

# A Comparative Study on the Education Systems in the Turkic Countries

İsmet ERGİN<sup>1</sup>, Sibel AÇIŞLI ÇELİK<sup>2</sup>, Burcu AKKAYA<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Education Manager and Teacher Training School, Ankara/Turkey

<sup>2</sup>Artvin Coruh University, Faculty of Education, Artvin/Turkey

<sup>3</sup>Republic of Turkey Ministry of National Education, Eskişehir/Turkey

## ABSTRACT

The purpose of this research is to examine the structure of education and training in the Turk World and to compare them with each other. In the study, the general structure, development and current situation of the education and training systems of the Turk World has been researched in detail and compared. In this comparative study, a horizontal approach was used that examined the elements of different education systems as a whole. The education and training systems in these countries, the stages of the educational institutions, the structure of the institutions that educate students, the admission conditions of the students to the schools, the duration of education, the status of higher education, and postgraduate education were examined, and evaluated. The education and training systems of the countries in the Turk World were first researched one by one and explanations were made in the light of the gathered information, then the tables were created with the information, the information in the tables was analysed and explanations were made under the tables. In the conclusion part, the information in the tables for all countries was summarized, the current situations were compared, and evaluations were made. At the stage of data collection; printed scientific resources such as thesis, books, journals, and articles related to the education and training systems applied in the Turk World were used. The data gathered were analysed using descriptive analysis approach according to the criteria determined with the aims of the research. As a result, it has been determined that there are similarities and differences in the structure of the education and training of the Turk World, and these determinations have been revealed. The main differences achieved are; secondary education (high school) and higher education periods, and the difference in the age of starting primary school. The duration of basic education (primary school) is the same in all countries. The Turk World should establish common quality standards in education and training, reflect these standards in their programs, and carry out remedial studies to bring education and training to the level of exclusive civilizations and put them into practice as soon as possible.

Keywords: Turkic Countries, Education Systems, A Comparative Study.

## INTRODUCTION

The Turkish nations are undoubtedly the oldest and most important nations that influenced and shaped the history of humanity. Turks are one of the rare nations that have established more than one state in the world from history until today and have ruled in geographies where world countries have their eyes. Turks, who continued their existence in various periods in different parts of the world, have never broken their ties with each other. The cultural unity between the Turkish states has always continued despite some negative situations (Bay et al., 2017). In 1991, the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (USSR) which became independent with the disintegration of Azerbaijan, Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Turkmenistan as being independent seven Turkish states (the other states, Turkey, North Cyprus Turkish Republic) can be said to be present. These states have initiated efforts to develop friendly relations and establish cooperation among themselves (Kara & Solak, 2017). With the independence of the Turkish States, they entered the process of rapid nationalization and the construction of national identity, and introduced new laws in the name of nationalization. National education laws are among the most

important of these laws. These laws provided the Turk World with the infrastructure of an education system suitable for its own cultural structures. Republic of Turkey and especially in this period of independence that is close to thirty years of training in Central Asia Turk world and its cultures, have undertaken reforms to the highest degree of education as the first step according to developments in the World (Özsoy et al., 2020). These reforms still continue today. Today, the most important and basic needs for these countries, which

**Corresponding Author e-mail:** ismet.ergin@gmail.com

**https://orcid.org/orcid.org/0000-0001-6501-0152**

**How to cite this article:** Ergin İ, Açışlı Çelik S, Akkaya B (2021). A Comparative Study on the Education Systems in the Turkic Countries. Pegem Journal of Education and Instruction, Vol. 11, No. 3, 2021, 67-80

**Source of support:** Nil

**Conflict of interest:** None.

**DOI:** 10.47750/pegegog.11.3.006

**Submission :** 20.03.2021

**Revision:** 02.05.2021

**Acceptance:** 03.05.2021

**Publication:** 01.07.2021

are trying to improve Turkish unity and solidarity with many projects, is the need for more comprehensive and robust cooperation with training programs. The Turkish nation, which established great states, had a unique culture of education and training in raising their children and shaping their future (Dündar, 2016; Gül, 2019). Education is one of the factors that are effective in the development of countries. After the Turk world gained their independence, books, articles, researches, language studies and projects related to the Turk world have been made and are still being carried out both in our country and in the republics established in Turkistan (Bayram, 2011; Savaş, 2010; Dinçsoy, 1995). Human beings have been living, developing, and shaping their lives within the education system since the day they were born (Alkan, 2001; Demir et al. 2013; Shuinshina, 2006; Ergün, 2008; Kaplankıran, 2017).

The education and training systems of the countries may differ from each other due to some features and applications in general. In order to determine what these differences are, it is necessary to research and compare the education and training systems with each other for these countries (Kalemoğlu & İmamoğlu, 2014).

Thanks to the education comparisons and training programs, countries can learn from each other and develop solutions to the problems in education (İnci, 2009). Thus, each country can find the opportunity to transfer the positive aspects of the education and training system of other countries to their own countries by comparing the education and training systems of their own country and other countries of the world (Özdemir et al., 2020).

For this reason, as a result of the research and examination of education and training studies both at home and abroad; It is considered that it will contribute to the establishment of an ideal and targeted education and training system that will increase the success of people, societies, nations, and countries. In countries where all these goals and sensitivities are known, researches are carried out systematically and regularly and an environment is prepared for new researches (Kaplankıran, 2017; Avcu & Zholdasbekova, 2018).

So in this study, the structure of education and training systems of Azerbaijan, Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Turkmenistan Republics from pre-school education systems to higher education were examined separately and then they were compared with each other (Toran, & Yağan-Güder, 2020).

Comparative education; whose main aim is to solve educational problems; addressing education in a cultural, economic, political and social context; It is a branch of science that aims to reveal the similarities between countries and makes use of all areas of educational sciences. Thanks to comparative education, facts, trends and problems related to education can be analysed and resolved from a wider

perspective. By focusing on the universal characteristics of education, educational phenomena can be analysed with a holistic perspective. The origins of educational practices can be revealed, and a contribution is made to the formation of a theory by seeing how the studies carried out in one country in one country have emerged in other countries.

In the study, the similarities and differences in the education and training structure between the Turkic World states were tried to be pointed out, and the sharing and convergence of important and beneficial points in the education and training systems, and the positive aspects of the developments in education and training with each other as an example in other countries, It is aimed to serve to increase the sharing even more.

As a result of the publication of this study, it is essential that the important, contemporary and technological developments in the education and training systems of the countries in the Turkic World can reach the systems of the developed countries, reach a higher level than them and share the important systems and studies with each other and thus to provide applications in systems.

Today, in the literature, it has been observed that there are not enough sources on the structure of education and training of the Turkic World and their comparison with each other, and there are limited and limited researches. Based on the results of the research, it is aimed that the education and training systems of the Turkic World are analysed and compared with each other and that they contribute positively to each other's system and to be a guide.

In some studies on these issues, it is aimed to draw attention to the similarities and differences in the education and training structure between the states of the Turk World, and it is aimed to bring the important and beneficial points in the education and training systems closer to each other and to enhance them. Today, in Turkey for the Turk World, the structure of education and training do not have enough available resources for making comparison with each other, it was found limited and narrowly focused researches. These studies were about the level of knowledge and perceptions of university students about the Turk World (Gülüm et al. 2016); classroom teacher candidates' perception of the Turk World (Taşkaya, 2014); Turk World in Turkish print media (Gadimov, 2008); Geography Education Students' Perceptions of the Turk World (Alım, 2009); mind map of 7th grade students about the perception of the Turk World (Karaçalı, 2012), Educational developments and innovations in the Turkic World (Savaş, 2010); It appears to be in the form.

## METHOD

In this section, the research model, population and sample, data collection tools and data analysis strategies are explained.

## Research Design

Comparative education research has formed the model of this study due to its subject. Studies that started with the adaptation of the best practices of the countries to other countries in the development course of comparative education; over time, it has evolved into studies that investigate and systematically examine the social reasons behind educational phenomena. Educational comparison research has formed the model of this study due to its aim. This model is structured within the framework of the horizontal approach, which is one of the four approaches used in educational comparison researches. In the horizontal approach, all dimensions in education systems are considered one by one, and all variables are brought together, and differences are researched to be underlined (Demirel, 2000). Horizontal approach; It aims to put education systems under the scrutiny since their establishment. In the horizontal approach, the elements of the education systems of the aforementioned nations are examined separately. In the next step, their similarities and differences are revealed. The reason for choosing this model in the research has been revealed in detail with the current situation of the education and training system in the Turk World; a detailed comparison was made (Kaya & Alci, 2019).

## Population and Sample

Education and training systems of the Turkic World constitute the universe of the research. As being the sample, the education and training system in the countries of the Turkic World has been examined one by one, starting from pre-school, to basic education (primary education, primary school), secondary education (high school) and higher education. As an example, the above-mentioned topics in the education and training systems of the States in Turk World (Azerbaijan, Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Turkmenistan) were investigated and compared with each other.

## Data Collection Tools

The study was carried out through examination based on document analysis, one of the qualitative data collection research methods. Documents were mostly used as data collection technique. In the research, the literature about Turkic World countries (Azerbaijan, Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Turkmenistan) is scanned;

Relevant literature is researched. The criteria for education and training were determined by examining master's, doctoral thesis, articles, books and notes; In the light of these criteria, official websites of the ministries of the Turk World, websites of universities in those countries, national educational institutions, and international report information many were used as data collection tools. So the data collection tools were related documents.

## Data Analysis

The criteria to examine education and training in the Turk World within the scope of the research are structural status of education in those countries, language of education, pre-school education, basic education (primary education, primary school) secondary education (high school), higher education, and arts education are determined in detail. Descriptive analysis was used as a data analysis method. The gathered data were analysed descriptively by taking the criteria into account. It is aimed to create alternatives for other countries by taking good practices as an example.

## FINDINGS

In this section, the education system of the Turk World (Azerbaijan, Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Turkmenistan) has been examined one by one.

### Education System in Azerbaijan Republic

Education in Azerbaijan Republic is divided in three as formal, private, and non-formal education. The main purpose of the educational system in the Republic of Azerbaijan is educate students as versatile, comprehensive, well-informed, and talented individuals, also as becoming experts in the field. The students also must be cultured, be loyal to his own background and lineage, have national and moral values, be loyal to national independence and democratic traditions, and be able to adapt quickly to the developing world. Also it is aimed to raise individuals who love their homeland and nation, respect the rights of whole other citizens and would be determined to keep his homeland Azerbaijan among the developing countries of the world (Education Law, 1993; Agamaliyev, 2020).

The detailed examination of the education system of Azerbaijan Republic is presented in Table 1.

**Table 1:** Structural Situation of Education System of Azerbaijan Republic (Gül, 2019; Dündar, 2016).

Age	Institution	Education Level
-	Doctoral Education (3-5 years) (Universities, Academies, Research Institutes)	Postgraduate Education
-	Master Education (2 years)	
17+	Undergraduate Education (4-5 years) (Universities)	Higher Education
15-17	Secondary Vocational Technical Education (3-4 years) (Associate degree)	Vocational Technical Education
	First Vocational Technical Training (1 year)	
15-17	Full Secondary Education (2 years, 10-11th Grades)	Full Secondary Education
10-14	General Secondary Education (5 years, 5th-9th Grades) (Compulsory)	Gen. Secondary Education
6-10	Basic Education Primary School (4 years, 1-4th Grades) (Primary School) (Required)	Primary School
1,5-6	Pre-school Education (3-4, 5 years) (Kindergartens, Kindergartens, Nursery classes)	Pre-school Education

According to Table 1, official education in the Republic of Azerbaijan consists of pre-school, primary school, secondary education (general/full secondary education), vocational technical education (primary vocational/secondary vocational technical education), higher education (undergraduate education), and postgraduate education (master and doctoral) education. According to the United Nations human development report, the literacy rate in the Republic of Azerbaijan is one of the highest in the world with 99.8%. In addition, 80% of the population over the age of 15 has completed 11-year secondary education, which is one of the highest averages in the world (Kurban & Aslanlı, 2018). The language of instruction in the schools of the Republic of Azerbaijan is Azerbaijani, which is the state language of the country (Agamaliyev, 2020; Mammadov, 2008).

Pre-school education in the Republic of Azerbaijan starts at the age of 1.5 and, it is given until the age of 6. It is given in the nursery, nursery class, nursery-nursery class, boarding children's dormitory, children's home, pre-school education institutions for mentally and physically underdeveloped children (Agamaliyev, 2020). Preschool education institutions aim to teach children the language of the Republic of Azerbaijan, to teach national and moral values, to reveal talented students, and to start basic education according to their abilities (gymnastics, chemistry, music, painting, foreign language, etc.) (Şiraz et al. 2017; Ergün, 1997).

Primary school in the Republic of Azerbaijan from 1 to 4, covers classes and is compulsory, so no diploma is awarded to those who finish primary school. Students who finish primary school can continue their education in the same school or in any schools they want (Gül, 2019; Azerbaijan Education, 2020; Mammadov, 2008).

Secondary education from 5 to 9, level covering classes is compulsory and graduates are awarded with a diploma. Graduated students can continue to their education in full secondary education (high school), in arts schools, in vocational schools, and in vocational high schools with entrance examinations (Gül, 2019; Mammadov, 2008).

Complete secondary education from 10 to 11 covers classes and is free of charge at state-owned educational institutions. Graduated students can apply to higher education with their diplomas (Gül, 2019; Agamaliyev, 2020; Education Law, 1993; State Admission Commission for Students, 2008).

In the first vocational training in the Republic of Azerbaijan, it is aimed to provide specialized workers in different professions according to the needs of the labour market. In private vocational training institutions, there are individual organizations, enterprises, labour exchanges, employment departments and other relevant structures. Graduates from these institutions can complete their general education by continuing to full secondary education if they wish (Agamaliyev, 2020).

In the Republic of Azerbaijan, secondary vocational technical education (associate degree education) is provided in colleges (technics and colleges). Those who go to secondary vocational technical education schools after secondary education receive 4 years of education, and those who go after completing full secondary education receive 2 years of education. Teknikum and colleges can be opened as independent schools or depending on universities (Azerbaijan Education, 2020; Agamaliyev, 2020).

Higher education in the Republic of Azerbaijan consists of three stages as undergraduate, graduate and doctorate. In the first step higher education institutions, only undergraduate education; in the second step higher education institutions, both undergraduate and graduate education; and in third step higher education institutions, undergraduate, graduate, and doctoral education are provided (Mammadov, 2008). Undergraduate education is for 4 years. In some cases, a preparational education may be required. A special exam is held by the relevant institution for graduate education and students are placed in universities according to these exam results. The education period of the master degree is two years, and at the end of this period, students are entitled to receive a diploma with the success of their thesis work (Mammadov, 2008).

Doctoral education in the Republic of Azerbaijan is given in various institutes and universities within the Azerbaijan National Academy of Sciences. There are two types of doctoral education in the Republic of Azerbaijan. These are Doctor of Philosophy received in a certain discipline, and Doctor of Science obtained in a certain discipline (Azerbaijan Education, 2020; Ministry of Education of the Republic of Azerbaijan, 2020).

Arts education is not compulsory in the Republic of Azerbaijan, but it starts with primary school education. While attending primary school, children can also attend arts education schools if they wish. These schools provide education for 9 years. Talented students can then receive education in the schools that are the upper level of these schools and it could be replaced as full secondary education. Students who graduate from such schools, which provide mainly art education, can attend conservatory or arts universities (Education Status of Azerbaijan, 2020; Azerbaijan Education, 2020).

### **Education System of the Republic of Uzbekistan**

Compulsory education in the Republic of Uzbekistan is 9 years. The main purpose of the education system in the Republic of Uzbekistan is to train students as being physically and spiritually educated in accordance with the state ideology, and also as being active in lessons. The students could use technology and could also compare their newly learned knowledge with their previously learned one (Eyüboğlu, 2017). The language of instruction in the Republic of Uzbekistan is Uzbek, which is also the state language of the country.



**Table 2:** Structural Status of the Education System of the Republic of Uzbekistan (Gül, 2019; Dündar, 2016; Mamirova, 2016).

Age	Institution		Education Level
29-31+	Doctoral Education (At least 3 years)		Postgraduate Education
26-28	Master Education (2-3 years)		
20-25	Higher Education Programs (Medicine, at least 12 years)	Master (At least 2 years)	Higher Education
		General Higher Education Programs (Undergraduate, at least 4 years)	
16-19	Academy/General High School (3 years)	Vocational College/Vocational Technical High School (2-3 years)	Medium Specialization and Secondary Vocational Technical Education
11-16	General Secondary School (5 years, 5-9 grades)		General Secondary Education (Primary Education/Secondary Education)
6-7 and 11	Primary school (4 years, grades 1-4)		
4 and 6-7	Kindergarten		Pre-school Education
2-4	Nursery		

The detailed examination of the education system of the Republic of Uzbekistan is presented in Table 2.

According to Table 2 formal education in the Republic of Uzbekistan consists of pre-school, (nursery/kindergarten), general secondary education (primary education/secondary education), vocational education (secondary specialization/secondary vocational technical education), higher education (undergraduate education), postgraduate education (master and doctorate) and arts education. In the Republic of Uzbekistan, in all general secondary education institutions, both primary and secondary education are provided as compulsory and free of charge. The literacy rate in the country is 99% (female: 99% and male: 99%). Tashkent University, the first university of the Republic of Uzbekistan, was opened in 1920 (Eyüboğlu, 2017).

In the Republic of Uzbekistan, preschool education is given to the children between the ages of 2 and 4 in nurseries and to the children between the ages of 4 and 7 in kindergartens. Foreign languages are also taught in kindergartens. The purpose of preschool education is to enhance children's learning skills, to ensure mental and physical and personality development, to eliminate negative factors affecting children's development, to ensure that children adopt national, cultural, and universal values, and to prepare children for basic education (Gül, 2019; Edunews, 2019).

Primary school is from 1 to 4 in the Republic of Uzbekistan. The books and school equipment are provided freely to all students (Gül, 2019). In primary education; It is aimed to make children learn reading and writing and also to make students gain the knowledge and skills required for general secondary education (Edunews, 2019; Gül, 2019). Students who have completed primary school in the Republic of Uzbekistan can continue their secondary education in the same institution. Graduates are given a general secondary education diploma

(Gül, 2019). In the Republic of Uzbekistan, there are two types of free secondary education, as private and vocational education. The first is given in academic high schools and the second is given in colleges (Edunews, 2019; Gül, 2019).

Vocational education institutions in the Republic of Uzbekistan consist of academia high schools and vocational colleges. Students, who have completed the 9<sup>th</sup> grade, or 11<sup>th</sup> grade, could receive education in these educational institutions. Students who have completed the 9<sup>th</sup> grade can attend the vocational education schools if they wish, and could learn a profession and also could complete their 9<sup>th</sup>, 10<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> grade education. A student who completes the 11<sup>th</sup> grade can have a profession by starting at vocational and technical education. This training period may vary according to the profession type. In the Republic of Uzbekistan, academy high schools are in a period of three-year educational institutions where students are taught on the basis of full secondary educational program, as well as providing them in-depth information about the profession and also enhancing their mental skills (Gül, 2019). Vocational colleges in the Republic of Uzbekistan are from two to three-year educational institutions where students' professional skills, knowledge and habits are enhanced, and also where students can have expertise in one or more fields according to their determined professions.

Higher education in the Republic of Uzbekistan consists of three stages as undergraduate, graduate, and doctoral stages. Undergraduate education includes providing basic skills and sufficient knowledge in different fields to the students, and the education period is 4 years, and graduates are given "undergraduate" diploma (Edunews, 2019; Gül, 2019). The duration of the master's education is from 2 to 3 years (Dündar, 2016). After graduation, graduates are awarded with a master degree. Doctoral studies are completed during 3-4 years of education after defending a doctoral dissertation.

Arts education in the Republic of Uzbekistan is given at educational institutions supported by the Republic of Uzbekistan, which were established in order to make students use of their time remaining from classes and to engage them in any art or sports branches according to their special abilities.

### Education System of the Republic of Kazakhstan

The main purpose of the education of the Republic of Kazakhstan is to provide all opportunities for all individuals to gain a profession in which they have sufficient knowledge and so they could contribute to the society, based on national and humanitarian values, by the help of their scientific and practical skills. To raise healthy citizens who respect the human rights, and also trust, protect and watch over the existing structure of the state. Kazakh is the official state language in the Republic of Kazakhstan. Although the language of education is in Kazakh and Russian, it is also taught in English and German as foreign languages (Kinacı, 2010; Dosbolov, 2019; Shuinshina, 2006).

The detailed examination of the education system of the Republic of Kazakhstan is presented in Table 3.

According to Table 3, general education in the Republic of Kazakhstan consists of pre-school, primary education, secondary education (basic/general secondary education), vocational and technical education, higher education (undergraduate) and postgraduate (master, doctorate) education. Compulsory education is an 11 years period in the Republic of Kazakhstan and all students are provided free of

charge under the state's obligation. Textbooks and teaching materials used in education are delivered to whole students (Kaplankıran, 2016; Shuinshina, 2006).

Pre-school education in the Republic of Kazakhstan depending on the age of the students is given in nurseries for 1-3 years old children, in kindergartens for 3-6 years old children and in playgrounds for 1-6 years old children (Gül, 2019). The aim of pre-school education is to prepare children for the future life and to make them much more socialized (Zhumasheva, 2018).

Primary education in the Republic of Kazakhstan is from 1-4. It is the first step of general secondary education and compulsory (Shuinshina, 2006). The basic values in the content of primary education are defined as patriotism, citizenship duties for the Republic of Kazakhstan, respect, unity, labour and creativity (Shuinshina, 2006; Gül, 2019).

Primary secondary education, which covers classes from 5 to 9, is the second step of general secondary education and compulsory and free. In order to graduate from secondary education and then apply for higher education, it is necessary to be successful in the state's final finishing exam (Shuinshina, 2006).

The third level of general secondary education in the Republic of Kazakhstan is 10-11 classes. The duration of education in high schools is 2 years of period. In addition to high schools, colleges could also provide education and training covering a period of 2-3 years and the education

**Table 3:** Structural Status of the Education System of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Bolatova, 2019; KC EBB, 2018; Dündar, 2016; OECD, 2014).

Age	Institution		Education Level
-	Doctoral Education (3-5 years) (Universities, Academies, Education and Research Institutes)		Postgraduate Education
-	Master Education (2 years) (Universities, Academies)		
-	Undergraduate Education (4 years) (Universities)		Higher Education
-	Vocational Technical Education (2-3 years) (Colleges, High Schools)		Vocational and Technical Education
16-17	General Secondary Education		General Secondary Education
	High School (Grades 10-11-12) (Schools, Existing Schools, Colleges, High Schools, Vocational Schools)	Technical and Vocational Schools (Vocational Education) (with a Grade 9 Certificate and a College Entrance Exam)	
11-15	Basic Secondary Education (5 years, 5th-9th Grades, Compulsory) (In order to attend general secondary school, it is necessary to take a midterm exam in the last semester of the 9th grade.)		Basic Secondary Education (Secondary School)
7-10	Primary Education (4 Years, Grades 1-4, Compulsory) (Primary school)		Primary School/Primary Education
1-6	Pre-school education (Kindergarten, Preschool Preparatory Classes, Groups, Compulsory)		Pre-school Education

period here includes 10-12 classes. In the Republic of Kazakhstan, there are secondary education institutions that provide evening education as well as full-time education. There are also schools that provide only music or technical education (Kaplankiran, 2017; Shuinshina, 2006).

Vocational education institutions in the Republic of Kazakhstan consist of primary and secondary vocational institutions, vocational high schools, and colleges. Students who attend these schools can both complete their education and have a profession. However, students can complete their secondary education by continuing to an institution providing general education. After completing a 9-year general education and training school, students may choose to go to a school that provides vocational education and training for 2 years or to an art school (Shuinshina, 2006). Vocational and technical education and training institutions have focused on increasing the knowledge level and workforce, restructuring the employment of employees and civil servants and raising awareness.

Higher education in the Republic of Kazakhstan consists of 3 stages as undergraduate and graduate; 4 years for undergraduate, 2 years for master and 3-5 years for doctorate (Gül, 2019; Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2020). The main task of higher education institutions is to prepare higher and post-higher educated students on the basis of science and practice (Zhumasheva, 2018). High education consists of universities, institutes, academies and high military schools (Tülbasieva, 2007; Shuinshina, 2006).

In the Republic of Kazakhstan, graduate education is carried out in two ways, which are scientific education, and education on a specific field. In the programs for a specific field, education is carried out in order to deepen knowledge in this specific field. Scientific education preparation, on the other hand, is the programs that are preferred by those who want to be teachers (Gül, 2019).

Doctoral education in the Republic of Kazakhstan is available in almost all universities, and it can be paid or free. In addition to the documents needed for doctoral application, students also have to enter to a two-stage exam. In the first stage of the exam, knowledge about the field is measured, while in the second stage, foreign language knowledge is measured (Gül, 2019; Findhow, 2018).

The aim of arts education in the Republic of Kazakhstan is to educate students as individuals who love their nation, work for the benefit of society, are loyal for their state, gain scientific thinking, and have good physical and mental health in addition to knowledge skills and general culture (Zhakanova, 2018).

### Education System of Kyrgyz Republic

General education is compulsory and free in the Republic of Kyrgyzstan (Gül, 2019; İdayeva, 2015). The main purpose of education in the Republic of Kyrgyzstan is to make young

generations gain the social and humanitarian basic principles. In addition to learning contemporary social, political and national values, and gaining the ability to respect the cultures of other societies through tolerance and to accept the diversity of civilization; experiencing problem solving skills are needed too (Alimbekov et al., 2017).

The state prepares the necessary conditions for teaching the state language (Kyrgyz), the official language (Russian) and a foreign language, starting from pre-school education to basic education in institutions. Kyrgyz, on the other hand, has been upgraded to the status of a state language (Zhyldyz, 2018).

A detailed examination of the education system of Kyrgyz Republic is presented in Table 4.

**Table 4:** Structural Status of the Education System of Kyrgyz Republic (Dündar, 2016).

Age	Institution	Education Level
24	Vocational Education After Higher Education Institutions	Postgraduate Education
21	Higher Professional Education (Master)	
21	Higher Vocational Education (Vocational Specialization)	Higher Education
18	Higher Professional Education (Undergraduate)	
16-18	Secondary Vocational Education (Through the Basis of Grades 9 and 10)	Vocational Education
15-18	Basic Vocational Education (Through the Basis of Grades 9 and 10)	
16-17	Secondary General Education (Grades 10-11-12)	Full Secondary Education
10-15	Basic General Education (5-9th Grades)	Basic Secondary Education
7-10	Primary Education (Grades 1-4)	Primary school
0, 6-7	Pre-School Education (3-5 years)	Pre-school Education

According to Table 4, general education in the Republic of Kyrgyzstan consists of pre-school education, primary school education, secondary education (primary/full secondary education), vocational education (basic/secondary vocational education), higher education (higher vocational education (undergraduate)/professional specialization) and postgraduate (master, doctorate) education (Kyrgyz Republic Ministry of Education and Science, 2018).

Pre-school education in the Republic of Kyrgyzstan consists of kindergarten for children from 6 months to 3 years old, childcare for children from 6 months to 7 years old, kindergarten for children from 3 to 7 years old, kindergarten for special students, orphan homes for orphans aged from 3 to 18, children's homes for orphans and special students up to 3 years old, rehabilitation centres, children's family home for orphans aged from 2 to 18, progimnasium for

intelligent children, maternity school for parents and children, community kindergarten provided by the local government from 3 to 5. Preschool kindergartens and kindergartens are opened in cities (Gül, 2019; Akimcan, 2008).

Primary education in the Kyrgyz Republic is from 1 to 4 grades. It is the first step of general education and its duration is 4 years. Children at the age of 7 officially start at primary education, but recently it has become a custom among the society where most of the 6-year-olds start to receive education in schools (Alimbekov et al., 2017).

Primary secondary education covering classes from 5 to 9 grades, is the second step of general education and it is compulsory and free of charge (Gül, 2019; İdayeva, 2015).

High schools, which are the third step of general education in the Republic of Kyrgyzstan and are the education system after primary secondary education, are named as full secondary education. Full secondary education is the last stage of compulsory education and covers grades of 10, 11 and 12 and the duration of education is 2 years. Students who successfully complete the 9<sup>th</sup> grade are entitled to receive the basic general education certificate, which is a state standard document, and the 11<sup>th</sup> grade graduates take the second general education certificate. A full secondary education diploma is presented as the most important requirement for entrance to higher education (Kyrgyz Ministry of Education, 2019; Gül, 2019). By providing secondary education in secondary education institutions, they have all the knowledge, and basic skills required in social life and vocational education (Alimbekov et al., 2017).

The second stage of secondary education in the Kyrgyz Republic consists of vocational high schools, technical high schools and colleges that provide education at the secondary education level, which are 4-year education programs. Students who complete this program are considered to have completed full secondary education as well as vocational education (Gül, 2019). The aim of vocational training is to train qualified citizens and workers according to labour needs. Vocational education programs consist of stages such as basic vocational education, secondary vocational education, higher vocational education, and post-university education. Basic vocational training aims to train qualified workers and officials in any specialization, to raise their qualifications, and to provide in-service training. Institutions providing secondary vocational education include technical schools, educational sciences and private schools providing education in the field of medicine. Generally, experts who will have professions in agriculture, production, transportation, health and education branches are trained in such institutions. Students who have passed secondary education or basic vocational education programs are accepted to such educational institutions.

Students who have passed secondary vocational education can benefit from the right to win one of the higher education institutions by having the relevant diploma (Alimbekov et al., 2017). Vocational higher education provides education at undergraduate, specialist and graduate levels to require the needs of increasing professional competence of labours on the basis of general secondary school, vocational secondary school and vocational schools (Gül, 2019; Zhyldyz, 2018; Polat, 2011).

Higher education in the Republic of Kyrgyzstan consists of 3 stages as undergraduate, graduate, and doctorate; 4 years for undergraduate, 2 years for master and 4-5 years for doctorate. Students who have a full secondary education diploma and who are successful in the entrance exam are accepted to all programs in higher education. In the Republic of Kyrgyzstan, 5-year education is provided in most areas such as engineering, education science, and law according to the higher education system. Those who successfully complete the program are given a diploma that is an indicator of expertise in the field, which is the first higher education degree. Those who study for 4 years are given a bachelor's degree. However, those who complete this 4-year education can receive a 2-year postgraduate education if they wish. Those who have completed the 5-year education program are considered to have completed their master's degrees (Toktogulov & Karamatov, 2018).

In the Republic of Kyrgyzstan, 2 and 3 years of education is provided in doctoral education programs. As a result of these programs, Kandidat or Doctor of Philosophical Sciences, that is, PhD degrees are awarded. Universities generally graduate with a master's degree after with a 5-year undergraduate education and the students accepted as Kandidat can receive a Doctorate education in a field they wanted at universities. The highest degree of education in the Republic of Kyrgyzstan is being a doctor (Gül, 2019).

Arts education in the Republic of Kyrgyzstan aims to ensure developing students' aesthetically, culturally and socially aspects, and to make students recognize nature and the environment within the scope of out-of-school education. Again, with this training, basic citizenship knowledge is given and knowledge on technology, sports, etc. is given too (Toktogulov & Karamatov, 2018).

### Education System of the Republic of Turkmenistan

It gained its independence in 1991. According to the education program adopted in the Republic of Turkmenistan in 1993, the primary education, which was 10 years, was reduced to 9 years, and the education program was divided into two in the primary education system. The first of these is the "Sovat", meaning literacy program from 1<sup>st</sup> to 4<sup>th</sup> grades, which aims to enable children to acquire behavioural aspects and speech culture, and also some basic skills such as writing, reading, and counting skills. The second is the "Science Program" (Gül, 2019; Dündar, 2016; Turkmenistan, 2014; Nessipbayeva &



Dalayeva, 2013; UNESCO, 2006). The language of instruction in the Republic of Turkmenistan is Turkmen. In order to prevent the Russian-speaking population from leaving the country, a gradual reduction in Russian education and the position of Russian is applied too (Kara & Solak, 2017; Gökdağ, 2013; Gürsoy-Naskali, 2002). According to statistics in 1991 in the Republic of Turkmenistan, the rate of reading and writing is 99.7% (Turkmenistan Demographic Profile, 2019; Principles and General Objectives of Turkmenistan Education, 2020).

The detailed examination of the education system of the Republic of Turkmenistan is presented in Table 5.

According to Table 5, in the Republic of Turkmenistan general education consists of pre-school, primary, secondary (full/general secondary education), vocational (secondary vocational education), higher education (undergraduate and higher vocational education) and graduate (masters, PhD) education on the basis of principles and general objectives of education of Turkmenistan (The principles and general objectives of education of Turkmenistan, 2020; The demographic profile of Turkmenistan, 2019).

In the Republic of Turkmenistan, pre-school education is given to children between the ages of 1-6 in public and in private educational institutions. Preschool education institutions aim to establish the foundations of children's physical and mental development, to promote national and universal values, and to determine children's abilities. Preschool education is divided into two stages. In the first stage, children up to the age of 3 receive training in groups with a medical specialist. In the second stage, the systematic education and training process begins for children aged between 3-6. Pre-school education; knowing the world needs; consists of language development, maths, hand skills, arts, physical education, singing, and music. It includes these components as a whole (Turkmenistan Education, 2020; Meredova, 2013; Horak, 2013; Karaağaçlı, 2012).

Primary education is for four years and compulsory in the Republic of Turkmenistan. In the Republic of Turkmenistan,

the Latin alphabet was adopted in 1995 to primary education. It encloses primary and secondary school levels and is compulsory. Graduates are given a secondary education diploma so that they can continue to their higher education (Turkmenistan Education System, 2020; Gül, 2019).

The duration of education in general high schools and colleges, which are secondary education institutions in the Republic of Turkmenistan, is for 2 or 3 years. Students take the final year of the school and receive a high school diploma if they are successful. Thanks to this diploma, students gain the right to continue their next education. Medicine, pedagogy, music and arts are in technical secondary education. There are colleges and technical schools hosting technical departments. The duration of the education and training program is between 2 and 4 years and lasts between the ages of 16-18. Those who successfully complete the exams at graduation are awarded with a technical secondary education diploma. Vocational secondary education includes vocational high schools and colleges. The education and training period of this program is for 2-3 years and education is between the ages of 16-18. Those who meet the required conditions and graduate are given a vocational high school diploma (Turkmenistan Education System, 2020; Gül, 2019).

Vocational education in the Republic of Turkmenistan is primary vocational education and secondary vocational education. It consists of higher vocational education programs. Primary education vocational education programs are carried out to train qualified personnel in all areas of expertise that are beneficial to society. Primary education is provided in vocational schools and high schools, and the education period is for 1 year or 1.5 years depending on the area of expertise. Graduates are given a certificate with the name of the profession. With this certificate, it gives the opportunity to study in secondary vocational or in higher vocational education as well as working in the Republic of Turkmenistan (Gül, 2019; Dündar, 2016; Korradini & Dergunaova, 2012). In secondary vocational education institutions, education is

**Table 5:** Structural Status of the Education System of the Republic of Turkmenistan (Gül, 2019; Dündar, 2016).

Age	Institution	Education Level
27-29	Doctoral Education (2 years)	Postgraduate Education
24-27	Higher Education - Postgraduate Education (3 years)	
17-19	Higher Vocational Education (2 years)	Higher Vocational Education
18-23	Higher Education (Undergraduate Education) (4-5 years)	Higher Education
16-17	Basic Vocational Education (1 year)	Basic Vocational Education (Secondary Education Vocational Education)
16-18	Full Secondary Education (2 years)	Full Secondary Education (General Secondary Education)
10-16	Secondary Education (6 years, compulsory)	
6-10	Primary Education (4 years, compulsory) (Primary school)	Primary Education
3-6	Pre-school Education - Kindergartens (3 years)	Pre-school Education
0-3	Nurseries (3 years)	

provided in three ways: education from outside, evening classes or regular class. Higher Vocational Education is for two years.

Higher education in the Republic of Turkmenistan is for 4-5 years, in fields such as medicine, it is for 6 years. University admission is based on entrance exam results. Higher education institutions in the Republic of Turkmenistan consist of academies, universities, institutes and conservatories. Education in higher education is conducted in Turkmen and Russian languages. The first stage of higher education is undergraduate education for four or five years. The second stage education is for three years. For the third stage, people who want to have the title of doctor of science can apply. Doctoral education is carried out on formal basis. The duration of the doctoral exceeds 3 years (Turkmenistan Academy of Sciences, 2020).

### CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

In the development of a country, the priority given to education is among the determining factors as well as the social, economic and cultural advantages of the society. The main purpose of the states' education policy is to establish a national education system in line with international standards, based on free and equal opportunity for every citizen.

The only solution for the Turk World is to act together to establish a common education system (Bay et al., 2017).

After the Turk World gained its independence, they made important studies in the field of education and training, as in many other fields, and took important and successful steps to increase the success of each of the countries in the education and training (Şişman & Arı, 2009). Achieving the balanced, progressive and sustainable development goals could only be achieved by improving the education and training qualities of the population and so increasing the quality of life (Şahan, 2021). The most important contribution to education and training in the Turk World was the transition from the Cyrillic alphabet, which was used before independence, to

the Latin alphabet. Also in this period, sending students to higher education institutions abroad and sending students from higher education institutions abroad were accelerated, and so information exchange was accelerated. Relations with other foreign countries have increased, as well as in the fields of health, trade, and military, some bilateral agreements have been signed in the field of education and training. In the continuation of this, many joint institutions were opened in both education and training and other fields. New textbooks were prepared and printed in the Latin alphabet, explaining the Turk World states' national histories, national geographies, cultures and core values. The unification of the Turk World, which has common culture and values, in a common alphabet has enabled them to cooperate more and share information in education and training and to transfer their experiences to each other (Akhmadjonov, 2019; Oran, 2018; Duymaz, 2015; Savaş, 2010).

Providing qualified education and training to millions of students in the Turk World also brings up a high financing requirement. In the Turk World, that does not ignore these requirements, sufficient resources have started to be allocated for education in order to become an information society that will take its place in the technology of the future by using this knowledge.

It has been determined that efforts have been made to establish a balance between the service intended to be provided to those trained in the Turk World and the resources allocated for education and training. The education budget is tried to be made sufficient not only to increase schooling rates, but also to ensure that schools have a structure that can respond to the needs of modernity and like other developed countries' ones and to equip them with modern technologies (Özdemir & Özdemir, 2017).

Within the scope of the above mentioned in the Turk World; education and training systems have been examined and the results are comparatively given in Table-6.

**Table 6:** Comparison of the Structural Situation of the Education System in the Turk World (Kaya & Alci, 2019).

Countries	Pre-school Education	Basic Education (Primary School)	Secondary Education (High School)	High Education
Republic of Azerbaijan	Age 6 required, (in Kindergartens between the age of 1.5 and 2, Kindergartens for age 3-6)	4 years	General Secondary Education (5 Years) Vocational Technical Education (3 Years) Full Secondary Education (2 Years)	Undergraduate (4 Years) Post Graduate (2 years) Doctoral education (3-5 Years)
Republic of Uzbekistan	2-4 age group Nursery, 4-6-7 age group Kindergarten	4 years	General Secondary School (5 Years) Academic High School (3 Years) Vocational College (3 Years)	Undergraduate (4 Years) Post Graduate (2 years) Doctoral education (3 Years)

**Table 6:** (Continued)

Countries	Pre-school Education	Basic Education (Primary School)	Secondary Education (High School)	High Education
Republic of Kazakhstan	Nurseries (0-3 age) Kindergarten (3-6 age)	4 years	Basic Secondary Education (5 Years) General Secondary Education (2 Years) Vocational Technical Education (2-3 Years)	Undergraduate (4 Years) Post Graduate (2 years) Doctoral education (3 Years)
Republic of Kyrgyzstan	Nurseries (0-3 age) Kindergarten (3-6 age)	4 years	Basic General Education (5 Years) Secondary General Education (2 Years) Vocational Training (2 Years)	Undergraduate (3-4 Years) Post Graduate (2 years) Doctoral education (3 Years)
Republic of Turkmenistan	Nurseries (0-3 age) Kindergarten (3-6 age)	4 years	Basic Secondary Education (6 Years) Full Secondary Education (2 Years) Basic Vocational Education (1 Year)	Undergraduate (4-5 Years) Post Graduate (3 years) Doctoral education (2 Years)

When we look at Table 6, the education and training levels in the Turk World and the time allocated to these levels can be seen.

In the Republic of Azerbaijan; 9-year general secondary education is compulsory (Şiraz et al., 2017). The education and training system in the Republic of Azerbaijan consists of separate levels and there is interdependence, continuity, and integrity between all these levels (Kaya & Alcı, 2019; Mammadov, 2008).

General secondary education in the Republic of Uzbekistan is compulsory, accessible to all citizens of the country, for 9 years and consists of two grades (1-4<sup>th</sup> grades, 5-9<sup>th</sup> grades) (Kaya & Alcı, 2019; Mamirova, 2016).

Compulsory education and training in the Republic of Kazakhstan is for 11 years. General secondary education in the Republic of Kazakhstan consists of 4-years primary education, 5-years basic secondary education, 2-years general secondary education (Kaya & Alcı, 2019; Çeltikçi & Sembi, 2016).

General education and training in the Republic of Kyrgyzstan is for 11 years (Polat, 2011). General education in the country consists of pre-school education, primary general education, basic general education and secondary education programs (Kaya & Alcı, 2019; Alimbekov et al., 2017; Alimbekov, 2001).

Compulsory education and training in the Republic of Turkmenistan is 12 years. Primary education starts at the age of 6 and goes on until the end of the 4<sup>th</sup> grade. Primary and secondary education is from 5 to 10 grades. This is followed by 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> grades in general secondary education (Kaya & Alcı, 2019; Kazak, 2016).

Since the emergence of teaching, education and training institutions have differences in the functions of education and training according to the conditions, which are rapidly changing and developing in this field as in all areas of life. Especially developments based on technology have revealed more burden, differences and responsibilities in the roles of teachers. In the research, firstly, education and training systems and durations in the Turk World were discussed. Accordingly, it was concluded that the compulsory education periods in the Turk World vary between 9 and 12 years. The distribution of these years is 9 years in the Republics of Azerbaijan and Uzbekistan, whereas is 11 years in the Republic of Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan, and also is 12 years in the Republic of Turkmenistan (Yaman, 2019; Baki & Baki, 2016; OECD, 2017; Kabaran & Görden, 2016; Orakçı, 2015; Aksoy, 2013; Mete, 2013).

The literacy rate, which is another indicator of the development of the education and training system of the Turkic World, is 99.8% in the Republic of Azerbaijan, 99% in the Republic of Uzbekistan, 99.5% in the Republic of Kazakhstan, 98.7% in the Republic of Kyrgyzstan and being 99.7% in the Republic of Turkmenistan, it is at a very high rate. The Turkic World should strive to maintain these levels where the literacy rate is very high, and they should take studies and measures to increase the quality standard and knowledge level of education for people with a very high literacy rate.

In the Turkic World, education of fine arts is compulsory in the Republic of Azerbaijan and is supported in the Republic of Uzbekistan in order to make use of the time remaining from lessons, and in order to ensure social development in

the Republic of Turkmenistan, it is given as art and music-oriented trainings.

The unification of the Turkic World, which has a common culture, in a common alphabet, will enable them to communicate more in education and transfer their experiences to each other.

An important result of the study is that the changes and developments in the education and training system of the Turk World that have been taking place for years, in accordance with today's conditions, are trying to be caught by adhering to national and spiritual values and by following world standards (Mammadov, 2008). Following the dissolution of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (USSR) in 1991, the Turk World, which gained its independence, took serious steps, especially in the field of education and training, to create national and especially international identity. It is noteworthy that there is a serious effort to strengthen their national and international identities with the language, culture and education and training policies they put into practice, and their efforts to reach the level of contemporary civilizations. The studies in the field of education and training will enable the Turk World to take its deserved place among the world countries.

In education and training; By making joint sharing, it should be aimed not only to reach the position and level of contemporary civilizations, that is, countries that are ahead of other countries in terms of social, economic, scientific and education and training, but also to reach much more advanced levels. In order to be an example to all countries in the world in education and training, they should act together, as it should be in every field, especially in education and training. In this context, it should be ensured that all kinds of information, documents and materials related to education and training are shared on the basis of states, ministries, universities, schools, teachers and students.

## REFERENCES

- Agamaliyev, R. (2020). *Azerbaycan Cumhuriyeti eğitim sistemi*. [https://dhgm.meb.gov.tr/yayimlar/dergiler/Milli\\_Egitim\\_Dergisi/144/agamaliyev.htm](https://dhgm.meb.gov.tr/yayimlar/dergiler/Milli_Egitim_Dergisi/144/agamaliyev.htm) (Erişim Tarihi: 12.08.2020).
- Akhmadjonov, K. (2019). *Özbekistan'daki üniversitelerde Türkçe öğrenen öğrencilerin Türkçe öğrenmeye ilişkin tutum ve motivasyonları (Taşkent örneği)*. Yayınlanmamış doktora tezi, Sakarya Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Sakarya.
- Akimcan, K. B. (2008). *Bağımsızlık sonrası Kırgızistan ortaöğretim ders kitaplarında din anlatımı*. Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Ankara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Ankara.
- Aksoy, E. (2013). *ABD (New York), Finlandiya, Singapur ve Türkiye'de öğretmen eğitimindeki dönüşümler (2000-2010)*. Yayınlanmamış doktora tezi, Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Ankara.
- Alım, M. (2009). Coğrafya eğitimi öğrencilerinin Türk dünyası algıları (Atatürk Üniversitesi örneği). *Uluslararası İnsan Bilimleri Dergisi*, VI(2): 574-586.
- Alimbekov, A. (2001). Kırgız Cumhuriyeti ve eğitim sistemi hakkında genel bilgi. *Türk Yurdu*, 21(171): 13-15.
- Alimbekov, A. vd. (2017). *Kırgızistan eğitim raporu. Türk Dünyasının eğitim sistemleri ve sorunları, eğitim raporu (2017)*. Ankara: Pegem A Yayıncılık.
- Alkan, C. (2001). *Türk Millî Eğitim sisteminin 2000'li yıllarda yeniden yapılanmasının temel esasları, eğitimde yansımalar VI*. Ankara: H.H. Tekişik Eğitim Araştırma Geliştirme Merkezi. 397-398.
- Avcu, S. A. & Zhodasbekova, A. (2018). *Bağımsızlıklarının yirmi yedinci yılında Türk Cumhuriyetleri (Kazakistan)*. İnceleme araştırma dizisi, Yayın No: 61. Editörler: Doç. Dr. Ayşe Çolpan Yıldız, Dr. Murat Yılmaz, Yayın Koordinatörü: Harun Sarıgül, ISBN: 978-9944-237-74-1. Ankara: SalMat Basım Yayıncılık Ambalaj San. Ltd. Şti.
- Azerbaycan Eğitim. (2020). *Azerbaycan eğitim sistemi*. <https://www.azerbaycanegitim.com/azerbaycan-egitim-sistem/> (Erişim Tarihi: 15.07.2020).
- Azerbaycan Cumhuriyeti Eğitim Bakanlığı. (2020). <https://www.edu.gov.az> (Erişim Tarihi: 15.05.2020).
- Azerbaycan'ın Eğitim Durumu. (2020). *Eğitim kalitesi*. <http://tehsil.20m.com/islahat/isl1-1.htm> (Erişim Tarihi: 22.02.2020).
- Baki, A. & Bektaş Baki B. (2016). Türkiye'nin ve Almanya'nın ortaöğretim matematik programlarının karşılaştırılması. *Turkish Journal of Computer and Mathematics Education* 7(1): 229-258.
- Bay Erdal vd. (2017). Türk Dünyası birliği algısı (The Perception of Turkish World Union). *Gazi Akademik Bakış Dergisi*, 11(21).
- Bayram, H. (2011). *Sosyal bilgiler öğretiminde Türk Dünyası*. Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Niğde Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Niğde.
- Bolatova, A. (2019). *Sovyetler Birliği döneminden günümüze Kazakistan eğitim sistemi*. Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Necmettin Erbakan Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Konya.
- Çeltikçi, O. & Nurbolat, S. (2016). Türkiye-Kazakistan eğitim sistemlerinin karşılaştırılması. *Akademik Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 58: 38-48.
- Demir, S. B. vd. (2013). 4+4+4 yeni eğitim sistemi'nin yansımaları: beşinci sınıflardaki eğitim ve öğretim sürecinin branş öğretmenlerinin görüşleri doğrultusunda değerlendirilmesi. *Turkish Studies*, 8(9): 1081-1098.
- Demirel, Ö. (2000). *Karşılaştırmalı eğitim*. Ankara: Pegem A Yayıncılık.
- Diñsoy, Ö. (1995). *2000'e Beş Kala Türk Eğitim Sistemi*. Ankara: Türk Demokrasi Vakfı, Ekin Matbaacılık, 51.
- Dosbolov, A. (2019). Ayşe Çolpan Yıldız ve Murat Yılmaz (ed.) (2018). *Bağımsızlıklarının yirmi yedinci yılında Türk Cumhuriyetleri*. Ankara: Ahmet Yesevi Üniversitesi Mütevelli Heyet Başkanlığı Yay.. *bilig, Türk Dünyası Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 89: 237-241.
- Duymaz, A. (2015). Türkmenistan'da kültürel kimliğin kaynağı olarak Dede Korkut geleneği. *Millî Folklor Dergisi* 107: 19-33.
- Dündar, H. (2016). *Türk dünyasında eğitim*. Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- Edunews. (2019). *Образование в узбекистане*. <https://edunews.ru/education-abroad/sistema-obrazovaniya/uzbekistan.html> (Erişim Tarihi: 08.11.2020).
- Eğitim Kanunu. (1993). *Azerbaycan Cumhuriyeti*. Bakü: Öğretmen Yayıncılık.



- Ergün, Muammer. (1997). Azerbaycan eğitim sistemi. *Eğitim Yönetimi Dergisi*, 3(4) Güz: 499-514.
- Ergün, M. (2008). Cumhuriyet dönemi eğitim tarihi. *Türkiye Araştırmaları Literatür Dergisi* 6(12): 321-348.
- Eyüboğlu, K. (2017). Türk dünyasında yer alan ülkelerin makro performanslarının karşılaştırılması. *bilig, Türk Dünyası Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, Güz, 83: 331-350.
- Findhow. (2018). *Kazakistan'da doktora*. <https://findhow.org/1269-kak-postupit-v-doktoranturu-phd-v-kazahstane.html> (Erişim Tarihi: 04.09.2020).
- Gadimov, C. (2008). *Türk yazılı basınında Türk Dünyası*. Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, İstanbul.
- Gökdağ, B. A. (2013). Türkmenistan'da dil politikaları. *Yeni Türkiye*, 53: 1-11.
- Gül, Y. E. (2019). *Günümüz Türk Devletlerinde Örgün Eğitim*. Nobel Bilimsel Eserler, Ankara.
- Gülüm, K. vd. (2016). Üniversite öğrencilerinin Türk Dünyası algısı ve bilgi kaynakları. *Turan Stratejik Araştırmalar Merkezi Dergisi*, V(18): 69-79.
- Gürsoy-Naskali, E. (2002). *Bağımsız Türk Cumhuriyetlerinde dil politikaları, bağımsızlıklarının 10. yılında Türk Cumhuriyetleri* (Editörler: Emine Gürsoy Naskali, Erdal Şahin). Haarlem-Hollanda: SOTA Yayınları, 55-61.
- Horak, S. (2013). Educational reforms in Turkmenistan: good framework, bad content?, Central Asia Policy Brief, no. 11, The George Washington University: 2-7.
- İdayeva, A. (2015). *Kırgızistan eğitim sistemi. Türk Dünyasında Eğitim*. Hakan Dünder (Editör), Ankara: Pegem Akademi, 125-139.
- İnci, S. (2009). *Türkiye sosyal bilgiler programının karşılaştırılmalı incelenmesi (Kanada (Ontario), İrlanda, ABD (New York, Kaliforniya), Finlandiya, Yeni Zelanda)*. Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Kocaeli Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Kocaeli.
- Kabaran, G. G. & Görgeç, İ. (2016). Güney Kore, Hong Kong, Singapur ve Türkiye'deki öğretmen yetiştirme sistemlerinin karşılaştırmalı olarak incelenmesi. *Bartın Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 5(2): 478-495.
- Kalemoğlu, Y. V. & İmamoğlu, A. F. (2014). Türk ve İngiliz eğitim sistemlerine ilişkin sayısal verilerin karşılaştırmalı olarak incelenmesi. *Eğitim ve Öğretim Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 3(1): 406-418.
- Kaplankıran, İ. (2017). Kazakistan Cumhuriyeti'nde eğitim sisteminin tarihî seyri ve günümüzdeki yapısı. *Ana Dili Eğitimi Dergisi (Journal of Mother Tongue Education)*, 5(1): 31-47.
- Kaplankıran, İ. (2016). Kazakistan Cumhuriyeti'nde eğitim sisteminin tarihî seyri ve günümüzdeki yapısı. *Ana Dili Eğitimi Dergisi*, 5(1): 31-47.
- Kara, A. & Solak, F. (2017). *Bağımsızlıklarının 25. yılında Türk Cumhuriyetleri (siyasi, ekonomik ve kültürel gelişmeler)*. İstanbul: Seçil Ofset, Türk Dünyası Belediyeler Birliği (TDBB) Yayınları, No: 23.
- Karaağaçlı, A. (2012). *Türkmenistan'ın siyasi ve anayasal yapısı*. <http://www.turansam.org/makale.php?id=4465> (Erişim Tarihi: 15.10.2020).
- Karaçalı, H. (2012). *7. Sınıf öğrencilerinin zihin haritasında Türk Dünyası algısı*. Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Gazi Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Ankara.
- Kaya, N. & Alcı, B. (2019). Türk Cumhuriyetleri'nde öğretmenlik mesleği. *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi (The Journal of International Social Research)*, 12(63).
- Kazak, K. S. (2016). *Türk Dünyasında eğitim-Türkmenistan*. Ankara: Pegem A. Yayıncılık.
- Kazakistan Cumhuriyeti Anayasası. (2020). <http://www.constitution.kz/> (Erişim Tarihi: 11.12.2020).
- KC EBB. (2018). *2017-2018 eğitim yılı için Kazakistan Cumhuriyeti eğitim sistemi istatistikleri*. Astana: Yıllık Ulusal Yayın.
- Kınacı, C. (2010). Sovyetlerden günümüze Kazakistan'da kazak dilinde eğitim politikaları. *Turkish Studies* 5(4): 1304-1319.
- Kırgız Eğitim Bakanlığı. (2019). <http://biskek.meb.gov.tr/> (Erişim Tarihi:07.02.2019)
- Kırgız Cumhuriyeti Eğitim ve Bilim Bakanlığı. (2018). <https://edu.gov.kg/ru/about/sistema-obrazovaniya/> (Erişim Tarihi: 05.06.2018).
- Korradini, M. & Dergunaova, I. (2012). *Türkmenistan meslek eğitimi ve iş piyasasına bakış, AB, ETF programı*. [http://www.etf.europa.eu/webatt.Nsf/0/FD47BD45ED215CF3C1257A720056B93B/\\$file/Turkmenistan%20VET%20&%20labour%20market\\_RU.pdf](http://www.etf.europa.eu/webatt.Nsf/0/FD47BD45ED215CF3C1257A720056B93B/$file/Turkmenistan%20VET%20&%20labour%20market_RU.pdf) (Erişim Tarihi: 05.06.2020).
- Kurban, V. & Aslanlı, A. (2018). *Bağımsızlıklarının yirmi yedinci yılında Türk Cumhuriyetleri (Azerbaycan). İnceleme araştırma dizisi*. Yayın No: 61. Editörler: Doç. Dr. Ayşe Çolpan Yıldız, Dr. Murat Yılmaz, Yayın Koordinatörü: Harun Sarıgül, ISBN: 978-9944-237-74-1. Ankara: SalMat Basım Yayıncılık Ambalaj San. Ltd. Şti.
- Mamirova, C. (2016). *Türk Dünyasında eğitim-Özbekistan*. Ankara: Pegem A Yayıncılık.
- Mammadov, J. (2008). *Bağımsızlık sonrası Azerbaycan eğitim sistemindeki değişim ve gelişmeler*. Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, İstanbul.
- Meredova, M. (2013). *Turkmenistan: reforming the education system*. London: Education in West Central Asia, ed. By Mah-E-Rukh Ahmed, Bloomsbury, 273-288.
- Mete, Y. A. (2013). Güney Kore, Japonya, Yeni Zelanda ve Finlandiya'da öğretmen yetiştirme ve atama politikaları. *Turkish Studies-İnternational Periodical for the Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic*, 8(12): 859-878.
- Nessipbayeva, O. & Dalayeva, T. (2013). Developmental perspectives of higher education in the post-soviet countries (for the Cases of Kazakhstan, Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and Turkmenistan). *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 89: 391-396.
- OECD. (2014). *Education at a glance 2014: OECD indicators, OECD publishing, Paris*. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/eag-2014-en> (Erişim Tarihi: 24.08.2020).
- OECD. (2017). *Education at a glance 2017: OECD indicators, OECD publishing, Paris*. [https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/education/education-at-a-glance-2017\\_eag-2017-en](https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/education/education-at-a-glance-2017_eag-2017-en) (Erişim Tarihi: 24.08.2020).
- Orakçı, Ş. (2015). Şangay, Hong Kong, Singapur, Japonya ve Güney Kore'nin öğretmen yetiştirme sistemleri'nin incelenmesi. *Asya Öğretim Dergisi (Asian Journal Of Instruction)*, 3(2): 26-43.
- Oran, M. (2018). *Ortaokul sosyal bilgiler ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti inkılap tarihi ve Atatürkçülük dersi öğretim programlarının Azerbaycan ve Türkmenistan'daki eşdeğer derslerin öğretim*

- programlarıyla karşılaştırılması*. Yayınlanmamış doktora tezi, Uşak Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Uşak.
- Özdemir, S., Çoban, Ömür & Bozkurt, S. (2020). Öğretmen algılarına göre okul yöneticilerinin 21. yy. eğitim yöneticisi becerileri ile stratejik liderlik davranışları arasındaki ilişki. *Pegem Eğitim ve Öğretim Dergisi*, 10(2), 399–426. <https://doi.org/10.14527/pegegog.2020.014>.
- Özdemir, C. & Özdemir, E. D. (2017). Kazakistan'da yürütülen eğitim-öğretim faaliyetleri üzerine bir değerlendirme. Демирел атында ы университетті хабаршысы (*Süleyman Demirel Üniversitesi Habarcı Dergisi*).
- Özsoy, V., Mamur, N., & Sarıbaş, S. (2020). Görsel sanatlar derslerinde görsel kültürün kullanımı: TÜBİTAK-4005 Projesi sonrası katılımcı öğretmenlerin görüşleri. *Pegem Eğitim ve Öğretim Dergisi*, 10(3), 767–808. <https://doi.org/10.14527/pegegog.2020.025>.
- Polat, F. (2011). Bağımsızlık sonrası Kırgızistan eğitim politikaları ve uygulamaları üzerine bir inceleme. *Atatürk Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 36: 1-18.
- Şahan, H. H. (2021). Öğretmen adaylarının eğitim felsefesi eğilimleri ve yaşam boyu öğrenme eğilimleri ile öğretme-öğrenme süreci yeterlikleri arasındaki ilişki. *Pegem Eğitim ve Öğretim Dergisi*, 10(4), 1325–1367. <https://doi.org/10.14527/pegegog.2020.040>.
- Savaş, S. (2010). Türk Dünyasında eğitim alanındaki gelişmeler ve yenilikler. (*Qafqaz Üniversitesi*) *Journal of Azerbaijani Studies*, 6, 21(1): 269-283.
- Shuinshina, N. (2006). *Türkiye'de Kazakistan eğitim sistemlerinin örgütsel yapılarının karşılaştırılması (merkezi ve taşra teşkilatı açısından)*. Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Gazi Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Ankara.
- Şiraz, F. vd. (2017). *Türk Dünyası eğitim raporu-Azerbaycan*. Ankara: Pegem A Yayıncılık.
- Şişman, M. & Arı, A. (2009). Kırgızistan'da eğitimin temel problemleri ve öğretmenlerin hizmet içi eğitim ihtiyacı. *Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 21: 133-147.
- Talebe Devlet Kabul Komisiyası. (2008). *Abituriyent*, 1. Bakü.
- Taşkaya, S. M. (2014). Sınıf öğretmeni adaylarının Türk Dünyası algısı. *Researcher: Social Science Studies*, II(2): 44-55.
- Toktogulov, B. & Karamatov, O. (2018). *Bağımsızlıklarının yirmi yedinci yılında Türk Cumhuriyetleri (Kırgızistan)*. İnceleme araştırma dizisi, Yayın No: 61. Editörler: Doç. Dr. Ayşe Çolpan Yıldız, Dr. Murat Yılmaz, Yayın Koordinatörü: Harun Sarıgül, ISBN: 978-9944-237-74-1. Ankara: SalMat Basım Yayıncılık Ambalaj San. Ltd. Şti.
- Toran, M., & Yağan Güder, S. (2020). Öğretmenlerin mesleki gelişiminin desteklenmesi: Lisans programındaki derslere katılan okul öncesi öğretmenlerinin görüşlerinin incelenmesi. *Pegem Eğitim ve Öğretim Dergisi*, 10(3), 809–868. <https://doi.org/10.14527/pegegog.2020.026>.
- Tülbasiyeva, L. (2007). *Kazakistan'ın eğitim sistemi ve yeni gelişmeler*. Çev: Dr. Almagül İsina, İslam Ülkeleri Kongresi, 24-27 Ekim, İstanbul. 455-460.
- Türkmenistan. (2014). <http://www.cografya.gen.tr/siyasi/devletler/turkmenistan.htm> (Erişim Tarihi: 16.02.2020).
- Türkmenistan Eğitim Sistemi. (2020). *Eğitim sistemi, müfredat, yüksek eğitim*. <http://countrystudies.us/turkmenistan/16.htm> (Erişim Tarihi: 25.03.2020).
- Türkmenistan Bilimler Akademisi. (2020). <http://science.gov.tm> (Erişim Tarihi: 04.15.2019).
- Türkmenistan Demografi Profili. (2019). [https://www.indexmundi.com/turkmenistan/demographics\\_profile.html](https://www.indexmundi.com/turkmenistan/demographics_profile.html) (Erişim Tarihi: 16.02.2019).
- Türkmenistan, Eğitim. (2020). <http://www.usaid.gov/turkmenistan/education> (Erişim Tarihi: 06.07.2020).
- Türkmenistan Eğitimin İlkeleri ve Genel Hedefleri. (2020). <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0021/002113/211313e.pdf> (Erişim Tarihi: 01.10.2020).
- UNESCO. (2006). *World Data on Education*. 6<sup>th</sup> Edition.
- Yaman, B. (2019). Türkiye'de öğretmen yetiştirme ile ilgili yapılan akademik çalışmaların karşılaştırmalı eğitimle incelenmesi. *Akademik Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 7(87): 240-253.
- Zhakanova, G. (2018). *Kazakistan ve Türkiye'de lisans düzeyinde resim-iş eğitiminin karşılaştırmalı olarak incelenmesi*. Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Erzincan Binali Yıldırım Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Erzincan.
- Zhumasheva, U. (2018). *Sovyet sonrası dönemde Kazakistan'da milli eğitim politikası*. Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Niğde Ömer Halisdemir Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Niğde.
- Zhyldyz, A. (2018). *Türkiye'de ve Kırgızistan'da ortaöğretim okullarında çalışan İngilizce öğretmenlerinin yabancı dil öğretiminde karşılaştıkları sorunlar: bir durum çalışması*. Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Akdeniz Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Antalya.