

A Comparison of Human Rights Education in Social Studies Textbooks in Turkey and the United State ¹

Zihni Merrey ²

Van Yüzüncü Yıl University

Abstract

The aim of this study was to compare the level of allocation of human rights education issues in social studies textbooks in Turkey and the United States. For this aim, six social studies textbooks from both countries were examined. Textbooks were analyzed in terms of their level of “human rights education issues,” in accordance with Karaman - Kepenekci’s (1999) subcategories. A content analysis method was used to analyze the textbooks. As a result, it was observed that human rights education issues were included more in Turkish social studies textbooks. The study showed that Turkish and United States textbooks contained the “rights” subcategory the most. While the intensity scores of the “democracy,” “freedom,” and “judgment” subcategories were listed the highest in both countries’ textbooks, on the other hand, the intensity scores of the “tolerance” and “peace” subcategories were placed last in the textbooks of both countries.

Keywords: Human rights education; textbooks; social studies, Turkey, the United States

DOI: 10.29329/ijpe.2018.179.2

¹ The study was presented in International Conference on Educational Research and Innovation (ICERI), on 11 and 12 May, 2016. Institute of Research and Community Services of Yogyakarta State University Yogyakarta, Indonesia

² **Zihni Merrey**, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Van Yüzüncü Yıl University, Faculty of Education, Turkish and Social Sciences Education Department, Van, Turkey

Email: zihnimerrey@hotmail.com

Introduction

“Rights that are so basic that they belong to all human beings are called human rights” (Donnelly & Howard, 1994). In other words, human rights are rights inherent to all human beings, whatever our nationality, sex, national or ethnic origin, color, religion, place of residence, language, or any other status is.

Human rights has been increasing since the adoption of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in 1948 (Donnelly, 1989; Donnelly & Howard, 1994; Eide, 1983; Gemalmaz, 2001; UNESCO, 2007). It raises the notion of universality at a time particularly when it is increasingly demanded and asserted by people on all continents. In 1948, the international community overwhelmingly endorsed the concept of a global rights regime through the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. This treaty is followed by the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) Convention against Discrimination in Education (1960), the International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights (1966) and the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (1981).

Human rights have been a major issue in international politics since World War II (Cladue, 1996; Diaz, 2005; Freeman, 2011; UNESCO, 2007). There were significant changes in human rights in the later nineteenth century, such as wide-ranging natural and social sciences, globalization of the economy and communications, political change, and so on. These changes have been added to new rights in the human rights corpus; these rights led to the protection of other rights (Babbio, 1996; Carey, 1970; Evans, 2005; Falk, 2004; Ishay, 2004; Vincent, 2010). The need for legislation to prevent the violation of human rights is not enough; therefore, human rights must be part of an educational program. The effectiveness of standards alone without enforcement measures can be enhanced through educational steps like human rights education courses (Carey, 1970; Cladue, 1996).

Human rights education is rapidly spreading, meeting important and widely felt social needs (Cladue, 1996; Mohanty, 2000).

“The United Nations’ Decade of Human Rights Education (1995-2004) became the first explicit effort to bring human rights education to the center of attention, although human rights education had been explored through other United Nations documents, specifically the 1974 UNESCO Recommendation Concerning Human Rights Education, the 1993 UNESCO World Plan of Action on Education for Human Rights and Democracy, and specific articles in the Vienna Declaration (1993), the Draft Plan of Action for the United Nations’ Decade of Human Rights Education (1978) animated efforts to building a universal culture of human rights through education” (Lapayese, 2002).

The United Nations General Assembly, for the United Nations’ Decade for Human Rights Education, defined human rights education in the following way:

“Human rights education contributes to a concept of development consistent with the dignity of women and men of all ages that takes into account the diverse segments of society such as children, indigenous peoples, minorities and disabled persons.... Each woman, man and child, to realize their full human potential, must be made aware of all their human rights” (United Nations General Assembly Res. 49/184, establishing United Nations Decade for Human Rights Education, 1994).

Lapayese (2002) states, human rights education is a life-long process by which people in all strata of society learn respect for the dignity of others and the means and methods of ensuring that respect in all societies. Human rights education is the only guarantee of demonstrating our commitment to human dignity, the promotion of an adequate standard of rights to everyone, and the promotion of world peace and prosperity for all. It also guarantees fundamental human rights and

freedom to all people, regardless of race, gender, region, religion, and economic and political statuses (Chaurasia, 2000; Cladue, 1996; Preece, 2005).

Textbooks and human rights education

Textbooks are basic instructional materials. In other words, textbooks are the most basic learning resources. The first reason why textbooks are assigned in the process of teaching and learning is because they are prepared in accordance with the program. The second reason why textbooks are assigned in the process of teaching and learning is because they are used as a teaching tool. This is a very important printed material that students should have. (Bayrakçı, 2005; Kılıç, 2005; Tan, 2007; Turner, 2004; Yanpar Şahin & Yıldırım, 2001).

Although textbooks are not the sole available instructional tools, as a result of the influence of technological developments, they are still major teaching tools playing an important role in education (Aslan & Karaman-Kepenekçi, 2008; Coşkun, 1996). Textbooks provide many advantages to educators, for example, to animate the curriculum and give life to topics taught in the class (Aslan & Karaman-Kepenekçi, 2008; UNESCO, 2007). Even though teaching and learning cultures differ from country to country and sometimes even within the same country, teachers still use textbooks. Even though teaching and learning cultures differ from country to country and sometimes even within the same country, teachers still use textbooks almost all over the world for preparing and structuring their lessons.

“Human rights are not only essential to have and understand but also these results suggest that many students in school may have a very inadequate understanding of connections between political ideas, institutions, and political life. Therefore, human rights education must be directed to providing an education which will enable children to use their human rights. Such education, in turn, depends on knowledge and instrumental tools” (Rendel, 1991). “The possession of human rights is not enough to dispense with teaching and education in the spirit of respect for human rights; it should also be taught as a subject integrated into the appropriate disciplines and, in particular, in fields such as philosophy, political science, law, and theology, also they should be taught as an independent course” (United Nations Decade of Human Rights Education UNESCO, 1987). Human rights must be taught at all levels of the educational system, as well as out-of-school settings, including literacy. Also, states must strive to improve and broaden human rights education and teaching and cooperate to this end (Cladue, 1996).

There has been a steady increase in the literature (Bajaj, 2004; 2011; Balton, 1992; Bottery, 1999; Branson & Purta, 1982; Claude, 1996; Çayır & Bağlı 2011; Davies, 2010; Gülmez, 2001; Guyette, 2009; Holland, 2011; Hornberg, 2002; Karaman-Kepenekçi, 1998; 1999a; 2000; Karaman-Kepenekçi & Gokce, 2000; Kerr and Keating, 2011; Lenhart & Savolainen, 2002; Leung, at el., 2011; Nazzari, at el., 2005; Patrick, 1999; Power & Allison, 2000; Tibbitts, 2002; UNESCO, 1969; 1987; 2007; Waldman, 2007) on human rights education in recent years.

There is also literature both in Turkey and in the world (Aslan & Karaman – Kepenekçi, 2008; 2010; Çayır, 2003; Drubay, 1986; Karaman-Kepenekçi, 1999b; 2003; 2005; 2009; 2010a; 2010b; 2011; Karaman-Kepenekçi & Aslan, 2011; Leung; 2008; Lucas, 2009; MEB, 2005; Meyer, at el., 2010; Merey, 2012a; 2012b; Nayir & Karaman – Kepenekçi, 2011; Parpuci & Merey, 2012; Savaş, 2004) related to contributions from other courses taught at school and the importance of textbooks in human rights education. In Turkey, there have been a number of studies conducted by Karaman-Kepenekçi about citizenship and human rights issues. Karaman - Kepenekçi (1999b)'s study aimed to determine the level of allocation of human rights issues in 17 Turkish high school textbooks and found that the intensity scores of human rights issues in religion, sociology, and philosophy textbooks were higher than the other analyzed high school textbooks. In Karaman - Kepenekçi (2003)'s study on human rights and responsibility education in elementary school, it was found that intensity scores on human rights issues were higher than responsibility issues. Karaman – Kepenekçi (2005)'s comparison

study, titled “citizenship and human rights education: A comparison of government and civics textbooks in Turkey and the United States,” found that the Intensity score of the category of “Rights” was at the highest level in almost all of the books studied. In Aslan & Karaman-Kepenekçi (2008)’s “Human rights Education: A comparison of mother tongue textbooks in Turkey and France,” it was observed that human rights issues are included in Turkish textbooks more frequently than in French textbooks. In History Foundation (2003)’s “Promoting Human Rights in Primary and Secondary School Textbooks,” this study recommended re-writing the primary and secondary textbooks so that future democratic citizens would be more aware of the underlying issues. In Savaş (2004)’s “Human rights in Turkish textbooks in primary schools,” it was found that citizenship and human rights issues were less common in Turkish textbooks than discovered by Karaman- Kepenekçi in Turkish primary school textbooks.

Social Studies Textbooks and Human Rights Education

In many countries, efforts to promote human rights education have proceeded at various rates depending on political, social, cultural, and educational factors. Today, especially in school contexts, human rights education is invariably integrated into core subject areas such as social studies courses (Eide, 1983; Starkey, 1991; Tarrow, 1987).

Social studies is the integrated study of the social sciences and humanities to promote civic competence... The primary purpose of social studies is to help young people develop the ability to make informed and reasoned decisions for the public good as citizens of culturally diverse, democratic society in the interdependent world (NCSS, 1994).

Social studies is the study of human beings. The aim of social studies in the elementary schools in Turkey is to introduce children to the world of people. The main aim of the social studies courses that have been practiced in Turkey is expressed as to provide an environment and opportunity for an individual to understand and to make contributions to himself/ herself, to the society in which he/ she lives, and to the world with his/ her own wishes and skills. In other words, the main purpose for teaching social studies is citizenship education (Ministry of National Education, 2005; Safran, 2004; Tezgel, 2006). United States textbooks in United States schools have similar objectives and they are considered part of citizenship education as the basic purpose of social studies (Chapin & Messick, 2002; Ellis, 2002).

Social studies classes are of great importance in elementary school programs because the overall objective of these programs is to educate individuals about being beneficial to themselves, their community, and global humanity. Every individual has different characteristics from another. Social studies combine different individuals and raises happy individuals who respect themselves and others in the light of basic rights and freedoms (Sezer, 2005). In Turkey, in social studies lessons, citizenship, democracy and human rights issues are presented as interdisciplinary and in this course, children are raised as individuals who know their rights and use them to fulfill their responsibilities (Karaman – Kepenekçi, 2010). A good book that will introduce students to the management of society, its economic characteristics, rights and duties of its citizens, and educates them about their country and the world will help to raise the future of the modern individual (Aycan, et al., 2001).

As it can be seen, there is only research about human rights education issues in social studies textbooks in Turkey. For example, Karaman – Kepenekçi (2003) examined the level of human rights and responsibility education in primary school. On the other hand, the level of allocation to human rights issues in United States social studies textbooks has yet to be examined. Therefore, it is thought important to examine the human rights issues in these textbooks and is thought to be useful to examine the content of both the texts. The comparison of social studies textbooks of the two countries will help change, develop and explain not only the textbooks, but also the global dimension of textbooks, as well as local, regional and national dimensions.

Firstly, the reason for choosing textbooks used in the United States for comparison is the fact that extensive and successful studies are being carried out in the United States about human rights education by various centers and organizations (e.g., Human Rights Centers, Children Protection Center, Center for Civic Education, Center for the Study of Human Rights, National Center for Human Rights Education, Center for Civic Education and Service, Citizenship Central, and the Center for Civic Education Through Law,) (Karaman-Kepenekçi, 2005). Today is an important time for human rights education in the United States because many big states, such as New York and California, have mandated human rights education programs for their schools, while others such as New Jersey and Connecticut recommend its inclusion in the school curriculum. Also, human rights enter the public school curriculum as a dimension of global education elsewhere. The government of the United States was founded on the belief that the primary purpose of government is to secure and protect the rights of the people (Starkey, 1991).

Objective of the study

The main objective of this study is to make a comparison between social studies textbooks in Turkey and United States in term of human rights issues.

Method

Selection of textbooks

In Turkey, primary level education is compulsory, encompassing twelve years between the ages of 6-18, Since the 2012-13 academic year compulsory education in Turkey increased to 12 years is divided into three stages. The first level consists of 4 years of primary school (1st, 2nd, 3rd and 4th grade), second stage is 4 years of middle school (5th, 6th, 7th and 8th grade) The third level is organized as a 4-year high school (9th, 10th, 11th and 12th grade). In Turkey, social studies lessons begin in 4th grade and continue up to 7th grade. That is to say, in primary schools, social studies lessons are compulsory in 4th, 5th, 6th, and 7th grades.

In the United States, the duration of compulsory education generally changes from state to state. Compulsory education covers the education of children between the ages of 6-16; the first six years are called the primary education level and the next four years are generally referred to as middle school or junior high school. Additionally, in the United States, social studies lessons begin at various levels in primary schools and vary from state to state. However, in the Midwest, social studies lessons usually begin in pre-school and continue until the sixth grade.

In this study, conducted in Turkey, social studies textbooks, recommended by the Turkish Ministries of Education, were selected.

Procedures

The textbooks were analyzed through “content analysis”, a qualitative research method frequently used in this type of studies. The main purpose in content analysis is to attain concepts and connections, which can serve to explain the collected data (Miller, 1997; Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2005). Content analysis is one of the fastest-growing technique in quantitative research. It may be briefly defined as the systematic, objective, quantitative analysis of message characteristics (Neuendorf, 2002, Cited in, Aslan, 2011). In the study, “Human Rights Education ” was taken as the analysis category, and this main category was divided into six subcategories as “Rights”, “Freedom”, “Democracy” , “Justice”, Tolerance” and “Peace” in accordance with Karaman – Kepenekçi ’s (1999b) classification. These subcategories were defined in the present analysis as follows (Karaman – Kepenekçi, 1999b):

- **Rights:** Benefits protected by law. Rights are divided into rights like civil, political, social.
- **Freedom:** Restriction and non-coercion, independent movement, having the power to do anything that is allowed by independence, sovereignty, and law.
- **Democracy:** People are self-directed. In other words, power is governed by elected representatives through a free and fair electoral system by the people.
- **Justice:** To be fair, to comply with the right, to punish the offender and to ensure that the managers act in accordance with the blood, honesty and dispute resolution.
- **Tolerance:** To show tolerance, to be respectful of differences, not to apply force or pressure, to have compromise and forgiveness
- **Peace:** co-existence, regular and peaceful living, safe environment, conflict resolution, anarchy, aggression, fraternity, social unity, irregularity or lack of tension".

In generating the inter-rater reliability of the content areas of interest, two subcategories and a textbook were arbitrarily selected and coded by the co-authors of the paper (namely the 'Rights' and 'Tolerance' subcategories and 'Turkish Textbook 5'). A consistency with an average of 85.5% was generated, implying good inter-rater reliability (Hall & Houten, 1983). All of the material, inclusive of poems, readings, and comprehension passages in the textbooks were assessed. However, the table of contents, chronology, bibliography, glossary, pictures, photos, maps, and graphics were not excluded in the coding process.

When examining the textbooks, a 'sentence' was chosen as the unit of analysis. Then, the frequency of subcategories was recorded for each sentences. To determine the total number of words in the texts, each word was counted individually and, accordingly, the values of the subcategories within the textbooks are expressed as percentage, frequency, and intensity values in the tables.

In order to find out the approximate total word number in each textbook, the remaining number of pages has been calculated and then multiplied by an average number of words on a page. The average number of words on a page was determined by calculating the average number of words from the three pages chosen randomly from the beginning, middle, and end of each textbook. The values of categories in the textbooks have been indicated in the tables as frequency, percentage, and intensity values. Coding was done by the researcher. For each textbook, the subcategory percentages and the subcategory intensity scores were obtained using the formulas given below (Aslan & Karaman- Kepenekçi, 2008; Karaman – Kepenekçi, 1999b, 2005):

Subcategory frequency

$$\text{Subcategory percentage} = \frac{\text{Subcategory frequency}}{\text{Total frequency of all subcategories}} \times 100$$

Subcategory frequency

$$\text{Subcategory intensity score} = \frac{\text{Subcategory frequency}}{\text{Total word number of the texts}} \times 1000$$

Due to small values in the original calculation, the intensity scores of all subcategories were multiplied by 1000 in order to avoid complications while interpreting. This modified operation on intensity scores was merely a matter of convenience.

Findings

Analysis of the Turkish Social Studies Textbooks

The TT-4 Textbooks

There are eight units that are found in the TT-4 Textbook; these include: “I Know Myself”, “I Am Learning My Past”, “We Live in a Place”, “From Production to Consumption”, “Lucky to Have”, “All Together”, “People and Government”, and “Friends Away From Home”. At the beginning of each unit under the “Preparatory Work” heading are a few “Prep Questions” that are specific to the unit content, while toward the end of each unit are “Assessment Questions”. In addition, the last pages of the textbooks typically include a Chronology, Bibliography, Glossary, Turkey Map, and Turkish World Map.

Table 1. Dissemination of all of the subcategories in Turkish social studies textbooks according to frequency (f), percentage (%), and intensity score (IS)

SUBCATEGORIES		THE TURKISH SOCIAL STUDENTS TEXTBOOKS			
		TT4 (21.750)*	TT5 (24.100)*	TT6 (27.245)*	TOTAL
Rights	f	170	280	320	770
	%	40.6	47.7	44.9	44.8
	IS	7.8	11.7	11.7	31.1
Freedom	f	45	48	95	188
	%	10.7	8.2	13.3	10.9
	IS	2.1	2.0	3.5	7.6
Democracy	f	130	125	144	399
	%	31.0	21.3	20.2	23.3
	IS	6.0	5.2	5.3	16.5
Justice	f	32	72	82	186
	%	7.6	12.3	11.5	10.8
	IS	1.5	3.0	3.0	7.5
Tolerance	f	24	34	36	94
	%	5.7	5.7	5.1	5.5
	IS	1.1	1.4	1.3	3.8
Peace	f	18	28	35	81
	%	4.3	4.8	4.9	4.7
	IS	0.8	1.2	1.3	3.3
TOTAL	f	419	587	712	1718
	%	100	100	100	100
	IS	19.3	24.4	26.1	69.8

*Total number of words in textbook

As can be seen in Table 1, the subcategories of “Rights” (7.8) and “Democracy” (6.0) have the highest intensity scores in this TT-4 textbook. These are the highest, followed by the subcategory of “Freedom” (2.0); the lowest intensity scores respectively include the “Justice” (1.5), “Tolerance” (1.1) and “Peace” (0.8) subcategories, with all three possessing fairly similar intensity ratios.

The lists below are some examples of statements for some categories in the textbooks:

- *Mrs. Gulden did a survey about consumer rights. She learned that the official and voluntary organizations have protected the rights of the consumer. She applied to one of these associations (TT4, p92).*
- *Our people gain the right to participate in management thanks to the elections. After the votes for the election are counted, the candidate with the most votes is selected as mayor (TT4, p151).*
- *Children's council elections are made by taking into account the principles of democracy. Each child who applies for the children's council candidacy is admitted as "the candidate child". To select the children's council, the names of four children are written into the voting records. Votes are counted in front of everyone at the end of the election. Candidates who get the most votes are selected to the children's council. (TT4, p157).*
- *Today, the Parliament (Grand National Assembly of Turkey) has 550 deputies. Members of the Parliament who are elected with the public's votes express their views and opinions in the Parliament related to our country. Everyone expresses their opinions in a democratic atmosphere (TT4, p161).*

The TT-5 Textbooks

There are eight units that are found in the TT-5 textbook; these include: "I Am Learning My Rights", "Turkey Step by Step", "We Know Our Region", "Our Products", "To Realize Dreams", "The Employees for Society", "A Country, A Flag", "We Are One World" Similarly, as in TT-4 textbooks, there are "Prep Questions" and "Assessment Questions" at the beginning and end of each unit, respectively. Again, there was a Chronology, Bibliography, Glossary, Turkey Map, and Turkish World Map located near the end of the textbook.

As can be seen in Table 1, the subcategories of "Rights" (11.7) and "Democracy" (5.2) have the highest intensity scores in this TT-5 textbook. These are the highest, followed by the subcategory of "Justice" (3.0), while "Freedom" (2.0), "Tolerance" (1.4), and "Peace" (1.2), respectively had the lowest intensity scores, again with close intensity ratio magnitudes.

In the list below are some examples of statements for some categories in the textbooks:

- *The state works for the nation and the nation's peace... the populism principle is based on national sovereignty for the nation, that is, democracy is based on the principle of populism. Atatürk, on this subject, says: "Our view is that the dominance of populism in the administration is to give directly to the public (TT5, p46).*
- *The republic of Turkey is a democratic, secular, and social state governed by the rule of law, bearing in mind the concepts of public peace, national solidarity, and justice; respecting human rights; ... (TT5, p149).*
- *The 1961 Constitution has expanded the scope of fundamental rights and freedoms (TT5, p149).*
- *The citizens started to use their democratic rights and to select rulers of the country (TT5, p150).*

The TT-6 Textbooks

There are seven units that are found in the TT-6 Textbook. They are: “I Am Learning Social Studies”, “Life on Earth”, “Turks on the Ipek Road”, “Resources of Our Country”, “Our Country and World”, “Adventure of Democracy”, and “Electronic Century “. At the beginning of each topic or issue and under the heading of Preparatory Work, according to the unit, there are a few “Prep Questions” and, at the end of each unit are “Assessment Questions”. In addition, at the end of the textbook, there is a Chronology, Bibliography, Glossary, Turkey Map, and Turkish World Map.

As can be seen in Table 1, the subcategories of “Rights” (11.7) and “Democracy” (5.3) display the highest intensity scores. These two subcategories are highest, followed by the subcategories of ‘freedom’ (3.5), ‘Justice’ (3.0), and ‘tolerance’ and ‘peace’ (1.3).

The list below includes some examples of statements for some categories in the textbooks:

- *Our King, to develop our country's trade and to protect our rights, further solidified the laws of the Babylonian ruler Hammurabi. (TT6, p52).*
- *“I'm the king of Babylon, Hammurabi, and did not find the legal rules of the Sumerians sufficient. I developed them, increased penalties, and prepared the first constitution” (TT6, p51).*
- *The Great Seljuk Sultan says, “everyone should search for the laws and judgments of all orders in the past, of the Seljuk sultans, and others (TT6, p88).*
- *I know that I have the right to vote and be elected. (TT6, p161)*

Analysis of the United States Social Studies Textbooks

The UST-4 Textbooks

There are eight units that are found in the TT-4 Textbook, namely: “A View of the United States”, “The Northeast”, “The South”, “The Middle West”, “The West”, and “The United States Today.” Just as in the TT textbooks, at the beginning of each unit is a Preparatory Work section with a few “Prep Questions” pertaining to the content within the unit and, at the end of each unit, are “Assessment Questions”. *In addition, at the end of the textbook, there is an Almanac (Facts About the United States, Facts About the States, Facts About the President), a Biographical Dictionary, Gazetteer, Glossary, and Index.*

Table 2. Dissemination of all the subcategories In the United States social studies textbooks according to frequency (f), percentage (%) and intensity score (IS)

SUBCATEGORIES		THE UNITED STATES TEXTBOOKS			
		UST4 (111.050)*	UST5 (150.450)*	UST6 (144.100)*	TOTAL
Rights	f	120	480	300	900
	%	29.7	37.7	42.7	37.8
	IS	1.1	3.2	2,1	6.4
Freedom	f	68	300	150	518
	%	16.8	23.5	21.3	21.8
	IS	0.6	2.0	1.1	3.7
Democracy	f	82	220	110	412
	%	20.3	17.3	15.6	17.3
	IS	0.7	1.2	0.8	2.7
Justice	f	69	200	100	369
	%	17.1	15.7	14.2	15.5

	IS	0.6	1.3	0.7	2.6
	f	22	32	15	69
Tolerance	%	5.5	2.5	2.2	2.9
	IS	0.2	0.2	0.1	0.5
	f	43	42	28	113
Peace	%	10.6	3.3	4.0	4.7
	IS	0.4	0.3	0.2	0.9
	f	404	1274	703	2381
TOTAL	%	100	100	100	100
	IS	3.6	8.4	4.8	16.8

*Total number of words in textbook

As can be seen in Table 2, the category of “Rights” (1.1) has the highest intensity score in this UST-4 textbook. This subcategory is highest, followed by the subcategory of “Democracy” (0.7); the lowest intensity scores respectively were found in “Freedom” and “Justice” (0.6), “Peace” (0.4), and “Tolerance” (0.2), with these subcategories having quite close intensity ratios.

The list below includes some examples of statements for some categories in the textbooks:

- *Like all Quakers, Penn believed that problems should be solved peacefully. He signed a treaty with the Native Americans to buy land..(UST4, p128).*
- *Some colonists used newspaper and printed pamphlets to protest, or speak out against, the taxes. Others refused to buy British good. Some colonists even began to talk about independence, or the freedom to themselves. ..(UST4, p130).*
- *The Constitution makes the United States a republic, a form of government in which the people elect representatives to govern the country. The Constitution also describes the rights that people in the United States have. Everyone must obey the Constitution – leaders and citizens alike.... ..(UST4, p467).*
- *The law gave women the right to vote. This was one the first victories in the fight for women’s suffrage or the right to vote, in the United States. ..(UST4, p138)*

The UST-5 Textbooks

There are eight units found in the UST-5 textbook; they include: “The Land and Early People”, “Time of Encounters”, “The English Colonies”, “The American Revolution”, ‘A New Nation”, “Civil War Times”, “The Twentieth Century”, and “The United States and the World”. As before, at the beginning of each unit are “Prep Questions” pertaining to the content within the unit and at the end unit of each are “Assessment Questions”. *In addition, at the end of the textbook, there is an Almanac (Facts About the States, Facts About the Western Hemisphere, Facts About the President), American Documents (The Declaration of Independence, The Constitution of the United States of America, The National Anthem, The Pledge of Allegiance), a Biographical Dictionary, Gazetteer, Glossary, and Index..*

As can be seen in Table 2, the subcategories of “Right” (3.2) and “Freedom” (2.0) have the highest intensity scores in this TTSS-5 textbook. These subcategories are the highest, followed by the subcategories of “Justice” (1.3) and “Democracy” (1.2). The lowest intensity scores, respectively, are “Peace” (0.3) and “Tolerance” (0.2).

The list below includes some examples of statements for some categories in the textbooks:

- *Africans had long used prisoners of war as slaves. Traders from Portugal saw that they could make Money by buying slaves in Africa and taking them to Europe to sell as servants. (UST5, p138).*
- *Slaves were treated ill or cruelly depending on their owners. There was little protection...also slave owners were free to beat, whip, or insult any slave as often as they chose to do so..(UST5, p246).*
- *Many people consider Crispus Attucks the first person to be killed in the struggle for American Liberty. (UST5, p285)*
- *In 1827 two free African Americans, Samuel Cornish and John Russwurm, started a newspaper that called for equality, or equal rights, for all Americans.(UST5, p448).*

The UST-6 Textbooks

The eight units found in the UST-6 Textbook are titled as the following: “The World and Early People”, “Early Centers of Civilization”, “Eastern Civilizations”, “Western Civilizations” “The Rise of Later Civilizations”, “The Spread of Civilizations”, “The Early Modern World,” and “Toward the Present Day”. At the beginning of each topic or issue and under the heading of Preparatory Work, according to the unit, there are a few “Prep Questions”, and at the end of each unit are “Assessment Questions”. In addition, at the end of the textbook, there is an Almanac (Facts About the World), a Biographical Dictionary, Gazetteer, Glossary, and Index..

As can be seen in Table 2, the subcategories of “Rights” (2.1) and “Freedom” (2.1) have the highest intensity scores in this TT-6 textbook. These are followed by the subcategory of “Freedom” (2.0); the lowest intensity scores, respectively, are “Justice” (1.5), “Tolerance” (1.1), and “Peace” (0.8). These subcategories have quite close intensity ratios.

The list below includes some examples of statements for some categories in the textbooks:

- *In a democracy people are free to make choices about their lives and their government. They often make their choices by voting. ..(UST6, p140)*
- *More reforms in 508 B.C. made the Athenian city-state into the world’s first democracy. (UST6, p253).*
- *To make sure that peaceful relations are maintained around the world, the United States sometimes makes treaties or forms alliances with other countries. (UST6, p435).*
- *The United States can sometimes help countries around the world find peaceful solutions to their conflicts. If negotiations fail, however, the United States must sometimes use its military strength to help restore peace... (UST6, p545)*

Discussion and Conclusion

Social studies textbooks play an important role in human rights education. As I mentioned in the introduction recently, a number of studies were conducted that showed the level of allocation of human rights education in elementary and high school textbooks. However, the level of allocation of human rights education in social studies textbooks has not been examined directly yet. As it can be seen, there is only research about human rights education issues in social studies textbooks in Turkey. For example, Karaman – Kepenekçi (2003) examined the level of human rights and responsibility

education in primary school. On the other hand, the level of allocation to human rights issues in United States social studies textbooks has yet to be examined.

In this comparison study, Turkish and United States textbooks are analyzed in terms of their level of “human rights education issues,” in accordance with Karaman-Kepenekci’s subcategories. Accordingly, the first remarkable finding is that the number of human rights education references in Turkish textbooks is much more frequent than in United States textbooks. This finding is not surprising, since similar results were previously found, for example a study conducted by Karaman – Kepenekçi (2005), in which she examined Turkish and United States textbooks and a study by Aslan & Karaman – Kepenekçi (2008), in which they examined Turkish and French textbooks about human rights education reached similar conclusions. In Meray (2012)’s study on “Inclusion Level of Children Rights Issues in Social Studies Textbooks: (Case of Turkey and USA)”, it was observed that children rights issues were included more in Turkish textbooks. Also, Parpuci & Meray (2012)’s comparison study, titled “children rights in social studies curricula in elementary education: A comparative study” Turkish social studies curriculum was found to include children’s rights more than USA curriculum does. This situation results most likely from primary education curricula. Primary curricula have been implemented in Turkey since the 2004- 2005 scholastic year, when it was implemented in primary school. Inclusion of the human rights issue in each textbook as an intermediary discipline was accepted as a principle; in other words, human rights education issues are interspersed in primary education curricula (Aslan & Karaman-Kepenekçi, 2008; Ceyhan & Yiğit 2004; Primary National Education Program, 2005). This situation about human rights topics is explained in the introduction to the primary educational curricula.

The primary educational curriculum stated that:

‘Curricula attach importance to the improved awareness regarding human rights. Personal inviolability, which is accepted as the essential human right within the philosophical and practical context, takes free-thinking rights, rights for the security of rights, social and economic rights and political rights into consideration. Besides, the curricula do not allow for discrimination against differences such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, nation, origins, political views, social class and physical/mental health states of persons.’ (Ministry of National Education, 2005, Cited in, Aslan & Karaman- Kepenekçi, 2008).

We find a notable increase in human rights emphases in textbooks in the period since 1995. The change is associated with the rise of more internationalized perspectives and with the relative increase of human rights issues in the curriculum (compared with former textbooks). In the most recent period, it seems to be associated with the rising student-centrism of textbooks and curricula.

As mentioned before, the intensity scores for the human rights issue in Turkish social studies textbooks are higher than in the United States social studies textbooks. Reasons for the lesser inclusion of human rights education in United States textbooks may be summarized as follows: First, the most important reason results from The United States Constitution’s positive influence. All people’s fundamental rights and freedoms are guaranteed in Amendments to the Constitution. In other words, the rights of freedom of speech, freedom of the press, peaceful assembly, and petitioning the government are guaranteed by the First Amendment of the U.S. Constitution. Provisions are stipulated for legal redress of grievance for untruthful information and malicious intent. This situation gives a person the power to influence others, make better decisions, and exert control in his or her life (Sunal & Haas, 2005).

Students are introduced to the Constitution of the United States as a part of the fifth-grade social studies curriculum in United States elementary schools. Many teachers incorporate the Constitution into their teaching and curriculum long before the fifth grade, but it is generally in this grade that children are helped to read and interpret the Constitution. This is an important moment in the political socialization of the next generation (Parker, 2005). In primary schools, a paraphrased version of the Constitution is usually included in fifth-grade textbooks. It contains all of the parts, for

example, the preamble, the 7 articles containing the rules by which citizens agree to live, and 27 changes or additions (amendments).

The United States Constitutions said that:

We, the people of the United States, in order to form a more perfect union, establish justice, insure domestic tranquility, provide for the common defense, promote the general welfare, and secure the blessing of liberty to ourselves and our posterity, do ordain and establish this constitution for United States of America (Parker, 2005).

The second reason why human rights issues are not taught directly in social studies textbooks in elementary schools is because the human rights issue is taught in Civics and Government courses. In the United States, citizenship education goals are that students become committed to the democratic form of government and rights and responsibilities (Chapin & Messick, 2002). This subject about the fundamentals of representative democracy is planned chiefly for civics and American government courses taught at the high-school. The lessons associated with core topics which are regarded as the basis for center of American government and its politics. Initially, the learners get the basic of freedoms and rights in the schools of the United States today. Then, these individuals try to get an insight as to how political and personal rights established by the Constitution, which may either strengthen or conflict with economic rights and freedoms. Lastly, the learners scrutinize the Bill of Rights. Accordingly, they familiarize themselves to state standards for civics and government. General standards on civics/government education said that:

Students understand the ideal, rights, and responsibility of citizenship, and content, sources, and history of the founding documents of the United States, with particular emphasis on the constitution and how the government punctuations at the local, state, national' and international level (Chapin & Messick, 2002) .

It was observed that in the textbooks of both countries, the 'Rights' subcategory was included in the most textbooks. The result was consistent with previous research findings (Karaman-Kapenekçi, 1999). In the study by Karaman-Kepenekçi (1999)'s on high school textbooks and in Aslan & Karaman-Kepenekçi (2008)'s "Human Rights Education: A Comparison of Mother Tongue Textbooks in Turkey and France," the intensity score of the 'Rights' subcategories in high school textbooks was found to be much higher than other subcategories, but, when we examined the intensity scores, the subcategory "Rights" in Turkish textbooks in Turkey was determined to be higher than in the United States textbooks.

An interesting unexpected finding is that the intensity scores for the subcategories of "Democracy", "Freedom", and "Justice" in Turkish social studies textbooks are higher than in United States textbooks. This result is not consistent with Karaman – Kepenekçi (2005)'s citizenship textbook study involving intensity scores for "Democracy," which was concluded to be higher in Turkish textbooks. Also, it is not consistent with these textbooks' context and chapters, because the United States textbooks focus on the United States' history of democracy and freedom, and there are numerous examples that examine human rights and democracy in context. When studying texts, for instance: "Bill of Rights" (UST 5, P. 351), "Slavery and Freedom" (UST 5, P. 444), "Working for Equal Rights" (UST 5, P.585), and "Our Country's Government" (UST 4, P.465), in this situation, the United States social studies textbooks need to explain the human rights issue so that students will read about issues and events. They know those issues and events may affect various people, including themselves. Students should be enabled to understand the debate and arguments' conflicting

perspectives if they are to know how issues and events are connected with certain rights or multiple categories of rights.

Another important finding is that the intensity scores for the subcategories of “Tolerance “and “Peace” in Turkish textbooks were concluded to be higher than in the United States textbooks. Furthermore, in both Turkish and United States textbooks, “Tolerance” and “Peace” comes at the very end of the textbooks. Although these subcategories do not hold a prominent place in the textbooks of both countries, they are found more often in Turkish social studies textbooks. For instance, when studying texts related to peace and tolerance, “Peace and Tranquility” (TT 5, P.180), “Tourism and Peace” (TT 5, P.180), and “World Children” (TT 5, P.168) were found in Turkish textbooks. This case may also be associated with the positive opinion about Ataturk and Mevlana. In fact, Turkish social studies textbooks frequently refer to Ataturk’s “Peace at home, peace in the world” statement and Mevlana’s tolerance approach; both often emphasize that peace and tolerance is very important for people, society, and the world we live in. This result was consistent with previous research findings (Aslan & Karaman-Kepenekçi, 2008).

As a result, in this comparative study when the sum of the dissemination of all of the subcategories according to intensity score, it was observed that human rights issues were included more frequently mentioned in Turkish textbooks (69.8) than in United States textbooks (16.8). The study showed that Turkish textbooks and United States textbooks contained the “rights” subcategory the most. While the intensity scores of the “democracy,” “freedom,” and “judgment” subcategories were listed the highest in both countries’ textbooks, on the other hand, the intensity scores of the “tolerance” and “peace” subcategories were placed last in the textbooks of both countries.

References

- Aycan, S., Kaynar, Ü., Türkoguz, H., & Arı, E. (2003). İlköğretimde Kullanılan Fen Bilgisi Ders Kitaplarının Bazı Kriterlere Göre Değerlendirilmesi Manisa: Celal Bayar Üniversitesi, Eğitim Fakültesi,
- Aycan, S., Kaynar, Ü., Türkoguz, H., & Arı, E. (2001) *Analysis of Science Textbooks use in Primary Education according to Certain Criteria* (in Turkish). Paper presented at the Science Education Symposium (in Turkish), 16-18 September 2002, Ankara, Turkey.
- Aslan. C. & Karaman-Kepenekçi, Y. (2008). Human Rights Education: A Comparison of Mother Tongue Textbooks in Turkey and France, *Mediterranean Journal of Educational Studies*, Vol. 13 (1), p101-124, 2008.
- Aslan, C. (2011). High Level Thinking Education in Mother Tongue Textbooks In Turkey and France, *The Journal of International Social Research*, Cilt: 4 Sayı: 16 Volume: 4 Issue: 16.
- Babbio, N. (1996). *The Age of Rights*, Polity Press.
- Bajaj, M. (2011). Teaching to transform, transforming to teach: exploring the role of teachers in human rights education in India *Educational Research*, Vol. 53 Issue 2, p207-221.
- Bajaj, M. (2004). Human rights education student self-conception in the Dominican Republic. *Journal of Peace Education*, 1, p1–16.
- Balton, D. A. (1992, April–May). Human rights in the classroom: Teaching the convention on the rights of the child. *Social Education*, p210–212.
- Bayrakçi, M. (2005). Ders Kitabı Konusu ve İlköğretimde Ücretsiz Ders Kitabı Dağıtım Projesi, *MEB Dergisi*, Sayı: 165. Ankara,

- Bottery, M. (1999). Getting the balance right: Duty as a core ethic in the life of the school. *Oxford Review of Education*, 25(3), p369–387.
- Branson, M. S., & Purta, J. T. (1982). Introduction. In M. S. Branson & J. T. Purta (Eds.), *International human rights, society and the schools* (p1–7). Silver Spring, MD: National Council for the Social Studies Bulletin, 6.
- Carey, J. (1970). UN Protection of Civil and Political Rights, Syracuse University Press.
- Ceyhan, E., & Yigit, B. (2004) *Subject Field Textbook Analysis* (in Turkish). Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık.
- Chapin J. R & Messick R. G. (2002). Elementary Social Studies -Practical Guide- A person Education Company, Boston.
- Coşkun, H. (1996) Content problems of Turkish and German textbooks of primary education second level within the context of education technology and intercultural education. In H. Coskun, I. Kaya & J. Kuglin (eds.) *Primary Education Textbooks in Turkey and in Germany* (in Turkish). Ankara: Türk-Alman Kültür İşleri Kurulu Yayın Dizisi.
- Chaurasia, S. (2000). *Empowerment of Women, Human Rights Education*, (Ed.: Jagannath Mohanty), Deep & Deep Publications PVT. LTD.
- Cladue, R. P. (1996). Educating For Human Rights *the Philippines and Beyond*, University of the Philippines Press
- Çayır, K. (2003). Improvement of human rights and democracy culture: writing textbooks. In M. T. Bağlı & Y. Esen (eds.) *Human Rights in Textbooks: For Textbooks that are Sensitive to Human Rights* (in Turkish). Istanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yayınları
- Çayır, K. & Bağlı, M. T. (2011). 'No-one respects them anyway': secondary school students' perceptions of human rights education in Turkey, *Intercultural Education*, Vol. 22 Issue 1, p1-14.
- Shiman, D. (1991). *Teaching Human Rights Classroom Activities For Global Age*. 'The Challenge of Human Rights Education' (Ed: Hugh Starkey) Council of Europe.
- Davies, L. (2010). The potential of human rights education for conflict prevention and security, *Intercultural Education*, Vol. 21 Issue 5, p463-471.
- Donnelly, J. & Howard. R. (1994), *International Handbook of Human Rights*, Greenwood Press New York.
- Diaz, B. (2005). The Concept of Human Rights In the Cuban Society, Ed: Deppe Karlsson, *Human Rights an Anthological Enquiry*.
- Donnelly, J. (1989) *Universal Human Rights in Theory and Practice* (translated by M. Erdogan & L. Korkut). Ankara: Yetkin Yayınları.
- Drubay, A. (1986). Educational aims, content and methods in secondary education. In R. T. Harris & C. Hahn (Eds.), *The teaching of contemporary world issues* (p67–90). Paris: United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO).
- Evans, T. (2005). *The Politics of Human Rights a Global Perspective*' Prute Press . Ellis, A. K. (2002). *Teaching and Learning Elementary Social Studies*, A Pearson Education Company, Boston USA.

- Eide, A. (1983). Dynamics of Human Rights and the Role of the Educator. *Bulletin of Peace Proposals*.14 (1): 105 114
- Falk, R. (2004). Interpreting the Interaction of Global Markets and Human Rights, (Ed: Alison Brysk),
- Freeman, M. (2011). *Human Rights An Interdisciplinary Approach*, Polity Press, USA.
- Gemalmaz, S. (2001) *Introduction to the General Theory of Supranational Human Rights Law* (in Turkish). Istanbul: Beta.
- Guyette, F. W. (2009). Human rights education and religious education: from mutual suspicion to elective affinity. *British Journal of Religious Education*, Mar2009, Vol. 31 Issue 2, p129-139,
- Gülmez, M. (2001) *Human Rights and Democracy Education* (in Turkish). Ankara: TODAIE.
- Hall, R. V., & Houten, R. V. (1983) *Managing Behavior, Behavior Modification: The Measurement of Behavior*. Austin: Pro-ed.
- History Foundation (2003) *Human Rights in Textbooks: For Textbooks that are Sensitive to Human Rights* (in Turkish). Turkey. Istanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yayınları.
- Holland, T. (2011). Advancing Human Rights Education in Peacebuilding *Peace Review*, Jan-Mar2011, Vol. 23 Issue 1, p86-93.
- Hornberg, S. (2002). Human rights education as an integral part of general education. *International Review of Education*, 48(3/4), p187–198.
- Ishay, M. R. (2004). *The History of Human Rights From Ancient Times To the Globalization Era*, University of California Press.
- Karaman-Kepenekçi, Y. (1999b) *Human Rights Education in Turkish High Schools* (in Turkish). PhD thesis, Institute of Social Sciences, Ankara University, Turkey.
- Karaman-Kepenekçi, Y. (2000) *Human Rights Education* (in Turkish). Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık.
- Karaman-Kepenekçi (2003) Human rights and responsibility education in primary education (in Turkish), *Educational Administration in Theory and Practice*, Vol. 34, p280-299. 122.
- Karaman-Kepenekci, Y. (2005) Citizenship and human rights education: a comparison of textbooks in Turkey and the United States, *International Journal of Educational Reform*, Vol. 14(1), p73-88.
- Karaman Kepenekci, Y. (2010b). Children's social rights in social studies textbooks in Turkish elementary education, *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, p576-581.
- Karaman-Kepenekçi, Y. (1998). Etkili insan hakları eğitiminde öğretmenlerin rolü [The role of teachers in effective human rights education]. *Bilgi Çağında Öğretmenimiz Sempozyumu* (Ankara), p61–68.
- Karaman-Kepenekçi, Y. (1999a). İnsan hakları eğitiminde okul ve sınıf havasının rolü [The role of school and classroom climate in effective human rights education]. *Kuram ve Uygulamada Eğitim Yönetimi*, 19, p353–361.

- Karaman-Kepenekçi, Y., & Gokce, E. (2000). Vatandaşlık ve insan hakları eğitimi dersinin genel ve özel amaçları ile hedef davranışları üzerine bir inceleme [A review of aims and behavioral objectives of civics and human rights education course]. *Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Fakültesi Dergisi*, 33, p147–153.
- Karaman-Kepenekci, Y. (2009) Children’s Right to Acquire Information and Be Protected from Injurious Publications in Textbooks, *Elementary Education Online*, 8(3), p965-977.
- Karaman-Kepenekci, Y. (2010a). An Analysis on Children's Rights in Stories Recommended for Children in Turkey, *Journal of Peace Education*, vol. 7, p65-83.
- Karaman-Kepenekçi, Y. & Aslan, C.(2011). *Okul Öncesi Döneme Seslenen Kitaplarda Çocuk Hakları*, Ankara Üniveritesi Çocuk ve Gençlik Edebiyatı Uygulama ve Araştırma Merkezi Eğitim, Araştırma ve İnceleme Dizisi –I-
- Kerr, D. & Keating, A. (2011). Intercultural, citizenship and human rights education: the challenges of implementation for policy, practice and research *Educational Research*, Vol. 53 Issue 2, p119-122.
- Kilic, D. (2005). Ders Kitabının Öğretimdeki Yeri, Konu Alanı Ders Kitabı İncelenmesi, Ankara: Pegem Yayınları
- Leung, Y. W. (2008). An ‘action-poor’ human rights education: a critical review of the development of human rights education in the context of civic education in Hong Kong *Intercultural Education*, Jun 2008, Vol. 19 Issue 3, p231-242.
- Leung, Y. W., Yuen, T. W. W., Chong, Y. (2011). School-based human rights education: case studies in Hong Kong secondary schools *Intercultural Education*, Apr 2011, Vol. 22, Issue 2, p145-162.
- Lapayese, Y. V. (2002). *The Work of Human Rights Educators: Critical Pedagogy in Action*, University of California,
- Lucas, A. G. (2009). Teaching about Human Rights in the Elementary Classroom Using the Book *A Life Like Mine: How Children Live around the World* *Social Studies*, Vol. 100, Issue 2, p79-84.
- Lenhart, V., & Savolainen, K. (2002). Human rights education as a field of practice and theoretical reflection. *International Review of Education*, 48(3/4), p145–158.
- MEB (2005). Primary National Education Program,
- Merey, Z. (2012a). Inclusion Level of Children Rights Issues in Social Studies Textbooks: (Case of Turkey and USA), *Erken Çocukluk Dönemi Eğitimi Küresel Sorunları ve Çocuk Hakları Uluslararası Konferansı, Zirve Universtitesi, Gaziantep, 27-29- Nisan 2012*.
- Merey, Z. (2012b). Political Rights in Social Studies Textbooks in Turkish Elementary Education, *4th World Conference on Educational Sciences, WCES, 2012, 02-05 February 2012, University of Barcelona, Barcelona, Spain*.
- Nayir, F. & Karaman Kepenekci, Y. (2011). Children’s Participation Rights in Elementary Schools’ Turkish Textbooks, *Elementary Education Online*, 10(1), p160-168.
- Meyer, J. W., Bromley, P. & Ramirez, F. O. (2010). Human Rights in Social Science Textbooks: Cross-national Analyses, 1970–2008 *Sociology of Education*, Vol. 83 Issue, 2p111-134.

- Ministry of National Education.(2005). *Primary Education Social Studies Educational Curriculum and Guide*. Ankara: Devlet Kitapları Müdürlüğü Basımevi.
- Ministry of National Education .(2005). *Primary Education Educational Curriculum and Guide*. Ankara: Devlet Kitapları Müdürlüğü Basımevi.
- Miller, G. (1997). Introduction: Context and method in qualitative research. In G. Miller & R. Dingwall (Eds.), *Context and method in qualitative research* Newbury Park, CA: Sage, p1–11.
- Mohanty, J. (2000). *Human Rights Education*, Deep & Deep Publications PVT. LTD.
- National Council for the Social Studies. (1994). *Curriculum guidelines for multiethnic education*. Washington, DS: Author.
- Nazzari, V., McAdams, P., Roy, D. (2005). Using transformative learning as a model for human rights education: a case study of the Canadian Human Rights Foundation’s International Human Rights Training Program *Intercultural Education*, Vol. 16 Issue 2, p171-186.
- NCSS (1994). *National Council for the social studies: Expectations of excellence, National curriculum standards for social studies*. Washington, D.C.: NCSS
- Neuendorf, K. A. (2002). *The Content Analysis Guidebook*, London: Sage Publications
- Parker, W.C. (2005). *Social Studies in Elementary Education*, Pearson Prentice Hall, United States.
- Parpucu, H. and Merey, Z. (2012). Children rights in social studies curricula in elementary education: A comparative study. *Erken Çocukluk Dönemi Eğitimi Küresel Sorunları ve Çocuk Hakları Uluslararası Konferansı, Zirve Universtitesi, Gaziantep, 27-29- Nisan 2012*.
- Patrick, J. J. (1999). Concepts at the core of education for democratic citizenship. In C. F. Bahmueller & J. J. Patrick (Eds.), *Principles and Practices of Education for Democratic Citizenship* (p1–41). ERIC Document Reproductive Service.
- Preece, J. J. (2005). *Human Rights and Cultural Pluralism International Human Rights in the 21st Century*, Ed: Gene M, Lyons: (Protecting the Rights of Groups)
- Power, S., & Allison, G. (2000). *Realizing human rights moving from inspiration to impact*. London: Palgrave Macmillan
- Rendel, M .(1991) *Challenging Patriarchy and Hierarchy The Contribution of Human Rights Education to the Achievement of Equality for Woman*. ‘The Challenge of Human Rights Education’ (Ed: Hugh Starkey) Council of Europe.
- Savaş, B. (2004). *Türkçe ders kitaplarında insan hakları* [Human rights in Turkish textbooks in primary schools]. Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Basılmamış, yüksek lisans projesi.
- Safran, M. (2004). “İlköğretim Programlarında Yeni Yaklaşımlar Sosyal Bilgiler (4–5. Sınıf)”, *Bilim ve Aklın Aydınlığında Eğitim Dergisi*, Ankara: Yıl. 5, Sayı 54–55, MEB Yayınları
- Sezer, A. (2005). *Hayat Bilgisi ve Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretim Teknolojileri*, Hayat Bilgisi ve Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretimi (Ed:, Abdurrahman TANRIÖĞEN), İstanbul: Lisans Yayınları
- Starkey, H. (Ed.) .(1991). *The Challenge of Human Rights Education*. London: Cassell Educational Ltd

- Sunal, C. S. & Haas, M. E. (2005). *Social Studies (Constructivist Approach)*, A Pearson Education, United States.
- Tan, S. (2007). *Öğretimi Planlama ve Değerlendirme*, Ankara: Pegema Yayıncılık,
- Tarrow, N. B. (1987). *Human rights Education*. Oxford: Pergamon Press.
- Tezgel, R. (2006). *Yeni İlköğretim Sosyal Bilgiler Dersi Öğretim Programında İnsan Hakları ve Değer Eğitimi, II. Uygulamalı Etik Kongresi, 18–20 Ekim 2006, Orta Doğu Teknik Üniversitesi, Ankara.*
- Tibbits, F. (2002). Understanding what we can do: emerging models for human rights education, *International Review of Education*, Vol. 48(3-4), p159-171.
- Turner, T. N. (2004). *Essential of Elementary Social Studies*, Perason Education.
- UNESCO .(1969). Trends in teaching about human rights. In *Some Suggestions on Teaching about Human Rights*. Paris: Author.
- UNESCO .(1987). Human rights: an ethical and civic education for our time, *Human Rights Teaching*, Vol. 6, p175-184.
- UNESCO .(2007). *Basic Learning Materials*. Available online at: <http://www.unesco.org>
- Waldman, J. (2007). Best practice in human rights education: The SHR Sport and Human Rights Olympics Intercultural Education, Vol. 18 Issue 3, p265-268.
- Yıldırım, A., & Şimsek, H. (2005). *Qualitative Research Methods in Social Sciences* (in Turkish). Ankara: Seçkin Yayınevi.
- Yanpar Şahin, T. & Yildirim, S .(2001). *Öğretim Teknolojileri ve Materyal Geliştirme*, Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık.
- Vincent, A. (2010). *The Politics of Human Rights*, Oxford University Press.

APPENDIX A

The Textbooks used in this study

Turkish Textbooks

1. Koyuncu Kaya M.,Dag, O., Kocak, E., Yildirim, T., Unal, M. (2010). Primary School Social Studies Turkis Textbook 4 (in Turkish). (Ed, Ismail Hakki Demircioglu). Ankara: Milli Egitim Yayinlari.
2. Bafiol, S., Unal, F., Azer,H., Yildiz, A. & Evirgen, O. F. (2010). Primary School Social Studies Turkis Textbook 5 (in Turkish). (Ed, Ismail Hakki Demircioglu). Ankara: Milli Egitim Yayinlari.
3. Genc, E., Polat, M. M., Basol, S., Kaya, N., Azer, H., Gokce, S., Koyuncu, M., Gok, A., Yildiz, A., Yilmaz, D. & Ozcan, A. (2010). Primary School Social Studies Turkis Textbook 5 (in Turkish). (Ed, Mustafa Safran). Ankara: Milli Egitim Yayinlari.

The United States Textbooks

1. Bacon, P., Bencloski, J., Buggey, J., Cunha, S., Fournier, E., Frank, R., Hardwick, S., Lanegran, D., Kaminski, J.P., Mancke, E., Manson, G., Meyer, M., Miyares, I., McKibben, C., Raboteau, A. & Strong, W. A. (2005). *Primary School Social Studies United States Textbook 4*,(Ed:, Michael J. Berson), Harcourt School Publishers: Newyork.
2. Bacon, P., Deans-Smits, S., Nichols, R., Johnson, J.W., Kaminski, J.P., Mancke, E., Banner, J. M., Egbo, C., Patrick , J.J., Frank, R., Giesburg, J., McKibben, C. & Raboteau, A. A. (2005). *Primary School Social Studies United States Textbook 5*,(Ed:, Michael J. Berson), Harcourt School Publishers: Newyork.
3. Gerberding, R.A., Sack, R.H., Caulker, P.S., O'Connor, D., Bast, R., B.Champion, C.B., Ganz, m.a., Pierard, R., Reiter, K.D., Soergel, P.M., Treadgold, W., Matthew, R., Sabol, S., Chio, Y.J., Glosser, S., Peterson, M. & Talbot, Cynthia (2005). *Primary School Social Studies United States Textbook 6*,(Ed:, Michael J. Berson), Harcourt School Publishers: Newyork.