australian society for music education incorporated

Fostering the development of expressive performance skills: A gestural approach within the reflective, one-to-one piano studio

Mark Griffiths
Queensland Conservatorium Griffith University

Abstract

Recent literature has challenged commonly held views of musical expression as a de facto measure of talent, or something that develops naturally and cannot be taught, suggesting instead that the importance of innate skill is often exaggerated and hinders a student's development. Nevertheless, there is a paucity of research detailing strategies that aid in developing the expressive skills of child and adolescent musicians, particularly pianists. With the aim of revealing such strategies, I conducted case studies with six of my pre-tertiary piano students as part of a reflective practice project, recording and analyzing their weekly lessons. Findings suggest that the implementation of an expressive gestural vocabulary might foster expressive skills, leading to more confident and fulfilling music making earlier in a student's development. The data also indicate that such an approach may not be appropriate at every stage of a student's learning trajectory, requiring modification when coaching with mindset, autonomy, practice methods, goal setting, and "learning how to learn" is more pressing. The research demonstrates the need to think beyond a one-size-fits-all approach in one-to-one studio teaching, a context where pedagogical lineage is often defended, leading to inflexibility and the exclusive adoption of the teach-as-taught approach within a master-apprentice framework.

Keywords: musical expression, gesture, expressive gestural vocabulary, body movement, one-to-one studio teaching, teaching and learning, piano pedagogy, reflective practice, teacher as researcher.

One-to-one instrumental and vocal instruction has become an area of increasing research interest in recent years, at least at tertiary level. A common theme in the literature is that expressive skills receive insufficient attention until rather late in a student's development (e.g. Juslin & Perrson, 2002; Lindström, Juslin, Bresin, & Williamon, 2003; Rostvall & West, 2001; Woody, 2000; Young, Burwell, & Pickup, 2003), raising the question of whether such strategies might best be fostered at an earlier stage. Indeed, a study of cello instruction by Lisboa (2008) indicated that teachers should be helping children to develop the tools needed for independent expressive playing, though it did not explicate what these might be.

Apart from the studies of Lisboa (2008), McPhee (2011), and Brenner and Strand (2013), within the small body of research concerning one-to-one teaching to school-aged students (e.g. Colprit, 2000; Duke, Flowers, & Wolfe, 1997; Fredrickson, 2007; Gillespie, 1991; Siebenaler, 1997; Ward, 2004), almost no consideration has been given to the teaching of musical expression, despite Davidson, Pitts, and Correia's (2001) suggestion that "expressive musical performance is the long-term goal of all instrumental work" (p. 51). Similarly, Zhukov (2004) stated that, "expressive playing is the ultimate goal of music teaching" (p. 27). Davidson (2002a) has suggested that a paucity of such research could be symptomatic of the somewhat erroneous view that the expressive skills separating average and excellent performers is a chasm filled only by an untrained, "enigmatic gift" (p. 98). Numerous scholars have argued that to view the

ability to "communicate beyond the notes on the page" (Fink, 2002b, p. 97) as reflective of an innate, genetic skill that cannot be learned actually hinders a student's development (Fink, 2002b; Karlsson & Juslin, 2008; Sloboda, 1996). Even so, influential scholars value the role of expression in music education, such as Elliott (2005), who stated that "we need to reflect upon and teach this dimension of musical meaning more carefully, deliberately, and creatively than we have in the past" (p. 103).

Gesture, body movement and expressive pedagogy

Although the analysis of musical expression to inform teaching and learning is gathering momentum, at least with instrumentalists and vocalists of advanced level (Laukka, 2004), contemporary research has mainly focused on aspects other than acoustical variance produced by gestural manipulation of the body. Rink (2004) argued that empirical studies that attempt to quantify musical expression tend to investigate tempo and dynamics, which are easier to scrutinize than timbre and bodily gesture. This is a curious state of affairs, considering Muñoz's (2007) view that "gestures are part of a range of human reactions to feeling, sensation and comprehension, and to underestimate them in live performance would mean to ignore human signals in a human invention, which is what music is" (p. 59).

In the present study, musical expression is understood as a process in which body movement, particularly gestural activity of the arms, hands, and trunk, is crucial in developing a young pianist's ability to convey tonal nuance, phrase shape, articulatory sparkle, rhythmic vitality, musical characterization, and "a connection to the music that is honest, real and radiating self-confidence" (Westney, 2003, p. 34). This approach is informed by my own pianistic background, as well as research literature that supports the indissoluble link between expressive body movement, gesture, instrument, tone production, timbral color, articulation, and musical character (e.g. Davidson & Correia, 2002; Doğantan-Dack, 2011; MacRitchie & Zicari, 2012; Muñoz, 2007; Parncutt & Troup, 2002), and Lehmann, Sloboda, and Woody's (2007) suggestion that the crux of expressive performance is found in tonal nuance, a subset of expression.

Tonal nuance appears to be similar to prosody, the rhythm and inflection of spoken language. Lehmann et al. (2007) described tonal nuance as the intricate manipulation of auditory parameters that gives music its ability to invoke humanistic arousal in the listener, and maintained that the artistic worth of a performance is largely determined by a musician's ability to manipulate timbre and tonal nuance in an aesthetically significant way (p. 86). Indeed, Holmes (2012) cited numerous scholars (e.g. Gabrielsson & Juslin, 1996; Juslin, 2003; Juslin, Friberg, Schoonderwaldt, & Karlsson, 2004) who viewed the ability to vary timbre as "one of the principal ways through which performers communicate musical structure, ideas, emotions and musical personality" (p. 301). Seashore (1936) saw timbre as "the most basic attribute of all music" (p. 24), and Levitin (2008) described it as "the most important and ecologically relevant feature of auditory experiences" (p. 45).

In particular, Davidson (2000) claimed that performers appear to develop a specific vocabulary of expressive gestures that facilitate functional playing, and Berman (2000) referred to professional pianists attaining "a vocabulary of physical motions" (p. 23) during their career. However, investigations are yet to appear of the pedagogical use of body movement and expressive gesture with young pianists, despite the long-standing, widespread acknowledgement in piano pedagogy of their role in fostering expressive performance. Indeed, Fink (2002a) saw the implementation of consistent arm choreography as "our most powerful expressive tool" (p. 61), and Bernstein (1981) held gestural movement of the arms to be "the primary source of your musical and technical control," which "influence the shaping of your phrases as much as they do the ease of your execution" (p. 173).

Research aims

The research aimed to identify strategies that fostered expressive performance skills and describe the learning environment(s) that encouraged expressive sensibility in my pre-tertiary students. Students of late-elementary to early-intermediate level were chosen, as recent research indicated that this population may represent a critical phase of instruction when many able pupils cease their lessons (cf. Bowden, 2010; Daniel & Bowden, 2013; Worthy, 2009). Specifically, this research sought confirmation that a working knowledge of tone production, articulation, and phrasing through the adoption of expressive gesture could foster expressive performance skills. It was hoped that young students could learn to intrinsically link how they move at the piano with how they sound, and to expressively characterize their pieces with my support, while building their own transferable knowledge base that could later be applied to multi-genred repertoire. Accordingly, a central research question was posed: In what ways could expressive gesture be used to foster the expressive performance skills of late-elementary and early-intermediate level pre-tertiary pianists?

Methods

Following Yin's (2009) assertion that case studies are desirable for understanding a real-life phenomenon in depth, dependent upon important contextual conditions, a case study framework was chosen to explore pedagogical processes with a high degree of ecological validity (Lisboa, 2008). According to Creswell (2013), a detailed understanding emerges from examining one or more cases that reflect clear boundaries of location and time, such as the one-to-one lesson environment. Pitts and Davidson (2000) stated that detailed case studies "allow close comparison of the methods and behaviour in evidence, from which broader discussion can be generated" (p. 46).

Sample

Two cases were chosen as pilots for the research; six cases were chosen for the study itself, two of which were excluded from the final analysis. All of the research participants were my students at Young Conservatorium, a pre-tertiary music school attached to Queensland Conservatorium Griffith University. They were chosen through purposive sampling, representing a spectrum of skill attainment, degrees of commitment, age, gender, and cultural background, and subjectively perceived levels of motor skill, coordination, kinesthetic awareness, timbral perception, self-confidence, and unique attributes of personality and temperament. My subjective judgments on such matters were based on the research literature above, more than two decades of experience in teaching pre-tertiary pianists, and my prior experience working with these students. Two of the final four research participants were male and two were female. Their pseudonyms are Finn, Adrian, Jade, and Kelly, and they were aged 12, 9, 11, and 9, respectively, at the time of data collection.

Data collection procedures

The one-to-one lessons were weekly interactions between myself (the researcher) and my pre-tertiary students (the research participants) over a 12-month period during 2014, amounting to approximately 30 lessons per student. Each lesson was digitally recorded with a Sony camcorder to mitigate the Hawthorne effect, which Daniel (2006) described as "the potential for better performance as a result of knowingly being placed under research scrutiny" (p. 206). The analysis of video footage has "substantial precedent in music education research" (Carey, Grant, McWilliam, & Taylor, 2013, p. 153), and it was anticipated that repeated, retrospective viewing of the recordings would elucidate pedagogical strategies not immediately apparent. Personal and professional reflections on the lessons were diarized in my

Reflective Journal as soon as possible after each lesson, usually within one or two days.

Data analysis procedure

Following Borkan's (1999) description of the procedure as a course of action whereby researchers immerse themselves in the data they have collected, I revisited my Reflective Journal many times over an extended period. Steps toward data analysis were as follows:

- Phase 1: Over a 12-month period, all one-to-one lessons were video recorded, and a reflective account of each lesson was entered into my Reflective Journal.
- Phase 2: The reflections were revisited many times, and areas of potential interest were highlighted with highlighter pens.
- Phase 3: Further observations on these areas of potential interest were noted in the manuscript margins with highlighter pens.
- Phase 4: Emerging themes were distilled from these observations.
- Phase 5: The emerging themes of each research participant's lessons were tabulated in a Word document and color coded for ease of cross comparison.
- Phase 6: Common themes among the six research participants were identified.
- Phase 6: The recordings of every lesson were viewed retrospectively, with a detailed synopsis and additional reflective observations notated.
- Phase 7: Vignettes from these synopses that best illustrate manifestations of each theme were identified and collated.
- Phase 8: Lesson footage corresponding to each vignette was sourced and edited.
- Phase 9: Reflections on each vignette were made to illuminate the research questions.

Summary of the research participants' research journey

Common to each research participant was their resultant understanding that expressive gesture can be used as a means to physically unlock expressive tonal nuance in their repertoire. Despite this congruency, they diverged somewhat in their ability to utilize expressive gesture to merge notation with sound. Jackie demonstrated a good overall grasp of expressive gesture, but her cautious nature appeared to impede her ability to leave the notation behind to take some physical risks when exploring expressive gesture. While Finn was able to intellectually grasp the concept of employing expressive gesture to facilitate expressive playing, challenges with body awareness, coordination, practice commitment, notational familiarity, and performance anxiety affected the way in which he engaged with expressive gesture, making coaching with 'learning how to learn' a greater priority. Although Kelly was engaged in her lessons and found the process of merging expressive gesture with notation relatively easy, despite some occasional problems with coordination and finger-joint laxity, encouraging her to be more extroverted and less dutiful when playing was an ongoing challenge. Being ambitious, confident, and able to implement goal-directed, deliberate partial practice techniques independently, Adrian demonstrated a superior ability to blend expressive gesture with notation, despite a sometimes overly self-critical mindset. His case clearly demonstrates how the three-dimensional spatial trajectory and speed of physical gesture can facilitate the creation of volume, articulation, and expressive tone color inherent within musical gesture. As Adrian's progress during the study best encapsulates the concept that expressive gesture can *facilitate* expressive playing, rather than simply being a *by-product* of it, his videos are used to illustrate the analysis below.

Analysis

Upon thematic analysis of the Reflective Journal and the lesson synopses, the central research question was illuminated in three main ways:

1. Expressive gesture can be an effective and tangible way to forge an understanding of how motion affects sound, and used as a vehicle to foster awareness of the intrinsic link between notation, body movement, and expressive tonal nuance.
2. Expressive gesture can be used to solve technical problems that may otherwise hinder physical ease, confidence, and the ability to generate an expressive sound.
3. Expressive gestures may be combined to form an 'expressive gestural vocabulary' that students can successfully apply across multiple genres.

First, despite their unique learning pathways, all research participants demonstrated that expressive gesture can be used to forge a tangible link between notation, body movement, and expressive tonal nuance. In this excerpt (Adrian, Lesson 22, https://vimeo.com/195610398/7bb522df9c), Adrian (primo) and Neil (secondo) are rehearsing Tchaikovsky's *Swan Lake*, Op. 20, arranged for piano duet by Mary Elizabeth Clarke. After establishing how the melodic line might be shaped expressively when sung, Adrian is quick to recognize that variation in tonal shape enhances forward flow and musical purpose. Using critical comparison and demonstration, this excerpt demonstrates an exploratory process whereby small amounts of notation are imbued with expressive gesture, and the resultant tone quality is analyzed. When prompted, Adrian is able to identify the types of expressive gesture used to create subtle variations in tonal nuance, which highlights his developing ability to correlate motion with sound.

Second, common to each case study is the concept of using expressive gesture to solve technical problems that may otherwise hinder expressive intention. In this excerpt (Adrian, Lesson 21, https://vimeo.com/195615871/75af1a0668), Adrian uses a combination of 'add-a-note' and 'add-a-group' (chaining) techniques in order to unlock freedom of gestural movement and expressive tonal shape simultaneously. He develops the rotary freedom needed to execute the left-hand semiquavers in Haydn's *Concerto in D Major*, Hob. XVIII:11 (first movement). As the difficulty of the repertoire increases, the point at which expressive nuance, expressive gesture, and technical freedom converge seems to become more difficult to pinpoint.

Third, an expressive gestural vocabulary can be viewed as a 'library of movements' that facilitate expressive tone production in piano performance. More specifically, it is the holistic awareness of one's body moving as a synergistic kinetic chain, in which an intrinsic connection is forged between gestural movement, touch, timbre, and tone production, with many individual components consolidated and embodied over time. Much the same as a spoken or written vocabulary, one might start with basic words (movements) followed by simple phrases (gestural fragments), before developing the ability to speak in more complicated sentences over time (gestural choreography). At its highest level, a person's written vocabulary could be quite complex and their speech patterns increasingly expressive and persuasive, but the process of its assimilation is often scaffolded, with increasingly difficult tasks being layered as skills are mastered, fluency increases, and confidence grows.

This process could be likened to the implementation of the expressive gestural vocabulary, whereby one or two basic movements are learned before being combined into gestural fragments, precursors to the assembly and assimilation of increasingly complex choreographic patterns in which the two hands 'dance' independently. Evolving step by step over time, these basic gestural fragments dovetail together, and may ultimately harness an increasingly independent ability to implement gestural combinations that facilitate the expressive

tonal shape embodied within musical notation. Rather than expressive gesture being added ad hoc as mere visual display, the teacher can hone a student's ability to analyze the notation and implement a range of physical gestures that help to unlock the expressive potential of the score's musical gestures. Expressive physical gesture may thus be seen as an intrinsic part of the musical notation, fundamental to expressive tonal shape and color.

What follows is an increasing ability to interpret and implement the three-dimensional spatial trajectory between consecutive notes, and how they might combine to produce larger gestural fragments, seamlessly merging together to create the overall gestural choreography implied by the notation. This may be likened to a dancer learning individual steps before combining them into larger movement sequences, and finally adding them together for a sequenced, fluid outcome. If dance notation is the two-dimensional representation of a three-dimensional activity, then the same concept could apply to music notation. As repertoire increases in motor complexity, the implicit gestural choreography of the notation may be forged with the expressive gestural vocabulary in mind. The data suggest that 'chaining' individual notes and gestural fragments together assists students to marry the external gestural choreography with an internal kinesthetic map of the musical score, in which the movements of their performing body are cyclical and causally linked to the embedded expressive tonal shape and timbral nuance. In effect, the *physical* gestures become an embodied representation of the *musical* gestures used within the score, and the two merge to become intrinsically expressive *tonal* gestures, resulting in an energized spirit and promoting an embodied, indissoluble connection between instrument, sound, and musician.

Six main types of expressive gesture common to each case study were elucidated:

1. 'The fundamental stroke', where the depression of a single key starts a kinetic chain reaction of the hand, wrist, forearm, elbow, and upper arm (i.e., the movement trajectory to press a single note continues well after that note has sounded).
2. Preparatory movement and cyclical down and up movement, where the beginning of one gesture merges with the end of another.
3. The breath metaphor, combined with preparatory movement and cyclical down and up movement, appears to facilitate momentum and the ability to 'roll' through the notes.
4. Gestural over-shape and under-shape (and the implicit clockwise and anticlockwise elliptical movement) embedded within ascending and descending two-, three-, four- and five-note slurs, which may be considered expressive gestural fragments.
5. Double rotary movement, a counter-intuitive precursory 'roll' to the opposite direction of travel acts to propel the forearm, hand, and finger unit, usually to negotiate a leap or to increase volume with a 'ring' in the sound, thereby avoiding brittleness and the need to press or 'key-bed.' It seems to further facilitate momentum and enhance fluidity, promoting a lubricated, organic approach to playing.
6. The pelvic tilt, a forward and backward tilt of the hips, trunk, and pelvis to generate expressive energy.

In this excerpt from Mary Elizabeth Clarke's arrangement of Tchaikovsky's *Swan Lake* Op. 20 (Adrian, Lesson 21, https://vimeo.com/195584017/6b3fe51995), Adrian demonstrates his understanding of the first gesture, 'the fundamental stroke', and how an expressive follow-through movement of his right forearm and elbow enhances the expressive 'ring' in the sound. Adrian's confidence in his ability to identify and implement concepts that have been visited before reflects an increasing ability to apply existing knowledge to novel contexts.

This example from Mozart's *Alla Turca*,

third movement of Sonata in A Major K331 (Adrian, Lesson 30, https://vimeo.com/195622094/1e8ec6d08f), illustrates Adrian's growing understanding of the second gesture, how preparatory movement can help to generate momentum in the arms, leading to enhanced clarity, freedom, and stylistic vigor. I help Adrian arrive at this conclusion using collaborative questioning, rather than direct instruction alone. Jessica also builds Adrian's sense of responsibility for his own learning, actively encouraging him to seek feedback in a way that supports learning autonomy. As usual, Adrian is quick to draw parallels between his own experience and my analogy of throwing a ball, with a forward throw preceded by a backward preparatory movement.

The third gesture is an extension to the concept of preparatory movement, using the breath metaphor combined with preparatory movement. This appeared to further facilitate the research participants' understanding of expressive tone production, especially when coupled with discussion of how singers and other instrumentalists might generate expressive tone. In this excerpt from the first movement of Haydn's *Concerto in D Major* Hob.XVIII:11 (Adrian, Lesson 17, https://vimeo.com/195623958/c576aca454), emphasis is placed on forging an intrinsic link between sound and movement sequentially, one note at a time. It demonstrates how metaphorical breathing and preparatory movement can combine to build confidence, fluency, and expressive tonal shape in ascending and descending scales. Building expressive gesture in this way appears to make sense to Adrian, as he bobs up and down excitedly. Jessica notices a difference, saying "it sounds sweet." By combining this process with analogical language, scales are transformed from mere finger exercises to expressive gestures that sound as if they are "ascending to heaven".

The fourth gesture may be considered a combination of expressive gestural fragments, gestural over-shape and under-shape (and the implicit clockwise and anticlockwise elliptical movement) embedded within ascending and descending two-, three-, four- and five-note slurs. Such fragments may consist of single and/or double notes that are consecutive or multi-directional. Further, there is a growing awareness of how differing rates of forearm vertical velocity within a slur's down and up movement affect volume and expressive tone color. This example illustrates both four-note and two-note slurs in the right hand of Dorian Le Gallienne's *Jinker Ride* (Adrian, Lesson 24, https://vimeo.com/195629926/b189466c52). It demonstrates how an understanding of differing rates of vertical velocity of the forearm can affect the overall expressive tonal shape within slurs of varying lengths, referred to here as expressive gestural fragments. Early in this excerpt, Adrian works to refine the inherent decrescendo in descending sequential quavers, and quickly recognizes that he is lifting too quickly on the last note of each four-note slur, causing inordinate tonal bumps and ultimately inhibiting expressive forward flow. Through a process of experimentation in a collaborative framework, I coach Adrian to "lift up slower and fall down quicker". He clearly draws on his previous experience with this concept, as he responds expeditiously. Later in the excerpt, expressive gesture is utilised not only to give tonal shape to a series of repeated (ascending) two-note slurs, but also to affect an overall expressive crescendo across the bar. The uptake of this gestural data is prompt, perhaps owing to Adrian's strong desire for self-improvement and positive feedback, as well as superior preparation of the notation between lessons.

The fifth gesture is seen in this excerpt from the primo part of Tchaikovsky's *Swan Lake,* Op. 20, arranged by Mary Elizabeth Clarke (Adrian, Lesson 21, https://vimeo.com/195639046/7dc73e1291). Adrian is initially confused when I ask him to roll to the left when the geographical direction of an ascending major 2nd is to the right. Through questioning, he quickly identifies that a precursory roll to the left might facilitate greater momentum, volume and 'ring' in the sound. Without prompt, he

recognizes that he is able to achieve a better sound, and I agree. Providing further support, Jessica is also able to discern the difference in expressive tone color when using such double rotary movement.

The following concept complements expressive gestural activity of the arms, as the research participants begin to incorporate and coordinate movement from both the upper and lower body. In essence, a 'whole-body' approach facilitates the gestural activity of the arms. Aware of Jane Davidson's (2002b, 2007) studies that measured professional pianists' use of forward pelvic tilt, I began to look for instances to apply that concept in the research participants' playing. All of the case studies provided evidence that a forward tilt of the pelvis induces a sense of natural momentum, working to enhance expressive color and energy. This seventh gesture, the pelvic tilt, became a useful method for Adrian to unify his entire body with the expressive gestural activity of his arms. In this excerpt from the first movement of Haydn's *Concerto in D Major* Hob. XVIII:11 (Adrian, Lesson 9, https://vimeo.com/195641511/b3846241ad), utilizing the pelvic tilt seems particularly effective, as the concept of 'leaning' into the two-note slurs corresponds directly with the expressive potential of what is essentially a notated appoggiatura (from the Italian verb *appoggiare,* 'to lean upon'). We rehearse the pelvic tilt without the distraction of the notation, before he merges the notes with a forward tilt of his upper body. Using critical comparison, demonstration, teacher expressive behaviour, and the analogies 'smile inside' and 'move like an ostrich', I encourage Adrian to find his most natural embodiment of the musical material. Jessica adds that "it seems more alive", which captures the purpose of employing expressive gestural movement of the entire body here.

Findings

The data suggest that expressive gesture can be an effective and tangible way to forge an understanding of how motion affects sound, and may be used as a vehicle to foster awareness of the intrinsic link between notation, body movement, and expressive tonal nuance. The results support the teacher working collaboratively with students to encourage a mindset of constantly refining and updating their expressive gestural skill base, ultimately to be drawn from independently. The data suggest that when small sections of notation are imbued with the tonal nuance and phrase shape that are by-products of expressive gesture, foundations may be built for a confident and musically expressive outcome. Expressive gesture thus forms an integral part of the notation itself, and therefore the learning process.

Common to each case study is the use of expressive gesture to solve technical problems that may otherwise hinder confidence, fluency, and expressive intention. The data support the notion that expressive gesture and technical prowess become harder to tease apart as repertoire increases in difficulty. While the four research participants are unique and at different stages of development, they each demonstrated increased awareness of the engagement of the deltoid muscles in the upper arm, and the direct correlation between tone production and the subtle movement of a pliable and well-aligned kinetic chain, where the upper arm, elbow, forearm, wrist, and hand are synergistic.

Further, the data indicate that expressive gestures can be learned and combined to form an expressive gestural vocabulary, in which the spatial patterns that link the notes dictate the types of expressive gestures used. This expressive gestural vocabulary need not be genre specific and may be developed over time.

Discussion

Using the established approaches of reflective practice and case study, this research aimed to explore the viability of using expressive gesture to foster the expressive performance skills of pre-tertiary pianists in the one-to-one studio. It seems that "expressive gesture facilitates coordination and coordination facilitates expressive gesture.

Both appear to facilitate a more rounded, expressive sound and improve overall confidence, perhaps in turn opening the door to greater self-expression" (Reflective Journal, Adrian Lesson 6). On a micro level, it is hoped that this research will contribute to the growing body of existing studies that have sought to investigate the pedagogy of musical expression, particularly those that have explored such strategies for musicians at relatively early stages of their development. Supporting young pianists in their expressive maturation using the strategies outlined herein may contribute to something more intangible, developing more rounded and satisfied human beings whose learning contributes to an educated society. This aim echoes Hallam's (2010) call for greater emphasis on affect in music education, citing the individual and societal benefits.

In order to fulfill increased economic and client-based accountability, it is hoped that this research will, on a macro level, contribute to a growing body of work that seeks greater transparency within the one-to-one environment. Tait (1992), Persson (1996a, 1996b), and Triantafyllaki (2005) have all called for more research into the nature of effective instrumental music teaching in the one-to-one studio, a context described by Rostvall and West (2003) as a "black box" (p. 214) about which we have very little knowledge.

While the outcomes detailed cannot be generalized owing to the small sample size of the individual case studies, this study will be useful for others who may find transferable commonalities in their practice. This research highlights the need to foster a student's self-confidence in order to improve expressive performance, and acknowledges that a student's mindset, autonomy, practice methods, and ability to 'learn how to learn' may need parallel development. More widely, the research demonstrates the need to maintain a "pedagogically agile" (Carey & Grant, 2016) approach within one-to-one studio teaching, a context where pedagogical lineage is often defended, leading to inflexibility and the exclusive adoption of the teach-as-taught approach within a master-apprentice framework. Further, this research gives credence to studies by Daniel (2006) and Carey et al. (2013) in which video analysis in the one-to-one studio context was useful in improving teaching and learning outcomes for students and their teachers.

References

Berman, B. (2000). *Notes from the pianist's bench*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Bernstein, S. (1981). *With your own two hands: Self-discovery through music*. New York, NY: G. Schirmer.

Borkan, J. (1999). Immersion/crystallisation. In B. F. Crabtree & W. L. Miller (Eds.), *Doing qualitative research* (2nd ed., pp. 179–194). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.

Bowden, J. P. (2010). *The intermediate piano student: An investigation of the impact of learning material on motivation* (Unpublished master's thesis). James Cook University, Townsville, Australia.

Brenner, B., & Strand, K. (2013). A case study of teaching musical expression to young performers. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 61*(1), 80–96. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022429412474826

Carey, G., & Grant, C. (2016, July). *Enacting transformative pedagogy in the music studio: A case study of responsive, relational teaching.* Paper presented at the ISME 2016, St Andrews, Scotland.

Carey, G., Grant, C., McWilliam, E., & Taylor, P. (2013). One-to-one pedagogy: Developing a protocol for illuminating the nature of teaching in the conservatoire. *International Journal of Music Education, 31*(2), 148–159. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761413483077

Colprit, E. J. (2000). Observation and analysis of Suzuki string teaching. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 48*(3), 206–221. https://doi.org/10.2307/3345394

Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.

Daniel, R. (2006). Exploring music instrument teaching and learning environments: Video analysis as a means of elucidating process and learning outcomes. *Music Education Research, 8*(2), 191–215. https://doi.org/10.1080/14613800600779519

Daniel, R., & Bowden, J. (2013). The intermediate piano stage: Exploring teacher perspectives and insights. *British Journal of Music Education, 30*(2), 245–260. https://doi.org/10.1017/s0265051713000041

Davidson, J. W. (2000, August). *Exploring the body in the production and perception of performance*. Paper presented at the 6th International Conference on Music Perception and Cognition, Keele, England.

Davidson, J. W. (2002a). Developing the ability to perform. In J. Rink (Ed.), *Musical performance: A guide to understanding* (pp. 89–101). New York, NY: Cambridge University Press. https://doi.org/10.1017/cbo9780511811739.007

Davidson, J. W. (2002b). Understanding the expressive movements of a solo pianist. *Musikpsychologie, 16*, 9–31.

Davidson, J. W. (2007). Qualitative insights into the use of expressive body movement in solo piano performance: A case study approach. *Psychology of Music, 35*(3), 381–401. https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735607072652

Davidson, J. W., & Correia, J. S. (2002). Body movement. In R. Parncutt & G. E. McPherson (Eds.), *The science and psychology of music performance: Creative strategies for teaching and learning* (pp. 237–259). New York, NY: Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195138108.003.0015

Davidson, J. W., Pitts, S. E., & Correia, J. S. (2001). Reconciling technical and expressive elements in musical instrument teaching: Working with children. *Journal of Aesthetic Education, 35*(3), 51–62. https://doi.org/10.2307/3333609

Doğantan-Dack, M. (2011). In the beginning was gesture: Piano touch and the phenomenology of the performing body. In A. Gritten & E. King (Eds.), *New perspectives on music and gesture* (pp. 243–265). Farnham, England: Ashgate.

Duke, R. A., Flowers, P. J., & Wolfe, D. E. (1997). Children who study piano with excellent teachers in the United States. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 132*, 51–84.

Elliott, D. J. (2005). Musical understanding, musical works and emotional expression: Implications for education. *Educational Philosophy and Theory, 37*(1), 93–103. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-5812.2005.00100.x

Fink, S. (2002a). Fingering: The key to arming. In K. Kropff (Ed.), *A symposium for pianists and teachers: Strategies to develop the mind and body for optimal performance* (pp. 60–68). Dayton, OH: Heritage Music Press.

Fink, S. (2002b). Musicality. In K. Kropff (Ed.), *A symposium for pianists and teachers: Strategies to develop the mind and body for optimal performance* (pp. 97–106). Dayton, OH: Heritage Music Press.

Fredrickson, W. E. (2007). Perceptions of college-level music performance majors teaching applied music lessons to young students. *International Journal of Music Education, 25*(1), 72–81. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761407074893

Gabrielsson, A., & Juslin, P. N. (1996). Emotional expression in music performance: Between the performer's intention and the listener's experience. *Psychology of Music, 24*(1), 68–91. https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735696241007

Gillespie, R. (1991). String teachers' diagnostic skills and their students' performance competencies. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 39*(4), 282–289. https://doi.org/10.2307/3345747

Hallam, S. (2010). Music education: The role of affect. In P. N. Juslin & J. A. Sloboda (Eds.), *Handbook of music and emotion: Theory, research, applications* (pp. 791–818). Oxford, England: Oxford University Press.

Holmes, P. A. (2012). An exploration of musical communication through expressive use of timbre: The performer's perspective. *Psychology of Music, 40*(3), 301–323. https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735610388898

Juslin, P. N. (2003). Five facets of musical expression: A psychologist's perspective on music performance. *Psychology of Music, 31*(3), 273–302. https://doi.org/10.1177/03057356030313003

Juslin, P. N., Friberg, A., Schoonderwaldt, E., & Karlsson, J. (2004). Feedback-learning of musical expressivity. In A. Williamon (Ed.), *Musical excellence: Strategies and techniques to enhance performance* (pp. 247–270). New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Juslin, P. N., & Perrson, R. S. (2002). Emotional communication. In R. Parncutt & G. E. McPherson (Eds.), *The science and psychology of music performance: Creative strategies for teaching and learning* (pp. 219–236). New York, NY: Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195138108.003.0014

Karlsson, J., & Juslin, P. N. (2008). Musical expression: An observational study of instrumental teaching. *Psychology of Music, 36*(3), 309–334. https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735607086040

Laukka, P. (2004). Instrumental music teachers' views on expressivity: A report from music conservatoires. *Music Education Research, 6*(1), 45–56.

Lehmann, A. C., Sloboda, J. A., & Woody, R. H. (2007). *Psychology for musicians: Understanding and acquiring the skills*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195146103.001.0001

Levitin, D. (2008). *This is your brain on music*. London, England: Atlantic Books.

Lindström, E., Juslin, P. N., Bresin, R., & Williamon, A. (2003). "Expressivity comes from within your soul": A questionnaire study of music students' perspectives on expressivity. *Research Studies in Music Education, 20,* 23–47. https://doi.org/10.1177/1321103x030200010201

Lisboa, T. (2008). Action and thought in cello playing: An investigation of children's practice and performance. *International Journal of Music Education, 26*, 243–266. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761408092526

MacRitchie, J., & Zicari, M. (2012, July). *The intentions of piano touch.* Paper presented at the 12th International Conference on Music Perception and Cognition and the 8th Triennial Conference of the European Society for the Cognitive Sciences of Music, Thessaloniki, Greece.

McPhee, E. A. (2011). Finding the muse: Teaching musical expression to adolescents in the one-to-one studio environment. *International Journal of Music Education, 29*(4), 333–346. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761411421084

Muñoz, E. E. (2007, August). *When gesture sounds: Bodily significance in musical performance.* Paper presented at the International Symposium on Performance Science, Porto, Portugal.

Parncutt, R., & Troup, M. (2002). Piano. In R. Parncutt & G. E. McPherson (Eds.), *The science and psychology of music performance: Creative strategies for teaching and learning* (pp. 285–302). New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Persson, R. (1996a). Brilliant performers as teachers: A case study of commonsense teaching in a conservatoire setting. *International Journal of Music Education, 28*, 25–36. https://doi.org/10.1177/025576149602800103

Persson, R. S. (1996b). Studying with a musical maestro: A case study of commonsense teaching in artistic training. *Creativity Research Journal, 9*(1), 33–46. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15326934crj0901_4

Pitts, S. E., & Davidson, J. (2000). Developing effective practice strategies: Case studies of three young instrumentalists. *Music Education Research, 2*(1), 45–56. https://doi.org/10.1080/14613800050004422

Rink, J. (2004). The state of play in performance studies. In J. Davidson (Ed.), *The music practitioner* (pp. 37–51). Aldershot, England: Ashgate.

Rostvall, A.-L., & West, T. (2001). *Interaktion och kunskapsutveckling. En studie av frivillig musikundervisning*. Stockholm, Sweden: KMH Forlaget.

Rostvall, A.-L,. & West, T. (2003). Analysis of interaction and learning in instrumental teaching. *Music Education Research, 5*(3), 213–226. https://doi.org/10.1080/1461380032000126319

Seashore, C. (1936). The psychology of music, III the quality of tone: (1). Timbre. *Music Educators Journal, 231*(24–26). https://doi.org/10.2307/3384948

Siebenaler, D. J. (1997). Analysis of teacher-student interactions in the piano lessons of adults and children. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 45*(1), 6–20. https://doi.org/10.2307/3345462

Sloboda, J. A. (1996). The acquisition of musical performance expertise: Deconstructing the "talent" account of individual differences in musical expressivity. In K. A. Ericsson (Ed.), *The road to excellence: The acquisition of expert performance in the arts and sciences, sports, and games* (pp. 127–166). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Tait, M. (1992). Teaching strategies and styles. In R. Colwell (Ed.), *Handbook of research on music teaching and learning* (pp. 525–534). New York, NY: Schirmer Books.

Triantafyllaki, A. (2005). A call for more instrumental music teaching research. *Music Education Research, 7*(3), 383–387. https://doi.org/10.1080/14613800500280535

Ward, V. (2004). The performance teacher as music analyst: A case study. *International Journal of Music Education, 22*(3), 248–265. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761404047406

Westney, W. (2003). *The perfect wrong note: Learning to trust your musical self*. Pompton Plains, NJ: Amadeus Press.

Woody, R. H. (2000, June). Learning expressivity in music performance: An exploratory study. *Research Studies in Music Education, 14*, 14–23. https://doi.org/10.1177/1321103x0001400102

Worthy, C. (2009). *Attitudes and social factors affecting the intermediate piano student: Perceptions of teachers and students* (Unpublished honours thesis). Griffith University, Brisbane, Australia.

Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.

Young, V., Burwell, K., & Pickup, D. (2003). Areas of study and teaching strategies in instrumental teaching: A case study research project. *Music Education Research, 5*(2), 139–155. https://doi.org/10.1080/14613800307110

Zhukov, K. (2004). *Teaching styles and student behaviour in instrumental music lessons in Australian conservatoriums* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia.

Mark Griffiths *has established a successful portfolio career in teaching, examining, adjudication and research. He is a graduate of Queensland Conservatorium Griffith University (QCGU), where he has been a tertiary and pre-tertiary specialist lecturer since 1998. His professional activities are informed by ongoing reflective practice with students from early childhood to adults of tertiary level. Mark's doctoral research, completed in 2017, involved the investigation of pedagogical strategies that foster pre-tertiary pianists' expressive performance skills. His research interests lie in reflective practice, expressive performance, one-to-one pedagogy, gesture, and movement analysis. An influential clinician, Mark has demonstrated his research through piano masterclasses in Brisbane and Melbourne. Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Dr Mark Griffiths, 30 Pear Street, Greenslopes, Queensland 4120. Contact: Mark.Griffiths@griffith.edu.au*