

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl	SC	P	L	#
Cl 1	SC 1	P14	L4	# i-120
Growth, Robert RMG Consulting				
<i>Comment Type</i>	TR	<i>Comment Status</i> A		
<p>The use of an undated reference (i.e., IEEE Std 802.3) indicates the current version of the reference. Today, this reference includes approved P802.3bt, approved P802.3cb, and by completion should include at a minimum P802.3cd. This standard clearly can't track a moving target. A dated reference should be used, and clarity should be added on what parts of IEEE Std 802.3-2018 are not included. It appears that the current approved amendments are not included. It would also be appropriate to indicate that the YANG modules do not include all cmanagement capabilities for DTE specified in Clause 30.</p>				
<i>SuggestedRemedy</i>				
Add appropriate words about this standard incorporating selected management capabilities for some DTEs defined in IEEE Std 802.3-2018.				
<i>Response</i>		<i>Response Status</i> U		
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.				
Change				
<p>This standard defines YANG modules for Ethernet data terminal equipment (DTE) specified in IEEE Std 802.3. This includes DTEs operating on mixing segments, using either Carrier Sense Multiple Access / Collision Detection (CSMA/CD) or multipoint control protocol (MPCP), link segments, and as Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE).</p>				
To				
<p>This standard defines YANG modules for various Ethernet devices specified in IEEE Std 802.3. This includes half-duplex and full-duplex data terminal equipment (DTE) using either Carrier Sense Multiple Access / Collision Detection (CSMA/CD) or multipoint control protocol (MPCP), and Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE).</p>				

Cl	SC	P	L	#
Cl 5	SC 5.2	P20	L24	# i-231
Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation				
<i>Comment Type</i>	TR	<i>Comment Status</i> R		<i>SI</i>
speed is m/s according to SI units				
<i>SuggestedRemedy</i>				
Change to data rate				
<i>Response</i>		<i>Response Status</i> W		
REJECT.				
<p>Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223 defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.</p>				
<p>Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".</p>				
<p>Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.</p>				

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

<i>Cl</i> 5	<i>SC</i> 5.3.1	<i>P24</i>	<i>L19</i>	# i-232
-------------	-----------------	------------	------------	---

Weber, Karl
Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *SI*

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy
Change to data rate

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in <https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223> defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (<https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50>) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

<i>Cl</i> 5	<i>SC</i> 5.3.2	<i>P27</i>	<i>L10</i>	# i-233
-------------	-----------------	------------	------------	---

Weber, Karl
Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *SI*

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy
Change to data rate

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in <https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223> defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (<https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50>) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

<i>Cl</i> 5	<i>SC</i> 5.3.2	<i>P27</i>	<i>L17</i>	# i-234
-------------	-----------------	------------	------------	---------

Weber, Karl
Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *SI*

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy
Change to data rate

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in <https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223> defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (<https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50>) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

<i>Cl</i> 5	<i>SC</i> 5.3.2	<i>P30</i>	<i>L48</i>	# i-235
-------------	-----------------	------------	------------	---------

Weber, Karl
Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **R** *SI*

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy
Change to data rate

Response *Response Status* **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in <https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223> defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (<https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50>) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3cf D3.0 YANG Data Model Definitions Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 5 **SC 5.3.2** **P30** **L49** # **i-236**

Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **R** **SI**

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy
Change to data rate

Response **Response Status** **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in <https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223> defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (<https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50>) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Cl 5 **SC 5.3.2** **P30** **L53** # **i-237**

Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **A**

speed is m/s according to SI units

SuggestedRemedy
Change to data rate

Response **Response Status** **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "Operational speed" to "Operational speed (data rate)"

Cl 5 **SC 5.3.2.1** **P27** **L10** # **i-158**

Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **R** **SI**

speed-type is not the appropriate term (speed should mean "data rate")

SuggestedRemedy
Replace this parameter by "phy-type" according to IEEE 802.3 30.3.2.1.2

Response **Response Status** **W**

REJECT.

Used consistently with IETF RFC, for example see leaf "speed" in <https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc7223> defining YANG Data Model for Interface Management.

Moreover, definition of "units" in RFC6020 (<https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50>) does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type".

Furthermore, the definition of baud (Bd) used heavily in IEEE Std 802.3 standard reads 'A unit of signaling speed, expressed ...'. ANSI/IEEE Std 260.1-2004 'IEEE Standard Letter Symbols for Units of Measurement (SI Units, Customary Inch-Pound Units, and Certain Other Units)' which is referenced by the IEEE-SA Standards Style Guide also defines baud as 'In telecommunications, a unit of signaling >>speed<< equal to one element per second.', see <http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#bps>.

Cl 5 **SC 5.3.2.1** **P33** **L48** # **i-163**

Weber, Karl Beckhoff Automation

Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **R**

According to 30.3.1.1.37, Max Frame is a enumerated value

SuggestedRemedy
Change definition to the 4 enumeration values

Response **Response Status** **W**

REJECT.

A pre-configured value is more useful, especially considering support for frames larger than allowed by 30.3.1.1.37