**IEEE Architecture and Enablers for Optimised Radio and**

**Spectrum Resource Usage Working Group**

**Sponsored by SCC41**

**13-15 December 2010  
Fort Lauderdale, FL, USA**

**Minutes**

**Chair: Masayuki Ariyoshi**

**Vice-Chair: Hiroshi Harada**

**Meeting recorder: Vincent Mérat**

**DAY 1, 13 December 2010**

1. **Call to order**

* The meeting was called to order at 8:35 am.
* Chair Ariyoshi welcomed the working group (WG).
* Chair Ariyoshi reminded to the working group the timeline of the two projects: According to PARs, P1900.4a and P1900.4.1 have an initial sponsor ballot date set to 02/11, and a submission to RevCom set to 09/12
* Chair Ariyoshi stated the objectives of the meeting for the two projects:
  + P1900.4a:
    - Resolve comments from the initial sponsor ballot as much as possible
    - Revise the draft standard as D2.0 for recirculation
    - RevCom submission deadlines:
      * 18 Feb for March review
      * 06 May for June review
  + P1900.4.1:
    - Make progress on describing interfaces and protocols, as there are some more work remaining
* There were no proxies or declarations of representation.
* Hitachi requested to be non-voting member for this meeting.
* A roll call was taken, 7 voting entities (Bitmeister, ISB, NEC, NICT, Sony, Tokyo University of Science, Worldpicom) present, qorum achieved.
* *Harada-san,NICT, moved to have Vincent Mérat (NEC) acting as temporary secretary for P1900.4 Dec 13-15 meeting, Watanabe-san, Bitmeister, seconded. Motion passed without opposition.*

1. **Approval of the agenda**

* *Harada-san (NICT) moved to approve the agenda (1900\_4wg-10-0026-01-DOT4-13-15-dec-2010-agenda.xls), Hasegawa-san (Tokyo University of science) seconded. Motion passed without opposition.*

1. **Call for patents**

* A call for patents was made (Templates\_Policies\_Procedures/ IEEE-SA-patent-slideset.pdf)

1. **Approval of the minutes of 6-9 July 2010 WG F2F meeting in Delft**

* Chair Ariyoshi presented an updated version of 1900\_4wg-10-0023-00-WS4a-p1900-4a-july-2010-minutes.doc

1. **P1900.4a - Amendment of Definitions, Use cases, Requirements, Architecture, Information Model - Establishment of Ballot Resolution Committee (BRC) / Sponsor Ballot comment resolution**

* WG acknowledges the Oversight Committee recommendation, the comment resolution will be handled by the entire WG.
* Vincent Mérat, NEC, presented the section of 1900\_4wg-10-0028-00-WS4a-somecommentresolutions.doc proposing a resolution to comment #9
* Stanislav Filin, NICT, requested a straw poll on the following question:  
  As a resolution to comment #9, to select between the following options:
* Option 1: as described in contribution 1900\_4wg-10-0028-00-WS4a
* Option 2: to delete the last sentence in sub-clause E.2.4

Straw poll results: Option 1: 1 (NEC); Option 2: 5 (NICT, Tokyo University of Science, Bitmeister, ISB, Worldpicom); Abstain: 1 (Sony)

The working group recessed at 12:15 am.

**DAY 2, 14 December 2010**

The working group reconvened at 8:30am

1. **P1900.4a - Amendment of Definitions, Use cases, Requirements, Architecture, Information Model - BRC Sponsor Ballot comment resolution (cont’)**

*Harada-san, NICT moved, Sato-san, Sony seconded for modifying the agenda according to 1900\_4wg-10-0026-02-DOT4-13-15-dec-2010-agenda.xls. Motion passed without opposition.*

* Vincent Mérat, NEC, presented the section of 1900\_4wg-10-0028-00-WS4a-somecommentresolutions.doc proposing a resolution to comment #29 and #35

*Harada-san, NICT, moved, Takayoshi-san, Worldpicom, seconded for modifying the agenda according to 1900\_4wg-10-0026-03-DOT4-13-15-dec-2010-agenda.xls. Motion passed without opposition.*

The WG recessed at 5:15pm.

**DAY 3, 15 December 2010**

The working group reconvened at 8:30am

1. **P1900.4a - Amendment of Definitions, Use cases, Requirements, Architecture, Information Model - BRC Sponsor Ballot comment resolution (cont’)**

* Stanislav Filin, NICT, requested a straw poll on the following question:  
  For comments #9, #10, #20, #22, #23 and #38 select between the following two directions:  
  - Option 1: to modify the normative part of the draft  
  - Option 2: to modify the informative part of the draft

Straw poll results: Option 1: 1 vote (NEC); Option 2: 7 votes(NICT, Tokyo University of Science, Bitmeister, ISB, Woldpicom, KDDI, Hitachi) ; Abstain: 1 (Sony)

* *Harada-san, NICT, moved, Hasegawa-san, Tokyo University of Science, seconded, for the resolution of comments #9, #10, #20, #22, #23 and #38, WG shall modify the informative part of the P1900.4a-D1.0 draft.*

Result of the motion: 6 yes (Sony, NICT, Tokyo University of Science, Bitmeister, ISB, Worldpicom). Motion passed.

* Stanislav Filin, NICT, requested a straw poll on the following question:  
  For the resolution of comment #12, select between the following two options:
* Option 1: have spectrum sensing as an optional functionality
* Option 2: keep spectrum sensing as a mandatory functionality

Straw poll results: Option 1: 1 vote (NEC), Option 2: 8 votes (KDDI, Worldpicom, ISB, Bitmeister, TUS, NICT, Sony, Hitachi)

* *Sato-san, Sony, moved, Hasegawa-san, Tokyo University of Science, seconded, for modifying the agenda according to 1900\_4wg-10-0026-04-DOT4-13-15-dec-2010-agenda.xls. Motion passed without opposition.*
* Stanislav Filin, NICT, requested a straw poll on the following question:  
  For the resolution of comments #29 and #35 select between the following two directions:
* Option1: in the information model, provide detailed description of classes to contain information from WS database
* Option 2: keep the information model general and open for future extensions

Straw poll results: Option 1: 0 vote; Option 2: 6 votes (NICT, Tokyo University of Science, Bitmeister, ISB, Worldpicomm, KDDI); abstains: 3 (Hitachi, Sony, NEC)

* Vincent Mérat, NEC, requested a straw poll on the following question:  
  For the resolution of comments #29 and #35 select between the following two directions:
* Option 1: Update the information model section to have a representation of the WS database information in P1900.4a
* Option 2: no update of the information model in P1900.4a-D1.0

Straw poll results: Option 1: 1 vote (NEC); Option 2: 3 votes (Bitmeister, ISB, Worldpicomm); abstain: 5 (KDDI, Tokyo University of Science, NICT, Sony, Hitachi)

* *Sato-san moved, Sony, Watanabe-san, Bitmeister, seconded to modify the agenda according to 1900\_4wg-10-0026-05-DOT4-13-15-dec-2010-agenda.xls.* Motion passed without opposition.
* *Sato-san moved, Watanabe-san seconded, to remove the commenter responses in comment resolution sheet and record the commenter responses to the meeting minutes.* Yes: Sony, NICT, Tokyo University of Science, Bitmeister, ISB, Worldpicom. Motion passed.
* NEC, as the author of comments #4, #11, #13, #14, #24, #25, #26, #27, #28, #30 and #39, agrees with the WG resolution to these comments
* NEC, as the author of comments #9, #10, #20, #22, #23, #29, #35 and #38 disagrees with the WG resolution to these comments

1. **Approval of P1900.4a comment resolution xls sheet**

* *Harada-san (NICT) moved, Hasegawa-san (Tokyo University of Science) seconded, to approve the comment resolution spreadsheet 1900\_4wg-10-0029-04-WS4a-sponsor-ballot-comment-resolution.xls, request technical editor to generate P1900.4a-D2.0 draft document in accordance with resolution details in that comment spreadsheet for sponsor ballot recirculation.* Yes: 5 votes (NICT, Tokyo University of Science, Bitmeister, ISB, Worldpicom); Abstain: 1 (Sony). Motion passed.

1. **P1900.4.1 - Protocols, descriptions of interfaces and SAPs**

Chair Ariyoshi encouraged WG members for active participation and contributions to P1900.4.1.

WG leadership will prepare the current status of P1900.4.1 for next meeting.

1. **Unfinished business**

Approval of the minutes of Delft July 2010 meeting postponed to next meeting.

1. **New business**

* WG secretary:
  + Chair Ariyoshi reminded that the position is currently vacant.
  + Timeframe: 14 days for getting nominees; without election processor, the chair can nominate a temporary secretary for up to 6 months
  + Email discussion will be conducted to identify someone to act as election processor.
* Update of the web page (WG practice information):
  + Chair Ariyoshi mentioned that the WG practices have to be updated (<http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/scc41/4/WG_Practices.pdf>)
  + This item is left opened since this is one of the role of the secretary
* Reconfirm and update of the mailing list:
  + Chair Ariyoshi mentioned that the mailing list shall be updated and the members of the list reconfirmed
  + This item is left opened since this is one of the role of the secretary

1. **Next meetings**

* Next phone conference: February 1st, 8am to 10am EST (2pm-4pm CET; 10-12pm JST)
* Next F2F meeting: March 21-24, Singapore, (collocated with SCC41 plenary meeting)

*Sato-san, Sony, moved, Hasegawa-san, Tokyo University of Science, seconded to adjourn the meeting. Motion passed.*

The working group adjourned at 3:30pm.