

The Journal of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The *Journal of Medical Ethics* was established in 1975, with a multi-disciplinary editorial board, to promote the study of contemporary medico-moral problems. The editorial board has as its aims the encouragement of a high academic standard for this developing subject and the influencing of the quality of both professional and public discussion. The *journal* is published quarterly. The *journal* includes papers on all aspects of medical ethics, analyses ethical concepts and theories and features case conferences and comment on clinical practice. It includes book reviews and details of lectures and symposia on issues raised by the practice of medicine.

Editorial Board

EDITOR:

Raanan Gillon, BA (philosophy), MB, BS, MRCP, Assistant Director, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics; Director, Imperial College Health Service, University of London.

CONSULTING EDITORS:

Sir Douglas Black, formerly, President, Royal College of Physicians.

D W Hamlyn, Professor of Philosophy, Birkbeck College, University of London and Editor of *Mind*.

EDITORIAL BOARD:

Thomas Oppé, Chairman, Professor of Paediatrics, St Mary's Hospital Medical School, London.

K M Boyd, Scottish Director, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, Edinburgh.

Alastair Campbell, Senior Lecturer, Department of Christian Ethics and Practical Theology, University of Edinburgh.

A W Clare, Professor of Psychological Medicine, St Bartholomew's Hospital Medical College, London.

Robin Downie, Professor of Moral Philosophy, Glasgow.

A S Duncan, Emeritus Professor of Medical Education, University of Edinburgh.

C M Fletcher, Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epidemiology, University of London.

Michael F Green, Consultant Physician, The Royal Free Hospital, London.

R M Hare, White's Professor of Moral Philosophy and Fellow of Corpus Christi College, Oxford.

Roger Higgs, General Practitioner, London.

Gerard J Hughes, Department of Philosophy, Heythrop College, London.

Peter Huntingford, Consultant, Obstetrics and Gynaecology, West Kent General Hospital, Maidstone.

Margot Jefferys, Emeritus Professor of Medical Sociology, Bedford College, London.

Ian Kennedy, Professor of Medical Law and Ethics, King's College, London.

David Paterson, Executive Producer, Science and Features, BBC Television, London.

Raymond Plant, Professor of Politics, Southampton.

Sir Desmond Pond, Chief Scientist, Department of Health and Social Security.

Sir Martin Roth, Professor of Psychiatry, Cambridge.

Robert Sells, Director, Renal Transplant Unit, Liverpool Royal Infirmary, Liverpool.

Gerald Stern, Consultant Neurologist, University College Hospital, London.

The Revd J S K Ward, Professor of Moral and Social Theology, King's College, London.

R B Welbourn, Emeritus Professor of Surgical Endocrinology, Royal Postgraduate Medical School, London.

Eric Wilkes, Professor of Community Care and General Practice, University of Sheffield.

Bernard Williams, Provost, King's College, Cambridge.

Jenifer Wilson-Barnett, Senior Lecturer, Department of Nursing Studies, Chelsea College, London.

Edward Shotter, Director of Studies, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, *ex officio*.

TECHNICAL EDITOR:

Ann Lloyd, London.

Submitting manuscripts for publication

Papers submitted for publication should be sent in triplicate to: The Editor, *Journal of Medical Ethics*, Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG. Rejected manuscripts are not returned unless accompanied by a stamped addressed envelope, or international reply coupon. Papers should be in double-spaced typewriting on one side of the paper only. On a separate sheet a brief entry for 'Contributors to this issue' should be supplied, containing the title of the author's present post, degrees and/or professional qualifications, and any other relevant information.

Four copies of the *journal* will be sent to authors free of charge after their papers are published. Offprints of individual papers may be bought from The Publisher, *Journal of Medical Ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

In March 1981 the *JME* adopted a simplified 'Vancouver style' for references: details are given in various issues including December 1983, p 234. They are also available from the editorial office. The full text of the 'Vancouver Agreement' was published in the *British Medical Journal* in 1982; Volume 284; 1725/1814. As the 'Vancouver style' is incompatible with the long established style of references for legal articles, lawyers should use their own standard style, but avoid abbreviations so as to facilitate reference by others. The *journal* is multidisciplinary and papers should be in clear jargon-free English, accessible to any intelligent reader.

Notice to subscribers

The *Journal of Medical Ethics* is published quarterly. The annual subscription rates are £22.00 in the United Kingdom and Irish Republic, and US \$56.00 in all countries overseas. Payment for overseas subscriptions should be made in dollars, ie US \$56.00, or in your national currency based on the prevailing exchange rate to the US dollar of that currency, payable to Professional and Scientific Publications/JME A/c. Orders can also be placed locally with any leading subscription agent or bookseller. (For the convenience of readers in the USA subscription orders, with or without payment, can also be sent to: Professional and Scientific Publications, *British Medical Journal*, Box No. 560B, Kennebunkport, Maine 04046. All enquiries, however, must be addressed to the Publisher in London). All enquiries regarding air mail rates, single copies, advertisements, etc. should be sent to: The Publisher, *Journal of Medical Ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

ISSN 0306-6800

Copyright © 1983 *Journal of Medical Ethics*. All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the *Journal of Medical Ethics*.

Thematic review and index

The thematic review of past issues appears in the June issue each year and an index to each volume appears in the December issue.

- readers: *experiences in family planning and health*. 1982; PIACT Paper Eight.
- (42) Callahan D. Population policy, universal rights and natural sovereignty. In: Callahan D, Clarke P G, eds. *Ethical issues of population aid: culture, economics and international assistance*. New York: Irvington Publishers, 1981.
- (43) Shain R N, Potts M. Need for and acceptability of long-acting steroidal contraception. Presented: Workshop on 'Long-acting contraceptive delivery systems,' May 31–June 3, 1983, New Orleans, LA, sponsored by the Program for Applied Research on Fertility Regulation (in press).
- (44) Baird, Sir Dougald. A fifth freedom. *British medical journal* 1965; 2: 1141.

Contributors to this issue

Thomasine Kushner lectures in Bioethics at the University of Miami School of Medicine, Miami, Florida where she is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Psychiatry.

Malcolm Potts is President of Family Health International, Research Triangle Park, North Carolina.

John M Paxman is Chief of the Population Policy Division of The Pathfinder Fund, Boston, Massachusetts, which works in the developing world with family planning and population programmes.

Alexander Burnfield is Associate Psychiatrist at the Child and Family Guidance Centre, Winchester and a Member of Council, Multiple Sclerosis Society of Great Britain and Northern Ireland.

Vernon Coleman worked as a GP for ten years. He is now a professional writer and author of 21 books which have sold around the world. He is also a journalist, syndicated columnist and regular broadcaster.

B Mahendra is Clinical Lecturer and Honorary Senior Registrar in Psychological Medicine at St Bartholemew's Hospital, London.

Teresa Iglesias is a professional philosopher engaged in the study of medical ethics. She is at present Research Officer at The Linacre Centre, London, a Roman Catholic Institute for the study of the ethics of health care. She is the author of various philosophical papers and of a Study-guide to Euthanasia and Clinical Practice, a forthcoming publication of the Linacre Centre.

G R Dunstan is Professor Emeritus of Moral and Social Theology at the University of London and Honorary Research Fellow at the University of Exeter.

The Hon Mr Justice M D Kirby is Chairman of the Law Reform Commission of Australia.

Case conference editor
Roger Higgs, 81 Brixton Water Lane, London SW2 1PH.

American correspondent
Bernard Towers, Department of Pediatrics, University of California at Los Angeles.

Lectures and symposia

Tuesday 3 April

LMG symposium: ARE HEALTH EDUCATORS THE NEW PURITANS? 5.45 pm Middlesex Hospital

Thursday 5 April

LMG symposium: IS THE WHITE LIE UNETHICAL? 5.45 pm Royal Free Hospital, Hampstead

Tuesday 10 April

LMG illustrated symposium: PREMENSTRUAL TENSION: A CASE OF DIMINISHED RESPONSIBILITY? 5.45 pm St Bartholomew's Hospital

Thursday 12 April

LMG illustrated symposium: PLEADING MADNESS: IS PSYCHIATRY EXPLOITED BY THE CRIMINAL? 6 pm St George's Hospital, Tooting

Tuesday 1 May

LMG symposium: GENERAL PRACTICE: A NINETEENTH CENTURY IDEA WHOSE TIME IS UP? 5.45 pm St Mary's Hospital

LMG: IS PREGNANCY AN ILLNESS? 5.30 pm Duncan Building, Royal Liverpool Hospital

Wednesday 2 May

SMG: ALTERNATIVE MEDICINE. Medical School, Royal Hallamshire Hospital, Sheffield

Thursday 3 May

LMG illustrated symposium: CHILD ABUSE: DO WE CARE ENOUGH? 5.45 pm St Thomas's Hospital

LMG: THE DOCTOR, THE PILL AND THE 15-YEAR-OLD GIRL. 5.30 pm Lecture theatre, Clinical Sciences Building, Leicester Royal Infirmary

Tuesday 8 May

LMG lecture: THE DEATH WISH: EXPERIENCES OF SUICIDE. 5.45 pm University College Hospital

Thursday 10 May

LMG symposium: IS PSYCHOTHERAPY A TREATMENT? 6.30 pm Westminster Hospital

DMG: PHARMACEUTICAL SCANDAL? 5.30 pm Lecture theatre 1, Ninewells Hospital, Dundee

Monday 14 May

NMG: ♂ DOCTOR ♀ MEDICAL ANCILLARY: SEXISM IN THE NHS. 7 pm New Lecture Theatre, Royal Victoria Infirmary, Newcastle

Thursday 17 May

LMG symposium: APPROPRIATE TREATMENT: CAN THE PATIENT MAKE THE FINAL DECISION? 5.45 pm Lecture theatre, Clarendon Wing, Leeds General Infirmary

Tuesday 22 May

LMG: THE MEDICINE OF OLD AGE - HAS EUTHANASIA A PLACE? 5.30 pm Duncan Building, Royal Liverpool Hospital

Wednesday 30 May

SMG: PRIVATE MEDICINE Medical School, Royal Hallamshire Hospital, Sheffield

Wednesday 13 June

SMG: PATIENTS' RIGHTS. Medical School, Royal Hallamshire Hospital, Sheffield

Further information on lectures and symposia

Further details and complete lecture lists are available from the secretaries of the Medical Groups listed on page 56. Please send a stamped, addressed A4 envelope.

Medical groups

ABERDEEN MEDICAL GROUP

Mrs Elaine Foreman, Clinical Research Centre, Cornhill Road, Aberdeen AB9 2ZH

Dr Charles Crichton, c/o The Aberdeen Medical Group, Medical Buildings, Foresterhill, Aberdeen AB9 2ZO

BIRMINGHAM MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Anthony Parsons, Department of Obstetrics, Birmingham Maternity Hospital, Edgbaston, Birmingham B15

BRISTOL MEDICAL GROUP

Fiona Fawthrop, Maybank, Bridge Road, Leighwoods, Bristol BS8 3PB
Steven Webber, 10 Whatley Road, Clifton, Bristol

CAMBRIDGE MEDICAL GROUP

Mr Patrick Doyle, Department of Urology, Addenbrooke's Hospital, Hill's Road, Cambridge

CARDIFF MEDICAL GROUP

Patrick Coyle, 20 Long Oaks Court, Sketty, Swansea SA2 0QH

DUNDEE MEDICAL GROUP

Dr David B Walsh, Consultant in Biochemical Medicine, Ninewells Hospital, Dundee

EDINBURGH MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Philip Cachia, 1 Bristo Square, Edinburgh EH8 9AL

GLASGOW MEDICAL GROUP

Mr Sam Galbraith, Institute of Neurological Sciences, Southern General Hospital, Glasgow

LEEDS MEDICAL GROUP

Stephen Singleton, Department of Medicine, Leeds General Infirmary, Leeds
Robert Wright, Charge Nurse, Accident and Emergency Unit, Leeds General Infirmary, Leeds

LEICESTER MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Liam Donaldson, Department of Community Health, Clinical Sciences Building, Leicester Royal Infirmary, PO Box 65, Leicester LE2 7LX

LIVERPOOL MEDICAL GROUP

Roger Cudmore, Alder Hey Children's Hospital, Eaton Road, Liverpool

LONDON MEDICAL GROUP

Director of Studies, Edward Shotter, Room 68, Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG

MANCHESTER MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Mary Lobjoit, Student Health Centre, Crawford House, Precinct Centre, Oxford Road, Manchester M13 9QS

NEWCASTLE MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Christopher Drinkwater, Department of Family and Community Medicine, The Medical School, Newcastle upon Tyne NE1 7RU

OXFORD MEDICAL FORUM

Adam Zeman, c/o Osler House Club, John Radcliffe Hospital, Headington, Oxford.

SHEFFIELD MEDICAL GROUP

David Watnough, Flat 3, 16 Beech Hill Road, Broomhill, Sheffield S10 2SB.

SOUTHAMPTON MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Barbara Leppard, Department of Dermatology, Graham Road, Royal South Hants Hospital, Southampton SO9 4PE

Society of Apothecaries of London

Diploma in the Philosophy of Medicine

The first year of the two-year Course leading to the examination for the Diploma in the Philosophy of Medicine of the Society of Apothecaries will begin on Saturday, 6th October 1984. The course is addressed primarily to graduates and students of Medicine and lectures will be given on alternate Saturday mornings in London by lecturers in philosophy and medical ethics. Some written work will be required during the first year.

Further information and application forms are available from the Registrar (Philosophy of Medicine Course), The Society of Apothecaries, Black Friars Lane, London EC4V 6EJ.

UNIVERSITY OF
CAMBRIDGE

MEDICO-LEGAL STUDIES: ESSAY PRIZES

Ver Heyden de Lancey Prizes, 1984, of between £500 and £4,000 are offered for substantial essays in medico-legal studies by graduates of the University of Cambridge with a professional qualification in medicine (including dentistry) or in law. Prior approval of subjects is required. Further details from: University Registry, The Old Schools, Cambridge, CB2 1TN.

Mason and McCall Smith: Law and Medical Ethics

1983

By J. K. Mason, CBE, MD, FRCPath., DMJ, Regius Professor of Forensic Medicine University of Edinburgh and R. A. McCall Smith, LLB. Ph.D. Lecturer in Civil Law, University of Edinburgh.

This topical book looking at the ethical and legal problems raised by new medical techniques is the first of its kind to be written jointly by a doctor and a lawyer, and as such it presents a broadly based, balanced study of medical jurisprudence. Medical ethics have in the past generally been approached from the viewpoint of the philosopher or social scientist. In this work Professor Mason and Dr McCall Smith choose a wholly different perspective and present an analysis of ethical concepts based on positive legal principles and court decisions. The book deals with a wide range of potentially difficult situations in which the community, as represented by the law, may come into conflict with the medical profession. **Mason and McCall Smith: Law and Medical Ethics** will prove invaluable to law students taking courses in medical jurisprudence and of compelling interest to all concerned with the complex relationship between the law and medical practice.

Hard cover 0 406 40015 6 £13.50 net
Soft cover 0 406 40016 4 £8.95 net

Order form-----

Please send me:-

Mason and McCall Smith: Law and Medical Ethics (1983)

.....copy/ies hard cover 0 406 40015 6 £13.50 net

.....copy/ies soft cover 0 406 40016 4 £8.95 net

Remittance value £_____ is enclosed/please charge to my/our existing Butterworths account, number _____

Name _____

Address _____

_____ Post Code _____

Post this form to:
Butterworth & Co (Publishers) Ltd, Borough Green,
Sevenoaks, Kent TN15 8PH Tel: 0732 884567

Butterworths

OFFICERS

Director of Studies
Edward Shotter

Scottish Director
Kenneth Boyd

Assistant Directors
~ Brendan Callaghan SJ,
Raanan Gillon, Dorian Haskard,
Richard Nicholson

Treasurer Allan Chappell

Secretaries Maureen Bannatyne,
Susan French

GOVERNING BODY

R B Welbourn Chairman
*Emeritus Professor of Surgical
Endocrinology, Royal Postgraduate
Medical School*

Sir Douglas Black
*Formerly, President, Royal College of
Physicians*

R D Catterall
*Consultant Venereologist, Middlesex
Hospital*

A W Clare
*Professor of Psychological Medicine,
St Bartholemew's Hospital Medical
College, London*

Sir Cyril Clarke
*Past President, Royal College of
Physicians*

Colin Currie
*Senior Lecturer in Geriatric Medicine,
Edinburgh University*

C H Edwards
*former Dean, St Mary's Hospital
Medical School*

C M Fletcher
*Emeritus Professor of Clinical
Epidemiology, University of London*

T W Glenister
*Dean, Charing Cross Hospital
Medical School*

Ian Kennedy
*Professor of Medical Law and Ethics,
King's College, London*

Stephen Lock
Editor of British Medical Journal

T E Oppé
*Professor of Paediatrics, St Mary's
Hospital Medical School, London*

Sir Desmond Pond
*Chief Scientist, Department of Health and
Social Security*

Robert Sells
*Director, Renal Transplant Unit,
Liverpool Royal Infirmary, Liverpool*

Sir John Donne
*Chairman of South East Thames
Regional Health Authority*

The Rt Hon Lord Limerick
*Chairman of Finance and General
Purposes Committee of the
Society for the Study of Medical
Ethics*

Lanil de Silva
President, London Medical Group

Andrew Williams
Vice-President, London Medical Group

Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is an independent non-partisan organisation for the multidisciplinary study of medical moral issues raised by the practice of medicine.

The Society aims to influence the quality of both professional and public discussion of medico-moral questions; to promote the study of medical ethics; to ensure a high academic standard for this developing subject; to encourage a multidisciplinary approach to discussion of the consequences of clinical practice; to stimulate research in specific problems; to remain non-partisan and independent of all interest groups and lobbies.

Since 1963 the London Medical Group, a student group for the study of medico-moral issues raised by the practice of medicine, has arranged a series of lectures and symposia, now twice weekly throughout the academic year, in the 12 London teaching and medical schools.

In 1967 the Edinburgh Medical Group was established with similar aims, and subsequently medical groups have been formed in the majority of the British medical schools – currently Newcastle, Sheffield, Glasgow, Bristol, Birmingham, Manchester, Liverpool, Cardiff, Southampton, Aberdeen, Dundee, Cambridge, Oxford, Leicester and Leeds.

In 1972 junior doctors, who had themselves been associated with the London Medical Group, founded the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics to develop these aims at a postgraduate level.

In 1975 research fellows were appointed by the Edinburgh Medical Group which established, in conjunction with the University of Edinburgh, a research project in medical ethics and education.

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is a registered educational charity and a Company Limited by Guarantee. It relies on voluntary grants and donations and is not supported from government sources.

There is no individual membership of the Society. Those interested in this work are invited to subscribe to the *Journal of medical ethics*. The lectures, symposia and conferences of the associated medical groups, although addressed primarily to medical, nursing and other students, are open to all those professionally interested. Details are published in the *Journal*.

Society for the Study of Medical Ethics
Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG.
Tel: 01-387 8132