

# *PDS Bends but Doesn't Break: How PDS Structures and Processes Can Help Schools and Universities Respond Effectively During a Crisis*

Corinne Kindzierski, SUNY Buffalo State  
Keli Garas-York, SUNY Buffalo State  
Pixita del Prado Hill, SUNY Buffalo State

**ABSTRACT:** This paper argues the professional development school (PDS) model is uniquely positioned to meet challenges faced by schools and universities as a result of COVID-19. A narrative case study design was employed to examine the innerworkings of a PDS consortium and depict a multidimensional portrait during a global pandemic and the impact on its stakeholders. Participants included teacher candidates, classroom teachers, school/district leaders, and teacher education faculty. Data for the study included two online surveys and email exchanges. The findings indicate the challenges faced were due to the shift to remote instruction—communication became more difficult and important with online teaching and learning, social-emotional needs increased for P-12 learners and teacher candidates with the isolation imposed by remote instruction, and field placements were compromised as buildings closed. The PDS 9 Essentials are utilized as a framework for decision making and priority-setting.

*NAPDS 9 Essentials: All 9 are addressed*

We are being told that novel coronavirus (COVID-19) has changed the world forever, and the ripple effects of the pandemic will be observed for decades to come (Allen et al., 2020; Politico, 2020). This impact will be especially apparent in schools as educators try to provide for the academic and social-emotional needs of students. As we wade through these challenging times, it is important to remember the great responsibilities of teacher education programs to research and pursue practices that respond to school need as they prepare and sustain teachers to meet the new needs that are arising. This paper argues that the professional development school (PDS) model is uniquely positioned to meet these challenges. We share our story here as it continues to evolve in this uncertain time. It is our hope that our use of the NAPDS 9 Essentials to guide us on this new journey will help other PDSs as they navigate uncharted waters during a global pandemic and its aftermath.

Similar to many PDSs, the Buffalo State PDS consortium was established to promote and facilitate dynamic relationships between the college and partner schools, with the guiding principle and conceptualization that teacher candidates benefit from ‘real world’ experiences, maximize growth in college/P-12 partnered professional development, and provide value added dimensions to partner site classrooms. The Buffalo State PDS began in 1991 with one partner school and has expanded to include more than 100 school and community partners with approximately 45 signed agreements each semester. These partnerships include local schools, schools in other parts of our

state, and internationally. Teacher candidates move through their preparation programs in a cohort model with field placements at partner schools. Teacher education faculty serve as liaisons between school and university and feedback from school and community stakeholders is sought on a regular basis. The consortium serves as a clearinghouse for these partnerships and provides professional development while supporting action research conducted collaboratively across stakeholder groups.

The Buffalo State PDS was designed to leverage the resources of the college and schools for mutually beneficial partnership within the framework proposed by Darling-Hammond (1994) and Brindley et al. (2008). Those resources include human, time, space, expertise, and when possible, financial. Informed by research and best practices (e.g., del Prado Hill & Garas-York, 2020; Ferrara et al., 2014; Garas-York et al., 2017; Teitel, 2004), the work of the Buffalo State PDS centers on relationships. In the current COVID-19 crisis as P-12 schools and universities have been forced to shift to remote learning, the nature of “relationship” has changed while the need for collaboration and partnership is arguably more important than ever. While the move to remote instruction was largely unplanned and rapid, this paper suggests that there are mechanisms already in place through PDS frameworks and processes that make it an essential organization to support P-12 schools and universities at this time of great uncertainty and need.

## Literature Review

### PDS as Structured Relationships

PDSs are communities in which all stakeholders develop and enhance their knowledge of teaching and learning through clearly established systems that help to manage the collaborative nature of such a relationship. The goal of the PDS model is to strengthen teacher preparation through carefully structured, mentored, and coordinated field experiences, which exemplifies a culture of inquiry, reflection, and collaborative relationships among all stakeholders (Kennedy, 2016). Historically, these relationships serve two primary purposes, to provide a professional context for teacher candidates and to provide ongoing teacher education to practicing professionals (Kennedy, 2016). Such relationships are transactional, with both universities and partner schools sharing resources, providing, and receiving professional development and serving as a forum for action research (Darling-Hammond, 2010).

Epstein et al. (2002) identified various forms of school-community relationships that can be applied to those within a PDS model. One relationship is found in the university setting including teacher candidates and university faculty. Another example is the relationships within the P-12 setting, such as teachers, administrators and students. Finally, there are the relationships that exist with the community at large including parents, families, and community partners. As Bryk and Schneider (2003) explain, distinct role relationships characterize the social exchanges of schooling: teachers with students, teachers with other teachers, teachers with parents, and all groups with the school principal. Each party in a relationship maintains an understanding of his or her role's obligations and holds some expectations about the obligations of the other parties (Darling-Hammond, 2010). In examining the characteristics of schools that have made significant gains, researchers have verified what most educators already know to be true: the quality of the relationships within a school community makes a difference.

Skim through the literature on PDS relationships and words like "trust," "respect," "collegiality," and "buy-in" appear again and again (Maeroff, 1993; Royal & Rossi, 1999; Sergiovanni, 1999). While it seems to be generally assumed that trust is a core criterion of successful school relationships, few publications address the issue explicitly or examine it in much depth (Bryk & Schneider, 2003). From the perspective of educational researchers, the level of trusting relationships present within a school is a difficult thing to measure, much less connect to concrete outcomes. While it may be clear intuitively that trust "matters," questions about why and how are not so easily addressed.

Guarded communication, for instance, can provoke distrust because people assume information is withheld and question why (Tschannen-Moran et al., 1998). The more interactions that relationships in a PDS have over time, the more their willingness to trust one another. Moreover, the level of trust between parents, caregivers, community partners, and teachers can greatly

impact the success of the students (Kennedy, 2016). The current crisis has forced educators to turn to those they trust. Now may be the time to more fully examine the possibilities of PDS relationships to meet new needs.

### PDS in the Context of Remote Teaching and Learning

The COVID-19 pandemic has made evident significant problems in education including unequal access to quality instruction and resources, learning struggles for children, and professional development needs of teachers (e.g., Goldstein et al., 2020). Particularly challenging for P-12 and university educators has been the rapid and unplanned shift to remote instruction. When considering remote learning, the educator must determine if the learning will take place synchronously (real-time interactions between the teacher and students) or asynchronously (delayed interactions) (Burdina et al., 2019). The instructional decisions required for successful online instruction take time. Quality remote learning does not consist of simply moving a face-to-face course online.

Another consideration for quality online instruction includes class interactions between the course instructor and the students as well as among the students (Fish & Wickersham, 2009). They emphasize that frequent communication and prompt feedback are some of the hallmarks of higher student satisfaction with an online course. Providing meaningful opportunities for learning and social interactions in an online course can be challenging. Everett (2015) stated, "In order to create a strong sense of community and to help students engage with learning in online courses, instructors need to find ways to help students feel more strongly connected with each other." (p. 72). Dixson (2010) sought to determine what types of online activities were more engaging for students. She found it was beneficial for course instructors to seek out assignments that allow the students to engage in the course content with classmates. Her results showed "across many types of courses when students readily identified multiple ways of interacting with other students as well as of communicating with instructors, they reported higher engagement in the course" (p. 8).

According to Fish and Wickersham (2009), online course instruction takes a great deal of planning as well as training for the course instructor and online students. Educators who were tasked with switching over to remote instruction during the COVID-19 crisis were not afforded this time or training to ensure delivery of quality online instruction. Professional development on how to set up remote learning for educators who switched from face-to-face to remote instruction likely occurred online as in person interactions became impossible at the onset of the pandemic. As P-12 schools and universities continue to ponder remote learning in the near future there is much they can learn from each other and many ways they can extend support to children and families through collaboration. At such a unique time in educational history, PDSs must turn to the guiding frameworks of the Nine Essentials (Brindley et al.

(2008) to engage the relationships for a collaborative response to the challenges presented by the pandemic.

## Methods

As educators consider the possibilities of PDS structures and processes in a time of crisis, this paper explores the following research questions:

1. How can PDS use its greatest strengths—relationships and leveraging common resources for mutual benefit—to respond effectively in a time of crisis?
2. How might PDS structures and processes provide the framework and flexibility to respond to school need in a time of crisis?
  - a. What data must be gathered (and how) to determine need quickly?
  - b. Where should PDSs place their energies and resources in a crisis?

## Research Design

A narrative case study design was employed to examine the innerworkings of a PDS consortium, the bounded system of this case study (Creswell & Poth, 2018), during a global pandemic and the impact on its stakeholders. Narrative inquiry helped to explore the experiences of teacher candidates, college faculty, and school partners amid a time of remote learning, teaching, and professional development (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000). This design afforded us a method to study the stories of PDS stakeholders and provide a rich understanding of their experiences during uncertain times (Riessman, 2008).

## Participants

Buffalo State PDS consortium partners with schools and community agencies in the city of Buffalo as well as the first ring suburbs, suburbs, and rural areas of the region. The consortium also includes partners from other parts of the state and internationally; however, the large majority of participants for this study live and work in the greater Buffalo area. The participants were a variety of stakeholders in the PDS consortium including teacher candidates, mentor teachers, school/district leaders, and university faculty.

## Data Gathering Procedures and Data Sources

Recognizing the importance of determining stakeholder need at this time of crisis, Institutional Review Board (IRB) approval was sought to gather data from March 2020 – June 2020 remotely through emails/correspondence among PDS stakeholders and online surveying via Qualtrics.

As the participants moved to online learning, teaching, and meetings, so did the interactions among stakeholders. Partners we talked to and worked with closely each week in person turned to email as their primary mode of communication with us. The

email exchanges were collected and examined to assess needs and describe the stakeholder experiences. For the purposes of this paper, we define “email exchange” as the full correspondence (or thread) about a particular topic.

*Email Correspondence Between Stakeholders and PDS.* From the shift to remote instruction in March 2020 through the end of the spring semester in May 2020, the researchers tracked email messages about the pandemic that were sent from the Buffalo State PDS to its partners and those received by the PDS co-directors and by the associate chair for undergraduate advisement.

As we collected the data, we noticed that the email exchange followed a timeline of stages and centered around the themes of (a) communication, (b) social-emotional concerns, and (c) field placements. Between the time period of March 6 and April 30 a total of 195 emails exchanges were analyzed. Of these, 128 were coded for communication, 26 for social-emotional concerns, and 41 for field placements. We also wanted to ensure that the data reflected the perspectives of various stakeholders. Of our total, 32 emails came from teacher education faculty, 15 from our partner schools, 37 from a liaison teams (teacher education faculty and partner school personnel), 45 from administration. Student voices were also included with 50 email exchanges from student advisees, 6 from field placement cohort students and 10 from student teaching candidates.

## Secondary Data Sources

Online surveys were targeted attempts to communicate with PDS stakeholders to determine how Buffalo State was meeting their educational needs, as well as assessing if we were doing this successfully. We inquired as to whether remote learning was addressing course objectives and requirements, as well as to the level of communication between faculty and fellow candidates during the initial stages of the pandemic.

*Online Surveys.* Two different surveys were distributed (see Appendix). One survey was sent to undergraduate and graduate teacher candidates in Buffalo State's largest department, which serves early childhood, childhood, literacy, and leadership candidates, by email at the end of the semester. Ninety-three students responded to this survey. Just over 70% of the respondents were undergraduate childhood and/or early childhood majors. The remainder of the respondents were undergraduate pre-majors and graduate students in the curriculum and instruction, masters in initial teaching certification, literacy specialist and educational leadership programs.

Another survey was administered to all PDS stakeholders through the Buffalo State PDS website and included in the spring PDS newsletter. Seventeen people responded (six classroom teachers, two teacher candidates, seven college faculty, one both classroom teacher and college faculty, and one enrichment (dance) teacher). The narrative case study approach was useful to pull together various data pieces at a time of crisis to tell our PDS story.

## Data Analysis

The analysis process included a multilayered approach. Primary data sources or email threads were read twice, sorted by date and color-coded by the type of stakeholder involved in the email exchange. The email exchanges underwent thematic analysis (Riessman, 2005). We concentrated on the content of our texts (email exchanges) and focused on “what” was said. We collected the stories of the PDS stakeholders and proceeded to “inductively create conceptual groupings” and organized these stories by themes (Riessman, 2005, p. 2). These themes are illuminated by a series of vignettes uncovered in the analysis as part of the findings to help create an overall story of the Buffalo State PDS during a time of crisis.

Secondary data sources were analyzed using the constant-comparative approach. Survey data were coded and grouped into labeled categories. Seventeen codes emerged from this data analysis. During axial coding, these original categories were collapsed into seven major categories. Next, selective coding helped to identify three major themes (Strauss & Corbin, 1998).

The themes from both analyses were compared for similarities followed by a chronological exploration of the data sources that led to an emergence of four stages. Finally, the themes were examined through the framework of the NAPDS 9 Essentials in order to provide a structural lens by which to further illuminate the experiences of the stakeholders and identify actions that the Buffalo State PDS consortium plans to take to respond to need.

## Findings

At the beginning of this study, we wondered how we could employ the strengths of our PDS consortium, such as relationships and common resources, to aid in our response to the crisis. We looked to see how flexible the guiding PDS structures (including the NAPDS 9 Essentials) could be to serve as a framework for responding to the needs of the PDS stakeholders at a critical time. We also wanted to know what kind of data we needed to gather and how while social distancing. Finally, at a time of great uncertainty and chaos, we wondered where to focus our energy and resources for maximum impact. The evolution of this study itself helped to answer some of these questions. The email communications that were authentically created and disseminated by stakeholders naturally emerged as the main data sources collected in addition to the surveys we created.

The analyses of these remotely acquired data provided a multidimensional portrait of the Buffalo State PDS during a global pandemic. The findings indicate the challenges faced were due to the shift to remote instruction—communication became more difficult and important with online teaching and learning; social-emotional needs increased for P-12 learners and teacher candidates with the isolation imposed by remote instruction, and field placements were compromised as buildings closed. As well, when the data were examined chronologically, we found

our story unfolded in stages. These stages not only provide an additional structure or method by which we can chronicle the exploration of the nature of our PDS consortium during a global pandemic but also present an important context for the emergence and/or pervasiveness of the aforementioned themes.

### Stage 1 (March 6-March 11) Panic, Uncertainty, and Need for Empathy

Initially, we, as well as most of the stakeholders, were in a state of shock and panic. Everyone wanted to find out if the partners with whom we worked most closely were safe and healthy. We found that the first stage was mainly focused on trying to address the rising questions in a time when there were few answers and attending to the social-emotional needs of candidates, faculty, and school partners. Our focus for this stage was concentrated on providing encouragement and positivity while admitting shared fears and challenges during an extremely fast-moving and complex time during March 2020.

At this stage, our review started with email exchanges beginning March 1 that confirmed upcoming PDS events and plans. The first indication that important changes were imminent was on March 6 with the cancellation of an international PDS program. Therefore, we used this date as our starting point for data collection. The email messages varied from official announcements to individual exchanges. At this stage, many centered on decisions to cancel PDS events and activities and were sent to calm rising fears. Examples of this type of communication include:

I'm sure all of you are trying to figure out what to do/say right now. I'm just checking if there is something official we should be saying tomorrow since based on the [college] president's email, it will be our last day [face-to-face]. (personal communication by a teacher education faculty member, March 11, 2020)

Also:

I am looking forward to working with you to implement this vision as expressed by our President today. . . We will model for our students what it looks like to be creative and focus on safety, learning AND engagement during challenging times. . . They will take their cues from our calm confidence. (personal communication by a department chair, March 11, 2020).

Faculty-student communication expressed concerns about what the closures would mean for high stakes requirements at this stage. For example, “I received the email about class cancellation and that Buffalo State is basically shutting down. Does this mean we will not have the edTPA writing days next week?” (personal communication by a student teacher, March 11, 2020)

While the email exchanges expressed empathy and concern at this stage, no specific reference was made to the potential impact of the social-emotional aspect of the pandemic; however, numerous email exchanges from all constituents expressed concern about the disruption of field placements similar to this message. "Is student teaching impacted by this shut down as far as attending our placements?" (personal communication by a student teacher, March 11, 2020). Interestingly, several messages suggested that the pandemic might be viewed as an opportunity for innovation:

I've seen so many amazing things developed by Buffalo State faculty that I have no doubt that, should we need to cut classroom time short because of a crisis, Buffalo State students would have an experience that would be as good or better than they would have had in a typical semester! (personal communication from the teacher certification director, March 10, 2020)

## Stage 2 (March 12-22) Needs and Priorities/Sharing Information

Analysis of the email exchanges indicate a shift beginning March 12 as we began to reevaluate the needs and priorities of PDS. This date marked the beginning of what we identified as Stage 2. We found that the emphasis for this stage moved from having questions to how best to answer them. A priority became how to adjust field placements to meet the changing needs of our school partners. This prompted our subsequent finding of the need for professional development on remote learning for PDS partners, faculty, and students. Additionally, we found the need for consistent interaction across all parties was crucial to avoid confusion and miscommunication between faculty, students and school, partners.

By Stage 2, all on-campus events planned by PDS were cancelled and the PDS budget was frozen. This included international PDS programs. Also significant is that all our local school partners closed during this period which impacted all field placements. However, not every PDS initiative was cancelled due to the pandemic. One faculty member who received a PDS mini grant to facilitate a book club at her PDS partner school with teachers carried on remotely using Google Classroom and Flipgrid to share the products of their learning and collaboration. This is one example of how our school partners drive many of our PDS initiatives, such as this type of professional development, and how our partners helped us to shift our thinking to the possibilities of remote instruction.

Administrators were working hard to avoid miscommunication at this stage. "Technically, NO one should be telling their students anything until official word comes from Buffalo State. . . Right now, the best I can tell you is to tell your students not to over-react. Faculty will be given the chance to define HOW they intend to meet the learning outcomes for their courses so that all students can remain on track to graduate and finish their requirements with reasonable assurance that

they have mastered the skills and competencies required for success on their certification exams and in their professional careers" (personal communication from college leadership, March 12, 2020). The director of student teaching understood the anxiety students were facing while also making it clear that ongoing communication would be essential.

Student Teachers, I know this has been a stressful time for all and we have asked all of you to patiently wait as we get answers to your questions. . . I need to hear from the student teachers who are still working side by side with their mentor teachers. For example, two student teachers in Buffalo are co-designing and teaching remote activities for students. (Personal communication from the director of student teaching, March 20, 2020)

As the pandemic impacted health and the economy, our school partners let us know that there is and will be more of a need for new teachers to be trained to help students with trauma. Through email we received requests to prepare student teachers to work with learners who are impacted and traumatized by their time away from school during remote learning. Additionally, the Buffalo State PDS sought to leverage already existing resources, such as our Resilience Project, which was created to integrate trauma-informed practices into teacher education courses and professional development.

As we know, trauma doesn't get a break for children or adults no matter what is happening—in fact schools closing, stable adult models unavailable, food and safe spaces provided outside of homes, friendships that may only be available in schools and calm, kind attachments made will probably be minimized or lost for children during this time. There will be challenges to children and adults that they may not be equipped to manage. (personal communication by an adjunct faculty and school partner, March 12, 2020)

At this stage, the college tried to send a consistent message that there are people to turn to and that we are facing this crisis together.

I know this time is rather...scary for some of us, but I want to reassure you that I will be available should you need advisement. Even though there are no face to face appointments, I can be reached via email, Facetime or phone conference. We are all facing these same circumstances, please know I am here to help you. I may not have all the answers, but I do have resources for you. I just ask for some leeway with time - we are learning online teaching, virtual meetings and home-schooling my children. We can get through this together- I am only a click away. (personal communication by a faculty advisor, March 19, 2020)

Of great concern was what to do about field placements. The email exchanges raised questions such as: Should teacher

candidates be pulled from schools? Should teacher candidates (with the support of their methods faculty) offer support to teachers as they shifted to remote instruction? Would the teacher candidates be considered a help to teachers or one more responsibility? How can faculty best support teacher candidates as the candidates themselves are facing a shift to remote instruction in their own classes and concerns about personal health and the economy? Before our partner schools closed, one exchange suggested, “My instinct is to keep them in schools while we can” (personal communication by a faculty member, March 12, 2020). However, once the schools officially closed, the PDS consortium recognized that each partner would request a different arrangement with some teacher candidates continuing to co-teach with their mentors and some mentors asking to be relieved of the responsibility for the teacher candidates. Those candidates who continued in their placements looked to their faculty for ways to shift pedagogical practice to an online format.

Just shooting you an email with some of the activities I’ve been working on the last two weeks! In my last email to you I mentioned I was conducting a science experiment. This was an activity I found myself feeling SO AWKWARD in front of the camera doing, and also found that editing was an obstacle to tackle on its own. (personal communication by a student teacher, March 13, 2020)

While faculty hoped that their partners would agree to continue to work with teacher candidates, the PDS consortium recognized that there were many factors contributing to mentor teacher concerns. Additionally, we wanted to consider our partnerships in a larger context of acknowledging our long relationship with mentor teachers and our hope that this relationship would continue into the future. Moreover, many of these mentor teachers are people we know well as alumni, neighbors, and friends. For this reason, many messages to mentor teachers included sentiments such as the following, “Our hearts have been going out to all of you, your families, and students during this stressful time. Thank you so much for everything you are doing for our student teachers” (personal communication from teacher education leadership, March 19, 2020).

### Stage 3 (March 23-April 30) Responding and Planning Forward

Beginning March 23, the email exchanges indicated that stakeholders were settling into new ways of teaching and learning and starting to think ahead to what the future might hold for the PDS consortium. The major focus on this stage was adjusting “how we used to do things.” Examples included shifting teacher candidate expectations to providing remote learning and engaging learners through virtual tools. We also found, although some of our partner schools may have not continued to work with Buffalo State candidates during this

time, many expressed the desire to continue in the future. This stage also indicated the growing need for teacher preparation programs to include professional development on addressing the social-emotional needs of children and adolescents through trauma-informed practices.

We wondered if schools would be open in the coming semester and if they were open, would they allow our teacher candidates back in the schools. We sought ways to communicate with schools and leverage previous relationships to discover how we could continue our mutually beneficial relationships by determining the new needs of our partners.

Our enrollment had been increasing and new programs were in the process of being launched when the pandemic struck. The realization hit that not only would we need to maintain our current partners, but we also needed to forge new relationships to meet the needs of our growing teacher education programs. We developed communications to send to partners and shared helpful information about how Buffalo State could assist them during this time. Despite a very promising video conference meeting with a local principal where we discussed a field placement for a new inclusion program, the teachers in the building felt that hosting a cohort of teacher candidates was too much to take on for the fall when so much uncertainty abounded. This led a faculty member to create a chart (Table 1 displays how Buffalo State teacher candidates can assist classrooms in-person as well as virtually) to help us more effectively communicate the value that teacher candidates bring to the classroom setting especially at a time of crisis. Using this chart and with a better sense of the concerns of classroom teachers we were successful in securing a field placement for this new program in the fall semester.

Our analysis yielded two major areas of professional development need. Our partner schools needed us to prepare our teacher candidates to work with students who have experienced trauma and to be able to teach using Google tools. Unfortunately, our institution is bracing for major budget cuts and is not authorizing any additional spending to support issues such as these. Therefore, we had to readjust our PDS budget for the upcoming academic year by cancelling our annual conference and regularly scheduled PDS events to reallocate these funds for various remote professional development opportunities.

At the same time, we recognized that the college and PDS consortium could serve as a hub to communicate ideas for all stakeholders. On March 25, the following was announced, “We’ve been building a new resource website to help out the newly-forced-into-homeschooling families although the dean thinks this could become a longstanding resource for the future. . . I’m looking for contributions for our School Away from School page” (personal communication by college leadership). Additionally, on April 14, the PDS consortium created space on their website for the ‘Teaching Remotely and Staying Connected’ page to provide a space for school partners to share their good work.

Table 1. How Student Teachers Supported Instruction

| <i>Face-to-face</i>  | <i>Remote learning</i>  |
|--|---|
| Deliver small group instruction  | Run virtual small group break-out sessions for struggling learners                |
| Deliver whole group instruction  | Run virtual whole-class meetings  |
| Administer and interpret assessments   | Pre-record instructional mini-lessons for students to watch before or after class |
| Provide feedback on student work   | Serve as a HW contact person, and provide feedback on student work                |
| Support and teach classroom behavior   | Provide technology support; teach and promote positive online behaviors           |
| Support community participation and celebrations (e.g., multicultural nights, math night, literacy nights, etc.) | Design home-based literacy activities   |

During this stage, the college and the PDS consortium clarified its message to mentor teachers and school leaders,

We are writing to you today to affirm our partnership with you in facing all of the complexities of delivering the highest quality instruction to all children and young adults. We have been “virtually there” with you to the greatest extent that we can. Social distancing regulations and school closures have not separated us! . . . Please call on our faculty and our amazing students to assist you, your teachers, families and communities. (personal communication by the teacher education leadership, April 22, 2020)

The message continues with a very specific listing of partnership activities of the past as well as suggestions for partnership in the context of remote learning.

Teacher candidate communication with faculty and school partners also increased as course assignments and certification requirements changed. Moreover, the email exchanges showed an increase in concerns related to social-emotional needs of stakeholders within the PDS consortium. For example, candidates recognized the important work of engaging children during this incredibly challenging time.

Thank you so much for agreeing to be my mentor and for taking me on as a pre-service learner teacher...It has been an incredible experience for me to learn your teaching strategies and classroom management strategies. I liked how you build a relationship with the students and the way you engage each and every one of them in your instruction. (personal communication by a teacher candidate, April 23, 2020)

School partners requested that teacher candidates learn how to support students instructionally as well as in social-emotional ways. “[Principal] from [a district partner of many years] would like us to work closely with our student teachers so they are well informed on Trauma Based Learning and SEL [social-emotional learning]” (personal communication from the director of student teaching, April 21, 2020). It should be noted that Social-Emotional Learning (SEL) refers specifically to the SEL standards of our state. When we discuss social-emotional issues,

we are speaking more broadly about these concerns. Faculty reported other requests of this kind from their school partners, so the PDS co-directors began to seek external funding to support professional development.

Also brought to the attention of the PDS co-directors at this time were the social-emotional challenges facing international students from China. With the help of a department chair, handwritten messages and a small gift were sent to each of these students who were quarantining in college housing. Their faculty advisor wrote,

Thank you. . .for your thoughtfulness of purchasing sweatshirts for our [international graduate students from China]. It is a hard time for everyone, but extremely hard for them. . .Early into this, [the department chair] sent me a message checking on them, and I forwarded that message to the group. The students were so moved and really appreciate the caring from the department. . .They are more worried about discrimination than the virus itself. I told them that they are safe [in the teacher education program] and at our college. (personal communication from a faculty advisor, April 7, 2020)

To help PDS stakeholders support children, a faculty member who is a psychologist and a member of the PDS Resilience Project mentioned above, co-authored a children’s book that answers children’s questions and addresses their concerns about COVID-19 while also providing many resources for caregivers. This electronic book was made available on the PDS website along with a corresponding read-aloud. School partners also shared their resources with PDS faculty. For example, a partner district invited all teacher education faculty to a professional development session focusing on social-emotional learning with a national expert as it aligns to the SEL standards of our state.

#### Stage 4 (May 1, 2020 to the present) Call to Action

The email exchanges at this stage also reported the many ways field placements were being adjusted to remote contexts and communicated a desire to continue programs already in place. For example, the PDS consortium sponsors a fellowship

program that hires Buffalo State teacher candidates to serve as substitute teachers in partner districts while receiving mentored support in these settings. The PDS co-directors assumed that district leaders would request that the program be paused due to the pandemic; however, all participating districts except one asked us to recruit candidates and interviews were conducted at the start of the semester.

New field placement activities reported in the email exchanges include a wide range of videoed read-alouds, posts of candidates singing to children, the creation of online materials for teachers to use, remote tutoring (by video conferencing and phone), small group instruction by video conferencing, and structured reflection and discussion of videos of exemplary teaching. PDS faculty also expressed concern that the spring 2020 completers would be at a disadvantage due to missing their traditional in-person student teaching placement so an informal mentoring program led by faculty to complement the formal mentoring they will receive in their new jobs began in fall 2020.

While the bulk of the data comes from the email exchanges, the two surveys that were distributed provide important information that aligns with the themes of communication, social-emotional needs, and field placements. In addition, the surveys provided very specific information on stakeholders' perspectives on remote learning. Stakeholders stressed the importance of communication in their survey responses. For instance, teacher candidates indicated that they viewed communication as both negative and positive results of remote learning during a pandemic. One respondent noted that her course instructor, "kept in constant communication." While another stakeholder replied "more communication" when explaining what could be improved during remote instruction.

Survey respondents alluded to social-emotional areas of need when asked about their experiences during remote instruction. One mentor teacher stated,

My students (grade 10) have a lot of barriers. They are often sharing devices with siblings, have weak internet connections, and have chaotic, distracting homes. They don't always have a peaceful environment in which they can work and are often pulled for household tasks, including childcare of younger siblings."

As well, a faculty member responded about teacher candidates, "Students struggle to motivate themselves—this was the largest concern my own students shared with me. The mental toll of being confined and the dramatic changes were a lot for them to handle."

While reflecting on interrupted field placements during spring 2020, a respondent noted

I loved that my education professor introduced us to tools that we could implement into a remote learning environment by using them during our weekly virtual lessons. I also enjoyed that every effort was made to

keep the schedule somewhat the same and adaptable to the circumstances."

Some survey participants felt the placements were just not as beneficial. One person noted, "It is not ideal but it is a great substitute for the situation we are in right now."

Upon analyzing the email and survey data, we have determined that these stages will likely be fluid, especially in the case of a resurgence of COVID-19 cases. PDS structures and flexibility make movement through these stages more effective. As great uncertainty looms for the coming year, we will need to do check ins with our students, colleagues, and school partners. Even though we have longstanding relationships with these groups, it is important to let them know that PDS is still here for them and that PDS still needs them (Stage 1). For the upcoming semester, we need to look to our survey data to determine what worked and what changes need to be made as far as instruction and professional development (Stage 2). We need to identify the needs of our consortium and how we can leverage our resources to meet these needs as quickly as possible to provide the best teaching and learning for our teacher candidates and P-12 learners (Stage 3). Additionally, we realize that the 9 Essentials can serve as a guiding structure to identify need, establish priorities, and take action steps (Stage 4), which we will discuss in more detail below. We are definitely a work in progress.

## Discussion

We acknowledge several limitations of the study—the short time frame and low response rate for the second survey—and we are planning to extend the study to seek input from a greater number of PDS stakeholders. However, we feel important data were gathered and analyzed, which provide us with information for how to move forward quickly in a crisis. We hope that by sharing stories across PDSs, we can be better prepared for a possible resurgence in the future.

Notably, we found that the challenges our stakeholders faced were due to the shift to remote instruction: (1) Communication was both more difficult and important with online teaching and learning, (2) social-emotional needs increased with the isolation imposed by remote instruction, and (3) field placements were compromised as schools closed and shifted to remote instruction. As a professional development mechanism centered on partnership, we believe that PDS can best respond to these challenges through regular and transparent communication that offers empathy and the plans to move forward based on ongoing assessments/data gathering; redirecting resources (human, knowledge, time, online, and financial) for innovative and collaborative professional development to build the necessary knowledge, skills, and dispositions for all educators to respond effectively to the social-emotional needs of learners, caregivers, and teachers during a pandemic; working collaboratively across partnerships to identify what schools need with regard to remote instruction that teacher candidates can support and then integrating the development of



the knowledge, skills, and dispositions into coursework and experiences.

*Importance of Communication.* The importance of communication was a crucial theme that arose from the overall analysis. We felt an urgency to communicate with our partners to check on their well-being, let them know we were still here to help, express our need for them, and provide updates on PDS events and services. The data illustrated that communication was not always as equal or as helpful as we would hope for all stakeholders. The teacher candidates who were surveyed reported a wide variety of experiences during remote learning surrounding communication. Some expressed appreciation for the care they were afforded by faculty and campus staff members while others reported their anxiety due to not being able to reach course instructors or campus offices regarding course work, advisement, etc.

Our analysis of emails yielded evidence of the measures taken by faculty members to reach out to students and school partners. Regular meetings that were typically held on campus or in schools turned into a plethora of video conferences to strategize about how to best meet the needs of students, stay in touch with stakeholders, carry out ongoing initiatives, and plan for an uncertain future. A team worked to gather materials and mail congratulatory packets to graduates. Video montages were created by faculty and sent to graduating students.

We found that the strength of the relationship of each PDS partnership depends heavily on the liaison team. Evidence of this communication with school partners mostly came in the form of emails. These communications were typically initiated by college faculty or administration and there was a positive response from several school partners, mostly administrators. A letter from our School of Education dean brought about the largest response from school partners. This letter was sent to all PDS school partner administrators via email. Along with checking in, the dean outlined many ways that Buffalo State could be helpful to the schools during this uncertain time and stressed our need for partnership now more than ever.

*Supporting the Social-Emotional Needs of Stakeholders* The Buffalo State Resilience Project had already been in existence at the onset of the pandemic. The initiative to prepare teacher candidates in the area of social-emotional learning was brought to PDS from school partners to meet SEL standards and respond to the needs of children during the pandemic. After the onset of COVID-19, school partners were even more adamant about our teacher candidates being prepared to work with P-12 learners who had experienced trauma specifically related to the pandemic.

One school partner invited college faculty to participate in their districtwide remote professional development related to trauma, so faculty members could share this information with teacher candidates. In addition, PDS sought to offer this much needed professional development for all stakeholders with priority given to fall 2020 student teachers. Through the reallocation of funds from a canceled annual PDS conference, the Buffalo State PDS is offering a menu of remote professional

development opportunities for stakeholders, which included two keynote addresses on trauma and strategies for fostering resilience on the PDS website.

PDS co-directors submitted grant proposals to support a targeted effort to remotely provide these strategies to high school students and their siblings with mentorship from teachers and teacher candidates while promoting equity. PDS was also able to disseminate a children's book written by a college faculty member and the associated website to school partners. The initial goals of the Buffalo State Resilience Project will continue, but PDS structures, such as the NAPDS 9 Essentials, allow for these types of initiatives to be more responsive and meaningful due to the close communication and strong relationships with school partners.

*Adapting Field Placements.* Prior to the pandemic, the Buffalo State PDS consortium had approximately 45 signed agreements with schools for the spring 2020 semester. Teacher candidates and college faculty were observing, teaching, providing professional development, conducting research, and implementing projects sponsored by PDS mini-grants in these schools. In mid-March, schools closed, and the sustainability of these relationships was uncertain. Some placements for teacher candidates ended abruptly, some went remote, and some morphed into new, unplanned projects. The flexibility of the longstanding PDS structures helps us to maintain and reimagine field placements in a time of great uncertainty.

Looking toward the coming academic year is daunting when considering the nature of field placements. PDS leadership can empathize with our school partners who are struggling to create plans for reopening safely. Every attempt was made to reach out to partners to remind them of ways Buffalo State can be part of their fall plans. Table 1 was shared with school partners to convey how teacher candidates and college faculty could assist as they reimagine their school day, instructional configurations and content delivery. Professional development for college faculty and teacher candidates in remote learning platforms and tools will also likely positively impact their ability to be more versatile if field placements change from face-to-face to remote.

College faculty prioritized the level of teacher candidates needing field placements. Those nearing the end of their program were placed immediately in schools to work with P-12 learners in face-to-face settings as long as possible to maximize their contact hours. Teacher candidates who are early on in their program are completing remote service-learning projects, using videos, and taking part in simulations as opposed to going into schools, so as not to overwhelm PDS partner schools. During these difficult financial times, PDS funds for fall 2020 have been committed to the small stipends paid to school partners who form agreements for field placements in whatever capacity they are able to safely manage.

*Using the Strengths of PDS to Respond.* We believe that the PDS model is uniquely positioned to address these communication, social-emotional, and field placement needs. Through formal partnership structures and the power of long-lasting relationships, PDSs can serve as the hub for communication, the

Table 2. An Example of How a PDS Might Utilize These Nine Principles and Themes that Emerge as Most Relevant and Important to Prioritize and Plan for Action

| <p><i>Considerations for how the BUFFALO State PDS should respond to the COVID-19 crisis categorized by the themes that emerged from the data</i></p>  | <p><i>BUFFALO State PDS plan to move forward based on these considerations</i></p>   |
|--|--|
| <p><i>NAPDS Nine Essentials</i></p> <p>1. A comprehensive mission that is broader in its outreach and scope than the mission of any partner and that furthers the education profession and its responsibility to advance equity within schools and, by potential extension, the broader community.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Planful communication from the School of Education dean and chairs, PDS co-directors, and PDS faculty</li> <li>• Online teacher candidate orientations to explain the mission of PDS</li> <li>• PDS newsletters published electronically three times per year with examples of successful partnerships</li> <li>• Regular updating of the PDS website to serve as a clearinghouse of information</li> <li>• Re-directing PDS funds to support trauma-informed practice programming for stakeholders</li> <li>• Grant writing to support trauma-informed professional development</li> </ul> |
| <p><b>Social-emotional:</b> PDS leadership must communicate empathy and make clear through its actions that challenges and solutions to those challenges are shared; actions should always seek to advance equity across all partnerships and for all stakeholders, especially P-12 learners.</p>      | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Taskforce called to plan innovative and meaningful clinically rich practice at all methods levels and student teaching</li> <li>• Use of PDS advisory council meetings to collectively develop a way to communicate the value added by teacher candidates, especially during remote instruction</li> </ul>  |
| <p><b>Field placements:</b> PDS leadership must use PDS structures and processes to demonstrate that leveraging common resources can result in mutual benefit.</p>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• PDS co-directors communicate that, given new needs by our partners, our teacher candidates can help meet those needs in email exchanges preparing for the fall semester</li> <li>• As requested by partner districts, the substitute teacher fellowship continues to recruit candidates for the fall semester</li> </ul>  |
| <p><b>Communication:</b> PDS leadership must reach out to partners to identify the importance of their role in developing future educators, especially during a time of teacher shortages.</p>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Working with teacher education faculty to integrate trauma-informed practice into the required coursework of all teacher candidates</li> <li>• Teacher candidates closest to graduation (student teachers, six-credit methods courses) are given priority for placements in schools when possible</li> <li>• Teacher candidates who are earlier in the program, provide support to teachers through remote instruction projects and tutoring</li> </ul>   |
| <p><b>Social-emotional:</b> PDS Resilience Project has to consider COVID-19 when planning next steps.</p>  | <p>2. A school–university culture committed to the preparation of future educators that embraces their active engagement in the school community.</p>  |
| <p><b>Field placements:</b> With P-12 and college faculty input, PDS leadership must design field placements where teacher candidates can add value to remote teaching and learning.</p>   | <p><b>Social-emotional:</b> PDS Resilience Project has to consider COVID-19 when planning next steps.</p>  |

Table 2. Continued

| <p>Considerations for how the BUFFALO State PDS should respond to the COVID-19 crisis categorized by the themes that emerged from the data</p>  | <p>BUFFALO State PDS plan to move forward based on these considerations</p>  |
|---|--|
| <p>NAPDS Nine Essentials</p> <p>3. Ongoing and reciprocal professional development for all participants guided by need.</p>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Professional development adapted for various stakeholders is offered through synchronous and asynchronous formats through a menu and online registration system available on the PDS website that include engagement strategies in remote learning settings, remote supervision, and assessing student work remotely</li> <li>• PDS partner schools invite teacher education faculty to participate in remote training in trauma-informed practices</li> <li>• PDS adjusted funding to offer professional development in trauma-informed practices within the context of COVID-19</li> <li>• In place of the annual conference, the 2020 NYS Teacher of the Year has agreed to make a virtual keynote address to inspire fellow teachers during the pandemic</li> <li>• The annual PDS conference was canceled and plans were made to reallocate the funds to provide professional development related to Google Classroom to college faculty who would then use this with their teacher candidates who would be able to use this tool when working with our school partners.</li> <li>• PDS leadership pivoted from planning an annual conference to reallocating funds for remote professional development on various ways to engage learners</li> <li>• Grant written to secure funds for remote mentorship program with strategies for fostering resilience modules for teacher candidates and P-12 learners from partner schools</li> <li>• Monthly discussion meetings planned for PDS faculty to share innovative field placement activities</li> <li>• PDS advisory council meets to share innovative field placement activities</li> </ul> |
| <p><b>Communication:</b> PDS co-directors gather data through surveys and email exchanges to determine stakeholder need during the pandemic.</p>  |  |
| <p><b>Social-emotional:</b> PDS partnerships must leverage resources to provide effective professional development on trauma-informed practices that is delivered by P-12 partners and/or university faculty.</p> |  |
| <p><b>Field placements:</b> PDS leadership and liaison teams were made aware that teacher candidates need to be able to use Google Classroom for face-to-face placements as well as remote instruction.</p>       |  |
| <p>4. A shared commitment to innovative and reflective practice by all participants.</p>  |  |
| <p><b>Communication:</b> PDS partners expressed a need for faculty and teacher candidates to be more knowledgeable about remote learning techniques and platforms.</p>  |  |
| <p><b>Social-emotional:</b> PDS leadership must seek innovative ways to provide mentorship and access to strategies for fostering resilience for teacher candidates and P-12 learners.</p>                        |  |
| <p><b>Field placements:</b> Courses that partnered with schools during the summer had to come up with alternative means to meet course objectives and maintain commitments to the community.</p>                  |  |

Table 2. Continued

| <i>NAPDS Nine Essentials</i>   | <i>Considerations for how the BUFFALO State PDS should respond to the COVID-19 crisis categorized by the themes that emerged from the data</i>   | <i>BUFFALO State PDS plan to move forward based on these considerations</i>  |
|--|--|--|
| <p>5. Engagement in and public sharing of the results of deliberate investigations of practice by respective participants.</p>           | <p><b>Communication:</b> PDS to serve as a hub for information and ideas during the pandemic.</p> <p><b>Social-emotional:</b> PDS stakeholders worried about the impact of COVID-19 on P-12 learners.</p> <p><b>Field placements:</b> PDS student representatives typically share their research at multiple conferences during their year of service. With travel in the near future unlikely, PDS leadership needs to find new ways for students to disseminate their research.</p> <p><b>Communication:</b> The number and nature of placements for fall 2020 and beyond are uncertain.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The PDS website features a space for faculty and school partners to post remote learning ideas that can also be shared with caregivers</li> <li>• PDS action research project minigrants are exploring aspects of remote learning</li> <li>• A Buffalo State faculty member developed a website for trauma-informed practice and fostering resilience</li> <li>• The Buffalo State’s online <i>Journal of Action and Inquiry in Education</i> editor has committed to working with the PDS student representatives to develop new ways to publish their work in an online forum.</li> </ul> |
| <p>6. An articulation agreement developed by the respective participants delineating the roles and responsibilities of all involved.</p> | <p><b>Social-emotional:</b> Although in-person service-learning projects have been discouraged, PDS still wants to be of service to school and community partners.</p> <p><b>Field placements:</b> PDS leadership and college faculty need to consider how teacher candidates can be helpful to their school partners during a pandemic.</p>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• PDS faculty remain in contact with school partners to provide updated information about fall 2020 placements</li> <li>• Service-learning courses will shift to remote service-learning projects to continue to support PDS partners</li> <li>• One PDS faculty member created a chart of scenarios and ways by which teacher candidates can be of assistance/work in schools and still meet the objectives of their teacher education courses during uncertain times that is being used by other PDS faculty</li> </ul>   |
| <p>7. A structure that allows all participants a forum for ongoing governance, reflection, and collaboration.</p>                        | <p><b>Communication:</b> PDS leadership must determine ways to stay in touch with the advisory council to obtain updates on stakeholders.</p> <p><b>Social-emotional:</b> Emails to PDS leadership indicated schools might have a variety of needs in the area of trauma.</p> <p><b>Field placements:</b> There is a great deal of uncertainty about how to maintain partnerships with schools and community organizations during the pandemic.</p>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• PDS leadership shifted from in person to remote advisory council meetings</li> <li>• PDS leadership put out a survey to check in with stakeholders and sought to determine needs</li> <li>• The BUFFALO State PDS consortium will consult the advisory council which includes members who are school and district administrators.</li> </ul>  |

Table 2. Continued

| <i>NAPDS Nine Essentials</i>   | <i>Considerations for how the BUFFALO State PDS should respond to the COVID-19 crisis categorized by the themes that emerged from the data</i>   | <i>BUFFALO State PDS plan to move forward based on these considerations</i>  |
|--|--|--|
| <p>8. Work by college/university faculty and P-12 faculty in formal roles across institutional settings.</p> | <p><b>Communication:</b> PDS leadership had to communicate the impact of COVID-19 on annual and upcoming events.</p> <p><b>Social-emotional:</b> Through email communications, the need for more professional development on trauma-informed care, specifically related to COVID-19 was expressed.</p> <p><b>Field placements:</b> PDS and college leadership pondered issues related to field placements and certification as a result of COVID-19.</p> <p><b>Communication:</b> Many of Buffalo State graduates received awards for their service and academic excellence during the pandemic.</p> <p><b>Social-emotional:</b> PDS stakeholders are concerned about self-care and being prepared to work with P-12 learners during and after the pandemic.</p> <p><b>Field placements:</b> PDS and department leadership puzzle about what types of placements and opportunities will be available in the new school year.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• During spring 2020 all face-to-face PDS events were cancelled; however, planning is in place for how to deliver these experiences in remote formats</li> <li>• PDS leadership collaborated with colleagues to seek funding for additional professional development related to COVID-19 for all PDS stakeholders.</li> <li>• PDS co-directors met remotely with clinically rich faculty and staff across the state to share ideas.</li> <li>• PDS included the award winners in a summer newsletter to share with all PDS stakeholders.</li> <li>• PDS faculty member wrote a book for children related to COVID-19 and it was shared for free with all stakeholders</li> <li>• Exemplary work of student teachers from the remote portion of spring 2020 was shared as possible ideas for meaningful placements.</li> </ul> |
| <p>9. Dedicated and shared resources and formal rewards and recognition structures.</p>                      |  |  |

mechanism to gather data on stakeholder need, and the center for developing programming and providing professional development to meet that need.

Before the pandemic, the Buffalo State PDS consortium was a hub for communication. The existing PDS structures allowed for this to continue during a global pandemic. Close-knit relationships with schools and community organizations prior to the crisis provided a foundation that led to comfort, assistance, and the leveraging of resources during an uncertain and chaotic time. PDS liaison committees continued to be in close contact, the PDS website was consistently updated with relevant news and resources, communications were sent via the extensive distribution lists through email, and individual and group calls, video conferences, and texts continued. It was through all these means of communication that we were able to gather important information to maintain and strengthen PDS relationships.

Communications from all PDS stakeholders helped to inform future planning. Along with the many emails received and sent, the PDS leadership team developed online surveys to gauge how stakeholders were faring during remote instruction. These data, along with PDS structures, such as the NAPDS 9 Essentials, have assisted us as we plan for future PDS initiatives. Future data collection plans include an evaluation tool for all professional development sessions offered by PDS. To find out more about field placements and school partner needs, PDS leadership plans to have regular PDS faculty meetings to share ideas, brainstorm solutions, and provide support on a regular basis. Minutes will be taken at each of these sessions to inform next steps.

As we develop innovative professional development, we turn to the literature to guide our next steps. Darling-Hammond et al. (2017) identified seven characteristics of quality professional development. They concluded that effective professional development is “content focused,” “incorporates active learning,” “supports collaboration,” “uses models of effective practice,” “provides coaching and expert support,” “offers feedback and reflection,” and “is of sustained duration” (p. v-vi). Because PDSs by their nature require longstanding relationships between P-12 and universities, the professional development offered to and by the various stakeholders can be ongoing and sustained. However, conducting professional development remotely has added another dimension of complexity to an already intricate process and needs to be carefully considered during the pandemic.

Through the survey data collected, the PDS advisory council, and communications from liaison committees, and individual stakeholders, the Buffalo State PDS has amassed a great deal of information regarding the immediate needs of our partners. This has allowed us to strategically curate and provide the professional development offerings needed to make the biggest impact on the greatest number of stakeholders in a systematic way and we hope sustaining manner.

As we use the data and subsequent analysis to plan next steps, we also recognized the tremendous power of the PDS 9 Essentials to provide a framework as PDSs respond to a crisis. In

Table 2, we offer an example of how a PDS might utilize these nine principles and themes that emerge as most relevant and important to prioritize and plan for action.

## Conclusion

We hope our story offers an example of how a PDS might consider school-university partnership during times of turmoil or change. Our research question of how can PDS use its greatest strengths—relationships and leveraging common resources—for mutual benefit to respond effectively in a time of crisis was answered by recognizing the need and importance of communication across stakeholders. As part of a PDS, we were able to maintain communication with school partners and continue to share resources to meet the changing needs of students and their teachers. Trust among partners is of critical importance. Our second question of how might PDS structures and processes provide the framework and flexibility to respond to school need in a time of crisis was answered by being able to gather data through email, personal communication, and shared websites regarding how to use institutional resources during a time of uncertainty. The NAPDS 9 Essentials then provide a structure by which to examine how we were still part of strong professional relationships to benefit teaching and learning, how to best communicate with our partners by using systems already in place, and what needs had to be addressed to move forward with our mutually beneficial goals. <sup>SUP</sup>

## References

- Allen, J., Burns, N., Garrett, L., Haass, R., Ikenberry, J., Mahbubani, K., Menon, S., Niblett, R., Nye, J., O’Neil, S., Schake, K., & Walt, S. (2020, March 20). How the world will look after the coronavirus pandemic. *Foreign Policy Analysis* [online]. Retrieved from <https://foreignpolicy.com/2020/03/20/world-order-after-coronavirus-pandemic/>
- Brindley, R., Field, B. E., & Lessen, E. (2008). *What it means to be a professional development school*. National Association for Professional Development Schools. <http://napds.org/9%20Essentials/statement.pdf>
- Bryk, A., & Schenider, B. (2003) Trust in schools: A core resource for school reform. *Educational Leadership*, 60(6), 40-46.
- Buffalo State College, <https://suny.buffalostate.edu/>
- Buffalo State Professional Development Schools, <https://pds.buffalostate.edu/>
- Burdina, M. G., Krapotkina, I. E., & Nasyrova, L. G. (2019). Distance learning in elementary school classrooms: An emerging framework for contemporary practice. *International Journal of Instruction*, 12(1), 1-16. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2019.1211a>
- Clandinin, D. J., & Connelly, F. M. (2000). *Narrative inquiry: Experience and story in qualitative research*. Jossey-Bass.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). SAGE.
- Darling-Hammond, L. (1994). *Professional development schools: Schools for developing a profession*. Teachers College Press.
- Darling-Hammond, L. (2010). Teacher education and the American future. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 61(1), 35-47.

- Darling-Hammond, L., Hyster, M.E., Gardner, M. (2017). *Effective teacher professional development*. Learning Policy Institute.
- del Prado Hill, P., & Garas-York, K. (Eds.) (2020). *The impact of PDS partnerships in challenging times*. Information Age Publishing.
- Dixson, M. D. (2010). Creating effective student engagement in online courses: What do students find engaging? *Journal of the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning*, 10(2), 1-13.
- Epstein, J. Sanders, M., Sheldon, S., Simon, B., Salinas, K., Jansorn, N. & Martin, C. (2002). *School, family and community partnerships: Your handbook for action* (2<sup>nd</sup> edition). Corwin Press.
- Everett, D. R. (2015). Adding value: Online student engagement. *Information Systems Education Journal*, 13(6), 68-76.
- Ferrara, J., Nath, J. L., & Guadarrama, I. N. (Eds.). (2014). *Creating visions for university school partnerships*. Information Age Publishing.
- Fish, W. W., & Wickersham, L.E. (2009). Best practices for online instructors. *The Quarterly Review of Distance Education*, 10(3), 279-284.
- Garas-York, K., del Prado Hill, P., Day, L.K., Truesdell, K., & Keller-Mathers, S. (Eds.) (2018). *Doing PDS: Stories and strategies from successful clinically rich practice*. Information Age Publishing.
- Goldstein, D., Popescu, A., & Hannah-Jones, N. (2020). As school moves online, many students stay logged out. *The New York Times*. <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/04/06/us/coronavirus-schools-attendance-absent.html>
- Kennedy, L. (2016). How does professional development improve teaching? *Review of Educational Research*, 86, 945-980.
- Maeroff, G. (1993). *Team building for school change: Equipping teachers for new roles*. Teachers College Press.
- Politico Magazine (2020, March 19). Coronavirus will change the world permanently. Here's how. *Politico Magazine* [online]. <https://www.politico.com/news/magazine/2020/03/19/coronavirus-effect-economy-life-societyanalysis-covid-135579>
- Riessman, C. K. (2005). Narrative analysis. In N. Kelly, C. Horrocks, K. Milnes, B. Roberts, & D. Robinson (Eds.), *Narrative, memory & everyday life* (pp 1-7). University of Huddersfield.
- Riessman, C. K. (2008). *Narrative methods for the human sciences*. SAGE.
- Royal, M. A., & Rossi, R. J. (1999). Predictors of within school differences in teachers' sense of community. *The Journal of Educational Research*, 92(5), 259-266.
- Strauss, A. L., & Corbin, J. M. (1998). *Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory*. SAGE.
- Sergiovanni, T. J. (1999). *Rethinking leadership*. Skylight Professional Development Press.
- Teitel, L. (2004). *How professional development schools make a difference: A review of research* (2nd ed.). National Council for the Accreditation of Teacher Education.
- Tschannen-Moran, M., Hoy, A., & Hoy, W. (1998). Teacher efficacy: It's meaning and measure. *Review of Educational Research*, 68(2), 202-248.



Corinne M. Kindzierski is an Assistant Professor in the Elementary Education, Literacy and Educational Leadership department at Buffalo State College. She teaches methods courses in literacy as well as courses in educational research. Her research interests include examining how PDS structures can

help recruit and retain diverse teacher candidates and how teacher candidates can re-define literacy.

Keli Garas-York is a Professor in Education at SUNY Buffalo State. She serves as PDS Co-Director, Literacy Specialist Program Coordinator, and Literacy Center Director. She is interested in studying equity in the field of education within the structures of a professional development schools (PDS) consortium.

Pixita del Prado Hill is a Professor in Education at SUNY Buffalo State. She serves as PDS Co-Director and co-leads the International PDS program with Santiago, Chile. She teaches content area literacy, and her research interests include school-university partnerships, international education, and language learners.

## Appendix

### Teacher candidate survey:

1. What is your major?
2. What is your year?
3. How was remote instruction compared to regular instruction:
  - a. Much worse than regular instruction
  - b. Somewhat worse than regular instruction
  - c. About the same as regular instruction
  - d. A little better than regular instruction
  - e. Much better than regular instruction
4. What are some specific things your education professors did that helped you during remote instruction?
5. What are some specific things that your education professors could have done better to help you during remote instruction?
6. Any other comments?

### All PDS Stakeholder survey:

1. How do you feel about remote instruction?
2. What tools are you using to teach remotely?
3. What is challenging about teaching remotely?
4. What is the best part about remote instruction?
5. To more effectively teach remotely, what do you need?
6. What have you learned about teaching remotely?
7. If you are a participant in remote learning (as a teacher candidate or perhaps through professional development), what forms of remote instruction are most helpful to your learning? What forms are most challenging?
8. How can PDS help you teach remotely?
9. What is your role? (building/district leader, classroom teacher, teacher candidate, college faculty, other)