

A bibliometric analysis of postgraduate theses on bilingualism covering the preschool period in Turkey

Elif Ermağan

İstanbul Medeniyet University, İstanbul, Turkey.

Accepted 20 March, 2023

ABSTRACT

Preschool education describes the education process of the child until primary school, and it is also within the scope of child bilingualism. This study examined the studies on bilingualism covering the preschool period in Turkey. The main statement of this study is that related postgraduate theses in different disciplines investigating the issue of bilingualism covering the preschool period are insufficient in the national literature in Turkey. This study aimed to analyze postgraduate theses between 2003 and 2022 registered in the Turkish Higher Education Institution (YÖK) database and to break down different variables. The main findings are that bilingualism studies are mostly concentrated on master's theses, they are not the subject of doctoral theses. Furthermore, education- and teaching-oriented theses are at the forefront and should be handled together with other disciplines. The model of the study is a qualitative case study, and the data of the study were obtained from theses on the website of YÖK. In the analysis of the data, the bibliometric technique is used, and statistics about the subject are created.

Keywords: Bilingualism, postgraduate theses, bibliometric analysis, preschool, Turkey.

E-mail: elif.ermagan@medeniyet.edu.tr. Tel: +905426196734.

INTRODUCTION

As Albert Costa points out in his book *The Bilingual Brain*, "more than half of the world's population is bilingual, yet few of us understand how this extraordinary, complex ability functions" (Costa, 2020). In the modern world, bilingualism is one of the most common conditions, regardless of whether it is the result of immigration, different ancestry-tribes, or growing up in a family that had to work in a variety of countries. Further, bilingualism is one of the main concepts affecting people through various aspects, such as linguistic and personal development from childhood, healthy integration into society, or being open to different cultures (Baker and Wright, 2021; Grosjean, 2019). However, this subject has not yet been studied sufficiently worldwide and in Turkey. For this reason, conducting interdisciplinary studies on this subject is essential.

Research conducted by individuals or institutions, books and newspaper articles on this subject have contributed to raising awareness; however, the material may also contain subjective information and may not be statistically investigated from multiple perspectives. Postgraduate studies not only review the relevant

literature in a variety of languages around the world but also incorporate it into an academic identity through different analysis methods. It is observed that the scarcity of postgraduate theses in Turkey is remarkable and recently, this subject has gained a great deal of academic importance. There are some books (Güleç et al., 2021; Yıldız, Arslan and Thomas, 2021; Haznedar, 2021), book chapters (İnal and Çakır, 2021), articles and theses on bilingualism, including the preschool period in Turkey. This analysis focuses on postgraduate theses in order to gain a deeper understanding of the Turkish academy's perspective on these topics.

Moreover, some studies reviewed articles and theses on bilingualism without limiting themselves to a specific domain. Kaya et al. (2022) studied postgraduate theses and refereed articles on bilingualism and multilingualism without regard to a particular field of study, while Avcı and Kurudayıoğlu (2022) and Günaydın (2020) focused on articles on bilingualism in Turkish education. On the other hand, using a field-neutral approach, Ünyılmaz (2022) examined postgraduate theses and peer-reviewed articles on preschool bilingualism. Several studies

included bilingualism in postgraduate theses in the field of education in the preschool period (Ahi and Kildan, 2013; İlhan and Erden, 2019). There is also evidence of bilingualism in studies that collate other research on Turkish children living abroad (Büyükkız and Yıldız, 2021; Ortaköylü et al., 2020). Moreover, researchers who discussed postgraduate theses on Turkish education have also included the subject of bilingualism (Boyacı and Demirkol, 2018; Maden and Önal, 2021; Büyükkız, 2014). Studies in the field of sociolinguistics (Canbulut and Özşavli, 2019) and of speech and language pathologists (Aydın and Erçikıtı, 2021) are also present in the context of papers on bilingualism.

First, this article will explain the theoretical and conceptual background of bilingualism, and the importance of bilingualism for the preschool period will be revealed. Then, the method of the research to investigate bilingualism in the preschool period in Turkey will be explained, various tables will provide statistical analyses of data, and finally, the paper will discuss these data and make recommendations. Theses which are examined in this study are available in PDF format. Four of these theses were made abroad, and thirty were from Turkey.

This article aims to obtain meaningful data using various variables on postgraduate theses on bilingualism covering the preschool period in Turkey and to determine what is present and what is necessary for the relevant field in Turkey. Furthermore, this study has identified which studies have been conducted on which different subtopics across different branches of relevant literature in Turkey, and a picture has been presented as to which new studies will be conducted. Considering the significant number of bilingual communities in Turkey, this will provide benefits in terms of promoting integration, communication and development within the country, as well as other similar studies in Turkey and abroad.

CONCEPTUAL AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Bilingualism

Many domestic and foreign situations result in bilingualism. Bilingualism occurs when the mother tongue of the linguistic minorities living in the country meets the official language. Sometimes, using at least two languages as an official language in the country also creates social bilingualism, one of the bilingualism types. Migration out of the country due to tourism, education, work, and marriage is also one of the reasons for bilingualism. The contact of speakers of different languages may occur outside of their preferences or forced by circumstances. Externally oriented factors contributing to language interaction include politics, natural disasters, religion, culture, economy, education, and technology (Wei, 2007: 3-4). In summary, there are many reasons for bilingualism, including individual, social, and political ones.

Many branches of science focus on bilingualism: from linguistic sciences, education, sociolinguistics, and psycholinguistics; from the social sciences, sociology, anthropology, language, and literature from social sciences; from health sciences, neuroscience, speech-language therapy, psychology, and psychiatry. Thus, an interdisciplinary field of study emerged among themselves. For this reason, the definition of bilingualism becomes difficult, and the subject of who can be called bilingual includes different views. The first questions in this context are who can be considered bilingual and under what conditions. There is no consensus on what level of knowledge of two languages will define bilingualism. According to Triarhé-Herrmann (2000), all the definitions in the literature unite at the point of knowing and using more than one language (as cited in Kelağa Ahmet, 2005: 44). Another common acceptance is that bilingualism exists in every age group, every level of society, and in most countries (Grosjean, 2012: 6).

In its simplest form, bilingualism is knowing two languages (Demirel, 2012: 166; Valdés and Figueroa, 1994). In this situation, an individual knows two languages or uses two languages in society (Vardar, 1980: 93). In using an ability, bilingualism is using two languages alternately (Weinreich, 1977: 15) or using two languages functionally (Dulkadiroğlu, 1998: 85). In terms of level, it is speaking the language of the society in which one lives perfectly, as well as the mother tongue (Guzel, 2014: 63). In another definition according to level, bilingualism is learning a second language at a level close to the mother tongue (Aksan, 1982: 28). On the other hand, according to several opinions, the second language learned in bilingualism will be enough if it can provide communication rather than if that language is perfect. McKey (2005: 23) stated that bilingualism is not a language phenomenon but a language use phenomenon, and the definition of bilingualism includes four problems: level (related to proficiency), function (related to the roles a bilingual person takes in using two languages), alternation (switching between two languages) and interference (mixing between languages). In parallel with these problems, attempts have been present to determine the types of bilingualism (İmer et al., 2013: 155). Here, to draw the boundaries of the definition more clearly, "age, proficiency, the balance of the two languages, the development of the language, the context of acquisition and use" should also be taken into account (Valdés and Figueroa, 1994). In early bilingualism/child bilingualism, different classifications can be beneficial according to the age at which the second language is acquired (Rudnytska, 2022: 19).

Importance of bilingual studies covering the preschool period

The implementation of bilingualism in the preschool period and revealing its advantages are possible by

identifying the characteristics of preschool education and integrating bilingualism into it. In preschool education, children from 0 to 77 months are provided with stimulating environments that are tailored to their developmental levels and individual characteristics, which promote their physical, mental, emotional, and social development, guide them in line with their cultural values, and prepare them for primary education. Hence, it is defined as an educational process that occurs within the framework of basic education (Altay et al., 2011: 661). Language education is especially critical in learning rights and responsibilities and gaining value in society. Considering the child's bilingualism, language acquisition is complete in this period. Among the many factors affecting language education due to language acquisition in children, using preschool education institutions and bilingualism, investigations are among the many factors that affect language development in children and thus language education (Hamarat, 2019: 22-33). Since children in early childhood are extremely open to emotional, mental-cognitive change and development, bilingualism is of great importance in this period (Temel and Bekir, 2005: 65-72; Çetintaş and Yazıcı, 2016: 174). In particular, bilingualism in early childhood contributes to new language learning (Franceschini, 2002: 59; De Bleser and Paradis, 2006: 56), general school success (Küçük, 2006), and social and academic development (Kearney and Barbour, 2015). Moreover, some writers emphasized their success in communication (Kara, 1999).

Many researchers in the international and national literature emphasized that studies on preschool bilingualism are insufficient (Kiremit, 2019: 171; Lazzarino, 2017; Çetintaş and Yazıcı, 2016; Coşkun et al., 2014). Future research seeking to understand the relationship between first and second language should consider a more comprehensive range of influences on the verbal knowledge transfer of bilingual children (Grøver, Lawrence and Rydland, 2016). In the final analysis, it is necessary to check whether the appropriate standards are followed by examining and comparing the applications made in different countries (Korkut, 2014).

METHOD

Model of the research

This study is a qualitative case study. The purpose of the case study is to present results related to a specific situation. The core feature of the qualitative case study is to investigate one or more cases in depth (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2011: 77). The study was modeled as a case study, as it aimed to present the bibliometric profile of bilingual preschool studies in detail.

Scope of the research

The scope of this study consists of 34 postgraduate

theses on preschool bilingualism registered in the Turkish Higher Education Council (YÖK) database between 2003 and 2022. As a constitutional institution, YÖK is responsible for managing and overseeing the teaching of higher education institutions in Turkey, directing scientific research activities, and planning for teacher training.

Limitations

In the context of the literature, this study is limited to only relevant theses in Turkey.

Data collection tools and data collection process

The data of the study were from the YÖK database. This archive has been accessed from <https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/>. The collected data were in the study if they were related to preschool bilingualism. Then, the determined articles were categorized by the researcher using Excel according to certain variables.

Analysis of data

The data analysis has the bibliometric technique. According to this technique, scientific studies are analyzed statistically in terms of author, subject, cited author, and cited sources, which makes it possible to reveal the general structure of a particular discipline in line with the statistical results obtained. Using this technique can more or less determine the following parameters: the topics studied in a specific discipline, specific country, the authors working on these topics, and the cooperation between the authors (Zan, 2012: 15). In bibliometric analysis, performance analysis evaluates the research and publications of individuals and institutions. In the present study, the postgraduate theses on preschool bilingualism in Turkey are analyzed according to the genre, publication year, university, institute, department, discipline, subject, consultant, language, number of pages, and keywords. Thus, the gaps in this field have been identified and an opinion has been formed regarding the type of research that should be conducted on new topics.

FINDINGS

The study categorized the theses under ten bibliometric parameters (Table 1), and the necessary data for the discussion in the conclusion section is presented in different tables.

The study identified 27 master theses, six dissertations, and one medical specialty on bilingualism. At their latest, master's and doctoral theses were from 2021. Only one

Table 1. Distribution of studies on bilingualism by year.

Year	Master	Doctorate	Medical Specialty	Piece
2003	1	0	0	1
2007	0	1	0	1
2009	2	0	0	2
2012	1	1	0	2
2013	0	1	0	1
2014	2	0	0	2
2015	3	1	0	4
2016	3	0	1	4
2019	1	0	0	1
2020	5	0	0	5
2021	6	1	0	7
2022	3	1	0	5
Total	27	6	1	34

master's thesis was published in 2003 and 2019, whereas only one doctoral thesis was published in 2007 and 2013. Interestingly, the number of doctorate theses is lower than the number of master theses. No master's thesis was published in the following years and ranges: 2004-2006, 2008, 2010-2011, and 2017-2018.

Twenty-three universities have published 27 master's theses and six doctoral dissertations between 2003 and 2022 (Table 2). In one university, the thesis of specialization in medicine was made. Nineteen of the 23 universities are in Turkey, whereas four are abroad. These four theses have two master's theses and two dissertations. Thirty theses from Turkey have 25 master's theses, one medical specialty, and four doctoral theses. Compared to doctoral theses, the number of master's theses is higher in theses from Turkey, while this rate is half for the ones from abroad.

Since the subject of preschool bilingualism is common to various disciplines, many different institutes conducted these theses (Table 3). These theses from the focus period of this study are from five institutes and one medical school. While the institute of social sciences and educational sciences is the institute with the highest number of theses, one thesis is a specialization in medicine and was from the faculty of medicine. Since this distinction is unspecified in the theses made abroad, the YÖK database included it as an institute abroad.

According to the distribution of the departments of the theses, the diversity of the departments is noteworthy (Table 4). English language education and psychology is the department that conducted the highest number of theses. In total, twenty departments have been identified.

According to the topic distribution, one or more subjects were the study subject for a thesis. Most theses have their subject as education or teaching (Table 5). The theme of the three theses was not specified in the YÖK data system in their thesis tag. The matter and the corresponding number of theses on that issue are as

follows: Linguistics and Education-Teaching have three theses, Education-Teaching and Psychology have two, Linguistics and French Language-Literature have one, Linguistics & Home Economics have one, Linguistics, Education-Teaching, and Turkish Language-Literature have one, and German Language-Literature and Education-Teaching have one. Singly selected subjects are education, linguistics, psychology, English language and literature, child health and diseases, psychiatry, and sociology.

The scientific branch of the 18 theses was unspecified (Table 6). There are 12 other branches of science in total. Disciplines related to education and teaching are predominant.

Most advisors of these theses have the Assistant Professor title (Table 7). Additionally, two of the advisors held the title of doctoral faculty at the date of publication. One thesis was supervised by two professors and one associate professor.

These theses have been published in Turkish, English, German, and French (Table 8). Most were in Turkish.

Considering the page range, the theses are usually between 100-200 pages (Table 9). They are not large in volume, and they show such distribution because they are predominantly master's theses.

The following keywords are the most frequent: bilingualism, preschool education, bilingual children, preschool, language development, language acquisition, and receptive language (Table 10). The keyword table has been included along with other criteria in order to demonstrate through the frequency table whether the subject of preschool bilingualism, which is an interdisciplinary study, shows similarities or differences in content. From this standpoint, it provides a quick overview of what subjects can be studied. As can be seen, the majority of these words are very rare, with some exceptions related to preschool bilingualism. This finding suggests that preschool bilingualism studies in

Table 2. Distribution of studies on bilingualism by university.

University	Master	Doctoral theses	Medical specialty	Total
Ankara University	2	0	0	2
Bahçeşehir University	1	0	0	1
Başkent University	1	0	0	1
Çukurova University	3	0	0	3
Dicle University	1	0	0	1
Dokuz Eylül University	0	0	1	1
Eskişehir Osmangazi University	1	0	0	1
Gazi University	0	1	0	1
Gaziantep University	1	0	0	1
University of Rouen	0	1	0	1
Üsküdar University	1	0	0	1
Van Yüzüncü Yıl University	0	1	0	1
Yaşar University	1	0	0	1
Yeditepe University	1	0	0	1
Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz University	1	0	0	1
Hacettepe University	1	1	0	2
İnönü Üniversitesi University	1	0	0	1
İstanbul Üniversitesi University	1	0	0	1
Kadir Has Üniversitesi University	1	0	0	1
Kahramanmaraş Sütçü İmam University	1	0	0	1
Kocaeli University	1	0	0	1
Konya Selçuk University	1	1	0	2
Maltepe University	1	0	0	1
Necmettin University	1	0	0	1
Okan University	1	0	0	1
Pamukkale University	2	0	0	2
State University of New York at Buffalo	0	1	0	1
University of London	1	0	0	1
Total	27	6	1	34

Table 3. Distribution of studies on bilingualism by the institute.

Institute	Frequency
Institute of Health Sciences	3
Institute of Social Sciences	13
Institute of Education Sciences	11
Graduate Education Institute	2
Faculty of Medicine/Medical Specialty	1
Graduate School Abroad	4
Total	34

Turkey are at an early stage of development.

DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Ultimately, this article seeks to demonstrate the academic community's focus on bilingualism in the preschool years.

Although an increase in the number of books, articles, and theses about preschool-level bilingualism in the international and national literature could be noticed, especially in recent years, more research is necessary for Turkey and Turkish children in preschool abroad. This study examined the postgraduate theses written in the last 20 years to understand what kinds of studies are present in preschool-level bilingualism in Turkey and which studies are necessary. Most of the theses belong to 2021, and most were from Çukurova University.

In general, this study produced results in parallel with previous studies. The common point of this research is the necessity of conducting more studies on bilingualism covering the preschool period.

After evaluating theses about bilingualism in Turkey with this bibliometric study, the conclusions are as follows:

1. Considering the importance of the subject, it turns out that we are at the beginning stage in terms of the total number of theses made in the research period. This situation coincides with the international literature

Table 4. Distribution of studies on bilingualism by department.

Department	Frequency
English Language Education	4
Psychology	3
Child Development and Education	2
German Language Education	1
Language Speech Pathology	1
Child Development and Home Management	1
Education Programs and Teaching	1
French Language and Literature	1
Department of Social Sciences and Humanities	1
Department of Child Development	1
Department of Child Psychiatry and Diseases	1
Department of Elementary Education	3
Department of Foreign Language Education	2
Department of Educational Administration, Inspection, Planning, and Economics	1
Department of Basic Education	1
Department of Linguistics and Cultural Studies	1
Department of Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language	1
Department of Education	3
Linguistics Department	1
Sociology Department	1
Department not specified	3
Total	34

Table 5. Distribution of studies on bilingualism by subject.

Subject	Frequency
Education and Teaching	14
Linguistics, Education, and Teaching	3
Linguistics	2
Education and Teaching; psychology	2
Psychology	2
English Language and Literature	1
Linguistics, French Language, and Literature	1
Linguistics = Home Economics	1
Child Health and Diseases	1
Psychiatry	1
Linguistics = Education and Teaching = Turkish Language and Literature	1
German Language and Literature = Education and Teaching	1
Sociology	1
Unspecified	3
Total	34

emphasizing the lack of preschool-level bilingual studies. For this reason, it would be beneficial to publish theses on the subject with an interdisciplinary approach, especially considering national needs. Considering Turkey in particular, mother tongues such as Laz and Kurdish language, spoken in the family other than the official language, or bilingualism situations that arise as a

result of the encounter of Turkish and other languages as a result of foreign migration, are waiting to be handled within the framework of the preschool-period. Out-migration is a mass or individual migration for various reasons, and it is one of the leading causes of bilingualism. Meeting the official language at school, independent of the mother tongue in the family, can also

Table 6. Distribution of theses by discipline.

Branch of science	Frequency
Language Speech Pathology	1
Education Programs and Teaching	2
Child Development and Education	1
Department of Preschool Education	2
English Language Teaching Department	2
Department of Preschool Education	2
Developmental Psychology Department	1
Department of Linguistics and Cultural Studies	1
Department of Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language	1
Foreign Language Teaching Department	2
Sociology Department	1
Science not specified	18
Total	34

Table 7. Distribution of studies on bilingualism by advisor titles.

Advisor title	Frequency
Assistant Professor	15
Professor	12
Associate Professor	7
Doctor	2
Total	36 (1 Thesis: 2 Prof + 1 Assoc. Prof.)

Table 8. Distribution of studies on bilingualism by the language of the publication.

Publication Language	Frequency
Turkish	21
English	9
German	2
French	2
Total	34

Table 9. Distribution of studies on bilingualism by the number of pages.

Page range	Frequency
1-100 pp.	11
100-200 pp.	17
200-300 pp.	4
300-600 pp.	2
Total	34

create bilingualism within the borders of the same country. In this respect, a study on children's bilingualism should be within the context of migration and language relations. Especially in external migration, the age of the child in migration to a new country and a second language finds meaning in the types of bilingualism. While immigration from various countries, especially during and after the Syrian War, increased bilingualism in Turkey, studies on the situation of Syrian children born in Turkey, for example, are waiting to be analyzed by experts. The foremost of these is to examine the factors affecting bilingualism in terms of linguistic-cognitive development for their adaptation to later social life. In addition to the family in which Syrian bilingual children live, environmental factors, economic factors, nutrition and health are also important factors affecting their

linguistic and cognitive development.

2. Another finding is the scarcity of doctoral theses on this subject compared to master's. For this reason, there is a greater need for doctoral theses that will study this subject more deeply. Upon reviewing the keywords, it becomes apparent that there are only a few languages that are the subjects of bilingualism studies alongside Turkish.

3. Large-scale doctoral studies that will support preschool bilingualism from a sociolinguistic perspective are necessary, given the mother tongue of preschool immigrant/refugee children in Turkey as well as the interactions with Turkish children living in different language environments abroad. In the study, the theses from Turkish and foreign universities in the Turkish Higher Education Institution database were analyzed. This topic

Table 10. Distribution of keywords used in studies on bilingualism.

Keywords	Frequency	Keywords	Frequency	Keywords	Frequency
Bilingualism	21	Developmental Path	1	National Education	1
Preschool education	5	Early bilingualism	1	Nonnative bilingualism	1
Bilingual kids	4	Early Childhood	1	Parents' Language Use	1
Code-switching	4	Early Childhood Education Models	1	Peabody 1	1
Language Development	4	Early mixing	1	Peer culture	1
Language education	4	Educational program	1	Pragmatic cues	1
Preschool	3	English teaching	1	Receptive language development	1
Receptive language	3	English teaching to children	1	School culture	1
Bilingual Children	2	Executive Functions	1	School Education	1
Bilingual Education	2	Expressive language development	1	School Maturity	1
Expressive language	2	Feeling of knowing	1	School readiness	1
Language	2	Figural Creativity	1	Second Language Education	1
Second Language Acquisition	2	Foreign language	1	Social-Emotional Development	1
Simultaneous bilingualism	2	Immersion model	1	Social development	1
Adult-child interaction	1	Intentional bilingualism	1	Spatial perspective-taking	1
Artificial bilingualism	1	Interlingual interaction	1	Story Retell	1
Autism	1	Language assessment	1	Successive bilingualism	1
Behavioral Development	1	Language Competences	1	Syntax	1
Bilingual child	1	Language education and development in children	1	Teacher beliefs in early childhood	1
Bilingual education	1	Language Exposure	1	The Competition Model	1
Bilingual kindergartens	1	Language teaching	1	Theory of mind	1
Bilingual Teaching	1	Learning Decision	1	Translanguaging	1
Bilingualism in early childhood	1	Metacognitive judgments	1	Turkish-English bilingualism	1
Chinese	1	Metalinguistic	1	Turkish-French bilingualism	1
Classroom culture	1	Minority	1	Turkish immigration	1
Cognitive flexibility	1	Montessori pedagogy	1	Turkish Language Skills	1
Communication	1	Morpheme	1	Verbal Creativity	1
Communication skills	1	Mother tongue	1	Vocabulary	1
Consecutive bilinguals	1	Multiculturalism	1	Within-Group Development	1
Creativity	1	Multilingual education	1		

is only briefly discussed in the theses from abroad. However, it would be appropriate to conduct thesis studies abroad, especially considering the situation of Turkish children living abroad currently.

4. Therefore, further studies are needed to meet the linguistic and social needs of preschool bilingual Turkish children living abroad and to meet the needs of the society where Turkish is spoken. Regarding the distribution of studies on

bilingualism by the institute, since bilingualism primarily falls under the domain of social sciences and educational sciences, more theses are presented in these fields. There is however a need for further research into social sciences and

educational sciences, as well as the evaluation of the subject from other disciplines in addition to theses in health and medicine. Currently, there is no consensus on a full definition of bilingualism. It may be possible to produce a more robust definition by combining information from various fields.

5. We encountered a wide diversity in departments and science because the subject is interdisciplinary and is a common research topic of different disciplines. The theses are mostly concentrated in social sciences institutes and English language and education departments. The most studied areas are education and teaching. A single topic is selected in the theses, and more than one topic is marked for a single thesis. The following suggestions are appropriate for the expansion of the field. In light of the field of education and the table of keywords in the present study, studies can address the following contexts: Firstly, studies can examine preschool education programs and early childhood education models. It is easier to discuss the teacher, peer, and linguistic interaction in the content of the program once the model or program has been established. Other topics in this context include determining preschool teachers' thoughts on the subject, examining the interactions of bilingual children with their peers in the educational environment, phonology, semantics, morphology, and syntax use of bilingual children. Sociolinguistics, a sublevel of linguistics, aims to compare bilingual children from immigrant families and bilingual children in Turkey and abroad from various perspectives.

6. When evaluated according to the titles of the advisors, most theses were made by the doctoral faculty members. Having the subjects that require knowledge and competence, such as bilingualism, done by associate professors and professors will contribute more to the field.

7. The theses were usually in Turkish. Except for Turkish, three other languages were present. In contribution to international literature, there is a greater need for theses to be in foreign languages other than Turkish. In addition, there is a need for languages other than Turkish, especially in preschool bilingualism issues in linguistics. For example, German-Turkish; Russian-Turkish, Ukrainian-Turkish; Persian-Turkish is one of languages that can be an example. For this reason, those who will work in this field should learn languages other than English, French and German.

8. The page range of 17 of 34 theses varies between 100 and 200. This is because they are master's theses with a limited number of pages rather than doctoral theses.

9. Keywords are diverse, as the subject is an interdisciplinary subject. The most frequently used keywords are bilingualism and preschool education, and keywords with a frequency of 1 are in the majority. In this case, more work is necessary to create a keyword network. For the keyword network to be established, further interdisciplinary studies are required, which are of importance in establishing the conceptual framework of

the preschool bilingual field, as well as showing the general and common trends among them.

REFERENCES

- Ahi, B., and Kıldan, A. O. (2013). An overview of postgraduate thesis within the field of pre-school education in Turkey (2002-2011). Mehmet Akif Ersoy University Journal of Faculty of Education, 1(27): 23-46.
- Aksan, D. (1982). Her yönüyle dil, Ana Çizgileriyle Dilbilim. Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu.
- Altay, S., Bozcan, E., İra, N., and Yenil, H. (2011). Cumhuriyetin kuruluşundan günümüze milli eğitim şuralarında okul öncesi eğitimi ve bugünkü durumu. E-Journal of New World Sciences Academy, 6(1).
- Avcı, M., and Kurudayıoğlu, M. (2022). Türkçede iki dillilik çalışmalarının bibliyometrik analizi. Ana Dili Eğitimi Dergisi, 10(1): 252-265.
- Aydın O., S., and Erçikti, H. (2021). Türkiye'deki dil ve konuşma terapisi bilim dalında yapılmış lisansüstü çalışmaların çeşitli değişkenler açısından incelenmesi. Dil, Konuşma ve Yutma Araştırmaları Dergisi, 4(2): 220-242.
- Baker, C., and Wright, W. E. (2021). Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism (Bilingual Education & Bilingualism Book 127), Multilingual Matters; 7th edition.
- Boyacı, S., and Demirkol, S. (2018). Türkçe eğitimi alanında yapılan doktora tezlerinin incelenmesi. Ana Dili Eğitimi Dergisi, 6(2): 512-531.
- Büyükkız, K. K. (2014). Yabancılarla Türkçe Öğretimi Alanında Hazırlanan Lisansüstü Tezler Üzerine Bir İnceleme. Mustafa Kemal Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 11: 203-213.
- Büyükkız, K. K., and Yıldız, A. G. (2021). Araştırmalar Ne Diyor? Yurt Dışındaki Türk Çocuklarına Türkçe Öğretimine Yönelik Yapılan Lisansüstü Araştırmalarının Değerlendirilmesi. Okuma Yazma Eğitimi Araştırmaları, 9(2): 81-95.
- Canbulut, M., and Özşavlı, M. (2019). Türkiye'de Toplumdilbilim Alanında Yapılan Lisansüstü Tezlerin Çeşitli Açılardan İncelenmesi. Turkish Studies Language and Literature, 14(2): 427-440.
- Çetintaş, B. G., and Yazıcı, Z. (2016). Erken çocukluk döneminde anaokulu ve anasınıflarında iki dilli eğitim uygulamaları ve deneyimleri üzerine öğretmen görüşleri. Mediterranean Journal of Humanities, 6(2): 173-187.
- Coşkun, İ., Dündar, Ş., and Parlak, Ş. (2014). Türkiye'de özel eğitim alanında yapılmış lisansüstü tezlerin çeşitli değişkenler açısından incelenmesi. Ege Eğitim Dergisi, 2(15): 375-396.
- Costa, A. (2020). The Bilingual Brain: And What It Tells Us about the Science of Language. Penguin.
- De Bleser, R., and Paradis, M. (2006). Mehrsprachigkeit macht schlau. In Gehirn & Geist (Eds.), Spektrum der Wissenschaft, Heidelberg, 6/2006, 54-57.
- Demirel, Ö. (2012). Eğitim Sözlüğü. Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- Dulkadiroğlu, S. (1999). Almanya'da ilköğretim okullarındaki iki dilli sınıflarda Türkçe öğretimi, Yayınlanmamış. Unpublished Master Thesis. Gazi Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Ankara.
- Franceschini, R. (2002). Das Gehirn als Kulturinspiration. In J. MüllerLancé/ C.M. Riehl (Eds), Ein Kopf - viele Sprachen: Koexistenz, Interaktion und Vermittlung (pp. 45-62). Aachen: Shaker Verlag.
- Grosjean, F. (2012). Bilingualism: A short introduction. In F. Grosjean & P. Li (Eds.), The psycholinguistics of bilingualism (pp. 5-25). Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons.
- Grosjean, F. (2019). A Journey in Languages and Cultures: The Life of a Bicultural Bilingual. OUP Oxford.
- Güleç, İ., İnce, B., and Demiriz, H. N. (2021). İkidillilik ve İkidilli Çocukların Eğitimi. Kesit Yayınları.
- Günaydın, Y. (2020). İki dillilik ile ilgili yayımlanan makalelerin incelenmesi (2010-2020). International Journal of Language Academy, 8(5): 352-365.
- Güzel, A. (2014). İki dilli Türk Çocuklarına Türkçe Öğretimi (Almanya Örneği). 3rd ed. Akçağ Yayınları, Ankara.
- Hamarat, H. (2019). İkinci Dil Eğitimi Almanın Tek Dilli Okul Öncesi

- Dönem Çocukları ile İki Dilli veya İkinci Dil Eğitimi Alan Okul Öncesi Dönem Çocuklarının Alıcı ve İfade Edici Dil Gelişim Düzeylerinin Karşılaştırılması. Unpublished Master Thesis. Necmettin Erbakan Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Konya.
- Haznedar, B. (2021).** İkidillilik ve Çokdillilik. Erken Çocukluk Döneminde Birden Fazla Dil Öğrenimi. Anı Yayıncılık.
- İlhan, D. S., and Erden, T. F. (2019).** A content analysis of graduate theses concerning early childhood education in Turkey. *Turkish Journal of Education*, 8(2): 86-108.
- İmer, K., Kocaman, A., and Özsoy, A. S. (2013).** Dilbilim Sözlüğü. Boğaziçi Üniversitesi Yayınevi.
- İnal, E., and Çakır, M. (2021).** Okul Öncesi Eğitim Sürecinde İkinci Dil Edinimi. In Güleç, İ., İnce, B. & Demiriz, H. N. (Eds.), *İkidillilik ve İkidilli Çocukların Eğitimi* (pp.135-176). Kesit Yayınları.
- Kara, Ş. (1999).** Erken Yaşta Yabancı Dil Öğrenim ve Öğretimi. *Dil Dergisi*, 79.
- Kaya, M., Palas, R., and Can, F. (2022).** İki dillilik ve çok dillilik üzerine yapılan araştırmalara ilişkin kaynakça denemesi. *RumeliDE Dil ve Edebiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi*, (31): 605-634.
- Kearney, E., and Barbour, A. (2015).** Embracing, contesting ve negotiating new languages: Young children's early socialization into foreign language learning. *Linguistic and Education*, 31: 159- 173.
- Kelağa Ahmet, İ. (2005).** Yunanistan'da (Batı Trakya'da) İkidilli Eğitim Veren Azınlık Okullarında Türkçe ve Yunanca Öğrenim Gören Öğrencilerin Okuduğunu Anlama ve Yazılı Anlatım Becerilerinin Değerlendirilmesi. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation. Ankara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Ankara.
- Kiremit, R. F. (2019).** Türkiye'de Okul Öncesi Eğitimde Dil Gelişimi Alanında Yapılan Lisansüstü Tezlerin İncelenmesi. *Eskişehir Osmangazi Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 20: 159-174.
- Korkut, G. E. (2014).** Erken çocukluk dönemindeki çift dilli çocuklar için farklı ülkelerde geliştirilmiş olan eğitim modelleri. Unpublished Master Thesis. Ankara Üniversitesi, Ankara.
- Küçük, M. (2006).** Okul öncesinde yabancı dil eğitimi konusunda eğitimcilerin ve ailelerin görüşleri. Unpublished Master Thesis. Çukurova Üniversitesi.
- Lazzarino, L. (2017).** Language related outcomes of bilingual education in preschool and primary school a systematic review from 2000 to 2016. Unpublished Master thesis. Jönköping University, Sweden.
- Maden, S., and Önal, A. (2021).** Yabancı dil olarak Türkçe öğretimi ile ilgili lisansüstü tezlerin araştırma eğilimleri. *Uluslararası Eğitim Bilim ve Teknoloji Dergisi*, 7(1): 42-56.
- Marian, V. (2022).** To bilingualism and beyond! Modeling bilingualism requires looking beyond language. *Language Learning*.
- Ortaköylü, S., Satılmış, S., and Eyüp, B. (2020).** Yurt dışında yaşayan Türk çocuklarına yönelik yapılan araştırmalar üzerine bir analiz çalışması. *Ana Dili Eğitimi Dergisi*, 8(1): 87-112.
- Rudnytska, A. (2022).** Türkiye'de Türkçe-Ukraynaca Konuşan Öğrencilerin Karşılaştıkları Dil Sorunları. Unpublished Master Thesis. Eskişehir Anadolu Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü.
- Schoder, S. (2010).** Language learning in three childhood programmes in Austria, Germany and the United States. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation. West Virginia University, Morgantown.
- Temel, F., and Bekir, H. (2005).** Erken çocukluk döneminde iki dillilik [Bilingualism in early childhood]. *Türk Dili ve Edebiyatı Dergisi*, 637: 65-72.
- Ünyılmaz, B. (2022).** Türkiye'de okul öncesi dönemde iki dillilik üzerine yapılan lisansüstü tezlerin ve makalelerin incelenmesi (2007-2021). *Çocuk ve Gelişim Dergisi*, 5(10): 37-52.
- Valdés, G., and Figueroa, R. A. (1994).** Bilingualism and testing: A special case of bias. Ablex Publishing.
- Vardar, B. (1980).** Dilbilim ve Dilbilgisi Terimleri Sözlüğü, Ankara.
- Wei, L. (2007).** The bilingualism reader. 2nd ed. New York: Routledge.
- Weinreich, U. (1977).** Sprachen in Kontakt. trans. J Kohlhase, München. (orijinal adı: Languages in Contact).
- Yıldız, C., Arslan, K., and Thomas, R. (2021).** İki Dillilik ve Dil Edinimi (Almanya'da Türkçe-Almanca İki Dilli Büyüyen Çocuklar Üzerine Bir İnceleme). Pegem Akademi.

Citation: Ermağan, E. (2023). A bibliometric analysis of postgraduate theses on bilingualism covering the preschool period in Turkey. *African Educational Research Journal*, 11(1): 119-128.
