

IEEE 802 LMSC Questions and Request for Clarifications from AudCom and SASB regarding IEEE 802 LMSC Policies and Procedures

Overview

- IEEE 802 LMSC reviewed the AudCom comments from revision 2
 - Authorized one change to the submitted IEEE 802 LMSC Policies and Procedures
 - Asked some questions for clarification by AudCom and SASB
- Note that changes to the submitted P&P can only be approved at the 3 plenary meetings during the year
- The first Vice Chair is only authorized to make editorial changes.

1.5 Fundamental Principles of Standards Development

- Marked not acceptable
 - R2: Use full name of Standards Committee
- We have:
 - “IEEE 802 LMSC”
- Agree that it should be spelled out:
 - “IEEE 802 LAN/MAN Standards Committee (LMSC)”

3.4.1 Chair - Comment

- Substantive:
 - R0: 1) Deleting “b) Forming study groups, as necessary.” text is not allowed
 - R2: Comment not addressed “b)” should be reinserted per instruction no modification except addition
- Marked as not acceptable

3.4.1 Chair - Question

- In the baseline document, 5.5 PAR Development the text says:
 - “the Standards Committee may form a PAR Study Group as a subgroup of the Standards Committee or as a subgroup of an existing Working Group to examine the proposal”
- This assigns responsibility for forming a PAR Study Group to the Standards Committee and not the Standards Committee Chair.
- Request SASB Interpretation:
 - 1) Are PAR Study Groups formed by the Standards Committee Chair or by the Standards Committee?
 - 2) in item b), does the term “study group” refer to a “PAR Study Group” or some other type of study group?

3.4.2 Vice Chair - Comment/Response

- Comment:
 - R2: since a first and a second vice chairs have been noted, the duties of these two distinct officers should be noted. Perhaps as 3.4.2.1 and 3.4.2.2 or as done with the multiple secretary titles.
- Response
 - Disagree: The roles are essentially identical, except to indicate which Vice Chair takes over for the Standards Committee Chair. In our view, it reads more clearly as a single description.

4.3.2 Request to the Chair for Voting Membership - Comment

- Editorial
 - 1) Changing Section title from “Request to the Chair” to “Request to the Standards Committee Chair” is usually not allowed with exception of advised in instructional text and special circumstance
 - R2: Comment not addressed. Section Title should be changed to the template text.
- Marked as not acceptable
- This section is marked “Not Applicable” in the IEEE 802 LMSC proposed P&P

4.3.2: Response

- In updating the baseline to match current rules, the relevant occurrences of “Chair” and “Sponsor Chair” were changed to “Standards Committee Chair”
- There are multiple chair’s in the document, e.g., Responsible Subcommittee Chair, Working Group Chair, Technical Advisory Group Chair, Chair of a subgroup, Chair of the Appeal Committee, Appeal Panel Chair
- Request to AudCom:
 - For consistency and accuracy, the section title should match the usage in the rest of the document, which uses uniformly the term Standards Committed Chair to refer to this position.
 - This change is consistent with the intent of SASB and the baseline and improves clarity.

PAR Study Groups - Clarification

- The SASB Operations Manual, “5.2 Project Authorization” states:
 - “A PAR Study Group is a subgroup of the Standards Committee or Working Group ...”
- The baseline says
 - “the Standards Committee may form a PAR Study Group or may task an existing Working Group”
- Clarification requested:
 - Are PAR Study Groups a subgroup of either the Standards Committee or Working Group as it says in the SASB Operations Manual?

PAR Study Group - impact

- Section 5.5 PAR Development
- Section 5.5.1 PAR Study Group
- Section 5.5.3 Participation and Voting
- Section 5.5.4 Submission of a PAR to the Standards Committee

7.1.1 Actions requiring approval by a majority vote

- Marked as not acceptable
 - 1) Editing Item e) violated the instruction only edit bracketed text
 - R2: Comment not addressed
- Actions
 - Reversed changes
 - Deleted bracked item “[Approval to co-sponsor a project (PAR).]” (allowed in instructions, c) taking care of the brackets)
 - Added new itme as e), “Approval for a joint development project” (allowed in the instructions, b) adding actions)

7.1.2 Actions requiring approval by a two-thirds vote - comment

- Marked as not acceptable
 - Editing Item a) violated the instruction clause shall not be modified
 - 3rd Paragraph is a new paragraph contain notes which violated the instruction except to include additional voting actions
 - R2: Comment not addressed
- Note: This has to do with changes to the P&P

7.1.2 Actions requiring approval by a two-thirds vote - Response

- The current text allows a minority of the voting members, with no notice, to change the P&P:
 - Example: 15 members, 8 present is a quorum, 6 in favor meets 2/3 but is only 2/5 (40%) of the members voted in favor. New P&P is submitted to AudCom.
 - In subsequent meetings, the 6 constitute $> 1/3$ and can block the majority's attempt to undo the rule changes.
 - There is no restriction on when rule changes can be proposed, they can be simply presented under new business or by modifying the agenda during approval.
- This was last approved by SASB in 2014
- IEEE 802 LMSC feels strongly that open participation would not allow a minority of the members to fundamentally change the Standards Committee operation with no notice.

12.0 Revision of Standards Committee P&P

- Marked as not acceptable
 - R2: The reviewers have considered the Standards Committee's comment; however, we do not agree that this is appropriate in the P&P. The section can either be removed or it will be a discussion item at the next AudCom meeting.
- Action
 - The method for changing rules need to be in that document, or in a superior document. Hence, in our opinion, it belongs in the P&P.
 - IEEE 802 LMSC feels strongly that open participation would not allow a minority of the members to fundamentally change the Standards Committee operation with no notice.