

Multiple Case Studies on the Impact of Apprenticeship of Observation on Novice EFL Teachers' Cognition and Practices¹

Mohammad Mosiur Rahman^{2, 3}, Manjet Kaur Mehar Singh⁴, Universiti Sains Malaysia, Penang, Malaysia

Md Salman Fersi⁵, Shamsul Haque Khan School and College, Dhaka, Bangladesh

Abstract

Cognition plays an important role in language teacher decision-making. A number of sources, including schooling, influence the cognition of language teachers. The concept of schooling is identified as the history of teachers' own personal education influences on the teachers' knowledge, also referred to as apprenticeship of observation (AO). Through further conceptualization of schooling/AO involving the notion of history-in-person, the current multiple case study explored the prior learning experience of two Bangladeshi novice teachers of English: Kamrul and Monabbir (pseudonym), and how these experiences influenced their cognition of language. The findings suggest that the prior learning experience of English teachers has influenced their cognition and has taken on distinctive trajectories. Both AO and anti-apprenticeship of observation (anti-AO) were documented on the basis of the positive and negative English learning experiences of Kamrul and Monabbir at school. The article concludes with the implication of schooling in shaping the knowledge of language teachers and developing a context-based teacher education program.

Resumen

La cognición juega un papel importante en la enseñanza de la toma de decisiones del profesor de idiomas. Varias fuentes, incluida la escolarización, influyen en la cognición de los profesores de idiomas. El concepto de escolarización se identifica como la historia de las influencias de la educación personal de los profesores en su conocimiento, también conocido como aprendizaje de observación (AO). A través de una mayor conceptualización de la escolarización que involucra la noción de "historia en persona", este estudio de caso múltiple exploró la experiencia de aprendizaje previa de dos profesores principiantes de inglés de Bangladesh: Kamrul y Monabbir (seudónimos), y cómo estas experiencias influyeron en su cognición de idioma. Los hallazgos sugieren que la experiencia de aprendizaje previa de los profesores de inglés ha influido en su cognición y ha tomado trayectorias distintivas. Tanto el AO como el anti-aprendizaje de observación (anti-AO) se documentaron sobre la base de las experiencias positivas y negativas de aprendizaje del inglés de Kamrul y Monabbir en la escuela. El artículo concluye con la implicación de la escolarización en la formación del conocimiento de los profesores de idiomas y el desarrollo de un programa de formación docente basado en el contexto.

Introduction

Since English has become the lingua franca of today's globalized world, the language has become an important tool for emerging economies (Rahman & Pandian, 2018). It has become relevant to examine the manner in which teachers, both in English as foreign language (EFL) and English as second language (ESL) contexts, believe or understand how English should be taught. On that note, language cognition has attracted a great deal of attention in educational research (Basturkmen, 2012). Research has shown that language teacher cognition (LTC) plays an important role in both pre-service and in-service teacher education and the actual practice of teaching the language. It is mainly because LTC has a significant impact on teaching decision-making in the classroom (Borg, 2003). However, it is often difficult to determine clearly whether a teacher knows or believes any aspect of pedagogy, as well as the source of that knowledge and belief (Borg, 2015). Therefore, as a source of LTC, it is also important to understand how teachers' previous learning experiences can influence their teaching beliefs and affect how they teach (Borg, 2003). Borg (2015) identified the phenomenon as schooling, that is the personal history and experience of teachers in the classroom while learning a/the language. According to Borg, schooling determines the preconception of teachers and teaching. However, in his seminal work, Lortie (1975) referred to this schooling period as the 'apprenticeship of observation' (AO) which includes multiple meaningful interactions and experiences that may play a key role in influencing teacher behavior. In this study, AO and schooling, are used interchangeably, not necessarily implying any conceptual or theoretical distinction. Novice teachers in an

¹ This is a refereed article. Received: 4 June, 2020. Accepted: 20 August, 2020.

² The first author acknowledges the support of Institute of Postgraduate Studies, Universiti Sains Malaysia for the Vice-Chancellor Award 2019.

³ mosiurbhai@gmail.com

⁴ manjeet@usm.my

⁵ salman.fersi@northsouth.edu

EFL context, such as Bangladesh, may not recognize if their prior schooling experience or AO impact what they value in pedagogy and how these affect their classroom practices.

Conceptualising Teacher Cognition and Schooling Experience in Language Teaching

LTC is an umbrella concept that informs what teachers believe, think and know (Borg, 2003). As defined by Borg (2015), teacher cognition can be “characterized as an often tacit, personally-held, practical system of mental constructs held by teachers and which are dynamic - that is, defined and refined on the basis of educational and professional experiences throughout teachers’ lives” (p. 40). In his influential work on language cognition, Borg (2003) identified teacher cognition as a dynamic process involving a wide range of issues related to the life and work of a teacher. As Borg (2015) theorized, LTC has several constructs, such as: belief, knowledge, attitude, perception, assumptions, conception, principles. All aspects of teaching and learning issues in the classroom are linked to these constructs. According to Borg (2015), these constructs of language teachers, together with aspects of teaching and learning, are referred to as the cognition of teachers. In this study, teachers’ belief as a construct of teacher cognition was investigated in relation to their teaching and learning philosophy and environment.

Borg (2015) has developed an LTC model comprised of notions which form the teacher’s cognition and explain their connections with each other, including: (a) schooling, which is described as one’s personal educational history; (b) professional coursework; and (c) contextual factors, which influence the cognition and practices of language teachers. According to Borg (2015), schooling influences teachers’ knowledge. Lortie (1975) described the influence of prior language learning in teaching as AO, which explains that the source of teacher cognition is their prior educational experience where they observe teaching and learning taking place and form their initial philosophy of teaching and learning. This is similar to Borg’s (2015) notion of *schooling*. LTC development is a sophisticated contextual (OR context-bound) cognitive process tied to their prior learning experiences (Johnson, 2015).

In order to further theorize the concept of schooling (Borg, 2015) and how it affects the current state of knowledge and practice of teachers, we drew on Holland and Lave’s (2001) concept of history-in-person. Emerging from the theory of social practice, the concept of human history has been used primarily to explain the processes of social formation and cultural production that emerges as the result of complex social, political and economic struggles (Holland & Lave, 2001). According to Holland et al. (1998) history-in-person is “the sediment from past experiences in which one improvises, using the cultural resources available, in response to the subject positions afforded one in the present” (p. 18). As a result, in their concluding remarks, Burns et al. (2015) identified the need to understand the development of language teachers from a socio-cultural and historical perspective that believes teachers learn from their context and, consequently, shape their understanding of teaching and learning. Thus, previous language learning and teaching experiences, and language teaching is deeply rooted in the everyday behavior of second language (L2) teachers. Accordingly, teachers need to gain some cognitive control over their previous experience in order to adapt to new learning and practice (Borg, 2003; 2015). In most cases, however, these histories and lived experiences remain unarticulated (Moodie, 2016).

(Anti)apprenticeship on LTC and practices. Numerous studies have confirmed that teachers’ AO (Lortie, 1975) influences their cognition and hence their classroom practices. For example, Johnson (1994) argued that previous language learning experience in language classrooms has a significant influence on teacher understanding of instructional strategies that is even more powerful than their teacher training programs in the development of their cognition. Nishino’s (2012) study on Japanese English teachers indicated that teachers’ AO, both in and out of Japanese secondary schools, has strong hold on their classroom practices. In the same vein, in South Korea, Rabbidge (2017) explored how *initial assumptions* based on experience transform into tentative attitudes and then into firmer beliefs about language use in class and found them to be a key factor in the implementation of the government recommended curriculum. These studies have reported strong AO as a learner in L2 teaching cognition and practices. Therefore, training interventions or large-scale curriculum change can not alter or impact novice teachers’ beliefs, attitude or knowledge, since their teaching is primarily informed by their own language learning experience and is identical to the way they have been taught (Borg, 2015; Lortie, 1975). As Kennedy (1991) pointed out in his seminal work, the previous language learning experiences of teacher as a learner make them rigid in changing their classroom practices as teachers and partly explains why teaching has persisted unchanged despite change attempts. Evidently, AO plays a key role in defining novice teachers’ cognition and its influence on their classroom practices because it is very difficult for them to disregard the teaching methods of their schoolteachers when

studying the language. Therefore, it could be argued that curriculum reform and implementation does not influence novice teachers' cognition; they teach in a way that is consistent with the way they were taught in the school (Cancino, Durán, & Solorza, 2020).

However, there are studies that have reported contrary results where teachers avoid teaching practices that they experienced as a learner. Moodie (2016) explained the phenomenon as "anti-apprenticeship of observation," (anti-AO) which refers to how "negative prior language learning experience" influence English-language teachers' cognition and classroom practices (p. 36). For example, Numrich (1996) found that teachers' prior learning experiences (both positive and negative) influenced their future teaching practices. While some teachers favourably adopted approaches such as corrective feedback and explicit grammar instruction in their teaching practise, others refrained using them. In a case study, Golombek (1998) found that Jenny's negative experiences with learning Russian was manifested in her teaching. Due to her previous negative experience as a language learner, Jenny (MA candidate and teaching assistant) hesitated to provide corrective feedback to learners in public during the entire data collection period. Moodie (2016) also found a similar trajectory of teacher cognition and explained the phenomenon as anti-AO, since the teachers intentionally avoided practices that they had experienced during their L2 learning.

The current literature on teacher cognition has established the idea of schooling, AO and anti-AO focused on positive and negative language learning experience of teachers, as essential aspects of teaching behaviour. Davin, Chavoshan, and Donato (2018) found that Anna had taken both trajectories in her teaching cognition and practices. She perceived her positive language learning experiences facilitative to her teaching and incorporated them into her own teaching. On the other hand, she perceived her negative experiences to be harmful for learning and believed they should be avoided in practice. In a recent study at a Chilean private university, Cancino et al. (2020) found pre-service teachers have been greatly influenced by several aspects of their prior language learning experiences, which have led them, according to their context, to replicate or avoid their teacher practices. It is because previous language learning experiences encountered by in-service and pre-service teachers have been related to positive and negative learning memories (Cancino et al., 2020). These studies indicate teachers truly form their identity based on their own personal and historical history (Holland & Lave, 2001). It is now a matter of inquiry as to whether that is the case for novice EFL teachers in Bangladesh.

Positioning Current Study

The current multiple case study was conducted in Bangladesh. Newly adopted education policies clearly demonstrated the significance of English in Bangladesh and of language skills for its citizens (Rahman & Pandian, 2018). In accordance with the policy, curriculum changes focused on communicative language teaching (CLT) took effect in the mid-1990s, replacing the conventional grammar-translation (GTM)-oriented language teaching system, initially in secondary schools and later at all other levels (Rahman, Islam, et al., 2019). Several issues have contributed to the limited implementation of a CLT curriculum. Among them, factors associated with teaching and teaching practices are frequently reported in existing literature (Ali & Walker, 2014; Hamid, 2010, Rahman, Singh, & Pandian, 2018; Rahman, Islam, et al., 2019).

Research has shown that most of the teacher training programs in Bangladesh are ineffective to change the teacher's classroom practices in line with the curriculum and had an impact on the implementation of CLT (Karim et al., 2017; Rahman, Pandian, & Kaur, 2018). However, despite the clear indication that teachers are inhibiting the implementation of new features of language teaching and learning, there is a scarcity of existing studies investigated by teachers that may influence their curriculum, methodology and textbook implementation (see Rahman, Johan, et al., 2019 for an exception). Hence, teachers' prior L2 learning has not been studied so far to project the source of teachers' belief in language teaching and learning. As a result, this study will contribute to the overall development of teachers in the context and scholarship in the field of education by problematizing the issue of two novice teachers' prior English learning experience and its influence on their subsequent (OR future) LTC.

This study sought to find out how the cognition and practices of two Bangladeshi novice secondary school teachers were influenced by their own experience or history as an English language learner (Moodie, 2016). With this particular emphasis on one's own personal experience of education based on Borg's (2015) schooling idea, along with the concept of AO by Lortie (1975) and Holland and Lave's (2001) history-in-person, the present multiple case study was unique in its effort in understanding the teachers by analysing their educational experience narratives. The study was guided by the following research questions:

1. What is the nature of the prior English language learning experiences of novice secondary school teachers in Bangladesh?
2. How do prior English learning experiences influence novice secondary school teachers' stated teaching cognition about teaching and their classroom practices?

In summary, as it is evident from the discussion above, the influences of teachers' prior learning experience on teachers' cognition and practice is complex and varied. For example, cognition resulting from previous experiences is more difficult to alter as teachers have experienced these situations as participants in their learning process. In the context of Bangladesh, consideration should be given to teacher cognition since the implementation of language policy and curriculum has not been carried out as intended, largely due to teachers. This situation can be addressed by developing a knowledge base through teacher education, informed by teacher cognition, and by raising awareness among teachers about how their prior learning experience shapes their beliefs and knowledge to move beyond them. Moreover, the contextual significance of this article is immense, given that Bangladesh remained as an under-researched context in education research in general on the premise of logistics and expertise shortage (Rahman, Islam, Karim, Chowdhury, Rahman, Seraj, & Singh, 2019).

Case Study Design and Cases of the Study

This multiple case study reports on two novice teachers as a part of a larger project that investigated teacher cognition from diversified perspective such as beliefs and practices of CLT (see Rahman, Singh, & Pandian, 2018), teacher cognition and practices in the implementation of curriculum reform (Rahman, Johan, et al., 2019). Instead of investigating the consistencies and discrepancies of teacher cognition and practices on which most of the prior studies in the field concentrated (Basturkman, 2012), this study focused on schooling as a factor that influences and shapes language teacher cognition as identified in Borg's (2015) framework of LTC. Considering the nature of the research question, this study has adopted a qualitative approach to research and multiple case studies (Yin, 2018). In studying the language-teaching mind from a sociohistorical perspective, a qualitative approach best suited the cause (Burns et al., 2015). According to Creswell and Poth (2017), case study research involves the study of an issue explored through one or more cases within a bounded system. Case studies can encompass one case (a sample size of one case), one case with multiple sites, multiple cases at one site, or multiple cases with multiple sites. Employing a literal replication, a multiple case study design has been introduced in this study, as data from a number of cases are often considered more compelling, persuasive, robust and instrumental than a single case study (Yin, 2018). The multiple cases, in this study, address the same research issue using similar data collection and analysis procedures in each setting. Yin (2018) also indicated that the process must be replicated equally in both the settings. In the current study, the replication in the selection of both the cases maintained (see further in the next section below), the data collection instrument and the data analysis procedure were designed to be used to explore both cases, ensuring the highest possible replication.

In the current study, these multiple cases (e.g., two selected cases of this study) are not only expected to provide rich and in-depth understanding of their life events but might also explore teachers' distinctive narratives regarding the impact of schooling on their cognition and practices of language teaching and learning. The novice secondary teachers' in-depth analysis of their schooling experience through a narrative frame (see Barkhuizen, 2011; 2014; Barkhuizen & Wette, 2014) and in-depth interviews allowed highlighting their English learning and teaching experiences through stories, which is the first research question the study seeks to answer. The second research question is of a reflective nature. To answer this question, the teachers articulated the impact of their prior language learning experiences on their teaching cognition and practices (Moodie, 2016). This is particularly important in this study, as these autobiographical narratives of teachers' own experiences in classrooms are a powerful source of experience in the form of their schooling (Davin et al., 2018).

The present multiple case study will contribute to the field by exploring the AO with two EFL teachers, Kamrul (pseudonym) and Monabbir (pseudonym), whose experiences as learners and teachers bridged the shifting national education context in Bangladesh. Kamrul is a 31-year-old senior teacher at the secondary level. He is Bangladeshi and speaks Bangla as his mother tongue. He has been teaching in this school and at the secondary level for past three years. This has been a high performing school in terms of secondary school result in Bangladesh in past five years, with a remarkable graduation rate of 100%, including the latest secondary examination of 2018. English is a required subject for all grades beginning in first grade. Kamrul holds a Master of Arts degree in English and a Bachelor of Arts in English. To be familiar and comply with the CLT curriculum, approach, textbook, and assessment, he has attended several teacher training

programs run by the Ministry of Education (MOE), including a donor-funded teacher training project (see Rabbidge, 2017 for details about the teacher development project). Monabbir is a 30-year-old EFL teacher at the same secondary school based in Dhaka. He is a Bangladeshi citizen and speaks Bangla as his mother tongue. He has been teaching English a little over four years. His undergraduate major was a mixture of literature and linguistics; therefore, he was unfamiliar with many aspects of English language teaching in L2 contexts. However, he also holds a Masters in TESOL. During his masters, he had familiarized himself with many aspects of TESOL. In addition to the formal degrees in English and TESOL, he attended mandatory teacher training offered by the MOE, to familiarise himself with the CLT curriculum, approach, textbook, and assessment system.

Data Collection and Analysis

A narrative framework was used as the main form of data gathering instrument in the study to learn about Kamrul and Monabbir's language learning experience and its impact in their teaching beliefs, understanding and knowledge (Appendix 1). According to Barkhuizen (2011), the narrative frame is

a written story template consisting of a series of incomplete sentences and blank spaces of varying lengths. It is structured like a story in skeletal form. The aim is for participants to produce a coherent story by filling in the spaces according to their own experiences and their reflections on these. (p. 402)

Although similar to questionnaire data, the use of the narrative frame in this study can be rationalized by mentioning its eloquent attribute of the chronological aspect, which allowed the case studies to combine past experiences with current or future actions in a single data collection instrument. In this study, the narrative frame entitled "My English Learning Story and My Teaching Belief of English" was adapted from Davin et al. (2018) and Moodie (2016). Furthermore, an in-depth interview was conducted by the researchers to strengthen the response of the narrative frames of the participants. These questions related primarily to their past experience as English-language learners, their current views on teaching approaches, and their perceived impact on their cognition and teaching practices, and allow teachers to add anything they want that they could not add in the narrative frame

The data collected from the narrative frame and the in-depth interviews were transcribed and analysed using qualitative content analysis. Data analysis of this study was ongoing and recursive, a feature of qualitative case studies (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). The data were analysed inductively, developing codes and themes, what Yin (2018) explained as "working your data from the ground up" (p. 217). This inductive strategy can yield appreciable benefits that have been demonstrated yet again in grounded theory research (Corbin & Strauss, 2014). The transcripts were repeatedly scanned for the purpose of coding (Creswell & Poth, 2017). Once this data coding was concluded, codes were compared to for the purpose of finding similarities. The results were therefore expressed at a descriptive level focusing on themes, but also indicating a link between themes based on evidence, while presenting findings. The themes derived from data from the two cases are presented in the context of each of the research questions.

Ethical Considerations

This research project followed the Ethical Policy set out by the Institute of Post-Graduate Studies (IPS) for post graduate research, Universiti Sains Malaysia (USM). This study strictly followed the ethics of informed consent, and confidentiality of the respondents. Participation was voluntary. Prior to the start of the interview, oral briefings were given to guarantee their ability to withdraw, anonymity, confidentiality with respect to their identity and the institution they work in. Furthermore, the purpose of the research and the future uses of the data such as publication of the data and preserving in the university repository were also explained.

Findings of the Study

This section reports the findings of the two research questions of the study. The first research question aimed to discover the related aspects of Kamrul and Monabbir's past schooling experience, which are delineated into three key aspects: English classroom environment, teacher role, and formal language teaching. The purpose of the second research question was to understand the manner in which schooling might affect the approach of novice teachers and their strategies, recorded under two broad aspects: AO and anti-AO.

Research Question 1: What is the nature of the prior English language learning experiences of novice secondary school teachers in Bangladesh?

Environment of the English classroom

As a learner, Kamrul completed his K-12 education in rural schools. Kamrul's classrooms used to be enormous in size, with more than 60 students in every class. He used to have a lot of friends. Kamrul, however, narrated a negative schooling experience while recollecting his learning experience in English. He said, *"I wanted to hide in English classes than any other classes since they were boring. There was no interaction in the classroom I saw. And classes weren't reflexive at all"*. In the same vein, Monabbir's experience was not much more discursive than Kamrul's, since it was not a good experience for him to learn English back in school either. He said, *"My classes were mostly boring, and at times daring to me, because nobody encourages me to learn the language, we all wanted to go through the subject."* From their experience, it could be assumed that they did not enjoy much of their time in the classroom enjoying learning English. Both participants felt that their language classroom environment was not conducive to the initiation of any language learning activities. Apart from the above-mentioned problems, they also talked about the issues of large class size and limited class time, which did not facilitate communicative activities in the classroom. These are the common characteristics of Bangladeshi classrooms in rural areas where they attended their schools. These still overlook these basic teaching and learning environment as well as the logistics such as electricity supply and technological facilities (see Nuby et al., 2019) and therefore did not adapt to real and meaningful communication.

Teacher's role

Kamrul's teachers are not deeply remembered. However, he believed that his teachers used to be good people, but they were so different in the classroom. *"They were awfully strict,"* he explained. He went on to say: *[...] they were very strict and unfriendly to me and my other friends. Not only my English teachers, but also the teachers of other subjects were like that."* In the same way, Monabbir's picture of English teachers was not a very nice one. It could be because of the teacher-centered nature of these classes, where teachers often viewed themselves as the leading force of the class, occupying so much power that the discourse and interaction of the classroom dissolves. As Monabbir pointed out:

Well, they were the centerpieces of the classroom, and we were dominated by them. They used to profess in the classroom and we used to listen to them without any comprehension. They believed in the teacher centeredness to control the classroom. It was a one-way lecture for the entire class time.

The English teachers of Kamrul and Monabbir failed to leave a good impression because of their nature and position. Their attitude is not informed by the teacher's role in the CLT curriculum nor supported by CLT approaches. Their practices were often characterized by their old-fashioned approach to teaching English. However, Kamrul and Monabbir considered the custom of their English teachers to be understandable since the popular teaching practices of this period followed a grammar-based approach and were teacher-centered; therefore, teachers did not embrace a friendly outlook in their behaviour.

Structured language teaching

Since the implementation of CLT in Bangladesh in the mid-90s, all Bangladeshi secondary schools have been required to teach English through a communicative approach and to emphasize communicative activities (Rahman, Johan, et al., 2019). The two participants in the study claimed that the communicative method was not used in their schools, and described their learning method as structural and grounded in the grammar translation method and memorization process. Kamrul said:

The lessons were not so student-friendly that we could talk to each other, and I still remember my teachers standing in front of us when giving lectures in the classroom. I can also recall that we were translating the grammar lessons from the text or using the paragraphs given to us in the class.

Monabbir explained his prior classroom lessons in school as not being informed by the CLT approach. He explained *"I'm not sure that the lessons were communicative because I recall just memorizing sections of speech and vocabulary and some essays to pass."* The problem was not that they were taught grammar, but the way they were taught was not suitable. He further added:

You see, of course, grammar is extremely necessary for language learning, but my problem is the way it was taught at my school. For example, if you take the teaching of language grammar techniques, they were deductive without contextualizing instructional materials.

Kamrul also added that the likely explanation for such a difference between the purpose of the curriculum and the teaching experience is the effect of the grammar translation method on language teaching at that time; he said:

It was 15 years back. Although, CLT guided the curriculum and textbook, you can assume the structured language teaching and learning. It was all about rote learning of vocabulary and grammar rules through reading and writing, you would know if you have attended such classes. Bangla was the dominant language in the classroom instruction. It was due to the grammar translation method, I believe.

As it is evident from the themes above, Kamrul and Monabbir's experiences of language learning, classroom environment, and their teachers were not pleasant. The articulated issues surrounding language learning and teaching were some of the identified problems of English language teaching in Bangladesh while first adopting CLT in the classroom (Hamid & Baldauf, 2008). However, many of these problems are still evident in the English language classroom in Bangladesh today (Rahman, Islam, et al., 2019; Rahman, Johan, et al., 2019)

Research Question 2: How do prior English learning experiences influence novice secondary school teachers' stated teaching cognition about teaching and their classroom practices?

Apprenticeship of observation

While teachers have negatively viewed their learning experience of English at school, Lortie's (1975) idea about AO is still implicit in the current study, as Kamrul and Monabbir highlighted several remnants of their teaching behaviour learned from their teachers (Holland & Lave, 2001). Previous language learning experiences of both teachers, Kamrul and Monabbir, played a key role in their teaching and in their knowledge and understanding of how teaching should be shaped. As Monabbir said, *"I want to duplicate the positive features of my teachers when I teach. For starters, jokes are always a good idea to lighten up students. Most of the teachers used to do that."* Kamrul's positive experiences in the English classes carry a good outlook. Kamrul reported that he likes to motivate his students and seeks to help them resolve learning difficulties. He explained:

Well, I have to note one good effect. I'm trying to inspire my learners to learn English, the way my teachers have inspired me... I also understand the difference between learning the language and not everyone learning the language in the same way and pace. Although my teachers were strict, they were close to me when I was a weak learner, I stand by the side of my learners today while they have difficulty learning English

Furthermore, Monabbir mentioned some of his teachers' skills were incorporated in his teaching, as he puts forward:

I try to imitate his pronunciation teaching skills and try to mimic his pronunciation when speaking English in the classroom. While it was a recurrence before him during the class, it is an outdated custom in the classroom today. It's been a remarkable experience in a rural classroom like ours.

It is evident from the aforementioned that in both the cases of Kamrul and Monabbir, the positive schooling that they encountered as English learners was favourably viewed and had a positive influence on their cognition and practice.

Anti-apprenticeship of observation

According to Moodie (2015), anti-AO is a prior language learning experience that influences the way teachers avoid certain teaching practices and form their cognition in order to avoid them. Both the cases in this study, Kamrul and Monabbir, have similar awareness regarding the influence of their schooling in forming their teaching approaches. As Monabbir said, *"Because I've had poor learning experiences with my teachers' teaching methods often, I always make effort not to repeat the mistakes my teachers have made."* Kamrul's experience as a school student has affected how he thinks teaching is. One way in which he tries to avoid situations he considered detrimental for learning, Kamrul said as follows:

Well, I try not to do things that I had experienced in school negatively. My classes were very structured and not interactive. I try to keep my classroom as interactive as possible. Students talk to each other and to me. We need to remember; my changed behavior is also a result of the current teaching approach. The approach of teaching language is now changed from GTM to CLT, and I follow it.

In the same way, Monabbir, too, does not want to replay the bad memories of his school of English learning and the classroom setting. One of the positive changes, according to him, is the change in approach that

helped him to be more reflexive and to make the classroom more comfortable and interactive. He added further:

I can also recall those days when we used to sit down and read the whole book to memorize. Oh, my God, that was frustrating. It's all about communication now. It's communicative English, therefore. I assume that students should be involved in communicative activities rather than memorizing terms and styles.

Monabbir also focused on the error correction aspect of the language teaching when he shared, “*Oh, I hated it since it was very humiliating*”. Apparently, one of Monabbir's negative aspects of studying English at school was that students were not permitted to commit any kind of mistake. He recalled teacher correction, as he added:

We were not allowed to make any errors. My teachers used to correct me with a red color marker and very direct corrective feedback in front of the entire class. It was frustrating, and I left the idea that I might learn English in my lifetime. It has been abusive.

He further added “*in my class I do not do such things*”. A teacher can ruin the faith of a student for a lifetime. Data were also collected on the experiences that Kamrul and Monabbir most disliked as learners when studying English. Kamrul said that the abusive behavior of the teachers, verbal and physical, was the most daunting experience for him. Kamrul and his friends were punished for many activities, such as being late in class, failing to answer any questions, making written or oral errors in homework or classwork, making noise or talking to friends during class time, etc. He said:

The worse one I would say that sometimes they (teachers) treated us with verbal and physical punishment such as hitting us with wooden ruler or keeping us standing outside the classroom under the sun. This is so humiliating and hard to bear.

Both Kamrul and Monabbir decided to be different from their schooling models of language learning in their current teaching belief, attitude and practice. Because of their adverse experiences as learners, they were not willing to repeat those in their language teaching activities.

Discussion and Implication

The findings of the study suggest a mixed impact, Lortie's (1975) concept of AO, and Moodie's (2015) idea of anti-AO- on the concept of teaching cognition (Borg, 2015), which conceptualized the influence of previous learning experience on teaching. The findings of the present study found that Kamrul and Monabbir's experiences of learning English strongly exemplified an anti-AO with occasional AO. However, in both the cases, their cognition was influenced by the concept of schooling (Borg, 2015).

Kamrul and Monabbir's negative memories of learning English is consistent with Moodie's research (2016), where those experiences were not reflected in their cognition and behavior. They demonstrated their optimistic cognitive attitude towards engaging classrooms, student-oriented classrooms, and punishment-free classrooms, as opposed to their learning experience of English in school. On the other hand, their positive experiences have been well received in their teaching as they applied the selective techniques from their teachers. Similarly, described in Johnson (1994) and Rabbidge's (2017) studies, in which the skills and behaviors of the participants were informed by their positive language learning experience. These two teaching cognition trajectories of Kamrul and Monabbir have been informed by experience as language learners.

Nonetheless, in line with Nishino (2012), the findings of this study suggest that whether novice teachers replicate and/or avoid their teaching practices may be varied and rely on the way they perceive their previous experience. However, the case study of Anna mentioned in Davin, Chavosha and Donato (2018) took both the trajectories in her teaching cognition and her practice. The teachers' positive experience believed that they were positive for learning the language and they decided to put it into practice. Similarly, she saw her negative experiences as detrimental to learning and felt it should be avoided. The results of the case studies show that whether schooling can be seen as positive or negative experience depends primarily on the opinion of the teachers rather than on any sound methodological approach.

The results also indicate that these experiences have been associated with subsequent experiences, such as a new approach to teaching and learning and Kamrul and Monabbir's experience as a teacher. It suggests Kamrul's cognition, conditioned by his early experience as a learner, but connected and inseparable from his subsequent experiences in the social and cultural sense in which he belongs (Holland & Leander, 2004). Both Kamrul and Monabbir's friendly and versatile disposition as an instructor can be traced back to his

personal past as a learner, conceived by Holland and Lave (2001), and has grown over time as they have progressed as more seasoned teachers. Along with this conceptualization, the present research has endorsed Borg's (2003; 2015) notion of schooling in shaping LTC. Teacher cognition appeared as an evolving construct; to that end, Kubanyiova and Feryok (2015) clarified the mechanism as an "emergent sense of behavior" (p. 445). Mediating the relationship of teachers of the present with the past will encourage teacher education to go beyond the constraints of the immediate act of teaching by incorporating a variety of current and historical influences that account for the experience and practice of teachers, as well as their achievements and struggles.

Based on the positive and negative learning experience of two novice teachers in Bangladesh, it is not possible to establish a pedagogical principle that could be applied in a number of contexts and circumstances. Nonetheless, this study demonstrated a strong correlation between teachers' knowledge and attitude as well as their emotional experiences in learning, suggesting the underlying reasoning behind the application of the CLT-based curriculum reform in Bangladesh (Ali & Walker, 2014; Rahman & Pandian, 2018). While some of the available studies examined cognition and practice of teachers in the context of Bangladesh (Rahman, Singh, & Pandian, 2018; Rahman, Pandian, & Kaur, 2018), this research explored schooling as one of the sources of teacher cognition of Bangladeshi English teachers. Teacher training programs may also benefit from increasing understanding of various aspects of teaching and learning through the development of a pre-service or in-service knowledge base informed by previous learning experiences of teachers. In turn, by doing so, teacher cognition and practices may be influenced by altering the existing perceptions of CLT-informed language teaching and learning, recommended by National Curriculum and Textbook Board. Future studies of the cognition of language teachers, the positioning of teachers as agents of their actions in the context of past social-material circumstances and the development of teachers must also consider the experiences and stories that teachers choose to express, and the ways in which these experiences and stories are shared.

References

- Ali, M., & Walker, A. L. (2014). Boggled down ELT in Bangladesh: Problems and policy: Investigating some problems that encumber ELT in an EFL context. *English Today*, 30(2), 33–38. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0266078414000108>
- Basturkmen, H. (2012). Review of research into the correspondence between language teachers' stated beliefs and practices. *System*, 40(2), 282-295. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2012.05.001>
- Borg, S. (2003). Teacher cognition in language teaching: A review of research on what language teachers think, know, believe, and do. *Language Teaching*, 36(2), 81-109. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0261444803001903>
- Borg, S. (2015). *Teacher cognition and language education: Research and practice*. Bloomsbury.
- Burns, A., Freeman, D., & Edwards, E. (2015). Theorizing and studying the language-teaching mind: Mapping research on language teacher cognition. *The Modern Language Journal*, 99(3), 585-601. <https://doi.org/10.1111/modl.12245>
- Cancino, M., Durán, M., & Solorza, C. (2020). What learning can do to teaching: Assessing the impact of apprenticeship of observation on pre-service teachers' beliefs. *English Teaching & Learning*, 1-16. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s42321-019-00044-z>
- Corbin, J., & Strauss, A. (2014). *Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory*. Sage.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2017). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). Sage.
- Davin, K. J., Chavoshan, I., & Donato, R. (2018). Images of past teachers: Present when you teach. *System*, 72, 139–150. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2017.12.001>
- Golombek, P. R. (1998). A study of language teachers' personal practical knowledge. *TESOL Quarterly*, 32(3), 447-464. <https://doi.org/10.2307/3588117>
- Hamid, M.O. (2010). Globalisation, English for everyone and English teacher capacity: Language policy discourses and realities in Bangladesh. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 11(4), 289-310. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14664208.2011.532621>
- Hamid, M. O., & Baldauf Jr, R. B. (2008). Will CLT bail out the bogged down ELT in Bangladesh?. *English Today*, 24(3), 16. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0266078408000254>
- Holland, D., Lachicotte, W., Jr., Skinner, D., & Cain, C. (1998). *Identity and agency in cultural worlds*. Harvard University Press.
- Holland, D., & Lave, J. (2001). *History in person: Enduring struggles, contentious practice, intimate identities*. School of American Research.
- Holland, D., & Leander, K. (2004). Ethnographic studies of positioning and subjectivity: An introduction. *Ethos*, 32(2), 127-139. <https://doi.org/10.1525/eth.2004.32.2.127>
- Karim, A., Mohamed, A. R., & Rahman, M. M. (2017). EIA--A teacher education project in Bangladesh: An analysis from diversified perspectives. *International Journal of Instruction*, 10(4), 51-66. http://www.e-iji.net/dosyalar/iji_2017_4_4.pdf
- Kennedy, M. (1991). An agenda for research on teacher learning (National Center for Research on Teacher Learning Special Report, ED331806). Michigan State University. <http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED331806.pdf>
- Kubanyiova, M., & Feryok, A. (2015). Language teacher cognition in applied linguistics research: Revisiting the territory, redrawing the boundaries, reclaiming the relevance. *Modern Language Journal*, 99, 435-449. <https://doi.org/10.1111/modl.12239>
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Sage.
- Lortie, D. C. (1975). *Schoolteacher: A sociological study*. University of Chicago Press.
- Moodie, I. (2016). The anti-apprenticeship of observation: How negative prior language learning experience influences English language teachers' beliefs and practices. *System*, 60, 29–41. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2016.05.011>

- Nishino, T. (2012). Modeling teacher beliefs and practices in context: A multimethods approach. *The Modern Language Journal*, 96(3), 380-399. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-4781.2012.01364.x>
- Nuby, M. H. M., Ab Rashid, R., & Hasan, M. R. (2019). Practices and outcomes of Communicative Language Teaching in higher secondary schools in rural Bangladesh. *Qualitative Research in Education*, 8(2), 148-181. <http://dx.doi.org/10.17583/qre.2019.4093>
- Numrich, C. (1996). On becoming a language teacher: Insights from diary studies. *TESOL Quarterly*, 30(1), 131-153. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-4781.2012.01364.x>
- Rabbidge, M. (2017). Assumptions, attitudes and beliefs: Tracing the development of teacher beliefs about classroom L1/TL. *The Journal of Asia TEFL*, 14(2), 211-379. <https://doi.org/10.18823/asiatefl.2017.14.2.11.346>
- Rahman, M. M., & Pandian, A. (2018). A critical investigation of English language teaching in Bangladesh: Unfulfilled expectations after two decades of communicative language teaching. *English Today*, 34(3), 43-49. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S026607841700061X>
- Rahman, M. M., Pandian, A., & Kaur, M. (2018). Factors affecting teachers' implementation of communicative language teaching curriculum in secondary schools in Bangladesh. *The Qualitative Report*, 23(5), 1104-1126. <https://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/vol23/iss5/6>
- Rahman, M. M., Islam, M. S., Karim, A., Chowdhury, T. A., Rahman, M. M., Seraj, P. M. I., & Singh, M. K. M. (2019). English language teaching in Bangladesh today: Issues, outcomes and implications. *Language Testing in Asia*, 9(1). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40468-019-0085-8>
- Rahman, M. M., Johan, M., Selim, S. M. M., Singh, M. K. M., & Shahed, F. H. (2019). Teachers' beliefs and practices of implementing secondary English curriculum reform in Bangladesh: A phenomenological study. *Journal of Asia TEFL*, 16(2), 448-767. <http://dx.doi.org/10.18823/asiatefl.2019.16.2.10.591>
- Rahman, M. M., Singh, M. K. M., & Pandian, A. (2018). Exploring ESL teacher beliefs and classroom practices of CLT: A case study. *International Journal of Instruction*, 11(1). <https://doi.org/10.12973/iji.2018.11121a>
- Yin, R. K. (2017). *Case study research and applications: Design and methods* (6th ed). Sage.

Appendix 1

Narrative frame prompts and the corresponding research questions.

Prompts

In my school, English classes were ...

My English teachers usually...

My positive experiences from English classes in school include ...

My negative experiences from English classes in school are ...

As a learner I have had success in mastering the language because my teachers did...

I think my experience as a student in school influenced how I think teaching is...

My positive experiences from English classes affect my teaching in...

My negative experiences from English classes affect my teaching in...
