

Instructional Content Design on the Cultural Geographical History of Miniature Art

Merve Görkem Zeren-Akbulut

Ondokuz Mayıs University, Turkey,  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7704-4031>

Abstract: The third goal-achievement in the “Global Environment, Regions and Countries” unit of the 11th grade geography curriculum includes the goal-behavior of “To be able to analyze the spreading areas of Turkish culture in terms of regional characteristics”. In the geography curriculum rearranged by the Republic of Turkey Ministry of National Education in 2018, the recommended approach to be followed in gaining the stated goal-behavior is explained with the statement “The main tangible and intangible elements representing Turkish culture are presented in relation to the space through examples. With an approach that takes into account the context-based perspective suggested in the geography curriculum, this paper aims to support the acquisition of knowledge content and cognitive process dimensions and to develop instructional content to transform these dimensions into goal-behaviors of the goal-achievement of “To be able to explain the cultural geographical history of Turkish arts of printmaking and miniature in relation to space”. Based on the stated aims and arguments, firstly, the importance of Uighur painting art, which is known to have reached maturity between the 8th and 13th centuries with the empowerment of the classical style based on strong pattern drawings, has been evaluated in terms of the intra/intergenerational transmission of *intangible cultural heritage (ICH)* and art history. Later, the Uighur graphic style, which is known to continue the traces of the old Turkish traditions and its origins are based on rock paintings, in other words the Uyghur line element; it is interpreted in the context of the themes used in the dominant compositions in the spaces where the style finds living space. This research is a content analysis research built in qualitative research design. Content analysis is one of the techniques frequently used in research in social sciences. The literature document of the research consists of the geography curriculum and the research works prepared by using Chinese annuals and Western sources.

Keywords: UNESCO, Integrating ICH in cultural geography teaching, Miniature art, Analysis of educational objectives, Instructional content design

Introduction

Goal-achievements are the main determinants that form the starting point for content/experience, material, method, strategy and assessment-evaluation processes, which are among the other elements of the curriculum and guide the learning process. To define in detail all the dimensions of goal-achievements in order to realize

effective learning and to determine the level of realization of goal-achievements; it is very important to express it as observable and measurable behavioral changes (Demirel, 2020: 115-120). Context-based approach; it is an approach based on the association of goal-behaviors with real life, constructing them and thus becoming permanent (Ahmed and Pollitt, 2007: 204). When and particularly where did cultural elements, practices and beliefs arise? This question is intended to be explained in lesson programs developed with a context-based approach in the field of landscape geography teaching. In addition, other questions aimed to be answered are as follows: How did cultural elements, practices and beliefs spread to other areas over time and how did they change and be transmitted from the past to the present? The reason for adopting this approach which deals with the changes over time; it reveals cultural integration and cultural diffusion defined as the spatial expansion of ideas, practices and beliefs. Another reason for the adoption of this approach is that it provides an understanding of the spatial patterns reflected in the landscape that the cultural groups have shaped with the raw materials the world provides them. If the spatial similarities and variations in culture are to be understood and explained, it is necessary to go back to the past with a historical perspective in order to find the answers. Because culture is conditioned to time and it cannot be studied without a time dimension (Tümertekin and Özgüç, 2019: 121).

In this paper, within the framework of the historical analysis approach suggested to be followed in the implementation of the geography curriculum, it is aimed to support the teaching/acquiring of knowledge and value dimensions of the goal-achievement "To be able to explain the cultural geographical history of Turkish arts of printmaking and miniature by associating with space" and to develop an instructional content design to transform them into goal-behaviors. In line with the stated purpose, answers to the following questions were sought in this research:

1. Regarding the Uighur graphic style in which the traces of the old Turkish traditions are continued and whose origins are based on petroglyphs; what are the themes reflected in the dominant compositions in the spaces where the style is kept alive?
2. What are the behavioral definitions of the revised Bloom taxonomy categorized according to the dimensions of knowledge and cognitive processes of the third acquisition in the "Global Environment, Regions and Countries" unit of the 11th grade geography curriculum?
3. Which under sub-headings can be presented the instructional content design that support the acquisition of the knowledge and cognitive process dimensions of the third acquisition in the "Global Environment, Regions and Countries" unit of the 11th grade geography curriculum?
4. What is the importance of the intergenerational transmission of the living heritage represented by Uyghur arts of printmaking and miniature in terms of human heritage and art history?

Method

This section contains information about the approaches followed and the processes performed in the process of ensuring the validity and reliability of the literature document, which is used to form the research design and

express the theoretical and methodological background of this research.

Research Design and Procedures

This research is a content analysis research constructed with the historical analysis approach in qualitative research design. The process carried out in the content analysis approach includes the stages of organizing, analyzing, categorizing, evaluating through analytical notes and recording the data in the literature document (Marshall and Rossman, 2006: 156; Uysal, 2020: 162). In this research, it is aimed to examine the message, intention, motivation and experiences that are intended to be given in the literature document within a certain historical context during the content analysis process. In this sense, an approach that comes from the logic of historical analysis research, which looks at the cultural geographic past and refers to the socio-cultural background in the historical texts that constitute the basic data sources, has been followed. Historical analysis studies are not only aimed at discovering the past (Seixas and Morton, 2013: 4). Therefore, in this research, it is also aimed to relate the past with the present and the future.

Analysis of the Validity and Reliability of the Literature Document

In researches based on the analysis of the content of the historical document, it is very important to clearly define the research focus. Therefore, deciding which of the hundreds of documents and materials to be selected and used is an intense and complex process, and this decision has a critical value (Bowen, 2009: 28). In this context, in the first stage of the literature review, the perspective proposed for the acquisition of the third goal-achievement in the 11th grade geography curriculum rearranged by the Republic of Turkey Ministry of National Education (MOE, 2018) in the 2018-2019 academic year, was examined. With an approach that takes this point of view into consideration, the goal-behavior "To be able to explain the cultural geographic history of Turkish arts of printmaking and miniature by associating with space" was written in this research. Later, instructional content was designed to support the acquisition of knowledge and cognitive process dimensions of the written goal-behavior.

The fact that the academic works in the literature document are prepared in line with scientific principles, provide accurate information, represent the mentioned time and place at a high level, and are supported by evidence show that these works are reliable (Mohajan, 2018: 37). In the second stage of the literature review within the framework of the internal reliability study of the research, the research works prepared by using Western sources and Chinese annals written by expert researchers who have important contributions in the definition and development of the research subject in theoretical and methodological terms were determined. Then, the data obtained from the main works specified in the following stages were examined by critical reading method and categorized and evaluated for use in the registration stage. The data obtained from the basic works used as a source in the research provided information about the cultural geographical history of Turkish arts of printmaking and miniature for a long period of 20 000 years. In this context, the data obtained from the literature document contributed to the external validity of the study in terms of having a quality that provides

data to researchers who want to prepare similar instructional content designs in the category of longitudinal researches (Neale, 2021: 45-69).

Results

In this section, the results obtained during the research process are presented by categorizing them under subheadings. The results include the processes of writing behavioral definitions of goal-achievement in the knowledge and cognitive dimension categories selected as the analysis unit of this research and constructing the instructional content by using the source works that form the literature document to support the acquisition of written goal-behavior expressions.

Creating Behavioral Definitions of Goal-Achievement Written as Analysis Unit and Classification According to Its Knowledge and Cognitive Process Dimensions

The unit of analysis is defined as the concept analyzed in a scientific research and constitutes the starting point for the research process. Curriculums are among the most common units of analysis identified in qualitative research (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2016: 246, 296). The goal-achievement of "To be able to explain the cultural geographical history of Turkish arts of printmaking and miniature in relation to the space" has been determined as the analysis unit of this research. Then, behavioral definitions of goal-achievement, written as analysis unit of this research, were categorized according to the revised Bloom's taxonomy (Anderson and Krathwohl, 2001: 67-68). In the next stage, the instructional content was organized using the literature document to support the acquisition of the written goal-behaviors (Table 1-4).

Table 1. Classification of the Analysis Unit According to Factual Knowledge and Cognitive Dimensions

Knowledge Dimension	Remember	Understand	Apply	Analyze	Evaluate	Create
A. Factual Knowledge	Aa-1.1: She/he states that the oldest known printmaking art technique is the woodprint.	Aa-2.2: She/he gives examples of Pranidhi compositions which are known to be one of the most important religious themes of Uygur classical painting in period between 9th and 13th	Ab-3.2: She/he shows the phases of the Uygur painting style on the timeline.	Ab-4-2: She/he organizes the style of figurative works depicting humans and animals in the nomadic cultural environment of the Gok-Turk period under the titles of legendary mixed shapes, masks, pictograms,	Ab-5.2: She/he points out that Uygur artists make a significant effort to express reality in their paintings while the pre-Uygur artists of East Turkestan tended to portray important figures with a narrative	Ab-6.3: She/he illustrates the manuscripts forms used by the Uygurs by drawing a concept map.

centuries from the Murtuk Valley near Turfan.

large-scale figures drawn on the basis of the most characteristic lines, simplified in a style close to the pictogram, tamgas, syllables, half syllables and letters.

covered with fog.

Aa-1.1:She/he states that the pages and books known to be printed with wooden text patterns by the Uyгур Turks are accepted as the first examples of Turkish art of printmaking.

Aa-2.5:She/he concludes that the Uyгур culture originated from North Asia and was influenced by the Chinese and possibly the Tunguzes just before entering the Central Asian civilization.

Ab-4.3:She/he points out that religious beliefs had an impact on the origin and development of graphic arts.

Table 2. Classification of the Analysis Unit According to Conceptual Knowledge and Cognitive Dimensions

Knowledge Dimension	Remember	Understand	Apply	Analyze	Evaluate	Create
B. Conceptual Knowledge	Bc-1.1: She/he expresses that culture encompasses the characteristic mosaic of lifestyles and dominant belief systems of a group of people living in a specific place at a particular time.	Bc-2.1: She/he explains the concept of intangible cultural heritage as practices, representations, narratives, knowledge, skills and related tools, materials and cultural spaces that groups, communities and individuals define as part of their	Bc-3.2: She/he draws a semantic map at the center of the concept of cultural geographic history which provides important evidence about the changes in cultural traits over time.	Bc-4.1: She/he distinguishes the elements that have visible evidence in the cultural geographical view as tangible cultural heritages, and the invisible elements that give the cultural geographical appearance character as	Bc-5.2: She/he evaluates the effects of the landscape of Turfan, Kansu and Karaşar on the emergence of a new style in Uyğur painting.	Bc-6.3: She/he writes a composition about the Gök-Turks who left very important articles for the Turkish language as well as the Turkish culture and art history.

	cultural heritage.	intangible cultural heritages (living heritage).
Bc-1.1: She/he defines petroglyphs as scripts and figures brought into the body by painting with red paint on the rock or drawing the stone with a metallic tip in all Turkish cultural circles.	Bc-2.5: She/he expresses that there are clear links between and Uygur painting and Ak-Beşim murals in which the technical features of the Toprak-kale fresco tradition are preserved and applied to Buddhist themes.	Ab-4.3: She/he explains the dominant colors in the Uygur palette by associating them with reflections of color symbolism arranged according to Chinese traditions.

Table 3. Classification of the Analysis Unit According to Procedural Knowledge and Cognitive Dimensions

Knowledge Dimension	Remember	Understand	Apply	Analyze	Evaluate	Create
C. Procedural Knowledge	Ca-1.1: She/he states that the pre-Khaganate union of Uygur clans was named differently as T'ieh-le, Kao-ch'e, Töles, Hui-Ho and Pa-ye-ku by British sinologists.	Ca-2.2: She/he gives examples of color plates in which real people are depicted with the naturalistic interpretation skill attributed to the Uygurs.	Cc-3.1: She/he classifies the distinctive features of Uygur art of printmaking and miniature in the order of the application of the rules determined in the Frayer model.	Ca-4.3: She/he argues that Uygur painting, in which important figures are depicted especially with book illustrations, is the forerunner of Seljuk painting.	Ca-5.2: She/he evaluates the efforts to register intangible cultural heritage elements as multinational files as in the example of miniature art in the context of strengthening cultural interaction between societies.	Ca-6.3: She/he makes a presentation in which the birth, development and characteristics of Uygur painting art are associated with space.

Ca-2.7:He explains the distinctive features of Ak-Besim painting with a strong linear contour with the red color in the foreground and a vibrant coloring technique as in nomadic Turkish petroglyphs, Gök-Turk miniatures and Uygur art.

Cc-3.2:She/he lists chronologically the earliest known forms of printed painting made 20,000 years ago as cave paintings made by engraving on rocks for spiritual purposes, graphical figures and signs on the rock.

Table 4. Classification of the Analysis Unit According to Metacognitive Knowledge and Cognitive Dimensions

Knowledge Dimension	Remember	Understand	Apply	Analyze	Evaluate	Create
D. Metacognitive Knowledge	Da-1.1: She/he takes note of unfamiliar concepts while discussing that Uygur painting, in which important figures are depicted especially in conjunction with book pictures, is the forerunner of Seljuk painting and ceramic art.	Da-2.6: She/he compares the newly learned information about the intangible cultural heritage representing Turkish culture with the previous knowledge.	Db-3.2: She/he plans before writing her presentation in which she/he relates the development of Uygur art to space.	Da-4.1: She/he explains the difference between the concepts of tangible and intangible cultural heritage through the living evidences of miniature art reflected in the cultural geographical view (landscape).	Dc-5.1: When she/he realizes that she does not know some features of the factual/conceptual/procedural and metacognitive knowledge related to the goal-achievement of explaining the cultural geographical history of Turkish arts of printmaking and miniature in relation to the space, she revises these features.	Db-6.3: She/he creates open-ended questions organized around the example of miniature art, one of the living heritages representing Turkish culture.

Constructing the Instructional Content Design According to the Subgroups of the Knowledge and Cognitive Process Dimensions of the Revised Taxonomy of the Analysis Unit

A literature review was conducted in order to design a holistic teaching content suitable for the knowledge and cognitive process dimensions of the goal-behavior expressions presented in Tables 1-4. Then, the focus is on the characteristics of cultural, intellectual, spiritual and political fields that change according to the periods and geographical locations in which intangible heritage practices/elements emerged in the example of Turkish arts of printmaking and miniature.

Aa-1.1: What Is The Oldest Known The Printmaking Art Technique?

The research works examined within the scope of the literature research show that the cave paintings, graphical figures and signs on the rock, dated to the prehistoric period in 20.000 B.C. and made by engraving on rocks for spiritual purposes, are the oldest known forms of printmaking. The oldest known printmaking art technique is woodprint. It is noted that there were religious beliefs in the beginning and development of graphic arts, and the first print samples carved into wooden molds were made by Taoist monks in China. The printing process, which continued with the carving of marble molds in the 6th century A.D., continued with the printing of the seal-shaped rings made of wood on the *nuska* made by the Buddhist monks in the 7th century, and then the image and letters were printed in the same mold by carving the wooden molds in the form of relief (İnan Temur, 2011:13-15). The woodprint and paper, which are known to be used in China for the first time, were also used by Uygurs in order to spread Manichean and Buddhist influences and to convey the teachings that war is prohibited. These pages and books, known to be printed with tree text patterns, are considered to be the first examples of Turkish printmaking art. Uygurs who made paper production between the 9th and 10th centuries developed a different method in which they printed texts by creating movable letters one by one from hardwood. Uyghurs used manuscripts in four different forms: These are large, folded in half, stitched books at the fold of the pages, long rolls of paper rolled up, *pothies (pustakas)* secured with wooden bindings and held with twine through holes drilled in the middle of thin long pages and silk pieces. It was preferred that the *miniatures* placed in different areas on the pages should be positioned horizontally according to the text after the text was written in the manuscripts (Tekin, 1993 as cited in Biçer Özcan, 2018: 213-221).

Bc-5.2: What are the Effects of the Landscapes of Turfan, Kansu and Karaşar on the Emergence of a New Style in Uyghur Painting?

Towards the middle of the 7th century, the traces of Greek and Indian culture were faded in Turfan and Kansu paintings and sudden stylistic and technical changes occurred in these paintings. The emergence of the new style coincided with the arrival of the Uygurs in Kansu in 847 and their arrival in Turfan and Karaşar from 856 onwards. The new style that it is an early phase of the classical Uygur painting style, which has many representative works in the territory of the Kocho Kingdom, which reigned in 856 and 1330 A. C., strengthens the argument that these two events are interrelated (Eberhard, 1942 as cited in Esin, 1967: 49). The first stage of

the Uyghur painting style was identified in the caves with Uyghur inscriptions in Şorcuk and Kum-tura which are places associated with Western Turks. The painting, which is thought to belong to the group of Şorcuk and Kum-tura in the Turfan region and depicts a Chinese pilgrim with *sgraffito* technique in 717, is dated to “the "year of the rabbit" according to the Twelve Animal Turkish Calendar. It is possible to date the early phase of the Uyghur painting style no later than the beginning of the eighth century or the end of the seventh century (Waldschmidt, 1925: 79).

Ca-2.7: What are the Connections between Uyghur Painting and Ak-beşim Murals?

It is known that the Uyghur culture originated from North Asia and was influenced by the Chinese and possibly Tunguzes just before entering the Central Asian civilization. Thus, Uyghur art reflects a blend of this stated cultural background (Esin, 1967: 50). Besides, Uyghur art is another version of the interaction between Altaic and Chinese arts, which Sung-yun calls the Hu style and uses Tabgac (To-pa/Wei) style, which is located in the east of Lou-lan (Rudenko, 1953: 30). It is known that in the development process of Uyghur art, especially Western Turkestan has also had an impact. Uyghur painting has distinct connections with the Ak-beşim murals, in which the technical characteristics of the Toprak-kale fresco (murals) tradition are preserved and applied to Buddhist themes. The Ak-beşim Temple was built between the 6th and 7th centuries, when the region was under Western Turkish rule and Türgiş coins were found there. Ak-Beşim, which is located in the Balasagun region and was the capital of Türgiş and Kara-khanids, maintained this status until the middle of the Kara-khanid period (11th century) (Esin, 1967: 50). The distinctive features of Ak-beşim painting are the use of a strong linear contour and a vibrant coloring technique in which the red color is at the forefront, as in nomadic Turkish *petroglyphs*, Gök-Turk miniatures and Uyghur art. In addition, important figures are depicted in the Uyghur style of art. Probably after the 6th century, a new school of Buddhist art developed on the border of the Northern and Western Turkish empires; art movements that take their source from here, Western Turkestan; Northern China and Tun-huang combined with Turfan through Ara-tam and Hami (Stein, 1921: 258).

The style used in frescoes by Uyghur Turks who came to Eastern Turkestan in the middle of the 9th century reflects a bold and naturalist expressionism, but has a unique artistic temperament exhibiting surrealistic grotesque qualities and includes figurative elements in unusual shapes and sizes (Le Coq, 1913: 8). The important figures depicted by the artists in small sizes as decorative motifs are remarkable elements in the complex composition of the frescoes in Kızıl. Besides, Uyghur frescoes are expressed with a sharp simplicity and monumental dimensions. Uyghurs developed and advanced the *Pranidhi* narrative, a theme unique to Uyghur art, and *Sukhavati* depictions, many of which originated from Turfan. Sukhavati composition was developed in Turkistan and introduced to China by the Khotanese painter Wei-Ch'ih-Po-Chih-na between 605 and 617. Pranidhi and Sukhavati narratives depicted by Uyghur artists are simple and symmetrical compositions derived from the mandala figures believed to be the schematic representation of the universe, *the Gandhara art school*, which was born and developed in and around the Peshawar region and considered the traditional art of the Kushan Emperor and his heirs (Esin, 1969: 6).

Ab-5.2: What are the Knowledge and Practices Transmitted between Generations Unique to the Performance of Uyghur Arts of Printmaking and Miniature?

Uygur painters are known to have different goals than their predecessors. While Eastern Turkestan pre-Uygur artists tended to portray important figures with a narration covered with fog; it is noteworthy that Uygur artists made a significant effort to express reality in their paintings. In Uygur painting, every personality is depicted with its personal features except for the sacred figurative elements whose characteristics should be traditionally depicted. Although paper patterns are in use, they have lost their importance in the vigorous hands of Uygur draughtsmen. The strong linear design exhibited in black ink which is extremely sensitive to the characteristics of every shape has been the most important element that solidifies the skeleton of the expressionist Uygur painting; some modeling were tried in contour drawing which reminded the curvilinear designs of nomadic art. In addition to these modelling, there are also models using concentric double and triple contour lines with graded transitions from black to red and sepia (dark brown) in the Toprak-kale style. The surfaces were filled with important pictograms in the manner of a nomadic metal work. The graphic decorations were sometimes made using a paper paste and sometimes a reed pen made of three wood, as Kashgari put it, on a piece of paper. Unlike Chinese calligraphers, Uygur artists preferred to use pencils instead of brushes. It is known that the Uygurs sometimes carved the ground of the mural in order to prepare for the gilded relief ornamentation (Le Coq, 1913: 16).

After the designs were completed, the colors were applied; instead of the thick paste application applied in previously established schools in Eastern Turkestan and Kansu, inscriptions and pictograms were made visible by using the method in which bold and vibrant ink drawings were covered with a transparent glaze-like colour solutions (Waldschmidt, 1925: 8). Vivid, bright and variable-colored opaline surfaces were produced with the glazing method which is the distinctive feature of Uygur painting art. Besides, the best pigments in connection with sculpting were prepared in Toyuk. The process of determining the color intensity of figurative elements by categorizing them according to the value attributed to them is unique to Uygurs. Thus, the main themes were brought to the fore with a lively coloring method. The face of Buddha and some important personalities has been made clear by bright shading and glazing method. Bright shading followed the traditional method applied in Miran; the white light effect was not used to highlight important elements (Pelliot, 1923: 159).

The favorite color of the nomadic Turkish painting is red and it is the dominant color tone of the Uygur palette with its blue-green undertones. The colors in the Uygur palette are reflections of a color symbolism in which cosmic hues are arranged according to Chinese traditions. These colors are red, blue-green, yellow, black and white. Earthly colors are made up of brownish yellow (oily) and earthly tones. Colors subject to aquatic elements are likened to the halo of the moon. Fiery elements are in flame color, atmosphere is violet in color. The sky is blue. Murals and book paintings by Manichaeans Uygur artists have witnessed the use of rare pigments in bright ultramarine tones (Mahler, 1959: 102). Uygurs also applied the practice of gilding with leaf gold and dipping them in gold solution. The reddish yellow ochre was mixed with gold water resulting in a stronger effect than the lustre of gold. The tone of the contour transitions applied on the leaf gold was softened

with a reddish paint. According to Chinese sources, brown and black ink was used in drawing elegant lines and pictograms on gilded surfaces and nephrite (jade) was used in polishing gold surfaces with a method unique to Kocho. There are also designs painted by Uyghur artists on wooden surfaces covered with a thin layer of clay (Esin, 1967: 53).

The book paintings of Turfan and Tun-huang, presented with manuscripts in Runic or Uyghur Turkish before the period when Turkish was spoken in Turfan, are dated to the seventh century. Although the *miniatures* presented with Turkish texts are partially or completely attributed to the Turks, some of the manuscripts have been associated with non-Turkish descendants who previously lived in the region. In connection with the Manichean period book paintings, it is possible to say that the Basmıl Turks who were Manichean, lived in Kocho before the Uyghurs. Kocho's illustrated manuscripts in Runic Turkish have a Manichean content. Similar to the mural painting technique, a careful ink drawing on which colour glaze is applied is used in Uyghur book paintings. Curvilinear modelling was avoided in book paintings. The contours are shaded in a traditional style; the illuminated surfaces are precisely covered with *pictograms* using a technique unique to Kocho painters (Stein, 1928: 1082).

While the paper made by Uyghurs of Turfan has a rough surface, it was known that the paper made by the Uyghurs in Sha-chou near Tun-huang was of finer quality (Andrews, 1935: 26 as cited in Esin, 1967: 53). In the Uyghur *bahşis*, who must have combined the arts of calligraphy and painting, black or red ink was used for drawing and text. Kocho ruins contain numerous inkpots, ink stones and pens made of bamboo. It is thought that the printing technique using wood blocks was first applied by Buddhist monks in order to reproduce Buddhist texts and depictions. The earliest known specimen from the Uyghur period found at Tun-huang in 969 represents an advanced stage of this technique. There are many Uyghur wood prints stamped in black or red (Le Coq, 1913: 40). However, it is possible to state that the Uyghur painting, which included many Lamaist themes in the period after the 13th century, lost its classical perfection and underwent a formal transformation in which the drawings were mechanically repeated.

Ca-4.3: What are the Figures and Themes Unique to Turkish Customs, Lifestyle and Mythology Depicted in Uyghur Book Paintings and Miniatures which are the Forerunners of Seljuk Arts of Painting and Ceramic?

It is known that some compositions and themes were occurred simultaneously in Kocho, Tun-huang and Wan-fu-hsia in the age of the Uighur Kingdoms of Kocho and Kansu (Stein 1921: 23). The tent composition overturned due to a storm is similarly depicted in Ch'ien-fu-tong and Wan-fu-hsia. There are more similarities between Kocho and Kansu murals of the Uighur period. Buddha's composition of mourning in the Kocho mural is almost identical to the Ch'ien-fu-tong mural depicting a sorrowing statesman slashes his face with a knife according to Turkish custom. Old monk figures frequently depicted in Prandhi scenes in *Bezeklik Cave Temples* were also found at Ch'ien-fu-tong (Gray, 1959: 57). The most important holy figure represented in the Uyghur Kocho painting is *Vaisravana*, who is represented as a Central Asian warrior with armor made of leather and a horsetail knot in her hand, and is revered as the warrior king from heaven. It is known that another theme frequently used

in Uygur painting art is the *dharmapala Acala* which stands out in East Asian Buddhism. The Uygur king is represented in a book painting as a warrior devoted to Manichaeism. Figures in the form of animals rise from among the flames of the depictions of hell in the paintings. Zoomorphic headed figures rise from among the flames of the scenes of infernal in the paintings. The multi-headed and multi-armed deity figure borrowed from Indian sculptures is also among the elements that are painted and reproduced in Uygur painting (Le Coq, 1913: 40).

Figures unique to Turkish mythology are frequently encountered in Uygur painting. In a mural found in Bezeklik Cave Temples, the legendary Altay ironmonger was represented with the inscription *ol temürcü* in Turkish beside Mount Sumeru. The guardian genii of the animal calendar were also depicted on Bezeklik murals along with Turkish inscriptions. The *tuğ*, belonging to the Gök-Turk dynasty, with a wolf head placed on it, constitutes another element represented in the Uygur painting art. It is known that the Central Asian portrait painting started in the Turkish period.

In Uygur painting, real people were depicted with the naturalistic interpretation skill attributed to Turks instead of donor portraits in which imaginary characters worshipping and praying side by side were depicted and included in the composition. It is possible to say that the people of Kocho who regularly progress during the religious procession are depicted in Uygur murals. These figures are honorable Uygur princes, elderly men with long robes, thin, white hair and beards, portly middle-aged men with double pointed beards and the young men with the rank of "Inal" depicted in short coats. The carefully selected clothes of all the mentioned figures are depicted with patterned silk robes or flap riding coats in which objects in their daily use are fastened to Turkish metallic belts with thin straps. The faces of the princesses are decorated with shades of red and painted in chalky white; her hair was carefully combed and polished with lacquer and decorated with flowers, hairpins, needles, transparent covers and headdresses.

The princesses are depicted in red and gold brocade dresses with long sleeves that allow hiding their hands gently folded over their breasts, in accordance with palace traditions (Le Coq, 1913: 38 as cited in Esin 1967: 55-56). Another category depicted in Uyghur painting is clergymen. The older monks, some of whom are depicted with blue eyes are highlighted by their devotion to their religion, their lean bodies and pale faces. The faces of the young followers are expressed enthusiastically. Manichean figures, believed to have been chosen by God to be sent to heaven, are depicted in white draped robes on frescoes in the Kocho Temple. A book painting depicts Uygur princes and princesses attending in the sermon of Manichean priests (Le Coq, 1913: 21-27).

Patterns and landscapes made of bright colours, which are a part of daily life, have been faithfully mirrored in Uygur painting art. While painters perform their arts skilfully; mourning and worshipping people from different lands, especially the Brahmans, are portrayed according to their unique characteristics. Horses, camels and other animals have been depicted in the heraldic style of naturalistic or old steppe art by artists who have the power to see fine details and have a nomadic life experience in their upbringing. It is accepted that Uyghur painting, in which important figures are depicted especially in connection with book paintings, is the forerunner of Seljuk

painting and ceramic art (Esin, 1967: 56). Although it is known that it was depicted in the Islamic cultural environment in 1436, the last known work of the Uygur painting art, which is technically and stylistically associated with the Uygur painting tradition, is the *Miraçname* written by *Malik Bahşi* in Uygur Turkish and prepared in the *Herat*, including 61 miniatures (İnal, 1995: 120).

Conclusion and Discussion

This research is a retrospective content analysis research constructed with the historical analysis approach (Menard, 2008: 3-13) in qualitative research design. In this paper, an approach that comes from the logic of historical analysis, looking at the cultural geographic past and referring to the socio-cultural background in the historical texts that constitute the main data sources, has been followed. The analytical process followed in the research includes the steps of finding, reading, categorizing, evaluating and saving the data in document sources. In the document review process, it was aimed not to summarize the document related to the research subject, but to analyze the content of the document and to examine the message, intention and motivation in the document within a certain historical context.

Within the scope of the results, considering the knowledge and cognitive process dimensions indicated by the goal-achievement of “To be able to explain the cultural geographical history of Turkish arts of printmaking and miniature by associating with the space”, which is determined as a research unit, goal-behavior expressions were determined. Instructional content was designed to support the acquisition of goal-behaviors classified according to the revised Bloom taxonomy (Amer, 2006: 213-230).

The written goal-behavior statements were classified gradually, and tables were created containing the factual, conceptual, procedural and metacognitive subgroups of the knowledge dimension and remember, understand, apply, analyze, evaluate and create categories of the cognitive process dimension. Categorization of the instructional content designed within the scope of this paper according to the dimensions of knowledge and cognitive processes of the revised Bloom taxonomy can provide a conceptual framework, especially for geography and history teachers who are new to their profession and teachers in other subjects, encouraging them to develop a more complete approach to learning goals.

Results of this paper can inspire active teachers who explore ways to develop the basic links between obtained answers about mental habits and the instructional content, and encourage their students to learn to live and work together in peace so that they can overcome the problems likely to be encountered in the next decades. Instructional content designed within the scope of this paper can contribute to the normative dimensions of the hybrid content designs, which stand out in the idea of updating the 21st century program (Buckingham Shum and Crick, 2016: 6), as they bring together the common points of thematic study areas such as global citizenship education, geography education, history education and cultural heritage education.

Recommendations

The Uygur painting art which started in the borders of China, developed in Central Asia for six centuries and spread in time and place, has managed to reach the present day from Seljuk period Konya and Ottoman Istanbul. The instructional content designed within the scope of this paper includes the living nature of miniature art reflected in its cultural geographic past, which started its adventure with Uygur murals and took its place in the pages of the book with its extraordinary vibrancy, artistic and technical originality in later periods. In the religious-themed miniatures of Uygur manuscripts, Uyghur princes and clergymen are depicted according to a hierarchical position indicated by colors. In the murals with social content, the cultural traces of the Uyghur geography from which the Buddhist and Manichaeen religions originated were vividly expressed. These traces constitute the most important sources influencing the development of Turkish miniature art (Berkli, 2010: 158). In this context, this paper can shed light on young researchers interested in the integration of intangible cultural heritage in education.

In the UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage (2003), the concept of intangible cultural heritage defined as practices, representations, narratives, knowledge, skills and related tools, materials and cultural spaces defined as part of the cultural heritage of groups, communities and, if any, individuals; it has a dynamic structure that cannot be considered separately from the material contexts that keep it alive (Pietrobruno, 2009: 227-247 cited in Büyükkayıkçı, 2018: 55). In this paper, the emphasis on understanding the distinction between tangible and intangible cultural heritage concepts may play an important role in eliminating erroneous definitions.

Miniature art has been registered in 2020 in the *UNESCO Representative List of Intangible Cultural Heritage* as Turkey, Azerbaijan, İran and Özbekistan have prepared submitted and registered multinational files. Miniature art is important not only as a cultural heritage that belongs to one country but is shared by multiple countries. As emphasized in the UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage, efforts to prepare, submit and register multinational files in the intangible cultural heritage list will undertake very important missions in the axis of cultural interaction between states and societies, the understanding of multidimensional and multicultural citizenship and the awareness of learning to live and work together.

References

- Ahmed, A., & Pollitt, A. (2007). Improving the quality of contextualized questions: an experimental investigation of focus. *Assesment in Education: Principles, Policy & Practice*, 14(2), 201-232.
- Amer, A. (2006). Reflections on Bloom's Revised Taxonomy. *Electronic Journal of Research in Educational Psychology* 4(8), 213-230.
- Anderson, L. W. & Krathwohl, D. R. (2001). *A Taxonomy for Learning, Teaching and Assessing: A Revision of Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives*. NY: Longman.

- Andrews, F. H. (1935). *Descriptive Catalogue of Antiquities recovered by Sir Aurel Stein: during his Explorations in Central Asia, Kansu and Eastern Iran*. Delhi: Manager of Publications.
- Berkli, Y. (2010). Uygur Resim Sanatının Üslup Özellikleri. [Stylistic Features of Uyghur Art of Painting]. *Atatürk Üniversitesi, Edebiyat Fakültesi, Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 45, 155-166.
- Biçer Özcan, Ş. (2018). Uygur Türklerinden Osmanlı Nakkaşlarına Minyatür Sanatının Serüveni [The Adventure of Miniature Art from Uyghur Turks to Ottoman Painters]. *TURAN Stratejik Araştırmalar Merkezi Uluslararası Bilimsel Hakemli Dergisi*, 41, 213-221.
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method. *Qualitative Research Journal* 9(2), 27-40.
- Buckingham Shum, S. & Crick, R. D. (2016). Learning Analytics for 21st Century Competencies. *Journal of Learning Analytics* 3(2), 6-21.
- Demirel, Ö. (2020). *Eğitimde Program Geliştirme/Kuramdan Uygulamaya* [Curriculum Development in Education/From Theory to Practice]. Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- Eberhard, W. (1942). *Çin'in Şimal Komşuları* [China's Northern Neighbours]. Trans. F. Nimet Uluğtuğ. Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu.
- Esin, E. (1967). *Antecedents and Development of Buddhist and Manichean Turkish Art in Eastern Turkestan and Kansu/The Handbook of Turkish Culture, Supplement to Volume II, Section of the History of Art*. Z.V. Togan (Ed.). İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Basımevi.
- Gray, B. (1959). *Buddhist cave paintings at Tun-huang*. London: Faber and Faber.
- İnal, G. (1995). *Türk Minyatür Sanatı (Başlangıcından Osmanlılara Kadar)* [Turkish Miniature Art (From the Beginning to the Ottomans)]. Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu.
- İnan Temur, G. (2011). *Günümüz Türk Baskı Resim Sanatındaki Gelişmelerin Sanatsal Anlatıma Etkileri* [The Effects of The Improvements on Contemporary Turkish Art of Printmaking on Artistic Expression]. (Unpublished master's dissertation). University of Dokuz Eylül, Institute of Education Sciences, İzmir, Turkey.
- Le Coq, A. von. (1913). *Chotscho: Fascimile-Wiedergaben der Wichtigeren Funde der Ersten Königlich Preussischen Expedition Nach Turfan in Ost-Türkistan*. Berlin: Dietrich Reimer.
- Mahler, J. G. (1959). *The Westerners among The Figurines of the T'ang Dynasty of China/Serie Orientale Rome, XX*. Rome: Istituto Italiano per il Medio ed Estremo Oriente.
- Marshall, C. & Rossman, G. B. (2006). *Designing Qualitative Research*. California: Sage.
- Menard, S. (Ed.). (2008). *Handbook of Longitudinal Research/Design, Measurement and Analysis*. USA: Elsevier Inc.
- Ministry of National Education (MOE). (2018). *Ortaöğretim Coğrafya Dersi (9-12. Sınıflar) Öğretim Programı* [Secondary School Geography Lesson (Grades 9-12) Curriculum]. Ankara: TC Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı.
- Mohajan, H. K. (2018). Qualitative Research Methodology in Social Sciences and Related Subjects. *Journal of Economic Development, Environment and People* 7(1), 23-48.
- Pelliot, P. (1923). *Guide-Catalogue du Musée Guimet/Les Collections Bouddhiques, Exposé Historique et Iconographique, Inde Centrale et Gandhara, Turkestan, Chine Septentrionale, Tibet*, par M. J. Hackin. Paris et Bruxelles: Van Oest.

- Pietrobruno, S. (2009). Cultural Research and Intangible Heritage. *SOKÜM Sözleşmesi/Yönelimler, Eğilimler ve Eleştiriler [Convention for the Safeguarding of the ICH/ Tendencies, Trends and Critics]* (pp. 53-70). Trans. M. Büyükkayıkçı, M. Ö. Oğuz, E. Ölçer Özünel, A. E. Aral (Eds.). Ankara: Geleneksel Yayıncılık.
- Rudenko, S. I. (1953). *The Culture of the Population of the Altai Mountains in Scythian Times*. Moscow & Leningrad: Academy of Sciences USSR Publication.
- Seixas, P. & Morton, T. (2013). *The Big Six: Historical Thinking Concepts*. Toronto: Nelson Education.
- Stein, M. A. (1921). *Serindia: Detailed Report of Archaeological Explorations in Central Asia and Westernmost China*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Stein, M. A. (1928). *Innermost Asia/Detailed Report of Explorations in Central Asia, Kan-su and Eastern Iran (vol.2)*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Tekin, Ş. (1993). *Eski Türklerde Yazı, Kâğıt, Kitap ve Kâğıt Damgalar [Writing, Paper, Book and Paper Tamgas in Ancient Turks]* İstanbul: Eren.
- Tümertekin, E. & Özgüç, N. (2019). *Beşeri Coğrafya/İnsan, Kültür, Mekân [Human Geography/Human, Culture, Space]*. İstanbul: Çantay Kitabevi.
- UNESCO. (2003). Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage. (2020, February 10). Retrieved from <http://ich.unesco.org/doc/src/0009-TR- PDF.pdf>
- Uysal, F. (2020). Veri Toplama Süreçleri ve Analiz Yöntemleri [Data Collection Process and Analysis Methods] In N. Cemaloğlu (Ed.), *Bilimsel Araştırma Teknikleri ve Etik [Scientific Research Techniques and Ethics]* (pp. 135-174). Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- Waldschmidt, E. (1925). *Gandhara, Kutcha, Turfan*. Leipzig: Klinkhardt and Biermann.
- Yıldırım, A. & Şimşek, H. (2016). *Sosyal Bilimlerde Nitel Araştırma Yöntemleri [Qualitative Research Methods in the Social Sciences]* Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.