Citizenship education or civic education?
A controversial issue in Spain

María Sánchez-Agustí
University of Valladolid

Diego Miguel-Revilla
University of Valladolid

- Educational reforms in Spain have addressed civic and citizenship education in multiple ways.
- From 2006 to 2013, a core citizenship education subject was imparted in primary and secondary education.
- After multiple controversies and a change in government, a new reform removed the subject from the curriculum.
- Since 2013, the current legislative framework has adopted a cross-curricular approach for civic education.
- Different conceptions of civic and citizenship education are expected to influence forthcoming reforms.

Purpose: The aim of this country report is to offer an overview of civic and citizenship education in Spain.
Approach: The report analyses the Spanish curriculum and the current legislative framework, examining the way social and civic competences are integrated in both primary and secondary education. Additionally, the paper also examines the latest educational reform, establishing a comparison between how citizenship education was addressed in the curriculum until 2013 and the way a cross-curricular approach has been adopted since then.
Findings: The paper has been able to establish a clear difference between two political and educational conceptions. On one hand, from 2006 to 2013, the Spanish government introduced "Citizenship and Human Rights Education" as a core subject linked to a broader approach to traditional civic education. After the 2013 reform, the new government favoured instead a cross-curricular orientation that avoided references to the idea of citizenship and limited the scope of civic education. A discussion is provided regarding what policy reforms can be expected in the near future in Spain.

JSSE

1 INTRODUCTION

Civic education has been implemented in different ways across the European Union, although its contents are usually integrated in broader subjects or learning areas instead of as a separate subject (Eurydice, 2017, p. 34). In any case, the latest Eurydice report states that "citizenship education is part of the national curricula for general education

Corresponding author: María Sánchez-Agustí, Department of Experimental Science, Social Science and Mathematics Didactics, University of Valladolid, Facultad de Educación, Paseo de Belén 1, 47011, Valladolid, Spain. E-mail: almagosa@sdcs.uva.es

in all countries" (2017, p. 11), generally using a broad scope that includes responsibility, cooperation and communication, but also critical thinking, as well as personal development and interpersonal interactions. This orientation can be traced to different conceptions and traditions, usually linked to a narrow ("civic education") or a broader approach ("citizenship education") to the idea of citizenship and it role in educational settings (Ruiz & Chaux, 2005). In Spain, civic education has been addressed over time adopting different forms (curricular complementarity, transversality or specificity) and a different terminology (ethical and moral education, civic education or citizenship education), something that has been a source of intense educational and extra-educational debates.

In the final years of the dictatorship, the Ley General de Educación (General Education Law) or LGE was enacted in 1970. This new legislative change abolished the subject Formación del espíritu nacional (Formation of the National Spirit), with a distinctively proselytising character and with a scarce academic value (González Pérez, 2014). In its place, the reform introduced civic education contents as a supplement in social science education in the last three years of compulsory education (for students of 12, 13 and 14 years of age).

It was in 1978, after the adoption of the democratic Spanish constitution, when the attention mainly focused on civic contents. These would be included in a subject called Educación ética y cívica (Ethical and Civic Education), with an explicit aim of instructing students about democratic values and attitudes. This is why the curriculum included elements related to coexistence, human rights, the constitution, international institutions and political participation. This legislative framework would last until 1990, with the implementation of the Ley Orgánica de Ordenación General del Sistema Educativo (Organic Act on the General Organisation of the Education System) or LOGSE.

Since then, educational reforms in Spain have succeeded one after another depending on the political party in power: the Partido Socialista Obrero Español (PSOE, a socialdemocratic party), or the Partido Popular (PP, a conservative party). Educational overhauls include the LOGSE in 1990 (enacted by the PSOE), the Ley Orgánica de Calidad de la Educación (Organic Act on the Quality of Education) or LOCE in 2002 (enacted by the PP), the Ley Orgánica de Educación (Organic Educational Law) or LOE in 2006 (enacted by the PSOE), and the Ley Orgánica para la Mejora de la Calidad Educativa (Organic Law for the Improvement of Educational Quality) or LOMCE (enacted by the PP). Despite these changes promoted by both parties, educational reform has become a political weapon and something that has not always provided an improvement in quality (Viñao, 2015).

In order to understand the state of civic education in Spain during the 1990-2002 period (when the LOGSE educational legal framework was in effect), it is possible to review the country report published in this very same journal by Naval, Print and Iriarte (2003). Here, the focus will be on the period between then and today. Leaving aside the short-lived educational reform proposed by the conservative party (PP) in 2002 (LOCE), which was not effectively implemented in schools due to a change in government, the debate regarding citizenship education after the enactment of a new law by the socialdemocratic party (PSOE) in 2006 will mark a significant change. After all, it is not possible to understand the current state of civic and citizenship education without analysing the reform that took place on that year.

2 A KEY PRECEDENT: CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN THE LOE (2006-2013)

On April 6, 2006, the Spanish parliament enacted a new educational legal framework with a socialdemocratic political majority: the LOE. In its preamble, the law explicitly stated the importance of "offering all students a space for reflection, analysis and study regarding the fundamental characteristics and mechanisms of a democratic regime". It also referred to the "principles and rights established in the Spanish constitution and in international treaties and

declarations", while also including all "common values that constitute the substrate of democratic citizenship in a global context" (MEC, 2006, p. 17163).

In order to achieve this, the law offered two important changes. At the outset, the key competences and learning strategies recommended by the EU in 2006 were introduced for the first time in the Spanish curriculum, both for primary (6 to 12 years) and for secondary education (12 to 16 years). Among them, social and civic competences were included, describing them as the ones that "make it possible to understand the social reality in which we live in, to cooperate, coexist and to put democratic citizenship into practice in a plural society, while also committing to its improvement" (MEC, 2006b, p. 43.061). With the inclusion of these competences, and an explicit mention in the normative to the way each subject can contribute to their development, the law adopted a cross-curricular approach. In this regard, all areas played an important part in order to address social and civic competences, a mechanism inherited from the previous legal framework.

In second place, and concurrently, a newly-created specific subject with the name Educación para la ciudadanía y los derechos humanos (Citizenship and Human Rights Education) was established for primary education and for one of the first three years in secondary education. A similar subject, titled Educación ético-cívica (Ethical and Civic Education) was designed for the fourth year of this last stage. The aim of the two subjects was to palliate the formative deficiencies that were previously detected, derived from an exclusively transversal or cross-curricular approach for civic education.

The complexity of this task, something that implied overcoming a traditional curriculum very closely associated with academic disciplines, was a response to the lack of attention to an education in citizenship values on the part of teachers, a difficult undertaking that has not taken hold in practice (Bolívar, 2008). Ultimately, in one way or another, it is possible to conclude that the LOE adopted a serious approach to the democratic education of Spanish children and adolescents, establishing two different, but complementary, roads for its success.

2.1 "CITIZENSHIP AND HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION" AS A SUBJECT: AIMS AND CONTENTS

The curricular objectives, contents and assessment criteria of the new subject in primary education, as well as its contribution for developing the key competences, were regulated by the enactment of Royal Decree 1513/2006. It also established that the subject should be taught in the last educational cycle of primary education (10 to 12 years). As indicated in the curriculum, children are able to understand the universal nature of human rights at this age, and they can become aware of how they are part of a nation and a global society at the same time.

Curricular contents were grouped in three broad sections: 1) Individuals and interpersonal and social relations, 2) Life in community, and 3) Living in society. The subject was programmed for the complete academic year, with a total of one and a half teaching hours per week. Pedagogically, those aspects closest to students had to be addressed first, while broader topics were covered later on, including the Spanish constitution, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, and the Convention on the Rights of the Child. The aim was to make students able to identify and accept social diversity, rejecting discrimination, marginalisation and injustice. They should also had to understand the need to collaborate as a society, not only identifying rights but also duties associated to a responsible idea of citizenship.

Methodologically, both in this educational stage and in the ensuing one, educators were encouraged to implement strategies that could help stimulate student participation, helping them become critical and caring citizens. Scholarly practices also had to be designed to address collective rights and responsibilities established in the Spanish constitutional framework with students, while also taking into account their individual identity and personal autonomy.

For secondary education, the law articulated two subjects with different denominations: Educación para la ciudadanía y los derechos humanos (Citizenship and Human Rights Education) and Educación ético-cívica (Ethical and Civic Education). Geography and History teachers were in charge of the first one, and could be accommodated in any of the three first years of secondary compulsory education, with one teaching hour per week. The second subject was assigned two weekly teaching hours, but philosophy teachers would be the ones in charge of it with fourth-year secondary education students (16 years of age).

The enactment of Royal Decree 1631/2006 established "the development of free and upstanding people through self-esteem, personal dignity, freedom and responsibility reinforcement" as a shared objective for both subjects in the curriculum. At the same time, the text detailed the need to educate "prospective citizens with a criteria of their own, respectful, collaborative and caring", but also "capable of knowing their rights, assuming their duties and developing civic customs to exercise as citizens in a responsible an effective manner" (MEC, 2007, p. 715).

Citizenship education was seen as indispensable for addressing elements such as solidarity, peace and the respect of human rights, something advocated by authors like Labrador Herráiz (2003) as a key part of the promotion of a culture of peace in the classrooms. In order to do this, the normative established a series of thematic sections about the duties and rights that every citizen has, about the mechanisms in democratic societies, and about conflicts and inequalities from the point of view of global citizenship, a key perspective that can influence social studies and history education in particular (Santisteban, Pagès, & Bravo, 2018). In any case, and preceding this, a first section focused on interpersonal relations, fondness and emotions, as well as on relationships and families in the framework of the Spanish constitution. These elements, linked to affective and sexual issues, were the ones that ignited debates and a series of significant political clashes.

2.2 CONTROVERSY AND POLITICAL REACTION TO THE LOE REFORM

The most conservative sectors of Spanish society perceived this subject as an attempt to impose a leftist bias and to indoctrinate students, enforcing a particular ideology about homosexuality, about sexual relations and about different types of family in schools. Catholic parent associations like CONCAPA went to court to exercise their right of conscientious objection and to exempt their children from enrolling in these subjects without any academic repercussions. It is important to note that one year earlier, in 2005, same-sex marriage was legalised despite a significant political controversy, making Spain one of the world's pioneers in this regard.

The debate about citizenship education was extensively covered by the media, and numerous opinion pieces were published defending opposing views. For instance, the catholic theologian González de Cardenal, a member of the Royal Academy of Spanish Moral and Political Sciences, highlighted how the EU was concerned about young people's lack of an instruction focused on democratic values. Taking this into account, he defended the implementation of this subject, while also rejecting the specific curriculum established by the government, accusing it of enforcing a socialist moral. From his point of view, contents should adhere exclusively to learning about the Spanish constitution and the international declarations of human rights, as only those values could be considered universal and be adopted independently of the political or religious orientation of each individual (González de Cardedal, 2007).

From an opposing perspective, Fernando Savater, writer and renowned Spanish philosopher, was surprised by the amount of critiques received by the subject and argued that in education it is not possible to decouple individual conscience and social norms shared by a community. In this respect, formal education does not only have the right, but also "a clear obligation to instruct making use of shared values, not to dismiss moral pluralism, but precisely to allow it to coexist in the same framework" (Savater, 2006).

Newspapers did not only echo the points of view of prominent individuals about the implementation of the subject, but also printed a series of opinion pieces in which the editorial board of each publication gave arguments in favour or against the reform. The editorial pieces published by the conservative newspapers *ABC* and *La Razón* were particularly belligerent, encouraging a clear opposition to the subject, and even civil disobedience. According to Carratalá (2010), these newspapers assumed the role of political agitators, leaving aside their function as instruments for dialogue, for a serene debate, and as a mechanism for mutual understanding in a society.

From an institutional standpoint, the educational and legislative decentralisation in Spain, comprised of 17 autonomous regions with the ability to implement specific curricular elements, allowed for those communities presided by conservative regional governments to apply substantial changes in the curriculum, removing controversial contents. These regions avoided all references to concepts like homophobia, gender, feminism, affective and sexual orientation, or xenophobia in the curriculum (Muñoz, 2016). On the other hand, these decisions did not defuse the conflict, and instead rekindled the discussion by focusing on a dispute about educational competences between regional governments and the central administration.

Finally, three years after the implementation of the law, the Supreme Court ruled in February 11, 2009 that the right of conscientious objection was not applicable for this subject. The tribunal did not perceive that curricular contents contravened the law, as controversial topics such as abortion, family types or same-sex marriage are options recognised in the Spanish constitutional and legislative framework. Addressing these topics in the classroom does not require an ideological allegiance and, while education must promote diversity and respect, this should not contravene the way families emphasise their own values and moral and religious convictions.

Even then, critiques promoted by catholic parent associations kept up, accusing some of the textbooks of socialist indoctrination (Profesionales por la Ética, 2012), although the main issue was limited only to three small leftist publishers. Both freedom to choose and diversity seemed guaranteed, as indicated by a study that analysed 13 civics textbooks, finding that democratic values were interpreted in multiple ways according to the educational model that was chosen and how values were understood (Carrillo, 2011).

With the return of the conservative party (PP) to power after the 2011 elections, the debate returned to the media. The new minister of education crítised the contents of this subject by declaring that they went beyond the recommendations of the European Council, while also proposing a curricular revision (Valencia, 2013). These changes would come into fruition in August of 2012, forcing publishers to modify their textbooks just before the beginning of the 2012-2013 academic year. This would also be a prelude of the profound modifications and reforms that would come in the future, removing the subject completely and instead adopting a transversal approach to foster key competences.

3 The current landscape: civic education in the LOMCE

During the second half of 2013, the recently-appointed conservative government decided to start a legislative procedure to amend the LOE and to introduce new legislation that would overhaul the educational framework and the curriculum. The LOMCE was enacted in December of 2013 and effectively implement just a few months later.

Among the most significant changes from the point of view of social studies, it is important to highlight a new approach to the way civic and citizenship education is addressed in the new legal framework. While the implementation of a new subject, with the provisional denomination of Educación cívica y constitucional (Civic and Constitutional Education) was considered as an

option before 2013, "Citizenship and Human Rights Education" was eventually eliminated as a core subject without an equivalent replacement.

Despite the absence of a specific subject like in the LOE, social and civic competences are considered a fundamental part of the key competences included in the curriculum in the LOMCE (MECD, 2015), in line with the European recommendations. It is important to note that this specific denomination matches the language used by the European Council and the European Parliament (EU, 2006), although recent revisions of this framework have instead begun referring to this competence as "citizenship competence" (EU, 2018), using a new terminology that integrates the same ideas under a new denomination, and that might be interpreted as a broader conception of the idea of citizenship.

In the preamble of the new legal text, the necessity of citizenship and democratic education to "promote a free, tolerant and just society that contributes to defend values such as liberty, pluralism, human rights, and the rule of law, key pillars of democracy" is explicitly mentioned. All of these aspects are referenced as principles that guide the Spanish educational system, and what follows is a clear statement that social and civic competences should be addressed "transversally, incorporating civic and constitutional education to all subjects during basic education, in a way that the acquisition of social and civic competences are included in the daily routine" (MECD, 2013, p. 97866). The way these competences are addressed in different educational stages, as well as in both compulsory and elective subjects, is examined in the next sections.

3.1 Social and civic competences in primary education

Among the notable changes in the new legislation, a slightly different orientation for social studies can be highlighted. Instead of a subject with the name Conocimiento del medio natural, social y cultural (Social, Natural and Cultural Studies), the LOMCE integrates all related contents in a new subject called Ciencias sociales (Social Sciences). Despite its name, the orientation of this subject is not of a disciplinary nature, supplementing an interest in geographical and historical contents with a promotion of reflective inquiry, in a transversal and comprehensive manner. Some of the most widely-used textbooks for this subject can be found on Figure 1.

Figure 1: Covers of a selection of Ciencias sociales (Social Sciences) textbooks for primary education. Publishers and date from left to right: Edelvives (2015), Santillana (2019), SM (2015) and Anaya (2015).

In relation to social and civic competences, the main aim of this subject is to "show respect to human rights, including the idea of equality as the basis of democracy, and to understanding the differences between the values of diverse religions and ethnic groups". At the same time, and while the democratic ideals are mentioned in the curriculum, the text explicitly states that the Spanish educational system aims for "the preparation for an exercise of a critical citizenship, and for an active participation in the economic, social and cultural life" (MECD, 2014, p. 19373).

Social and civic competences are implemented in four distinct sections, each one of them focusing on different contents, which are distributed over the six years of primary education. Table 1 shows the key learning standards that, in the framework of this particular subject, address those ideas or topics that are more closely related with civic or citizenship education.

Table 1: Learning standards related to civic or citizenship education in the primary education curriculum. Subject: "Social Sciences"

Section 1: common contents
- Take part in group activities adopting a responsible, constructive and supportive behaviour, observing the key principles of democracy.
- Value the importance of a pacific and tolerant coexistence between different human groups, attending to universally shared democratic values and human rights.
- Effectively and constructively, take part in social live, developing strategies to resolve conflicts.
- Value cooperation and dialogue as a way to avoid and resolve conflicts, promoting democratic values.

Section 2: the world in which we live in
- Explain the sustainable use of natural resources, proposing and adopting a series of measures and actions that can contribute to the improvement of the environmental conditions of our planet.
- Explain the causes and consequences of climate change, and the responsible actions to put a stop to it.

Section 3: living in a society
- Identify, respect and value the main democratic principles established in the constitution, and explain their importance for the functioning of the Spanish state.
- Identify the main institutions of the Spanish state, and describe its functions and organisation.
- Identify and understand the separation of powers in the state, and what are the attributions detailed in the constitution for each of them.
- Explain the territorial organisation in Spain, naming the basic structures of the government, and situate in political maps the different [autonomous] communities that comprise Spain, as well as its regions.
- Value, focusing on the Spanish context, the cultural, social, political and linguistic diversity in the same territory as a source of cultural enrichment.
 2 Explain what the European Union is, and its political and economic aims, situating in a map its member states and their capitals.

Section 4: the traces of time
- Describe the main features of the current Spanish society, and value its democratic and plural character, as well as its status as a European Union member.
- Appreciate the cultural heritage at both the local, national and European scale as a shared resource that should be known, preserved and taken care of.

Note: A complete list of learning standards can be found in MECD (2014, pp. 19374-19377).

Although the subject "Citizenship and Human Rights Education" disappeared from the curriculum after the 2013 reform, and despite the fact that social and civic competences are addressed transversally, an important aspect needs to be clarified. While mathematics, Spanish language and literature, social sciences, natural sciences and a foreign language are considered core subjects in primary education, the Spanish educational system establishes a series of different elective subjects (referred to as "specific subjects" in the legislation).

Religión (Religion) is offered as an elective subject, adopting a confessional nature. Although parents are allowed to choose among the main faiths in Spain, in practice, 98.6 per cent of them opt for a subject focused on the Catholic confession (MEFP, 2019, p. 330). Those students who do not select "Religion" (34.5 per cent of primary education students) must enrol in another

elective subject called Valores sociales y cívicos (Social and Civic Values) in its place (MEFP, 2019, p. 330). Some of the most popular textbooks have been selected in Figure 2.

Figure 2: Covers of a selection of Valores sociales y cívicos (Social and Civic Values) textbooks for primary education. Publishers and date from left to right: Santillana (2019), Anaya (2015), Everest (2014) and SM (2015).

In contrast with core subjects, elective subjects do not include a series of pre-defined contents, but instead just a list of assessment criteria and learning standards. In the case of "Social and Civic Values", the subject is divided into three sections: one linked to the ideas of identity and dignity, another one that focuses on respect and comprehension in interpersonal relations, and a last one that addresses harmony and social values. While the moral dimension of education clearly assumes a main role, there are numerous references to institutional aspects, including the Spanish constitution, but also to fundamental rights and duties in a democratic society, as can be observed in Table 2.

Table 2: Learning standards related to civic or citizenship education in the primary education curriculum (selection). Subject: "Social and Civic Values".

Section 1: identity and dignity
- Explain the value of personal respectability and dignity.
- Propose alternatives to solve social conflicts.
- Identify and define social conflicts and institute potentially effective solutions.
- Clearly define and formulate coexisting conflicts.

Section 2: comprehension and respect in interpersonal relations
- Utilise elements that contribute to dialogue.
- Recognise those elements that impede communication in diverse situations.
- Integrate ideas and opinions to find common values.
- Understand and appreciate in a positive way cultural differences.
- Analyse those issues that originate social prejudices.

Section 3: harmony and social values
- Resolve conflicts in a constructive manner.
- Reason about the meaning of social responsibility and social justice.
- Identify and critically analyse social inequalities.
- Argue about the universal nature of human rights.
- Critically assess the circumstances of those people that lack basic rights.
- Analyse all forms of discrimination: racism, xenophobia, lack of equal opportunities.
- Value and respect freedom of speech.
- Critically assess those attitudes linked to a lack of respect regarding equal opportunities for men and women.
- Reflect about rights and duties present in the Spanish constitution.
- Argue about the importance of civic values in a democratic society.

Note. A complete list of learning standards can be found in MECD (2014, pp. 19417-19420).

While "Social and Civic Values" can be considered a spiritual successor to "Citizenship and Human Rights Education", its optional character and the fact that parents have to choose between this subject and religion make this case unique. This is, precisely, the main difference with the LOE, which established "Citizenship and Human Rights Education" as a core subject, and not as an alternative to religious courses, an issue that has generated many debates, also in secondary education.

3.2 Social and civic competences in secondary education

In contrast with primary education, the Spanish secondary education curriculum adopts a clearly different treatment for social studies education. Instead of approaching social studies from a comprehensive point of view, the legislative framework embraces a disciplinary orientation, in line with the idea of social studies as social science, something consistent with one of the three main traditions of this area of knowledge (Fallace, 2017). For instance, during the four years of compulsory scholarship in this educational stage, the only subject intrinsically related to social studies is called "Geography and History", instead of using the term "Social Sciences", as can be observed in Figure 3.

Figure 3: Covers of a selection of Geografía e Historia (Geography and History) textbooks for secondary education. Publishers and date from left to right: Vicens Vives (2015), Santillana (2019), SM (2015) and Anaya (2015).

This subject is imparted for four years, all of them compulsory for students up to 16 years of age. From a practical standpoint, historical contents are usually taught in three of the four years, while geographic contents are generally concentrated in just the first and third year of this educational stage. On the other hand, as can be observed in Table 3, those learning standards that can be directly linked with civic education topics and issues are scarce.

Table 3: Learning standards related to civic or citizenship education in the secondary education curriculum. Subject: "Geography and History".

Geography and History (first and second year):
- Understand that many cultures coexist at the same time in different geographical locations.
- Analyse diverse examples of roman heritage that persist in the present.
- Ponder conflicting interpretations about the conquest and colonisation of America.
- Distinguish features of authoritarian, parliamentary and absolutist regimes.

Geography and History (third year):
- Analyse migration movements in the last three decades using different media.
- Explain the impact of migration waves in both origin and receiving nations.
- Define 'sustainable development' and describe its key concepts.
- Make a report about measures that can help overcome poverty.

Geography and History (fourth year):
- Establish, through the analysis of different texts, the difference between absolutism and parlamentarism.
- Discuss the implications of violence with diverse historical sources.
- Explain the working conditions for women and children in industrialised capitals.
- Develop a series of discussions about eurocentrism and globalisation.
- Establish a connection between specific aspects of the past and the present, with the potentiality of the future in mind, for instance, in relation to the 1929 and 2008 economic crisis.
- Discuss the causes of the fight for women's suffrage.
- Recognise the significance of the holocaust in world history.
- Understand the pros and cons of welfare state.
- Discuss about the configuration of the European Union and its future.
- Discuss potential benefits and disadvantages of some of the consequences of global warming (like ice melting in the Baltic Sea) for human societies and the natural environment.

Note. A complete list of learning standards can be found in MECD (2015, pp. 298-304).

While the orientation of this subject is clearly influenced by a disciplinary tradition, mainly focusing on the teaching of geography and history, a series of social and civic competences are also integrated. This way, elements that are fundamentally related with civic and citizenship education (institutions, social diversity, human rights) are covered through purely historical or geographical contents, "an old aspiration and a constant since these disciplines have been taught" (Pagès, 2009, p. 9). This approach can also be found in three other subjects ("Geography", "History of the Contemporary World" and "History of Spain") that are offered in secondary education after the compulsory stage, for students over 16 years of age.

Just like in primary education, secondary education students must select between two elective subjects for their first four years: Religión (Religion) or Valores éticos (Ethical Values). This last alternative assumes a different denomination than its primary education counterpart, removing from the name the term "civic values". In this occasion, 44.1 per cent of parents decide not to select religion as a subject for their children in secondary education, in comparison to 34.4 per cent in the case of primary education (MEFP, 2019, p. 330).

While only a minority of students choose this subject, the aims established in the curriculum explicitly mention the necessity to promote "respect to democratic and coexistence principles, and to fundamental rights and freedoms", as well as "active participation of conscious and respectful citizens" in social life (MECD, 2015, p. 534). Although ethical values and moral development occupy a fundamental role in the first part of this subject, an institutional point of

view is adopted in its second part, touching on subjects such as the Spanish constitution, European integration, or the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR). A selection of learning standards related to some of these aspects can be found in Table 4.

Table 4: Learning standards related to civic or citizenship education in the secondary education curriculum (selection). Subject: "Ethical Values".

Section 2: comprehension, respect and equality in interpersonal relations
- Justify and appreciate the necessity of rational critique as an indispensable way to adequate habits, norms, values, etc. in the environment, to the universal ethical values established in the UDHR, rejecting everything that goes against human dignity and fundamental rights.
- Elaborate a list with some of the ethical values that should be present between the individual and society, including responsibility, compromise, tolerance, pacifist, loyalty, solidarity, caution, mutual respect and justice, among others.
Section 4: justice and politics
- Substantiate (from a rational and ethical point of view) the election of democracy as a system that is above other forms of government, due to its integration of the principles and values established in the UDHR.
- Define the concept 'rule of law' and establish a relation with the defense of ethical and civic rights in a democratic society.
- Assume and explain the moral and civil right to actively participate in the exercise of democracy that citizens have, with the aim of respecting ethical and civic values in the state.
- Define the magnitude of some of the risks that exist in democratic governments when ethical values in the UDHR are not respected, including demagogy, dictatorship of the majority and democratic apathy, formulating proposals to avoid them.
- Identify and appreciate key ethical values in the Spanish constitution through comprehensive reading of its preamble, noting the origin of its legitimacy and aims.
- Know and appreciate the adequacy of the Spanish constitution to the UDHR, indicating the ethical values that are the base of citizens' rights and duties, as well as the guiding principles of social and economic policy.
- Explain and assume the citizen duties established in the constitution, and put them in order, justifying this election.
Section 5: ethical values, law, the UDHR and other human rights international treaties
- Explain the role of the UDHR as an 'ethical code' recognized by UN nations with the aim of promoting justice, equality and peace in the world.
- Design a campaign as a group with the aim of publicising the UDHR as a pillar of law and democracy in academic, familiar and social contexts.
- Undertake, as a group, the development of a campaign against discrimination of women and gender-based violence in their familiar, academic and social context, assessing the results that were obtained.

Note. A complete list of learning standards can be found in MECD (2015, pp. 537-543).

Finally, it is important to note that philosophy teachers, and not social studies educators are usually in charge of this elective subject, one of the reasons why ethical and moral elements are so predominant. In contrast with the subject "Geography and History", any sort of historical contextualisation assumes a secondary role at best, and those learning standards linked with civic education present a fundamentally different orientation (focusing on critical thinking and the transmission of values) that the ones that could be found in the core subject.

4 CIVIC EDUCATION IN SPAIN: TEACHER TRAINING, RESOURCES AND PROPOSALS

Leaving aside the educational legislative framework, it is also important to focus on other aspects related to civic education in Spain, including initial teacher training, but also teacher associations, resources, publications and dissemination of resources and proposals.

Regarding this first element, the inclusion of civic education in the curriculum of compulsory stages requires educators committed with values and attitudes that promote a peaceful and pacific coexistence. Teacher training is usually expected to provide educators with a comprehensive formative model, capable of providing answers to the complexities and challenges in advanced societies: multiculturalism, migrations, sexual diversity, environmental

protection, etc. Despite all this, tertiary education cannot always provide solutions to these and many other necessities.

In Spain, primary education initial teacher training takes place in universities by means of a four-year Bachelor's degree. The need for a generalist background for educators at this stage, in charge of students from 6 to 12 years of age, requires a multidisciplinary instruction, including didactic, humanistic and disciplinary courses. This variety allows for subjects closely related with some conceptual pillars of civic education to be included in each university curricula, including Educación para la paz y los derechos humanos (Peace and Human Rights Education), Educación multicultural (Multicultural Education), Educación para la salud (Health Education), Educación ambiental (Environmental Education), etc.

On the other hand, secondary education initial teacher training offers a much more specialised orientation, closely linked to scientific disciplines. Prospective teachers that will be in charge of 12 to 16-year-old students in compulsory secondary education, and students of 16 to 18 years of age in post compulsory secondary education, need to finish a four-year Bachelor's degree in history, geography, art history or humanities. After that, they would need to enrol in a Master's degree of one year of duration, specifically designed to provide pre-service teachers with basic educational notions. Furthermore, they would be required to spend two months in a school during a training period.

The disciplinary character of social science Bachelor's degrees, and the limited time that can be devoted to the professionalization of teaching in the Master's degree, offer a series of obstacles. Among them, there is a very noticeable lack of inclusion of transversal topics related to citizenship or civic education, an example of the discrepancy between teacher training and public policy emanated from European directives. These gaps would only be filled by lifelong teacher education, including training courses offered to acting teachers by Centros de Formación del Profesorado (Teacher Training Centres) available in every province in Spain and that report to the Department of Education of each autonomous region.

Teacher interest in civic education is manifested in the significant number of didactic proposals that have been designed and shared by educators, both for primary and secondary education. For instance, Procomún (procomun.educalab.es) is an open repository developed by the Instituto Nacional de Tecnologías Educativas y Formación del Profesorado (National Institute of Educational Technologies and Teacher Training) or INTEF, offering a total of 912 digitised resources related to civic education. Agrega (agrega.educacion.es), another platform developed by the Ministry of Education and the Departments of Education of the different autonomous regions in Spain also offers numerous educational resources. Among the materials developed and shared by educators, teachers can find resources like "Women and interculturalism", "Poverty: an obstacle for peace" or "Human rights and disability", among many others.

Social studies educators also have several associations, including the Spanish Federation of History and Geography Teachers (Federación Española del Profesorado de Historia y Geografía) or FEPHG, focused on secondary education. From the point of view of tertiary education, the Asociación Universitaria de Formación del Profesorado (University Association for Teacher Training) or AUFOP, and the Asociación Universitaria del Profesorado de Didáctica de las Ciencias Sociales (University Association of Teachers of Didactics of Social Science) also focus their attention on civic and citizenship education. These associations regularly organise symposiums and publish books and journals where some of the latest contributions to the field can be found.

Among some of the latest special issues dedicated to civic and citizenship education in Spain, it is possible to highlight the special issue about citizenship and education in *Edetania. Estudios y Propuestas Socioeducativas* (Romero & Mínguez, 2018). Additionally, a special issue of *Revista Interuniversitaria de Formación del Profesorado* focused on civic education in different educational stages and initial teacher training was published in that very same year (López Melero, 2018). Other specialised journals, such as *RISE. Revista Internacional de Sociología de la Educación* or

Educatio Siglo XXI have also published special issues about citizenship education in 2017 and 2019.

Other Spanish journals, like *Íber. Didáctica de las Ciencias Sociales, Geografía e Historia*, with significant influence in Spain and Latin American nations, have also published proposals or results of interventions in primary or secondary education that cover topics related to civic or citizenship education. These include a proposal on how to address issues like climate change in primary education (Riquelme Adán, 2019), how to use resources that can help discuss with students about immigration in secondary education (Olmos Villa, 2019), or how to share local experiences to promote active participation as citizens in secondary education (Domenech & Campo, 2018).

Apart from specialised journals, one of the side-effects of the enactment of the LOE in 2006 and the subsequent implementation of "Citizenship and Human Rights Education" as a core subject was the publication of multiple theoretical books about citizenship education. While some of these books have been influential in the past and have been an integral part of teacher training (e.g. Bolívar, 2007; Jares, 2004), virtually no handbook has been published on the matter after the implementation of the LOMCE, except for a few examples (e.g. Mínguez & Romero, 2018).

Finally, it is important to note that the Centre for Sociological Research of Spain (CIS) and public institutions like INJUVE periodically provide information about the way the Spanish youth, usually between 15 and 29 years of age, conceive democratic institutions, their political culture, or their involvement in social organisations. It is possible to find surveys regarding these specific aspects in relation to some of the last decades (CIS, 2001; 2003), as well as more recent studies (INJUVE, 2014; 2017).

5 CIVIC AND CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN SPAIN: NEW REFORMS ON THE HORIZON

After examining the orientation of civic and citizenship education in Spain for the last decade and a half, there are some aspects that are necessary to highlight. First of all, despite the different approaches that have been adopted, the necessity to address social and civic competences in the classroom does not seem to be questioned by any of the main political parties in Spain. While they have disputed the denomination of particular subjects (again, contraposing the idea of *citizenship* and *civic* education), particularly controversial contents (such as sexual education or diversity in the classroom), and even the necessity to adopt a narrower or broader conception of the idea of citizenship, there is no debate about the need to at least introduce specific competences in the classroom. The last two educational reforms have effectively integrated EU recommendations regarding the inclusion of key competences for lifelong learning, allowing for social and civic competences to be covered adopting different forms depending on the legislative framework, in line with other European nations (Eurydice, 2017).

These conceptions can affect different conceptualisations of what it means to be a citizen, and how these ideas are promoted in classrooms. It is important to note, nonetheless, that this is not only an effect of personal or pedagogical choices, but also of political decisions, which can have clear consequences and can promote different approaches to social science, civic or citizenship education (Westheimer & Kahne, 2004). Contrasting ideological and political values are, in fact, the main reason civic and citizenship education has been addressed in such distinct ways in the Spanish educational system.

As previously discussed, the main source of controversy in the past has been related to contested topics (usually linked to affective and sexual contents, among other issues like homophobia, xenophobia or feminism) and their inclusion in the curriculum (Muñoz, 2016). The origin of this dispute can be traced to the implementation, between 2006 and 2013, of a broad interpretation of what citizenship education should entail. From this point of view, any substantial debate should not only consider the terminology used in each context, but also the

orientation or tradition that each policy ascribes to.

   Differences between a conception of civic education and citizenship education can be identified, at least in part, due to the broad nature of the concepts. In some occasions, these simply cover "the specific rights and duties of legal citizens", or also include "knowledge, skills, and attitudes that children are expected to learn to be virtuous and civically productive members of society" (Levinson, 2014, p. 134). In this regard, Ruiz and Chaux distinguish between a narrow and static conception of citizenship that simply focuses on civility and on the compliance of social norms, something that they refer to as "civic education", and a broader approach conceptualised as "citizenship education" (Ruiz & Chaux, 2005, p. 19), a conceptualization that is shared between Spain and other Latin American nations due to its cultural and historical connections.

   The first of these two conceptions is, arguably, the one that has been established in the Spanish legislative framework since 2013. As indicated, while social and civic competences are still present due to a cross-curricular approach, the removal of the core subject "Citizenship and Human Rights Education" and the lack of a more extensive vision of the idea of civic education might entail a less ambitious approach, probably by design since the enactment of the LOMCE.

   Unlike civic education, citizenship education does not only focus on institutional elements, and four different spheres can be addressed, including socio-political, socio-economic, socio-cultural and socio-affective development (Bolívar, 2007). This is, precisely, one of the main differences between the LOE and the LOMCE, and one of the causes of the political controversy in the past, as some of these spheres were deemed intrusive by some associations and political parties.

   From an educational point of view, some of these conceptions can be easier to reconcile with a broader notion of citizenship education (Bolívar, 2016). This is the case, for instance, of the idea of citizenship as agency (usually concerned with a conception of students as social and active actors), which promotes political participation from a critical perspective (Martínez-Rodríguez, Sánchez-Agustí, & Muñoz-Labraña, 2019), in line with the attitudes encouraged in the curriculum, even if they do not always influence Spanish students in practice (Molina-Neira, Barriga-Ubed & Gámez-Ceruelo, 2017).

   Regardless of the legislative instability in this particular context, the idea of civic education has substantially expanded since the beginning of the century, adopting a considerably different approach to participation (Haste, Bermúdez & Carretero, 2017). In this regard, citizenship education has embraced "preparing youth to critically assess the barriers and challenges that impede the realization of greater democratic living within a person's civic communities" (Castro & Knowles, 2017). Whether a narrower or broader conception will be finally adopted in the Spanish curriculum is expected to be addressed this legislature (2020-2023), in the framework of an impending legislative reform.

   Despite both the contrasting and shared visions about the idea of civic and citizenship education described above, the current political landscape in Spain indicates that a new reform is expected in the next few years. After a change in government as a result of the 2019 Spanish general elections, the left-leaning government currently in power is expected to pursue a reformist agenda. Focusing specifically on education, the governing party (PSOE) will foreseeably intend to build a parliamentary consensus in order to enact a new legislative framework. According to the election manifesto, the PSOE has promised to repeal the LOMCE, in line with other left-wing political parties. In addition, further changes would also include an update in the curriculum, promising to reinstate "Citizenship and Human Rights Education" as a subject and to cover contents such as the Spanish constitution, European and international institutions and human rights, in line with the situation between 2006 and 2013.

   Other political parties have also stated their interest in encouraging a reform that should address civic and constitutional values. From this perspective, students would be required to explicitly focus on institutional aspects (reinforcing aspects related to the Spanish constitution and democratic mechanisms) as part of their compulsory education. This can arguably be seen as a reaction to separatist forces in some regions in Spain, such as Catalonia, and as a way of

reinforcing a national and institutional discourse against competing narratives.

Whether prospective educational changes in Spain might adopt one orientation or another, the updated framework on key competences for lifelong learning will probably play an important role in the process. As indicated before, the European Council recommendations decided to embrace a new language, referring explicitly to the "citizenship competence" instead of "social and civic competences" (EU, 2018). Although there are no profound conceptual differences, a debate over the denomination of a potential new subject might still be a controversial topic between political parties in Spain.

In this regard, the political debate is expected to be determined by two key elements that have influenced the orientation of civic and citizenship education in the last decades in Spain. On one hand, a different conception what social studies education (and particularly civic education) should entail has shaped the way political parties have approached educational policies in the past. The debate over civics has, in fact, contraposed a narrow and a broader vision of what it means to be a citizen and to live in a democracy. Themes such as gender, diversity, or affective and sexual contents have become controversial topics and their role in the classrooms is still debated.

Whether to make use of a core subject or to adopt a cross-curricular approach can be identified as the second element that has influenced civic and citizenship education in Spain. In this regard, legislative reforms have been very inconsistent, indicating that the integration of social and civic competences into broader subjects or using a transversal approach might just simply be a reflection of the political conceptions discussed in the previous paragraph, and not of other considerations (technical or otherwise). From this point of view, a narrow vision of civic education has been consistent with policies that try to hinder the visibility of a potential core subject, avoiding controversial topic by diluting contents into other areas of knowledge.

Despite the instability of the Spanish legislative framework, and regardless of the different conceptions about the aims of social studies, civic education is still valued as a fundamental element, even if there are disagreements about the scope and the contents that should be addressed in schools. While controversial, this debate will assume a key role in the future, even if, as previously indicated, educational reform has been traditionally used as a political weapon rather than as a fine-tuned instrument. A consensus has been elusive until now, and while the next few years will provide another opportunity for the main Spanish political parties to leave behind their differences and reach a comprehensive agreement, expectations should be tempered.

References

Bolívar, A. (2007). *Educación para la ciudadanía. Algo más que una asignatura* [Citizenship education. Something more than a subject]. Barcelona: Graó.

Bolívar, A. (2008). La educación para la ciudadanía en el currículo de la LOE [Citizenship education in the LOE curriculum]. *Avances en supervisión educativa. Revista de la Asociación de Inspectores de Educación en España*, *9*, 1-15.

Bolívar, A. (2016). Educar Democráticamente para una Ciudadanía Activa [Democratic Education for an Active Citizenship]. *Revista Internacional de Educación Para La Justicia Social (RIEJS)*, *5*(1), 69–87. DOI: 10.15366/riejs2016.5.1

Castro, A. J., & Knowles, R. T. (2017). Democratic Citizenship Education. Research Across Multiple Landscapes and Contexts. In M. M. Manfra & C. M. Bolick (Eds.), *The Wiley Handbook of Social Studies Research* (pp. 287–318). Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Carratalá, A. (2010). El editorial como generador de campañas de agitación: intervención social de ABC y La Razón ante Educación para la Ciudadanía [The editorial piece as a generator of agitation campagins: social intervention of ABC and La Razón regarding Citizenship Education]. *Estudios sobre el Mensaje Periodístico*, *16*, 107-129.

Carrillo, I. (2011). La educación en valores democráticos en los manuales de la asignatura Educación para la Ciudadanía [Education for democratic values in Citizenhip Education textbooks]. *Revista de Educación*, *1 (extraordinary issue)*, 137-159.

CIS (2001). *Valores y creencias de los jóvenes* [*Youth values and beliefs*]. Madrid: Instituto de la Juventud & Centro de Investigaciones Sociológicas (CIS).

CIS (2003). *Jóvenes, Constitución y cultura política* [*Youth, constitution and political culture*]. Madrid: Instituto de la Juventud & Centro de Investigaciones Sociológicas (CIS).

Domenech & Campo (2018). Soluciones escolares a los problemas ciudadanos [Scholarly solutions to citizenship problems]. *Íber. Didáctica de las Ciencias Sociales, Geografía e Historia*, *93*, 22-28.

EU (2006). Recommendation of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 December 2006 on key competences for lifelong learning (2006/962/EC). *Official Journal of the European Union*, L 394, 30.12.2006, pp. 10-18. Retrieved from http://data.europa.eu/eli/reco/2006/962/oj

EU (2018). Council Recommendation of 22 May 2018 on key competences for lifelong learning (2018/C 189/01). *Official Journal of the European Union*, C 189, 4.6.2018, pp. 1-13. Retrieved from https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=uriserv:OJ.C_.2018.189.01.0001.01.ENG

Eurydice (2017). *Citizenship Education at School in Europe 2017*. Brussels: Eurydice.

Fallace, T. (2017). The Intellectual History of the Social Studies. In M. M. Manfra & C. M. Bolick (Eds.), *The Wiley Handbook of Social Studies Research* (pp. 42–67). Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

González de Cardedal, O. (2007, June 6). La prueba de la verdad [The test of truth]. *ABC*, p. 3.

González Pérez, T. (2014). La educación cívica en España: retrospectiva y perspectiva [Civic education in Spain: retrospective and perspective]. *História da Educação*, *18*(42), 115-130.

Haste, H., Bermúdez, Á., & Carretero, M. (2017). Culture and Civic Competence: Widening the Scope of the Civic Domain. In B. García-Cabrero, A. Sandoval-Hernández, E. Treviño-Villarreal, S. Diazgranados, & M. G. Pérez (Eds.), *Civics and Citizenship. Theoretical Models and Experiences in Latin America* (pp. 3–16). Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

INJUVE (2014). *Jóvenes, valores y ciudadanía* [*Youth, values and citizenship*]. Madrid: Observatorio de Juventud en España.

INJUVE (2017). *Jóvenes, participación y cultura política* [*Youth, participation and political culture*]. Madrid: Observatorio de Juventud en España.

Jares, X. (2004). *Educar para la paz en tiempos difíciles* [*Educating for peace in difficult times*]. Bilbao: Bakeaz.

Labrador Herráiz, M. (2003). La cultura de la paz, marco para la ciudadanía [Culture of peace, framework for citizenship]. *Revista de Educación*, (2003 Special Issue), 155–168.

Levinson, M. (2014). Citizenship and Civic Education. In D. C. Philips (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of Educational Theory and Philosophy* (pp. 134–138). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.

López Melero, M. (2018). Presentación. Educar como Proceso de Transformación

en la Convivencia [Introduction. Education as a Transformation Process in Conviviality]. *Revista Interuniversitaria de Formación del Profesorado*, *92*(32.2), 17-29.

Martínez-Rodríguez, R., Sánchez-Agustí, M., & Muñoz-Labraña, C. (2019). What Does It Mean to Be a Citizen? A Comparative Study of Teachers' Conceptions in Spain and Chile. *Education as Change*, *23*, 1–24. DOI: 10.25159/1947-9417/4209

MEC (2006a). Ley Orgánica 2/2006, de 3 de mayo, de Educación [Organic Law for the Regulation of the Spanish Educational System]. Boletín Oficial del Estado (BOE), 106, 4/05/2006, pp. 17158-17207. Retrieved from https://www.boe.es/eli/es/lo/2006/05/03/2/con

MEC (2006b). Real Decreto 1513/2006, de 7 de diciembre, por el que se establecen las enseñanzas mínimas de la Educación primaria [Royal Decree that establishes minimum teaching requirements in primary education]. Boletín Oficial del Estado (BOE), 293, 08/12/2006. Retrieved from https://www.boe.es/eli/es/rd/2006/12/07/1513/con

MEC (2007). Real Decreto 1631/2006, de 29 de diciembre, por el que se establecen las enseñanzas mínimas correspondientes a la Educación Secundaria Obligatoria [Royal Decree that establishes minimum teaching requirements in secondary education]. Boletín Oficial del Estado (BOE), 5, 05/01/2007. Retrieved from https://www.boe.es/eli/es/rd/2006/12/29/1631/con

MECD (2013). Ley Orgánica 8/2013, de 9 de diciembre, para la mejora de la calidad educativa [Organic Law for the Improvement of Educational Quality]. Boletín Oficial del Estado (BOE), 295, 10/12/2013. Retrieved from https://www.boe.es/eli/es/lo/2013/12/09/8/con

MECD (2014). Real Decreto 126/2014, de 28 de febrero, por el que se establece el currículo básico de la Educación Primaria [Royal Decree that establishes minimum teaching requirements in primary education]. Boletín Oficial del Estado (BOE), 52, 01/03/2014. Retrieved from https://www.boe.es/eli/es/rd/2014/02/28/126/con

MECD (2015). Real Decreto 1105/2014, de 26 de diciembre, por el que se establece el currículo básico de la Educación Secundaria Obligatoria y del Bachillerato [Royal Decree that establishes minimum teaching requirements in compulsory secondary education and the baccalaureate]. Boletín Oficial del Estado (BOE), 3, 03/01/2015, pp. 169-546. Retrieved from https://www.boe.es/eli/es/rd/2014/12/26/1105/con

MEFP (2019). *Las cifras de la educación en España. Curso 2016-2017 (Edición 2019) [Figures of education in Spain. 2016-2017 academic year (2019 edition)]*. Madrid: Ministerio de Educación y Formación Profesional. Retrieved from https://sede.educacion.gob.es/publiventa/las-cifras-de-la-educacion-en-espana-estadisticas-e-indicadores-estadistica-2019/ensenanza-espana-estadisticas/22812

Mínguez, R., & Romero, E. (Eds.) (2018). *La educación ciudadana en un mundo en transformación: miradas y propuestas [Citizenship education in a transforming world: views and proposals]*. Barcelona: Octaedro.

Molina-Neira, J., Barriga-Ubed, E., & Gámez-Ceruelo, V. (2017). Representaciones sociales de los adolescentes catalanes sobre la participación política en democracia [Social representations of Catalan adolescents on political participation in democracy]. *International Journal of Sociology of Education*, *6*(1), 85-109. DOI: 10.17583/rise.2017.2472

Muñoz, A. (2016). ¿Qué ha sido de Educación para la Ciudadanía con el Partido Popular? [What has happened to citizenship education with the Popular Party?] *Foro de Educación*, *14*(20), 105-128. DOI: 10.14516/fde.2016.014.020.007

Naval, C., Print, M., & Iriarte, C. (2003). Civic Education in Spain: A Critical Review of Policy. *Journal of Social Science Education*, *2*, 1-14.

Olmos Villa, R. (2019). 21 Days: las dificultades de un refugiado sirio al llegar a Europa [21 Days: Difficulties of a Syrian refugee when reaching Europe]. *Íber. Didáctica de las Ciencias Sociales, Geografía e Historia*, *94*, 77-78.

Pagès, J. (2009). Competencia social y ciudadana [Social and citizenship competence]. *Aula de Innovación Educativa*, *187*, 7-11.

Profesionales por la Ética (2012). *Educación para la ciudadanía en España: 20 cuestiones controvertidas [Citizenship education in Spain: 20 controversial issues]*. Madrid: Profesionales por la Ética. Madrid: Área de Estudios Profesionales por la Ética.

Riquelme Adán, M. P. (2019). Reflexionamos sobre el cambio climático [We reflect about climate change]. *Íber. Didáctica de las Ciencias Sociales, Geografía e Historia*, *95*, 77-78.

Romero, E., & Mínguez, R. (2018). Presentación del monográfico "Ciudadanía y educación" [Presentation of the special issue "Citizenship and Education"]. *Edetania. Estudios y Propuestas Socioeducativas*, *53*, 17-19.

Ruiz, A., & Chaux, E. (2005). *La formación de competencias ciudadanas [The development of citizenship competences]*. Bogotá: Ascofade.

Santisteban, A., Pagès, J., & Bravo, L. (2018). History Education and Global Citizenship Education. In l. Davies, L.-C. Ho, D. Kiwan, C. Peck, A. Peterson, E. Sant, & Y. Waghid (Eds.), *The Palgrave Handbook of Global Citizenship and Education* (pp. 457–472). London, UK: Palgrave Macmillan UK.

Savater, F. (2006, August 12). En defensa propia [In self-defense]. *El País*, Retrieved from https://elpais.com/diario/2006/08/12/opinion/1155333605_850215.html

Valencia, R. (2013). *La implantación de Educación para la Ciudadanía en el sistema educativo español [The implementation of Citizenship Education in the Spanish Educational System]*. Madrid: Dykinson.

Viñao, A. (2015). La Ley Orgánica de Mejora de la Calidad Educativa (LOMCE) de 2013: ¿una reforma más? [The Law for the Improvement of the Education Quality (LOMCE) of 2013: one more reform?], *Historia y Memoria de la Educación*, *3*, 137-170 . DOI: 10.5944/hme.3.2016.14811

Westheimer, J., & Kahne, J. (2004). What Kind of Citizen? The Politics of Educating for Democracy. *American Educational Research Journal*, *41*(2), 237–269. DOI: 10.3102/00028312041002237