# The 11ax dominance complaint

The following complaint related to a claim of dominance in IEEE 802.11ax was received in June 2016 from Graham Smith, see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/16/11-16-0784-00-0000-dominance-allegation-in-tgax.doc>.

The recommended actions were supported by the members of the IEEE 802 Executive Committee that is unconflicted on this issue during an meeting held in executive session on 8 November, 2016.

# Recommended mitigation actions for consideration by the EC

The investigating team recommend that

1. The IEEE 802.11WG chair treat the vote of all individuals affiliated with DensiFi SIG members as a single vote in WG and TG motions until such time as the SIG follows the “Best practice” level operation in section 2.1 below or is no longer active. This mitigation action is as specified in the IEEE 802 WG Policy and Procedure document section 3.4.1 item x).
2. Additional guidance information regarding the expectation and requirements of individual participation in standards development be developed and provided to 802.11 participants. The following proposal may serve as an example: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0149-00-00EC-2016-nov-proposed-addition-to-chair-s-guidelines-re-participation.pptx> .

## Special Interest Group guidance

**Best practice**

1. Participation in SIG meetings and decisions is open to all who meet nominal membership requirements. The method and requirements for joining the SIG are easily available to all interested parties.
2. SIG publicly states that individuals affiliated with SIG members are not required to vote or act on behalf of the SIG as a condition of the members participation in the SIG. The SIG reminds its members on a regular basis that IEEE 802 participation is on an individual expert basis.
3. The SIG has a publicly stated policy that no action will be taken by the SIG against a member in response to the voting or participation of individuals in IEEE 802 who are affiliated with a SIG member
4. While individuals affiliated with SIG member companies may vote the same on a particular motion, they are not instructed or pressured to vote in a particular manner.

**Questionable practice**

1. It is not clear how to join a SIG.
2. The SIG is silent on its policies for IEEE 802 participation by individuals affiliated with its members
3. Membership in the SIG is secret and individuals are not allowed to state that their affiliation as a member of the SIG.
4. Individuals associated with the SIG (if that can be determined) always vote the same way on contentious issues.

**Bad practice - should result in IEEE 802 consequences**

1. SIG membership is closed and/or new members cannot obtain voting and/or leadership rights
2. The SIG encourages individuals associated with SIG members to vote/support SIG positions within IEEE 802 regardless of the individual's expert opinion.
3. The SIG has taken punitive action against a member for whom an individual associated with the SIG has voted or acted against a SIG position/decision in IEEE 802.
4. Individuals have received voting instructions for IEEE 802 matters from the SIG or a member of the SIG.

# Personnel involved in report and recommendation

The investigating committee membership is:

Dorothy Stanley

Michael Montemurro

James Gilb (unconflicted IEEE 802 EC member)

IEEE legal staff who participated in the review of the report and recommendations (not present during executive session):

Michael Lindsay

Jonathan Wiggins

In addition to the investigating committee, the following unconflicted IEEE 802 EC members were present at the executive session:

Paul Nikolich

Clint Chaplin

Glens Parsons

David Law

Bob Heile

Richard Kennedy

Subir Das

Tim Godfrey

Kathyrn Bennett from IEEE SA Staff also attended the executive session.