

GEOGRAPHY AND IDENTITY: AN ANALYSIS OF GEOGRAPHY CURRICULA IN TURKEY*

ZAFER KUŞ

Ahi Evran University, Kırşehir, Turkey, Faculty of Education, e-mail: zaferkus@gmail.com

HİLAL MERT

Ahi Evran University, Kırşehir, Turkey, Faculty of Education, e-mail: h.mert@ahievran.edu.tr

(Received: August 2021; in revised form: October 2021)

ABSTRACT

Although there are differences in identity construction depending on countries and periods, some courses have come to the fore in the education system in each period. In Turkey, the education system in general, and history, geography, citizenship and social studies courses, in particular, have instrumental importance in the construction of identity. When the literature is examined, it can be observed that there are many studies on history, social studies and citizenship lessons for identity construction. However, there is a limited number of studies on identity construction for the geography curricula. The main purpose of this research was to examine the secondary education geography curricula in Turkey in terms of identity and citizenship construction. The study was planned and carried out as a qualitative case study. Case studies often describe the exploration of a bounded system. In this research, the sample was limited to the 2005 and 2018 geography course curricula, and a detailed description was made by using "content analysis" based on the research purpose. As a result of the research, it was determined in both curricula that the national identity theme had the most expressions, and national identity was aimed to be built by presenting details about the geography of the homeland. In addition to national identity, it was determined that there were also contents related to social identity, ecological identity, universal identity, and a limited number of digital identity and religious identity themes.

Keywords: curriculum, education, geography, identity, Turkey

* This study was presented at the 3rd International Congress on Geographical Education, October 14–17, 2021, Sivas Cumhuriyet University, Sivas, Turkey.

INTRODUCTION

The concept of identity is as old as human history. However, identity in the modern sense became more evident with the emergence of national states, and the French Revolution enabled nation-states to build positivist and secular identities, far from tradition and religion, in line with the idea of nationalism. In other words, as of the end of the 18th century, modernity has revealed many different intellectual ideological ideas in order to build the contemporary society and create new identities. Socio-political causes have been decisive in the establishment of the modern meaning of identity (Mollaer, 2019, p. 41).

However, with the emergence of national states, identity has become more clear, and after 1980 identity debates, especially, have increased in different social sciences (Anderson, 1983; Gellner, 1987; Smith, 1987). Firstly, sub-branches related to identity were formed in sociology and over time, they were included in the study area of sciences such as psychology, anthropology, history, geography, political science and citizenship. Therefore, each field has dealt with this concept within its own research limitations and different definitions and classifications of identity have emerged.

Identity, in its most general sense, encompasses all the characteristics of the individual. Both the person's answer to the question "Who am I?" and how it is viewed in terms of society are directly related to the concept of identity (Dalbay, 2018). On the one hand, identity creates differentiation and distinction for people from an individual point of view; on the other hand, it has a socially integrative effect (Şahin, 2019).

Since the French Revolution, education has been one of the biggest tools in imposing the desired identity to citizens during the construction of nation-states. States have made their official ideologies and national education policies operative only through their curricula, especially the goals and objectives, in order to raise individuals who will ensure the continuity of the countries (Geçit, 2008; Atmaca & Çamurcu, 2020). In general, the identity construction that is aimed to be built through the education system is directly reflected in the content of some courses specifically.

In Turkey, history, geography, citizenship and social studies courses are at the forefront of courses that include content directed at the construction of identity. With the end of the Ottoman Empire and the establishment of the new Republic of Turkey, an identity construction was attempted to be ensured through these lessons. Although there are some differences depending on various periods, goals for identity construction have been targeted in each of these courses. In this context, citizens learn their sense of belonging to the state through education in schools and build an identity accordingly.

One of the important social sciences that came to the fore in the process of identity construction is undoubtedly geography. Society and people are shaped according to the geographical structure in which they

live. Over the last decades, geographic research on identity has focused on three main issues: i) The spatiality of social practices related to race, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, social class or other social markets (identity politics); ii) Social conflicts on the identity of specific geographical spaces (identity of the place); iii) Geopolitical aspects of identity (political-territorial identities) (Banini, 2021). Thanks to its geographical objectives, it creates some identities in people.

In the process of forming identities, geography education contributes to the recognition of the ethnic, social and cultural structures of the society in which the individual lives and the reasons that create them, with physical and human elements. Thanks to geographical objectives, a citizenship consciousness is formed in people. In this way, people see themselves as a part of the society they live in and feel responsible for the society and their environment (Akinoğlu, 2006). Geography is not merely a general culture course that broadens the perspective and enables individuals to understand the systematics of the world more easily. In addition to these functions, it also plays an important and effective role in the formation and development of patriotism in the individual (Doğanay & Zaman, 2002). In Turkey, it is aimed through geography lessons to raise conscious citizens who love their homeland and fulfil their duties and responsibilities towards their homeland in the best way in accordance with the general objectives of Turkish National Education (Kaya, 2013).

Huntington discusses different sources (cultural, regional, political, etc.) that affect people's identities. Huntington's concepts of "environment, village, town, city, province, state, region, country, geographical location, continent, hemisphere" (2004, p. 27), listed in regional resources, are all related to geography. Within the geography course, students learn the position of the country in which they live in the world, its borders, population, landforms, economy, underground and aboveground riches. As people get to know their country and learn the details about it, their love for their homeland increases and accordingly their responsibility develops. As a result, they gain national identity (Yörü, 2007; Okur, 2013; Kaya, 2013; Özunal, 2015).

At the same time, identity cannot be separated from the physical and human structure of society. When defining identity in geography, it can be stated that besides the material elements, the spiritual values, which are the complements of these elements, have a greater effect. These values are moral values such as feelings, thoughts, dreams, and philosophy of life. These are the complementary elements of people's identity that make up their character (Özunal, 2015).

The use of geography education by the state as a practice of "nationalising" the land is an important point. Maps play a leading role in creating this practical national identity, which serves to spread patterns about neighbouring states, natural resources, political borders to future generations (Durgun, 2018, p. 36). The most striking example of this can be observed in Germany. At the 1881 Berlin Congress, geography professor Kirschhoff noted the discourse that geography should emphasise patriotism and the idea of homeland, and regarded geography as "the most German"

of all sciences. The schoolbook series *Vaterländische Erdkunde (Knowledge of Homeland and Geography)*, published in 1926, was also dedicated to strengthening national consciousness (Durgun, 2018). Similarly, in Turkey, after the 1st Geography Congress held in 1941, geography lessons were instrumentalised in schools, and the aim was to build a national identity with concepts such as knowledge of homeland, patriotism, national borders, threat, etc. through this course (Kuş, 2020). As can be seen, the geography course has an important role in the process of identity construction and national consciousness formation in the individual.

Polat states that “since their foundation, nation states have aimed to create a new national identity by uniting the people within their geographical borders around certain ideals, beliefs and values, by providing education and language unity. The same process was experienced in the establishment of the Republic of Turkey. A new national identity has been built on a modern line with Kemalist ideology” (2011, p. 142). Mustafa Kemal Atatürk made radical reforms in many areas in order for the new state to become a democratic and modern state. He introduced various novelties in the field of education in order to establish a modern-secular education system in the country. Therefore, Atatürk has a very important place for the Turkish nation. For this reason, starting from the first years of the Republic of Turkey, Kemalism has been included in all curricula.

There are many studies in the literature on history (Parlak, 2005; Güvenç, 2010; Pamuk, 2017; Copeaux, 2016; Eranlı, 2018; Turan, 2009; Yıldırım, 2014; Aslan & Alkış, 2015), social studies (Erbaş & Aksoy, 2020; Özunal & Özel, 2016; Karasu-Avcı & İbret, 2018; Kurdaş & Ulukaya-Öteleş, 2021; Türkcan & Bozkurt, 2015) and citizenship lessons (Demirci & Arslan, 2004; Güngör, 2017; Karakılıç & Müjdecı, 2014; Ozan & Kuş, 2021) for identity construction. However, there is a limited number of studies on identity construction for the geography course curriculum (Atasoy & Koç, 2015; Atmaca & Çamurcu, 2020; İbret, Aydın & Turgut, 2018). This study, unlike previous studies, is important in terms of making comparisons with regard to identity in the geography course curricula. We assume that geography courses have an important instrumental role in identity construction in Turkey. In this context, the main purpose of the research was to examine the last two secondary education geography curricula in Turkey (2005 and 2018) in terms of identity and citizenship construction. Based on this purpose, the following research questions were answered:

- What are the identity types emphasised in the geography curriculum developed in 2005 in Turkey?
- What are the identity types emphasised in the geography curriculum developed in 2018 in Turkey?
- What are the similarities and differences between the two curricula (2005-2018) in terms of identity construction?

METHOD

This research employs a qualitative design; more specifically, we are referring to a case study. A case study is a qualitative approach in which the researcher collects detailed and in-depth information about real life, a current situation or multiple limited situations in a certain time, through multiple sources of information, and presents a case description or case themes (Creswell, 2013, p. 97). In other words, a case study is an in-depth description and examination of a limited system (Merriam, 2013). Documents constitute an important data collection resource in case studies. In this sense, curricula were considered as data sources; these data sources were limited to the 2005 and 2018 geography curricula in Turkey.

Sample

In Turkey, the first geography curriculum of the Republican period was the 1924 one. Most recently, the geography curriculum was updated in 2018. As a result of the literature review, it has been determined that a total of ten main geography curricula have been prepared from the beginning of the republic to the present (Engin, Akbaş & Gençtürk, 2003; Geçit, 2008; Şahin, 2019). Case studies often describe the exploration of a bounded system (Bloor & Wood, 2006). In this sense, within the scope of content analysis, the last two curricula (the 2005 and 2018 geography curricula) were considered as a bounded system. According to Creswell, "bounded" means that the case is separated out for research in terms of time, place, or some physical boundaries" (2002, p. 485). In other words, it is possible to create limits around the object to be studied (Merriam, 1998).

The 2005 curriculum is a very detailed one. In this programme, the general objectives of the geography curriculum, explanations about the implementation of the geography curriculum, and the geography curricula of the 9th, 10th, 11th, and 12th grades were examined. On the other hand, the 2018 curriculum is much simpler. In this programme, the general objectives of the geography curriculum and the geography curricula of the 9th, 10th, 11th, and 12th grades were examined. In addition, the section of competencies, which is common in all curricula prepared in 2018, was also included in the geography curriculum. This section was included in the analysis.

Data Analysis

In qualitative research, methods classified as descriptive and content analysis by Straus and Corbin (1990) are generally used to analyse data. In this research, curricula were analysed using "content analysis". The basic process in content analysis is to gather similar data in the context of certain concepts and themes and to organise and interpret them in a way that the reader can easily understand (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2005, p. 162). The expressions in the 2005 and 2018 geography curricula were coded separately in terms of identity types in the literature, and categories and

themes were created by combining the codes. Only the sentences that can be associated with identity construction in the curriculum were analysed.

Table 1. The framework of themes, subcategories and codes used in content analysis

Identities (Themes)	Subcategory	Codes
National Identity	Homeland geography	<i>Turkey's geopolitics, location and importance, geographical location, landforms, climate, population and settlement, geographical location of the place where students live</i>
	National economy	<i>Turkey's economy, agriculture and livestock in Turkey, industry, trade, tourism, transportation and energy resources in Turkey's regional development projects</i>
	Kemalism	<i>Atatürk's views, practices, impressions, and words</i>
	Values	<i>Commitment to national values, protecting the homeland, sensitivity to homeland integrity and national values, patriotism</i>
	Turkish history and culture	<i>Cultural regions and distribution areas of Turkish culture</i>
Ecological Identity		<i>Human-natural environment relationship, perception of natural environment, causes and consequences of natural disasters, value of natural resources, causes and consequences of environmental problems, recycling strategies</i>
Social Identity	Value	<i>Tolerance, aesthetics and sensitivity, justice, friendship, honesty, respect, love, responsibility and helpfulness</i>
	Culture	<i>Cultural regions and distribution areas of different cultures</i>
Universal Identity	Global economy	<i>Types of economic activities in the world, the effect of industrialisation on countries, trade between countries, the level of development of countries, the effect of economic activities on social and cultural life</i>
	World population and migration	<i>Distribution and change of world population, factors affecting population distribution, population policies in different periods of countries</i>
	Different countries and regions	<i>Geographical features of different regions of the world, developed and underdeveloped countries</i>
	International organisations	<i>Economic, political and environmental organisations that are active at the regional and global level, their classification and their importance for Turkey</i>
	Natural disasters	<i>Earthquakes in the world, causes of natural disasters, practices causing natural disasters</i>
Digital Identity		<i>Technology, using information technologies, technological changes and using geographic information systems, Digital Competence and Mathematical competence and basic competencies in science/technology</i>
Religious Identity		<i>Muslim scientists who contributed to the development of geography, Islamic cities</i>

Reliability in qualitative research refers to whether the results obtained in the study can be obtained in the same way in similar environments and whether other researchers will reach the same results with the same data set (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2005). In this study, the coding process was carried out separately by two different researchers during the content analysis process, and then the coding was cross-checked. In the comparison, it was determined that the coding was largely similar, and the codes that did not show similarity were reviewed. Explaining the analysis process clearly with an example is an element that increases reliability. The framework for the themes, subcategories and codes used in the analysis process is shown in Table 1.

FINDINGS

The analysed curricula were presented under six themes: national identity, ecological identity, universal identity, digital identity and religious identity.

National Identity

2005 Curriculum

Under the theme of national identity in the 2005 geography curriculum, there were expressions related to the subcategories of geography of the homeland (41), national economy (12), Kemalism (13), value (6) and culture (4).

It was observed that the most emphasis was placed on the geography of the homeland within the theme of national identity. Within the subcategory of homeland geography, it was remarked that there were objectives about the geopolitical position and importance of Turkey, geographical location of Turkey, landforms, climate, population and settlement, the geographical location of the place where students reside and the recognition of their immediate surroundings.

Another frequently emphasised subcategory under the theme of national identity was expressions and objectives related to the economy. Regarding the Turkish economy, there were many focus points on agriculture and livestock, industry, trade, tourism, transportation and energy resources in Turkey. Similarly, with regard to the economy, the objectives about the reasons and effects of Turkey's regional development projects, economic policies and the conditions affecting economic activities were included.

Another subcategory emphasised under the theme of national identity was Kemalism. In the 2005 curriculum, it was emphasised that geography topics should be presented by relating them to Atatürk's views, practices, impressions and words.

Another subcategory highlighted under the theme of national identity was represented by values. Within the subcategory of values, loyalty to national values, protection of the homeland, sensitivity to homeland

integrity and national values, solidarity and patriotism were emphasised. Moreover, the curriculum emphasised the objective that the students comprehend the importance of geographical values in gaining “the homeland consciousness” (MEB, 2005).

2018 Curriculum

The 2018 Geography curriculum included expressions about the subcategories of homeland geography (57), national economy (38), Turkish history and culture (11), and value (5) under the theme of national identity.

Within the theme of national identity, it was determined that the most emphasis was placed on the geography of the homeland. There were many objectives regarding the homeland geography, such as the formation of Turkey, its geopolitical position, landforms, use and distribution of land, water assets, vegetation, Turkey’s population and characteristics and settlement in Turkey.

Another frequently emphasised subcategory under the theme of national identity was expressions and objectives related to the economy. These objectives included issues related to the Turkish national economy, in particular. For example, regional development projects in Turkey, transportation in Turkey, trade routes, Turkey’s tourism potential and policies, geographically indicated products, the service sector in Turkey were the subjects included in the objectives related to the national economy. Additionally, regarding the national economy, there were expressions related to agriculture, mining and energy and industry sectors in Turkey.

Within the theme of national identity, there were also some objectives related to Turkish history. Among these objectives, the scientists who contributed to the development of geography, important Turkish cities in history, and the reasons for Turkish migration in history were emphasised.

Regarding values, the value of patriotism was frequently mentioned, the value of responsibility was emphasised, and it was expressed that the indivisible integrity of the country within the current borders should be emphasised while teaching the administrative structure of Turkey.

Ecological Identity

2005 Curriculum

It is possible to state that most of the expressions under the ecological identity theme in the 2005 Geography curriculum were related to the environment, natural disasters, and environmental problems. Within the subcategory of ecological identity (65), there were objectives about human-natural environment relationship, perception of the natural environment, the causes and consequences of natural disasters, the value of natural resources, the causes and consequences of environmental problems, recycling strategies, and the negative effects of production, distribution, and consumption of mines and energy resources on the environment. Moreover,

the objectives about ecology aimed at inculcating in the students a sense of responsibility towards environmental problems and functioning of the ecosystem.

2018 Curriculum

The ecological identity (70) theme in the 2018 Geography curriculum included objectives about the causes, consequences and types of environmental problems, disasters and protection methods, the effect of technology on the environment, the natural environment and the effects of humans on the natural environment, the use of natural resources, the ecosystem, the use of renewable/non-renewable energy resources and sustainable development. There were objectives related to the impact of the Ramsar Convention, Kyoto Protocol and other environmental organisations and agreements on environmental management and protection. It was observed that the values of love for nature and responsibility regarding the environment were also included. In addition, it was remarked that many goals of the geography curriculum were related to the environment.

Social (Cultural) Identity

2005 Curriculum

Within the theme of social identity, there were expressions related to Turkish culture and social values. Within the subcategory of culture, there were expressions about cultural regions and the spread of culture.

Within the value subcategory, it was determined that there were also emphases on tolerance, love, respect, aesthetics and sensitivity values.

2018 Curriculum

Values such as justice, friendship, honesty, respect, love, responsibility and helpfulness, which were the root values in the 2018 Geography curriculum, were the values within the theme of social identity.

Universal Identity

2005 Curriculum

Under the theme of universal identity in the 2005 geography curriculum, there were the subcategories of global economy (21), population and migration (18), different countries and regions (9), international organisations (7), and natural disasters (5).

In the subcategory of global economy, there were objectives that included lifestyles from past to present, types of economic activities and general characteristics, the effect of industrialisation on countries, trade between countries, the level of development of countries, and the impact of economic activities on social and cultural life.

In the subcategory of population and international migration, it was observed that there were objectives related to the distribution and change of the world population in the historical process, the factors that affect the population distribution, and the population policies of different periods of the countries.

Under the subcategory of different regions and countries, there were expressions regarding the geographical characteristics of different regions, developed and underdeveloped countries in the world.

In the subcategory of international organisations, economic, political and environmental organisations that were active at the regional and global level, their classification and their importance for Turkey were emphasised.

In the subcategory of natural disasters, it was remarked that there were objectives related to the earthquakes that occur around the world, the causes of natural disasters, the practices that cause natural disasters, the effects of natural disasters and the protection methods.

The theme of universal identity also emphasised the responsibility for peace and the protection of the world and humanity.

2018 Curriculum

Under the theme of universal identity, there were expressions related to the global economy (13), world population and migration (12), different countries and regions (11), and international organisations (9).

The subcategory of global economy involved objectives related to the international trade, world trade centers, international trade routes, tourism, industrialisation process of states, energy transmission lines, the effect of technology on trade, and natural resources.

In the subcategory of different countries and regions, there were objectives related to examples of different regions in the world, their characteristics and the criteria used in determining the region, the characteristics of developed and undeveloped countries, the problems that cause conflict between countries and their causes. Under the theme of universal identity, statements about the locations of continents and oceans, the locations of countries and the first cultural centres, different cultural regions, and the importance of cultural diversity were included.

It was observed that the objectives related to the distribution of the world population, the population policies followed by different countries, the causes and consequences of migration in the world, and refugee migration were included in relation to the world population and international migration. Global and regional political, military and economic organisations, of which Turkey is a member, were included in the universal identity.

Moreover, the Turkish Qualifications Framework and communication, cultural awareness and expression in foreign languages that were included in the curriculum are competencies directly related to universal identity.

Digital Identity

2005 Curriculum

There were expressions related to digital identity (5), albeit a small number, in the 2005 geography curriculum. These were the emphasis on using information technologies, the importance of technology in the development of the country, technological changes and using geographic information systems.

2018 Curriculum

In the 2018 Geography curriculum, however, there were explanations about digital commerce, cyber security, the importance of digitalisation in the development of countries, the use of GIS and other spatial technologies in the solution of geographical problems, regarding the theme of digital identity. However, as in all curricula updated in 2018, the "competencies" section was added to the geography course curriculum. In this context, Digital Competence and Mathematical Competence and basic competencies in science/technology in the Turkish Competences Framework were directly related to digital identity. Moreover, the "Fundamental Philosophy and General Goals" section of 2018 curriculum involved the statement "emphasis has been increased on the use of information and communication technologies in all areas of our lives, in geography teaching and on the relationship between objectives and daily life" (MEB, 2018, p. 11).

Religious Identity

2005 Curriculum

In the 2005 geography curriculum, no association was made with religious identity.

2018 Curriculum

In the category of religious identity, there were some objectives related to Islamic religious history. Among these objectives, Muslim scientists who contributed to the development of geography and the prominent features of Islamic cities (Samarkand, Bukhara, Konya, etc.) were emphasised.

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

In this study, in which the 2005 and 2018 secondary education geography curricula were examined in terms of identity construction, a number of results were obtained.

It is seen that there are concrete expressions for the construction of national identity in both curricula. This result shows us that an important instrumental function of geography lesson in identity construction still continues from the first years of the republic to the present day. It is seen

that the content of the “nationalization of geography” (Özgen, 2011; Özkan, 2014), which strengthened the nationalist tendency in the geography course in the first years of the Republic (1920s and 1930s), continues today. In addition, in the examined curricula, there are contents on the themes of ecological identity, universal identity and digital identity in accordance with the necessity of the age. However, in the 2005 and 2018 curricula, national identity is still the most expressed theme.

Within the theme of national identity, there were mainly expressions related to the “geography of the homeland”. In the homeland geography, all the details of Turkey’s geopolitical position and importance, geographical location, landforms, climate, population and settlements were given. The goal of contributing to the construction of national identity by giving these details of the homeland geography is maintained. The presence of a clear effort to build national identity in history textbooks and curricula since the first years of the Republic has been demonstrated by many studies (Parlak, 2005; Güvenç, 2010; Copeaux, 2016; Pamuk, 2017; Ersanlı, 2018; Turan, 2009; Yıldırım, 2014). Although it is not as common as the research in the field of history education, it can be observed that some research also focused on the geography curriculum and textbooks for identity construction, albeit in a limited number (Özgen, 2011; Özkan, 2014; Çayır, 2014).

In the process of forming identities, geography education contributes to the recognition of the ethnic, social, and cultural structure of the society and the reasons that create them through physical and human elements. Thanks to geographical objectives, a citizenship consciousness is formed in people. In this way, people see themselves as a part of the society they live in and feel responsible for the society and their environment (Akınoğlu, 2006).

As Smith stated, one of the basic conditions for the formation of national identity and for it to show/maintain its existence is a “historical land/country or homeland” (Smith, 2017, p. 30). The comprehension of these lands by the citizens with all their geographical features and the fact that they are unique in the world play a very important role in the construction of national identity. Citizenship and identity awareness is formed in people who know and learn their geography. In this way, people feel responsible for the society and environment in which they live (Özünal, 2015). Therefore, there is a direct relationship between geography education and identity construction. The famous Turkish thinker and educator Satı Bey stated the following at the conference organised in Istanbul in 1913:

Geography is a very important course to teach the physical features and parts of the homeland. History as a science is important to teach the spirit of the homeland. Both sciences are very important tools for patriotic education. The teaching of these two sciences should be restructured to awaken patriotism in people’s hearts (Satı Bey, 1913 as cited in Özkan, 2014, p. 457).

Özkan (2014) states that in the geography textbooks that he has studied since the last periods of the Ottoman Empire, after 1923, education has been an important tool in the nationalisation of daily life and space by the

state, so spatial representations such as maps and images used in geography textbooks have changed dramatically with the establishment of the republic. The main purpose of these changes is the effort to create a "national homeland".. When the history of modern nation-states is reviewed, it can be seen that the patriotisation of space is a common situation. With the nationalisation of the geography and the society gaining an identity with the homeland, the nation is embodied; land and political integrity/sovereignty create nation-states (Taştan, 2012).

Nation-states, since their establishment, have taken measures to eliminate conflicts between social classes by uniting the people within their geographical borders around certain ideals, beliefs and values, and by providing education and language unity. In this way, they aimed to create a new national identity; they have reached a homogeneous, holistic definition of national identity. The same process was experienced in the establishment of the Republic of Turkey. A new national identity was built on a modern line with Kemalist ideology (Polat, 2011).

In both curricula examined, there were statements about the national economy in terms of agriculture and livestock, industry, trade, tourism, transportation and energy resources, regional development projects, Turkey's tourism potential and policies, and geographically indicated products. The national economy has an important place in the construction of national identity. As in all nation-states, efforts have been made to create a national economy in our country since the years of the War of Independence. The principle of establishing a National Economy was adopted at the Izmir Economy Congress.

One of the surprising results within the theme of national identity was that while many associations were made with Kemalism in the 2005 curriculum, there was no association with the subjects of Kemalism in the 2018 curriculum. Mustafa Kemal Atatürk is an important and indispensable leader for the Turkish society. During World War I, the Ottoman Empire was occupied, Atatürk brought the Turkish nation together, led the War of Independence and declared the current Turkish Republic on the 29th of October 1923. For this reason, the new generation was requested to know Atatürk and to be raised as citizens with Kemalist thought (Kuş, 2014).

In line with this understanding, the beginning of teaching the History of Revolution courses dates back to 1925 (Kaymakçı & Er, 2009). With the decision taken in 1982, it was emphasised that teachers should educate their students as citizens who adhere to Atatürk's reforms and principles. In 1986, it was officially accepted that the subjects of Kemalism should be transferred to all courses in primary and secondary education programmes (Yılmaz, 2006). The subject of Kemalism was mentioned in the 1983 curriculum for the first time in geography courses (Merter, 2012). In 1999, it was determined how the topics related to Kemalism would be included in the curriculum and took their place in all curricula in the form of an objective and behaviour approach. In the reorganisation of the curriculum in 2005, the subject approach was adopted instead of the previous objective and behaviour approach in the majority of primary education courses, and the subject sequences were written in the explanations section (Ata, 2006).

The results of this research showed that while Kemalism was included in the 2005 curriculum, it was not included in the last updated 2018 curriculum.

In both curricula, the values of loyalty to national values, protection of the homeland, sensitivity to the integrity of the homeland and national values, solidarity and patriotism were emphasised. Doğanay and Sever (2011) stated that the sense of patriotism can be gained through the geography of the country. The common love for the common living space, represented by the homeland, is one of the strongest spiritual bonds between people. The wars and bloodshed for the protection of the common homeland are for making the place an indispensable homeland. This is why patriotism and nationalism are often seen in the same sense (Erdem, 2008, pp. 155-156).

Geography is a social science. Individuals living in society are expected to know the environment in which they live. People who do not know the geography they live in are not aware of some values. Geography gives people a cultural and national identity. Thanks to geography, the love of country and consciousness increase and people form some identities. In order to create identities, first of all, geography education contributes to the individual's recognising the culture, the society, the country and the reasons that create them, with physical human elements (Akinoğlu, 2006).

Ecological identity is a broad concept that includes values, beliefs, attitudes and behaviours towards the environment (Gezer & İlhan, 2018). It was observed that there were many contents related to ecological identity in the examined curricula. The ecological identity theme included objectives related to the human-natural environment relationship, the perception of the natural environment, the causes and consequences of natural disasters, the value of natural resources, the ecosystem, the use of renewable/non-renewable energy resources and sustainable development. Through all these objectives, it prompted the students to develop values, beliefs, attitudes and behaviours towards protecting the environment.

Akinoğlu and Sarı (2009) examined the environmental issues in the curricula of primary education courses in Turkey, and they found that the curricula emphasised some themes such as basic concepts of environment and ecology, the structure of the world, natural disasters, conscious consumption of resources, environmental cleanliness, and weather events.

The reasons, consequences, types of environmental problems and giving more space to environmental conventions, protocols and international environmental organisations in the 2018 curriculum is another result related to ecological identity. Moreover, it has been concluded that many items in the general goals of the 2018 geography curriculum are related to the environment. Global environmental problems created by the global expansion of industrialisation, urbanisation and rapid economic growth have created concerns about both the human species and the future of the planet on which it lives (Kılıç & Tok, 2014). Therefore, in line with all these concerns, the number of studies on the environment in different disciplines has increased rapidly and has emerged as an interdisciplinary approach. In this direction, it is desired to create an environmentalist

identity by including environmental education and environmental literacy skills in many curricula such as geography, biology, social studies and life sciences in the education system.

Undoubtedly, one of the most important concepts in the formation process of identity is deprivation. The attempts of the individuals to eliminate the deprivation they see in themselves play an important role in the formation of a new identity in them. One of the most important deprivations that modern society feels is undoubtedly a clean environment and unspoiled natural areas. The fact that the existing traditional ideologies and the industrial society that emerged under their influence are far from meeting the expectations of individuals regarding the environment in the social and economic field has led to the emergence of environmentalist thought and gradually its transformation into a new ideology. The fact that the traditional ideologies of the right and the left are insufficient to solve the political, socio-economic and environmental problems throughout the world and polarise the countries and draw them to the battle line, facilitated the strengthening of environmentalist views in the social arena and the emergence of ecological identity as a new type of collective identity (Kılıç & Tok, 2014).

It is one of the results of the research that many expressions related to the theme of universal identity are included in the 2005 and 2018 geography curricula. Regarding the universal identity, geographical information about the global economy, world population and international migration, international organisations and different parts of the world are included. In the 2005 curriculum, the responsibility for peace, protection of the world and humanity is also emphasised within the theme of universal identity.

In addition, as in all recently updated curricula, the Turkish Qualifications Framework, which was designed to be compatible with the European Qualifications Framework, was included in the 2018 Geography curriculum. Competencies such as "communication in foreign languages", "cultural awareness and expression", within this framework, are directly related to universal identity. It is observable in the literature that expressions about globalisation are more common in all curricula updated since 2005 (Çengelci, 2007; Sağlam, Vural & Akdeniz, 2011).

However, special importance is given to universal identity in geography education. Education conceptualised within the framework provided by globalisation, and geography education, in particular, have a modern function and understanding of conveying epistemological truths to students with "universal" knowledge and ethics (not cultural or religious ethics) (Öztürk & Karabağ, 2013). Geography education makes significant and important contributions to the country's accumulation in political fields, as well as researching the increasing problems of the global world, both commercially and professionally.

In the modern world, geography is no longer approached as a lesson that makes people memorise the characters and some of the usual features of places and locations in the form of a series. The geography curriculum

developed and implemented after the declaration of the International Geography Education Declaration should include knowledge, skills, values and concepts for global and regional developments (Kaya, 2014). In line with these explanations, it was seen that there were objectives and explanations for universal identity in both curricula.

Another conclusion of the research was that while there were very few statements about digital identity in the 2005 curriculum, more emphasis was placed in the 2018 curriculum, in line with the competencies in the Turkish Qualifications Framework. Digital identities include everything that individuals do or share in the online world (Kavut, 2020). Depending on the technological developments that have occurred in recent years, individuals are becoming more involved in the digital world. Therefore, within the education system, content aimed at developing digital competencies and digital identities within the framework of rights/responsibilities were included. The increase in the 2018 curriculum shows a parallel development. However, it cannot be stated that technological developments and objectives for developing digital identity are sufficiently included in the geography curriculum.

While there was no association with religious identity in the 2005 geography curriculum, there were emphases on Muslim scientists and Islamic cities that contributed to the development of geography in the 2018 curriculum.

References

- Akinođlu, O. & Sarı, A. (2009). İlköğretim Programlarında Çevre Eğitimi [Environmental Education in Primary Education Programs]. *Marmara Üniversitesi Atatürk Eğitim Fakültesi Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi*, 30(30), 5-29. Retrieved 2 October 2021, from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/maruaeabd/issue/372/2144>
- Akinođlu, O. (2006). Coğrafya eğitimi ve toplum [Geography Education and Society]. *Marmara Coğrafya Dergisi*, 13(1), 24-48.
- Anderson, B. (1983). *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London and New York: Verso.
- Aslan, S. & Alkış, M. (2015). Osmanlı'dan Cumhuriyete Geçişte Türkiye'nin Modernleşme Süreci: Laikleşme ve Ulusal Kimlik İnşası [Turkey's Modernisation Process in the Transition from the Ottoman Empire to the Republic: Secularization and National Identity Construction]. *Akademik Yaklaşımlar Dergisi* 6(1), 18-33. Retrieved 2 October 2021, from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/ayd/issue/3333/46201>
- Ata, B. (2006). İlköğretimde Atatürkçülük Konularının Öğretimi: Öğrenci Kompozisyonlarında Atatürkçülük. 21nci Yüzyılın Başında Kemalizm'in Anlaşılması ve Anlatılmasındaki Sorunlar [Teaching the Subjects of Kemalism in Primary Education: Kemalism in Student Compositions. Problems in Understanding and Explaining Kemalism at the Beginning of the 21st Century]. Yeditepe Üniversitesi, Atatürk İlkeleri ve İnkılâp Tarihi Enstitüsü, 8-9 Kasım.

- Atasoy, T. & Koç, H. (2015). Coğrafya Öğretiminin Aktif Vatandaşlık Eğitimindeki Rolü: Öğretim Üyesi Görüşleri [The Role of Geography Teaching in Active Citizenship Education: Faculty Members' Views]. *Zeitschrift für die Welt der Türken/Journal of the World of Turks*, 7(2), 113-131.
- Atmaca, D. & Çamurcu, H. (2020). Milli Bilinç Oluşturmada Coğrafya Dersinin Etkisine Yönelik Öğretmen Görüşleri [Teachers' Views on the Effect of Geography Lesson in Creating National Consciousness]. (Çanakkale İli Örneği), *Milli Kültür Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 4(2), 77-84.
- Banini, T. (2021). Chapter 1. Towards a Methodology for Constructing Local Territorial Identities. In Ilovan, O.-R. (ed.), *Territorial Identities in Action* (pp. 13-39). Cluj-Napoca: Presa Universitară Clujeană.
- Bloor, M. & Wood, F. (2006). *Keywords in Qualitative Methods: A Vocabulary of Research Concepts*. Sage Publications Ltd.
- Copeaux, E. (2016). *Tarih ders kitaplarında (1931-1993) Türk Tarih Tezi'nden Türk İslam sentezine [From Turkish History Thesis to Turkish-Islamic Synthesis in History Textbooks (1931-1993)]*. (Translation: A. Berktaş). İstanbul: İletişim.
- Creswell, J.W. (2002). *Educational Research: Planning, Conducting, and Evaluating Quantitative and Qualitative Research*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Merrill Prentice Hall.
- Creswell, J.W. (2013). *Nitel araştırma yöntemleri [Qualitative Research Methods]* (Translation: M. Bütün ve SB Demir). İstanbul: Siyasal.
- Çayır, K. (2014). "Biz" kimiz? Ders kitaplarında kimlik, yurttaşlık, haklar: Ders kitaplarında insan hakları III projesi: Tarama sonuçları [Who Are We? Identity, Citizenship, Rights in Textbooks: Human Rights III Project in Textbooks: Survey Results]. Tarih Vakfı; Seçbir Sosyoloji ve Eğitim Çalışmaları Merkezi.
- Çengelci, T. (2007). Küresel eğitimin Türkiye'de 2004 ilköğretim programlarına yansımaları [Reflection of Global Education on 2004 Primary Education Programs in Turkey]. Unpublished Research, Eskişehir.
- Dalbay, R.S. (2018). "Kimlik" ve "Toplumsal Kimlik" Kavramı [The Concepts of "Identity" and "Social Identity"]. *Süleyman Demirel Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 31, 161-176.
- Demirci, A. & Arslan, S. (2004). Toplumda Mekânsal Bilincin Geliştirilmesi: Mekânsal Vatandaşlık [Developing Spatial Consciousness in Society: Spatial Citizenship]. *Coğrafya Eğitimi Dergisi*, 1(2), 10-30.
- Doğanay, H. & Sever, R., (2011). *Genel Fiziki Coğrafya [General Physical Geography]*. 5th Edition. Ankara: Pegem Yayınları.
- Doğanay, H. & Zaman, S. (2002). Orta Öğretim Coğrafya Eğitiminde Hedefler-Stratejiler ve Amaçlar [Goals-Strategies and Aims in Secondary Education Geography Education]. *Doğu Coğrafya Dergisi*, 7(8), 6-25.
- Durgun, S. (2018). *Memalik-i Şahane'den Vatan'a [From Memalik-i Şahane to Vatan]*. İstanbul: İletişim.
- Engin, İ., Akbaş, Y. & Gençtürk, E. (2003). I. Coğrafya kongresinden günümüze liselerimizde müfredat programlarındaki değişimler [Changes in the Curriculum in Our High Schools from the 1st Geography Congress to the Present]. *Milli Eğitim Dergisi*, 157, 103-114.

- Erbaş, S. & Aksoy, B. (2020). Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretmen Adaylarının Millî Kimlik Algılarının İncelenmesi [Investigation of National Identity Perceptions of Social Studies Teacher Candidates]. *Journal of History Culture and Art Research*, 9(4), 415-428.
- Erdem, G. (2008). *Türk kimdir? Türklük nedir? [Who Is Turkish? What Is Turkishness?]*. İstanbul: Töre-Devlet.
- Ersanlı, B. (2018). *İktidar ve Tarih Türkiye’de "Resmi Tarih" Tezinin Oluşumu (1929-1937) [Power and History. The Formation of the "Official History" Thesis in Turkey (1929-1937)]*. İstanbul: İletişim.
- Geçit, Y. (2008). Liselerde Coğrafya Öğretim Amaçlarına Yönelik Tarihsel Bir Analiz [A Historical Analysis of Geography Teaching Objectives in High Schools]. *Marmara Coğrafya Dergisi*, 17, 113-139.
- Gellner, E. (1987). *Culture, Identity, and Politics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Gezer, M. & İlhan, M. (2018). Ekolojik Kimlik Ölçeğinin Türkçe Uyarlaması: Geçerlik ve Güvenirlik Çalışması [Turkish Adaptation of Ecological Identity Scale: Validity and Reliability Study]. *Gazi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 38(3), 1121-1142.
- Güngör, M. (2017). Bir Kimlik İnşası Olarak Ulus-Devlet Yurttaşlığı ve Yurttaşlık Kavramının Dönüşümü [Nation-State Citizenship as an Identity Construction and Transformation of the Concept of Citizenship]. *Mersin Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 13(2), 438-464.
- Güvenç, B. (2010). *Türk Kimliği Kültür Tarihinin Kaynakları [Sources of Turkish Identity Cultural History]*. İstanbul: Boyut.
- Huntington, S.P. (2004). *Biz Kimiz? Amerika'nın Ulusal Kimlik Arayışı [Who Are We? America's Quest for a National Identity]* (Translation: A. Özer). İstanbul: CSA Global.
- İbret, B.Ü., Aydın, F. & Turgut, T. (2018). Coğrafya eğitiminin birey yetiştirilmesindeki rolü [The Role of Geography Education in Raising Individuals]. *International Journal of Geography and Geography Education*, 38, 1-19.
- Karakılıç, C. & Müjdecı, M. (2014). Yurttaşlık Bilgisi Kitaplarında Kimlik ve Vatandaşlık (1950-1960) [Identity and Citizenship in Civics Books (1950-1960)]. *Pursuit of History*, 11, 173-198.
- Karasu-Avcı, E. & İbret, Ü. (2018). Toplumsal kimliğin oluşumunda sosyal bilgiler dersinin rolünün incelenmesi: Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretim Programları (1968, 1998, 2005) [Examining the Role of Social Studies Course in the Formation of Social Identity: Social Studies Curriculum (1968, 1998, 2005)]. *Adıyaman Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 10(29), 510-550.
- Kavut, S. (2020). Kimliğin Dönüşümü: Dijital Kimlikler [Transformation of Identity. Digital Identities]. *Selçuk İletişim*, 13(2), 987-1008. Retrieved 4 October 2021, from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/josc/issue/55089/691445>
- Kaya, H. (2013). *Neden Coğrafya? Neden Coğrafya Eğitimi? [Why Geography? Why Geography Education?]* (Master's Thesis). Ankara: Gazi Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü.
- Kaya, N. (2014). Küresel Gelişmeler Işığında Coğrafya Öğretim Programına Eleştirel Bir Bakış [A Critical Look at the Geography Curriculum in the Light of Global Developments]. *Milli Eğitim Dergisi*, 44(203), 107-128.

- Kaymakçı, S. & Er, H. (2009). T. C. İnkılap Tarihi ve Atatürkçülük Dersinin Öğretimi Üzerine Yapılan Tezlerin Analizi [Analysis of Theses on the Teaching of "Turkish Republic History of Revolution and Kemalism"]. *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Cumhuriyet Tarihi Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 5(9), 165-181.
- Kılıç, S. & Tok, N. (2014). Çevrecilikte Yeni Bir Kimlik: Ekolojizm [A New Identity in Environmentalism: Ecology]. *Akademik İncelemeler Dergisi*, 223-250. Retrieved 4 October 2021, from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/akademikincelemeler/issue/1544/18963>
- Kurtdaş, E.M. & Ulukaya-Öteleş, Ü.U. (2021). Ulusal ve Küresel Kimlik Bağlamında Sosyal Bilgiler Eğitimi [Social Studies Education in the Context of National and Global Identity]. *İnönü Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 22(2), 1115-1168.
- Kuş, Z. (2014). What Kind of Citizen? An Analysis of the Social Studies Curriculum in Turkey. *Citizenship, Social and Economics Education*, 13(2), 132-145.
- Kuş, Z. (2020). *Türkiye’de ve Dünyada ve Vatandaşlık Eğitimi* [Citizenship Education in Turkey and in the World]. Ankara: Pegem Yayıncılık.
- MEB (Ministry of National Education) (2005). *Coğrafya Dersi Öğretim Programı* [Geography Lesson Curriculum]. Ankara.
- MEB (Ministry of National Education) (2018). *Coğrafya Dersi Öğretim Programı* [Geography Lesson Curriculum]. Ankara.
- Merriam, S.B. (1998). *Qualitative Research and Case Study Applications in Education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Merriam, S.B. (2013). *Nitel araştırma: Desen ve uygulama için bir rehber* [Qualitative Research: A Guide to Design and Implementation] (Translation from 3rd Edition, Translation Editor: S. Turan). Ankara: Nobel Yayın Dağıtım.
- Merter, F. (2012). Coğrafya Öğretim Programlarında (1924’ten Günümüze) Atatürkçülük ve Türk Kültürü [Kemalism and Turkish Culture in Geography Teaching Programmes (From 1924 to Present)]. *JASS*. 5(7), 1013-1054.
- Mollaer, F. (2019). *Kimlik, Tanınma Mücadelesi ve Şarkiyatçılık* [Identity, Struggle for Recognition and Orientalism]. İstanbul: Metis.
- Okur, M. (2013). *Liselerde Coğrafya Eğitiminin Milli Kimlik Bilincine Etkisinin Öğrenci Görüşlerine Göre Değerlendirilmesi* [Evaluation of the Effect of Geography Education on National Identity Consciousness in High Schools According to Student Views] (Master’s Thesis). Ankara: Gazi Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü.
- Ozan, H. & Kuş, Z. (2021). Meşrutiyetten Cumhuriyete Vatandaşlık Öğretim Programlarında Kimlik İnşası [Identity Construction in Citizenship Education Programmes from the Constitutional Monarchy to the Republic]. *Eğitim ve Toplum Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 8(2).
- Özgen, N. (2011). Türkiye Cumhuriyeti'nin Kuruluşundan Günümüze, Coğrafya Ders Kitaplarında Vatanın Sonu Gelmez Kurguları [From the Establishment of the Republic of Turkey to the Present, the Endless Fictions of the Homeland in Geography Textbooks]. *Toplum ve Bilim*, 121, 48-78.
- Özkan, B. (2014) Making a National *Vatan* in Turkey: Geography Education in the Late Ottoman and Early Republican Periods. *Middle Eastern Studies*, 50(3), 457-481.

- Öztürk, M. & Karabağ, S. (2013). Küreselleşmenin Epistemolojisi ve Coğrafya Eğitimi [Epistemology of Globalization and Geography Education]. *Marmara Coğrafya Dergisi*, 27, 72-97.
- Özünal, S. & Özel, A. (2016). Sosyal Bilgilerdeki Coğrafya Konularının Kimlik ve Vatandaşlık Bilinci Kazandırmasına İlişkin Öğretmen Görüşleri [Teachers' Opinions on Gaining Identity and Citizenship Awareness of Geography Subjects in Social Studies]. *Akademik Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 4(23), 348-369.
- Özünal, S. (2015). *Sosyal Bilgiler Dersinde Coğrafya Konularının Kimlik İnşası ve Vatandaşlık Bilinci Kazandırmasına İlişkin Öğretmen Görüşleri [Teachers' Views on Identity Construction and Citizenship Awareness of Geography Subjects in Social Studies Lesson]* (Doctoral Thesis). Kütahya: Dumlupınar Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü.
- Pamuk, A. (2017). *Kimlik ve tarih kimliğinin inşasında tarihin kullanımı [Identity and History. The Use of History in the Construction of Identity]*. İstanbul: Yeni İnsan.
- Parlak, İ. (2005). *Kemalist ideoloji 'de eğitim erken cumhuriyet dönemi tarih ve yurt bilgisi ders kitapları üzerine bir inceleme [An Investigation of Education, Early Republican History and Civics Textbooks in Kemalist Ideology]*. Ankara: Turhan Kitabevi.
- Polat, E.G. (2011). Osmanlıdan Günümüze Vatandaşlık Anlayışı [Understanding of Citizenship from the Ottomans to the Present]. *Ankara Barosu Dergisi*, 3, 127-157.
Retrieved 7 October 2021, from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/abd/issue/33792/374228>
- Sağlam, M., Vural, L. & Akdeniz, C. (2011). Küreselleşmenin Türkiye'deki İlköğretim Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretim Programı ve Ders Kitaplarında Görülen Yansımaları. [Reflections of Globalization in Primary Education Social Studies Curriculum and Textbooks in Turkey]. *Elektronik Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 10(35), 1-15.
- Smith, A.D. (1987). *The Ethnic Origins of Nations*. New York: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Smith, A.D. (2017). *Milli kimlik [National Identity]* (Translation: Bahadır Sina Şener). İstanbul: İletişim.
- Strauss, A.L. & Corbin, J. (1990). *Basics of Qualitative Research: Grounded Theory Producers and Techniques*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Şahin, A.M. (2019). Yakup Kadri Karaosmanoğlu'nun Hikâyelerinde Millî Kimlik İnşası. [National Identity Construction in Yakup Kadri Karaosmanoğlu's Stories]. *Uluslararası Beşerî Bilimler ve Eğitim Dergisi*, 5(10), 275-292.
- Taştan, Y.K. (2012). Kanonik Topraklardan Ulusal Vatana: Balkan Savaşları ve Türk Ulusçuluğunun Doğuşu [From Canonical Lands to National Homeland: The Balkan Wars and the Birth of Turkish Nationalism]. *Türk Dünyası İncelemeleri Dergisi*, 12(2), 1-99. Retrieved 2 October 2021, from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/egetdid/issue/34457/380673>
- Turan, M. (2009). *1950 İle 1960 Yılları Arası Ortaokul Tarih Dersi Kitaplarında Yer Alan Milli Kimlik Kavramının İçerik Analizi. [Content Analysis of the Concept of National Identity in Secondary School History Textbooks Between 1950 and 1960]*. (Master's Thesis). Ankara: Gazi Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü.

- Türkcan, B. & Bozkurt, M. (2015). İlkokul Öğrencilerinin Sosyal Bilgiler Dersi Bağlamında Kimlik, Kültür ve Yurttaşlık Algıları [Primary School Students' Perceptions of Identity, Culture and Citizenship in the Context of Social Studies Lesson]. *Turkish Studies*, 10(11), 1501-1526.
- Yıldırım, A. & Şimşek, H. (2005). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri* [Qualitative Research Methods in the Social Sciences] (8th Edition). Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.
- Yıldırım, T. (2014). *Meşrutiyetten Günümüze Tarih Ders Kitaplarında Türk Kimliğinin İnşası* [The Construction of Turkish Identity in History Textbooks from the Second Constitutional Era to the Present]. (Doctoral Thesis). İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü.
- Yılmaz, M.S. (2006). Türkiye Cumhuriyeti İnkılâp Tarihi ve Atatürkçülük dersi konularının ilköğretimde öğretimi [Teaching the Subjects of Turkish Republic History of Revolution and Kemalism in Primary Education]. In Doğaner, Y. (ed.), *Türk eğitim sisteminde Atatürkçülük ve cumhuriyet tarihi öğretimi* [Kemalism and Republican History Teaching in the Turkish Education System] (pp. 24-44). Ankara: Hacettepe Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- Yörü, S. (2007). *Vatan Sevgisi ve Yurttaşlık Bilinci Oluşturmada Lise Coğrafya Derslerinin Yerinin Değerlendirilmesi* [Evaluation of High School Geography Lessons in Creating Patriotism and Citizenship Awareness]. (Master's Thesis). Ankara: Gazi Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü.