Rendering Latinas Invisible: The Underrepresentation of Latina Role Models in K-12 History Textbooks

Angela M. Leslie
California State University, Sacramento
U. S. A.

ABSTRACT: There is a lack of research on the prevalence of Latinas in K-12 history textbooks. This research offers a content analysis of the unique gendered contributions of Latinas in history to fulfill this gap in educational research. Twelve middle and high school textbooks were examined using content analysis to assess the extent of Latina inclusion in history as well as how Latinas were characterized when discussed in books. The author confirms that there is an underrepresentation of Latinas in history textbooks. Latinas only represent .0063 of the individuals mentioned in historical content with few pictures of these successful Latinas. If young Latinas do not see Latina role models who are doctors, scientists, inventors, or entrepreneurs, they may be less apt to pursue those occupations. The author contends that it is imperative for all students, including Latinas, to see culturally relevant role models represented in textbooks to create a more inclusive and engaging classroom experience.

KEYWORDS: Latinas' history, women's history, history textbooks, content analysis, critical race theory

Schools play an integral role in disseminating ideas about history and groups of people in the world through curriculum content. Textbooks are a highly influential means of instilling political values (Spring, 2018). Recently, the Texas Board of Education sought to remove Dolores Huerta, a renowned United States social activist who advocates for farm workers and other marginalized communities, from its textbooks because she "did not exemplify good citizenship" (Maganini, 2016, para. 14). Dolores Huerta, a notable Latina who is committed to civil rights and serves as co-founder of the National Farm Workers Association, is

also a member of the Democratic Socialists of America. This socialist image did not fit with the Texas mission to incorporate a more conservative and religious foundation in their latest textbook adoptions (Spring, 2014). The push to omit someone as significant as Dolores Huerta in Texas textbooks is alarming, considering the growing number of Latino students in Texas as well as the United States. According to the National Center for Educational Statistics (2017), Latino students constitute 25% of enrolled students in public elementary and secondary schools, with a projected enrollment of 29% by 2025. The Texas School Board's efforts to erase an important Latino role model is indicative of how people of color have been erased from history books (Brown & Brown, 2010; Busey, 2019; Eraqi, 2015; Ladson-Billings, 2003, 2014; Loewen, 2018; Suh et al., 2015). The invisibility of prominent role models such as Dolores Huerta, points to the discrepancy in who is emphasized in our history books and who is not, particularly Latinas.

Despite increased digitization and mass media, classrooms continue to rely on the traditional textbook to shape children's knowledge of the world. Additionally, part of the erasure of marginalized groups in textbooks stems from policy makers and the social dominance of publishers. There are only a handful of companies in the United States that publish textbooks, which means that students are receiving limited information and perspectives of history (Spring, 2018). The politics of textbooks that centralize what students learn have been a longstanding issue (Apple, 1993). Limited publishers coupled with intentional or unconscious bias also perpetuates the lack of women and women of color in books (Crocco, 2007; Crocco & Libresco, 2007; Sadker & Sadker, 1994; Schocker & Woyshner, 2013; Suh, et al., 2015; Tetreault, 1986; Trecker, 1971; Woyshner & Schocker, 2015). In the case of Texas, it is widely known that the Texas State School Board embodies conservative political views and actively enforces these values and censors liberal people in textbooks, such as Margaret Sanger, who developed contraception (Spring, 2018). Furthermore, teachers also have to contend with pressure to cover materials from textbooks in an effort to be aligned with standardized tests and state standards in states such as California, that are seen as more progressive in their textbook adoptions (VanSledright, 2008).

Social studies textbooks provide a framework of understanding our world and how individuals and groups contributed to the development of the United States. Unfortunately, the invisibility of the crucial roles of various ethnic groups or women in building our nation can lead students to believe that their culture or gender is not valued (Brown & Brown, 2010; Busey, 2019; Crocco & Libresco, 2007; Eraqi, 2015; Suh et al., 2015). Past research has supported that there is a cultural disconnect that alienates Latinas from schools and contributes to their lack of engagement in high school (Bettie, 2003; Gándara & Contreras, 2009; Ginorio & Huston, 2001; Solórzano & Ornelas, 2002; Valenzuela, 1999). Today, Latinas account for 8.4% of high school dropouts compared to 4.1% of white females and 6.5% of Black females (National Center for Educational Statistics, 2016). These figures cascade further through the educational pipeline when examining Latinas' college completion rate, which was 12.5% in the 2014-2015 academic year as compared to white females' graduation rate of 65% (National Center for Educational Statistics, 2016). If Latinas feel that school is not an inclusive

environment and they do not see prominent Latina professionals in books, this lack of engagement could influence Latinas' lower high school and college completion rates. Leaving Latina role models out of curriculum and textbook materials only compounds this sense of alienation in school.

The Importance of Role Models in Textbooks

Ladson-Billings (2014) contends that history curriculum has been exclusionary and many cultural groups are underrepresented in social studies. This is particularly problematic as these groups are often portrayed in negative ways in media depictions and/or society. Ladson-Billings (2003) states:

> If the people who look like them occupy the lowest skilled jobs in the school – janitors, cafeteria workers, instructional aids – then they begin to calculate their own understanding of people. The official curriculum only serves to reinforce what the societal curriculum suggests, i.e., people of color are relatively insignificant to the growth and development of our democracy and our nation and they represent a drain on the resources and values. (p. 4)

The exclusionary practices of textbooks and curricula further marginalize students of color and reinforce the negative stereotypes of the larger society. Research has demonstrated that race matters in education and all students should be afforded opportunities to examine and critique the world around them (Banks, 2008; Busey, 2019; Busey & Russell, 2016; Epstein et al., 2011; Howard, 2003; Ladson-Billings, 2014; Martell, 2013; Santiago, 2017; Suh et al., 2015).

When students of color are offered positive role models, there is evidence to support that culturally relevant pedagogy aids students in seeing themselves as change agents. Researchers have elaborated on how teaching from diverse and multiple perspectives serves as an emancipatory tool in understanding and appreciating cultural differences (Banks, 2008, Epstein et al., 2011; Ladson-Billings, 2003, Martell, 2013; Nieto, 2000). Baber (2003) conducted a study on culturally relevant pedagogy given to ethnically diverse children in a three-week unit entitled "Celebrating Our Heroes and Sheroes." This intersectional lens had the aim of developing students' understanding of their cultural identity in the hopes of increasing their academic efficacy. The study confirmed that the culturally relevant curriculum indeed had a positive impact on diverse students' academic motivation and achievement. The students discovered that they had male and female role models such as scientists and politicians that they could identify with and, in studying them, realized that they could also aspire to those occupational roles.

Gender and cultural inclusion are critical to ensuring that all students feel connected to the curriculum they are learning about. Belenky et al. (1986) developed the concept of connected knowing, predicated on the idea that when students are connected to learning objectives, then they are more apt to be engaged in those materials. Early research on the lack of females in history textbooks has been substantiated with the authors advocating for increased gender equity in school curriculum to foster girls' engagement with history (Crocco & Libresco, 2007; Sadker & Sadker, 1994; Tetreault, 1986; Trecker, 1971).

Furthermore, student engagement and having female role models in the curriculum gives young women the chance to see what is possible (Doherty, 2013; Mertus, 2007). Just as the aforementioned curriculum intervention gives students women of color role models, teachers can also play an active role in creating culturally relevant curriculum in the classroom.

The importance of female role models is also reinforced in Daisey's and José-Kampfner's (2002) study on student drawings of Latinas at work. The student demographic was comprised of 150 low-income Puerto Rican and Mexican children. At the beginning of the year, students were asked to draw a Latina at work. The majority of the students drew women working in factories or doing domestic work, since these were the role models they saw around them in their communities. During the course of the year, teachers used biographical storytelling to teach students about successful Latinas. After teachers included professional women in the curriculum, most of the students drew a Latina in a professional career. This provides evidence as to the importance of providing successful role models in curriculum. Delgado Bernal (2002) affirms the importance of marginalized people having a voice in naming their own realities and stories to challenge stereotypes or societal oppression. Within this framing, people who are typically absent from mainstream academia emerge as agents of change. The visibility of women of color as role models in curriculum and books serves as counterstories for young students. Educators can slowly eradicate gender stereotyping and give young women, particularly Latinas, alternative narratives to promote post-secondary education and diverse career opportunities. Although teachers can create a more inclusive environment through culturally relevant curriculum, textbooks also need to do their part by including a wider diversity of role models.

Women in History Textbooks

Gender inequity in textbooks and the lack of female representation in history books has been a long-standing issue. Previous significant studies center on the lack of gender balance in male-centric United States history books and how women are positioned in these historical contexts (Chick, 2006; Clark et al., 2005; Clark & Mahoney, 2004; Osler, 1994; Schmidt, 2012; Tetreault, 1986; Trecker, 1971). Additional research on how females are integrated within the World War II era in history textbooks indicates that there has been a slight increase of women's contributions represented in books, but this increase continues to fall short in creating a comprehensive narrative of females' accomplishments during this time (Gordy et al., 2004; Schrader & Wotipka, 2011). Previous researchers have examined how females are framed in history, as well as how many women are mentioned in textbooks compared to men (Chick, 2006; Clark et al., 2005; Clark & Mahoney, 2004; Osler, 1994; Schmidt, 2012; Tetreault, 1986; Trecker, 1971). The amplification of male representation over female role models in books promotes a disparate perception that is magnified in students' self-perception of whose contributions to history are valued.

Early studies reveal a lack of females represented in U.S. history textbooks during the 1980s and 1990s. In 1986, Tetreault's seminal work on 12 textbooks

found that approximately 5% of the text centered on women's contributions to the historical development to the United States. Similarly, Sadker and Sadker (1994) found that only 3% of the copy in their analysis was devoted to female figures in history. More recently, Clark and Mahoney (2004) completed a comprehensive investigation of 19 textbooks to gauge how much history texts have improved in their representation of women throughout the 1960s to the 1990s. The researchers' conclusions were that, overall, women were viewed more prominently from one decade to the next; however, women still significantly lag behind male representation in textbooks. The authors concluded that women accounted for 4.9 figures in textbooks compared to 100 men in the 1960s, 12.7 in the 1980s, and 16.3 in the 1990s. None of the aforementioned studies included race in their assessment; therefore, the numbers of women of color are not known. While little attention is devoted to more recent contributions by women to the United States in textbooks, there is even less information and research that attends to inequities for women of color in textbooks, specifically Latinas.

Women of Color in Textbooks

To date, there is minimal research on women of color or Latinas' representation in K-12 history textbooks. Research that investigates the intersection of gender and race is almost non-existent, with only two research articles found that interpret the intersection of gender and race in the visual representations of Black women in U.S. high school history textbooks (Schocker & Woyshner, 2013; Woyshner & Schocker, 2015). Earlier examinations of cultural representations of Latinos in K-12 history textbooks revealed Latinos as being stereotyped predominantly as immigrants and agricultural laborers (Cruz, 1994, 2002; Garcia, 1980; Salvucci, 1991). More recent research calls attention to monolithic historical interpretations of Latino identity and culture (Busey, 2019; Santiago, 2017). Other than those primary depictions, the information on Latino culture and contributions to the United States in K-12 textbooks is negligible and gender is non-existent.

Similarly, no current studies that specifically examine the role of Latinas in K-12 history textbooks could be found with the exception of one research article that focused on the scarcity of Latinas in collegiate textbooks. The researcher's feminist interpretive analysis investigated introductory sociology texts at the baccalaureate level for its treatment of Latinas and/or Hispanic women in these books (Marquez, 1994). This research confirmed that Latinas' representation was exclusionary and limited in scope by perpetuating a homogenized view of females that identify as "Chicana," "Latina," "Puerto Rican," or "Cubana," and were stereotyped with a deficit view. Lavariega Monforti's and McGlynn's (2010) research centered on Latino representation in 29 introductory government and political science textbooks and found that many of the books discussed the merits of César Chávez yet only three mentioned Dolores Huerta. Additionally, the absence of other gendered examples in the researchers' analysis was most likely predicated by the lack of historical context attributed to the unique female experiences of Latinas. For this reason, it is imperative to draw attention to the insufficiency of research that attends to how Latinas are represented in K-12

history textbooks. This paper queries the treatment of Latinas in K-12 U.S. history textbooks and explores the extent of Latinas' presence in textbooks, as well as how they are characterized in the content of these books.

Theoretical Framework

Critical race theory (CRT) is important in understanding how institutions maintain the marginalization of groups of people in education (Ladson-Billings, 2003; Solórzano & Yosso, 2002; Yosso, 2002). Ladson-Billings (1998) asserts that the dominant narratives in school curricula celebrate the accomplishments of white males and eliminate or distort the history of people of color. The erasure of underrepresented groups further alienates students from the curriculum and their sense of agency in the world around them. CRT illuminates how marginalized groups of students feel alienated from educational institutions and how these discriminatory practices are connected to larger issues of bias in society.

Latina/o critical theory (LatCrit) is a branch of CRT that centers on the multiplicities of Latino experiences with language, immigration, cultural, gender, and ethnic differences (Solórzano & Delgado Bernal, 2001). From a LatCrit lens, textbooks should capture the nuances and the complexities of women and their racialized experiences in a pluralistic way by providing stories that counter dominant negative narratives of Latinas. Both CRT and LatCrit acknowledge the importance of counterstories to combat deficit views of marginalized groups of people. Solórzano and Delgado Bernal (2001) developed LatCrit to advance their work on school resistance and to offer a racial and gender lens to understand Chicana and Chicano students' intersectional experiences. The researchers forwarded LatCrit as a theory that "can address the intersectionality of racism, sexism, classism, and other forms of oppression" (p. 5). The authors view LatCrit as supplementary to critical race theory, as well as "an important lens from which to talk about transformational resistance, especially for Chicanas" (p. 5). For the purposes of this study, LatCrit offers a space to fulfill any intersectional gaps and provide a comprehensive critique in exploring Latinas' multifaceted experiences and identities.

Yosso (2002) describes the implications of critical race curriculum as key in recognizing marginalized people as holders and creators of history and knowledge. The potential of critical race curriculum includes materials that challenge racism, sexism, and other subordination, disrupts deficit views of people of color, and empowers students to focus on their cultural contributions to society, while critiquing the world around them to work toward social justice. Solórzano and Yosso (2002) highlight how counterstories lend a voice to marginalized people to counter deficit or stereotyped beliefs of groups of people. The authors expand on the idea of counterstories as spaces for marginalized groups to tell their own stories and to challenge misconceptions or stereotypes. These alternate views provide important and powerful narratives of resistance and cultural empowerment.

Method of Inquiry

The researcher examined 12 middle school and high school United States history textbooks currently used in Texas and California and chose these two particular states since they dominate 70% of the entire textbook market (Spring, 2014). Furthermore, these two states have a large population of Latino students, 54% in California (California Department of Education, 2017) and 52% in Texas (Texas Education Agency, 2017). Six textbooks from California were chosen from the largest school districts in the state due to their wide representation of students studying from these books. The six textbooks from Texas were the only choices offered from the Texas Adoption List from 2017. The author applied the use of content analysis to examine the information and illustrations in the textbooks. Interpreting meaning from text and images from a large quantity of data in a meaningful and replicable way is the cornerstone of content analysis (Krippendorff, 2004). Krippendorff (2004) further recommends that researchers use valid inferences from text to align with singular or multiple contexts in a study. These techniques are transferrable and applicable towards many different disciplines (Krippendorff, 2004). Babbie (2013) also confirms the relevancy and importance of context analysis in exploring meaningful connections in the social sciences. Considering these attributes, content analysis was used to not only investigate the extent to which Latinas are included in historical information, but to also assess how Latinas are characterized when discussed in books. The process included quantifying the amount of content present in the text and analyzing the qualitative information in the books. Content analysis was used to answer the following questions:

1. What percentage of Latinas are represented in textbooks when compared to other ethnic groups of women and to men in general?

2. What roles do unidentified Latinas occupy in the illustrations of textbooks?

3. How are Latinas characterized in textbook content when identifying specific Latinas or discussing Latinas as a group?

Positionality

Feminist researchers Commeyras and Alvermann (1996) state that identity and inquiry cannot be conducted by a neutral stance. "In identifying ourselves as feminists engaged in examining the portrayal of women in texts, we disavow any claim to disinterestedness, objectivity, or passivity" (p. 34). Nonetheless, in identifying myself as a Latina feminist, in order to create more balanced analysis, I have created a rubric to identify either negative or positive attributions of Latinas' representation in textbooks. With the intention of recognizing textbooks for including inclusive information on Latinas, I developed a five category framework that includes two positive classifications. My coding rubric is based on the tenets of a critical race theoretical framework to investigate potential erasure of Latinas in history, as well as the counterstories of Latina role models.

Coding Rubric

The coding framework the researcher developed is congruent with the tenets of critical race theory. CRT serves as a tool to investigate the ways groups are rendered invisible through systematic erasure. The rubric in this study was adapted from aforementioned existing theoretical frameworks (Banks, 2008; Sadker & Zittleman, 2002) to create a coding scheme with new positive and negative categories built upon principles of CRT after analyzing the initial textbook in this study.

Table 1

Categories for Analyzing Textbooks Using the P.R.O.V.E. Rubric.

Categories	Definitions
Pluralistic	Text gives a multifaceted critique of an individual or event in history that gives readers multiple perspectives culminating in a comprehensive picture of that individual or event.
Retelling	Information is told in a way that reinterprets historical events or an individual with illusions of equity involving individuals, groups, or historical occurrences.
One-sided	Content is delivered and interpreted from one perspective. Events or people are described in a way that excludes multiple perspectives and full analysis. Stereotypes or generalizations about groups of people or events could be evident.
Validation	Validates individuals and/or groups of people and reaffirms the accomplishments to their communities and country as a whole. The voices and viewpoints of individuals and/or groups are presented in the text.
Elementary	Limited and superficial copy is given towards an event or person. There is little narrative of what individuals or groups faced in terms of the issues and struggles they encountered.

Bank's (2008) Transformation Approach addresses curriculum that encompasses multiple in-depth perspectives, which led to the creation of the "Pluralistic" category. The "P" designation seeks text that challenges racism, sexism, and other discrimination to critique society and move toward a comprehensive understanding of individuals or groups of people. The Retelling "R" classification signifies the reinterpretation of historical events or people. Sadker and Zittleman (2002) used "stereotyping" and "selectivity" as part of their rubric, which this researcher redeveloped into the "One-Sided" "O" category for this study. The "Validation" "V" category looks for ways that text centers on positive cultural

affirmations, which disrupts deficit views of marginalized groups. The "Elementary" "E" category references textbooks that merely include one sentence or two of superficial information. This category was informed by Bank's (2008) Contributions Approach, which describes how holidays and cultural events may be celebrated and compartmentalized into one day or one week of study without any diverse content outside of this timeframe.

The categories discussed above are aligned with CRT and LatCrit and used to determine if textbook bias and/or erasure is present. Three of the classifications represent the potential erasure of Latinas in textbooks, looking for ways in which the text reinterprets or minimizes Latina role models and their accomplishments. Two categories affirm positive representations of Latinas in books that serve as role models and counter traditional stereotypes of Latinas. These categories are influenced by Yosso's (2002) critical race curriculum and the importance of counterstories. By creating concrete categories with positive and negative attributions, this textbook coding rubric is situated within an analysis that promotes identification using well-defined objectives. It is also important to note that the P.R.O.V.E. rubric is easily transferable for other researchers to utilize in their content analysis of other marginalized groups.

Data Gathering and Analysis

The research protocol began with counting the names in the index of each textbook and collecting data of men and women mentioned in the text. The women were then categorized into ethnic groups. Data was collected from the index that referenced Chicanas, Latinas, and Mexican American, Cuban, Puerto Rican, and Hispanic women, as well as any other Latino group in the index. Additional research analysis included the assessment of how unnamed Latinas and specific Latinas were depicted in textbook illustrations and accounted for regarding their gender and/or occupational role. This assessment procedure was challenged by the lack of identification of unnamed women in illustrations in books. The author relied on observational cues such as skin tone, hair texture, cultural dress, and the context of the textbook material to determine race in textbook pictures since, oftentimes, the illustrations were not labeled with names or ethnicity information. This limitation renders potential validity concerns in controlling for accuracy in deciding on the race of an unnamed individual in illustrations that other researchers have contended with in the past (Woyshner & Schocker, 2015). The lack of information given in captions underneath pictures also speaks to how textbooks diminish the importance of women by not including any identifying information about them.

Findings

Representation of Latinas in Textbooks

Table 2 illuminates the number of individual Latinas found in each textbook reviewed. The first research question addressed the extent of Latinas' representation in textbooks and this study confirmed the underrepresentation of Latinas in the 12 United States history textbooks used in this inquiry. The author found that students have limited access to Latina role models in history, with only

0-3 Latinas represented in eight out of 12 books examined (see Table 2). Table 3 illustrates that Latinas were represented as .0063 of individuals in the books examined, less than 1% of the names mentioned in the textbooks, while 86% of text was devoted to male figures in history. These findings confirm the invisibility of Latinas in Texas and California textbooks. One Texas textbook published in 2016 had no content on a specific Latina, rendering Latinas completely invisible.

Table 2
Summary of Latinas Found in Textbooks

California Textbooks:	**Grade**	**Latinas**
Ayers, E.L., Schulzinger, R.D., de la Teja, J.F., & White, D.G. (2007). *American anthem: Modern American history.* Holt, Rinehart, and Winston.	9-12	5
Cayton, A., Perry, E.I., Reed, L., & Winkler, A.M. (2007). *America: Pathways to the present.* Prentice Hall.	9-12	3
Danzer, G.A., Klor de Alva, J.J., Krieger, L.S., Wilson, L.E., & Woloch, N. (2006). *The Americans: Reconstruction to the 21st century.* McDougal Littell.	9-12	8
Davidson, J.W., & Stoff, M.B. (2006). *America: History of our nation.* Pearson Publishing.	8	3
Deverell, W., & White, D.G. (2006). *United States history: Independence to 1914.* Holt, Rinehart, and Winston.	8	4
Hart, D. (2005). *History alive: The United States through industrialism.* Teachers' Curriculum Institute.	8	1
Texas Textbooks:		
Appleby, J., Brinkley, A., Broussard, A.S., McPherson, J.M., & Ritchie, D.A. (2016a). *United States history since 1877.* McGraw-Hill Education.	9-12	3
Appleby, J., Brinkley, A., Broussard, A.S., McPherson, J.M., & Ritchie, D.A. (2016b). *United States history to 1877.* McGraw-Hill Education.	8	3
Danzer, G.A., Klor de Alva, J.J., Krieger, L.S., Wilson, L.E., & Woloch, N. (2016). *The Americans: United States history since 1877.* Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.	9-12	9
Davidson, J.W., & Stoff, M.B. (2016). *United States history: Colonization through reconstruction.* Person Publishing.	8	0
Gray White, D. & Deverell, W. (2016). *United States history: Early colonial period through reconstruction.* Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.	8	1
Lapsansky-Werner, E.J., Levy, P.B., Roberts, R., & Taylor, A. (2016). *United States history: 1877 to the present.* Pearson Education.	9-12	2

Table 3

Percentages of Each Group Represented in Textbooks

Categories	Percentages of Groups in Textbooks	
All Males		86%
White Females		10%
Black Females		2%
Latinas	(Less than 1%)	.0063%
Native American Females		.0045%
Asian Females		.0033%

Latinas in Illustrations

The second research question analyzed the role of Latinas in illustrations where unidentified Latinas appear. There were few Latinas pictured in textbooks, as little as two photographs to as many as 15 images of specific Latinas and unnamed Latina individuals. The six middle school history textbooks revealed a lower number on average of visible Latinas, from two to five pictures per book. This is particularly poignant given the lasting impression that notable Latina professionals in curriculum have on middle school children in the aforementioned study by Daisey and José-Kampfner (2002). Also noteworthy was how unidentified Latinas were framed in these pictures. Out of 50 pictures of Latinas in this query, there were fourteen females in domestic roles as well as fourteen females portrayed as activists. Sixteen Latinas were depicted as immigrants and/or as migrant farm workers. In contrast, only two unnamed Latinas were presented in an occupational role, a nurse (picture was less than a millimeter in size) and a Head Start teacher, giving Latina students a limited scope of potential professional careers.

Content Analysis Using the P.R.O.V.E. Rubric

The invisibility of Latinas and limited copy of predominantly superficial text of Latinas is evident in the data collection of sentences attributed to specific Latinas in history. Research question three addresses how Latinas are described in textbooks. There was only one example out of 12 textbooks that gave a comprehensive view of Latinas' accomplishments in a couple of paragraphs and was given a "P" designation, which demonstrated a pluralistic view of Latinas and illuminated the intersectionality of gender and race issues in history. Ayers et al. (2007) discussed the obstacles that Latinas faced in the Brown Berets movement, struggling to be heard within their own cultural group due to gender roles and the obstacles they faced in their work and leadership roles. This section gave readers a comprehensive picture of the complexities women faced in leadership roles that is aligned with critical race curriculum (Yosso, 2002). Students should have the opportunity to challenge the social constructions of gender and race stereotypes in history courses and see themselves represented as positive role models.

In one textbook, Dolores Huerta's accomplishments were not given credit, which earned the "R" designation for retelling history. Huerta, in addition to her role as Co-founder of the National Farmworkers Association, was instrumental in implementing the Grape Boycott in 1965, which served to increase wages and improve working conditions for migrant farm workers. Most books give credit to Huerta and Chávez, with one book giving sole credit to Chavez for the Grape Boycott without mentioning Huerta's role (Cayton et al., 2007). Additionally, both César Chávez and Dolores Huerta co-founded the National Farm Workers Association, yet Dolores Huerta was only mentioned in six out of 12 textbooks in this study; whereas, Chávez's role in the struggle of migrant farm workers was evident in all twelve of the books. Queen Isabella of Spain served as another example of sharing a leadership role with King Ferdinand. Queen Isabella was the most often cited Latina figure in history textbooks; she appeared in eight out of 12 books. Only three out of those eight references gave Queen Isabella credit for leading and being the deciding factor in authorizing and funding Christopher Columbus' initial voyage. Regardless of one's view of Columbus or the merits of that decision, these references are hampered by the lack of female recognition as leaders whose influence made an impact on the trajectory of history. Four books gave credit for that monumental decision to both King Ferdinand and Queen Isabella but did not receive the "R" designation for retelling historical information, since she was given partial credit.

The author did not identify any textbook examples for content that was one-sided and where an "O" appointment seemed appropriate. The "V" category was the second highest type of coding found in textbooks. Thirty-four percent of Latina references included a sentence or two on the accomplishments or importance of Latinas or a specific Latina's role in history. These examples are a step in the right direction in countering traditional stereotypes of Latinas in that they offer cultural affirmation and elaborate on Latinas' accomplishments. Text that validated Latinas' success was generally described briefly in one or a few sentences. In a section entitled "Hispanic Growth and Influence," the authors Ayers et al. (2007) expanded on Loretta and Linda Sanchez in one additional sentence: "Californians Loretta and Linda Sanchez are the first sisters to serve together in the U.S. Congress. They joined 22 other Hispanic Americans serving in the House of Representatives and over 6,000 Hispanic Americans holding elected office" (p. 754). This section received a "V" designation for its validation of Latinos' accomplishments in political office even though its content was centered on Latinos as a group.

Other authors, such as de la Tejaeat al. (2016) validated Latinas' achievements by elaborating on Sonia Sotomayor's accomplishments and leadership abilities in a short paragraph, demonstrating efficacy in her role as a Supreme Court Justice. Other books also received a "V" designation by elaborating on Latinas' important influences in history. Two books referred to Queen Isabella as "King" Isabella, denoting how powerful and influential a leader Isabella was (Danzer et al., 2006; de la Teja, et al., 2016). In a textbook by Hart (2005), there were three paragraphs describing community property law and how Mexican female immigrants brought their ideas on equitable property rights between

married couples to the United States and influenced our laws on more egalitarian practices for couples. The aforementioned examples of "V" designations were coded in this way based on the authors' elaboration of an individual's strengths or affirmation of the significance of their accomplishments to their cultural group. All of these text examples were congruent with Yosso's (2002) critical race curriculum that focuses on cultural strengths and achievements of Latinas.

Overwhelmingly, 64% of the coding fell under the "E" elementary designation, which signified superficial historical information from the P.R.O.V.E. framework seen in Table 1. Consequently, most of the text on Latinas was referenced in one brief sentence with no elaboration. For example, Lapsansky-Werner et al. (2016) provided the following representation: "Nina Otero-Warren, a Hispanic woman who headed New Mexico's State Board of Health" (p. 172). Her work in the government was in the early 1900s and there was no indication of how significant this was in relation to her gender and ethnicity related to this time period where Latinos and women were afforded few opportunities in high profile government roles. Similarly, de la Teja et al.'s (2016) text stated, "In 1990, President Bush named Dr. Antonia Coello Novello to the post of surgeon general" (p. 844). There was no mention of Dr. Novello as the first female and first person of Latin descent to hold this position. Another example from this textbook included the sentence, "Ellen Ochoa, part of the first shuttle crew to dock to the ISS [International Space Station], hoped to inspire young students" (p. 879). Again, there was no mention that Ellen Ochoa was the first Latina astronaut. Furthermore, Deverell and Gray White (2006) wrote, "Linda and Loretta Sanchez, pictured here, are the first sisters to serve in Congress at the same time" (p. 129). This sentence received an "E" coding since it did not present any further details or information and, more tellingly, focused on their familial affiliation without mentioning their political accomplishments.

Discussion

This study sought to explore how Latinas are represented in middle and high school U.S. history textbooks. The findings confirm that Latinas are underrepresented in books and account for only .0063 of the individuals mentioned in textbook information. Furthermore, notable Latina individuals are not always given full credit for their accomplishments and few books discuss the gendered implications and discriminatory practices that occurred throughout history. When Latinas are introduced in books, the information about each individual is brief and superficial with limited pictures of prominent Latinas as well as unidentified Latinas. Additionally, most illustrations of Latinas are seen as immigrants/migrant farm workers or in domestic roles or as activists. These findings are comparable to Amedeo Marquez's (1994) work on the treatment of Latinas in college introductory sociology textbooks and reflective of an underrepresentation of females in K-12 history textbooks (Chick, 2006; Clark et al., 2005; Clark & Mahoney, 2004; Osler, 1994; Schmidt, 2012; Tetreault, 1986; Trecker, 1971). Other than these limited stereotypical roles, young Latinas have few other role models to aspire to as conveyed by the textbooks (Atchison, 2017; Doherty, 2013; Mertus, 2007).

Consequently, the majority of students are only gaining access to noteworthy Latinas in small numbers. It is crucial that young Latinas see cultural role models in textbooks so they can aspire to advanced educational and professional goals. Classroom discussions on the intricacies of gender stratification during the Chicano movement would benefit many students with critical thinking on gender issues and how this connects to present day issues (Atchison, 2017). Examining the intersection of gender, race, and/or socioeconomic status of marginalized groups of people is necessary in understanding the complexities of what ethnic groups faced historically and how historical events set up the context for discriminatory practices today. So often historical textbooks do not connect the past with the present nor the present with the past, which is essential in examining institutional discrimination (Epstein et al., 2011; Howard, 2003; Ladson-Billings, 2014; Loewen, 2018; Martell, 2013; Santiago, 2017; Suh et al., 2015).

Whose voices are heard and at what cost? Due to its sheer size and volume, textbook content becomes the official voice or master narrative for the nation, as well as the truth (VanSledright, 2008). As previously stated, the dominance of limited publishers and policy makers complicates and hinders the process of textbook adoption. Furthermore, creating state or nationwide policies that increase marginalized voices and representation is also necessary. In one study, Crocco (2007) investigated state curriculum frameworks to gauge if women's rights and human rights were included. Approximately 14 states included no standards on human and women's issues. An additional seven states only focused on human rights. To further complicate matters, Schmeichel (2015) found a lack of scholarship on how to incorporate women in social studies curriculum. She reviewed six social studies journals encompassing 1,085 articles and ultimately decided only 16 articles contained detailed and robust instructions and lesson plans. The invisibility of women and ethnic representations has been well established; yet, there is hope as a growing number of researchers in the past few years are grounding their work on gendered and cultural inclusion in curriculum.

In the absence of gender and ethnic diversity in textbooks or state standards requirements, teachers can create culturally relevant classrooms. Ladson-Billings (2014) ruminates on how the practice of culturally relevant pedagogy has evolved over the years. Ladson-Billing's conclusion confirms that, although many practitioners are increasingly focused on diverse representation and inclusion, teachers should utilize a more sociopolitical lens in constructing discourse in the classroom. Students should be engaging in lessons that critique the world around them. Gay (2018) expands on Ladson-Billing's work and describes culturally responsive teaching as giving students the tools to activate their classroom engagement by using who they are and what they know to become empowered in their learning. Students' cultural knowledge is used as a lens to view curricular materials and serves as a catalyst for students to learn about one another. Gay's (2018) seminal work includes in-depth strategies for teachers to incorporate these lessons into practice. Busey and Russell (2016) also offer key strategies on how to support Latino students in social studies that could be used for all students. Santiago (2019) provides a more comprehensive example of how to implement a

specific lesson on the case of *Mendez v. Westminster* primarily with Latino students in 11th grade. The impressive, detailed curriculum is more aligned with what Ladson-Billings (2014) describes as the "remixed" version of the impact of how sociopolitical discourse supports culturally sustaining pedagogies. The curriculum encourages students to examine the nuances and complexities of the case, while simultaneously countering textbook information that essentializes the topic of segregation and Mexican Americans' experiences. Students engage in their own narratives and critical thinking to advance their knowledge by critiquing historical evidence, constructing meaning of complex policies and discussing ideas about racial/ethnic hierarchy under the larger systemic issues occurring in the country.

The findings of this study align with other research on the importance of including gender in curriculum and textbooks (Atchison, 2017; Doherty, 2013; Mertus, 2007). Similar to Banks (2008), Atchison introduces the idea of gender mainstreaming as a purposeful approach to including gender in political science curriculum as a comprehensive pedagogical tool to be used throughout the entire course, not just a one-time lecture or one week on gender issues. Crocco (2011) also provides recommendations for topics to be discussed in a world history course and resources to include women in curricular materials. Comparably, Brugar et al. (2014) introduce a creative and resourceful lesson for fourth graders that meets Common Core standards and could easily be transferable to other grade levels. The thorough lesson plan incites students to become active researchers in examining the presence of women in their own history textbooks. The collaboration of students and a higher-level critical inquiry which leads to social action is a wonderful example of how teachers can frame their teaching on inclusion. Moreover, a teacher could also replicate this lesson plan with students surveying books for more specific representation of Latinas.

For example, incorporating a more comprehensive view of Dolores Huerta and her life's work would provide a valuable lesson to frame gender and race discourse in the classroom. In the book, *Latina Legacies: Identity, Biography, and Community,* Chávez (2005) features meaningful stories of Huerta's life that could serve as a conduit for these types of classroom conversations. Earlier in her life, Dolores was a teacher, a mother of eleven children, a highly successful lobbyist and an activist who overcame unsurmountable gender barriers and made many life sacrifices to help others. She also endured a severe beating by police at a peaceful rally where "she suffered six broken ribs and the removal of her spleen in emergency surgery" (Chávez, 2005, p. 251). According to the author, Huerta also had to endure gender bias in her role within the United Farm Workers Union and often deferred to César Chávez in the beginning of their work together. Historically, women have had a much harder time receiving recognition and accolades for their roles in society.

The absence of credit for Huerta's crucial role in the Grape Boycott is emblematic of how gender role socialization and stereotypes have followed women throughout history, particularly women of color. This example is also illustrative of why LatCrit is important to research since much of feminist historical information is

based on white activists and civil rights leadership is centered on men of color, rendering women of color, particularly Latinas, invisible in textbooks. Lavariega Monforti and McGlynn (2010) found similar results in the government textbooks where Dolores Huerta was only mentioned in three out of the 29 books they examined. Alarmingly, if you are a Latina student in Texas, you may not see yourself represented at all if you are in a district that requires textbooks with little or no representations of Latinas. For example, one textbook used in Texas schools had no Latinas represented while another textbook had nine Latinas represented. Similarly, in California, depending on what textbook their school adopted, students could benefit from having eight Latinas versus one Latina referred to in their history text. All students should have equal access to diverse female role models. This variability should not be present since research finds that the importance and power of including Latinas in biographical stories can change the trajectory of what is possible for young Latinas (Daisey & José-Kampfner, 2002).

Conclusion

One way to include diverse individuals and groups is to increase the visibility of people of color while also offering a more pluralistic and comprehensive critique of their cultural histories framed by an examination of institutional policies and practices that discriminate against others. Yosso (2002) provides guidelines for a critical race curriculum based on the five tenets of CRT:

> (1) acknowledge the central and intersecting roles of racism, sexism, classism, and other subordination in maintaining inequality in curricular structures, processes, and discourses; (2) challenge dominant social and cultural assumptions regarding culture and intelligence, language and capability, objectivity and meritocracy; (3) direct the formal curriculum toward goals of social justice and the hidden curriculum toward Freirean goals of critical consciousness; (4) develop counterdiscourses through storytelling, narratives, chronicles, family histories, scenarios, biographies, and parables that draw on the lived experiences students of color bring to the classroom; and (5) utilize interdisciplinary methods of historical and contemporary analysis to articulate the linkages between educational and societal inequality. (p. 98)

These tenets would be useful for textbook authors to incorporate into their books in an effort to create increased critical discourse for all students and to develop more culturally inclusive curriculum. Curriculum already acknowledges the historical contributions that European Americans have made to the development of the United States. Now it is time for textbook authors to center on the lived experiences and voices of diverse historical role models. This challenge to the dominant narrative in history will empower students of color as the creators and holders of knowledge (Delgado Bernal, 2002).

More counterstories need to be incorporated into U.S. high school history curriculum and textbooks. Critical race counterstories would advance the voices of women of color and dismantle dominant stories that typically marginalize people of color (Ladson-Billings, 1998; Solórzano & Yosso, 2002). The inclusion of more

female leaders and their accomplishments in books will serve as empowering stories so that future generations of young women can see themselves in powerful societal roles. Symbolic representation in books is vital in that students make sense of the world around them when they read and see images legitimized in textbooks (Sleeter & Grant, 1991). Giving underrepresented students increased chances to see themselves as agents of change in historical context will allow them to be engaged in that curriculum. Students who are residentially segregated from diverse groups of students can also learn from what others have contributed to history and society. Increased knowledge of how societal structures reinforce privilege and informs historical as well as the current political environment is necessary for all students to gain empathy and understanding on how our past informs present day discriminatory practices and politics. One way to increase diverse representation is through K-12 policies and legislation. California is working on a statewide Ethnic Studies curriculum that will be a high school graduation requirement pending approval from legislation. Instilling such curricular specifications will aid in providing diverse historical role models; hopefully, this will also include increased representation of women of color.

The inclusion of more Latina role models in curriculum could increase engagement for young Latina students and increase their aspirations for higher learning by introducing professional and accomplished role models in textbooks. Young Latinas can benefit from having strong Latina role models to serve as inspiration and motivation to aspire to leadership roles. Notable feminists such as Elizabeth Cady Stanton and Susan B. Anthony are generally included in history textbooks; however, important Latina feminists such as Dolores Huerta, Sonia Sotomayor, and Juana Inés de la Cruz are rarely included in middle and high school history textbooks. The importance of textbooks and curriculum in including diverse counterstories and culturally relevant pedagogy (Ladson-Billings, 2014) is a step in creating a more inclusive educational environment for all students. Ladson-Billings (2014) accentuates these points that marginalized students are nurtured academically through cultural competence and fostering the ability to critique the social and political institutions around them. Furthermore, CRT in curriculum development and textbooks places women of color at the forefront of history rather than the margins. All students, regardless of their ethnicity, can learn about Latinas' accomplishments to dispel stereotypes and misconceptions about Latinas and gain valuable knowledge about how women of color have faced gender, race, and socioeconomic hardships in history and how this history manifests itself in gender and racial discrimination practices today. This study underscores the invisibility of Latinas and women of color in textbooks that reflect the broader role of how sexism and racism continue to plague our educational policies and practices.

References

Amedeo Marquez, S. (1994). Distorting the image of "Hispanic" women in sociology: Problematic strategies of presentation in the introductory text. *Teaching Sociology, 22*(3), 231-236. https://doi.org/10.2307/1319137

Apple, M. (1993). The politics of official knowledge: Does a national curriculum make sense? In *Knowledge, power, and education.* Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203118115-15

Appleby, J., Brinkley, A., Broussard, A. S., McPherson, J. M., & Ritchie, D. A. (2016a). *United States history since 1877*. McGraw-Hill Education.

Appleby, J., Brinkley, A., Broussard, A. S., McPherson, J. M., & Ritchie, D. A. (2016b). *United States history to 1877*. McGraw-Hill Education.

Atchison, A. L. (2017). Where are the women? An analysis of gender mainstreaming in introductory political science textbooks. *Journal of Political Science Education, 13*(2), 185-199. https://doi.org/10.1080/15512169.2017.1279549

Ayers, E. L., Schulzinger, R. D., de la Teja, J. F., & White, D. G. (2007). *America anthem: Modern American history.* Holt, Rinehart, and Winston.

Babbie, E. (2013). *The practice of social research*. Wadsworth.

Baber, C. R. (2003). From liberal teacher to liberated teacher educator. In G. Ladson-Billings, (Eds.), *Critical race theory perspectives on social studies.* Information Age Publishing.

Banks, J. A. (2008). *An introduction to multicultural education*. Pearson.

Belenky, M. F., Clinchy, B. M., & Goldberger, N. R., & Tarule, J. M. (1986). *Women's way of knowing.* Basic Books.

Bettie, J. (2003). *Women without class: Girls, race, and identity*. University of California Press.

Brown, A. L., & Brown, K. D. (2010). Strange fruit indeed: Interrogating contemporary textbook representations of racial violence toward African Americans. *Teachers College Record, 112*(1). 31-67. http://www.tcrecord.org/Content.asp?ContentId=15592

Brugar, K., Halvorsen, A., & Hernandez, S. (2014). Where are the women? A classroom inquiry into social studies textbooks. *Social Studies and the Young Learner 26*(3), 28-31. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1041713

Busey, C. L. (2019). Más que esclavos: A BlackCrit examination of the treatment of Afro-Latin@s in U.S. high school world history textbooks. *Journal of Latinos and Education, 18*(3), 197-214. https://doi.org/10.1080/15348431.2017.1386102

Busey, C. L., & Russell III, W. B. (2016). "We want to learn": Middle school Latino/a students discuss social studies curriculum and pedagogy. *Research in*

Middle Level Education, 39(4), 1-20. https://doi.org/10.1080/19404476.2016.1155921

California Department of Education. (2017). "Fingertip facts on education in California." Retrieved June 10, 2018 from https://www.cde.ca.gov/ds/sd/cb/ceffingertipfacts.asp

Cayton, A., Perry, E. I., Reed, L., & Winkler, A. M. (2007). *America: Pathways to the present.* Prentice Hall.

Chávez, A. (2005). Dolores Huerta and the United Farm Workers. In V. L. Ruiz, & V. Sánchez Korrol, (Eds.), *Latina legacies: Identity, biography, community.* Oxford University Press.

Chick, K. A. (2006). Gender balance in K-12 American history textbooks. *Social Studies Research and Practice, 1*(3), 284-290.

Clark, R., Ayton, K., Frechette, N., & Keller, P. J. (2005). Women of the world, re-write! Women in American history high school textbooks from the 1960s, 1980s, and 1990s. *Social Education, 69*(1), 57-62

Clark, R. A., & Mahoney, T. J. (2004). How much of the sky? American high school history textbooks from the 1960s, 1980s, and 1990s. *Social Education, 68*(1), 57-62.

Commeyras, M., & Alvermann, D. E. (1996). Reading about women in world history textbooks from one feminist perspective. *Gender and Education*, *8*(1), 31-48. https://doi.org/10.1080/713668481

Crocco, M. S. (2007). Speaking truth to power: Women's rights as human rights. *The Social Studies, 98*(6), 257-269. https://doi.org/10.3200/TSSS.98.6.257-269

Crocco, M. S. (2011). Teaching about women in world history. *The Social Studies 102*(1), 18-24. https://doi.org/10.1080/00377996.2011.532731

Crocco, M. S., & Libresco, A. S. (2007). Citizenship education for the 21st century: A gender inclusive approach to social studies. In D. Sadker, & E. S. Silber, (Eds.), *Gender in the classroom: Foundations, skills, methods, and strategies across the curriculum*. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Cruz, B. C. (1994). Stereotypes of Latin Americans perpetuated in secondary school history textbooks. *Latino Studies Journal, 1*(1), 51-67. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED389648

Cruz, B. C. (2002). Don Juan and rebels under palm trees: Depictions of Latin Americans in US history textbooks. *Critique of Anthropology, 22*(3), 323-342. https://doi.org/10.1177/0308275X02022003761

Daisey, P., & José-Kampfner, C. (2002). The power of story to expand possible selves for Latina middle school students. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy, 45*(7), 578-587. http://www.jstor.org/stable/40012242

Danzer, G. A., Klor de Alva, J. J., Krieger, L. S., Wilson, L. E., & Woloch, N. (2006). *The Americans: Reconstruction to the 21st century.* McDougal Littell.

Danzer, G. A., Klor de Alva, J. J., Krieger, L. S., Wilson, L. E., & Woloch, N. (2016). *The Americans: United States history since 1877*. Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.

Davidson, J. W. & Stoff, M. B. (2006). *America: History of our nation.* Pearson Publishing.

Davidson, J. W., & Stoff, M. B. (2016). *United States history: Colonization through reconstruction.* Pearson Publishing.

de la Teja, J. F., Danzer, G. A., Klor de Alva, J. J., Krieger, L. S., Wilson, L. E., & Woloch, N. (2016). *The Americans: United States history since 1877.* Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Publishing Company.

Delgado Bernal, D. D. (2002). Critical race theory, Latino critical theory, and critical raced-gendered epistemologies: Recognizing students of color as holders and creators of knowledge. *Qualitative Inquiry, 8*(1), 105-126. https://doi.org/10.1177/107780040200800107

Deverell, W., & Gray White, D. (2006). *United States history: Independence to 1914.* Holt, Rinehart, and Winston*.*

Doherty, L. (2013). Gender mainstreaming in political science experiential learning programs. *Politics & Gender, 9*(2), 223-227. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1743923X1300007X

Epstein, T., Mayorga E., & Nelson, J. (2011). Teaching about race in an urban history class: The effects of culturally responsive teaching. *The Journal of Social Studies Research 35*(1), 2-21. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ926054

Eraqi, M. M. (2015). Inclusion of Arab-Americans and Muslim-Americans within secondary U.S. history textbooks. *Journal of International Social Studies, 5*(1), 64-80. https://doi.org/10.1080/15210960.2015.1022449

Gándara, P., & Contreras, F. (2009). *The Latino education crisis: The consequences of failed social policies.* Harvard University Press.

Garcia, J. (1980). Hispanic perspective: Textbooks and other curricular materials. *The History Teacher, 14*(1), 105-120. *https://doi.org/10.2307/493985*

Gay, G. (2018). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice* (3rd ed.). Teachers College Press.

Ginorio, A., & Huston, M. (2001). *Si, se puede! Yes, we can*: *Latinas in school.* Association of University Women Educational Foundation.

Gordy, L. L., Hogan, J., & Pritchard, A. (2004). Assessing "herstory" of WWII: Content analysis of high school history textbooks. *Equity & Excellence, 37*(1), 80-91. https://doi.org/10.1080/10665680490422133

Gray White, D., & Deverell, W. (2016). *United States History: Early colonial period through reconstruction.* Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.

Hart, D. (2005). *History alive: The United States through industrialism.* Teachers' Curriculum Institute.

Howard, T. (2003). The disgrace of the social studies. In G. Ladson-Billings, (Eds.), *Critical race theory perspectives on social studies.* Information Age Publishing.

Krippendorff, K. (2004). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology* (2nd ed.). Sage.

Ladson-Billings, G. (1995). Toward a theory of culturally relevant pedagogy. *American Educational Research Journal, 32*(3), 465-491. https://doi.org/10.2307/1163320

Ladson-Billings, G. (1998). Just what is critical race theory and what's it doing in a nice field like education? *Qualitative Studies in Education, 11*(1), 7-24. https://doi.org/10.1080/095183998236863

Ladson-Billings, G. (2003). Lies my teacher still tells. In G. Ladson-Billings (Eds.), *Critical race theory perspectives on social studies.* Information Age Publishing.

Ladson-Billings, G. (2014). Culturally relevant pedagogy 2.0: a.k.a. the remix. *Harvard Educational Review, 84*(1), 74-84. https://doi.org/10.17763/haer.84.1.p2rj131485484751

Lapsansky-Werner, E. J., Levy, P. B., Roberts, R., & Taylor, A. (2016). *United States history 1877 to the present.* Pearson Education.

Lavariega Monforti, J., & McGlynn, A. (2010). Aqui estamos? A survey of Latino portrayal in introductory U.S. government and politics textbooks. *Political Science and Politics, 43*(2), 309-316. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1049096510000181

Loewen, J. W. (2018). *Lies my teacher told me*. The New Press.

Maganini, S. (2016, July 29). California's new public school history standards reflect state's diversity. *The Sacramento Bee*. Retrieved June 19, 2017 from www.sacbee.com/news/local/education/article92446782.html

Martell, C. C. (2013). Race and histories: Examining culturally relevant teaching in the U.S. history classroom. *Theory & Research in Social Education 41*(1), 65-88. https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.2013.755745

Mertus, J. (2007). Teaching gender in international relations. *International Studies Perspectives, 8*(3), 323-325. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1528-3585.2007.00295.x

National Center for Educational Statistics. (2016). Bachelor's degrees conferred by postsecondary institutions, by race/ethnicity and sex of student: Selected years, 1976-77 through 2014-15. Retrieved September 8, 2017 from https://nces.ed.gov/programs/digest/d16/tables/dt16_322.20.asp?current=yes

National Center for Educational Statistics. (2017). Status and trends in the education of racial and ethnic groups. Retrieved June 10, 2018 from https://nces.ed.gov/programs/raceindicators/indicator_rbb.asp

Nieto, S. (2000). *Affirming diversity: The sociopolitical context of multicultural education.* (3rd ed.). Longman.

Osler, A. (1994). Still hidden from history? The representation of women in recently published history textbooks. *Oxford Review of Education, 20*(2), 219-235. https://doi.org/10.1080/0305498940200206

Sadker, D., & Sadker, M. (1994). *Failing at fairness: How our schools cheat girls.* Simon & Schuster.

Sadker, D., & Zittleman, K. (2002). Gender bias in teacher education texts: New (and old) lessons. Teacher education books: The unfinished gender revolution. *Educational Leadership, 60*(4), 59-63. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487102053002008

Salvucci, L. K. (1991). Mexico, Mexicans and Mexican Americans in secondary-school United States history textbooks. *The History Teacher, 24*(2), 203-222. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ440294

Santiago, M. (2017). Erasing differences for the sake of inclusion: How Mexican/Mexican American students construct historical narratives. *Theory & Research in Social Education, 45*(1), 43-74. https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.2016.1211971

Santiago, M. (2019). Historical inquiry to challenge the narrative of racial progress. *Cognition and Instruction, 37*(1), 93-117. https://doi.org/10.1080/07370008.2018.1539734

Schmeichel, M. (2015). Skirting around critical feminist rationales for teaching women in social studies. *Theory & Research in Social Education 43*(1), 1-27. https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.2014.1002648

Schmidt, S. J. (2012). Am I a woman? The normalization of woman in US History. *Gender and Education, 24*(7), 707-724. https://doi.org/10.1080/09540253.2012.674491

Schocker, J. B., & Woyshner, C. (2013). Representing African American in U.S. history textbooks. *The Social Studies, 104*(1), 23-31. https://doi.org/10.1080/00377996.2012.655346

Schrader, C. E., & Wotipka, C. M. (2011). History transformed? Gender in World War II narratives in U.S. history textbooks, 1956-2007. *Feminist Formations, 23*(3), 68-88. https://doi.org/10.1353/ff.2011.0037

Sleeter, C. E., & Grant, C. A. (1991). Race, class, gender, and disability in current current textbooks. In M. W. Apple & L. K. Christian-Smith, (Eds.), *The politics of the textbook*. Routledge.

Solórzano, D. G., & Delgado Bernal, D. (2001). Examining transformational resistance through a critical race and LatCrit theory Framework: Chicana

and Chicano students in an urban context. *Urban Education, 36*(3), 308-342. https://doi.org/10.1177/0042085901363002

Solórzano, D. G., & Ornelas, A. (2002). A critical race analysis of advanced placement classes: A case of educational inequality. *Journal of Latinos and Education, 1*(4), 215-229. https://doi.org/10.1207/S1532771XJLE0104_2

Solórzano, D. G., & Yosso, T. J. (2002). Critical race methodology: Counter-storytelling as an analytical framework for education research. *Qualitative Inquiry, 8*(1), 23-44. https://doi.org/10.1177/107780040200800103

Spring, J. (2014). *American education* (16th ed.). McGraw-Hill.

Spring, J. (2018). *American education* (18th ed.). Routledge.

Suh, Y., An, S., & Forest, D. (2015). Immigration, imagined communities, and collective memories of Asian American experiences: A content analysis of Asian American experiences in Virginia U.S. history textbooks. *The Journal of Social Studies Research 39*(1), 39-51. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jssr.2014.05.002

Tetreault, M. K. T. (1986). Integrating women's history: The case of United States history high school textbooks. *The History Teacher, 19*(2), 211-262. https://doi.org/10.2307/493800

Texas Education Agency. (2017). Enrollment in Texas public schools, 2016-17. Retrieved June 20, 2018 from https://tea.texas.gov/sites/default/files/enroll_2016-17.pdf

Trecker, J. L. (1971). Women in U.S. history high school textbooks. *Social Education, 35*(3), 249-260.

Valenzuela, A. (1999). *Subtractive schooling: U.S.-Mexican youth and the politics of caring.* State University of New York Press.

VanSledright, B. (2008). Narratives of nation-state, historical knowledge, and school history education. *Review of Research in Education, 32*, 109-146. https://doi.org/10.3102/0091732X07311065

Woyshner, C., & Schocker, J. B. (2015). Cultural parallax and content analysis: Images of black women in high school history textbooks. *Theory & Research in Social Education, 43*(4), 441-468. https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.2015.1099487

Yosso, T. J. (2002). Toward a critical race curriculum. *Equity & Excellence in Education, 35*(2), 93-107. https://doi.org/10.1080/713845283

Author Contact

Angela M. Leslie, **angela.leslie@csus.edu**
College of Education, California State University, Sacramento
6000 J Street, Sacramento, CA. 95819, U. S. A.