

The Influence of Confucian Philosophy on Adult Learners Who Come from Confucian-Influenced Societies

Szu-Fang Chuang
Louisiana State University

This paper reviews the literature on Confucian philosophy in general and explores its influences on adult learners who come from Confucian-influenced societies. The Confucian philosophy is reviewed to four principles and found to have a strong influence on Confucian adults in learning. The implication of findings and recommendations are discussed.

Keywords: Confucian Philosophy, Cultural Value, Confucian Adult Learners

Demographics, the global economy, and technology have influenced the nature of adult learning in American society and the world (Merriam & Caffarella, 1999). According to the Yearbook of Immigration Statistics of 2004 from the United State Citizenship and Immigration Service (2005), about 35 percent of immigrants are Asians and approximately 40 percent (130,300) of Asian immigrants come from Confucian-influenced societies, which include China, Hong Kong, Japan, Korea, Malaysia, Singapore, Taiwan, Thailand and Vietnam (Barron & Arcodia, 2002; Albrecht, 2001). Asian immigrants have greatly affected the current and future growth of the U.S. workforce (Tolbert, 2002). For nearly 2,500 years, the power of Confucian philosophy has dominated, influenced and shaped the civilization of Confucian societies in Far East Asia (Lu, Gilmour, & Kao, 2001). Social transformation and the multicultural workplace, particularly the influence of Western philosophies and ideas seem to have changed the patterns of the influence of Confucianism. "East Asia is not as Confucian as it was 150 years ago; what exists today is the product more of shared consequences of modernization than of a distant heritage suitable for an agrarian society," said Gilbert Rozman (1990, p.13). Yet, Oldstone-Moore (2002) argued that Confucius philosophy still has an enormous impact on East Asian civilization and the tradition remains a special trait in life of the people. As Wang, Wang, Ruona and Rojewski (2005) stated, there is a need for further research in cross-cultural differences (between West and Confucian cultures), Confucian dynamic, and its impact on HRD.

To create a win/win outcome, it is important to recognize how a philosophy influences our daily life in ways we see, think, learn and act in our world, and it is essential to learn, appreciate and work with cultural difference (Ruona & Lynham, 2004; Tolbert, 2002). Understanding the cultural diversity that exists in organization today is crucial for success and remaining competitiveness in this rapidly changing world. Therefore, it is critical for the international human resource development (HRD) professionals and adult educators to understand the influence of Confucian dynamics on employees, who come from Confucian-influenced societies, in order to work effectively on the cultural differences and to achieve optimal learning outcome on all learners.

The purpose of this study is to explore the influence of Confucian philosophy on adult learners who come/came from Confucian-influenced societies and once exposed to Confucian teaching. Hence there is no universal definition of Confucian philosophy and limited research have been found associate with influence of Confucian philosophy on Confucian adult learners, the purpose was fulfilled through qualitative inquiry into three basic research questions:

- 1) What is Confucian philosophy?
- 2) Does Confucian value have empirically tested?
- 3) If it does, what critical issues have observed?
- 4) Does Confucian philosophy appear to influence the Confucian adult learners in workplace learning? This question may be answered by comparing the findings from previous questions with Western culture in learning.

The methodology for this study is literature review. The literature search began with searches through databases (e.g., *Academic Search Premier*, *ERIC*, *ABI/INFORM*, and *Article 1st*) through March 2006, using key words "Confucius," "Confucian philosophy," and "Confucian values." Hand searches of journals (e.g., *Human Resource Development International*, *Human Resource Development Quarterly*) were also used. A check was also made of the references cited in relevant articles. Yet, the literature review yielded limited resources for exploring the influence of Confucian philosophy in adult learning. To extend the review, additional resources from related subject matter were selected from various journals (e.g., *Journal of Chinese Philosophy*, *International Studies of Management and organization*, *Adult Education Quarterly*) and books in the fields of psychology, management, education, philosophy

and sociology. A total of 66 articles (29 journal articles, 19 research articles, and 18 book chapters) from journals and books were reviewed and patterned into subjects, as they were interpreted and presented in this paper.

What is Confucian Philosophy?

KongZi (also Confucius) was the first educational and political revolutionary in Chinese antiquity, around 500 B.C. His powerful ideology, recorded by his apprentices, has been discussed, translated, and criticized with various explanations by researchers and scholars. Many scholars believe that Confucius played a major role in constructing Chinese culture with a cross-border influence upon generations, eras and regions (Cho & Lee, 2001; Pun, 2001). Its definition is more easily described than defined by terms like *guanxi* (relationship), *yi* (justice), *li* (ritual), filial piety (respecting and obeying parents), *ren* (humaneness), virtue and social order seem to capture the concept. In general, the Confucian philosophy put the greatest emphasis on the following four principles.

Forming a Hierarchical Society for Stability and Order

One key principle of Confucian teaching is the *stability of society*, which is structured by hierarchical relationships (known as the five cardinal relationships called *Wu Lun*): ruler/subject, father/son, older-brother/younger-brother, husband/wife, and older-friend/younger-friend (Hofstede & Bond, 1988; Kennedy, 2002). To fulfill the obligation in each relation involves with understanding moral characters, exercising moral dispositions and cultivating self (O'Dwyer, 2003). To exercise moral dispositions in a brotherhood, the younger brother needs to give respect and obedience to the older brother, and the older brother is expected to provide protection and be a role model to the younger. In a father/son relationship, the father is an example to the son, and the son must be filial (a virtuous behavior) to the parents by obeying and respecting the parents' demands (Bi & D'agostino, 2004). However, a blind and unthinking obedience cannot be accepted because the son is encouraged to give a gently remonstrance to any transgression by the father (Bi & D'agostino, 2004). It is believed that human beings can live with happiness and in safety only if a societal stability is formed by social- and family-orders as represented by such hierarchical relationships. Self-education and self-regulation (based on one's status with good intent) are keys to promote an ordered and harmonious society (Oldstone-Moore, 2002).

Focusing on Self-cultivation (Long-term Oriented)

The idea of learning in Confucian philosophy, according to Tu (2001), is to emphasize ethical and cognitive intelligence. Here, learning is a continually developing process through the entire life, which is similar to what we call "lifelong learning" today in the field of adult education, rather than simply obtaining a new skill or completing an educational degree (Granrose, 2001). Under this notion, mass education is required intellectually and the goal of learning is to amend one's mind in order to "cultivate" the individual, known as *self-cultivation* (Lan, 2003; O'Dwyer, 2003). To be self-cultivated, the person must have the following aims in order: (a) self evaluation, (b) family regulation, (c) community harmony, (d) national peace and prosperity, and (e) virtuous world (Nuyen, 2004). The meaning of "Knowledge" in the Chinese language is written by two words: one is "learn" and the other is "question" in English, which can be interpreted as that the knowledge is gained by observing and questioning (Kennedy, 2002). It points out that the accomplishment of learning should depend on the learners themselves, and the learners are required to rethink and reflect on what they have learned. Based on this concept, one is expected to obtain knowledge around him- or her-self and use the knowledge to correct and guide his or her behavior (Lan, 2003). The idea of acquiring knowledge from one's experience is found similar to a Western idea of using experience to approach new experience and to determine which knowledge and skills should be employed (MacKeracher, 2004). Yet, in Confucianism, experience is mainly used for amendment and cultivation of oneself for achieving true virtue and human relation with others. The intention of learning is different between the two cultures.

Creating and Maintaining a Harmonious Environment and Relation with Others

To maintain a harmonious relationship, one should (a) consider oneself as a member of a "family", (b) overcome one's individuality, and (c) maintain other individual's "face" (respecting other's dignity and prestige) (Hofstede & Bond, 1988). Confucius believed that individuals with few-thought (referred to people at the bottom level) are as needed as people with many thought (referred to people at the top level) in a workplace because they can also create astounding results if they receive appropriate work which matches with their knowledge and skills (Mak, 2000). Each individual thus has their own position for their specific skills and people with few- and many-thought in the workplace can be balanced in a way that promotes harmony in the workplace. Moreover, a pleasant *guanxi* with others is another major approach to harmonious relations. *Guanxi* (as "relation" or "connection") means a sensitive social network to form and maintain an effective personal or social relationship (Yeung & Tung, 1996).

Its affection on moral and ethical behavior, performance, trust, turnover and absences in the workplace has been discovered in many researches (Farh, Tsui, Xin & Cheng, 1998; Tan & Snell, 2002; Tsui & Farh, 1997). To develop an effective *guanxi*, one could: (1) mention kinship and locality (e.g. state one come from), (2) find common experience (e.g. school), (3) give or return favors, and (4) build personal relationship and trust (Yeung & Tung, 1996). Reciprocations of greeting and gifts will be considered as positive social activities and manners to maintain a pleasant *guanxi* (Kipnis, 1997). *Guanxi* may be used unethically as a “back door” to secure someone’s advantage over better working conditions or promotion (Lu, Cooper, Kao & Zhou, 2003), which is often deemed as a draw back. Yet, *guanxi* was not encouraged to work this way in Confucian teaching because it would violate the emphasis on virtuous behavior and *yi* (justice). Although *guanxi* can create a friendly workplace and enhance productivity mainly by face-to-face interaction, it may be affected by technology today. For instance, telecommunications provide better family ties and long-distance interpersonal relations but it limits the opportunity of physical contact and social networks, which are often sought in Confucian-influenced societies (Bockover, 2003; Wang, 2002). As the distance education becoming popular today, it is crucial for the educator to understand the significance of social presence and provide opportunities (e.g., teamwork or group discussion) for social connection (Aragon, 2003).

Living a Moral Life and Performing Virtuous Behavior

In Confucian notion, a moral action has priority over learning and it must be sincere. It involves focusing on the continuity of the family tree and importance of worshipping the ancestors and being filial to the parents and elders in the family (Bockover, 2003; Granrose, 2001). Filial piety is a root of Confucian virtue, a form of family obligation, a personal morality for family harmony, and a political method for social order (Bi & D’agostino, 2004; O’Dwyer, 2003). It is not presented by simply hiring a housekeeper and buying food for the parents but by showing reverence to the parents/ancestors and fulfilling parents’ wishes. In this hierarchic society, the father’s authority is absolute while alive and after death, and that guides the son’s life. A survey of data from China (509 parents and 731 grown children) in 1994 and Taiwan (1,149 parents and 662 grown children) in 1989 and 1993 concluded that the filial obligations of grown children to their parent have remained and survived after the past and current social transformation (e.g. WWII, Civil war in China) (Whyte. 2004). In a historical background such as this, a person’s responsibility for others, particularly to the family members, is definite and that affects people in their decision-making (Nuyen, 2004).

These four principles appear to be associated with each other and mainly start from oneself to the family, society, nation, and finally the universe. A hierarchical and harmonious society can be formed in order and stability if each individual is continually self-cultivating and consistently performing virtuous behavior (civility, respect, filial piety etc.) and maintaining harmony. Confucian philosophy is a kind of universalism which can promote cultural diversity, develop a notion of universal justice with a respect for culture differences, enhance our cognitive perspective to reframe situations, direct our anger into self-scrutiny rather than criticize or judging others’ behaviors to promote harmonious relations and merit trust from others, and contribute to a moral organization (Kezar, 2004; Koehn, 2001; Nuyen, 2004; Romar, 2002). As Romar (2004) stated, this philosophy seems to be a philosophy of (a) governance based on individual and social relationships, (b) ethics based on human behavior and moral decision, and (c) leadership based on justice and hierarchy.

Empirical Research on or Related to Confucian Philosophy

By doing a study of individual employees’ attitude and value for IBM around 1968 and 1972, Hofstede identified four national culture dimensions- *individualism*, *power distance*, *uncertainty avoidance* and *masculinity*, based on the analyzed result of over 116,000 questionnaires from 40 countries in 20 different language versions (Hofstede, 1983). He later added the fifth variable- *Confucian dynamic* based on the result of Chinese Value Survey (CVS) around 1985 (Hofstede, 2001). Unlike the IBM questionnaire, the CVS survey was developed based on the Eastern mindset (teaching of Confucius) and distributed to 23 countries (Hofstede, 2001). His contribution to the national culture value has been well discussed and adopted by many scholars (e.g., Inglehart & Carballo, 1997; Tan & Snell, 2002). In his study, the Confucian-influenced societies clearly proved their distinguishability from individualism. Ever since the result of CVS was initially published in Chinese Culture Connection in 1987 with the first identification of Confucian dynamism in social science, the influence of Confucianism has been gaining more attention and recognition than before. Many available empirical studies regarding Confucian philosophy (see Table 1) used CVS, Hofstede’s five cultural dimensions, and/or some of his finding as a theoretical framework to examine the role of Confucian philosophy and its relation to other variables, such as Vitell, Paolillo and Thomas’ study (2003). Studies in this table together present a convincing evidence of the power of Confucian philosophy on the adults of the Confucian-affected societies. Culture value studies by Lu, Rose and Blodgett (1999) and Lu, Gilmour

and Kao (2001) significantly identified the difference between the Confucian-affected societies and Western country. People from Confucian-influenced societies are not likely to express and act their emotions in public as Westerners do but they often have higher loyalty and commitment to the organization and greater mercy on other group members (Chiu, Wong, & Kosinski, 1998). The Western culture tends to be individual-, problem-solving- and short-term-oriented with a direct style toward realistic (Lussier, 2005). In contrast, the Confucian-influenced societies of East Asia tend to be social-, family-, group-, and long-term oriented with an indirect communication style and virtuous behavior preference (Lu, Cooper, Kao & Zhou, 2003). For instance, in South Korea, companies tend to use collectivized, hierarchical and authoritarian management practices with much authority resting in upper levels of management with a strong Confucian ethic (Rowley & Bae, 2004). Different culture leads different human groups to different value system and response to its environment. One important issue needs to be addressed is the change in generations from both regions. It has been found that Western ideas have increasingly influenced Asian countries (Czander & Lee, 2001). The young generations in both regions seem to become somewhat similar but each still retains their traditional values. This could become a challenge to adult educators and HRD professionals in terms of training and personnel development. For example, some Japanese firms are developing approaches with a greater emphasis on individual performance to satisfy demands of younger employees, who tend to have different levels of organizational commitment and value from older employees and prefer to receive immediate reward for their individual contribution (Benson & Debroux, 2004). Such change may dramatically shift the workplace to become a more performance-based and individual oriented with diverse HR systems.

Does Confucian Philosophy Appear to Influence Confucian Adult Learners in Learning?

How Westerners learn can be examined from two aspects: educational philosophies and adult education. According to Scott and Sarkees-Wircenski (2001), education in North America has been influenced by five major philosophies: idealism, realism, pragmatism, existentialism and behaviorism. These philosophies root the Westerners in the belief in truth, value, tangible fact, law, problem solving, freedom and self-centering. These characteristics are often used to describe Westerners in many cross-culture studies (Chang, 2004; Lu, Gilmour & Kao, 2001; Lu, Rose & Blodgett, 1999). Also, among all the models or theories of adult learning in the Western (America) culture, *andragogy* seems to gain the most recognition and attention in the field of adult education. Its concept was introduced by Malcolm Knowles with six basic assumptions about adults as learners: *self-directing, experience, readiness to learn, problem-centered, motivation, and need to know* (Knowles, Holton & Swanson, 2005). The andragogical model is well recognized and deemed as “a core adult learning model” (Swanson & Holton, 2001). The goals and purpose for adult learning in the model include *societal growth* by assisting social transformation and order; *institutional growth* by increasing productivity; and *individual growth* by enhancing personal development (Knowles, Holton & Swanson, 2005). This model is found to incorporate some similar factors from Confucian philosophy and that makes the model to be adoptable and modifiable for use in a Confucian environment. These factors include the self-directing (as the self-cultivation in Confucianism), using prior experience (as obtaining knowledge around oneself in Confucianism), and societal growth (as societal stability and order in Confucian). Yet, the approaches and implications are somewhat different. For instance, experience is only deemed as a rich resource for learning new knowledge or skills and used as a core adult learning principle in the Knowles’ model. However, in the Confucian philosophy, experience is a learning tool for self-cultivation to obtain knowledge which is used to correct and guide one’s moral behavior and thought for harmony. Similar to the Westerners, the Confucian adult learners are influenced by their own educational philosophy- Confucianism, which leads them into different cultural values, thoughts and behaviors. Identified attitudes about filial and behaviors about moral discipline, avoidance and accommodation from selected empirical studies reveal the existence of power and influence of Confucian teaching on Confucian adult learners. Based on the four principles, Confucian adult learners may have a greater tendency to look at learning as self-cultivating and life-long edifying with a big picture. To promote harmony, they may likely to be family-, group- and societal- oriented and to build *guanxi*. As Phuong-Mai, Terlouw & Pilot (2005) stated, most Confucian learners seem to perform best in groups. The learners tend to avoid face-to-face conflict with a teacher and to deal with the conflict by self-adjustment, while the teacher is expected to have wisdom and act as a role model to the students (Barron & Arcodia, 2002). These appearances are the product of Confucian philosophy. That perhaps explains why the Westerners are often described by words like independent behaviors and individualism; while the Far East Asians are described by interdependent behaviors, collectivism, extroversion and hard-working (Baumgart & Halse, 1999; Yeung & Tung, 1996). Different educational philosophies lead different learning focus and mode. By comparing with Western philosophy, the Confucian philosophy does appear to affect the adults in Confucian-influenced societies in learning.

Table 1. *Experimental Studies that Contribute to Our Understanding of Confucian Philosophy*

Author (Year) /Methodology/ Variables examined	Major Finding(s) Relate to Confucian Philosophy
Li & Gasser (2005) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Valid survey: 117 Asian international university students in US ▪ Sociocultural adjustment; ethnic identity; Cross-cultural contact 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Contact with the hosts partially adjusted the effect of cross-cultural self-efficacy but not the effect of ethnic identity on the sociocultural adjustment.
Vitell, Paolillo & Thomas (2003) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Valid survey: 235 Marketing managers in US ▪ Perceived Role of Ethics & Social Responsibility (PRESOR) vs. Hofstede's five cultural dimensions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Those who believe in the importance of ethics and social responsibility for the success of firm will exhibit more loyalty and follow social norms. Higher levels of PRESOR come with higher uncertainty avoidance and Confucian dynamism; yet, Lower levels of PRESOR come with higher individualism & masculinity.
Lu, Cooper, Kao, & Zhou (2003) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Valid survey: 190 Employees in China & Taiwan ▪ Job satisfaction; Mental/physical well-being; Work stress 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ In PRC, <i>guanxi</i> at work is an important aspect of work stress affecting well-being. In Taiwan, recognition is an important source of work stress to affect work morale and personal well-being. Confucian ethics is still leading the Taiwanese organizations.
Tamai & Lee (2002) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Valid survey: 558 University students in Korea & Japan ▪ Confucian values 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ There are different trends of Confucianism between Korean and Japanese students. In Korean, filial attitudes are widely seen in the family context. In Japan, filial attitudes are more likely to be observed in the work side (e.g. junior-senior relation).
Cho & Lee (2001) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Valid survey: 693 Managers in Korea ▪ Org. Commitment vs. Managers' perceptual & attitudinal diff. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The function of Confucian values may be the cause of similarity in organizational commitment between public and private sectors.
Lu, Gilmour & Kao (2001) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Valid <i>Chinese Happiness Inventory (CHI) & Chinese Value Survey (CVS)</i>: 783 Students in Taiwan & UK ▪ Confucian values vs. Happiness 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The value of Confucian dynamic has demonstrated its influence on happiness. Some traditional Confucian daily practices ("social integration") such as interpersonal benevolence and collective welfare have influenced the Taiwanese subjects group on their life satisfaction and happiness, particularly the affection on harmony.
Hyun (2001) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Valid survey: 367 Citizens in Korea & Korean immigrants in US ▪ Confucian values vs. Sociocultural change 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Most Korean and American Korean hold moderately traditional Confucian values but vary with age, gender, and contact with Western ideas. Young Koreans appear to have less traditional values than older Koreans for being socialized to national change.
Robertson & Hoffman (2000) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Valid survey: 255 business students in the US ▪ Hofstede's five cultural dimensions; Confucian dynamism at individual level 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Confucian traits may exist all over the world. People who have low uncertainty avoidance tend to be less fearful about future events.
Ralston, Egri, Stewart, Terpstra & Kaicheng (1999) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Valid <i>Schwartz Value Survey</i>: 869 Managers in China ▪ Confucianism vs. generations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The new generation managers still hold their Confucian values although they have become more individualistic and independent in work.
Lu, Rose, & Blodgett (1999) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Valid survey: 637 Employees in US & Taiwan ▪ Ethical decision-making vs. Hofstede's five dimensions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ People from a high power distance and collectivism culture (i.e., Taiwan) placed more value on company and fellow employee interests than people from a masculine, individualistic culture (i.e., U.S.).
Farh, Tsui, Xin, & Cheng (1998) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Valid survey: 560 Sales-supervisor dyads in Taiwan & China ▪ Relational Demography vs. <i>Guanxi</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ <i>Guanxi</i> is extraordinarily important for business executives' trust. One often fines an individual trustworthy when the individual is related to oneself.
Chiu, Wong, & Kosinski (1998) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Valid <i>CVS & Management-of-Differences Exercise (MODE)</i>: 185 male managers in Japan & China ▪ Chinese Value vs. Conflict handling style 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Subjects who have higher moral discipline and Confucian work dynamics will have lower competitiveness but higher avoidance and accommodation. A good human (harmonious) relationship is encouraged in Japan and China.

Contribution to New Knowledge in HRD

Cultural difference is in an urgent need to be understood, particularly in multinational organizations. It is critical for the HRD professionals to understand the cultural background of Confucian adult learners and to create culturally relevant approaches to learning and development in order to help the learners in the workplace (Guy, 1999). Wang, Wang, Ruona and Rojewski (2005) remind us that Western theories often are less appropriate to the Chinese organization and employees due to the influence of Confucian philosophy, and the HRD professionals and adult educators should ensure that cultural difference has been understood and studied. This study provides a fundamental knowledge of Confucian philosophy and its impacts on Confucian adult learners which future research can build on for HRD research and implications.

Conclusion and Recommendations

The fundamental Confucian mode of life and thought may be modified by Western ideas but it still remains in most of the Confucian adult members at different degrees. Since the Confucian philosophy appears to affect the Confucian adult members in learning, the HRD professionals need to think about how to utilize the strengths of the Confucian philosophy (e.g. harmony, networking and flexibility to face uncertainty) to promote a harmony in the workplace and develop effective HRD programs for both Westerners and Confucian members use (Albrecht, 2001). One key for the international adult educators and HRD professionals to remember is that Confucian adult learners with custom of teacher-centered learning style tend not to argue or disagree with teacher's opinions and suggestions. They tend to believe in and respect for teacher's wisdom, and they tend to keep the teacher's "face" and dignity for harmony. Accordingly, the Confucian adult learners' need or problem may not be truly met or solved. In addition, the optimal learning/training outcome may not be achieved effectively. Thus, it is critical for adult educators to: (1) see the connection between a hierarchical relationship, between the teacher as a ruler and learners as subjects, and learners' behavior and (2) understand the expectation and behavior of these traditional Confucian adult learners in a class setting (Kennedy, 2002).

An important task to adult educators now is to find out what modern Confucian adult learners' learning style, preference, and expectation are and how to respond to the culture difference between Confucian and Western adult learners. Future research could first identify the retaining level of Confucian philosophy in traditional Confucian adults (who are elder and live in Confucian-influenced societies), Western-ideas-exposed Confucian adults (e.g., international students), and immigrants from Confucian-influenced societies. The researchers can then identify the learning preference and expectation in each group. In addition, the Confucian-influenced societies have been shifting to a more diverse society as well as Western countries, and young generations seem to become more individualist by increased explosion to Western ideas and culture. Future research is suggested to determine the needs and expectations of modern Confucian adults at all ages, particularly the younger generations who are said to be more individualistic, to contribute to HRD professional in designing personnel trainings and career development programs. Third, future researchers must account for cultural difference before adopting a Western model for Eastern use. If a researcher is going to adopt or modify a Western training model for Western and Confucian adult learners use, it is important for the researcher to recognize that Western-based models are mostly formed with individualistic orientation with an emphasis on self-contribution rather than in a group (Hansen, 2003). Since Confucian adult learners tend to be collectivism and focus on group performance, they may have a difficulty in adjusting themselves into an individual-center type of training or working environment. Therefore, conducting a cross-cultural analysis to a diverse class and considering any possible cultural conflict among the instructor, Western learners, and Eastern learners are critical for effective planning in personal training and development.

References

- Albrecht, D. (2001). Culture and brainstyles: New alternatives for human resource strategies to develop Chinese-Western cooperation. In B. Kidd, X. Li, & J. Richter. (Eds.), *Advances in human resource management in Asia business* (pp. 233-253). New York: Palgrave.
- Aragon, S. R. (2003). Creating social presence in online environments. In S. R. Aragon (Eds.), *Facilitating learning in online environments* (pp. 57-68). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Barron, P., & Arcodia, C. (2002). Linking learning style preferences and ethnicity: International students studying hospitality and tourism management in Australia. *Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport & Tourism Education*, 1(2), 15-27.
- Baumgart, N., & Halse, C. (1999). Approaches to learning across cultures: The role of assessment. *Assessment in*

- Education*, 6(3), 321-339.
- Benson, J., & Debroux, P. (2004). The changing nature of Japanese human resource management: The impact of the recession and the Asian financial crisis. *International Studies of Management and Organization*, 34(1), 32-51.
- Bi, L., & D'agostino, F. (2004). The doctrine of filial piety: A philosophical analysis of the concealment case. *Journal of Chinese Philosophy*, 31(4), 451-467.
- Bockover, M. I. (2003). Confucian values and the internet: A potential conflict. *Journal of Chinese Philosophy*, 30(2), 159-175.
- Chang, W. W. (2004). A cross-cultural case study of a multinational training program in the United States and Taiwan. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 54(3), 174-192.
- Chiu, R. K., Wong, M. M., & Kosinski, F. A. (1998). Confucian values and conflict behavior of Asian managers: A comparison of two countries. *Social Behavior and Personality*, 26(1), 11-22.
- Cho, K. H., & Lee, S. H. (2001). Another look at public-private distinction and organizational commitment: A cultural explanation. *International Journal of Organizational Analysis*, 9(1), 84-102.
- Czander, W. M., & Lee, D. H. (2001). Employee commitment: A psycho-social perspective on Asian and American culture and business. In B. Kidd, X. Li, & J. Richter (Eds.), *Maximizing human intelligence deployment in Asia business: The sixth generation project* (pp. 57-78). New York: Palgrave.
- Farh, J. L., Tsui, A. S., Xin, K., & Cheng, B. S. (1998). The influence of relational demography and guanxi: The Chinese case. *Organization Science*, 9(4), 471-488.
- Granrose, C. (2001). The challenge of Confucius: The generalizability of North American career assumptions. In B. Kidd, X. Li, & J. Richter (Eds.), *Maximizing human intelligence deployment in Asia business: The sixth generation project* (pp. 96-123). New York: Palgrave.
- Guy, T. C. (1999). Culturally relevant adult education: Key themes and common purposes. In T. C. Guy (Eds.), *Providing culturally relevant adult education: A challenge for the twenty-first century* (pp. 93-98). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Hansen, C. (2003). Cultural myths in stories about human resource development: Analysing the cross-cultural transfer of American models to Germany and the Côte d'Ivoire. *International Journal of Training and Development*, 7(1), 16-30.
- Hofstede, G. (1983). National cultures in four dimensions: A research-based theory of cultural differences among nations. *International Studies of Management and Organization*, 13(1/2), 46-74.
- Hofstede, G., & Bond, M. H. (1988). The Confucius connection: From cultural roots to economic growth. *Organizational Dynamics*, 16(4), 5-21.
- Hofstede, G. (2001). *Culture's consequences: Comparing values, behaviors, institutions, and organizations across nations* (2nd.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Hyun, K. J. (2001). Sociocultural change and traditional values: Confucian values among Koreans and Korean Americans. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 25(2), 203-229.
- Inglehart, R., & Carballo, M. (1997). Does Latin America Exist? (And is there a Confucian culture?): A global analysis of cross-cultural differences. *PS: Political Science & Politics*, 30(1), 34-46.
- Kennedy, P. (2002). Learning cultures and learning styles: Myth-understandings about adult (Hong Kong) Chinese learners. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 21(5), 430-445.
- Kezar, A. (2004). Philosophy, leadership, and scholarship: Confucian contributions to a leadership debate. *Leadership Review*, 4, 110-131.
- Kipnis, A. B. (1997). *Producing guanxi: Sentiment, self, and subculture in a North China village*. Durham, England: Duke University Press.
- Knowles, M. S., Holton, E. F., & Swanson, R. A. (2005). *The adult learner: The definitive classic in adult education and human resource development* (6th ed.). London: Elsevier.
- Koehn, D. (2001). Confucian trustworthiness and the practice of business in China. *Business Ethics Quarterly*, 11(3), 415-429.
- Lan, F. (2003). Ezra Pound/Ming Mao: A liberal disciple of Confucius. *Journal of Modern Literature*, 27(1), 79-89.
- Li, A., & Gasser, M. (2005). Predicting Asian international students' sociocultural adjustment: A test of two mediation models. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 29(5), 561-576.
- Lu, L., Cooper, C. L., Kao, S. F., & Zhou, Y. (2003). Work stress, control beliefs and well-being in Greater China: An exploration of sub-cultural differences between the PRC and Taiwan. *Journal of Managerial Psychology*, 18(6), 479-510.
- Lu, L., Gilmour, R., & Kao, S. F. (2001). Cultural values and happiness: An East-West dialogue. *The Journal of Society Psychology*, 141(4), 477-493.
- Lu, L. C., Rose, G. M., & Blodgett, J. G. (1999). The effects of cultural dimensions on ethical decision making in

- marketing: An exploratory study. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 18, 91-105.
- Lussier, R. N. (2005). *Human relations in organizations* (6th ed.). New York: The McGraw-Hill Companies.
- MacKeracher, D. (2004). *Making sense of adult learning*. Toronto, Canada: University of Toronto Press.
- Mak, W. M. (2000). The Tao of people-based management. *Total Quality Management*, 11(4), S537-S543.
- Merriam, S. B., & Caffarella, R. S. (1999). *Learning in adulthood: A comprehensive guide* (2nd ed.). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Nuyen, A. T. (2004). The contemporary relevance of the Confucian idea of filial piety. *Journal of Chinese Philosophy*, 31(4), 433-450.
- O'Dwyer, S. (2003). Democracy and Confucian values. *Philosophy East & West*, 53(1), 39-63.
- Oldstone-Moore, J. (2002). *Confucianism: Origins, beliefs, practices, holy texts, sacred place*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Phuong-Mai, N., Terlouw, C., & Pilot, A. (2005). Cooperative learning vs Confucian heritage culture's collectivism: Confrontation to reveal some cultural conflicts and mismatch. *Asia Europe Journal*, 3(3), 403-419.
- Pun, K. F. (2001). Cultural influence on total quality management adoption in Chinese enterprises: An empirical study. *Total Quality Management*, 12(3), 323-342.
- Ralston, D. A., Egri, C. P., Stewart, S., Terpstra, R. H., & Kaicheng, Y. (1999). Doing business in the 21st century with the new generation of Chinese managers: A study of generational shifts in work values in China. *Journal of International Business Studies*, 30(2), 415-428.
- Robertson, C. J., & Hoffman, J. J. (2000). How different are we? An Investigation of Confucian values in the United States. *Journal of Managerial Issues*, 12(1), 34-47.
- Romar, E. J. (2004). Globalization, ethics, and opportunism: A Confucian view of business relationships. *Business Ethics Quarterly*, 14(4), 663-678.
- Romar, E. J. (2002). Virtue is good business: Confucianism as a practical business ethic. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 38, 119-131.
- Rowley, C., & Bae, J. (2004). Human resource management in South Korea after the Asian financial crisis: Emerging patterns from the labyrinth. *International Studies of Management and Organization*, 34(1), 52-82.
- Rozman, G. (1990). *The East Asian region: Confucian heritage and its modern adaptation*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Ruona, W. E. A., & Lynham, S. A. (2004). A philosophical framework for thought and practice in human resource development. *Human Resource Development International*, 7(2), 151-164.
- Scott, J. L., & Sarkees-Wircenski, M. (2001). *Overview of career and technical education* (2nd ed.). Homewood, IL: American Technical Publishers.
- Swanson, R. A., & Holton, E. F. (2001). *Foundation of human resource development*. San Francisco, CA: Berrett-Koehler Publishers.
- Tamai, K., & Lee, J. (2002). Confucianism as cultural constraint: A comparison of Confucian values of Japanese and Korean university students. *International Education Journal*, 3(5), 33-49.
- Tan, D., & Snell, R. S. (2002). The third eye: Exploring guanxi and relational morality in the workplace. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 41, 361-384.
- Tolbert, A. S. (2002). *Reversing the ostrich approach to diversity: Pulling your head out of the sand*. Minneapolis, MN: Nasus.
- Tsui, A. S., & Farh, J. L. L. (1997). Where guanxi matters: Relational demography and guanxi in the Chinese context. *Work and Occupations*, 24(1), 56-79.
- Tu, W. (2001). Implications of the rise of Confucian East Asia. *Chinese American Forum*, 16(3), 13-15.
- United State Citizenship and Immigration Services. (2005). *Yearbook of Immigration Statistics of 2004- Table 3 Immigrants admitted by region and country of birth: Fiscal years 1989-2004*. Retrieved March 6, 2006, from Office of Immigration Statistics Web site: <http://uscis.gov/graphics/shared/statistics/yearbook/YrBk04Im.htm>
- Vitell, S. T., Paolillo, J. G. P., Thomas, J. L. (2003). The perceived role of ethics and social responsibility: A study of marketing professionals. *Business Ethics Quarterly*, 13(1), 63-86.
- Wang, J., Wang, G. G., Ruona, W. E., & Rojewski, J. W. (2005). Confucian values and the implications for international HRD. *Human Resource Development International*, 8(3), 311-326.
- Wang, R. R. (2002). Globalizing the heart of the dragon: The impact of technology on Confucian ethical values. *Journal of Chinese Philosophy*, 29(4), 553-569.
- Whyte, K. (2004). Filial obligations in Chinese families: Paradoxes of modernization. In C. Ikels (Eds.), *Filial piety: Practice and discourse in contemporary East Asia* (pp.106-127). Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Yeung, I. Y. M., & Tung, R. L. (1996). Achieving business in Confucian societies: The importance of guanxi (connection). *Organizational Dynamics*, 25(2), 54-65.