

In Education and in Work: The Globalized Community College*

JOHN S. LEVIN

North Carolina State University

ABSTRACT

This is a multiple case study of seven colleges using field methods research to examine institutional life and organizational context. This study determines that community colleges in both Canada and the United States exhibited educational and work behaviors in the 1990s consistent with the globalization process. Education was oriented to the marketplace, and the needs of business and industry received high priority in educational programming. Work within these institutions was valued for and carried out with economic ends: to realize productivity and efficiency.

RÉSUMÉ

Cette étude de cas multiples a été réalisée auprès de sept collèges communautaires et utilise des méthodes de recherche sur le terrain afin d'examiner ces établissements d'enseignement supérieur et leur contexte organisationnel. Cette étude constate que, dans les années 90, les collèges communautaires aux États-Unis et au Canada fonctionnaient dans le domaine éducatif et du travail de manière compatible avec le processus de mondialisation. L'éducation s'orientait vers le marché, et les besoins des entreprises et industries avaient une priorité très élevée

* This research was supported by a grant from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council. The author thanks John Dennison for his advice and support.

dans le cursus éducatif. Le travail dans l'enceinte de ces établissements était valorisé et mis en oeuvre avec cet objectif économique : production et efficacité.

The general argument of this article is that community colleges in both Canada and the United States exhibited educational and work behaviors in the 1990s that can be identified with the globalization process. Educational behaviors include the formal curriculum and instructional practices. Work includes both instruction and administration. Specifically, the argument indicates that work tends to be valued for and carried out with economic ends: to realize productivity and efficiency. These behaviors are referred to as "economizing." Education is most prominently oriented to the marketplace, and the needs of business and industry receive high priority in educational programming. These behaviors are referred to as "the new vocationalism." Although both behaviors were evident in these institutions in the 1980s, they did not become ascendant until the 1990s. As a consequence of the central place of "economizing" and "the new vocationalism," community colleges have become globalized institutions: that is, they adhere to the tenets of "corporatism" (Saul, 1995) and respond to the demands of a global economy and the neo-liberal state (Manzer, 1994).

THE COMMUNITY COLLEGE IN CANADA AND THE UNITED STATES

As relatively new postsecondary institutions in Canada and the United States, community colleges are often viewed as educational institutions placed mid-way between the high school and university. Such a perspective characterizes community colleges first as primarily educational institutions and second as part of a stratified system (Labaree, 1997). Often ignored in these conceptions are the multi-purposes and multi-functions of the institution. Indeed, the variant purposes of the community college are reflected in claims that the institution has an identity crisis (Clowes & Levin, 1989; Dougherty, 1994). It has also been argued that with few traditions and multiple functions, the community college is subject to considerable influence from external pressures

and societal conditions, including governments and economies — local, regional, national, and international (Cohen & Brawer, 1996; Dennison, 1995; Dennison & Levin, 1989; Levin, 1998). Responsiveness to social and economic needs is a hallmark characteristic of community colleges (Dennison & Gallagher, 1986; Dennison & Levin, 1989). Embedded in this responsiveness is a commitment of the institution to serve the underserved (Cohen & Brawer, 1996; Dennison & Gallagher, 1986).

Part of the evolution of the community college is a consequence of institutional responsiveness to changing demographics within the communities served. As illustrated in Table 1, U.S. community colleges have enrolled increasing numbers of minority students from the 1980s to 1999. For example, the Hispanic population of U.S. community colleges comprised 5.8% of the total in 1980 compared to 13.2% in 1999. These changes also reflect immigrant patterns in both the United States and Canada, where societal demographics have altered considerably over the past two decades as can be seen in Tables 2 and 3.

Such demographic changes in the population — changes propelled by immigration, specifically from non-European countries — are driving forces of mission expansion in community colleges, as exemplified by the growth of English language training programs and a more multi-cultural curriculum. Institutional responses to these demographic changes are one mechanism that brings community colleges into a globalizing process (Levin, 2001). However, whereas in the late 1970s and 1980s, responsiveness was characterized as the democratizing intent of community colleges (Cohen & Brawer, 1996; Dennison & Gallagher, 1986; Dennison & Levin, 1989), by the late 1980s and 1990s responsiveness can be viewed as service to markets and consumers rather than to communities and citizens. This shift has become a pattern in community college organizational behaviors and is connected to the globalization process.

GLOBALIZATION AND THE COMMUNITY COLLEGE

Globalization is both a concept and a process. Conceptually, globalization entails the drawing together of disparate locations and the compression of time. As a process, globalization intensifies social and

Table 1
Enrolments, Public Two-Year Colleges by Ethnicity/Race*

	1980	1990	1995	1997	1998	1999
Total	4,328,800	4,996,500	5,277,800	5,360,700	5,246,000	5,339,400
Hispanic	249,800	408,900	540,300	660,200	675,900	704,500
%	5.8%	8.2%	11.2%	12.3%	12.8%	13.2%
Asian	122,500	210,300	308,700	331,100	351,300	344,300
%	2.8%	4.2%	5.8%	6.2%	6.7%	6.4%
Black	437,900	481,400	588,200	616,200	616,700	637,700
%	10.0%	9.6%	11.1%	11.5%	11.8%	11.9%

* U.S. Department of Education, 1999. Categories are those of Department of Education. Also, American Indian student enrollments are basically unchanged at 1% as a percentage of the total from 1980 to 1999.

Table 2
Immigrants to the United States, by Place of Birth, 1961–1990; Total Persons and Percentage of Total Immigration*

Country of Birth	1961–1970	1971–1980	1981–1990	1990–1996
All	3,321,700	4,493,300	7,338,100	7,682,800
Europe	1,238,600 (37.3%)	801,300 (17.8%)	707,600 (9.6%)	988,000 (12.9%)
Asia	445,000 (13.4%)	1,633,800 (36%)	2,817,400 (38.4%)	1,921,800 (25%)
Mexico	443,000 (13.3%)	637,200 (14%)	1,653,300 (22.5%)	2,330,500 (30.3%)
Soviet Union (included in Europe figures)	15,700 (.047%)	43,200 (.096%)	84,000 (.1%)	365,400 (4.8%)

* U.S. Department of Commerce, Statistical Abstract of the United States, (Washington, D.C.: Bureau of the Census, 1998), 11; *Ibid.*, 1996, 11; *Ibid.*, 1995, 11; *Ibid.*, 1995, 11; *Ibid.*, 1994, 11; *Ibid.*, 1993, 11; *Ibid.*, 1992, 11; *Ibid.*, 1991, 10; *Ibid.*, 1990, 10; *Ibid.*, 1989, 10; *Ibid.*, 1989, 10; *Ibid.*, 1987, 11; *Ibid.*, 1986, 86; *Ibid.*, 1985, 86; *Ibid.*, 1981, 126.

political relationships and heightens economic competition. Globalization in the past two decades has been propelled by capital, electronic technology, the movement of people, specifically migration, as well as by government policy and actions.

As a practical term, globalization reflects a perception “that the world is rapidly being moulded into a shared social space by economic and technological forces and that developments in one region of the world can have profound consequences for the life chances of individuals or communities on the other side of the globe” (Held, McGrew, Goldblatt, & Perraton, 1999, p. 1). For Robertson (1992), the cornerstone of globalization is the consciousness of a global society, culture, and economy, as well as global interdependence. Consciousness and interdependency have

Table 3

Immigrants to Canada, by Origin, 1981, 1989, 1991, and 1993; Total Persons and Percentage of Total Immigration*

Country of Origin	1981	1989	1991	1993
All	128,618	192,001	230,834	252,042
Europe	46,295 (36.0%)	52,105 (27.0%)	48,073 (20.8%)	50,050 (19.8%)
Asia	48,830 (38.0%)	93,261 (48.5%)	120,019 (52%)	134,532 (53.4%)

* Leo Driedger, *Multi-Ethnic Canada: Identities and Inequalities* (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1996), 58-59; Employment and Immigration Canada, *Immigration Statistics, 1980, Table 3; Ibid., 1981, Table 3; Statistics Canada, Annual Demographic Statistics, 1993, Catalogue no. 91-213; Ibid., 1998, Catalogue no. 91-213; Ibid., 1993, Catalogue no. 91-213, Table 4.3.*

saliency in knowledge-based enterprises, such as universities and colleges. Held and McGrew (1993) characterize globalization as a multi-dimensional process, noting that distance and time are no longer primary constraints upon social interactions. The process of globalization is evident in several institutional types such as political, military, cultural, economic, and legal. Higher education institutions, because of their cultural, social, and economic roles, are caught up in and affected by globalization as well.

The process of globalization has been connected to numerous alterations in higher education. For example, with emphasis upon international competitiveness, economic globalization is viewed as moving postsecondary institutions into a business-like orientation, with its attendant behaviors of efficiency and productivity. For the management and operations of research universities in both the U.S. and Canada, globalization can be equated with corporatism, with the marketplace playing a more pronounced role than in the past. The placement of higher education institutions in closer proximity to the marketplace, especially in fields connected to techno-science, through corporate partnerships and

associations, is an obvious manifestation of economic globalization. Many consider training and education as synonymous, much like the interchangeability of “knowledge” and “skills” (Aronowitz & Di Fazio, 1994; Currie, 1998; Leslie & Slaughter, 1997; Levin, 1999a; Newson, 1994; Slaughter, 1997; Slaughter & Leslie, 1997).

Globalization literature either implicitly or explicitly suggests a number of organizational behaviors that are influenced by globalizing processes (Appadurai, 1990; Aronowitz & Di Fazio, 1994; Bridges, 1994; Castells, 1993; Castells, 1996; Held et al., 1999; Rifkin, 1995; Teeple, 1995; Waters, 1995). These processes include not only economic globalization but also cultural and social. These behaviors suggest how higher education institutions (their members) respond to global forces as well as to the behaviors of the state in its responses to global forces such as global competitiveness. Behavioral sets or categories include *internationalization, multiculturalism, commodification, homogenization, marketization, re-structuring, labor alterations, productivity and efficiency, and electronic communication and information*. Furthermore, with the role of the state increasing in the affairs and operations of public higher education institutions, the state has become a more noticeable institutional actor, intervening or interfering in organizational actions. This set of behaviors is referred to as *state intervention* (Levin, 2001). These behavioral categories are not only consistent with globalization but also reflect both the impact of global forces upon higher education institutions and the reproduction of the globalization process (Alfred & Carter, 1996; Aronowitz & Di Fazio, 1994; Currie, 1998; Dudley, 1998; Levin, 1999b; Leslie & Slaughter, 1997; Marginson, 1997; Newson, 1994; Ritzer, 1998; Schugurensky & Higgins, 1996; Slaughter, 1997; Slaughter & Leslie, 1997).

Recent scholarship on universities (Clark, 1998; Marginson & Considine, 2000; Slaughter & Leslie, 1997) emphasizes the global political economy in the development of universities internationally. These scholars suggest that global forces are penetrating universities in numerous countries. For Clark (1998), universities are businesses with capitalistic behaviors, including contracting with business and industry to generate revenues for sustaining university mission and activities. There are, thus, “entrepreneurial universities.” Slaughter and Leslie (1997)

investigate “academic capitalism” and argue that research universities are driven by the marketplace, especially through research where faculty become independent entrepreneurs who seek resources. The diminution of state funding gives rise to these behaviors. Marginson and Considine (2000) identify the “enterprise university” where organizational behaviors are directed at generating institutional prestige as well as income. For them, and particularly applicable to Australian universities, research and scholarship are subjected to new systems of competition and performance measures. For all of these scholars, universities are influenced by economic globalization and the institution is conceptualized as a component of the political economy.

Although behaviors and actions at community colleges suggest that economic motives play a significant role in globalization, there is more to globalization than economic behaviors, which include relationships between labor and capital and market forces. Specifically, electronic technologies not only drive globalization, they have also become part of the culture or behavioral patterns of globalization. Immigration, in both its patterns and its sheer numbers, also contributes to globalization, as do ideological shifts and international associations (Appadurai, 1990; Barnett & Cavanagh, 1994; Clegg & Gray, 1996; Dudley, 1998; Friedman, 1999; Lash & Urry, 1994; Waters, 1995).

For community colleges, economics, electronic technology, and immigration patterns serve as dominant globalizing influences. Economics includes the wide area of global production, both government and private sector behaviors in response to a global economy, and fiscal resources available to community colleges. Electronic technology includes computer-based information and production processing technologies, communication technologies such as electronic mail (e-mail), voice mail, and video broadcasting, and software programs from financial accounting packages to content-rich data sources that might be encyclopedic in nature. This technology grouping incorporates production, communication, and knowledge technologies. And finally, immigration patterns include the rationales for immigration, such as political upheaval, the geographical locations of immigration origination, essentially non-European and non-English speaking regions in the 1990s, and

the demographic characteristics of immigrants, including skill and income levels. In addition to these three domains of influence, the roles and actions of governments are significant catalysts and sustainers of organizational change. This is a domain of politics, and government, specifically state and provincial government, is conceived as a principal agent of globalization.

THE STUDY

This is a qualitative multiple case study of community colleges in Canada and the United States, beginning in April 1996 and concluding in November 2000. State, provincial, and national jurisdictions were also investigated to determine both government policies relevant to community colleges and census and demographic statistics pertinent to the patterns of change affecting the case institutions. The qualitative multiple case study design was used because of several factors that made case study appropriate for the research questions and given the comprehensive scope of the topic with its emphasis upon the understanding of organizational life and institutional contexts (Berg; 1995; Burgess, 1984; Hardy, 1996; Mason, 1996).

The choice of sites followed two basic patterns. The first was along the lines of theoretical or purposeful sampling. The second was associated with site access. Purposeful sampling consists of choosing a sample of a population (in this case, community colleges) which fit characteristics of the study's purpose and which may conform to working hypotheses (Mason, 1996). Thus, colleges possessing characteristics that suggested connections to globalization and internationalization were chosen as part of the sample pool. This pool included those colleges with reputations for international projects and programs; those colleges that served diverse populations; and those colleges reputed to be innovative, especially in their use of electronic technology. Sampling also included those colleges that were in jurisdictions where influential policy bodies promoted change along marketplace — both domestic and international — lines; those colleges in geographical areas where there was considerable international activity, in finance, business, industry, and culture; and

those colleges where college officials possessed high profiles in national and international educational forums, or reputations as participants in international education activities.

Additionally, in order to provide cases that were not identical to each other and reflected as a whole a variety of other sites, the sample pool was further refined to include different organizational systems. This selection included, for example: colleges that were part of a multi-college district; colleges that were part of a larger educational system; and colleges that were independent, that is, with their own governing board. Also included were colleges in different political jurisdictions (that is, the U.S. and Canada on one level and different states and provinces on another), and of differing sized institutions, especially because of the widely held view of organizations that size is related to complexity and that, primarily, differences among organizations can be a factor of size differences. Thus, the sample pool was limited conceptually.

The second pattern was associated with site access. From the sample pool of fifteen colleges, those where there was known opportunity for uncontested access were the preferred choices. Ultimately, seven colleges were selected and agreed to participate.

The investigative strategy was to study multiple sites in depth through interviews and informal conversations with college personnel and students, through the review and analysis of institutional documents, and through observations. A group of researchers undertook site visits — from three to five investigators at one site at the same time. The use of a group approach not only assisted in data collection but also in analysis during collection. The multiple viewpoints, the discussion of individual on-site observations, and the confirming and disconfirming of preliminary hunches all contributed to a richer and more accurate understanding of the site (Eisenhardt, 1989).

The study of multiple sites was augmented by the collection and analysis of other related data covering the period of 1989 to 1999. Data sources included federal (Canada and the U.S.) departments, agencies, and commissions, state and provincial government departments and agencies, and individual colleges and college districts. Document data included institutional documents, government documents, and institutional survey

data. Institutional documents were comprised of college calendars, annual reports, collective agreements, policies, institutional reports, program/course schedules, and institutional communications (e.g., memoranda); they also included material such as student newspapers and informational brochures gathered during site visits. Government documents comprised legislation, policies, policy discussion papers, and reports. Data also included regional and local demographic figures related to jurisdiction served by each community college.

In addition to existing public documents, personnel from each college were surveyed and asked to provide quantitative information on budgets, students, programs, and graduate employment placements. This survey was intended to provide a comparative guide for the sites as well as a quantitative measure against which qualitative assessments could be compared within sites. Survey data not only provided for a validity check but also enhanced the investigator's understanding of participant perceptions.

The multi-site investigation was both cross-sectional and longitudinal. The first site visit was on the one hand an extensive examination involving interviews, conversations, and observations, using the concept of organizational change over a five year period as an analytical tool to gain understanding of the present. On the other hand, a second site visit at each college, from between 12 and 18 months subsequent to the first, permitted a longitudinal analysis, enabling the research to address observable change over time, as well as a validity check on initial observations.

At each institution, the following college personnel were interviewed: president or chief executive officer, president's assistant or secretary, chief business officer, chief academic officer, chief student services officer, chief human resources/personnel officer, samples of mid-level administrators (deans, directors), samples of full time faculty and part-time faculty, faculty union president and vice-president, support staff union president, student government leaders, and one to two board members (if available, the board chair was interviewed). Additionally, if a college was part of a multi-college district, the district chancellor and other district officials were interviewed. As well as formally arranged interviews, more informal interviews and conversations were held with administrators, faculty (full-time and part-time), support staff, and students.

At the second set of site visits, only the principal investigator was on site for all visits, with a collaborator present at a majority of sites. During these site visits, the principal investigator and collaborator interviewed faculty and administrators as well as one or two support staff, using follow-up questions derived from the questions and responses in the first round of interviews. Questions addressed changes to missions and structures over a period of 12 to 24 months. The purpose of the second site visits was to explore a limited number of questions in greater depth and to ascertain the extent of institutional change over a one to two-year period, relative to the changes identified in the previous five years (see Levin, 2001 for a more extensive use of interview data including student data).

In all, interviews were conducted over a two-year period at seven colleges in the U.S. and Canada, in the states of California, Hawaii, and Washington and the provinces of Alberta and British Columbia. Approximately 60 individuals were involved in interviews, formally or informally, at each college, for a total of approximately 430 people interviewed, with the majority of formal interviews lasting from 50 minutes to two hours.

Following site investigations, the principal investigator reviewed data collected at each site and subsequently wrote a detailed case study report, combining analyses of observations, documents, and interviews as well as historical and social analyses drawn from secondary sources. The case study write-up aided in making sense of the enormous quantity of data collected during site visits (Eisenhardt, 1989).

The seven colleges in this study were given fictitious names, consistent with the agreement with each college president to maintain relative anonymity of institutions. The colleges were named City Central College (CCC); City South Community College (CSCC); East Shoreline College (ESC); North Mountain College (NMC); Pacific Suburban Community College (PSCC); Rural Valley College (RVC); and Suburban Valley Community College (SVCC).

In order to determine the ways and the extent to which globalizing forces affected and influenced community colleges, several analytical frameworks were employed to understand organizational behaviors. These frameworks were developed from globalization theory discussed

Exhibit 1

Higher Education Globalization Categories

Category	Abbreviation Code
A. Internationalization (students, curriculum, delivery)	[I]
B. Workforce training	[WT]
C. Electronic technology — real time communications	[ET]
D. Labor alterations (e.g., additional work)	[LA]
E. Productivity and efficiency	[P/E]
F. Public sector funding constraints	[LPS]
G. Restructuring	[R]
H. State intervention	[SI]
I. Marketization	[MRK]
J. Partnerships	[PA]
K. External competition	[C]
L. Homogenization	[HOM]
M. Commodification	[COM]

above and from organizational theory (e.g., Cameron, 1984; Di Maggio & Powell, 1983; Gephart, 1996; Levy & Merry, 1986; Mintzberg, 1983; Morgan, 1997), as well as upon recent applications of globalization to institutions (e.g., Appadurai, 1990; Carnoy, Castells, Cohen, & Cardoso, 1993; Castells, 1996; Held et al., 1999; Marginson, 1997; Newson, 1994; Slaughter & Leslie, 1997). Specifically, the frameworks used were: Cameron's (1984) organizational adaptation framework; Levy and Merry's (1986) organizational transformation framework; and a third framework created from the literature relevant to globalization and higher education. This specific analytical framework drawn from higher education literature that addressed globalization was used to categorize all data. Thirteen major behavioral categories were applied to these data (See Exhibit 1). Furthermore, additional literature on globalization (Robertson, 1992; Teeple, 1995; Waters, 1995) served to clarify the analysis of data. The goal of analysis was to identify patterns and themes

Exhibit 2

Categories for Government Policy Document Analysis

Category	Abbreviation Code
Internationalization	[I]
Public sector funding constraints	[LPS]
Private sector interaction	[PR]
Electronic technology	[ET]
Productivity and efficiency	[P/E]
External competition	[C]
Restructuring	[R]
Partnerships	[PA]
Workforce training	[WT]
Marketplace	[MRK]

that helped to explain the organizational effects of globalizing forces and how the globalization process affected college behaviors.

Data were coded according to the categories noted in Exhibit 1, and coding identified recurring patterns and noted relationships between variables (Miles & Huberman, 1994). Furthermore, national and state and provincial policy document data underwent a second iteration of coding and thus another analysis process. First, documents were categorized according to their jurisdiction: Federal Canada; Federal U.S.; state; or province. Second, documents were categorized according to their source: government; government affiliate; non-government body; non-government organization; institution; and private. And, finally, documents were categorized by type, including legislation; policy (formal policy, policy discussion, policy background, policy draft); review of legislation; review of policy; research; and report. Analysis then proceeded to include coding, using a modified pattern of the higher education globalization categories discussed previously, as noted in Exhibit 2 (Categories for Government Policy Document Analysis).

After pattern coding, content analysis of the extracted data included counting of coded data by category and the identification and explanation

of specific themes. Counting ensured that there was a substantial quantity of data for the established patterns. Thematic analysis led to a clearer understanding of the meaning of the patterns.

Observational data were analyzed both during site visits at each college and following site visits for all colleges, and treated in two distinct ways. On the one hand, observational data served as evidence of the presence of patterns related to concepts consistent with those drawn from globalization literature and theory. On the other hand, observational data were coded using categories derived from globalization theory and used in conjunction with other types of data, such as data from interviews.

Finally, interview and journal data were coded thematically, relying upon patterns identified as those connected to college mission and college operations, such as mission alteration that favors higher level programming in instruction and operational changes to institutional decision-making. These themes and patterns were then used to explain alterations to institutional mission and operations.

ECONOMIZING

Where institutional decisions are grounded on economic values and justified as efficient or productive, or both, the term “economizing” was used for these decisions and the resultant behaviors. “Economizing” is a community college behavior that reflects the impact of the globalization process upon institutions: in these institutions, state and provincial governments serve as intermediaries, directing public institutions to model private sector behaviors and to view communities as a marketplace.

Policy documents from the various jurisdictions clearly indicate the pressures from government upon institutions to achieve greater productivity in meeting student and employer demands and improving operational efficiencies in order to reduce the financial burdens of the state. Table 4 displays the dominant intentions expressed in policy documents from each jurisdiction that pertain to community colleges. Federal Canadian policy, for example, emphasizes the requirement to reduce unemployment and increase job training that will be relevant for a global marketplace. Alberta policy during the 1990s aimed at cutting

Table 4
Policy Documents' Intentions

Jurisdiction	Explicit Intent
Federal Canada	Reduce unemployment nationally and train for marketplace.
Alberta	Offer less expensive education, provide greater responsiveness to business and industry, and achieve greater productivity of institutions, with less reliance upon public funds.
British Columbia	Provide workforce training to meet the needs of business and industry and assist province in global and economic competitiveness.
Federal U.S.	Meet national economic needs for global competitiveness through workforce training.
California	Achieve economic competitiveness for business and industry through workforce training and increased institutional productivity to assist state economy.
Hawaii	Assist economic performance of state by increasing productivity and efficiency and train a globally competitive workforce.
Washington	Improve economic condition of the state within a globally competitive environment by training and retraining the workforce.

educational costs while requiring colleges to become more responsive to the training needs of business and industry. British Columbia policy stressed workforce training both to meet the requirements of business and industry and to assist the province generally in global economic competitiveness. A sample of policy documents from the Canadian jurisdictions is displayed in Exhibit 3.

Interview data indicate that institutional behaviors during the 1990s were directed at "economizing" through *re-structuring*, *labor alterations*, *productivity and efficiency* measures, and the use of *electronic*

Exhibit 3

Canadian Policy Documents

Alberta

Province of Alberta. (1994). *New directions for adult learning in Alberta: Adult learning access through innovation*. Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development.

Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development. (1995). *Vision for change: A concept paper for the development of a virtual learning system*. Alberta Advanced Education and Career Development.

Alberta Advanced Educational and Career Development. (1994). *Business Plan*. Advanced Education and Career Development.

Alberta Advanced Educational and Career Development. (1996). *Business Plan*. Advanced Education and Career Development.

British Columbia

British Columbia Labour Force Development Board. (1995). *Training for what?* Ministry of Skills, Training, and Labour.

Government of British Columbia. (1994). *College and Institute Amendment Act*. Victoria, BC: Queen's Printer.

Ministry of Education, Skills and Training. (1996). *Charting a new course*. Victoria, BC: Ministry of Education, Skills and Training.

Canada

Minister of Human Resource Development, Lloyd Axworthy. (1995). *Federal and provincial support to post secondary education in Canada: A report to parliament 1993-94*. Ottawa, ON: Minister of Supply and Services Canada.

Couillard, Robert. (1993). *The Adult Education Training Survey*. Employment and Immigration Canada. Statistics Canada.

Human Resource Development Canada. (1994). *Community economic development and you*. Ottawa, ON: Minister of Supply and Services Canada.

Minister of Supply Services. (1995). *A 21st century employment system for Canada*.

communication and information, as well as revenue generation through *internationalization, commodification, and marketization*. At Pacific Suburban Community College in Hawaii, David, a department chair, speculated about the college's altered future:

We're going to increasingly be tasked to pay our own way. Raising tuition is inevitable. We have become more entrepreneurial and [have] moved closer to the market. Rising costs will squeeze the college. The answer [to rising costs] is in changing operations to become more effective.

At Suburban Valley Community College, in California, Douglas, a faculty union official, noted that administrative decisions were motivated by finances: "money drives." But "there is no money for faculty and staff salaries," as a result of economic recession in the state in the early 1990s. These fiscal decisions and administrative behaviors demonstrated "how faculty are no longer necessary." Douglas' view was supported by another faculty leader, Henry. He observed further that labor relations and actual or threatened alterations to faculty work dominated organizational life in the middle of the decade to the extent that the college lost its "collegial" atmosphere. A college counselor at City Center College in British Columbia, Janice, explained that "economic survival is the real mission" of the college as a consequence of "government cutbacks":

We are trying to sell the place: [this is] almost exploitative behavior and the opposite of student centered. There is false advertising. There are no computers but we do have an Internet address logo. We make students pay for placement tests and we make them take prerequisite courses. The commitment to our mission and goals' statement is not borne out by reality.

For Janice, the education of students as an institutional goal was superseded by financial behaviors. At another Canadian college, Rural Valley College in British Columbia, the Dean of Continuing Education outlined the dramatic alterations that have affected her college:

There have been changes in funding. There have been changes in federal and provincial policy. The demographics of the local communities have changed and the expectations

of the communities have increased... The mobility of the learner is shifting: they have jobs; they move; they have another job; they train; they have night classes; and they have children... there's been a blurring of the public and private sectors: the private... is getting public money and the public is entrepreneurial.

At East Shoreline College, in British Columbia, which has a history of market-oriented behaviors going back to the 1980s, the college president noted that personnel were "stretched" to their limits. Robert, a senate executive member, observed that East Shoreline was "a free-market organization: we offer what is marketable." In the 1990s, he noted, "economic expediency" and emphasis upon applied education within the provincial system had altered the "value placed upon education." East Shoreline nonetheless increased its emphasis upon a market orientation and the acquisition of resources became a central feature of institutional life:

There is more pressure to be entrepreneurial. There is competition for offshore revenues.

Doreen, a nursing faculty member at East Shoreline, noted that, "in trying to deal with economic constraints, the college has taken on an entrepreneurial role, and competition adds to severe stress within the institution.

At North Mountain College in Alberta, Alan, the college president, explains his rationale for marketplace behaviors at his institution:

In the college, there are higher levels of work; there are higher levels of stress. We are confronted with a less supportive and more hostile government. We are being challenged by government, by the private sector, by taxpayers generally. People at North Mountain are wondering whether their work is really valued or appreciated or understood. We are facing rising levels of expectation and demands... Education institutions: these are knowledge industries, companies... In this highly competitive environment, you feel enormous pressure to be adroit, nimble, flexible, and to respond to rapidly shifting corporate, government, student demands and needs. It takes years. We just had to operate in a far more businesslike way: [this has] become a pattern now.

For Alan, North Mountain College had little choice but to alter the institution to fit the expectations of “government,” the “private sector,” and “taxpayers.” As a consequence, the college became a different institution over the decade, operating less like an academic institution and more like a business. Faculty reflected this trend at North Mountain College. Doreen, a business instructor, observed these alterations in a less than flattering manner and described how economic goals altered organizational behaviors:

Power is centralized at the top. The president and vice-president are control freaks. [The college is] bureaucratic, dictatorial, stultifying.

Another faculty member suggested that organizational goals were shifting: “we are to a certain extent abandoning our community, looking for opportunity in a global marketplace.” An English instructor, Randall, asserted that “the big change at the college is the orientation toward business and the business model of education.” Finally, Constance, a business instructor, referred to faculty as “volume oriented worker bees,” indicating the effects of economic objectives:

Stress is placed upon instructors. They are not supported and have no time. There is no release time for curriculum development. Faculty are burned out with classroom size increased.

Observational data also suggest that institutional behaviors during the 1990s were directed at “economizing.” Field notes from a meeting with the Dean of Continuing Education at Rural Valley College in British Columbia indicate that this administrator sees the diminution of government funding for the public sector as a key government policy that has set the course for public institutions to engage in competition for resources. That is, funding is a vehicle of policy.

She [the Dean] is confident that provincial and federal policies are directing all colleges in the province. She acknowledges the privatization of post-secondary education and also recognizes the inadequacies of policies and practices in encouraging high level job training... She says that 30% of the revenues at the college are non-government and that in five years 50% will be non-government. (Field notes, May 9, 1997)

Observations from meetings with other Rural Valley College members including faculty and administrators indicate that they are preoccupied with the provincial government and its funding behaviors, but not aware of policy shifts and impending long-term alterations to post-secondary education. Rural Valley College is an institution caught up in its concerns for funding. For example, the college pursues additional provincial government dollars through the addition of more and more students, yet organizational members are unaware of the implications for institutional mission given an expanding program base and an enlarging budget — one that grew 200% over the period of 1990–1991 to 1995–1996, a 40% a year growth.

Although college members at the seven institutions are cognizant of the financial stresses upon their institution, they do not acknowledge, with few exceptions, the larger arena of globalization, such as global competition and transformations in production following technological innovation, particularly increasing computerization in the workplace. These innovations lead not only to the redesign and reorganization of the workplace but also to changes in the nature of work (Aronowitz & Di Fazio, 1994; Rifkin, 1995; Teeple, 1995). Governments transform themselves and their institutions to address the needs of business and industry (Saul, 1994) and the means of transformation are based upon efficiency (Taylor, 1991). Thus, decisions in community colleges are grounded on economic values and justified as efficient or productive, or both, and reflected in, if not precipitated by, provincial, state, and national objectives for a competitive, international economy.

THE NEW VOCATIONALISM

The process of globalizing education considers education as an adjunct of the managerial economy and treats education as instrumental, altering it from a knowledge to an acquisition base. “The new vocationalism” in the community college orients curriculum and instruction to a global economy. In this economy, global capital dominates, production is increasingly automated, more rapid, and efficient, and the labor force

has been restructured and re-stratified (Bridges, 1994; Carnoy et al., 1993; Friedman, 1999; Held et al., 1999; Teeple, 1995).

At North Mountain College in Alberta, Mary, an English instructor, lamented the shift of institutional emphasis to a global economy:

There is a heavier focus upon entrepreneurship and money making. We have lost the focus on the soulful part of education. Jobs drive students who want technical training and the college responds. These influence the teaching of writing and [writing becomes] applied communications. The social function is being lost.

At North Mountain College, “the new vocationalism” is exemplified by and is contained within the programming of the applied baccalaureate degree (referred to as applied degrees) established by the Alberta government for colleges and technical institutes in the mid-1990s. According to the legislation, “applied degree programs must... be designed with the object of preparing students for careers” (Province of Alberta, 2001). The Minister of Advanced Education and Career Development in Alberta noted in October of 1998 that “[t]he main purpose of applied degrees are [sic] to prepare Albertans for work” (Government of Alberta, 1998). The views of college members at North Mountain reflected this intent. The college’s vice-president noted that “the applied degree initiative was very important... [these programs] were driven by workplace and students’ needs to be in a competitive situation...” A department chair indicated that the college’s “mission has changed to include applied degree programming.” Another instructor expanded on this mission alteration:

[Programming is] shifting upward and away from the low end of the mission. I don’t like seeing the college movement away from reaching the under-prepared, remedial, and working class students. (Economics faculty, North Mountain College)

A senior administrator described the new vocationalism as a change in the college from “the liberal arts core to having more of a focus on technology and entrepreneurship.” Faculty described these new applied degree programs as responses to local business and industry demands for a competitive workforce, and they indicated that the curriculum was

moving not only towards the increased use of technology but also towards an outcomes-based focus. According to several administrators, the curriculum is “more training focused” with a “more practical orientation.” They referred as well to the “global skills requirement” in the curriculum. The college president referred to the altered curriculum as the inclusion of “new economy skills.”

Observations at North Mountain College — during the second site visit to the institution — highlight the change to both college curricula and to college mission.

One major change is the establishment of two degree programs and the development of five other degree programs. Justified and formed around critical concepts of employment, [such as] competitive skills, knowledge economy, and market-sensitive, these four-year programs capture considerable institutional energy and serve as beacons of the new mission — positioning the college as a four-year institution, with its focus upon employment. No longer educating generalists, such as Arts and Sciences’ baccalaureates, the college is beginning to educate and prepare specialists — small business and entrepreneurship, journalism, public relations, and technical writing. Future proposals include industrial ecology, policy studies, applied justice studies, interior design, and child, family, and community studies. (Field notes, October 7, 1998)

The claim of “learner-centered” education (Barr & Tagg, 1995; Dolence & Norris, 1995; O’Banion, 1997) can be seen at North Mountain College as addressing the needs of business and industry and conforming to government policy for economic development. “Learner-centered” means more practical education, practical for employers and thus for students to obtain employment. North Mountain’s president at a public address on September 19, 1997 noted that there was a list of skills required for the new economy and that “retraining is lifelong learning.” Two days earlier, a chief executive officer of an oil company and member of the college’s foundation spoke to an assembly of North Mountain College members promoting organizational change so that “education could be more like a business” and adapt to “an evolving marketplace.” The applied degrees represent a response to the marketplace and contain

vocationally-oriented curricula: preparing students for work, for careers in a competitive marketplace, and strengthening a managerial economy.

At Pacific Suburban Community College in the State of Hawaii, college programming adjusted to rapidly changing state economic conditions and to business needs locally and internationally. Observations from two site visits indicated that education at Pacific Suburban has become commodified so that college actions serve what has been termed the managerial economy (Marginson & Considine, 2000).

Commodification looms: efforts to make education products marketable, such as distance education, [a] special Emergency Medical program; looking at Asian markets; pilot testing distance education programs; and on-line programs — microbiology, emergency medical technician. Moving closer to [the] marketplace to secure business support. New Japanese language courses for business, Japanese [courses for] credit... New type of ESL [English as a second language], for those who want English as another language... to market in China. (Field notes, March 17, 1998)

At Pacific Suburban Community College, remedial programming and courses were shifted from credit to non-credit status and expected to be self-supporting. At the same time, the college increased its focus and energies on the local as well as the Pacific Rim market. Furthermore, the college began to develop advanced training programs, notably in Culinary Arts, with the goal of establishing a four-year degree program on campus. A mid-level administrator described these developments as “looking for new markets.” A college counselor added that the college “was always looking for new markets.” A department chair noted that there were efforts to “maintain the core curriculum,” because the college continued to add new programs as the college “redefines [its] educational population.” “The trick is to keep our eye on curriculum,” he said speculatively. On the minds of most, if not all, organizational members interviewed was the state’s economy, which was suffering because of a weakening Asian economy and thus less tourism, and the continuation of threats from the state government of public sector budget cuts. The college’s mission expanded: doing more programming, reaching international students, increasing

distance education yet preserving a multi-cultural focus. As well, however, programming emphasis shifted to address marketplace needs and to meet demands for programs and courses that bring financial gain, including higher-level offerings for offshore Asian markets.

The new vocationalism not only shapes curriculum to employment and careers for students, but also shapes institutional responsiveness to the marketplace — to revenue sources and their requirements for training. The new vocationalism expands the community college's curriculum but at the same time it stratifies programs. Programs are added in high demand employment areas, such as in business and computer-related subjects; programs are re-structured or even discarded in areas where employment needs are minimal or where there is no obvious connection to employment, such as in adult basic and remedial education. At North Mountain College in Canada, English as a second language programming, a non-credit area, was a profit center; at Pacific Suburban Community College in Hawaii, remedial education, removed from the credit area to the non-credit one, was expected to be self-supporting. In both cases, tuition for these programs rose either to cover costs or to generate a profit; and in both cases those who could not afford these costs went elsewhere or nowhere.

Seen through this perspective, community colleges have altered their public role, changing from serving communities to serving a managerial economy. Their comprehensive curriculum has become skewed to the extent that educational goals are synonymous with those of private business. Former goals including personal development of students and the provision of general education are re-defined in economic terms, with skills and employment substituting for learning and knowledge as outcomes.

CONCLUSIONS: THE GLOBALIZED COMMUNITY COLLEGE

Globalization is not a one-way process: interpretations and responses of organizational members, and especially key decision-makers, are influential in how globalization affects an organization. Institutional members, including faculty, board members, administrators,

and professional and support staff, contribute to globalization and thus to the alteration of their institution. Organizational ideology that values competition, the marketplace, and the instrumentality of education favors and pursues the reduction of goods, services, people, and organizational relationships to an economic value. In higher education, this ideology underlies the treatment of students as consumers and citizens as economic entities (Levin, 2001; Marginson, 1997; Ritzer, 1998). Globalization understood this way has played a significant role in the alteration of the community college to a globalized institution. In this sense, we can understand the community college as a conflicted institution, suspended within traditional values of responsiveness and serving the under-served. This conflict is captured in observations at Suburban Valley Community College in California.

Suburban Valley Community College reflects several of the characteristics and conditions confronting American [and Canadian] society in a global environment. They value and reward achievement, responding to competition but they also feel the need (guilt) to serve the under-served: capitalistic on the one hand... social democrats on the other... They run fast, respond, adopt the latest fashion, [and] want to stay ahead. They want to extol their way, but change in order to accommodate the ways of others...

The mission is changing, moving toward accommodating new learners... They are also addressing short-term training... and they are moving increasingly to distance education, especially on-line and Web-based delivery. Changing demographics, changing industry needs, federal welfare policy, more work... for students and less school, new immigrants, and new technologies are driving forces, as is the state [and provincial] funding system which promotes enrolment growth as the only way to generate additional money. (Field notes, May 22, 1998)

Observations of North Mountain College in Alberta provide a perspective on an institution that has moved beyond traditional conceptions of the community college; yet, not all organizational members embrace the new ideology.

North Mountain College is a post-modern globalizing institution in progress, showing the tensions between a solid comprehensive institution and a market-oriented business. There is a rise in training for the marketplace, but not the vocationalism of the past: no mechanical or industrial programs. There is adaptation to a competitive environment, especially a local business ethos. North Mountain seeks to re-define and re-identify itself... But... the managers and their strategies are in a different place than and not necessarily consistent with the views and the behaviors of the rest of the institution. (Field notes, September 1997)

Traditionally conceived, community colleges are responsive, adaptable institutions that meet community needs (Cohen & Brawer, 1996; Dennison & Gallagher, 1986; Dennison & Levin, 1989). Notwithstanding this traditional conception of the institution, the community has become re-defined as part of a managerial economy, which is promulgated by global capital, by large corporations, and supported by governments at the federal, provincial, and state levels (Barnet & Cavanagh, 1994; Lash & Urry, 1994; Schugurensky & Higgins, 1996; Teeple, 1995). Local business and industry profit by the community college's responsiveness: economic development is fostered through the training of a workforce and the re-training of workers. In responding to this community and to pressures of government, community colleges have fulfilled part of their mission but perhaps at the expense of their social and educational function of serving the under-served. In both education and work, community colleges exhibit characteristics of globalizing behaviors as they pursue "the new vocationalism" in education and "economize" in work. ❖

References

- Alfred, R., & Carter, P. (1996). Inside track to the future. *Community College Journal, February/March, 66*(4), 10–19.
- Appadurai, A. (1990). Disjunctures and difference in the global cultural economy. In M. Featherstone, (Ed.), *Global culture: Nationalism, globalization and modernity* (pp. 295–310). Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.

Aronowitz, S., & Di Fazio, W. (1994). *The jobless future: Sci-tech and the dogma of work*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.

Barnet, R., & Cavanagh, J. (1994). *Global dreams: Imperial corporations and the new world order*. New York, NY: Simon & Schuster.

Barr, R., & Tagg, J. (1995). From teaching to learning: A new paradigm for undergraduate education. *Change (November/December)*, 13–25.

Berg, B. (1995). *Qualitative research methods for the social sciences*. Boston, MA: Allyn and Bacon.

Bridges, W. (1994). *Job shift*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company.

Burgess, R. (1984). *In the field: An introduction to field research*. London: George Allen and Unwin.

Cameron, K. (1984). Organizational adaptation and higher education. *The Journal of Higher Education*, 55(2), 122–144.

Carnoy, M., Castells, M., Cohen, S., & Cardoso, F. (1993). *The new global economy in the information age*. University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University.

Castells, M. (1993). The informational economy and the new international division of labor. In M. Carnoy, M. Castells, M. Cohen, & F. Cardosa (Eds.), *The new global economy in the information age* (pp. 15–43). University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University..

Castells, M. (1996). *The rise of the network society*. Cambridge, MA: Blackwell Publishers.

Clark, B. (1998). *Creating entrepreneurial universities: Organisational pathways of transformation*. Oxford: Pergamon.

Clegg, S., & Gray, J. (1996). Metaphors of globalization. In D. Boje, R. Gephart, & T. Thatchenkery (Eds.), *Postmodern management and organization* (pp. 293–307). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Clowes, D. & Levin, B. (1989). Community, technical and junior colleges: Are they leaving higher education? *The Journal of Higher Education*, 60(3), 349–355.

Cohen, A., & Brawer, F. (1996). *The American community college*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Currie, J. (1998). Introduction. In J. Currie & J. Newson (Eds.), *Universities and globalization* (pp. 1–13). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Dennison, J. (1995). *Challenge and opportunity*. Vancouver, BC: The University of British Columbia Press.

Dennison, J., & Gallagher, P. (1986). *Canada's community colleges*. Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press.

Dennison, J., & Levin, J. (1989). *Canada's community college in the nineteen eighties*. Willowdale, ON: Association of Canadian Community Colleges.

DiMaggio, P., & Powell, W. (1983). The iron cage revisited: Institutional isomorphism and collective rationality in organizational fields. *American Sociological Review*, 48, 147–160.

Dolence, M., & Norris, D. (1995). *Transforming higher education: A vision for learning in the 21st century*. Ann Arbor, MI: Society for College and University Planning.

Dougherty, K. (1994). *The contradictory college*. Albany, NY: State University of New York.

Dudley, J. (1998). Globalization and education policy in Australia. In J. Currie & J. Newson (Eds.), *Universities and globalization* (pp. 21–43). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Eisenhardt, K. (1989). Building theories from case study research. *Academy of Management Review*, 14(4), 532–550.

Friedman, T. (1999). *The Lexus and the olive tree*. New York, NY: Farrar, Straus Giroux.

Gephart, Jr., R. (1996). Management social issues and the postmodern era. In D. Boje, R. Gephart, & T. Thatchenkery (Eds.), *Postmodern management and organization* (pp. 21–44). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Productions.

Government of Alberta. (1998). *Applied degrees to continue in post-secondary system*. News Release, October 2.

Hardy, C. (1996). *The politics of collegiality: Retrenchment strategies in Canadian universities*. Buffalo, NY: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Held, D., & McGrew, A. (1993). Globalization and the liberal democratic state. *Government and opposition: The International Journal of Comparative Politics*, 23(2): 261–288.

Held, D., McGrew, A., Goldblatt, D., & Perraton, J. (1999). *Global transformations*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Labaree, D. (1997). *How to succeed in school without really learning*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Lash, S., & Urry, J. (1994). *Economies of signs and space*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Leslie, L., & Slaughter, S. (1997). The development and current status of market mechanisms in United States postsecondary education. *Higher Education Policy*, 10(March/April), 238–252.

Levin, J. (1998). Organizational change and the community college. In J. Levin (Ed.), *A ripple or a sea change? Organizational change in the community college* (pp. 1–4). *New Directions for Community Colleges*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Levin, J. (1999a). *Mission and structure: The community college in a global context*. Report for the Social Sciences and Humanities Council of Canada. Tucson, AZ: Center for the Study of Higher Education.

Levin, J. (1999b). Missions and structures: Bringing clarity to perceptions about globalization and higher education in Canada. *Higher Education*, 37(4), 377–399.

Levin, J. (2001). *Globalizing the community college: Strategies for change in the twenty-first century*. New York, NY: Palgrave.

Levy, A., & Merry, U. (1986). *Organizational transformation: Approaches, strategies, and theories*. New York, NY: Praeger.

McGrath, D., & Spear, M. (1991). *The academic crisis of the community college*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

Manzer, R. (1994). *Public schools and political ideas: Canadian educational policy in historical perspective*. Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Marginson, S. (1997). *Educating Australia: Government, economy and citizen since 1960*. Melbourne: Cambridge University Press.

Marginson S., & Considine, M. (2000). *The enterprise university: Power, governance and reinvention in Australia*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.

Mason, J. (1996). *Qualitative researching*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Miles, M., & Huberman, A. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Mintzberg, H. (1983). *Power in and around organizations*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, Inc.

Morgan, G. (1997). *Images of organization*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Newson, J. (1994). *NAFTA and higher education in Canada*. Unpublished paper, York University, Toronto, ON.

- O'Banion, T. (1997). *The learning college for the 21st century*. Phoenix, AZ.: American Council on Education and the Oryx Press.
- Province of Alberta. (2001). *Colleges Act. Chapter C-19*. Edmonton, AB:
- Levy, A. & Merry, U. (1986).
- Rifkin, J. (1995). *The end of work*. New York, NY: G.P. Putnam's Sons.
- Ritzer, G. (1998). *The McDonaldization thesis: Explorations and extensions*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Robertson, R. (1992). *Globalization: Social theory and global culture*. London: Sage Publications.
- Saul, J. (1995). *The unconscious civilization*. Concord, ON: House of Anansi Press.
- Schugurensky, D., & Higgins, K. (1996). From aid to trade: New trends in international education in Canada. In R. Raby & N. Tarrow (Eds.), *Dimensions of the community college: International, intercultural, and multicultural* (pp. 53–78). New York, NY: Garland Publishing.
- Slaughter, S. (1997). *Who gets what and why in higher education? Federal policy and supply-side institutional resource allocation*. Presidential address, Association for the Study of Higher Education annual meeting, Memphis, TN.
- Slaughter, S., & Leslie, L. (1997). *Academic capitalism, politics, policies, and the entrepreneurial university*. Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Taylor, C. (1991). *The ethics of authenticity*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Teeple, G. (1995). *Globalization and the decline of social reform*. New Jersey: Humanities Press.
- Waters, M. (1995). *Globalization*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Yin, R. (1984). *Case study research*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.