Teacher Perceptions of Inclusion in Online Instructional Practices

Sheri K. Dion, *Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Office of Education*

Abstract

The purpose of this study is to explore world language teacher perceptions of inclusion in online instructional practices. Data were collected from semi-structured interviews conducted with six world language teachers in one large public school district during the 2020-2021 academic year. Four of six teachers described practices that incorporate racial and ethnic diversity in curricula, and five teachers expressed uncertainty about how to integrate diverse gender and sexual identities in their practices. Teachers found the support of world language colleagues instrumental in adapting their online practices to be inclusive. Findings hold practical implications for teachers and teacher educators who aim to develop inclusive instructional practices in online settings.

Introduction

Recent studies call for inclusion in world language instructional practices (Cashman & Trujillo, 2018; Freeman & Li, 2019; Knisely, 2020; Knisely & Paiz, 2021). Nevertheless, little research has investigated how world language teachers adapt their practices to be inclusive in online formats. Inclusion in this context can be defined as teaching methodologies and instructional practices that address and welcome variation in student identities, abilities, and experiences. The development of inclusive instructional practices directly aligns with the ACTFL proficiency-based, communicative principles of instruction (2020a, 2020b). Further, the proficiency benchmarks outlined in the "Can-Do Statements" (National Council of State Supervisors for Foreign Languages and ACTFL [NCSSFL-ACTFL], 2017) clarify students' capacity to interpret and negotiate meaning across global contexts and to engage with complexities in pluricultural identities.

The purpose of this study was to examine world language teachers' perceptions of inclusion in their online instructional practices during the first year of the COVID-19 pandemic, including how their practices were different from face-to-face instruction. Six world language teachers in one large public K-12 district each participated in one semi-structured interview during the 2020-2021 academic year (AY). The overarching concern of this qualitative research study is to explore how world language teachers establish inclusive pedagogies. The following research question guided this inquiry: How are teachers' online instructional practices and methodologies inclusive of diversity in race, ethnicity, gender, and sexual identities?

Conceptual framework

This research was conducted through the lens of critical consciousness, defined as the willingness and capacity to see how power and privilege work to systematically advantage some while simultaneously disadvantaging others (Radd & Kramer, 2016). As teachers' ability to enact pedagogical change assumes their capacity to develop a critical consciousness about their own identities and those of the languages and cultures they teach (Glynn, 2012), the development of critical consciousness is important in its relation to inequities and oppression that can stem from socially constructed ideologies.

World language instructional practices that address the development of critical consciousness can foster critical reflection on and engagement with inclusion in curricula. Broadly, inclusion can be interpreted as a universal human right, as it assumes more than representation in materials and instructional practices. Inclusion can also signify sociocultural value systems, equal access, the eradication of discrimination, and the removal of structural barriers. Complex conceptions of inclusion in world language curricula may stimulate interrogations of language and power, which involve how teachers critically reflect on inequities, how they are sustained, and how they may be perpetuated in social settings (Collins, 2019). Recognizing that the development of critically conscious practices is a complex process, an extended goal of this study is to attend to how race, ethnicity, gender, and sexuality are addressed. An additional goal is to examine areas where educators may decide to remain silent and why.

Review of the literature

World language scholars reiterate the importance of adopting practices in language pedagogy that are inclusive and that develop teachers' critical consciousness (Baggett, 2020; Prieto-Bay, 2007). Recent scholarship suggests that to establish inclusive pedagogies, teachers ought to reconceptualize certain pedagogical choices about language education, such as materials and instructional approaches in teachers' practices (Anya, 2020; Cashman & Trujillo, 2018; Knisely, 2020; Knisely, 2021; Knisely & Paiz, 2021; Scott & Edwards, 2019).

As they develop inclusive pedagogies, educators may benefit from critical reflection on their own identities, power, and privilege, including the roles they can assume for diverse student populations (Baggett & Simmons, 2017). Recent studies emphasize a need for sustained attention toward fostering inclusive, supportive teaching environments that actively challenge coercive power relations and support student identities (Liao & Maddamsetti, 2019; Wedin, 2020). Teachers may aim to affirm student identities and offer spaces for identity negotiation, which are aspects that are particularly important for students who are at risk of marginalization (Baggett, 2018; Wassell et al., 2019).

Related to teachers' adoption of critical perspectives, studies (Abreu, 2016; Watson, 2013) suggest that Afro-Hispanic diversity is often missing from world language pedago-

gies. Abreu (2106) investigated perspectives of 241 students and nine instructors of Spanish as the language of instruction through surveys with both closed and open-ended questions. Results indicated that Spanish students had relatively narrow perceptions of cultural, ethnic, and racial diversity among Spanish-speaking populations. Although teachers communicated knowledge of diversity within the Spanish-speaking world, their knowledge did not appear to be communicated with students (Abreu, 2016). This finding suggests that world language educators may benefit from making sustained efforts in their instructional practices to help students develop critical consciousness and an awareness of diversity.

Next, research in language education advocate for a critical interrogation of the role of gender and sexual identities in world language education, where trans, non-binary, gender non-conforming (TGNC), bisexual, and queer identities tend to be invisible and erased (Cashman & Trujillo, 2018; Coda, 2017; Knisely, 2020, 2021; Knisely & Paiz, 2021; Paiz, 2020). World language materials often depict normative views, specifically heteronormativity, or privileging heterosexual identities (Cahnmann-Taylor & Coda 2018), and cisnormativity, which assumes that individuals identify with the gender they were assigned at birth (Knisely, 2021). To this point, materials ought to be carefully selected with the goal of equitable and inclusive representation of LGBTQ+ individuals and communities in World Language curriculum and instructional practices. Alongside practices that adequately represent queer identities, teachers and teacher educators should also demonstrate a commitment to challenging and eliminating harmful discourse (Cashman and Trujillo, 2018).

In practices designed to reflect ACTFL's (2020a, 2020b) proficiency-based, communicative principles of instruction and the "Can-Do Statements" (NCCSFL-ACTFL, 2017) for intercultural competence, teachers may also derive value from weighing the nature and meaning of inclusive pedagogies in their instructional practices. Recent research advances the imperative of a critical approach to world language education that develops students' critical consciousness by incorporating social justice issues and different historical and political perspectives (Glynn & Spenader, 2020; Randolph & Johnson, 2017; Wassell et al., 2019). Examples that can promote an awareness of differences and inequities include critical content-based instruction that interweaves content, language, and critical thinking (Glynn & Spenader, 2020) and professional support to the development of social justice approaches for teachers and teacher educators (Wassell et al., 2019). Teachers' decisions about the components they include involve developing strategies, working in collaboration with other teachers and communities, and reflecting further on critical approaches to world language education (Randolph & Johnson, 2017).

Further, the growth in online world language programs and the shift to online instruction during the COVID-19 pandemic have resulted in the need for teachers to reassess their practices across the curriculum (Jin et al., 2021; King Ramírez, 2021). In turn, a resulting greater need for online learning fosters opportunities for world language teachers to continue to build virtual skills and to adapt their practices. Research that examines various strategies that world language educators may employ in online settings suggests that creative collaboration on projects, shared knowledge, and a nurturing space for professional reflection and growth can sustain growth in instructional practices (Gregersen et al., 2021; Knight, 2020; Wesely, 2013).

Methods

Participants

Teachers of any world language who were teaching at the middle or high school level in one large public school district in the northeastern United States were invited to partic-

ipate. Six teachers from three schools in the district expressed an interest in participating and were included in the study. World language instructor participants had an average of 20 years of teaching experience. All teachers reported learning the languages they instruct at least in part during their K-16 educational experiences. Five teachers had one or more experiences living abroad where the languages taught are spoken, from one semester to greater than a decade. Two teachers regularly visit immediate and extended family members living in French and Spanish-speaking countries, and two instructors were raised speaking the languages taught in their households. Pseudonyms are employed for each participant. Table 1 presents a summary of participant characteristics, degrees, and number of years teaching.

Table 1
Summary of teacher characteristics by institution, roles, and experience (n = 6)

Participant	School type	Language taught	Highest degree	# of years teaching
June	High school	French	Bachelors	30
Kathryn	High school	French	Masters	17
Genevieve	Middle school	French	Masters	23
Rachel	High school	Spanish	Bachelors	27
Jason	High School	Latin	Bachelors	7
Olivia	High School	French	Masters	20

June holds a bachelor's degree and has been teaching French for over 30 years. She began taking French courses in junior high and "just loved it." June is a teacher who believes that her students' identities are central to her instructional approach. She offers, "I don't want any of them feeling that their identity is something to be covered up and hidden." Viewing language teaching as deeply embedded in cultures and the rich histories of local and global communities, she puts her beliefs into practice by designing student conversational opportunities to discuss experiences living in other countries, family traditions, holidays, and inviting Francophone speakers to her classes, both in person and online.

Kathryn always loved French classes as a student, but she did not set out to become a French teacher. She explains, "Originally, I thought I would do international business." After her first undergraduate economics class, however, she decided, "This is not for me." She holds a master's degree and has been teaching for 17 years. In her instructional practices, Kathryn describes the importance of student options to select from reading materials provided where they can "see themselves" and she finds it important "to incorporate a variety of authors and perspectives, [so that] the materials are not all representing just one nationality or one group."

Genevieve has taught French for 23 years. She has also extensively studied Spanish and German. She holds a master's degree and has a field experience partnership with a local university that hosts international teaching scholars from the Fulbright Program (Bureau of Educational and Cultural Affairs, n.d.). In the four years prior to the pandemic, Genevieve has hosted Fulbright teacher scholars for six weeks each, with participants from the Ivory Coast, Egypt, and the West Bank. She and her students enjoy hearing the scholars "talk about their languages, their own lives, and definitely the global communities."

Rachel began learning Spanish as an elementary school student while living in Venezuela with her family for over a year. Her parents lived and worked in Caracas while she attended a private school for international students. She found the Venezuelan schools "very, very challenging" where speaking Spanish was "about learning but also survival." She holds a bachelor's degree and has been teaching Spanish for 27 years. In her online classes, she has created a virtual library for her students that integrates diverse identities, interests, and backgrounds. Rachel continued to use the virtual library when online instruction ended.

Jason began taking Latin classes in high school and holds a bachelor's degree in Classics. He has been teaching for seven years and discussed how he likes to "give students some sort of freedom, whether artistically or about a topic." He keeps his students at the forefront of his curriculum design and often includes modern perspectives on Greek mythology as part of his instructional repertoire.

Olivia began taking French classes in middle school, holds a master's degree, and has been teaching French for more than 20 years. In addition to French, Olivia also teaches English to high school students who have recently immigrated to the U.S. In her instructional practices, she aims to personalize student activities with the support of curricular materials and individual journals that she was able to purchase as a grant recipient during the pandemic. She guides her students to further development of critical consciousness through student reflection on their cultural and linguistic identities and follow-up activities during which students discuss their identities with their classmates.

Research design and data sources

This study employs semi-structured participant interviews to address the research question: How are teachers' online instructional practices and methodologies inclusive of diversity in race, ethnicity, gender, and sexual identities? Data were collected during teachers' online instruction between December 2020 and April 2021. Interviews were conducted virtually and were audio recorded, transcribed, and stored in a password protected folder. The semi-structured interview guide is included in the Appendix, see pp. 23-24. Transcripts and resulting themes were shared with participants to determine accuracy and afforded opportunities to weigh in qualitative interpretations of findings (Creswell & Creswell, 2018). Teachers at the three institutions taught their classes remotely from March 2020 to April 2021. Six interviews were conducted virtually for a total of 260 minutes, with an average of roughly 43 minutes per interview.

To address the research question, participants were asked about their teaching experiences, how inclusive pedagogies are integrated in their online teaching practices and methodology, and how they draw upon students' identities and experiences in their instructional practices. Participants were also asked to bring curriculum artifacts to their interviews and told the stories of the artifacts from a pedagogical perspective. This study was supported and approved by the author's home institutional review board (IRB) and administrators at each institution.

Research setting

Participants in this study teach world language classes in a large, public school district located in the northeastern United States that is situated in a community that serves as an international refugee resettlement area. In the 2020-21 academic year (AY), the high school where Kathryn and Jason teach had a student body of approximately 1,650 students. Thirty-five percent of students identified as non-White, and greater than 40% of students are economically disadvantaged, based on measures of free and reduced-price lunch (National Center for Education Statistics [NCES], 2021). June, Rachel, and Olivia teach at a high school with approximately 1,800 students enrolled, a 41% non-White student body, and over 34% of students who qualify for free and reduced-price lunch (NCES, 2021). Genevieve teaches at a middle school (Grades 6-8) where roughly 1,100 students are enrolled, 45% of students are non-White, and 45.5% of students are economically disadvantaged (NCES, 2021).

In the adapted online teaching format, teachers delivered online instruction Monday through Thursday mornings from 7:20 am to 11:44 am, and Friday mornings were exclusively dedicated to meeting virtually as a department. Within the Friday morning collaborative space, teachers shared ideas about curriculum, instructional practices, and how their practices could be adapted in online settings. Teachers used this time to engage in discussions of how they understand and incorporate cultural diversity, how their online practices could be inclusive, and in what ways they might address challenges within this process.

A rather unique aspect of world language curricula at these public institutions is teachers' self-selection of all materials for their courses. Teachers do not adopt textbooks in their instructional practices and are afforded the curricular freedom to select their own materials, based on availability and teacher preferences. June described this feature as an opportunity to form a curriculum that is "as current as it can be," and as Jason states, he is "always sort of trying new things." Teachers' approach to selecting materials is varied. For example, Jason adopted an online text for his course and integrates additional readings, resources, and projects based on his students' preferences. Olivia develops all of her own materials, and Rachel uses the Somos Curriculum (2019) for her Spanish classes, which she supplements with projects, an online library, and media resources.

Data analysis

Data analysis began with the transcription of data and coding processes that occurred in three phases. First-round initial coding placed an emphasis on the actual spoken words of participants and was used to explore initial relevant themes (Saldaña, 2016). Second-round focused coding consisted of re-coding the transcript to develop guiding themes and involved searching for the most frequent codes to develop the most prominent categories (Saldaña, 2016). Third-round axial coding was used to thematically organize dominant and less-dominant codes and to identify different dimensions in constructs (Saldaña, 2016), including their relevance to the guiding question. The first round of coding resulted in 26 identified themes, which were organized thematically, narrowed to five themes in the second round, and resulted in three themes in the third round.

Photographs of curricular artifacts added depth to participants' descriptions of their practices and methodologies. Artifacts were analyzed for the context in which they were created, the audience for which they are intended, their purpose, their historical significance, and their connection(s) with the guiding question. Throughout the analytic phase, a dual focus was placed on the language teachers' descriptions of practices themselves and the

resources drawn upon in language instruction. Multiple strategies such as analytic memos, member checks, and interview transcripts shared with participants were used to mitigate researcher biases.

Findings

Three major themes resulted from the coding process: teachers' instructional practices that address racial and ethnic diversity, uncertainty about how to integrate diversity in gender and sexuality in curricula, and the support of world language colleagues in inclusive online practices. Teachers' autonomy to select and develop the curricular materials they preferred appeared to engender engagement with a range of sociodemographic characteristics, current events, and social identities in teachers' instructional practices.

Racial and ethnic diversity in teachers' instructional practices

There is evidence that four teacher participants incorporate materials in their online instructional practices that present diverse racial and ethnic identities and espouse beliefs of critical consciousness. For example, three teachers developed online literary and media resource libraries that incorporate diversity in race and ethnicity. Prior to remote learning, teachers' online libraries did not exist. Resources include discussions of Black Lives Matter, immigration in domestic and international contexts, human rights, and race-based discrimination. In her practices, Rachel draws upon over 100 books and articles organized around specific topics and themes. She creates units organized around guiding questions such as, "What does it feel like to be an immigrant, being pulled in multiple ways?" She describes one story from Spanish IV: "It is about a girl from the Dominican Republic who not only is she from D.R., but she's also experiencing mental issues as a teenager. And it goes through her issues with anxiety and emotional distress."

Kathryn believes that her online bookshelf is one of the best tools that can foster awareness of diversity and support the development of critical consciousness. She emphasizes the importance of "continuing to build [awareness] and being conscious about the choices of books that we're offering our students, making sure they are representing diverse voices and diverse subjects." At least twice a week, students in her French classes select an online text and read for 10-15 minutes from any text based upon their preference. Students then bookmark the text and fill out a reading log once they have completed the weekly task. This activity, as Kathryn describes, "involves the roots of where [students] came from and the experiences they've had."

In addition to online libraries, teachers draw upon several literary sources to interweave discussions of colonialism, language, culture, and identity in their practices. For example, participants incorporate films based upon stories of im/migration, such as *Under the Same Moon* (Riggen, 2007). Students in Rachel's Spanish IV classes read the novel *The House on Mango Street* (Cisneros, 1984), engage in debates, and write essays on poverty, gender, and immigration. At the Spanish III level, Rachel introduces a television series that was produced in Argentina called *Go! Live Your Way* (Mellino, 2019) as one way to address equitable representation of sexual identities. Kathryn's French classes explore recycled art created by Ivorian artist Koffi (Brignoli, 2019) to engage in conversation about sustainability, health effects, and social class. June draws upon Prévert's poem, "Le Cancre" (1945) in her French IV classes to explore themes of rebellion against oppression, humiliation, and individual freedom.

Olivia describes how racial and ethnic representation in her curriculum relies, in part, upon the diverse sociodemographic characteristics of her world language students. Olivia states, "There are very few students who have one race or ethnicity. More likely there are

three or four backgrounds based on their parents having two ethnicities or races. So we have this long list when they say, '*Je suis*' [I am].' June offers, "Race definitely comes up in a lot of ways," such as with the incorporation of Francophone literature featuring African and Vietnamese writers, global news articles used to discuss current events, and the study of art. While engagement in local communities and cross-curricular connections were primarily restricted by the pandemic, participants had good intentions of maintaining institutional and local collaborations to integrate diversity and develop critical consciousness once in person instruction resumed.

Uncertainty about diverse gender and sexual identities

A second theme that resulted from data analysis was teachers' uncertainty about how to integrate diversity in gender and sexual identities in their instructional practices. When asked to describe how diversity in gender and sexual identities was represented in their practices, teachers were pressed to articulate a curricular example. Five of six teachers expressed an interest in greater engagement with diverse gender and sexual identities in their instructional practices. As Genevieve describes, "Sexuality does not come up very often." Although evidence was limited, Jason offered an example of a senior Latin student who designed a graphic novel project to illustrate variation in gender and sexual identities in Greek mythology as part of an independent study.

The integration of diverse gender and sexual identities as periphery in world language curricula was consistent across teacher participants in this study. Rachel describes how a student contacted her via email at the beginning of the year, stating "This is what I was born as. This is what I go by, and that was it. There was no big deal, nothing after that." Olivia offers an example of how uncertainty manifests in her classes: "I do have students that I figure out don't want to be '*il*' *or 'elle,'* [he or she], so I just call them by their name." June communicates her desire for increased engagement with gender and sexual identities: "There have been times when I've wanted to get more heavily into certain issues, using certain pieces of literature to really talk about homosexual unions and that sort of thing, [but] I just haven't gone there."

To the point of uncertainty, there were many reasons teachers articulated as underlying factors that sustained a hesitancy towards a more proactive approach to integrating diversity in gender and sexual identities. Olivia suggests that at the introductory levels, world language curriculum is already overloaded. She states, "I don't tend to reach out and look for anything that would have that information because I'm in, well, about a third grade level." On the other hand, June was confident in her students' interest in exploring gender and sexual identities at any level. While she wanted to use literary pieces to "get more heavily into certain issues," she feared having to answer to parents. June states, "I wish that I felt more comfortable doing that, but I don't feel safe doing it, which is sad."

As Kathryn describes, "We need to be more cognizant of the use of gender identity and the French pronouns, [and] to me, it should be a natural introduction of, these are other options in terms of language use." Genevieve and Rachel prefer to offer non-binary and gender-neutral pronoun options to students in their French and Spanish classes and lead their students through discussions of pronoun development in non-U.S. countries. This is what Genevieve describes as "a work in progress." Recognizing that inclusive pronouns differ by languages and cultures and that many languages have binary gender grammatical structures, scholars recommend creating and implementing materials that were created by TGNC individuals and communities, using circumlocution to avoid binary structures, and careful attention to the use of pronouns (e.g., they) to avoid specifying gender (Knisely, 2020; Knisely & Paiz, 2021).

Support of World Language colleagues around inclusive, online practices

A relatively unique aspect of the virtual schedules that were adopted during 2020-21 AY was the space the district created for teachers to consistently collaborate virtually on Friday mornings to share ideas about online instructional practices and inclusion. As Department Chairs, Kathryn and June encouraged their World Language colleagues to have thoughtful conversations within the collaborative space about how diversity and inclusion could be understood and addressed in online instructional practices, including how they can guide students in the development of critical consciousness.

Olivia spoke further about how her ability to develop inclusive online practices was supported by the added professional learning community (PLC) time during the pandemic. As she describes, "Every Friday in PLCs, we would share our trials, tribulations, and our successes." Olivia found these conversations useful to her development of performance assessments based upon authentic materials, which she used to address diversity in brochures, blogs, websites, and magazines that she designed for her remote classes during the pandemic. Since the transition to online teaching, Jason developed online newsletters and discussed how to address inclusion in student projects with Latin colleagues in the district.

As part of this professional time, teachers discussed useful strategies for inclusive teaching across online platforms. For example, June, Kathryn, and Rachel shared their experiences drawing upon a broader range of racial and ethnic identities with the support of online libraries and authentic news and media resources. Teachers reflected on weekly discussion topics such as, "What does it means to be culturally sensitive in online teaching?" (and) "How can we help students develop cultural awareness?" Genevieve shared how she invited former students located in non-U.S. countries to visit her classes virtually. Over the course of year, she hosted three virtual visitors from France, the Ivory Coast, and Canada. Her students asked questions about the school communities and what learning was like in different educational contexts.

Reflecting upon these experiences, Olivia states, "It's been magical." June offers, "Working with each other, that's not time that we've ever really had before." In broader online professional communities, teachers engaged with other world language educators in social media groups. For example, Rachel is an active member of several social media communities, such as Spanish Teachers in the U.S. (https://www.facebook.com/groups/stitus/about/), Tech for World Language Teachers (https://www.facebook.com/tech4worldlanguageteachers/), and Diversify your Bookshelf (https://m.facebook.com/groups/diversifyyourbookshelf/). For each of these resources, diversity and inclusion are prominent topics.

Discussion

Findings from this study suggest that several participants (*n*=4) critically engage with racial and ethnic diversity in world language curricula. Four of six participants offer examples of engagement with Black and other non-White identities in world language materials. To the topic of normalizing heterosexuality and the invisibility of queer people in language materials and curricula (Cashman & Trujillo, 2018; Knisely, 2021; Knisely & Paiz, 2021), there was limited evidence of diversity in gender and sexual identities in the data beyond discussions of personal pronouns, an Argentine television series depicting non-heteronormative identities, and a senior graphic novel project on Greek mythology.

However, there is a growing body of research related to gender and sexual diversity among queer scholars, applied linguists, and world language educators. To address how teachers explore inclusive practices that engage with identities and communities in mate-

rials and instructional practices, Knisely and Paiz (2021) recommend queer-inquiry based pedagogies (QIBPs). QIBPs aim to help students "trouble all forms of normativity and to engage with LGBTQ+ identities and topics in linguistically, culturally, and rhetorically appropriate ways" (Knisely & Paiz, 2021, p. 29). To help support teachers, resources have been developed to support critical reflection, including a toolkit with a self-inventory to examine instructional practices, positionality, and knowledge (Knisely, 2020; Knisely & Paiz, 2021).

Five of the six teacher participants expressed a sense of uncertainty about how to approach diversity in gender and sexual identities in their practices, even though they were interested in integrating diverse identities in their curricula. Teachers in this study recognized that TGNC students who participate in world language courses may find it difficult to connect with curricula that depict gender-binary and heteronormative patterns in materials and practices (Cashman & Trujillo, 2018; Knisely, 2021; Knisely & Paiz, 2021). To this end, world language educators ought to critically consider how their instructional approaches may, or may not, serve to sustain normative views of gender, sexuality, and race (Cahnmann-Taylor & Coda, 2018).

This study offers evidence of world language teacher collaboration during weekly meetings was a virtual space that nurtured professional growth, reflection, and engagement with colleagues (Gregersen et al., 2021; Knight, 2020; Wesely, 2013). Additionally, the Friday PLC time was unique to virtual teaching during the 2020-2021 academic year; it did not exist prior to or after that timeline in this district. Teachers' weekly time served to develop online libraries with colleagues and to engage in conversations about cultural awareness. This finding also suggests that teachers in this study were interested in elevating their own and students' critical consciousness about the languages and cultures that were taught (Glynn, 2012).

Given that culturally diverse content is of great interest to developing engaging questions about issues in the world and developing critical consciousness (Tedick & Cammarado, 2012), findings offer evidence that teachers' online instructional practices can engage with racial and ethnic diversity in products, practices, and perspectives (ACTFL, 2016) while also connecting with student identities and interests. Moreover, an intentional focus on the interrogation of issues such as social inequities in world language teachers' pedagogies may further support the development of critical consciousness among both students and educators.

Regarding the development of critical consciousness, world language teachers might focus on nurturing students' critical reflection on developing their own voices and providing space to celebrate in their diverse experiences and identities. As examples, June and Kathryn described their efforts to develop students' critical consciousness with discussions of colonialism and international oppression in their French classes. Teachers may encourage students to write about their own linguistic and cultural histories (Lippi-Green, 2012) and to share their experiences learning languages among students and fellow educators.

Significance of Research

This research advances two practical implications for world language teaching and teacher education. First, this study is important for teachers and educational stakeholders as they consider diversified approaches to inclusive pedagogies in online learning formats. Teachers unanimously described their weekly online meetings as unequivocal professional time that promoted individual and collective reflection on how their practices could be inclusive in online settings. To this point, they described their curricular freedom and the ability to select or develop the materials they preferred as a considerable benefit to inclu-

sive instructional practices. Future studies that explore professional collaboration in online spaces and teachers' curricular freedom to select course materials are highly recommended.

Finally, teachers' uncertainty about diversity in gender and sexual identities and interest in affirming and integrating all students' identities in their practices point to a need for more professional opportunities for educators. These opportunities ought to help teachers develop strategies that are sensitive to difference in student identities, experiences, and abilities in their practices. With respect to teachers' uncertainty of how to address diversity in gender and sexual identities, schools and districts ought to provide resources to help teachers adapt curricula, design and select materials that affirm student identities, and offer ongoing professional support, such as workshops in virtual and in-person settings. In closing, these findings will inform and support educators and teacher educators as they engage with inclusion in language education.

References

Abreu, L. (2016). Awareness of Racial Diversity in the Spanish-Speaking World Among L2 Spanish Speakers. *Foreign Language Annals, 49,* 1, 180-190.

ACTFL (2016). World-Readiness Standards for Learning Languages. https://www.actfl.org/sites/default/files/publications/standards/World-ReadinessStandardsforLearningLanguages.pdf

ACTFL. (2020a). Guiding principles for language learning. https://www.actfl.org/resources/guiding-principles-language-learning

ACTFL (2020b). ACTFL assessment of performance toward proficiency in language. https://www.actfl.org/assessment-research-and-development/actfl-assessments/actfl-k-12-assessments/actfl-assessment-performance-toward-proficiency-languages

Anya, U. (2020). African Americans in World Language Study: The Forged Path and Future Directions. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics, 40,* 97-112.

Baggett, H. C., & Simmons, C. G. (2017). A Case Study of White Teacher Candidates' Conceptions of Racial Profiling in Educational Contexts. *Journal of Education, 197,* 1, 41-51.

Baggett, H. C. (2018). We're Here to Learn to Speak French: An Exploration of World Language Teachers' Beliefs About Students and Teaching. *Educational Studies, 5,* 6, 641-667.

Baggett, H. C. (2020). Relevance, Representation, and Responsibility: Exploring World Language Teachers' Critical Consciousness and Pedagogies. *L2 Journal*, *12*, 2, 34-54.

Brignoli, A. (2019, 11 June). Mounou Désiré Koffi, l'artiste déconnecté. *Le Monde*. https://www.lemonde.fr/afrique/article/2019/06/11/mounou-desire-koffi-l-artiste-deconnecte_5474828_3212.html

Bureau of Educational and Cultural Affairs. (n.d.). The Fulbright Program. https://eca.state.gov/fulbright

Cahnmann-Taylor, M., & Coda, J. (2018). Troubling normal in world language education. *Critical Inquiry in Language Studies, 16,* 2, 107-129.

Cashman, H. R., & Trujillo, J. A. (2018). Queering Spanish as a Heritage Language: Contesting heteronormativity in the SHL curriculum and making LGBTQ identities visible in the SHL classroom. In Potowski, K. (Ed.), *The Routledge Handbook of Spanish as a Heritage Language*, (pp. 124-143). Routledge.

Cisneros, S. (1984). *The House on Mango Street*. Arte Público.

Coda, J. (2017). Disrupting Standard Practice: Queering the World Language Classroom. *Dimension,* 74-89.

Collins, P. H. (2019). *Intersectionality as critical social theory.* Duke University.

Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches.* Sage.

Diversify Your Bookshelf [Username]. (n.d.). *Home* [Facebook page]. Facebook. Retrieved May 31, 2022 from https://m.facebook.com/groups/diversifyyourbookshelf/

Freeman, K., & Li, M. (2019). "We Are a Ghost in the Class": First Year International Students' Experiences in the Global Contact Zone. *Journal of International Students*, 9, 1, 19-38.

Glynn, C. L. (2012). *The role of ethnicity in the foreign language classroom: Perspectives on African-American students' enrollment, experiences, and identity* (Doctoral dissertation). University of Minnesota.

Glynn, C., & Spenader, A. (2020). *Critical Content Based Instruction for the Transformation of World Language Classrooms. L2 Journal*, 12, 2, 72-93. University of California.

Gregersen, T., Mercer, S., & MacIntyre, P.D. (2021). Language teacher perspectives on stress and coping. *Foreign Language Annals*, 54, 1, 1-19.

Jin, L., Xu, Y., Deifell, E., & Angus, K. (2021). Emergency Remote Language Teaching and U.S.-Based College-Level World Language Educators' Intention to Adopt Online Teaching in Postpandemic Times. *Modern Language Journal, 105,* 2, 412-434.

King Ramírez, C., Lafford, B. A., & Wermers, J. E. (2021). *Online world language instruction training and assessment: An ecological approach.* Georgetown University.

Knight, S. W. P. (2020). Establishing professional online communities for world language educators. *Foreign Language Annals, 53,* 2, 298-305.

Knisely, K. (2020). Subverting the culturally unreadable: Understanding the self-positioning of non-binary speakers of French. *The French Review, 94*, 2, 149-168.

Knisely, K. A. (2021). L/G/B and T: Queer Excisions, Entailments, and Intersections. In J. M. Paiz & J. E. Coda (Eds.), *Intersectional Perspectives on LGBTQ+ Issues in Modern Language Teaching and Learning* (pp. 153-181). Palgrave Macmillan.

Knisely, K. A., & Paiz, J. M. (2021). Bringing trans, non-binary, and queer understandings to bear in language education. *Critical Multilingualism Studies, 9*, 1, 23–45.

Liao, W., & Maddamsetti, J. (2019). Transnationality and Teacher Educator Identity Development: A Collaborative Autoethnographic Study. *Action in Teacher Education, 41*, 4, 287-306.

Lippi-Green, R. (2012). *English with an accent: Language, ideology, and discrimination in the United States*. Routledge.

Mellino, S. (Producer). (2019). *Go! Live Your Way* [Television broadcast]. Onceloops Kuarzo Entertainment.

National Center for Education Statistics. (2021). Search for Schools. https://nces.ed.gov/globallocator/

National Council of State Supervisors for Languages, American Council on the Teaching of Foreign Languages. (2017). Can-Do Statements. https://www.actfl.org/publications/guidelines-and-manuals/ncssfl-actfl-can-do-statements

Paiz, J. M. (2020). *Queering the English language classroom: A practical guide for teachers*. Equinox.

Prévert, J. (1945). Le Cancre. https://www.ilini.com/blog/learning-french/french-poem-le-cancre/

Prieto-Bay, A. M. (2007). Revisiting assumptions about foreign language instruction in diverse student settings. NECTFL *Review*, 61, 21–35.

Radd, S. I., & Kramer, B. H. (2016). Dis Eased: Critical Consciousness in School Leadership for Social Justice. *Journal of School Leadership, 26,* 4, 580-606.

Randolph, L. J., Jr., & Johnson, S. M. (2017). Social Justice in the Language Classroom: A Call to Action. *Dimension, 100*, 99-121.

Riggen, P. (Director). (2007). *Under the Same Moon* [Film]. Fox Searchlight Pictures.

Saldaña, J. (2016). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers*. Sage.

Scott, S., & Edwards, W. (2019). *Disability and world language learning: Inclusive teaching for diverse learners*. Lanham, M.D.: Rowman & Littlefield.

Somos Curriculum (2019). The Somos Curriculum: Where Language and Culture Collide. Retrieved May 31, 2022 from https://www.somoscurriculum.com/

Spanish Teachers in the U.S. [Username]. (n.d.). *Home* [Facebook page]. Facebook. Retrieved May 31, 2022 from https://www.facebook.com/groups/stitus/about/

Tech for World Language Teachers [Username]. (n.d.) *Home* [Facebook page]. Facebook. Retrieved May 31, 2022 from https://www.facebook.com/tech4worldlanguageteachers/

Tedick, D. J., & Cammarata, L. (2012). Content and Language Integration in K-12 Contexts: Student Outcomes, Teacher Practices, and Stakeholder Perspectives. *Foreign Language Annals, 45,* 1, 28-53.

Wassell, B. A., Wesely, P., & Glynn, C. (2019). Agents of change: Reimagining curriculum and instruction in world language classrooms through social justice education. *Journal of Curriculum and Pedagogy*, *16*, 3, 263-284.

Watson, S. (2013). Teaching Afro-Latin American culture through film: Raíces de mi corazón and Cuba's Guerrita de los Negros. *Hispania, 96,* 1, 71-80.

Wedin, A. (2020). Negotiating identities through multilingual writing: Local school policy that opens up spaces for students' diverse languages. *Linguistics and Education*, *55*, 1-8.

Wesely, P. M. (2013). Investigating the Community of Practice of World Language Educators on Twitter. *Journal of Teacher Education, 64,* 4, 305-318.

Appendix

Interview guide for teacher participants

1. I have a few biographical questions to start:
   (a) Which languages do you teach (and speak)?
   (b) How did you learn this/these language(s)?
   (c) What is a typical remote instruction day in this school?
   (d) Have you taught in remote settings prior to the COVID-19 pandemic?

Module 1: Inclusion in Curriculum and Communities
2. How do you integrate various forms of student diversity into your curriculum?
   (a) In what ways do your assignments draw upon students' unique backgrounds?
   (b) How is diversity integrated in readings or other curricular materials (films, texts, and online sources)?
3. Do you draw on activities in the local community as resources in your teaching (e.g., events, guest speakers, plays, films, etc.)?
   (a) In what ways has teaching online altered your engagement with local communities?

(b) Has remote teaching fostered any cross-curricular connections within the school community?

Module 2: Gender, Race, and Inclusive Classrooms

4. Students seem interested in discussing is (a) race and ethnicity and (b) gender and sexual identities. How are these identities woven into your classes?
5. (a) Is there a memorable example of differences in race and ethnicity that has occurred in your classes?
    (b) Can you tell me about a time when diversity in gender and sexual identities was integrated in materials?
    (c) Are there any connections with race or gender that students make to media or literature that you discuss in your classes?
    (d) Are there current or community events that relate to these questions?
    (e) None of us have the time to do all that we want to do. Is there anything you have thought about modifying in your teaching that would make your materials or practices inclusive of a range of race, ethnicity, and non-heteronormative views?

Module 3: Student Identity

6. Can you tell me about a time when a character in a book or film helped a student articulate who they were?
7. Is there anything you look for when selecting materials that may give students' voices?
8. Participants are asked in advance to bring a curriculum artifact that relates to diversity to their interviews. The following series directly addresses the artifact:
    (a) What is the story of this artifact from a teaching perspective?
    (b) What is the purpose of this artifact from a pedagogical standpoint?

Biographical questions

9. I am going to wrap up with a few questions:
    (a) How many years have you been teaching?
    (b) What is your highest level of education?
    (c) Do you have teaching or professional certifications?
    (d) Are you from the area originally?

Sheri Dion, Ph.D., is a Research Analyst in the Office of Education at the Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health. Her research focuses on quantitative and qualitative methodologies, equity and inclusion, language education, and critical theory. Prior to her doctoral work, she taught French at independent secondary schools in the Boston area for over a decade.