How Do We Teach Social Justice? A Cross-Disciplinary Synthesis of Social Justice Andragogy

Bagmi Das
The George Washington University
U. S. A.

Isabel Farrell
Wake Forest University
U. S. A.

Kriti Vashisht
McNeese State University
U. S. A.

Alexandra Gantt-Howrey
New Mexico State University
U. S. A.

Elisabeth Simpson
West Virginia University
U. S. A.

Adrianne Johnson
Wright State University
U. S. A.

ABSTRACT: Social justice is a critical component of many of the helping disciplines. Similar goals govern these different disciplines, which are reflected in the scholarship of their professional training. However, the crossover in scholarship is limited. This review of social justice andragogy literature from various fields in the United States creates a conversation among these helping disciplines so that they may be able to learn from each other. From these separate realms of scholarship, the authors have derived terms and recommendations of what these disciplines may learn from one another through their shared obstacles and through processing of their work.

KEYWORDS: Social justice, education, training, andragogy, helping professions

Methods
Purpose of this Article
Social Justice Andragogy within Select Helping Professions
Recommendations for Implementing a Social Justice Curriculum
Considerations and Future Research

Social justice, the practice of increasing equity and justice within the community, is a political buzzword, motivation for many community-based policies, and a critical component of many of the helping professions. As a concept, social justice aims to dismantle systemic injustice, such as racism and classism, in an effort to reduce disparities across populations (Garland & Batty, 2021). Thus, social justice movements have been at the forefront of societal rhetoric. Students around the world have witnessed historical social justice movements such as Black Lives Matter, sex and gender justice movements including LGBTQ+ rights and #Metoo, and climate justice. In addition, COVID 19 has disproportionately affected Black, Indigenous, and People of Color (BIPOC) communities (Center for Disease Control and Prevention, 2020). Therefore, conversations around social justice will happen in the classroom and educators will be faced with the need for the inclusion of social justice education, regardless of andragogical approaches.

Counselors for Social Justice, a division of the American Counseling Association (ACA), commissioned a taskforce in 2019 to determine a social justice curriculum that could be implemented in communities across the United States. The intention of this taskforce was to broaden the counseling profession's scope of social justice advocacy and equip local communities with the awareness and skills to implement social justice actions in their own communities. To better understand social justice andragogy, as defined as the science of teaching adult learners about issues and action surrounding social justice, the taskforce comprised of counselors and counselor educators embarked on an effort to understand social justice andragogy in the United States. The team focused on andragogy as separate from pedagogy, as adult learners possess a more solidified set of beliefs and values about the world that must be unlearned in the andragogy process (Suleiman, 2014).

This effort required a review of literature outside the counseling profession. Helping professions electing to espouse social justice must find ways to define social justice and integrate it into the education and training of their professionals. Each helping profession has created their own culture of discipline and scholarship regarding social justice through their lens.

Methods

The taskforce met and agreed that it is critical to observe disciplines which have championed significant contribution to the conversation of social justice in the US; they, therefore, determined a breadth of professions to review. These

professions included nursing, counseling psychology, education, social work, and public health. Multidisciplinary, health sciences, and education discipline-specific databases, particularly JSTOR, ProQuest Sciences, PubMed, PsychINFO, Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC), and Google Scholar were reviewed. The search was refined by utilizing appropriate search terms: 'social justice', 'advocacy', and 'pedagogy'. Further search terms, including 'education,' 'andragogy,' 'higher education,' 'public health,' 'counseling,' 'nursing,' and 'social work', were subsequently combined with 'social justice', 'advocacy', and 'pedagogy' in order to limit the results to papers relevant to the review. Additionally, graduate professional organizations and accreditation programs were reviewed for relevance. As the taskforce entered into this review, we did not set parameters on the number of articles or websites reviewed. Given the breadth of professions and the individual professional frameworks of andragogy, we chose to maintain curiosity and not use a particular framework. However, we did maintain that andragogy is more dependent on the learner's experience than texts (Knowles et al, 2012), and therefore focused on literature that enlightened us to these experiential notes.

Purpose of this Article

As counselors and counselor educators based in the US who are focused on learning from related helping disciplines, the writing of this article promoted careful examination of different andragogical practices from these helping professions. After reviewing the literature, we assert that social justice andragogy can be improved through communication across disciplines and their fields of scholarship. The purpose of this article is to synthesize conceptual scholarship and empirical literature from nursing (n=17), counseling psychology (n=10), education (n=28), social work (n=19), and public health (n=8) in order to understand what andragogical practices exist in these fields and provide comprehensive community-based social justice curriculum. A consolidation of lessons learned from social justice andragogy is proposed and specific andragogical practices that can be added to each discipline's professional training are recommended.

Social Justice Andragogy within Select Helping Professions

The authors each chose a discipline, used search engines relevant to the specific field, and searched terms related to social justice teaching, andragogy, and pedagogy. Articles were reviewed and discussed to determine key areas of learning around andragogy within each profession. In the main body of this article the social justice andragogy featured in the professional scholarship of each discipline is reviewed.

Nursing

Scholarship in nursing directly addresses the implementation of social justice curriculum. Nursing's motivation to focus on social justice developed from an understanding that issues in healthcare access and quality of care primarily affect marginalized populations. A few authors (e.g., Hutchison, 2015; Reid & Evanson, 2016; Thurman & Pfitzinger-Lippe, 2017) have noted that nurses' frequent exposure to healthcare injustices reinforce the urgency to include social justice advocacy in the nursing curriculum. Thurman and Pfitzinger-Lippe (2017) further argued that infusing social justice into the nursing curriculum can empower nurses to act when they see injustices and threats to cultural safety. Similarly, the American Nurses Association (ANA) code of ethics states that nurses must act as advocates to promote health and reduce disparities (ANA, 2020).

According to Reid and Evanson (2016), such curricula need to be immersive. It is suggested to use simulation activities that put students in situations that require social justice advocacy (Reid & Evanson, 2016). Examples include "development monopoly," a game that simulates differences in power in socioeconomic groups (Ansoms & Geenen, 2012) and "negotiating on poverty," a game that forces participants to understand the complicated assessment of the various dimensions of poverty (Ansoms, 2013). Another strategy is argued by Metzl and Hansen (2014) for community-led strategies and partnerships. These authors added that experiential andragogical techniques can assist students of diverse backgrounds and learning styles to be more engaged and willing to participate in difficult activities related to social justice. Authors suggested a combination of lectures, small and large group activities and discussions, guest speakers, community projects, self-reflection activities, and videos and films (Mohammed et al., 2014).

Other researchers in nursing suggested specific types of andragogy and models to be infused with the nursing curriculum. Andragogies included Freire's (2005) dialogical method (Mabhala, 2013; Mohammed et al., 2014) and hook's (1994) engaged pedagogy (Woolsey & Narruhn, 2018). Additionally, proposed models included Emancipatory Praxis by Snyder (2014), Blanchet Garneau's Cultural Competence Development Model (Garneau, 2016), Mezirow's Transformation Process and Critical Reflection Model (Garneau, 2016; Mezirow, 1991), and the Lifeworld (Dahlberg et al., 2009). Furthermore, Mabhala (2013) and Woolsey and Narruhn (2018) added that, regardless of the andragogy, educators need to encourage students to situate themselves within the context of others and encourage self-reflection and classroom dialogue.

The nursing curriculum can also benefit from specific assignments that address social justice issues and increase self-awareness (Hutchison, 2015). Lee and Kotler (2011) suggested social marketing, in which students partner with a population and develop a campaign to increase health access, policy change, and promote a population's strengths. Woolsey and Narruhn (2018) suggested a

reflection paper of observed injustices in the field during students' clinical experience and an anonymous classroom journal for students to express thoughts, comments, and opinions without shame. Hutchison (2015) suggested using case studies that include social justice issues and have students engage in hypothetical advocacy action.

These efforts can be met with challenges, however. Garland and Batty (2021) wrote that educators in nursing lack education, time, and resources to teach on issues of social justice. Instead, their efforts are usually guided to make sure the nurses pass national nursing exams, which can lead to apolitical teaching practices. Nursing, therefore, often examines healthcare without any critical lenses towards politics, society, or race, which serves counter to the professions ethical call towards social justice (Garland & Batty, 2021).

Educator Training Programs

Education encompasses programs that focus on the professional training of educators and affiliated staff. In the US, education includes grade school, or K-12, education programs, higher education graduate programs, and counselor education training programs. Educator training programs have moved forward in their conceptualization of social justice to better understand the outcome gaps between different student populations. The literature in the field reflects on social justice as a disposition (Allen et al., 2017). These values are in line with taking an anti-racist stance to facilitate active evaluation of the systemic racism in programs (Watt, 2017).

K-12 Educator Training Programs

In the US, K-12 education, rather than higher education, has had to take the biggest strides in social justice as many students from underrepresented groups do not make it to postsecondary institutions (Guillaume et al., 2019). Therefore, much research has been done to increase understanding of how to equip teachers and school personnel with social justice knowledge so that they can apply these lenses to the students they work with, in both an academic and administrative manner. A qualified teacher usually receives teacher education before fully establishing professional identity. Within teacher education, there has been a call for including knowledge of social justice within the curriculum. For example, Guinier (2004) proposed that racial literacy is an essential concept for future educators to learn and understand. It is necessary for educators to master the ability to identify, name, and unpack the injustice practice that are embedded in our society (Kohli, 2019). Additionally, researchers posit that educators are in a unique position to create social justice leaders within the students they teach.

Therefore, there is a call for all educators, administrators, and instructors to be taught about social justice to appropriately transfer these ideals and knowledge to the students they teach (Guillaume et al., 2019).

This call for social justice integration leads to a tiered approach. A tiered approach is recommended as K-12 education in the public domain of the US is often hierarchical in design. K-12 education in the United States is formatted differently from higher education. In higher education, faculty are often experts in their field and allowed much academic freedom and autonomy. This relative freedom can be compared to K-12 education, in which teachers fall under the hierarchy of the administrative tier. Therefore, administration is trained in issues of social justice and they, in turn, educate the instructors, who educate their aides, and collaborate together to apply social justice ideals to students (Cambron-McCabe & McCarthy, 2005; Guillaume et al., 2019). Failure to educate administration could lead to a lack of support when teachers ask for assistance with initiatives towards social justice (Cambron-McCabe & McCarthy, 2005). For instance, in one high school, the staff reacted to an incidence of bullying by implementing preventative groups rather than policing the halls (Guillaume et al., 2019). The collaboration between staff and administration was necessary to offer both educators and students experience in social justice practice.

There remains a debate in education about how to teach issues of social justice. Teaching about specific groups has impacted educators' views regarding students belonging to certain populations. However, it limits educators from moving towards understanding and investigation of social justice issues on a broader scale (Schmidt et al., 2019). In K-12 institutions, staff are also often limited by time. In order to implement any social justice practices, students, faculty, and administration need to make time to build understanding (Guillaume et al., 2019).

Higher Education Administration Training Programs

Higher education administration training allows for more time and resources to implement social justice curriculum. A frequent tool has been the use of intergroup dialogue to build cross-cultural understanding (Alimo, 2012; Ford & Malaney, 2012; Glass et al., 2016; Madden, 2015; Schmidt et al., 2019; Tittler & Wade, 2019; Yeung et al., 2013). Researchers and higher education administrators have created and implemented these groups to facilitate dialogues on social justice. These groups consist of people with privileged and oppressed identities. Some examples include a heterosexual and LGB group, white and African American group, and a group that included the two ends of the spectrum of socio-economic status (Alimo, 2012; Ford & Malaney, 2012; Glass et al., 2016; Madden, 2015; Schmidt et al., 2019; Tittler & Wade, 2019; Yeung et al., 2013).

Counselor Education Programs

In the US, programs in counselor education are often housed in university education programs and focus on the training of clinical mental health counselors, marriage and family counselors, career counselors, school counselors, and rehabilitation counselors. Counselor education programs are, therefore, focused on training professionals that serve in a variety of settings. The integration of social justice in counselor education has been requested by many organizations and researchers (e.g., Decker et al., 2016; Goodman et al., 2015; Green et al., 2008; Steele, 2008). Most notably, the Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs Standards (2016) introduced the inclusion of social justice and advocacy as a necessary curriculum focus for Counselor Education programs in the US. In addition, the American Counseling Association sponsored the formation of multicultural competencies that integrated social justice as an essential part of the counseling process in 2015 (Ratts et al., 2016). The Multicultural and Social Justice Counseling Competencies intended to translate the professional standards into praxis, and they encourage the development of critical consciousness as a step towards praxis. Social justice education is still in a conceptual, rather than implementation, stage within the profession.

Numerous definitions of social justice in counselor education exist. From "fair and equal access and opportunity without limitations" (Goodman et al., 2015, p. 148) to the maintenance of rights of all individuals (Green et al., 2008). The counselor education literature indicates a shift in focus from individual to systemic social reform (Farrell & Barrio Minton, 2020; Holcomb-McCoy, 2018), while recognizing that the definition of social justice may change depending on context (Rountree & Pomeroy, 2010). The inclusion of advocacy as a tool for social justice is also stressed in the counselor education literature (Holcomb-McCoy, 2018)

Advocacy is considered a central aspect of the profession (Chang et al., 2010) and can be understood as the work that takes place to combat oppression experienced by both individuals and groups within society (Shin, 2008). Fickling and González (2016) sought to provide counselor educators with practical information on how to incorporate advocacy and social justice in the classroom. The authors suggested a view of advocacy as a key component of the counselor's professional identity, one that must be integrated "in both the content and the process of the counseling classroom" (Fickling & González, 2016, p. 4).

In the 2018 American Counseling Association Advocacy Competencies, Toporek and Daniels addressed the skills, knowledge, and behaviors that may be taught and practiced to address such societal barriers faced by clients. Additionally, Lee and Rodgers (2009) emphasized the importance of counselors acting outside of the counseling room to promote social justice and advocate for their clients. The advocacy competencies identified six domains of counselor advocacy, including: "empowerment, client advocacy, community collaboration, systems advocacy, collective action, and social/political advocacy" (Toporek &

Daniels, 2018, p. 2). Along with these competencies, self-awareness and training are necessary for effective advocacy intervention (Decker et al., 2016).

To improve social justice training in counselor education, researchers call for more consistent inclusion of social justice and advocacy training throughout the graduate counseling curriculum (Decker et al., 2016; Goodman et al., 2015; Green et al., 2008). Suggested pedagogical interventions include fieldwork activities, reflective exercises aimed at increasing cultural awareness (Decker et al., 2016; Farrell et al., 2020), and decolonizing the counseling curriculum (Goodman et al., 2015). Decolonization of the counseling curriculum can be achieved by including diverse media, guest speakers and scholars, and immersing students in diverse communities (Decker et al., 2016; Fickling and Gonzalez, 2016; Goodman et al., 2015; Green et al., 2008; Marbley et al., 2011; Steele, 2008).

Counseling Psychology

Current literature on social justice in counseling psychology identifies the continued need for determining competencies, incorporating activities in training, and developing curriculum (Arczynski, 2017; Beer et al., 2012; Flores et al., 2014). The literature in the field suggests specific coursework, assessing student competence, and pedagogical approaches specific to social justice principles and practices. Similarities in curricula can be seen in the inclusion of knowledge or competency-based learning activities, the use of social justice and multicultural competency scales, and service-learning experiences.

Mallinckrodt et al. (2014) discuss a scientist-practitioner-advocate (SPA) training model. These authors identified a need to revise training within a doctoral counseling psychology program. The SPA model offers a comprehensive graduate training program that prepares students to intervene at both the individual and systemic levels. As in education, intergroup dialogue is utilized in the SPA model to attend to attitudes/values, facilitate communication, and strengthen students' capacities to promote social justice (Simpson, 2017). Other activities include competency-based learning objectives, phase-anchored instructional activities, assessments, and an evaluation of the course (Arczynski, 2017).

Service learning and immersive experiences are used to enhance social justice training, though the experiences are approached differently across the field (Pieterse et al., 2009; Toporek & Worthington, 2014; Zucchero et al., 2014). Some of these experiences are intentionally phase-based so that students develop their understandings progressively throughout (Toporek & Worthington, 2014). Others try to engage students in service learning while providing content and building self-awareness simultaneously (Zucchero et al., 2014). Service learning has also been expanded into larger immersive learning experiences, including keynote addresses, networking within the community, and group processing.

Carr et al. (2014) describe postdoctoral counseling psychology training and clinical experiences in working with individuals in recovery, grounded in a social justice framework. Clinical experience requirements included a minimum of 16 hours per week of work in direct clinical services at mental health facilities. In addition to using traditional approaches, such as Cognitive Behavioral Therapy and Dialectical Behavioral Therapy, counseling psychologists in fellowship placements worked with clients in recovery using a strength-based approach that incorporated advocacy, self-determination, and trauma-informed interventions. Participants were also expected to engage in peer support services, lead training sessions, attend public health and leadership seminars, and produce scholarly material focused on concepts of recovery and social justice. In summary, the counseling psychology literature describes activities that focus on student development, including an understanding of social justice in the context of groups, general social justice topics (i.e., oppression, social status, personal reflection of beliefs and values), application of awareness and knowledge in group settings, and the use of intergroup dialogue for reflection and termination of the group process (Arczynski, 2017).

Social Work

Social justice as a curricular priority is ingrained into the competencies of the social work field (NASW, 2022). The Council on Social Work Education (CSWE) mandates programs to include content on social, environmental, and economic justice in social work curriculum (CSWE, 2015) and the National Association of Social Workers (NASW) promotes social justice value and practice among social workers (NASW, 2017). Social work programs are foundationally rights-based, justice-based frameworks which train students to practice social work in the real and dynamic world. However, there is no common understanding of social justice in the social work profession (Kiesel & Abdill, 2017). Scholars, educators, and practitioners emphasize diverse definitions of social justice in the field of social work. They often associate social justice with diversity and multiculturalism, as well as promoting equity produced by normative power structure (Reisch, 2002). Others define social justice as empowerment (Cox, 2001). Some viewed it through a human rights lens, redistribution of resources, social change, or global perspective (Beck & Eichler, 2008; Witkin, 2000). This definitional disagreement complicates how social work educators can effectively design curricula to teach the primary aspect of social work (Morgaine, 2014). Despite the struggles in defining social justice and its macro-level application, a few graduate programs engage social work students in macro-level social justice work.

A variety of approaches have been used to incorporate the aforementioned competencies into the classroom. The most common method for teaching the applications of human rights and social justice to social work practice includes

integration of materials like readings or discussions into courses, followed by talks and seminars. Conferences supplement this learning of content as well (Answering the Challenge of Social and Economic Justice, n.d.).

Social work programs also develop opportunities for experiential learning (CSWE, 2015; Deepak et al., 2015; Wiener & Rosenwald, 2008). Students can be encouraged to engage in micro-practice in which they create or join active coalitions, design campaigns, and use media outlets to promote change at the community level (Rocha, 2000). They also are encouraged to involve themselves in empirical research around issues of social justice in which they promote awareness and utilize an interdisciplinary approach (Bexell et al., 2019; Raworth, 2012). The promotion of awareness is also reflected in the clinical experiences of social work trainees within their fieldwork, internship, and the applied project components of their education (McBeath, 2016). Many programs are supplemented with foci on human rights and international development (Cornell Institute for Public Affairs, n.d.; Social Justice and Human Rights, MA, n.d.).

Public Health

Public Health curriculum is influenced by changes in policy that are then enforced by the Council on Education in Public Health. The United States Department of Health and Human Services recently led a nation-wide initiative that integrates social justice into healthcare as it presents in health equity (Gonzales et al., 2019; Levy & Sidel, 2006). The initiative focused on health equality, elimination of disparity, and improvisation of health quality among all (Gonzales et al., 2019).

According to the social work literature, there are various degrees of specialization in social justice within public health programs (Elias et al., 2017; Gonzalez et al., 2019). Some programs include specialization courses, while others barely skim the topics of health equity. Within the social justice curriculum, though, a wide variety of activities, both formal and informal, have been designed and implemented to teach the public health graduates about social justice and health (Rosales et al., 2012).

Social justice knowledge and practice among health professionals is promoted through self-reflection, advocacy, and collaborative learning. The strategies to increase social justice and health equity orientation among students include class discussions on incorporating social justice topics, as well as brown bag lunch presentations on community engagement, social injustice interventions, and training in research or grant writing. Programs also include service learning in community coalitions (Rosales et al., 2012). For example, in one program, students are encouraged to explore both local and global health issues by interviewing a healthcare professional who is actively engaged in social justice. To promote social justice positioning through advocacy, those students are encouraged to reflect on culturally competent interventions on various levels:

individual, community, and structural. They then complete an applied project to reduce health disparity (Hatchett et al., 2015).

Andragogical Commonalities

These diverse, but related, disciplines have one common goal: to increase social justice practices within their professions and in the common experience of society (CACREP, 2016; CSWE, 2015; Gonzales et al., 2019. These fields encourage diverse modalities, as can be seen in Table 1, for teaching social justice, however, there are some experiences that span the different professions. From the review of scholarship, the authors were able to determine some overarching andragogical strategies and find commonalities. Before presenting this synthesis, it is important to acknowledge that our synthesis is limited by the published literature. Some programs may not publish about all of their andragogical practices.

Table 1

Social Justice Curricular Themes Across Different Disciplines' Literature

	Nursing	Education	Counseling Psychology	Social Work	Public Health	Counselor Education
Immersive learning	x		x	x		
Simulations	x					
Systems approach		x		x	x	x
Lecture	x	x				x
Research			x	x	x	
Direct application			x	x	x	
Media/Current events	x			x		x
In-class dialogue		x	x			x
Self-reflection		x				x

Immersive learning was an aspect of andragogy mentioned in nursing, counseling psychology, and social work scholarship (Pieterse et al., 2009; Reid & Evanson, 2016; Rocha, 2000; Toporek & Worthington, 2014; Zucchero et al.,

2014). Knowledge of social justice is incorporated in the curricular design in all these fields. Similarly, introducing and using a systems-approach to conceptualizing social justice was mentioned in education, social work, and public health scholarship (Beck & Eichler, 2008; Guillaume et al., 2019; Rosales et al., 2012). Using research as an andragogical activity and finding direct application of social justice was an aspect of andragogy from counseling psychology, social work, and public health (Bexell et al., 2019; Hatchett et al., 2015; Mallinckrodt et al. 2014; Raworth, 2012). Utilizing current events and media to conceptualize social justice was a part of nursing, education, and social work scholarship (Decker et al., 2016; Fickling and Gonzalez, 2016; Goodman et al., 2015; Green et al., 2008; Lee and Kotler, 2011; Marbley et al., 2011; Rocha, 2000).

The commonalities for these pedagogical strategies are the parts of identity and experience that these different professions want to build upon. There is, first, the urgency to engage multiple systems at a time. Though the studies reviewed in this article discussed the education of trainees in their field, the educational strategies simultaneously sought to include the systems of their workplace whether it be hospitals, schools, or communities. In order to achieve this systems-view, each field also encouraged different interactions to promote holistic learning within the discipline. Students, across disciplines, were given didactic materials, experiential activities, and research and application projects to promote a building of skills and knowledge in creating advocacy.

Still, there are some andragogical tools that are only mentioned in one or two disciplines' scholarship. Nursing was the only discipline to mention simulations as part of social justice andragogy and education was the only field that mentioned the use of self-reflection in their professional training in the reviewed literature. Similarly, only two professions used lecture (nursing and education) or in-class dialogue (education and counseling psychology). This synthesis of andragogy may be used to inform the professional training about these more isolated andragogical tools so that professional training can learn and grow from exposure to new methods.

Each discipline has its own history of how the discipline has adopted social justice into its competencies. There is, in common, a pattern for identifying social justice as an aim. All fields agree upon their own specific terminology that requires understandings of social justice. These terms are researched and then brought to a national organization such as the American Psychological Association. The next part of the process has been to create competencies or programs to consolidate an understanding of social justice. Each discipline will continue to evolve as understanding evolves; cross-disciplinary communication and understanding are vital to carrying social justice forward.

Recommendations for Implementing a Social Justice Curriculum

The review of literature from these different fields leads to a synthesis of the practices important to teaching social justice. Some programs hold multicultural courses where social justice education is housed. This synthesis recommends that the teaching of social justice be integrated throughout a program and recommends instruction methods that can fit into different courses and terminology that should supplement these instructional methods to provide integrity to social justice education. Each discipline should challenge its current processes and adopt some of the curricular practices of other programs. Further, each discipline's scholarship should fill in the gaps in the research about their social justice andragogy. The following tenets can be used to guide social justice andragogy across helping professions: 1) instructor's critical evaluation of curriculum; 2) integration of current events, media, and technology; 3) immersive service-learning and research; and 4) community engagement.

Instructor's Critical Evaluation of Curriculum

Social justice andragogy relies on the instructors of such materials to analyze their own approach to social justice materials (Garland & Batty, 2021). It is first necessary that the instructor takes a critical approach to the teaching of social justice (Garland and Batty, 2021; Garneau, 2016). An instructor's constant critical evaluation of their own social justice andragogy transfers into a practitioner's constant critical evaluation of their own social justice action (Garneau, 2016).

Continuing education requirements and faculty development opportunities exist across these domains. These are environments in which instructors should be actively involved in deconstructing their curricula and engaging in critical self-evaluation. Department heads, licensing boards, and accreditation boards can enforce such evaluation within their purview (CACREP, 2016; CSWE, 2015).

Integration of Current Events, Media, and Technology

These critical methods of social justice andragogy must be supplemented with creative approaches to teaching. Instructors that rely on readings and lectures will be ill-prepared to properly convey the real-time work of social justice action. At this juncture in our history, digital engagement in social justice is ubiquitous. Hashtag movements and video exposés are constantly evolving and changing the messages of social justice and instructors need to integrate these new types of communication and advocacy into their coursework so that students are prepared

for the real-life practice, micro and macro, of engaging with social justice (Guillaume et al., 2019, Mallinckrodt et al., 2014; Toporek & Daniels, 2018).

Counseling psychology and counselor education might integrate these through discussions on mental health and social and emotional well-being. Further, instructors might have students engage with media and reflect on their changes in attitudes towards social justice. Similarly, the fields of public health and nursing might use these movements and videos to facilitate discussion around social determinants of health.

Immersive Service-Learning and Research

Service Learning is another component to increase creative exposure and critical engagement. Service-learning and immersive activities provide an environment in which students can demonstrate social justice and advocacy skills. The inclusion of similar activities and associated observation assessments allow students to practice social justice advocacy. Arczynski (2017) includes specific assessments of learning and instructional activity prompts, which could be referenced when developing similar curricula. In addition, each of the activities included in Toporek and Worthington's (2014) model, Zucchero et al.'s (2014) pedagogies, and Carr et al.'s (2014) postdoctoral training could be incorporated in training. For example, students in their clinical or practical experiences would be able to include service learning as part of their direct contact hours with seminars, training, and pre-and-post activities and discussions as indirect hours. A challenge to contend with would be identifying community events and facilities for participation. Programs that operate in an online capacity would also need to adjust in the structure of discussions so that students would be able to provide a synopsis of their service-learning experience.

Service learning can also be supplemented with speaker engagements. Advocates and members of the local communities can join classes via on-line or in-person guest lectures. These lectures would allow students to hear from a person and ask direct questions rather than rely on their own conceptualizations of social action. Service-learning is conceptualized within community-based work (Noonan et al., 2018).

Similarly, the professions that encouraged research as an andragogical process used research to effect change. While social workers focused their research to disseminate information and promote social awareness (Bexell et al., 2019; Raworth, 2012), public health educators encouraged their students to use research to facilitate grants (Rosales et al., 2012), thereby using research as both an andragogical and social justice practice. Counseling psychology, too, asked doctoral students to engage in research to better understand their roles in addiction and mental health treatment (Carr et al, 2014).

Community Engagement

While the andragogy of social justice is important to understand, the praxis is the aspect of social justice that impacts the community. Vital to praxis is continual evaluation and feedback. A social justice research modality common across a few professions is Community Based Participatory Research (CBPR) that includes community members in designing and evaluating practices of social justice that are both pertinent and realistic for them (Noonan et al., 2018). The power behind a practice such as CBPR is that it includes a continual process of feedback and evaluation that encourages progress within the community. Research done with medical practitioners and members of the lesbian, gay, and bisexual population led to better "informed healthcare restructuring, access initiatives, and training curriculum for disparities research" (Noonan et al., 2018, p. 125). This essential aspect of social justice work is a critical component of any praxis.

Considerations and Future Research

This article looks at the social justice andragogy in major helping professions in the published literature. However, as the authors are themselves a research tool and therefore may have missed articles or relevant searches, it is possible that some professions are more represented than others. While each discipline can benefit from engaging critically with some of the ideas implemented by other helping profession training programs, some of this review is limited by the research within the program. There are gaps in the current discipline-specific literature. These gaps may be attributed to two things: Either the professional training does not use these andragogical tools or the extant scholarship is not comprehensive concerning the professional training. Based on the discipline's standards and training procedures, the authors recommend that these professions use empirical practices and conceptual scholarship to highlight the use of these andragogical practices within their training and use the discussion in this manuscript to inform new andragogical approaches.

The authors' review shows these gaps. For instance, nursing's scholarship does not discuss the use of systems approaches, direct application of learning, in-class dialogue, or self-reflection as andragogical tools. Education and public health do not discuss immersive learning or simulations. Further, education scholarship does not discuss direct application of learning social justice in professional training, and public health does not feature in-class discussion or self-reflection in its scholarship. Social work also does not discuss the use of simulations, systems approach, in-class dialogue, or self-reflection in its scholarship. Finally, counseling psychology has no mention of the use of simulations, systems approach, lecture, integration of media and current events, or self-reflection.

The authors suggest future research to take into consideration these aspects. Each discipline should understand these gaps in scholarship and fill them with new research and conceptual articles. The more literature is produced, the better informed our interdisciplinary conversation on social justice andragogy. This will also help facilitate a comprehensive base of empirical literature from which to derive other professional and non-professional social justice training.

Conclusion

Progressing in the overarching social justice agenda calls for collaboration and a multi-dimensional approach. Unity can be created by conversations between and amongst professional training programs. This article provides recommendations that can be used across different programs and different andragogical modalities. In addition to these recommendations, it is the impetus of these programs to continue to evaluate and assess the work that trainees and graduates conduct in determining the social justice footprint of their program.

References

Alimo, C. J. (2012). From dialogue to action: The impact of cross-race intergroup dialogue on the development of white college students as racial allies. *Equity and Excellence in Education, 45*(1), 36–59. https://doi.org/10.1080/10665684.2012.643182

Allen, J. G., Harper, R.E., & Koschoreck, J. W. (2017). Social justice and school leadership preparation: Can we shift beliefs, values, and commitments? *International Journal of Educational Leadership Preparation, 12*(1), 1–20. https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1145455.pdf

American Nurses Association. (2020). *Code of ethics for nurses*. https://www.nursingworld.org/practice-policy/nursing-excellence/ethics/

Answering the Challenge of Social and Economic Justice (Monmouth University) (n.d.). https://www.monmouth.edu/insidemonmouth/a-commitment-to-human-rights-and-social-justice/

Ansoms, A. (2013). Negotiating on poverty: aparticipatory poverty assessment simulation game. *Simulation and Gaming, 44*, 586–601. https://doi.org/10.1177/1046878112440162

Ansoms, A., & Geenen, S. (2012). Development monopoly: a simulation game on poverty and inequity. *Simulation and Gaming, 43*, 853–862. https://doi.org/10.1177/1046878112451877

Arczynski, A.V. (2017). Multicultural social justice group psychotherapy training: Curriculum development and pilot. *Training and Education in Professional Psychology*, *11*(4), 227–234. https://doi.org/10.1037/tep0000161

Beck, E. L., & Eichler, M. (2008). Consensus organizing: a practice model for community building. *Journal of Community Practice, 8*(1), 87–102. https://doi.org/10.1300/J125v0801_05

Beer, A. M., Spanierman, L. B., Greene, J. C., & Todd, N. R. (2012). Counseling psychology trainees' perceptions of training and commitments to social justice. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 59*(1), 120–133. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0026325

Bexell, M. S., Sparks, L. D., Tejada, J., & Rechkemmer, A. (2019). An analysis of inclusion gaps in sustainable development themes: findings from a review of recent social work literature. *International Social Work, 62*, 864–876. https://doi.org/10.1177/0020872818755860

Cambron-McCabe, N., & McCarthy, M. M. (2005). Educating school leaders for social justice. *Educational Policy, 19*, 201–222. https://doi.org/10.1177/0895904804271609

Carr, E. R., Bhagwat, R., Miller, R., & Ponce, A. N. (2014). Training in mental health recovery and social justice in the public sector. *The Counseling Psychologist*, *42*(8), 1108–1135. https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000014555200

Center for Disease Control and Prevention. (2020, July 24). Health equity considerations and racial and ethnic minority groups. https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/community/health-equity/race-ethnicity.html

Chang, C. Y., Crethar, H. C., Ratts, M. J., & Editors, G. (2010). Social justice: A national imperative for counselor education and supervision. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, *50*(2), 82-87. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1556-6978.2010.tb00110.x

Cornell Institute for Public Affairs (n.d.) Human rights and social justice. https://www.human.cornell.edu/cipa/academics/curriculum/concentrations/humanrights

Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs (2016). 2016 standards for accreditation. https://www.cacrep.org/for-programs/2016-cacrep-standards/

Council on Social Work Education (2015). Education policy and accreditation standards for baccalaureate and master's social work programs. https://www.cswe.org/getmedia/23a35a39-78c7-453f-b805-b67f1dca2ee5/2015-epas-and-glossary.pdf

Cox, A. L. (2001). BSW students favor strengths/empowerment-based generalist practice. *Families in Society, 82*(3), 305–313. https://doi.org/10.1606/1044-3894.193

Dahlberg, K., Todres, L., & Galvin, K. (2009). Lifeworld-led healthcare is more than patient-led care: an existential view of wellbeing. *Medicine, Health Care and Philosophy,12*(3), 265–271. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11019-008-9174-7

Decker, K. M., Manis, A. A., & Paylo, M. J. (2016). Infusing social justice advocacy into counselor education: Strategies and recommendations. *The Journal of Counselor Preparation and Supervision, 8*(3). https://doi.org/10.7729/83.1092

Deepak, A. C., Rountree, M. A., & Scott, J. (2015). Delivering diversity and social justice in social work education: The power of context. *Journal of Progressive Human Services, 26*(2), 107–125. https://doi.org/10.1080/10428232.2015.1017909

Elias, T. I., Williams, K. R., Hershey, T.B., Documet, P.I., Barinas-Mitchell, & Gary-Webb, T. (2017). The health equity certificate program: a targeted approach to reducing health disparities and increasing the competence of health professional students. *Pedagogy in Health Promotion*, *3,* 187–194. https://doi.org/10.1177/2373379916665637

Farrell, I. C., & Barrio Minton, C. A. (2019). Advocacy among counseling leaders: The three-tiered legislative professional advocacy model. *Journal of Counselor Leadership and Advocacy, 2*(6), 144–159. https://doi.org/10.1080/2326716X.2019.1644254

Farrell, I. C., DeDiego, A. C., & Marshall, R. C. (2020). Service learning to foster advocacy training in CACREP accredited programs. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*, *15*(4), 522–534. https://doi.org/10.1080/15401383.2020.1733724

Fickling, M. J., & Gonzalez, L. M. (2016). Linking multicultural counseling and social justice through advocacy. *Journal of Counselor Leadership and Advocacy 3*(2), 85–94. https://doi.org/10.1080/2326716X.2015.1124814

Flores, M. P., de la Rue, L., Neville, H. A., Valgoi, M., Brooks, J., Lee, E. S., Ginsburg, R., Santiago, S., Ben Rakemayahu, K., Garite, R., & Brawn, M. (2014). Developing social justice competencies: A consultation training approach. *The Counseling Psychologist*, *42*(7), 998–1020. https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000014548900

Ford, K. A., & Malaney, V. K. (2012). "I now harbor more pride in my race": The educational benefits of inter- and intraracial dialogues on the experiences of students of color and multiracial students. *Equity and Excellence in Education, 45*(1), 14–35. https://doi.org/10.1080/10665684.2012.643180

Freire, P. (2005). *Pedagogy of the oppressed.* Continuum.

Garland, R., & Batty, M. L. (2021). Moving beyond the rhetoric of social justice in nursing education: Practical guidance for nurse educators committed to anti-racist pedagogical practice. *Witness: The Canadian Journal of Critical Nursing Discourse*, *3*(1), 17–30. https://doi.org/10.25071/2291-5796.96

Garneau, B. A. (2016). Critical reflection in cultural competence development: A framework for undergraduate nursing education. *Journal of Nursing Education,* 55(3), 125–132. https://doi.org/10.3928/01484834-20160216-02

Glass, K., Glass, C. R., & Jason Lynch, R. (2016). Student engagement and affordances for interaction with diverse peers: A network analysis. *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education,* *9*(2), 170–187. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0039726

Gonzales, G., Quinones, N., & Martin, M. (2019). Health equity curricula within health policy and management concentrations in U.S. public health graduate programs. *Pedagogy in Health Promotion, 5,* 276–282. https://doi.org/10.1177/2373379918814024

Goodman, R. D., Williams, J. M., Chung, R. C.-Y., Talleyrand, R. M., Douglass, A. M., McMahon, H. G., & Bemak, F. (2015). *Decolonizing traditional pedagogies and practices in Counseling and Psychology Education: A move towards social justice and action*. Springer New York.

Green, E. J., McCollum, V.C., & Hays, D. G. (2008). Teaching advocacy counseling within a social justice framework: Implications for school counselors and educators. *Journal for Social Action in Counseling and Psychology, 1*(2), 14–30. https://doi.org/10.33043/JSACP.1.2.14-30

Guillaume, R. O., Osanloo, A. F., & Kew, K. L. (2019). The Principal and the PEA (Parent Education Association). *Journal of Cases in Educational Leadership, 22*(2), 39–53. https://doi.org/10.1177/1555458919831346

Guinier, L. (2004). From racial liberalism to racial literacy: Brown v. Board of Education and the interest-divergence dilemma. *Journal of American History, 91*(1), 92–118. https://doi.org/10.2307/3659616

Hatchett, L., Elster, N., Wasson, K., Anderson, L., & Parsi, K. (2015). Integrating social justice for health professional education: Self reflection, advocacy, and collaborative learning. *Online Journal of Health Ethics*, *11,* https://doi.org/10.18785/ojhe.1101.04

Holcomb-McCoy, C. (2018). Conducting socially just and relevant research. In *Counseling for social justice (3rd ed.)* (pp. 221–238). American Counseling Association Foundation.

hooks, b. (1994). *Teaching to transgress: education as the practice of freedom*. Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203700280

Hutchison, J. S. (2015). Anti-oppressive practice and reflexive lifeworld-led approaches to care: A framework for teaching nurses about social justice. *Nursing Research and Practice 2015,* 1–5. https://doi.org/10.1155/2015/187508

Kiesel, R. L., & Abdill, R. L. (2017). Mapping social justice: Integrating policy practice across the curriculum. *Journal of Social Work Education, 55*, 695–709. https://doi.org/10.10.1080/10437797.2018.1491360

Knowles, M., Holton, E. F., III, & Swanson, R. A. (2012). The adult learner (7th ed.). New York: Routledge.

Kohli, R. (2019). Lessons for teacher education: The role of critical professional development in teacher of color retention. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *70*(1), 39–50. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487118767645

Lee, C. C., & Rodgers, R. A. (2009) Counselor advocacy: Affecting systemic change in the public arena. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 87*(3), 284–287. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1556-6678.2009.tb00108.x

Lee, N. R., & Kotler, P. (2011). *Social marketing: influencing behaviors for good.* SAGE.

Levy, B., & Sidel, V. (2006). *Social injustice and public health*. Oxford University Press.

Mabhala, M. A. (2013). Health inequalities as a foundation for embodying knowledge within public health teaching: A qualitative study. *International Journal for Equity in Health, 12*(1), 46. https://doi.org/10.1186/1475-9276-12-46

Madden, M. (2015). Social class dialogues and the fostering of class consciousness. *Equity and Excellence in Education, 48*(4), 571–588. https://doi.org/10.1080/10665684.2015.1086227

Mallinckrodt, B., Miles, J. R., & Levy, J. J. (2014). The scientist-practitioner-advocate model: Addressing contemporary training needs for social justice advocacy. *Training and Education in Professional Psychology*, *8*(4), 303–311. https://doi.org/10.1037/tep0000045

Marbley, A., Steele, J., & McAuliffe, G. (2011). Teaching social and cultural issues in counseling. In: McAuliffe G and Eriksen K (eds), *Handbook of counselor preparation: constructivist, developmental, and experiential approaches* (pp.163–191). SAGE Publications.

McBeath, B. (2016). Re-envisioning macro social work practice. *Families in Society, 97,* 5–14. https://doi.org/10.1606/1044-3894.2016.97.9

Metzl, J. M., & Hansen, H. (2014). Structural competency: theorizing a new medical engagement with stigma and inequality. *Social Science and Medicine, 103*, 126-133. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2013.06.032

Mezirow, J. (1991) *Transformative dimensions of adult learning.* Jossey-Bass.

Mohammed, S. A., Cooke, C. L., Ezeonwu, M., & Stevens, C. A. (2014). Sowing the seeds of change: Social justice as praxis in undergraduate nursing education. *Journal of Nursing Education*, *53*(9), 488–493. https://doi.org/10.3928/01484834-20140805-03

Morgaine, K. (2014). Conceptualizing social justice in social work: Are social workers "too bogged down in the trees?" *Journal of Social Justice, 4*, 1–18. http://transformativestudies.org/wp-content/uploads/Conceptualizing-Social-Justice-in-Social-Work.pdf

National Association of Social Workers. (2022). *Policy issues.* https://www.socialworkers.org/Advocacy/Policy-Issue

National Association of Social Workers (2017). Code of ethics. https://www.socialworkers.org/About/Ethics/Code-of-Ethics/Code-of-Ethics-English

Noonan, E. J., Sawning, S., Combs, R., Weingartner, L. A., Martin, L. J., Jones, V. F., & Holthouser, A. (2018). Engaging the transgender community to improve medical education and prioritize healthcare initiatives. *Teaching and learning in medicine*, *30*(2), 119–132. https://doi.org/10.1080/10401334.2017.1365718

Pieterse, A. L., Evans, S. A., Risner-Butner, A., Collins, N. M., & Mason, L. B. (2009). Multicultural competence and social justice training in counseling psychology and counselor education. *Counseling Psychologist, 37*(1), 93–115. https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000008319986

Ratts, M. J., Singh, A. A., Nassar-McMillan, S., Butler, S. K., & McCullough, J. R. (2016). Multicultural and social justice counseling competencies: guidelines for the counseling profession. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 44*(1), 28-48. https://doi.org/10.1002/jmcd.12035

Raworth, K. (2012) A safe and just space for humanity: Can we live within the doughnut? *Oxfam Policy and Practice: Climate Change and Resilience, 8*(1), 1–26. https://www-cdn.oxfam.org/s3fs-public/file_attachments/dp-a-safe-and-just-space-for-humanity-130212-en_5.pdf

Reid, C. A. & Evanson, T. A. (2016). Using simulation to teach about poverty in nursing education: A review of available tools. *Journal of Professional Nursing, 32*(2), 130–140. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.profnurs.2015.10.002

Reisch, M. (2002). Defining social justice in a socially unjust world. *Families in Society, 83*(4), 343-354. https://doi.org/10.1606/1044-3894.17

Rocha, C. J. (2000). Evaluating experiential teaching methods in a policy practice course: The case for service learning to increase political participation. *Journal of Social Work Education, 36*, 53–63. https://doi.org/10.1080/10437797.2000.10778989

Rosales, B. C., Coe, K. C., Ortiz, S., Gamez, G., & Stroupe, N. (2012) Social justice, health, and human rights education: Challenges and opportunities in schools of public health. *Association of Schools of Public Health*, *127*, 126-130. https://doi.org/10.1177/003335491212700117

Rountree, M. A., & Pomeroy, E. C. (2010). Bridging the gaps among social justice, research, and practice. *Social Work, 55*(4), 293-295. https://doi.org/10.1093/sw/55.4.293

Schmidt, C. K., Earnest, D. R., & Miles, J. R. (2019). Expanding the reach of intergroup dialogue: A quasi-experimental study of two teaching methods for undergraduate multicultural courses. *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education*, *13*(3), 264–273. https://doi.org/10.1037/dhe0000124

Shin, R. Q. (2008). Advocating for social justice in academia through recruitment, retention, admissions, and professional survival. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, *36*(3), 180-191. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2161-1912.2008.tb00081.x

Simpson, E. B. (2017). *Counselor supervisors' perceptions of the importance of social justice competence in novice counselors* (Publication No. 10604873) [Doctoral Dissertation, Duquesne University]. ProQuest Dissertations Publishing.

Snyder, M. (2014). Emancipatory knowing: Empowering nursing students toward reflection and action. *Journal of Nursing Education, 53*(2), 65-69. https://doi.org/10.3928/01484834-20140107-0

Social Justice and Human Rights, MA. (Arizona State University). (n.d.). Retrieved from https://newcollege.asu.edu/social-justice-and-human-rights-ma

Steele, J. M. (2008). Preparing counselors to advocate for social justice: A liberation model. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 48*(2), 74-85. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1556-6978.2008.tb00064.x

Suleiman, M. (2014, August 4-7). *Leading for equity and social justice: from rhetoric to reality* [Paper presentation]. Annual Conference of the National Council of Professors of Educational Administration, Camarillo, CA, United States.

Thurman, W., & Pfitzinger-Lippe, M. (2017). Returning to the profession's roots: social justice in nursing education for the 21st century. *Advances in Nursing Science, 40*(2), 184–193. https://doi.org/10.1097/ANS.0000000000000140

Tittler, M. V., & Wade, N. G. (2019). Engaging white participants in racial dialogues: group composition and dialogue structure. *Group Dynamics, 23*(2), 75–90. https://doi.org/10.1037/gdn0000099

Toporek, R. L., & Daniels, J. (2018). *American counseling association advocacy competencies.* American Counseling Association.

Toporek, R. L., & Worthington, R. L. (2014). Integrating service learning and difficult dialogues pedagogy to advance social justice training. *Counseling Psychologist*, *42*(7), 919–945. https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000014545090

Watt, D. (2017). Dealing with difficult conversations: Anti-racism in youth and community work training. *Race Ethnicity and Education, 20*(3), 401–413. https://doi.org/10.1080/13613324.2016.1260235

Wiener, D., & Rosenwald, M. (2008). Unlocking doors: providing MSW programs and students with educational "keys" to social justice. *Journal of Progressive Human Services*, *19*, 125–139. https://doi.org/10.1080/10428230802475422

Witkin, S. L. (2000) Writing social work. *Social Work, 45*(5), 389-394. https://link.gale.com/apps/doc/A66168327/AONE?u=anon~7be4b82b&sid=googleScholar&xid=0f5dff4c

Woolsey, C., & Narruhn, R. A. (2018). A pedagogy of social justice for resilient/vulnerable populations: structural competency and bio-power. *Public Health Nursing, 35*(6), 587–597. https://doi.org/10.1111/phn.12545

Yeung, J. G., Spanierman, L. B., & Landrum-Brown, J. (2013) Being White in a multicultural society: critical whiteness pedagogy in a dialogue course. *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education, 6*(1), 17–32. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0031632

Zucchero, R. A., Iwasaki, M., Lewis, M. M., Lee, J., & Robbins, M. J. (2014). Social justice training within geropsychology: nontraditional pedagogies to cultivate a competent workforce. *Counseling Psychologist, 42*(7), 946–971. https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000014540342

Author Contact

Bagmi Das, bagmidas@gwu.edu

Isabel Farrell, farrelic@wfu.edu

Kriti Vashisht, kvashisht@mcneese.edu

Alexandra Gantt-Howrey, aghowrey@nmsu.edu

Elisabeth Simpson, elisabeth.simpson@mail.wvu.edu

Adrianne Johnson, adriannejohnson@gmail.com