


## Women's Gender Roles in History Textbooks in Turkey

Akif PAMUK<sup>1</sup>, Köksal MUÇ<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Marmara University, Department of History Teacher Education, Istanbul, Turkey  0000-0002-8147-611X

<sup>2</sup>Marmara University, Institute of Educational Sciences, Istanbul, Turkey  0000-0002-9016-3051

### ARTICLE INFO

#### Article History:

Received 24.01.2021

Received in revised form

21.02.2021

Accepted 28.03.2021

Available online

21.04.2021

### ABSTRACT

Although the notion of gender has a biological meaning, the concept of gender refers to a social construction that emerges from a biological basis. This construction includes cultural definitions of masculinity and femininity that are more appropriate for social life. In the definition and distinction of gender roles in social life construction, the discussion of the public and private sphere is seen. Textbooks have an important place as a dominant discourse tool in the public and private sphere debate. Therefore, textbooks in general and history textbooks in particular have an important share in this debate. Textbooks convey stereotypes of gender roles to students and contain descriptions of roles. On the other hand, history textbooks construct and legitimize the historical context along with the definitions of roles. Therefore, history textbooks have an important share in the production of women's gender roles. In this context, it is determined that the purpose of the study is to evaluate the gender roles of women in compulsory or history courses textbooks in the 2019-2020 academic year in Turkey. In the research, document analysis is carried out using a case study, one of the qualitative research designs. 9, 10, 11 and 12th-grade history textbooks and 11th-grade elective History of Turkish Culture and Civilization, 12th grade Turkish Republic History of Revolution and Kemalism and 12th grade elective Contemporary Turkish and World History textbooks were examined. In the study, the discourse repertoires built on women's gender roles were determined using critical discourse analysis. In the textbooks, it has been determined that the gender roles of women are associated with traditional roles such as motherhood, child-rearing, and sewing and embroidery. Besides, although it is argued that women are the subjects of the public sphere in the textbooks, it has been seen that the roles of the private sphere are concretized, clarified, legitimized and reproduced with various examples. As a result, history textbooks have been shaped in a male-dominated structure and the basic discourse produced from this is that women are a part of private life, not the public sphere. To eliminate the disadvantageous situation of women regarding gender roles in history textbooks, guidelines for textbook authors should be prepared in the history course curriculum.

© 2021 IJPES. All rights reserved

Keywords:

History textbooks, gender, gender roles

### 1. Introduction

The production of knowledge carries the traces or reflections of the producer of the information. The objectivity of the knowledge form produced refers to the basic acceptance point of modernity. Modern objective knowledge also enables the construction of the dominant discourse. The dominant discourse implies a hierarchical order, although it has a political meaning. Considering that the rules produced for the object express the discourse (Arkonaç, 2014), it has made the question of who the subjects in the discourse are, as

<sup>1</sup> Corresponding author's address: Marmara University, Atatürk Faculty of Education, Istanbul, Turkey.

e-mail: [akifpamuk@marmara.edu.tr](mailto:akifpamuk@marmara.edu.tr)

Citation: Pamuk, A. & Muç, K. (2021). Women's gender roles in history textbooks in Turkey. *International Journal of Psychology and Educational Studies*, 8(2), 133-147.

<https://dx.doi.org/10.52380/ijpes.2021.8.2.391>

well as the gender of these subjects, a subject of discussion, and put into question the entire form of knowledge produced by the dominant discourse.

There are some reasons why the woman cannot be the subject against the male subject who constructs the dominant discourse. In the historical background of this situation, in a period close to the end of the 20th century, before the influence of different disciplines in gender studies, there is the understanding that approaches the difference between women and men as natural. This natural difference demonstrated the existence of a hierarchical order in many issues ranging from social position to forms of power. There was no production of information about the life of the ordinary woman. However, one of the most important reasons underlying that women are not seen as historical subjects is that history seems to be related only to the transmission of politics, economics and the execution of power, while another reason is that historians are men. In addition, while these male historians saw women as mothers, wives and servants, they also regarded their activities as irrelevant to history (Rose, 2018).

Apart from understanding history and the perspective of historians on women as subjects, the main argument is that the male-dominated discourse of modernity is dominant in making sense of all events and phenomena, including concepts. In this context, the existence of the concepts of gender and gender roles in social sciences is a criticism of the aforementioned masculine structure. Unlike the concept of gender, the notion of gender emerges as a cultural definition of behavior that is assumed to be appropriate for the sexes in a particular society at a given time (Berktaş, 2019, p. 29). In a sense, the concept refers to the unequal division between masculinity and femininity in the social direction. It is understood that the most important reason underlying the unequal division is the reproduction of the inborn sexes by gender.

It provides information about gender, expectations from the gender and the position of the individual. The domain of the concept is not limited to expectation and position. Gender is also related to the private and public lives of men and women. The most important factor that maintains the stereotypes that are produced and expected to be followed is the belief that the behavior, attitude and reactions between these genders are different from each other and the differences between men and women, which are believed to be found (Vatandaş, 2007). These differences are the most important factors that make up the roles in the life of the breed. Connell (1996) explains gender roles as gender stereotypes that describe appropriate behavior for women and men and address social expectations. According to him, gender is a way in which social practice is organized.

The production of gender roles is not as simple as it might seem. Even the names such as father, son, and brother are not simple ones, on the contrary, they are people who bring very important mutual duties for the society beyond the individual structure (Engels, 2003). The mother and father take the first steps in building roles for the child, once the gender of the child is revealed. Again, Connell (1987) states that gender began its emergence with the family, and that social and cultural dynamics shaped it in the following process. Besides, in shaping the individual through values in this process, the production and continuation of gender roles and traditional values are provided. The transferred values and the applied approaches make it possible to build an appropriate citizen (Muç, 2019). Thus, the individual, who goes through various processes, adopts gender roles in the society's direction.

The main theme of gender adaptations has always been two gender roles. The male role and the female role or the male role and the female role. The roles to be followed make their presence felt in all areas of life. There are clear differences between the roles of men and women in every field from daily life to working life, from marriage to family life. However, it is seen that men are generally given the role of fatherhood, headship and breadwinner in the family, while women are mostly given the role of motherhood and housewife (Yılmaz, 2018, p.3). However, it should not be overlooked that women are at a disadvantage compared to men in this distribution of roles. It is especially noteworthy that this disadvantaged situation occurs in the public sphere, and women are primarily associated with the private sphere and the family.

According to Scott (1986), gender identity is constructed through language. In this construction process, especially since the relationship between the genders will be different, gender roles will be the main factor in understanding their sexual identity. Learning the roles that start with the interaction with the family and close environment is not limited to the family, but also, according to Özdemir (2018, p.81), from mass media, social environment, stories, fairy tales and textbooks. On the other hand, educational institutions play an active role

in the creation and reproduction of gender roles (Adaçay, 2018). In this context, one of the means of producing gender roles is textbooks.

### 1.1 Textbooks and Gender

Textbooks, one of the most widely used educational resources by schools, carry the acquisitions, concepts, values, and skills to students in line with the national curriculum's basic goals and objectives (Doğan & Torun, 2018, p. 112). While textbooks are also seen as powerful cultural, ideological and political tools of the society in which new generations socialize (Chiponda & Wassermann, 2011), they are the sources whose content is created within the framework of determined curriculums and the behaviors that the state wishes to see in individuals who want to train can be seen concretely (Alabaş, 2018a). Textbooks have an important content on gender roles as the distinctive power of social structure. This content conveys explicit and implicit messages to students about gender roles and conveys whether or not the gender-appropriate behaviors and roles are (Özmeriç Taştekin, 2019). Textbook reviews in this context provide important data on the relationship between textbooks and gender roles. For example, in the textbook reviews conducted until the end of the 1990s, it is clearly stated that there is gender discrimination against women and it is stated that women are restricted to housework and childcare roles (Güneş, 2008). More broadly, in the analysis reports of the Human Rights in Textbooks project (I, II, III) carried out in collaboration with TÜBA and the History Foundation, it was stated that the textbooks of Güvenli and Tanrıöver (2009) were particularly problematic due to their potential to sustain unequal gender roles. The most common violations are the use of sexist language in primary education, the unquestioned acceptance of the unequal distribution of social roles, the patriarchal understanding of the family, and the family's male-dominated portrayal. It has been stated that the most common violation at secondary education level is sexism in language (as cited in Çayır, 2014, p. 83).

Apart from these studies, the results of other studies (Gümüšoğlu, 2016; Altan Arslan, 2000; Tezer-Asan, 2010; Yurtsever, 2011) that examine the textbooks in terms of gender roles suggest that the passive position of women in the distribution of roles, the inequality and imbalance between the genders are maintained, women are home to traditional roles. (Karaboğa, 2020, p.55). In the textbooks that can be considered as a tool of dominant discourse, students are introduced to mothers as someone who cleans the house, cook, wash the laundry and dishes, take care of their children. Even in texts that mention women working in a job, it is emphasized that the main duty of women is in the home (Yılmaz, 2018). Accordingly, it is understood that women are associated with loyalty to their families and private sphere jobs, while men are associated with all public affairs except these jobs.

Taking place of the concept of gender in historiography is a product of the historical process. Indeed, the birth and rise of gender historiography in historiography was accompanied by linguistic turn, poststructuralism and postmodernism. Throughout this period, gender historians have been trying to demolish the idea that the subjects of history are disembodied white men. This situation also weakened traditional historiography. However, in the debates between feminist historians and traditional historians, Michel Foucault stated that the power's commitment to knowledge, gender has become the object of scientific knowledge in the history of sexuality. The information produced functions as a means of control. Jacques Derrida put forward the idea of deconstruction as a way of understanding and reading texts. Following the contributions of names such as Joan Scott and Kathleen Canning, it is seen that interdisciplinary approaches and different traditions made significant contributions to gender historiography (Rose, 2018).

It is known that after the inclusion of the concept of gender in historiography, history lessons have a structure that builds the dominant discourse besides conveying the knowledge of the past. According to the feminist theory, it is accepted that history lessons display a masculine structure as an ideological tool in this construction process. The historical construction of this masculine structure is closely related to the current paradigm. The modern paradigm has been an important factor determining the distribution of women and gender roles. As a matter of fact, gender-based modernist approaches distinguish between public and private spheres in the patriarchal family structure (Özbek, 2016). The public sphere is seen as the man's sphere, and the private sphere as the woman's sphere. This spatial differentiation gave women the roles of "mother, wife and housewife".

The inclusion of women in history textbooks different from their traditional roles in the private sphere is the reflection of the developments in democratization and human rights after the Second World War. The

development of social history understanding in the 1960s and 1970s has accelerated this situation. Firstly, the materials used in history education in England and the USA constitute the discussion's starting point. In the School History Project (SHP) in England, women are not sufficiently represented in history teaching, and a male-dominated understanding of history has been maintained in the context of the curriculum and textbook. Women and gender follow this discussion in special education in Turkey and in the world and history textbook study shows that began to be built (Demircioğlu, 2014).

In general, history textbooks contain subtexts that contribute to understanding men and women's social and historical roles (Chiponda & Wassermann, 2011). Therefore, history textbooks have been seen as an important tool for producing, interpreting, and converting gender roles into behavior. History lessons and textbooks have an important place in the formation of collective consciousness and in the construction of social reality, and it is seen that gender in social reality is legitimized as yesterday, today and tomorrow (Pamuk, 2014). In addition, it should be considered that history teaching programs are an important framework for history textbooks. Can (2009) states that in the history lesson curriculums prepared since 2006, there are issues and achievements related to women in social, economic and cultural history, and the emphasis is on the fact that women are the subjects of history like men. However, although there is no information about women and gender roles in the 2018 secondary education history course curriculum, only for the authors of the textbook, the contents of the textbook should be prepared by considering gender equality statement (MEB, 2018, p. 18).

The purpose of this study is to determine and analyse what the gender roles of women who are included in the textbooks, grade 9, 10, 11, 12 history textbooks, 11th Grade elective course The History of Turkish Culture and Civilization, Grade 12 Modern Turkish and World History, Grade 12 Turkish Republic History of Revolution and Kemalism, are and how they are reflected. The problem statement of research in this context is what the gender roles of women in history textbooks in Turkey are? Sub-problems to be answered within the framework of this problem statement are as follows;

1. What are the main features of the description of women in history textbooks?
2. What are the main characteristics of women's gender roles in history textbooks?
3. What are the main characteristics of women in history textbooks?

## **2. Methodology**

### **2. 1. Research Model**

In this study, a case study from qualitative research designs was used. "Case study is a qualitative approach that collects detailed information from real life situations or situations in a certain time interval through multiple sources of information, and reveals descriptions or themes" (Creswell, 2015, p.97). Unlike other types of research, the case study (Stake, 1978), which determines what the study is about, is a frequently preferred research design in social sciences. In this study, the gender roles of women in history textbooks, which are multiple sources of information, were examined and interpreted in a holistic manner with the case study.

### **2. 2. Data Collection Tools**

Document analysis was used as the data collection tool of the research. Written materials that provide information to the researcher about the subject to be researched are called documents (Balci, 2013). Based on the problem statement, the sample of the research for which the document was examined; The Ministry of National Education's 9th, 10th, 11th grade secondary education history textbooks, which were accepted as an educational tool with the letter of the Board of Education and Discipline on 25.06.2018 and numbered 12254648, and which are compulsory in schools in the 2019-2020 academic year, In addition to the 12th grade Turkish Republic History of Revolution and Kemalism textbook, elective courses are 11th grade Turkish Cultural History and 12th grade Contemporary Turkish and World History.

### **2. 3. Analysis of Data**

The data obtained in the research were analyzed by using critical discourse analysis. Critical discourse analysis is based on the use of language in texts. So much so that language has a central place in the meaning of the outside world. Rather than being a means of communication or representation (Elliott, 1996), it has a structure that constitutes the subject's social life.

There is a constant interaction between social life and language use. According to Gee (1999), the use of language has a political content and therefore a political discourse since the ideologies of the social world in which it emerged are intertwined. As a matter of fact, it is almost impossible to evaluate language outside of political and ideological factors. In other words, language, which has a role in constructing the external world and affecting social facts, differs in social situations related to the individual. This difference in the structure of the language is described as discourse, and discourse analysis can be expressed as a textual analysis of the different uses of language. With its general structure, discourse analysis is related to the context (power / knowledge relationship) and grammar of the text (Yetim & Erdağ, 2018, p. 83). Finally, it includes various analysis methods developed to explain the impact between the concepts of language and the social world's construction.

Critical discourse analysis relates to the use of the social power of elites, institutions or groups, the role of discourse in the (reproduction and challenge of) domination, resulting in social inequality, including political, cultural, class, ethnic, racial and gender inequality. It reveals and analyzes how power relations with another party are presented among participants, legitimized, denied, hidden. Critical discourse analysis explores and shows the structures, strategies or other features of text, speech, verbal interaction or communicative events that play a role in power and domination structures (Kress, 1990). That is, critical discourse analysis specifically focuses on manipulation, legitimation, consent generation, and other discursive ways to influence people's minds (and indirectly their actions) for the benefit of the powerful (Van Dijk, 1993).

In this context, by using critical discourse analysis in the research, the basic features of the presentation of women, how the woman as a subject is positioned and what kind of features come to the forefront in the history textbooks at secondary education level were determined. Then, by determining the roles of gender roles in the basic characteristics, it was investigated about the discourse produced. On the basis of the basic characteristics of the desirable woman, based on the basic features of the presentation and the discourse produced in the basic characteristics of the roles, the discourse of the acceptable woman that the dominant discourse tries to construct in the textbooks has been identified. Evaluations were made by discussing the contribution of these discourses to the general discourse.

### 3. Findings

#### 3.1. Basic Features of the Description of Women in History Textbooks

The interpretation of the dominant discourse that determines the gender roles with critical discourse analysis aims to reveal the social power and influence relations built by the dominant discourse. The discourses built on the gender roles of women in the textbooks, which are an important tool that produce and legitimize these power relations, contain important clues about the place of women who are positioned as a subject. The basic discourse produced in the basic characteristics of the description of women in history textbooks is that women are the public sphere's subjects. In the sub-repertoire of this discourse, which expresses a meaning that women take an active role in social, political and economic life, there are a) gender equality, b) modern women, c) women as a defense mechanism, d) military women.

In the sub-repertoires of the discourse identified in the presentation of the woman in the textbooks, the emphasis on the equality of women with men in all matters associated with women draws attention. Supporting the basic discourse, the impression is created that equality is provided in all relevant fields, regardless of public and private discrimination. However, it is striking that the area to which equality is associated is mostly within the family and private. For example, in the 11th grade Turkish Culture and Civilization History textbook (MEB, 2019d, p.75): *"In the Turkish-Islamic society, the patriarchal family structure is observed as in pre-Islamic Turkic societies. In this structure, even though the father is the head of the family, the mother greatly influences family management. "The female bird makes the nest." The importance of women in society was stated with the proverb. Instead of the words kang (father) and ög (mother) used for mother and father in ancient Turks, the Turkish-Islamic states used the words ata for fathers and ana for mothers. In Turkish Islamic society, multi-spouse marriage was not common and the woman had the same rights as her husband."* As seen in the text, it is seen that women are in the role of motherhood and in the second place (mother also), as can be understood from the use of language created about women. Again, this situation, which is associated with the society and being a spouse, is supported by a proverb and it creates a meaning that it is equal with their spouses in terms of rights,

although it is not certain. Considering the text's general context, it is noteworthy that there is an emphasis on motherhood and being a wife in the context of women, and some issues that may cause controversy (such as polygamy) are avoided. In addition, it is seen that the theme of equality put forward in the description of women is wanted to be supported with a historical background by giving examples from Old Turks.

In addition to the historical background, how the meaning of the constructed discourse is provided and what has been done in this regard is another dimension that draws attention in the textbooks. In this context, studies conducted through laws, such as in the 11th grade Turkish Culture and Civilization History textbook: "An important step was taken in equality between women and men with the Civil Law enacted in the Republic Period." (MEB, 2019d, p.98) and: "With the Turkish Civil Code adopted on October 4, 1926, many changes were made in social life, and women and men were tried to be equal in almost every field from working life to education." (MEB, 2019d, p.123), as can be understood from the examples, laws were mentioned in ensuring equality, especially the importance of the Civil Code was pointed out. However, considering the predicates in the text, the fields in which equality is achieved and the changes made are not clearly stated. This shows that laws enacted are one of the tools that constitute the power of the dominant discourse in the description of women. Therefore, there is an expression that equality is placed on a legal basis.

Modernization has an important role in reproducing and transforming gender roles. Especially the female perspective of the new regime in the modernization of Turkey represents a major break with the old situation. In this context, as society's progress is in question, it is inevitable for women to have new roles in this progress. Modern women are included in the sub-repertoire that supports the basic discourse on exactly this understanding. It has been observed that this situation became concrete by granting legal rights to women in the early periods of the regime. The following expressions in the 12th grade textbook (MEB, 2019e, p.113) can be given as an example to this:

*"On February 17, 1926, the Turkish Grand National Assembly accepted the Turkish Civil Code with the law it passed. The law entered into force on October 4, 1926. With the adoption of the Turkish Civil Code, the family structure was rearranged according to modern societies. Legal equality was achieved in Turkish society and thus an important step was taken in secularization of the legal system. With the acceptance of the Turkish Civil Code*

- 1. Religion, language, and equality before the law regardless of race and gender were brought to all Republic of Turkey citizens.*
- 2. Turkish women have gained all kinds of social rights in social life.*
- 3. Turkish women gained the right to work in various professions.*
- 4. The monogamy rule was introduced.*
- 5. Women were also given the right to divorce.*
- 6. It was accepted that the marriage was made in the presence of an official marriage official.*
- 7. Women have been given the right to an equal share of the inheritance. "*

With the innovations brought by the articles of the Civil Code, it is seen that the new roles of women in public and private spheres are realized. However, the existing state of being in the second plane manifested itself in substances. Another point that draws attention here is that the new roles and gender regime have a paternalistic structure. However, there is an emphasis on the changes in gender roles for the benefit of women with the steps taken in the legal dimension in terms of general structure.

#### **Image 1. One of the first woman representatives Meliha Ulaş**



Another legal step where change occurs is the law on the right to vote and be elected. Regarding this law, which represents an important point in the construction of modern women of the new regime, in the 11th grade Turkish Culture and Civilization History textbook (MEB, 2019d, p.57): *"Women who did not have the right to vote and be elected in the first years of the Republic, could take part in the I. and II. assemblies. However, with a law enacted in 1934, women were also given the right to vote and be elected, so that the will of the people was fully reflected in the parliament."* The text emphasizes that the new roles of women in

the public sphere are realized. The second plan of the woman, who is directly associated with the management, is included as in the previous example. With the new image and profession of Meliha Ulaş, who was given as the first female deputy in Image 1, it is seen that the modern woman as a subject of the public sphere is embodied.

The answer to the question of what are the gender roles of women is closely related to the language used. Context is as important as the use of language in critical discourse analysis. Another of the sub-repertoires that construct the basic discourse in the description of women is women as the defense mechanism determined in relation to the context of the texts about women in the textbooks. The meaning desired to be created in these texts is that Turkish women are not passive characters in social and political life, on the contrary, they are active and constructive characters. 11th grade Turkish Culture and Civilization History textbook (MEB, 2019d, p.78) In the text of "The Place of Women in the First Islamic States": *"In addition, women were seen in all areas of social life in this period and there were even women who went on the expedition and participated in the war. Seljuk Sultan Tuğrul Bey consulted with his wife Altuncan Hatun on some issues related to state affairs."* It is possible to see an example of this situation in the statement. As can be seen in this example, although the areas where women are kept unclear when associated with the previous examples, direct attention is drawn to the warrior characteristics frequently encountered in later examples. At the same time, in the example given, it is seen that in a limited area, women are in a position to be consulted or consulted rather than making decisions. When we look at the language structure used, the place where the defense is made is on the place where women take part in war, which is seen as an area that does not belong to women. Therefore, it is understood that it is desired to create an impression that women are included in all areas of social life, and even more, besides historicity.

Various texts on women's defence mechanism have been identified from the sub-repertoires of the discourse, which constitute the basic discourse in the description of women and which constitute a response to certain judgments. In this context, highlighting the value and value given to women: "Sometimes you meet women with their men and then you think these men are servants of women." "One of the interesting attitudes I saw in this region is the extreme respect men show to women. Women were considered superior to men in this country." (MEB, 2019d, p.78), it is stated that the place of women is glorified and superior in the sense constructed. In the previous example, there was a judgment that women existed even outside the sphere of existence under normal conditions. In this text, the state of equality seen in the description of women in the previous examples has evolved into being superior to men. Therefore, this state of defense, which emerges in the basic characteristics of the description of women, has occurred in the form of glorifying the position and value of women contrary to the judgments.

Another sub-repertoire that constructs the discourse in the woman's presentation is military women. It is noteworthy that in the general historical construction of history textbooks, the military characteristics of women are brought to the fore in line with the discourse of "army-nation" or "warrior nation". In the 11th grade Turkish Culture and Civilization History textbook that can serve as an example for this situation: The army organization in the Turks has been an example for many countries. (MEB, 2019d, p.61) emphasizes that there is no discrimination due to this established understanding and that women are potential military power.

Another similar example is a text in the same textbook stating that women have a military force when necessary: *"In the ancient Turks, men and women knew the art of war well. Women would even join the war when necessary. As a result of the army-nation tradition, even children were accustomed to military service from an early age. Today, young people who are sent to the military in accordance with the understanding of the army-nation, which does not lose its meaning, are sent off to the army with drum and turnout ceremonies."* In the text (MEB, 2019d, p.19), it is stated that as can be understood from the structure of the sentence, women are in the second place in terms



of military power, as in the previous examples, but this power of women is used when appropriate. At the same time, it is seen that military service is a voluntary task rather than an obligation, and that women are associated with the duty of defending the homeland. In this direction, the military role has been legitimized as a manifestation of an established understanding.

### Image 2. Bâcıyan-ı Rûm (Representational)



Various images were also used to strengthen the basic discourse. The representational picture given in image 2 aims to visualize the military women of the period. In the 10th grade history textbook that associates painting with: "Turkish women, who were masters in horse riding and shooting in the Pre-Islamic Period, participated in wars with men. After the conversion to Islam, this tradition was continued and an organization of women was established in Anatolia under the name of Bâcıân-ı Rûm." In the text (MEB, 2019b, p.77), attention is drawn to equality in the military field in relation to the previous examples. The historicity that builds the discourse is also seen in this example. It is seen that the military role, which is carried out on an abstract plane in terms of context, is made concrete with a representation picture, and the position of women is combined with war, which is an indicator of masculinity.

Different methods are used in the reproduction or transformation of gender roles in history textbooks. In this context, while emphasizing women's military characteristics, the self-sacrifice and sacrifices shown by women in various wars and their exemplary behavior are included.

### Image 3. Heroine Nene Hatun



An example of this situation is in image 3 (MEB, 2019c, p.118) in the 11th-grade history textbook in the text "Kahraman Nene Hatun at the 93 War" ....*Although her husband told her to stay, take care of the child," Nene Hatun entrusted her child to God and joined the crowd... After the Korean War, General Ridgway, a NATO officer in Erzurum, visited Nene Hatun at her home and kissed her hand. "I did my duty at the time," she told Ridgway, who visited her. Today, despite my advanced age, I have the strength and excitement to do the same service in a more perfect way. " once again, she showed the spirit of the heroic Turkish woman "*, showing the example of a woman who put the defense of the homeland before her other roles. Considering the general context of the text and the language structure of the text and the picture used, the roles were concretized through exemplary historical figures and stories, starting from the historical background.

Exemplary figures and stories that support the basic discourse are frequently included in the military women's sub-repertoire. 12th grade Turkish Republic History of Revolution and Kemalism textbook, this situation is observed mainly in the stories of the devoted and devoted women of the homeland who took an active role in the struggle for liberation. For example, in the text of "Şerife Bacı" "I don't read" in this textbook, the following statements are included:

*"While Şerife Bacı was carrying ammunition and supplies from İnebolu to Kastamonu; In the barracks near Kastamonu, he froze to death because of the snow and blizzard... This young woman who covered her own quilt in one hand to protect the precious burden of oxen ruminant in her carriage, with a long wand in one hand, stretched her arms and froze to death. Cemil Sergeant; While he was sweeping the snow on the martyr and lifting the woman in tears, he was surprised to hear the voice of a crying child screaming under the blanket. When the martyr pulled the martyr aside and immediately lifted the quilt, what they saw: A girl wrapped in sackcloth placed among cannon balls wrapped in grass, escaped freezing and woke up and started to cry upon intervention. (MEB, 2019e, p.88)*

In this text in the textbook, the heroized story of the historical personality who sacrificed his life for the defense of the homeland is conveyed. The symbolic representation of the woman involved in the struggle was provided with motherhood. Thus, by including the stories of the homeland's glorified women, it is possible to construct a meaning that women with military qualifications constitute an important dimension of homeland defense.



In the light of all these findings, the basic features of women's description are that the basic discourse constructed is the subject of the public space. In order to legitimize this discourse, the historical background is striking in all textbooks. However, when the sub-repertoires of the discourse are examined, it is revealed that women in the language used in the texts are in the background, the ambiguity in the expressions about rights and fields, the clarification of traditional roles, women are a part of the private sphere, not the public sphere.

### 3.2. Basic Characteristics of Women's Gender Roles in History Textbooks

Studies on gender roles basically express the disadvantageous position of women in the discrimination made on gender. This disadvantage is maintained by the historical contexts and references produced by the dominant discourse. As seen in the previous chapter, although the basic discourse produced in the description of women in the history textbooks is in the direction of the subject of the public sphere, the findings revealed that women are a part of the private sphere. Accordingly, in the second problem sentence of the research, the basic discourse produced in the basic characteristics of gender roles is that women are private life subjects with traditional roles. The discourse produced in the basic characteristics of gender roles is that women take part in the traditional roles of motherhood, child-rearing and sewing and embroidery.

The text titled "Boats' Migration to the Plateau" in the 9th grade history textbook supports the determined roles: "... Migration was carried out with bactrian camels (loadlet) or four-wheeled, covered and ox-driven carriages (ox). These cars were almost like a real dwelling in which women spun wool, sewed, gave birth and nursed their children. Migration to the plateaus would become a complete entertainment. Beautiful clothes were put on and cheerful songs were sung along the way. (MEB, 2019a, p.107) mentions the jobs women do in private life, and therefore women's roles have been made functional. It is seen that the motherhood role, which is basically associated with the child, is associated with the home known as a private space. In addition, it is seen that in the motherhood role, emphasis is placed on domestic work and raising children.

The texts studied in gender roles are the product and process of discourse. In this context, the text's grammatical structure and the associated fields provide the determination of the discourse produced about the roles. The following statements in the 11th grade Turkish Culture and Civilization History (MEB, 2019d, p.96) textbook are an example of this: "Volunteer caregivers rushed to help thousands of soldiers injured in the battlefield through this association. In the Society of Hilal-i Ahmer, women as well as men have undertaken important roles and collected plenty of aid. During the Balkan Wars, they provided the materials such as underwear, sheets and bandages required for hospitals by working day and night." Looking at the grammatical structure of the text, it is seen that women are in the second place. Although it is stated that women take different roles, it is noteworthy that they take a role in realizing the work that can be seen as sewing and embroidery. Based on this, it is understood that the works associated with it mostly refer to private areas and traditional roles.

Another example of works involving private field roles is under the title of "Daily Life in the Ottoman Empire" in the 11th grade Turkish Culture and Civilization History textbook: "In Ottoman society, women took part in social life and showed their presence in various fields from economy to property trading, from weaving to housework." (MEB, 2019d, p.86). Although it is stated in the previous text that women assume different roles, it is understood that the work directly in the text is sewing-embroidery and household work, thus drawing attention to the traditional roles of the private space.

It is seen that the main characteristics of women's roles in the public and private sphere conflict in gender roles are mostly related to the private sphere. Supporting this situation, another example in which women are mostly referred to as mother and family roles is included in the 11th grade Turkish History of Culture and Civilization textbook: "In the Turkish family structure, the mother has a very important place in addition to the father. There was no distinction. There is a division of labor for all family activities; the mother would come right after the father in the family. Father in the upbringing of sons; Mother was also prominent in raising daughters. Women did not only do housework, but participated in all activities of the family." (MEB, 2019d, p.70). While the field of activity of the motherhood role associated with the family is specified, it is striking that the woman is made responsible for raising especially girls. Apart from this, it is observed that women are not limited to housework but other activities are left uncertain. In both cases, the area that women are associated with is traditional family roles.

In the discourse that is tried to be legitimized about gender roles, it is seen that traditional roles are emphasized. In these roles, examples highlighting the private sphere were encountered in the public-private sphere discussion. In this direction, it is seen that gender roles in history textbooks produce and clarify the discourse of women as the subject of private life.

### 3.3. Basic Characteristics of Appropriate Women in History Textbooks

The basic discourse produced in the description of women in history textbooks and the discourse produced in gender roles also reveals the discourse that is appropriate for women. In this context, two different discourses emerge periodically in the desired woman's basic characteristics in the analyzed history textbooks. While the first was women who were associated with pre-Islamic and Ottoman periods and showed military characteristics with traditional roles, the second was seen that the discourse produced about the desirable woman after the regime change was women who took roles in public life.

In the first discourse, emphasis is placed on the position of women and their social activities in the first Turkish communities. More attention is paid to the military characteristics of women. It is then stated that these roles were not interrupted by the adoption of Islam. But basically, the clarification of traditional roles was emphasized in the narration of the subjects related to the Ottoman Period.

To set an example for this situation, in the 11th grade Turkish Culture and Civilization History textbook: *"Turks used to regard the rights they care about and deem sacred as their main right, and they valued and respected women greatly. When the head of the house went to war, women would do all the remaining work in the house. The Turkish woman, who was very fond of honor and chastity, would ride a horse, shoot arrows, go hunting and join the war when necessary. In epics, women warriors such as Selcen Hatun and Banu Çiçek can be found reflecting the alp tradition."* As can be seen in the text (MEB, 2019d, p.73), it is seen that the place of women is glorified by emphasizing the maternal role, family roles and warrior characteristics of the desired woman in the pre-Islamic period. Therefore, the emphasis on traditional roles expressing the special field, whose examples we have also seen in the previous themes, generally reflects the basic characteristics of the desirable women of this period.

In the Ottoman period, when traditional roles became more pronounced, it is seen that the desired woman was defined by the new concept "Ottoman Woman". In the text in the information note given in the 11th grade Turkish Culture and Civilization History textbook, "Woman in Ottoman; The most important factor that kept the family alive was the person who was the most effective in child care and upbringing. The woman had a say in the house. Phrases such as "Ottoman Woman" and "Neither an Ottoman woman were formed as a result of such a woman image" (MEB, 2019d, p.86), which are still used in society today, it is said that women are associated with the family in the private sphere, such as raising children. It is seen that the importance of traditional roles is emphasized.

It is seen that the discourse repertoire produced about the desirable women and roles was affected by the changes and transformations of the period in political and ideological dimensions. In this context, transition to the nation-state model constitutes an important breaking point in Turkish women's basic characteristics. It has been observed that the roles of women in the public sphere, who appeared before us with their traditional roles, became more pronounced. The women of this period became the modern faces of the Republic and the nation in line with the principles of the Kemalist ideology.

It is possible to see examples in which public roles are emphasized in the 12th grade history textbook. Indeed, "Lale Aytaman, who was assigned as a governor of Mugla, was Turkey's first female governor." or in the example of "Tansu Ciller has become Turkey's first female prime minister." (MEB, 2019f, p.227- 233), there is an emphasis on being the first of the roles of two women in the public sphere.

It is striking that women, who have become symbols of modernization, who are directed to the public sphere and are encouraged to take responsibilities, have a break from the previous period in the field of dress. In this context, it is possible to see the representations of the desired women of the period in the 12th grade history textbook in image 4 (MEB, 2019f, p.124)

#### Image 4. Atatürk and Modern Turkish Women



In general, periodic differences were observed in the textbooks in the discourse repertoire identified in the desired woman's basic characteristics. Until the regime change, it was determined that the desired women were associated with traditional roles in the private sphere, and after the regime change, the public sphere was associated with roles in line with the goals of the Kemalist ideology and supported by images reflecting the spirit of the time.

#### 4. Conclusion and Discussion

The traditional roles of motherhood gender roles of women in history textbooks in Turkey in the study were found to be associated with child-rearing and sewing and embroidery works. Although it is argued in the textbooks that women are the subjects of the public sphere in general structure, it has been observed that the roles of the private sphere are concretized, clarified, legitimized and reproduced with various examples.

In the basic characteristics of the description of women, which is the first of the research questions, it has been determined that the historicity is brought to the fore in the discourse produced about women and that it is legitimized in accordance with the general structure. In the sub-repertoire of equality between women and men that emerged in this direction, it is seen that in addition to equality of women with their husbands in the family, it is also emphasized that equality is achieved in the legal dimension. In this context, it has been understood that the meaning produced is to create the perception that women are equal with men in every field. However, in the language structure used even in the aforementioned areas of equality, the secondary status of women is maintained and it is seen that other areas except those related to the private area remain uncertain. In modern women, who are in another sub-repertoire of discourse, it is seen that the meaning of women is reproduced and transformed with the regime change. With the nation-state model's implementation, it has been determined that the emphasis is placed on women as the subject of the public sphere, and a new image of women has emerged, unlike the previous periods. Modernity is emphasized in the rights and duties given to women. Thus, it is understood that the woman in the reproduced sense is trying to be shown as one of the symbols of the new modern state.

It is seen that women are considered superior to men and are glorified in the sense constructed in the texts, which is one of the sub-repertoire of the discourse, which is determined in the basic characteristics of the description of women and where women take place as a defense mechanism. It has been determined that it is a matter of creating a perception that women are an active and constructive, active rather than passive subject of social life. Even in this state, the woman's secondary state in the language used in the texts continues. It is thought that among the aims to reach is to refute negative judgments about the place and importance of women and to prevent issues that may cause controversy. Finally, the sub-repertoire, which is among the main features of the description of women, is the military women in which the warrior aspects of women are emphasized. It is seen that women, who are shown as defense forces, have warrior features like men are associated with their characteristic structures. In addition to drawing attention to the fact that this situation is directly related to the social structure, it is striking that it is also touted as a source of pride. In this context, while emphasizing military characteristics, it is also emphasized that women are self-sacrificing and self-sacrificing, and concretized with representative pictures.

In the second sub-problem sentence of the study, it is seen that the main characteristics of the gender roles examined are directly emphasized on traditional roles and women are highlighted with roles that highlight the special field, as well as engaging in motherhood, child-rearing, and sewing and embroidery. These roles, which are highlighted, reveal women's position and their rights and duties, and they reflect the dominant discourse's perspective on women. As a result, it is understood that the roles expressed are aimed at maintaining traditional roles. Therefore, it is seen that there is an effort to continue the disadvantage of women in gender roles.

In the third sub-problem sentence of the study, although there are periodic differences in the discourse of appreciated women, it is seen that the desirable woman was clarified with traditional roles in the private

sphere until the regime change, then restructured in line with the goals of the Kemalist ideology and associated with the roles of the public sphere. In the same direction, women have become symbols of modernity and civilization with their clothes and looks, as well as progress, the modern secular state's break from the Ottoman past. Thus, the direct relationship between the meaning produced about women and the dominant discourse was determined.

It is possible to establish a relationship with the history textbooks' results, which were examined with critical discourse analysis in the research, with similar studies in the field. Regarding the masculine nature of the dominant discourse, Köse (2004) stated that all of the images he identified about women in history textbooks reflected the viewpoint of men towards women. In this respect, the finding that history textbooks are shaped by male-dominated discourse results from this research shows that the results of the two studies are parallel. Apart from this study, a connection can be established between the results of the research and the results of different studies. As a matter of fact, in a case study that examined the place of women's history in history textbooks before the curriculum change in 2018, Alpargu and Çelik (2016) stated that the most common roles of women in history textbooks are mothers and wives. In this context, Turkey in the 2019- 2020 academic year, taught history textbooks we have found in the second sub-problem research, motherhood of women in basic features of gender roles, thus it is seen that it continued, in the same way, the co-roles. In his research, Demircioğlu (2014) states that in the texts in history textbooks, women are in passive and second-class positions compared to men, and in the images they are shown while taking care of children or doing various works. In the same direction, Can (2009) stated that the sections in which the information about women are widely included are the sections in which the place and duties of women in the family are explained, which will ensure the continuation of the traditional role of women, Baçoğlu (1996) has a secondary position in social life in his research on high school history books has determined that. The first sub-problem of this study, which is the basic characteristics of the presentation of women, shows that there is a similarity between the results of the studies, as we have determined that the woman is in the second place and the child-rearing and association with the spouse and family.

As a result of examining the images in the 5, 6 and 7th grade social studies textbooks of Karaboğa (2020) in terms of gender roles, findings were determined to reproduce and reinforce gender stereotypes in the image elements of the books. As a matter of fact, it has been determined that concretization of gender roles supports the discourse produced with the images examined in this study. Yılmaz's (2018) thesis about the textbooks that gender roles are used as a tool in the transfer of gender roles directly overlaps with the results of the analyzed history textbooks although it is stated in the textbooks that the gender roles of women are in the public sphere, the emphasis is on the private sphere. It has been determined that motherhood, housewife and child-rearing are involved.

In his research, Çelik (2016) found that women emphasize equality with men in social studies textbooks, show warrior characteristics, and roles expressed as motherhood and child rearing in gender roles. Among the sub-problem sentences of this research, the results obtained in the basic characteristics of gender roles coincide with the sub-repertoires of gender equality and military women's discourse, which are the main features of the description of women. Fingerless (2017) expresses the production of nationalism through the redescription of women, who are sometimes glorified in texts as mothers of the nation who directly or indirectly participate in the war. These women are military women as the devoted mothers of the motherland. Emphasis on military women, both through images and texts, in the presentation of the woman identified in this study supports this judgment. Similarly, Fingersiz (2017) states that the steps taken on women during Kemalist modernization were deemed necessary for women to advance to the level of contemporary civilizations, and in this context, important rights were given to women with the Civil Code and the right to be elected. In this study, the meaning produced in the texts about the Civil Code and the right to be elected, which we have identified in modern women, which is one of the sub-repertoires of the discourse, in the basic characteristics of the description of women is parallel to these expressions.

Trecker (1971), who made studies on US high school history textbooks, states that in addition to the male-dominated structure in the textbooks, women are considered complementary materials. The fact that the secondary school history textbooks, which were examined using critical discourse analysis in this study, were secondary to the context of the texts and the language structure used shows that there is a similarity in the results of the two studies. Schmidt (2012), who made a feminist analysis of the US History textbook curriculum,

which is taught as a basic history book in the USA, states that in the presentation of the woman, the woman is embodied and normalized depending on the home space. Indeed, the gender roles in Turkey as compulsory and elective taught in history textbooks, said the woman was part of a discourse of private life to be produced and shown to be embodied. In this context, there are parallels in the history textbooks of the two countries. Chiponda & Wassermann (2011), based on the findings of the studies on the position of women in Taiwan, the United States, the United Kingdom, Russia and South Africa history textbooks, generally stated that gender roles in these textbooks are patriarchal and male-dominated, and that women are more stereotypical in the home environment. He states that he is depicted in traditional roles. He also states that history textbooks convey a strong educational message that serves to maintain a particular status quo. In this context, in the general results of the research, the fact that history textbooks are male-dominated, emphasizing women's gender roles as traditional roles and using textbooks as a tool in this process shows that the two studies' results are similar. Alayan and Al-Khalidi (2010), as a result of analyzing the history textbooks taught in Palestine and Jordan from a gender perspective, stated that female roles are motherhood and being a wife in relation to the family, in addition to a male-dominated structure. In this context, in the results obtained from the research's problem statement, the association between women's traditional roles with motherhood and child rearing reveals the similarity between the two countries.

In the light of the data obtained from the history textbooks, the roles of the public sphere that are left uncertain, except for the traditional or private sphere roles emphasized on the roles in history textbooks, should be clarified. In the curriculums of the History, Turkish Republic History of Revolution and Kemalism, Contemporary Turkish and World history, it is stated that courses and textbooks need to be designed "considering gender equality were identified as" (Kohlrabi, 2018b). Nevertheless, the subject of "gender equality" has a limited reflection in the textbooks prepared according to the curriculum. Therefore, to eliminate the disadvantage of women in gender roles, a guideline for the authors of history textbooks should be established in the Ministry of National Education History Teaching Programs. Performance indicators regarding the history of women and gender should be defined in the Field Education Competence Information in the History Teacher Special Field Qualification Certificate (MEB, 2011) within history teaching. In the same direction, it should be ensured that the representation of women is at a certain rate for each unit, and the content of women in the topics should be increased.

## 5. References

- Adaçay, F. R. (2008). Toplumsal cinsiyetin yaratılması ve sürdürülmesinde temel kurumların rolü. *Uluslararası İnsan Çalışmaları Dergisi*, 1(2), 345-363.
- Alabaş, R. (2018a). Cumhuriyet'in ilk yıllarında ilk mekteplerde insani ve toplumsal değerler eğitimi: Resimli, yeni musâhabât-ı ahlâkiye ve medeniye ders kitabı örneği. *Çağdaş Türkiye Tarihi Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 18(36), 55-87.
- Alabaş, R. (2018b). 2018 Öğretim programlarında toplumsal cinsiyet eşitliğinin yeri. D. M. Siyez, Ö. Belkıs ve Y. Soylu (Ed.), *II. Uluslararası Kadın Kongresi Tam Metin Kitabı* içinde (ss.1316-1323). İzmir.
- Alayan, S. and Al-Khalidi, N. (2010). Gender and agency in textbooks of Jordan and Palestine. *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society*, 2(1), 78-96. <https://doi.org/10.3167/jemms.2010.020105>
- Alpan Özdemir, E. D. (2018). Toplumsal cinsiyet kalıp yargılarının çocuk oyunlarına yansımaları. *Atatürk Üniversitesi GSF Sanat Dergisi*, 31, 80-89.
- Alpargu, M. ve Celik, H. (2016). Türkiye'de güncel tarih ders kitaplarında kadın tarihinin yeri. *International Online Journal of Educational Science*. Retrieved from [http://www.iojes.net/userfiles/Article/IOJES\\_2039.pdf](http://www.iojes.net/userfiles/Article/IOJES_2039.pdf)
- Arkonaç, S.A. (2014). Psikoloji ve söylem çalışmaları. *Eleştirel Psikoloji Bülteni*, 5, 39-54.
- Balçı, A. (2013). *Sosyal bilimlerde araştırma*. Pegem Akademi.
- Başoğlu, N. (1996). *Lise tarih kitaplarında kadının görünmezliği, Orta Asya Türk kadın tarihi*, (Yayımlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi), İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü. İstanbul.

- Berktaş, F. (2018). *Tarihin cinsiyeti*. Metis.
- Can, S. (2009 Mart). Tarih Ders Kitaplarında Kadının Görünen Yüzü, *Sakarya Üniversitesi Uluslararası Disiplinler arası Kadın Çalışmaları Kongresi 5-7 Mart 2009*, Kongre Bildirileri, II. Cilt, ss. 281-290, Sakarya.
- Connell, R.W. (1987). *Gender and power, society, the person and sexual politics*. Polity Press
- Connell, R.W. (1996). New directions in gender theory, masculinity research, and gender politics. *Ethnos: Journal of Anthropology*, 61(3-4), 157-176, DOI: 10.1080/00141844.1996.9981534
- Creswell, J.W. (2013). *Nitel araştırma yöntemleri, beş yaklaşıma göre nitel araştırma ve araştırma desenleri*. Siyasal.
- Çayır, K. (2014). Who are we? Identity, citizenship and rights in turkey's textbooks: Promoting Human Rights In Textbooks III: Research Results, Retrieved from <https://tarihvakfi.org.tr/Images/UserFiles/Documents/Gallery/16-6-2015-17-20-35698e.pdf>.
- Çelik, H. (2016). Tarihi süreçte Türk kadını imgesinin sosyal bilgiler güncel ders kitaplarına yansımaları. *Turkish History Education Journal*, 5(1), 263-279.
- Chiponda, A. & Wassermann, J. (2011). Women in history textbooks – What message does this send to the youth? *Yesterday & Today*, 6.
- Demircioğlu, E. (2014). 10. ve 11. sınıf tarih ders kitaplarında yer alan görseller ve metinlerde toplumsal cinsiyet temsiliyle ilgili tarih öğretmenlerinin görüşleri (Trabzon örneği), (Yayımlanmamış Doktora Tezi), Atatürk Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Erzurum.
- Elliott, R. (1996). Discourse analysis: Exploring action, function and conflict in social texts. *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*, 14(6), 65-68.
- Engels, F. (2003). *Ailenin, özel mülkiyetin ve devletin kökeni*, Eriş.
- Gee, J.P. (1999). *An Introduction to discourse analysis: Theory and method*. Routledge.
- Güneş, Ö. (2008). Ders kitaplarında toplumsal cinsiyet ayrımı (1990-2006), *Toplum ve Sosyal Hizmet*, 19(2).
- Karaboğa, T. (2020). Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında cinsiyet rolleri. *Uluslararası Toplum Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 10(5).
- Köse, M. (2004). Tarih Öğretiminde kadın ve Türk kadını imajı, (Yayımlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi), Gazi Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü. Ankara.
- Kress, G. (1990). Critical discourse analysis. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 11, 84-99.
- Millî Eğitim Bakanlığı [MEB]. (2011). <http://otmg.meb.gov.tr/yeterlikdos/Tarih/Tarih.pdf>, Erişim Tarihi: 19.12.2020.
- MEB. (2018). Ortaöğretim tarih dersi (9, 10, 11. Sınıflar) öğretim programı, <http://mufredat.meb.gov.tr>. Erişim Tarihi: 11.07.2020.
- MEB. (2019a). Ortaöğretim tarih 9 ders kitabı, Ankara.
- MEB. (2019b). Ortaöğretim tarih 10 ders kitabı, Ankara.
- MEB. (2019c). Ortaöğretim tarih 11 ders kitabı, Ankara.
- MEB. (2019d). Ortaöğretim Türk Kültür ve Medeniyet Tarihi ders kitabı, Ankara.
- MEB. (2019e). Ortaöğretim Türkiye Cumhuriyeti İnkılap Tarihi ve Atatürkçülük 12 ders kitabı, Ankara.
- MEB. (2019f). Ortaöğretim Çağdaş Türk ve Dünya Tarih ders kitabı, Ankara.
- Muç, K. (2019). Ortaöğretim tarih ders kitaplarında değer aktarım yaklaşımları nelerdir? (Yayımlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi), Marmara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, İstanbul.
- Özbek, Ç. (2016). Modernite – postmodernite ikiliğinde cinsiyeti yeniden kurgulamak, *İstanbul Kemerburgaz Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 1(2).
- Pamuk, A. (2014). *Kimlik ve tarih, kimliğin inşasında tarihin kullanımı*. Yeni İnsan.

- Parmaksız, P.M.Y. (2017). *Türkiye'nin modernleşmesinde kadınlar: 1839'dan günümüze*. İmge.
- Schmidt, S.J. (2012). Am I a woman? The normalisation of woman in US History. *Gender and Education*, 24(7), 707-724.
- Scott, J.W. (1986). Useful category of historical analysis. *The American Historical Review*, 91(5), 1053-1075.
- Sonya, O. R. (2018). *Toplumsal cinsiyet tarihçiliği nedir?* Can.
- Stake, R.E. (1978). The case study method in social inquiry. *American Educational Research Association*, 7(2), 5-7. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X007002005>
- Trecker, J. (1971). Women in U.S. history high school textbooks. *Social Education*, 35, 249-260.
- Van Dijk, T. (1993). Principles of critical discourse analysis. *Discourse & Society*, 4(2), 249-283.
- Vatandaş, C. (2007). Toplumsal cinsiyet ve cinsiyet rollerinin algılanışı. *İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyoloji Konferansları Dergisi*, 35, 29- 56.
- Yetim, M. ve Erdağ R. (2018). Uluslararası ilişkilerde eleştirel söylem analizi: revizyonist söylemin gelişimi. *İstanbul Gelişim Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 5(1), 79-100.
- Yılmaz, S. (2018). Toplumsal cinsiyet rollerinin günlük hayattaki yansımaları: Çorum/Alaca örneği, *İmgelem*, 2(2), 55-76.
- Yıldırım, A. & Şimşek, H. (2013). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri*. (9. Baskı). Seçkin.