IEEE 802.3 motions

Closing IEEE 802 EC

Friday 15th March 2019

ME 5.012: IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet to Standards Association (fka Sponsor) ballot

IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet to Standards Association (fka Sponsor) ballot

Item 1:Date the ballot closed

The 4th Working Group recirculation ballot on IEEE P802.3cg draft D2.4 closed on 8th March 2019 at 23:59 AoE

Item 2:Vote Tally

	Initial Draft D2.0			1st Recirculation Draft D2.1			2nd Recirculation Draft D2.2			3rd Recirculation Draft D2.3			4th Recirculation Draft D2.4			Req %
	#	%	Status	#	%	Status	#	%	Status	#	%	Status	#	%	Status	
Abstain	15	10	PASS	15	10	PASS	16	10	PASS	18	10	PASS	20	11	PASS	< 30
Dis with comment	24	-	-	20	-	-	9	-	-	4	-	-	2	-	-	-
Dis w/o comment	0	-	-	0	-	-	0	-	-	0	-	-	0	-	-	-
Approve	100	80	PASS	115	85	PASS	131	93	PASS	142	97	PASS	153	98	PASS	≥ 75
Ballots returned	139	55	PASS	150	60	PASS	156	62	PASS	164	65	PASS	175	70	PASS	> 50
Voters	249	-	-	249	-	-	249	-	-	249	-	-	249	-	-	-
Comments	739	-	-	502	-	-	351	-	-	128	-	-	47	-	-	-

IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet to Standards Association (fka Sponsor) ballot

Changes to draft prior to Sponsor Ballot

- Change the draft number to 3.0
- Change the front matter to reference that the draft is for Standards Association ballot. (P1 L34, replace “Draft 2.4 is prepared for Working Group review” with “Draft 3.0 is prepared for initial Standards Association ballot.”
- Delete editors notes marked ‘to be removed prior to sponsor ballot’.

Comments that support the remaining disapprove votes and WG responses

- 69 unsatisfied negative comments from 2 commenters

See <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0052-01-00EC-ieee-p802-3cg-unsatisfied-comment.pdf>

IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet to Standards Association (fka Sponsor) ballot

Unsatisfied comments summary: Thompson – 17 comments

- PLCA constitutes a new MAC function, and/or modifies MII
  - D2.0:637, 645, 646, 650, 656, 657, 658 ; D2.2: 322, D2.3: 128:
    - See http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/Feb2019/Thompson%20addl%20comments%20P802.3cgD2.3v2.pdf
- Draft does not use AUI : D2.0: 632, 659, 638
- Draft does not support repeaters: D2.0: 661
- Cross reference to primitives in clause 40.2 rather than clause 22: D2.0 642
- PCS reset - desires text describing level or pulse for reset.: D2.0 643
- Collision detect – desires energy-detect description of collision detect.: D2.0 648
- Clarification for reg 1.0.11 low power mode: D2.1 337

IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet to Standards Association (fka Sponsor) ballot

Unsatisfied comment summary: Kim

- Mixing segment specification: – claims draft requires measurements, and violates economic feasibility
  - D2.4:42, 43
- CSDs – claims draft violates CSDs, PLCA a new MAC and/or compatibility concerns at MII:
  - D2.4: 44; D2.2: 120, 198, 210, 264, 265; D2.0: 289, 637:
    - See http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/Mar2019/802.3%20cg%20PAR%20and%20CSD%20Issues%20D2-4_v1_Kim_2019-03-08.pdf
  - D2.3 102: PLCA resides in PCS
  - D2.3 119: xMII is inappropriate in Figure 1-1
  - D2.2: 259, 264, 265, 273
  - D2.0: 292, 294, 295, 313, 604, 605
- PLCA Management:
  - D2.4: 45, D2.0 301: (location of oPLCA in draft)
  - D2.4: 46, 47, D2.3 205, D2.2 274, D2.0 273, 274, 275 (PLCA mgmt defaults or range)
  - D2.3: 105 (name of counter), 106, D2.2: 214
  - D2.2 199, 200: Location of PLCA management in PHY
  - D2.2 269; D2.0 311: Guidance on parameter setting

IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet to Standards Association (fka Sponsor) ballot

Unsatisfied comment summary: Kim

- ‘Multidrop mode’: wants word “multidrop” removed/replaced: D2.3: 99, 101; D2.2 206
- Register bit naming - D2.3 100: PCS Fault text, “Fault detected” is vague
- PLCA MDIO registers (no longer in draft): D2.2 211, 212, 213, 214; D2.0 276, 277, 278
- Definition of collision detect or collision: D2.3: 103, D2.2: 212, 196, 223, 242, 261
- There is no MDI specification: D2.3 104, 113; D2.2 231, 257
- Description of echo cancellation in receiver of 10BASE-T1L: D2.3 112; D2.2 277, 278
- Desires a single PHY or split 10BASE-T1S PHY types : D2.3 116; D2.2 210
- Delete P2P Half Duplex mode: D2.2 246, 252
- Cl 147 PCS processing of PLCA BEACON & COMMIT:
  - D2.3 117, 118; D2.2 209, 245, 248, 249, 267
- 10BASE-T1L use of TXER: D2.3 120
- Wording of clause 147 mode control: D2.2 241
- CRS & COL timing: D2.2 243, 244; D2.0 602
- RX_DV assertion: D2.0 603
- Descriptive text of PLCA: D2.2 262, 268; D2.0 286
- Use of Carrier Sense primitive: D 2.0 287

IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet to Standards Association (aka Sponsor) ballot

Motion

Approve sending IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet to Standards Association ballot.
Approve CSD documentation in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0079-00-ACSD-802-3cg.pdf>

M: Law S: D'Ambrosia

Y: ??, N: ??, A: ??

Working Group vote

Y: 70, N: 6, A: 41

ME 5.013: IEEE P802.3.2 (IEEE 802.3cf) YANG Data Model Definitions to RevCom

IEEE P802.3.2 (IEEE 802.3cf)
YANG Data Model Definitions to RevCom

Item 1: Date the ballot closed

The 2nd Standards Association (fka Sponsor) recirculation ballot on IEEE P802.3.2 (IEEE 802.3cf) draft D3.2 closed on 2nd February 2019 at 23:59 ET

Item 2: Vote tally

	Initial Draft D3.0			1st Recirculation Draft D3.1			2nd Recirculation Draft D3.2			Req %
	#	%	Status	#	%	Status	#	%	Status	
Abstain	7	8	PASS	7	8	PASS	7	8	PASS	< 30
Dis with comment	5	-	-	3	-	-	2	-	-	-
Dis w/o comment	0	-	-	0	-	-	0	-	-	-
Approve	66	92	PASS	71	95	PASS	73	97	PASS	≥ 75
Ballots returned	78	79	PASS	81	82	PASS	82	83	PASS	≥ 75
Voters	98	-	-	98	-	-	98	-	-	-
Comments	246	-	-	20	-	-	0	-	-	-
Public comments	0	-	-							

IEEE P802.3.2 (IEEE 802.3cf)
YANG Data Model Definitions to RevCom

Comments that support the remaining disapprove votes and WG responses

- 10 unresolved negative comments from 2 commenters

See <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0051-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3-2-ieee-802-3cf-unsatisfied-comment.pdf>

- Preference to use SI units vs custom units (defined in modules): preference tested in Task Force several times, and definition of "units" in RFC6020 <https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6020#page-50> does not mandate the use of SI units, stating that it is "a string that contains a textual definition of the units associated with the type". Comments: i-231, i-232, i-233, i-234, i-235, i-236, i-237, i-158
- Preference for user-defined value versus enumerated values: i-163
- Reference type (dated versus undated): i-120

IEEE P802.3.2 (IEEE 802.3cf) YANG Data Model Definitions to RevCom

Motion

Approve sending IEEE P802.3.2 (IEEE 802.3cf) YANG Data Model Definitions to RevCom.
Approve CSD documentation in <http://www.ieee802.org/3/cf/ec-16-0142-00-ACSD-802-3cf.pdf>.

M: Law S: D'Ambrosia

Y: ??, N: ??, A: ??

Working Group vote

Y: 105, N: 0, A: 1

MI 6.012: IEEE 802.3 Automotive Ethernet beyond 10 Gb/s Electrical PHYs Study Group

IEEE 802.3 Automotive Ethernet beyond 10 Gb/s Electrical PHYs Study Group

Motion

Approve the formation of IEEE 802.3 Automotive Ethernet beyond 10 Gb/s Electrical PHYs study group to consider development of a Project Authorization Request (PAR) and Criteria for Standards Development (CSD) responses for Automotive Ethernet beyond 10 Gb/s Electrical PHYs.

M: Law S: D'Ambrosia

Y: ??, N: ??, A: ??

120 CFI attendees, 73 interested in participating

Working Group vote

Y: 87, N: 0, A: 2

ME 7.021: Submission of IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018 and IEEE Std 802.3cd-2018 to ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 for adoption under the PSDO agreement

Submission of IEEE Std 802.3bt-2018 and IEEE Std 802.3cd-2018 to ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 for adoption under the PSDO agreement

Motion

Approve submission of IEEE 802.3bt-2018 IEEE Standard for Ethernet Amendment 2: Physical Layer and Management Parameters for Power over Ethernet over 4 pairs and IEEE 802.3cd-2018 IEEE Standard for Ethernet - Amendment 3: Media Access Control Parameters for 50 Gb/s and Physical Layers and Management Parameters for 50 Gb/s, 100 Gb/s, and 200 Gb/s Operation for adoption under the PSDO agreement

M: Law S: D'Ambrosia

Y: ??, N: ??, A: ??

Working Group vote

Y: 104, N: 0, A: 3