nendica Chair agreed with NEA leadership on main logistical points
- Meeting announced 2020-04-08

Schedule

- **Meetings:**
 - April 20 12:00-13:00 ET (chaired by Nendica Chair)
 - April 27 12:00-13:00 ET (chaired by NEA Chair)
 - May 4 12:00-13:00 ET (chaired by Nendica Chair)
- **Schedule and agendas:**
 - Nendica/NEA Joint Ad Hoc on Cut-Through Forwarding
 - <https://1.ieee802.org/802-nendica/ctf-adhoc/>